COLLECTED WORKS OF KOREAN BUDDHISM

7-1

公案集

GONGAN COLLECTIONS I

Jogye Order of Korean Buddhism

COLLECTED WORKS OF KOREAN BUDDHISM

VOLUME 7-1

公案集

GONGAN COLLECTIONS I

Collected Works of Korean Buddhism, Vol. 7-1

Gongan Collections I

Edited by John Jorgensen
Translated by Juhn Y. Ahn
Published by the Jogye Order of Korean Buddhism
Distributed by the Compilation Committee of Korean Buddhist Thought
45 Gyeonji-dong, Jongno-gu, Seoul, 110-170, Korea / T. 82-2-725-0364 / F. 82-2-725-0365

First printed on June 25, 2012
Designed by ahn graphics ltd.
Printed by Chun-il Munhwasa, Paju, Korea

This project has been supported by the Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism, Republic of Korea.

ISBN: 978-89-94117-10-2
ISBN: 978-89-94117-17-1 (Set)

Printed in Korea

COLLECTED WORKS OF KOREAN BUDDHISM

VOLUME 7-1

公案集

GONGAN COLLECTIONS I

EDITED BY

JOHN JORGENSEN

TRANSLATED AND ANNOTATED BY

JUHN Y. AHN

Preface to *The Collected Works of Korean Buddhism*

At the start of the twenty-first century, humanity looked with hope on the dawning of a new millennium. A decade later, however, the global village still faces the continued reality of suffering, whether it is the slaughter of innocents in politically volatile regions, the ongoing economic crisis that currently roils the world financial system, or repeated natural disasters. Buddhism has always taught that the world is inherently unstable and its teachings are rooted in the perception of the three marks that govern all conditioned existence: impermanence, suffering, and non-self. Indeed, the veracity of the Buddhist worldview continues to be borne out by our collective experience today.

The suffering inherent in our infinitely interconnected world is only intensified by the unwholesome mental factors of greed, anger, and ignorance, which poison the minds of all sentient beings. As an antidote to these three poisons, Buddhism fortunately also teaches the practice of the three trainings: *śīla*, or moral discipline, the endurance and self-restraint that controls greed; *samādhi*, the discipline of meditation, which pacifies anger; and *prajñā*, the discipline of wisdom, which conquers ignorance. As human beings improve in their practice of these three trainings, they will be better able to work compassionately for the welfare and weal of all sentient beings.

Korea has a long history of striving to establish a way of life governed by discipline, compassion, and understanding. From the fifth century C.E. onward, the Korean saṅgha indigenized both the traditional monastic community and the broader Mahāyāna school of Buddhism. Later, the insights and meditative practices of the Seon tradition were introduced to the peninsula and this practice lineage lives on today in meditation halls throughout the country. Korea, as a land that has deep affinities with the Buddhist tradition, has thus seamlessly transmitted down to the present the living heritage of the Buddha's teachings.

These teachings begin with Great Master Wonhyo, who made the vast and profound teachings of the Buddhadharma accessible to all through his

various "doctrinal essentials" texts. Venerable Woncheuk and State Preceptor Daegak Uicheon, two minds that shined brightly throughout East Asia, left us the cherished legacy of their annotated commentaries to important scriptures, which helped to disseminate the broad and profound views of the Mahāyāna, and offered a means of implementing those views in practice. The collected writings of Seon masters like Jinul and Hyujeong revealed the Seon path of meditation and illuminated the pure land that is inherent in the minds of all sentient beings. All these works comprise part of the precious cultural assets of our Korean Buddhist tradition. The bounty of this heritage extends far beyond the people of Korea to benefit humanity as a whole.

In order to make Korea's Buddhist teachings more readily accessible, Dongguk University had previously published a fourteen-volume compilation of Korean Buddhist works written in literary Chinese, the traditional lingua franca of East Asia, comprising over 320 different works by some 150 eminent monks. That compilation effort constituted a great act of Buddhist service. From that anthology, ninety representative texts were then selected and translated first into modern vernacular Korean and now into English. These Korean and English translations are each being published in separate thirteen-volume collections and will be widely distributed around the world.

At the onset of the modern age, Korea was subjected to imperialist pressures coming from both Japan and the West. These pressures threatened the continuation of our indigenous cultural and religious traditions and also led to our greatest cultural assets being shuttered away in cultural warehouses that neither the general public nor foreign-educated intellectuals had any interest in opening. For any people, such estrangement from their heritage would be most discomforting, since the present only has meaning if it is grounded in the memories of the past. Indeed, it is only through the self-reflection and wisdom accumulated over centuries that we can define our own identity in the present and ensure our continuity into the future. For this reason, it is all the more crucial that we bring to the attention of a wider public the treasured dharma legacy of Korean Buddhism, which is currently embedded in texts composed in often impenetrable literary Chinese.

Our efforts to disseminate this hidden gem that is Korean Buddhism

reminds me of the simile in the *Lotus Sūtra* of the poor man who does not know he has a jewel sewn into his shirt: this indigent toils throughout his life, unaware of the precious gem he is carrying, until he finally discovers he has had it with him all along. This project to translate and publish modern vernacular renderings of these literary Chinese texts is no different from the process of mining, grinding, and polishing a rare gem to restore its innate brilliance. Only then will the true beauty of the gem that is Korean Buddhism be revealed for all to see. A magnificent inheritance can achieve flawless transmission only when the means justify the ends, not the other way around. Similarly, only when form and function correspond completely and nature and appearance achieve perfect harmony can a being be true to its name. This is because the outer shape shines only as a consequence of its use, and use is realized only by borrowing shape.

As Buddhism was transmitted to new regions of the world, it was crucial that the teachings preserved in the Buddhist canon, this jewel of the Dharma, be accurately translated and handed down to posterity. From the inception of the Buddhist tradition, the Buddhist canon or "Three Baskets" (*Tripiṭaka*), was compiled in a group recitation where the oral rehearsal of the scriptures was corrected and confirmed by the collective wisdom of all the senior monks in attendance. In East Asia, the work of translating Indian Buddhist materials into literary Chinese –the lingua franca for the Buddhist traditions of China, Korea, Japan, and Vietnam– was carried out in translation bureaus as a collective, collaborative affair.

Referred to as the "tradition of multi-party translation," this system of collaboration for translating the Indian Sanskrit Buddhist canon into Chinese typically involved a nine-person translation team. The team included a head translator, who sat in the center, reading or reciting the Sanskrit scripture and explaining it as best he could with often limited Chinese; a philological advisor, or "certifier of the meaning," who sat to the left of the head translator and worked in tandem with him to verify meticulously the meaning of the Sanskrit text; a textual appraiser, or "certifier of the text," who sat at the chief's right and confirmed the accuracy of the preliminary Chinese rendering; a Sanskrit specialist, who carefully confirmed the accuracy of the language

of the source text; a scribe, who transcribed into written Chinese what was often initially an oral Chinese rendering; a composer of the text, who crafted the initial rendering into grammatical prose; the proofreader, who compared the Chinese with the original Sanskrit text; the editor, who tightened up and clarified any sentences that were vague in the Chinese; and finally the stylist, who sat facing the head translator, who had responsibility for refining the final rendering into elegant literary Chinese. In preparing these vernacular Korean and English renderings of Korean Buddhist works, we have thought it important to follow, as much as possible, this traditional style of Buddhist literary translation that had been discontinued.

This translation project, like all those that have come before it, had its own difficulties to overcome. We were forced to contend with nearly-impossible deadlines imposed by government funding agencies. We strained to hold together a meager infrastructure. It was especially difficult to recruit competent scholars who were fluent in literary Chinese and vernacular Korean and English, but who had with the background in Buddhist thought necessary to translate the whole panoply of specialized religious vocabulary. Despite these obstacles, we have prevailed. This success is due to the compilation committee which, with sincere devotion, overcame the myriad obstacles that inevitably arose in a project of this magnitude; the translators both in Korea and abroad; the dedicated employees at our committee offices; and all our other participants, who together aimed to meet the lofty standard of the cooperative translation tradition that is a part of our Buddhist heritage. To all these people, I would like to express my profound gratitude.

Now that this momentous project is completed, I offer a sincere wish on behalf of all the collaborators that this translation, in coming to fruition and gaining public circulation, will help illuminate the path to enlightenment for all to see.

Kasan Jikwan (伽山 智冠)
32nd President of the Jogye Order of Korean Buddhism
President, Compilation Committee of Korean Buddhist Thought
October 10, 2009 (2553rd year of the Buddhist Era)

On the Occasion of Publishing *The Collected Works of Korean Buddhism*

The Jogye Order of Korean Buddhism, together with Buddhists everywhere, is pleased to dedicate to the Three Jewels –the Buddha, Dharma, and Saṅgha– the completed compilation of the Korean and English translations of *The Collected Works of Korean Buddhism.* The success of this translation project was made possible through the dedication of Venerable Kasan Jikwan, former president of the Jogye Order and president of the Compilation Committee of Korean Buddhist Thought. Both the Korean and English translations are being published through the labors of the members of the Compilation Committee and the many collaborators charged with the tasks of translation, editing, and proofreading the compilation.

The thirteen volumes of *The Collected Works of Korean Buddhism* are the products of nearly 1,700 years of Buddhist history in Korea. These Buddhist works are the foundation and pillar of Korean thought more broadly. This compilation focuses on four towering figures in Korean Buddhism: Venerable Wonhyo, posthumously named State Preceptor Hwajaeng, who was renowned for his doctrinal thought; Venerable Uisang, great master of the *Avataṃsaka Sūtra* and pedagogical role model who was respected for his training of disciples; Venerable Jinul, also known as State Preceptor Bojo, who revitalized Seon Buddhism through the Retreat Society movement of the mid-Goryeo dynasty; and Venerable Hyujeong, also known as State Preceptor Seosan, who helped to overcome national calamities while simultaneously regularizing Korean Buddhist practice and education.

Through this compilation, it is possible to understand the core thought of Korean Buddhism, which continued unbroken through the Three Kingdoms, Goryeo, and Joseon periods. Included are annotated translations of carefully selected works introducing the Hwaeom, Consciousness-Only, and Pure Land schools, the Mahāyāna precepts, Seon Buddhism, the travel journals of Buddhist pilgrims, Buddhist cultural and historical writings, and the epitaphs of great monks.

This work is especially significant as the fruition of our critical efforts

to transform the 1,700 years of Korean Buddhist thought and practice into a beacon of wisdom that will illuminate possible solutions to the many problems facing the world today. Śākyamuni Buddha's teachings from 2,600 years ago were transmitted centuries ago to the Korean peninsula, where they have continuously guided countless sentient beings towards truth. *The Collected Works of Korean Buddhism* contains a portion of the fruits realized through Koreans' practice of the Buddha's wisdom and compassion.

With the successful completion of this compilation, we confirm the power of the Jogye Order executives' devotion and dedication and benefit from their collective wisdom and power. So too can we confirm through the thought of such great masters as Wonhyo, Uisang, Jinul, Hyujeong and others a key feature of Buddhism: its power to encourage people to live harmoniously with each other through mutual understanding and respect.

The current strengthening of the traditions of Buddhist meditation practice and the revitalization of the wider Korean Buddhist community through education and propagation derive in large measure from the availability of accurate, vernacular translations of the classics of the sages of old, so that we too may be imbued with the wisdom and compassion found in their writings. When the lessons of these classics are made available to a contemporary audience, they can serve as a compass to guide us toward mutual understanding so that we may realize the common good that unifies us all.

Compilation of this thirteen-volume English-language edition of *The Collected Works of Korean Buddhism* is an especially monumental achievement. To take on the task of translating these classics into English, global experts on Korean Buddhism were recruited according to their areas of expertise and were asked to consult with the scholars preparing the new Korean translations of these texts when preparing their own renderings. Though some English translations of Korean Buddhist texts have been made previously, this is the first systematic attempt to introduce to a Western audience the full range of Korean Buddhist writing. The compilation committee also sought to implement strict quality control over the translations by employing a traditional multiparty verification system, which encouraged a sustained collaboration between the Korean and English teams of translators.

This English translation of the *Collected Works* will serve as the cornerstone for the world-wide dissemination of knowledge about the Korean Buddhist tradition, which has heretofore not garnered the recognition it deserves. Together with international propagation efforts, Korean traditional temple experiences, and the temple-stay program, the English translation of the *Collected Works* will make an important contribution to our ongoing efforts to globalize Korean Buddhism. To facilitate the widest possible dissemination of both the Korean and English versions of this compilation, digital editions will eventually be made available online, so that anyone who has access to the Internet will be able to consult these texts.

Among all types of giving, the most precious of all is the gift of Dharma, and it is through sharing these teachings that we seek to spread the wisdom and compassion of Korean Buddhism, as well as the spirit of mutual understanding and unity, to people throughout the world. Our efforts to date have been to secure the foundation for the revitalization of Korean Buddhism; now is the time for our tradition to take flight. *The Collected Works of Korean Buddhism* appears at an opportune moment, when it will be able to serve as a guiding light, illuminating the way ahead for Korean Buddhism and its emerging contemporary identity.

To all those who worked indefatigably to translate, edit, and publish this collection; to the compilation committee, the researchers, translators, proofreaders, editors, and printers; and to all the administrative assistants associated with the project, I extend my deepest appreciation and thanks. Finally, I rejoice in and praise the indomitable power of Venerable Jikwan's vow to complete this massive compilation project.

With full sincerity, I offer this heartfelt wish: may all the merit deriving from this monumental work be transferred to the Buddhas, the bodhisattvas, and all sentient beings.

Haebong Jaseung (海峰 慈乘)
33rd President of the Jogye Order of Korean Buddhism
President, Compilation Committee of Korean Buddhist Thought
January 20, 2010 (2554th year of the Buddhist Era)

Preface to the English Edition of *The Collected Works of Korean Buddhism*

Buddhism has nearly a 1,700-year history in Korea and the tradition continues to thrive still today on the peninsula. Buddhism arrived in Korea from India and China by at least the fourth century C.E. and the religion served as the major conduit for the transmission of Sinitic and Serindian culture as a whole to Korea. But Korean Buddhism is no mere derivative of those antecedent traditions. Buddhists on the Korean peninsula had access to the breadth and depth of the Buddhist tradition as it was being disseminated across Asia and they made seminal contributions themselves to Buddhist thought and meditative and ritual techniques. Indeed, because Korea, like the rest of East Asia, used literary Chinese as the lingua franca of learned communication (much as Latin was used in medieval Europe), Korean Buddhist writings were disseminated throughout the entire region with relative dispatch and served to influence the development of the neighboring Buddhist traditions of China and Japan. In fact, simultaneous with implanting Buddhism on the peninsula, Korean monks and exegetes were also joint collaborators in the creation and development of the indigenous Chinese and Japanese Buddhist traditions. *The Collected Works of Korean Buddhism* seeks to make available in accurate, idiomatic English translations the greatest works of the Korean Buddhist tradition, many of which are being rendered for the first time into any Western language.

The thirteen volumes of this anthology collect the whole panoply of Korean Buddhist writing from the Three Kingdoms period (ca. 57 C.E.–668) through the Joseon dynasty (1392–1910). These writings include commentaries on scriptures as well as philosophical and disciplinary texts by the most influential scholiasts of the tradition; the writings of its most esteemed Seon adepts; indigenous collections of Seon *gongan* cases, discourses, and verse; travelogues and historical materials; and important epigraphical compositions. Where titles were of manageable length, we have sought to provide the complete text of those works. Where size was prohibitive, we have instead offered representative selections from a range

of material, in order to provide as comprehensive a set of sources as possible for the study of Korean Buddhism. The translators and editors also include extensive annotation to each translation and substantial introductions that seek to contextualize for an English-speaking audience the insights and contributions of these works.

Many of the scholars of Korean Buddhism active in Western academe were recruited to participate in the translation project. Since the number of scholars working in Korean Buddhism is still quite limited, we also recruited as collaborators Western specialists in literary Chinese who had extensive experience in English translation.

We obviously benefitted enormously from the work of our Korean colleagues who toiled so assiduously to prepare the earlier Korean edition of these *Collected Works*. We regularly consulted their vernacular Korean renderings in preparing the English translations. At the same time, virtually all the Western scholars involved in the project are themselves specialists in the Buddhist argot of literary Chinese and most already had extensive experience in translating Korean and Chinese Buddhist texts into English. For this reason, the English translations are, in the majority of cases, made directly from the source texts in literary Chinese, not from the modern Korean renderings. Since translation always involves some level of interpretation, there are occasional differences in the understanding of a passage between the English and Korean translators, but each translator retained final authority to decide on the preferred rendering of his or her text. For most of the English volumes, we also followed the collaborative approach that was so crucial in preparing the Korean translations of these *Collected Works* and held series of meetings where the English translators would sit together with our Korean counterparts and talk through issues of terminology, interpretation, and style. Our Korean collaborators offered valuable comments and suggestions on our initial drafts and certainly saved us from many egregious errors. Any errors of fact or interpretation that may remain are of course our responsibility.

On behalf of the entire English translation team, I would like to express our thanks to all our collaborators, including our translators Juhn Young

Ahn, Robert Buswell, Michael Finch, Jung-geun Kim, Charles Muller, John Jorgensen, Richard McBride, Jin Y. Park, Young-eui Park, Patrick Uhlmann, Sem Vermeersch, Matthew Wegehaupt, and Roderick Whitfield; as well as our philological consultants Chongdok Sunim, Go-ok Sunim, Haeju Sunim, Misan Sunim, Woncheol Sunim, Byung-sam Jung, and Young-wook Kim. We are also appreciative to Ven. Jaseung Sunim, the current president of the Jogye Order of Korean Buddhism, for his continued support of this project. Our deepest gratitude goes to Ven. Jikwan Sunim (May 11, 1932–January 2, 2012), one of the most eminent monks and prominent scholars of his generation, who first conceived of this project and spearheaded it during his term as president of the Jogye Order of Korean Buddhism. Jikwan Sunim's entire career was dedicated to making the works of Korean Buddhism more accessible to his compatriots and better known within the wider scholarly community. It is a matter of deep regret that he did not live to see the compilation of this English version of the *Collected Works*.

Finally, it is our hope that *The Collected Works of Korean Buddhism* will ensure that the writings of Korean Buddhist masters will assume their rightful place in the developing English canon of Buddhist materials and will enter the mainstream of academic discourse in Buddhist Studies in the West. Korea's Buddhist authors are as deserving of careful attention and study as their counterparts in Indian, Tibetan, Chinese, and Japanese Buddhism. This first comprehensive collection of Korean Buddhist writings should bring these authors the attention and sustained engagement they deserve among Western scholars, students, and practitioners of Buddhism.

Robert E. Buswell, Jr.
Distinguished Professor of Buddhist Studies, University of California, Los Angeles (UCLA)
Chair, English Translation Editorial Board, *The Collected Works of Korean Buddhism*
May 20, 2012 (2556th year of the Buddhist Era)

Above: *Seonmun yeomsong jip*, fascicle 16, published at Beopheung Monastery, Sun-an, dated 1568 (first year of reign of King Seonjo)

Below: *Seonmun yeomsong jip*, fascicle 16, published at Beopheung Monastery, Sun-an in 1678, first page of the original case of gongan 614.





Above: *Seonmun yeomsong jip*, fascicle 1, published by Daewon Monastery, Boseong, in 1636 (fourteenth year of King Injo), verse from case 2.

Below: *Seonmun yeomsong jip*, fascicle 13, published by Daewon Monastery, Boseong, in 1636 (fourteenth year of King Injo), topic raised for comment, case 550.





Above: *Seonmun yeomsong seolhwa*, volume 6 (fascicle 16 to fascicle 18), published by Seonjeong Hermitage, Anju, in 1685 (eleventh year of King Sujong)

Below: *Seonmun yeomsong seolhw*a, fascicle 16, published by Seonjeong Hermitage, Anju, in 1685; the seolhwa of case 615.





Above: *Seonmun yeomsong seolhwa,* volume 1 (fascicle one to fascicle twenty-three), published by Neungga Monastery, Paryeong-san, Jeollado in 1707 (thirty-third year of King Sukjong)

Below: *Seonmun yeomsong seolhwa*, published by Neungga Monastery, Paryeong-san, Jeollado in 1707, Preface to *Seonmun yeomsong jip*, which assumes the Seolhwa was written by Gag'un





Table of Contents

GONGAN COLLECTIONS II

Explanatory Notes

The *Seonmun yeomsong seolhwa* (gongan/koan collection) is the seventh volume in the series, the *Collected Works of Traditional Korean Thought* that the Jogye Order of Korean Buddhism is using to enhance and circulate the traditional thought of Korean Buddhism.

The translation and related matters in this volume has been guided by the Committee for the Publication of Works of Korean Traditional Thought.

One hundred gongan (koan) have been selected from the 1463 gongan of the *Seonmun yeomsong seolhwa*. Each of the selected gongan have been completely translated and annotated. Two separate texts, the *Seomun yeomsong jip* and the *Seonmun yeomsong seolhwa* have been combined for each of these gongan. This is a different system of compilation than that found in the *Seonmun yeomsong seolhwa* that is printed in the fifth volume of *Hanguk Bulgyo Jeonseo* (Complete Works of Korean Buddhism), where all of the *seolhwa* (explanation of the gongan) is given at the end of the gongan. Here the appropriate *seolhwa* part has been placed immediately following the original gongan and each of the verses and other parts found in the *Seomun yeomsong jip*.

Where doctrinal or scholastic concepts have a direct relation with the content of the text, the extent and nature of the annotation is decided on its relative importance. Where it is of little importance in the Seon context it has been dealt with briefly.

For the base text used here, see the explanation in the *Bibliographical Introduction*, part 2

With few exceptions, the text directly follows the original without indications of editing.

Sanskrit = S, Pali = P, Tibetan = T.

Square brackets [ ] indicate notes in the original text. Parentheses ( ) indicate additions by the translators to make the meaning clearer or the English more natural.

The English Translation

The first fifty gongan and associated explanations have been translated by Professor Juhn Y. Ahn, the second fifty by Dr. John Jorgensen. Attempts have been made to standardize the terminology (the technical terms for different forms of comment follow those adopted by Professor Ahn; the Seon terminology largely follows that adopted by Dr. Jorgensen as these have been used in the other volumes of the series that deal with Seon). However, in some instances the alternative version may be given in a note. This is because there are no standardized translations for many terms, and even the best dictionaries can disagree as to the meanings of the words and terms.

Even the word *gong-an* (Chinese and Korean) has different translations into English, and the Japanese word *kōan* has been adopted in English dictionaries. Although strictly speaking *gong-an* should be used for purposes of disambiguation, here *gongan* has been adopted for reasons of simplicity, and because this transcription is common to both Korean and Chinese. The problem with *koan* is that it has certain Japanese nuances and references that differ from those of *gongan*.* It is for such reasons that translators will differ in their translations and use of terms. *The Seomun yeomsong jip* and the *Seonmun yeomsong seolhwa* stand at the beginning of the gongan tradition in Korea; the later volumes on Seon in this series represent some later developments in China and the maturation of the tradition in Korea and

* See Michel Mohr, "Emerging from Nonduality: Kōan Practice in the Rinzai Tradition since Hakuin," in Steven Heine and Dale S. Wright, eds., *The Kōan: Texts and Contexts in Zen Buddhism* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2000), section titled "Shifts in the Meaning of the Word 'Kōan'", especially p. 246: "using the word 'kōan' as a generic term may be confusing. In addition, the use of kōans in the Japanese Rinzai tradition appears to be quite different from the Korean method …" As the editors of this volume in their "Introduction: Kōan Tradition: Self-Narrative and Contemporary Perspectives," pp. 5–6 note, current Western understanding of the koan has almost entirely come via the Rinzai Zen of Japan in the interpretation of D. T. Suzuki, whereas koan practice is far more diverse. See also note 1 to case 1 in this volume.

so differ from the tradition as it developed in Japan. Moreover, most of the terms are given in Chinese transcription because almost all of the material has been copied or adapted from Chinese. The *Seonmun yeomsong jip* contains only three "Korean" monks out of the 1463 cases; most of the others are Chinese or the largely legendary Indian Buddhists included in the invented Chan lineage of India.

公案集
GONGAN COLLECTIONS I

INTRODUCTION

By Kim Young-Wook
Translated by John Jorgensen

Bibliographical Introduction

1. The Hundred Cases Selected

This volume is made up of a hundred gongan cases selected from the 1463 cases of the *Seonmun yeomsong seolhwa*. Each of these cases has been completely translated and annotated. To the extent that the original text follows the sequence of the lineages of the Dharma, we have impartially selected and distributed the cases so as to not favour any one lineage or period. The *Seonmun yeomsong seolhwa* that takes up all of the fifth volume of the *Hanguk Bulgyo Jeonseo* is a combination into one book of the *Seonmun yeomsong jip* and *Seonmun yeomsong seolhwa* (hereafter abbreviated *Seolhwa*). The method of compilation of the original adopted the form of attaching the entirety of the *seolhwa* (explanation) appropriate to the case to the end of each case. However, here the method of compilation is different. We have attached the appropriate part of the seolhwa immediately after the components such as the original case, the verse and *yeom* (topic picked up for comment) and so on.

2. Bibliographical Matters

The adoption of the date 1226 for the first print of the *Seonmun yeomsong jip* is because this was the year in which Hyesim (National Teacher Jin'gak) wrote his preface. The first printed copy to which this preface was attached is not extant. The base text for the copy in volume five of the *Hanguk Bulgyo Jeonseo* is that found in the supplementary block to the re-carved Goryeo Tripitaka.[1] Although the definite date of that woodblock engraving

---

1 According to fascicle 24 of the *Goryeo-sa* (History of the Goryeo) the Tripitaka was completed over the sixteen-year period from 1236 to 1251. However, according to the carving dates of the Tripitaka blocks, it started in 1237 with the carving of two texts in 115 fascicles and ended with the

cannot be determined, in general it can be assumed to be around 1245. This corresponds to the case of the Goryeo Tripitaka blocks from *mak* to *su*.

The text for collation used in the *Hanguk Bulgyo Jeonseo* is the revised print of 1636 published by Daewon Monastery on Mt. Cheonbong (kept by Dongguk University). There are earlier printed copies such as the 1568 Beopheung Monastery print and the 1634 Yongbok Monastery of Mt. Sucheong print. Later there are the printed copies of 1682 from Daewon Monastery and the 1707 print from Neungga Monastery of Mt. Paryeong.

We do not know the period of the first print of the extant *Seorhwa*. The base texts for the *Hanguk Bulgyo Jeonseo* were those carved into blocks at Seonjeong Hermitage on Mt. Myohyang in 1684 and the woodblock text printed in the next year at Gomyo Buddha Hall in Anju (kept in the Gyujanggak Library in Seoul National University). The texts for collation were the photo-print text issued by Boryeon-gak publishers, the revised print from Neungga Monastery of Mt. Paryeong (kept at Dongguk University) and the *Hoepyeon Seonmun yeomsong jip seolhwa* (*Combination of the Seonmun yeomsong jip* and the *Seolhwa*) of unknown printing date kept in the National Central Library.

The extant *Seolhwa* is the *seolhwa* (explanation of the stories) attached by Gag'un not only to the 1125 cases in thirty fascicles that he received from Hyesim, making a total of 1463 cases. According to the "Post-face to the *Supplemented Yeomsong*" (*Jeungbo Yeomsong bal*) by Jeong An, the gongan that National Teacher Jeongjin did not have were appended later. It is not definite from extant records whether someone of a later period attached explanations to the parts besides those that Gag'un had written in his first *Seolhwa*.

Catalogue of the Tripitaka in 1248 (35th year of King Gojong), in all taking twelve years, with a total of 1469 texts and 6568 fascicles. The supplementary blocks are of fifteen texts in 231 fascicles that were not entered into the *Catalogue of the Tripitaka*.

3. The aims of the structure and compilation of the *Seonmun yeomsong jip*

The compiler was National Teacher Jin'gak, named Hyesim (1178–1234). His lay name was Choe Sik, his style was Yeongeul and his self-appellation was Mu-uija. National Teacher was a posthumous title granted by King Gojong; Hyesim was his Dharma-name.

Strictly speaking, the *Seonmun yeomsong jip* and the *Seolhwa* that explains it are two kinds of document. The *Seonmun yeomsong jip* is a voluminous collection of gongan in which Hyesim compiled over a thousand gongan cases into a single book of thirty fascicles. He recorded various kinds of explanations of the gongan classified into the forms of verses (*song*), topics picked out for comment (*yeom*), topics raised for comment (*geo*), formal sermons (*sangdang*), universal sermons (*boseol*), and informal sermons (*socham*). The representatives of these many forms; the topic picked out for comment, and the verses; make up part of the title of the book. The *Seolhwa* is an overall explanation of each section of the *Seonmun yeomsong jip*.

This literature arranges the gongan in the historical order given by the Dharma-genealogy. It begins with Śākyamuni and then commences with Kāśyapa who was made the first patriarchal teacher of the Indian Chan lineage. It presents as gongan the major incidents and dialogues of the twenty-eight patriarchal teachers from them until Bodhidharma, the first Chan patriarch of China. The dialogues and stories about the Buddha that are used as materials for his gongan do not concur with the contents of the scriptures (sutras), are material not in the scriptures. Moreover, the material of scriptures such as *the Lotus, Flower Garland* (Avataṃsaka), and *Yuanjue* sutras that come after the time of the Śākyamuni Buddha was also made into original cases (gongan).

Following such a structure in the early section, it then collects all the major stories of the Chan school as it developed in China after Bodhidharma, and so formed a gongan collection. In particular, the occasions of enlightenment of eminent monks of the Tang to Song dynasty that may be the essence of Patriarchal Teacher Chan are regarded as important

material. Here Hyesim has used as the basic materials for the *Seonmun yeomsong jip* the histories of the lamplight transmission such as the *Jingde chuandeng lu* and the recorded sayings of various masters.

However, the various kinds of Dharma text beginning with the *yeom* that reproduce the original case form the main content of this book. The *yeom* takes the original gongan as a *hwadu* (point of the story) that emits the lion's roar, which is the soaring authority of the patriarchal teachers of previous ages. The other form is the verse (*song*) of the Chan masters that condense the original case in the form of a poem. It is exactly at this point that the Patriarchal Teacher Chan that looks at the original case and the viewpoint of *ganhwa Seon* (C. *kanhua Chan*, investigation of the point of the story Chan) are clearly revealed. While dealing with the story or dialogue of the original case as a barrier-gate, it shows its nature as a gongan. In this way, while presenting various verses and *yeom* in accordance with the gongan's individual characteristics, it unfolds broadly the possibilities for inspecting the gongan.

Hyesim, who was the very first patriarchal teacher in the history of Korean Seon Buddhism to leave a recorded sayings (*eorok*) of his teaching style, together with his students compiled a huge collection of gongan he called the *Seonmun yeomsong jip*. Even though it is not an authored literary work or a recorded sayings volume, if Hyesim was not thoroughly acquainted with the appreciation of a compiler who selected the gongan, structured them, and chose *yeom*, verses, and formal sermons and the like to apply to them, he would not have been able to compile this collection. Not only that, the process of making the collection by gathering material and weaving it together reflects his intellectual viewpoint.

The "verses of Mu'uija" that are recorded in the *Seolhwa* are Hyesim's own compositions and the verses attached to the twenty-four gongan found in the *Supplement to the Recorded Sayings of National Teacher Jin'gak* (Jin'gak guksa eorok boyu) were brought into it from the Seolhwa. Because the verses are not found in other texts and because they only appear in the Seolhwa, it would seem that when Hyesim gave Gag'un his *Seonmun yeomsong jip* that he also handed over his own verses. There is a likelihood that Gag'un kept them properly and recorded them in the appropriate section. It is just

that the compiler did not stop there; he also showed his face as a Seon master who evaluated gongan himself. Even if we do not take this aspect into consideration, the chief viewpoint of the *Seolhwa*, it would not be unreasonable to suggest, was learnt by Gag'un from Hyesim who was the grand master in the field of Seon at that time.

A controversy over the authorship of the *Seolhwa* has erupted, opposing the theory that the author was the Gag'un who was a contemporary disciple of Hyesim against the claim that he was Gugok Gag'un of the late Goryeo period. However, it is reasonable to see this to be an error produced because of an identity in the names.[2] The viewpoint that the *Seolhwa* has borrowed from concepts particular to Hyesim means that there is a great possibility that its author was Hyesim's immediate disciple.

What was Hyesim's aim in compiling the *Seonmun yeomsong jip*? In the history of the Korean Seon school Hyesim was the very first person to highlight the entirety of the tenets of Patriarchal Teacher Chan and kanhua Chan. Preceding Hyesim, Bojo Jinul (1158–1210) in the same period wrote the *Ganhwa georuibon* (On the Resolution of Doubts in Ganhwa) that compared kanhua Chan methods of practice with scholastic or doctrinal Buddhism and thereby showed its characteristics. Indebted to this product, Hyesim could only base himself on the method of practice and the thinking of Patriarchal Teacher Chan and kanhua Chan alone, clearing away the content of doctrinal Buddhism as far as possible. If we see this as his foundation it is justified to see that this book realized his hopes, for he

---

2 A clear presentation of this claim is found in the "Clue to the writing by Gag'un of a masterpiece" by Yi Neunghwa in his *Joseon Bulgyo tongsa* (A General History of Korean Buddhism), part 3, pp. 528–530: "The *Yeomsong seolhwa* mostly quotes the words of Mu'uija. No-one but a pupil who had personally received his instruction could do this. So it is clear that Gag'un was Jin'gak's disciple." Here Yi Neunghwa not only clearly shows the true nature of Gag'un as the author of the *Seolhwa*, he also asserts the theory that the explanations of the *Seolhwa* were those of Jin'gak Hyesim. However, this latter assertion is a question that needs more thorough investigation. It is clear that there are parts of the *Seolhwa* that have been discovered to have been Hyesim's theories, and although it is possible to infer from that point that this was because a disciple had learned them, this does not mean that Gag'un lacked views of his own and that he should be excluded from authorship.

persistently sought to create a textbook of realistic models of investigating the *huatou* (K. *hwadu*, point of the story) and to present clever schemes for examining gongan with the appreciative eyes of patriarchal teachers. This was because he was convinced that the result of re-ordering his own thought was sufficient to be a guide for students in the future following the same path.

4. The position of the *Seonmun yeomsong jip* and the Gong-an collections through the ages

As Hyesim made clear in his "Preface," in 1226, together with his disciple Jinhun at Suseon-sa, he had gathered 1125 cases and the *yeom*, verses, formal sermons, universal sermons, and informal sermons by various patriarchal teachers on those cases. These were compiled into thirty fascicles, producing a pair with the *Jingde chuandeng lu*.

In the same category of gong-an collections as the *Seonmun yeomsong jip* are the *Zongmen tongyao* (The Complete Essentials of the Chan School) in ten fascicles compiled by Huiyan Zongyang of the Song dynasty in 1133 and the *Zongmen tongyao xuji* in twenty-two fascicles that supplemented Zongyang's compilation with an extra twelve fascicles compiled by Gulin Qingmao in the Yuan dynasty.

In 1257 in the Song dynasty, Zuqing recompiled the *Nian bafang zhuyu ji* (Collection of Gongan Selected for Comment that are the Pearls and Jade of the Chan Masters of All Directions) and printed it. This was a book that picked out and evaluated the core of each of the 319 gongan of four Chan masters who were pupils of Wuzu Fayan: namely Taiping Huiqiao, Yuanwu Keqin, Fang'an Zongxian, and Shiqi Xinyue. Originally, as can be seen even in its title of *Chanmen bafang zhuyu ji*, this was a gongan collection that attached evaluations in the form of *yeom* (topic picked up for comment) to the gongan it recorded, the *Chanmen bafang zhuyu ji* is not extant.

Besides these, there are six collections from the Song dynasty of verses on old cases (*songgu*) that have verses on the gongan. They are: the hundred cases of Fenyang's verses on old cases written by Fenyang Shanzhao in the

reign of Emperor Zhenzong (998–1022); the hundred cases of Xuedou's verses on old cases written by Xuedou Chongxian of the Tianxi reign (1017–1021); the hundred cases of Danxia's verses on old cases written by Danxia Zizhun of the Chongning reign (1102–1106); the hundred cases of Hongzhi's verses on old cases written by Hongzhi Zhengjue in the Shaoxing reign (1131–1162); sixty-four cases of Wumen's verses on old cases written by Wumen Huikai in the Shaoding era (1228–1233); and the hundred cases of Xutang's verses on old cases compiled by Danxia Zizhu written in the Ganzhun reign (1265–1274). Of these, the Xuedou verses on old cases, the Hongzhi verses on old cases, the Wumen verses on old cases, and the Danxia verses on old cases appeared in a new format of gongan collections in which capping phrases and prose evaluations were added as recorded in the *Biyan lu*, *Congrong lu*, *Wumen'guan*, and *Xutang ji* respectively.

Besides these there were also the *Xuean Congjin chanshi songgu* in which Xuean Congjin (1117–1200) added verses to thirty-eight gongan. In the Song dynasty, Touzi Yiqing selected a hundred gongan and added verses to them, and later Danxia Zizhun appended instructions to the assembly and capping phrases to these, and in the Yuan dynasty, Linquan Conglun added prose comments to form the *Konggu ji* in six fascicles. It is a representative gongan collection.

The *Biyan lu*, *Congrong lu*, *Konggu ji*, and the *Xutang ji* share the formats of being constituted of the original cases, the provided instructions (introductions 垂示) that correspond to prefaces to each case, instructions to the assemblies, capping phrases to each phrase of the original case and the verses, the prose comments that explain the original case, and the prose comments on the verses. The *Xuedou songgu zhizhu* (Direct Commentary on Xuedou's Verses on Old Cases) in two fascicles written by Tianqi Benrui of the Ming dynasty took the form of attaching capping phrases to every sentence of the hundred cases and verses on old cases by Xuedou.

Although such gongan collections that are centered on the verses on the ancient cases were mostly compiled on the standard of a hundred cases and expanded on the bases of a Chan master's verses, the *Seonmun yeomsong jip* is distinguished from them by being a comprehensive gongan collection that

has gathered all the categories of evaluation starting with the various Chan masters' verses on each single gongan. Although the *Songgu lianzhu tongji* (Complete Collection of a Rosary of Verses on Old Cases) in forty fascicles that was printed in 1179 and reprinted in 1392, is seen as a precursor of the *Seonmun yeomsong jip*, there is also a possibility that the *Seonmun yeomsong jip* rather had an influence on the reprint. In it there is recorded a total of 818 cases. After the *Zongmen nian'gu huiji* (United Collection of Old Cases Taken Up for Comment of the Chan School) in forty-five fascicles that was printed in 1664, it was supplemented and recorded a total of 1700 cases, and was printed in 1714 as the *Zongjian falin* (Dharma Forest of the Mirror of the Lineage), which recorded a total of 2720 cases.

The *Seonmun yeomsong jip*, with the exception of the category of the collections of verses on old cases, belongs to the comparatively early period in the history of comprehensive gongan collections. Moreover, although there were earlier gongan collections, this book alone was evaluated as very valuable for its material and the fact it had very many words on enlightenment incidents and verses and selected comments (*nian'gu*, *yeomsong*).

5. The Seon methods of the *Seonmun yeomsong jip* and *Seolhwa*

5-1. The function of the huatou

Each single material of the *Seonmun yeomsong jip* that is recorded so extensively is a guide to the practice of kanhua Chan and displays a fundamental tendency to decode Chan language. However, in this field it would not be easy for people without some study of this to understand what the given gongan, *yeom*, verses and so on indicate. Even for people who had long studied Chan, it would not be so simple to apprehend the meaning revealed by a single verse.

This book tries to clarify what the Chan method is throughout its entirety,

picking out the usual content and asking what the function of the keyword or *huatou* of the gongan is. Being such a difficult barrier-gate, this is a job that obviously cannot deal with it using the usual tools of discrimination. As such this method of study therefore is rejected. One only can seek a direct method to reveal the truth of these *huatou* and that commences from knowing what a *huatou* is. If one establishes a certain amount of knowledge about this, one can prepare a foundation for approaching the true meaning of the various *huatou* that are presented in the book that were desires to know.

Above all, all the words of the gongan that are composed of dialogues and stories, as subject matter, must be made into weapons to destroy the impediments and undo the bonds of consciousness. The role of such a master craftsman is the assignment given to every person who faces a gongan. The fearful weapon is another word, the *huatou*. The people who show embodied within themselves these guides and make *huatou* in this way, are the group known as the patriarchal teachers, and the *yeom* and verses and so forth are exemplars of the weapons that they hone and polish.

The *huatou* destroys the form of all words and makes powerless the content that they carry. It is another word to waken one to the tyranny and authority of words that influence one daily without one even knowing it. The *huatou* is not different from the shout of Linji or the blows of Deshan[3] that were brandished and struck no matter whether they encountered the Buddha or patriarchal teachers, and which drive one into a dilemma that cannot grasp any meaning or any reason. However, investigators of the *huatou* must know that in fact these actions of Linji and Deshan become the new objects of ridicule. This in itself is because at each time it is only one *huatou* (that the student is investigating). If it is not so, then the favor of the blows and shouts that free from these tense feelings will instead become a noose that strangles them.

Likewise, the *huatou* that is presented by a gongan is destroyed by another *huatou*. This is not attributed to a feeble attribute of the constitution of the

---

3 See the first note to case 672.

huatou as a *huatou*. All the words of the verses or *yeom* and so on are not kind guides that lead you through the story or a weapon that withdraws one from such gongan of the original case. However, even that one weapon also cannot but be hit by a different poisoned arrow, and it itself willingly allows that to happen. The meaning of a *huatou* being a weapon is that to that extent it is a sacrificial good for another weapon.[4]

5-2. The equality of the huatou

The ideal Buddha used as a subject of gongan is not to be regarded as wise or of an elevated rank, and an ordinary person is not to be nailed down as stupid or of a mean rank. If he is despised, then both are despised; if one is valued then both are valued. This is the thorough-going equality in the *huatou*.

Such examples can be discovered in the verse of Yuanwu Keqin in which Kāśyapa rebukes Mañjuśrī for spending the summer retreat period profligately, but there was no contest for superiority between them; they exist equally.[5] In this gongan, Mañjuśrī plays an indispensible role in which he violates the precepts and Kāśyapa practices perfectly the role of trying to expel Mañjuśrī from the assembly. Here Mañjuśrī is described as freely developing his own boundaries and Kāśyapa is depicted keeping strictly to the rules and being slightly uptight. It takes two parties to complete the gongan. Of them, nobody is correct and nobody is wrong. Although people who have completely different views are put in place, if they are correct they are all correct, and if they are wrong they are all wrong. It is a consistent comment of Chan masters that what separated these two was the cutting

4 The story in the formal sermon of Jinshan Liaoyuan of case 2 in this book of a cicada, a praying mantis, a goldfinch and a hunter being food for each other in that sequence is a metaphor that shows this nature of the *huatou*.

5 See number 4, old case 33.

off of the discrimination of right and wrong. Here it is not necessary to remember that Kāśyapa was the first patriarch of the Chan school who directly received the Dharma from the Buddha and so forth. These two figures were probably only stage props for the gongan.

The reason that the contents of the scriptures could be adopted as gongan is because of the nature of kanhua Chan. It can institute them as a *huatou* that restructures all the subject matters of stories. Therefore it cannot but be essentially different in the aspects of form and content from the meaning of the scriptures as explained in doctrinal Buddhism. The abundant reasons for them often having sections that contradict the original sentences, even while quoting the scriptures, and developing them into a completely different reality reside in this.

In the *seolhwa* concerning the "Preface" to the *Seonmun yeomsong jip*, an affirmative sentence of the *Diamond Sutra* was changed into a negative form. This method is stipulated as a characteristic of Patriarchal Teacher Chan. This touches on the nature of the *huatou* that leaves absolutely no traces of seeking via discrimination. And so it says, "it has absolutely no remnants of a technique of discrimination, rooting out the whole right down to the roots."[6] Seen from the viewpoint of kanhua Chan, whether it was from the recorded sayings of the patriarchal teachers or a scripture, this was because the *huatou* was instituted in order that no verbal comments can be penetrated through the framework of discrimination.

At the same time, that *huatou*, whether it is the words of the scriptures or the words of the man in the street, is overturned and re-adjusted endlessly, and it is polished and transformed until it becomes a sharp blade, and does not straightforwardly accept the original form. If you say the beans are the field, although it will of course be overturned and reversed, it is impartial in that it must use a technique that plugs the mouths that correctly says beans are beans.

---

6 See Gag'un's "Preface" to the *Seonmun yeomsong jip* and note 7 to that.

5-3. The live sentences of reversal

When the words of the patriarchal teachers and the teachings of the scriptures were correctly instituted and are accompanied by investigation in conformity with that, they are called "live sentences." If that is not so, and unnecessary discrimination is applied, they are only "dead sentences."

It is not to be thought that Chan masters of Patriarchal Teacher Chan made the words presented by the Buddhas and patriarchs in the gongan into exemplary rules and preserved correctly the essence of those words and the method of receiving them. Many of the authors of the *yeom* and verses did not agree with the presented *huatou* as it is, and by making a critical evaluation and explanation, this leads to live sentences. Following on through another *yeom* and verse, this method of using them was to follow with a reversal, displaying another critical appreciation. An example of such a reversal is the format wherein Yunmen Wenyan responded to the presentation by Panshan Baoji of a realm in which all object and subject have disappeared with a discriminated and clearly differentiated world.[7]

No one will agree that the *yeom* and the verses will overcome the conclusions of firmly established theories about a gongan. Rather, in this way it pretends to thoroughly discard them, and when one is about to be ensnared they are only used as a technique of waking one. It was a commonplace for patriarchal teachers to remove vain concepts with a pitying and kind mind via a gongan. However, even though it tossed out a single word, it did not offer a roost where one can rest safely. If you think you can approach it thinking that there is something to be grasped or gained, you will not be able to penetrate through the barrier-gates of the patriarchal teachers. Why? This is because you will fall completely into a dead sentence due to that thinking, no matter whether it is a gongan or a *yeom* or a verse. The "live sentences" indicate so that you will continuously cast off all frameworks of discrimination and cognition, and opens up the air ways to take off always

---

7 See note 12 to case 250.

with a new step.[8] The Chan master who directly sets up his own barrier-gate prepares for it to collapse at the hands of anybody, which is an ideal, and accepts that contentedly. It is this very person who is a true friend who understands you and your motives. It is dangerous if you accept it as is and you are overwhelmed by the authority of the words of past people as if they are models for eternity and you do not see the nature of the gongan. By doing this you not only fetter yourself with these words, you also kill the living, moving *huatou*.

Not any gongan of an original case itself can be a live sentence. Due to critical comments that breathe life into each single word that are a component, a gongan appears on the scene as a *huatou*. When it is being tempered by an experienced and skilled Chan master, all the trivial causations are resuscitated as live sentences. If you do not depend on their hands then all the sentences of the twelve-part teachings of the doctrine, and the words and deeds of the Chan masters cannot become living sentences and be shown as such to us.

People confronting a gongan must be able to exhibit the positive implication in the negative form, and must know how to wield the sharp sword of negation in the affirmative form.[9] Any comment of kanhua Chan about a gongan does not remove the thickness that tries to suffocate the gongan, and on the other hand it does not broaden the means to live when you toss out the sparse net.

If you are bound by a word or sentence in the gongan given to you, whatever it is, it will become a dead sentence. The words of the Dharma texts and dialogues that are exchanged for the most part are tasteless live sentences that cannot be approached via discrimination. Therefore, the moment you analyze the characteristic meaning and symbol concerning this, that sentence

---

8 See note 57 of case 181 and note 12 of case 1069.

9 This speaks of a method instituted so that one does not settle on total negation or total affirmation. See note 123 of case 2.

will fall into a dead sentence. We must know beforehand the point that these *huatou* are presented as the barrier-gate that is the core of the study.

Who are the individuals who appear in the original case and the people who create new barrier-gates by attaching *yeom* and verses to the original case? They are free people who besides rejecting all authority and outward appearance, and being only thorough in their original endowment, set up the method of unlocking that barrier-gate, and having unlocked it, lock it again. No matter how excellent a patriarchal teacher of past ages, you cannot limit the knowledge of those people who have investigated their original endowment. Their single words break down rigid concepts that have been firmly held and shake off like something useless the highest ideals that have been carefully cherished through the ages.

Even though you know that no matter whether it is Buddha or a patriarchal teacher, or Buddha-nature or True Thusness converted into a *huatou*, it is only a surface of an ideal that is not revived and is likely only an empty word wrapped up. It is like an officially gazetted chronic disease for which there is no method of treatment. If these are born as new things by going into the furnace of the *huatou*, they will change into live sentences that are not bound by the prescription of some meaning, having removed all restraints of high and low or valuable and cheap. The feigned method, like the master teaching and the disciple learning, is the typical framework of the live sentence. In a severe way, only the words of the master thrown to the student are not a barrier-gate, even the words and deeds of the disciple who receives the teaching and whose errors are pointed out for the most part conceal daggers. They must recognize clearly that assistance in the mutual creation of a barrier-gate. You must not try to apprehend the meaning of the gongan by separating out its relative merits beforehand. Even though it is common sense to use the intentional trick that thinks that the person of the gongan is superior to his opponent, this is the lock of the barrier-gate that deceives easily. Because there are many kinds of words and deeds that are enticing traps, the moment one accepts them with common-sense thought, one will end up falling into a trap. If we try to understand them with the stories accumulated in our consciousness or the feelings that

resemble concepts as given, we will definitely not be able to confront them properly. In this way the words of the gongan must have an appreciation that sees through and skillfully uses our prejudices. Therefore the heroes of the gongan confront the trap dug by the opponent with yet another trap. In circumstances where the opponent leads them to deceive themselves, they unfold a strategy to fight against it with a new deception.

For this reason, the kind guides of kanhua Chan lead us to confront and crush the effectiveness of our tools of thought-discrimination. In front of this tasteless *huatou*, all the bundles of meaning cannot be called an effective tool and become a useless burden that the body carries in vain and with difficulty.

6. The Explanatory Method of the *Seolhwa*

According to the "Preface to Old Selected *Hwadu*" (Goyeomhwa bal) by Uju Ong, National Teacher Jin'gak gave the *Seonmun yeomsong jip* in thirty fascicles that was compiled from all sorts of recorded sayings and lamplight-transmission histories to Gag'un, and Gag'un accepted the command and so wrote the *Seolhwa* at Suseon-sa. The author, Gag'un, was a disciple of Hyesim, but we know virtually nothing of his life besides the fact that he wrote the *Seolhwa*.

Although the comments of the *Seolhwa* are not applied to every sentence, it usually gives directions clearly and very kindly to sections. It often gives detailed descriptions in the cases of scriptural context or an allusion. However, there are not a few places where the quoted sentence at times does not agree with the source authority or it has the overall idea wrong. Cases appear where weight is given to doctrinal content or the dialogues and verses are so condensed that they are instead obscured. According to such viewpoints, the explanation by the *Seolhwa* may possibly also be evaluated as having devalued the original intention of the *Seonmun yeomsong jip*. This agrees with the claim that the *Seolhwa* over scrutinizes and opposes the original characteristics possessed by the gongan and the verses and so on.

In a later period, Seosan Hyujeong quoted from the *seolhwa* for the first case that says "As time is unhindered and place is unhindered, and beginning and end are on a single thread, so the very last sentence is also the very first sentence, and the very first sentence is also the very last sentence." Having summed up its import, he wrote, "However, in our Seon Gate, originally there is no such discussion. I fear that if people discuss it (they will think that) they know the *Dharma*."[10] This is a criticism of making a framework of discrimination and applying it as a means of understanding the gongan.

The method of interpreting gongan as in the *Seolhwa* is also found in gongan collections like the *Biyan lu* and *Congrong lu*. This corresponds to the prose evaluations of the original cases or verses seen in these collections. The reason that Dahui Zonggao had for burning the *Biyan lu* was because he saw the abuse among students of accepting the explanations of the *Biyan lu* uncritically, leading to an increase in discrimination and ignoring of real practice. This has a similar context as the possibility of a latent criticism of the *Seolhwa*.

The *Seolhwa* borrows not a little for its commentary on the verses from the *Chanmen zhuzushi gesong* (Gathas and Verses of the Patriarchal Teachers of the Chan School) in four fascicles written by Zisheng of the Song dynasty. It also takes the format of attaching capping phrases to each line of the verses. The *Seolhwa* adopted and accepted fully the formats of such earlier gongan collections.

Although all of the cases following in this book have to be translated, annotated, and meticulously analyzed, and through that work, if we look at what has been excerpted to date here, we can discover a coherent viewpoint of the explanations of the original cases or verses and so on, but we can also find sections that are not coherent. Therefore, even though Gag'un was the person leading the writing of the *Seolhwa* as a whole, we cannot completely exclude the idea that another author participated in writing part of it. Even though they may have been disciples of Hyesim, it could be that they were

10 *Selections from Hyujeong*, "Seongyo seok," Differences of Seon and Doctrine section.

not members of the legitimate lineage of Hyesim's headquarters, Gwansim Monastery.

Even though such suspicions remain, Gag'un was influenced by the core of Hyesim's method of Seon, and it is almost certain that he created a collection of explanations in the *Seolhwa* that accords with Hyesim's Seon thought. We can know that relationship of influence from the Dharma talks Hyesim gave to Gag'un. "If you can understand this then you will understand that a mortar mouth will produce flowers and the Buddha's face will flush with embarrassment. Since you have understood this, you will understand that when the ox of Huaizhou eats grain, the stomach of the horse of Yizhou had a bloated stomach."[11] As Hyesim gave Gag'un this *hwadu*, and most of the Dharma texts with which he led Gag'un have not escaped the influence of Patriarchal Teacher Chan, we can be certain that Hyesim influenced the writing of the *Seolhwa*.

Moreover, in the *seolhwa* of Hyesim's "Preface to the *Seonmun yeomsong jip*," by highlighting the meaning that is based on the Seon method of Patriarchal Teacher Chan, Gag'un reveals the fundamental viewpoint that explains this text.

> What are the similarities and differences of Tathāgata/Thus Come Chan and Patriarchal Teacher Chan? Thus Come Chan is the view that it is good that mountains are mountains and waters are waters, and so each single dharma is real. Patriarchal Teacher Chan pulls out roots and all, leaving absolutely no methods of discrimination. For instance, the words of the *Diamond Sutra*, 'If you see that characteristics/marks are not characteristics, you will not know the Buddha's meaning' reveal the standpoint of Thus Come Chan. The words of Fayan, 'If you see that characteristics are not characteristics, you will not know the Buddha's meaning,' that differ from the sutra reveal the standpoint of Patriarchal Teacher Chan. Again, the aspect that is revealed in the Buddha dharma

11 "Instructions to Eminence Gag'un" in *Jin'gak eorok*, HBJ 6.296b2.

is called Thus Come Chan, and the absence of even the slightest aspect revealed in the Buddha dharma is called Patriarchal Teacher Chan."[12]

If we examine such words, we can know that the direct disciple of Hyesim, Gag'un, had an ideological relationship and solidarity with his master. The compiler of the *Seonmun yeomsong jip* and the author of the *Seolhwa* in this way had a close intellectual connection.

There are also places where we can discover the direct influence of Hyesim. The *seolhwa* of case 74 uses the framework for the explanation of the concepts of "thrift and extravagance". This is a terminology peculiar to Hyesim that cannot be found in other Chan literature.[13] The method of mediating a dialogue as a barrier-gate by paralleling identity and separation[14] as a theory frequently used in kanhua Chan was taught to Gag'un by Hyesim. The concepts of "directly gained without limit" that is often seen in the *Seolhwa* are a characteristic usage of Gag'un which were used frequently according to the circumstances. As he was not furnished with his own appreciation in the explanations of the gongan, it is easy to see such a feature.

Overall, the standpoint that the *Seolhwa* adopts in explaining the *Seonmun yeomsong jip* had the identical line as the Chan thought represented by Hyesim. This is a viewpoint reflecting overall the accumulated theory and practice of Chan masters that practiced the investigation of the *huatou* in the intellectual sphere of Patriarchal Teacher Chan until the time of Hyesim and Gag'un.

---

12 See note 1 in "Preface to the *Seonmun yeomsong jip*."

13 See note 12 of case 74.

14 See the *seolhwa* to case 108.

SEONMUN YEOMSONG SEOLHWA

- 禪門拈頌說話 -

Preface to the *Seonmun yeomsong jip* 禪門拈頌集序

I wish to report that ever since the World Honored One transmitted it to Kāśyapa there has been a transmission from generation to generation, a continuing lamplight to lamplight without end,[1] a personal conferral.[2] This is regarded as the proper transmission. What that proper transmission personally confers is not something that does not have words and meaning; it is something that words and meaning are inadequate to reach. Therefore, although it is an indication and an exposition, it does not rely on letters and just transmits mind to mind. Those who love phenomena record these traces[3] assiduously and convey them in books that have been transmitted to the present, so these coarse traces really are not worth valuing. However,

1 The lamplight expresses the light of enlightenment or the news of the original endowment. The possession of that lamplight and the transmission through the generations only to the most suitable disciple as the heir is called transmission of the lamplight or the transmission of the Dharma. In the Chan school this is the lineage that continues on from the Buddha without interruption.

2 "Personal conferral" means that the lineage of the Chan school goes through a direct transmission from master to disciple and does not depend on an indirect method or another expedient means. This is the same as "personal transmission." *Buchok: bu* or conferral has the sense of transmitting something; *chok* is earnestly requesting something. It is used in the sense of the Buddha or the lineage master widely transmitting the tenets of the lineage and entrusting the disciples to circulate them extensively. "In the past the Thus Come personally conferred the Storehouse of the Eye (Appreciation) of the Great Dharma on Kāśyapa, and this was then transferred from generation to generation until it reached me. I now confer it on you so that you will protect and cherish it." *Jingde chuandeng lu* 1, "Biography of Ceṭaka," T 2076.51.208a8ff.

3 "Traces" mean the manifold traces of the teachings that explain a fundamental principle. This is contrasted to the original, that which expresses the fundamental principle. "The original is the original/root of the principle, that is, the true characteristic, a single ultimate Way. Traces are the various (teachings) remaining once the true characteristics of the dharmas are excluded and these are all called traces. Also, principle, together with phenomena, is called the original; the preaching about principle and about phenomena are all named the traces of the teaching." *Fahua xuanyi* by Zhiyi, T 1716.33.764b11ff.

that does not prevent one from following the flow and reaching the source or depending on the branches to know the root/origin. Those who obtain the origin or the source, even though they speak of it in different ways, have always hit the mark, and those who have not obtained this, even though they have eliminated words and have kept to that have always been deluded.[4]

For this reason the venerable elders[5] from all over are not alienated from letters[6] and not sparing of compassion, sometimes (using) examination,[7] topics picked up for comment,[8] substitute answers,[9] separate answers,[10] and verses or songs to display the profound tenets and leave them to later

4 From "Those who obtain the origin" to here are an adaptation of lines of "Preface to the Wuling Collection" in Qisong's *Xinjin wenji*, T 2115.52.704a23ff.

5 "Venerable elders" is a term of praise for monks who have practiced for a long time and are of eminent virtue. It is the same as senior elders 老宿.

6 "They obtained the tenets beyond words and therefore they only took up the general meaning from lectures; they raised the outlines of the themes and were not bogged down in name and form. They caused the hearers to dimly get it by themselves, know that it is within them, is not related to letters, and yet still they do not alienate them from letters." *Bu xu gaoseng zhuan* (Supplement to the Continuation of Biographies of Eminent Monks) 2, "Biographies of Benru and Zilin," XZJ 134.58b15ff.

7 A question about the case of a gongan, and in a form of an inquiry it is raised again. Examples are case 399 and the investigation of Xuanjue, and the investigation of Yunju Qingxi of case 598. It is a form found in *Jingde chuandeng lu* 27, "The topics raised (for comment), investigations, topics picked up (for comment), substitute answers, and separate answers," T 2076.51.434b29ff., that contains the forms of topics raised for comment, topics picked up for comment, substitute answers, and different answers, along with investigations.

8 A method of raising, selecting, and picking out only the core of the gongan. It is a form, along with verses, that makes up the heart of this book.

9 "Substitute answers": When either of the parties in a dialogue has nothing to say, these are answers made to substitute for them. There are two types. 1. When a lineage teacher is giving a Dharma talk, he speaks substituting for a student: Indicates cases where no one from the assembly can respond or speak in agreement with the truth about the lineage teacher's Dharma talks or question, the lineage teacher himself speaks instead of the assembly. The separate answer and the substitute answer are regarded as having begun with Yunmen Wenyan, and these two forms are found frequently in the *Yunmen guanglu*. 2. When a person of the past could not answer at that time, and a person now

people. So then if all those who wish to open the correct eye/vision, possess the profound opportunity,[11] and extract the different kinds of beings[12] from the ensnaring three realms[13] and discard (these words), then by what means can they do it? How much more then that none of the materials from ever since the Ancestral Saint[14] of this court united the three (Han)[15]

---

answers instead: Indicates when a lineage teacher looks at a student's response and raises a question, and he picks up a gongan of a person of the past to which a student had nor replied, and now the lineage teacher answers instead of that student.

10 Although the person of the past had an answer, these are different words from the standpoint of another, a third person. It indicates answering with his view that differs in content from the existing answer made during a dialogue exchanged between other Chan masters. "When in the abbot's quarters (a student) requests the benefit (of instruction) about the gongan of a person of the past which has yet to be concluded well, and (the student) requests an answer as a substitute, or when (the answer to the gongan) does not measure up, and (the student) requests a separate (answer) to it, they are therefore named 'substitute and separate.'" *Fenyang yulu*, XZJ 120.130b14ff. "In raising an old case, even though the person of old had an answer, I also separately hand down a turning word. That is called a separate answer. They are seen in various records and are not the same as substitute answers." Mujaku, *Zenrinshokisen* 11.

11 "Profound opportunity." This is the opportunity for enlightenment that cannot be known through thought and discrimination. It means the opportunity that is the basis for showing the realm of Chan. "Chan practitioners have a profound opportunity, and that profound opportunity is correct and then wrong. If you wish to realize the tenets before the opportunity, then everything should be distant from the sentences (of the tetralemma)." *Jingde chuandeng lu* 12, "Biography of Chen Cao," T 2076.51.296b15. "Therefore the perfect person conceals his profound opportunity before the signs appear, and hides his subtle movements just (as things are going to) change." *Zhaolun*, T 1858.45.161a12.

12 Literally the four kinds of birth: from eggs, wombs, moisture, and transformation. These are discriminated and described in *Da bibosha lun* 120, T 1545.27.626b2ff. and *Yuqie shidi lun* 2, T 1579.30.288b12ff.

13 From "extracting" to here is a phrase that appears in Dahui Zonggao's "recorded sayings," the *Dahui yulu* 4, T 1998A.47.825c29.

14 The Ancestral Sage is the first ancestor of the Goryeo dynasty, King Taejo, Wang Geon (877–943). This is the most respectful title for him, meaning he was the founder of the dynasty with the virtue of a saint; also in the sense of a primal ancestor of saintly virtue.

15 The Three Han indicate the Ma Han, Jin Han, and Byeon Han of the southern part of the Korean peninsula in antiquity. Also used as a word for the Korean peninsula.

and used the Way of Seon to extend the fortunes of the country and with wise discussion[16] warded off the armies of neighbors[17] and enlightening to the themes (of Buddhism) and discussing the Way, is more urgent than this (book)? Therefore students of the Seon school (desired this book) like thirsty people looking for a drink or like starving people who long for food. I have been strongly requested (for this) by these students, and mindful of the Ancestral Sage (Wang Geon)'s original thought, and so hoping to offer up good fortune for the state, and to be of aid to the Buddha-dharma, I led my disciple Jinhun and others, and selected and collected old stories, in all 1125 cases,[18] together with *yeom* and verses[19] of the masters and the essential records of their words, and formed them into thirty fascicles in order to pair (this book) with the *Transmission of the Lamplight*.[20]

What I hope for is the wind of Yao and the wind of Seon blow forever,

---

16 "Wise discussion." Looking at the following content, it indicates the "wise discussion" of the Seon school recorded in this book, the *Seonmun yeomsong jip*. Moreover, the pairing of the "Way of Seon" with "wise discussion" means it has the overall sense of Buddhist doctrinal teachings. As seen in the next footnote, when Sangchong quoted this line it had exactly this meaning.

17 From the words "used the Way of Seon to extend" to here can be found in a memorial to King Taejo of Joseon by Sangchong concerning the unity of the Seon school and the Doctrinal school. See "Memorial from Abbot Sangchong of Heungcheon Monastery," 13th day of the 5th month of the 7th year, *Taejo sillok* (Veritable Records of the Reign of King Taejo).

18 There are 1463 cases extant. This is because a further 347 cases were added to the original 1125 cases. What we have is the recompiled text.

19 *Yeom* is a form of evaluation in prose that picks up the case of the gongan. The *song* is a verse about it.

20 "Transmission of the Lamplight" is a work recording the enlightenment occasions that were related to the transmission of the Dharma through the generations of the Chan school. The transmission of the Dharma means that the lamplight of enlightenment is transmitted through the generations just as a lamplight is transmitted continuously on a dark night. It is usually called the *Chuandeng lu* and indicates the *Jingde chuandeng lu* of 1004. The beginning of the making of the lamplight record was in the northern and southern dynasties and the lamplight record proper was produced after the Chan school was established. While it continued through the ages and reached its height in the Song dynasty, these works of lamplight records continued to be written on the lineage

that the sun of Shun and the sun of the Buddha always shine,[21] that the sea calms and the rivers become clear, that the seasons are mild and the harvests plentiful, that everything has its own place, and each family purely enjoys nothing to be concerned about. My insignificant feelings are most earnest about this. I regret that we have not been able to read all of the recorded sayings of the masters and I fear there are omissions. I await later wise people to (fill in) the incomplete sections.

Fourteenth year of the Zhenyou reign,[22] *byeongsul*, mid-winter,[23] preface by Mu-uija at Suseon-sa on Mt. Jogye in Haedong (Korea).

詳夫自世尊迦葉已來, 代代相承, 燈燈無盡, 遆相密付, 以爲正傳. 其正傳密付之處, 非不該言義, 言義不足以及. 故雖有指陳, 不立文字, 以心傳心而已. 好事者强記其迹, 載在方冊, 傳之至今, 則其麤迹, 固不足貴也. 然不妨尋流而得源, 據末而知本. 得乎本源者, 雖萬別而言之, 未始不中也, 不得乎此者, 雖絶言而守之, 未始不惑也. 是以諸方尊宿, 不外文字, 不悋慈悲, 或徵或拈, 或代或別, 或頌或歌, 發揚奧旨, 以貽後人. 則凡欲開正眼, 具玄機, 羅籠三界, 提拔四生者, 捨此奚以哉? 況本朝自祖聖, 會三已後, 以禪道延國祚, 智論鎭隣兵, 而悟宗論道之資, 莫斯爲急! 故宗門學者,如渴之望飮, 如飢之思食. 余被學徒力請, 念祖聖本懷, 庶欲奉福於國家, 有裨於佛法, 乃率門人眞訓等, 採集古話, 凡

succession in the Yuan, Ming, and Qing dynasties. Besides the *Jingde chuandeng lu* there are another four texts that make up the "Five Lamplight (Records)". They are: *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (1101), *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* (1148), *Liandeng huiyao* (1183), and *Jiatai pudeng lu* (1204). Before the five lamplight records were established, there were the *Baolin zhuan* and *Zutang ji*.

21 This means the harmony of Confucianism and Buddhism. Yao and Shun were mythical sage emperors venerated by Confucians for their ideal governance. This passage and the references to Wang Geon and the use of Seon by the Goryeo court suggests this preface was largely addressed to the court, and the initial words, "I wish to report" largely confirm this, as these words 詳夫 are used by a junior to report to a senior.

22 The Zhenyou reign was from 1213 to 1216 and was the reign name of King Xuanzong of the Jin. According to the cyclical number of *byeongsul*, Zhenyou 14 would correspond to 1226. This was when Hyesim was forty-nine years old.

23 Middle of winter; the eleventh month of the lunar calendar

一千一百二十五則, 幷諸師拈頌等語要錄, 成三十卷, 以配傳燈. 所冀, 堯風與禪風永扇, 舜日共佛日恒明, 海晏河清, 時和歲稔, 物物各得其所, 家家純樂無爲. 區區之心, 切切於此耳. 弟恨諸家語錄, 未得盡覽, 恐有遺脫. 所未盡者, 更待後賢.

貞祐十四年, 丙戌, 仲冬, 海東曹溪山修禪社, 無衣子序.

Preface to *Seonmun yeomsong jip* 禪門拈頌集序[24]

Seon (Chan) is as Guifeng says,[25] "In full, *channa*,[26] which in Chinese is thought cultivation[27] or calmed thinking. These are all general terms for *samādhi* and *prajñā*.[28]"[29] If we look at this, then this is the single-taste

24 This is the *seolhwa* (explanation) of the previous preface by Hyesim. It is assumed that the author was Gag'un. Each of the words of "Preface to *Seonmun yeomsong jip*" are explained one by one, and partially by highlighting the idea that distinguishes Patriarchal Teacher Chan from Thus Come Chan, and that the *Seonmun yeomsong jip* is based on Patriarchal Teacher Chan, it shows that this is the fundamental viewpoint for reading this text.

25 Guifeng Zongmi (780–841), a member of both the Chan and Huayan schools who tried to classify and justify Chan in terms of doctrine. His works were very influential on Bojo Jinul, the master of Hyesim.

26 S. *dhyāna*. Chan is an abbreviation of this transliteration. It was transcribed in a number of ways. See also *Jusha lunji* 28, T 1821.41.417c26ff.

27 Also written "practice and cultivation of thought" or "thought settled."

28 If either of *samādhi* and *prajñā* are absent it is not Chan/dhyāna. In its full sense, these two must be substantially perfected. Accordingly, the "calmed" of "calmed thinking" corresponds to *samādhi* and the "thinking" to *prajñā*. Zongmi's *Yuanjue jing lueshuzhu* 1, (T 1795.39.527a23ff.) has the same content. "And so the Dharma that is transmitted does not go beyond *samādhi* and *prajñā*. If enlightenment and cultivation/practice, or sudden and gradual (practice and enlightenment), lack *samādhi* and lack *prajñā*, this is madness and is stupidity. If you are based on only one of these, this is an ignorant, perverse view. When these operate as a pair they form the Venerated among Humans

Chan of the separate transmission outside of the teachings.[30] How are Thus Come Chan and Patriarchal Teacher Chan the same or different? Thus Come Chan is that mountains are mountains and waters are waters, each single dharma being entirely true; Patriarchal Teacher Chan pulls out roots and all, in the end there is no clue.[31] As the (*Diamond*) sūtra says, "If you see the characteristics as not being characteristics, that is to see the Thus Come (Tathāgata)," which is Thus Come Chan. As Fayan says, "If you see characteristics as not being characteristics, that is not to see the Thus Come," which is Patriarchal Teacher Chan. Also, the Buddha-dharma that has a starting point is called Thus Come Chan; the Buddha dharma that has no starting point is called Patriarchal Teacher Chan.

Mun (gate) is not the same as the worldly gate that is shallow (exterior) and the room that is deep (interior). It just has the meaning of exiting and entering, and so no-gate is the gate. Because there is no gate, all gates can be revealed.[32]

(the Buddha)." Again, the *Fanyi mingyiji* 4, T 2131.54.1126c18ff. says, "*Dhyāna*: in Chinese calmed thinking. The *Bibosha lun* says that this is *samādhi*, but since *samādhi* and *prajñā* are equally balanced, if one of the other *samādhi*s is missing, it is not calmed thinking. Calmed is *samādhi* and thinking is *prajñā*."

29 This is an explanation of the first word in the title of this book. See *Chanyuan zhuquan ji duxu*, T 2015. 48.399a18.

30 "Single-taste Chan": As found in the dialogue of Guizong Zhichang, this indicates Patriarchal Teacher Chan. "Because a monk was taking his leave, Guizong said, 'Where are you going?' The monk said, 'I am going all over to learn five-tastes Chan.' The master said, 'I have single-taste Chan!' 'What is your single-taste Chan?' The master hit him." *Wudeng huiyuan* 3, XZJ 138.97a10ff.

31 "No clue": The word for clue here, something to grasp, is a method that is like a halter that is threaded through the nose of an ox so that it can be led as desired. "No clue" is the condition where there is absolutely no such method. Whether "mountains are mountains and waters are waters," or if it is a quote from the scriptures, if it is filtered as a Chan word it becomes clueless and there is absolutely no method of discrimination to grasp or base yourself on. This word is the same as "tasteless." The realm of the clueless is news that you have arrived at the summit of hwadu study. See *Baiyun Fayan yulu* in *Guzunsu yulu*, XZJ 118.434b8ff., Dahui's *Shuzhuang* (i.e. *Dahui shu*), "Reply to Drafter Lü," T 1998A.47.931c3ff.

32 "The gate that has no gate is called the Dharma gate." *Dafangdeng daiji jing* 13, T 397.13.86b6.

Yeomsong: *Yeom* is to pick up and shake out the net; *song* is to display its intention.

Jipseo (preface to the collection): Xingjing[33] said, "A preface (*xu*, K. *seo*) is a clue/introduction. Just as you have a start to a silkworm cocoon, then through to its end from the start is all the silk thread of the cocoon, so this collection (here the *Seonmun yeomsong jip*) has a preface that can exhaust the meaning of a sūtra."

禪者, 圭峯云, "具云禪那, 此云思惟修, 亦云靜慮, 斯皆定慧之通稱也." 當此看, 則教外別傳一味禪也. 且如來禪, 祖師禪,同別如何也? 如來禪者, 山山水水, 法法全眞也; 祖師禪者,和根拔去, 了沒巴鼻也. 如經云, "若見諸相非相, 卽見如來" 云云者, 是如來禪也; 如法眼云, "若見諸相非相, 卽不見如來" 云云者, 是祖師禪也. 又佛法有頭角邊, 謂之如來禪; 佛法無頭角邊, 謂之祖師禪也. 門者, 不同世間門淺室深, 但以出入爲義, 無門爲門. 無門故, 能現一切門也. 拈頌者, 拈振其綱, 頌宣其意也. 集序者, 行靜云, "序者, 緖也. 如繭得緖, 緖盡一繭之絲, 玆集得序, 以盡一經之義也."

"The Perfectly Passable Gate is completely open. If you can enter through the gate you are not worth speaking with, so be sure to enter the gate of no-gate and then you can rise to the rear of the hall and sit." *Liandeng huiyao* 18, "Entry on Donglin Daoyan," XZJ 136.720a16. "If we speak of the gate-less Way, all the people of the earth can enter; if we speak of the Way that has a gate, no Chan teacher has the endowment (for entering it)." *Wumen'guan*, "Preface by Xi'an Chenxun," T 2005.48.292a25.

33 行靜 is an error for 行靖 Xingqing, a Song-dynasty commentator on the *Yongjia ji*. This text is the source of this gloss (compare *Hanguk Bulgyo Jeonseo* 5.1b22–24 with 7.171c). The following texts also quote this as is, with the only changes being according to the nature of the work it is quoted in; it could be "a sutra," or "book" or "collection" or "commentary." See Purui, *Huayan xiantan huixuan ji* 1, XZJ12.3b7ff.; Jueyuan, *Dari jing yishi yanmichao*, XZJ 37.10b18ff,; Tongrun, *Fahua jing dakuan* 1, XZJ 50.55aff.; Dajian, *Chanlin baoxun yinyi*, XZJ 113.307a5ff. The first use of the comparison of prefaces or introductions and silk is the *Erya*.

Case 1.

The Greatly Enlightened, World Honored One, Śākyamuni Buddha

大覺世尊釋迦文佛

[Old Case[1]]

The World Honored One, without having yet departed Tuṣita, had already descended into the palace and, without having yet left his mother's womb,

---

1 The word, "old case" (Ch. *guce*, Kr. *gochik* 古則), as the editors of the *Han'guk Bulgyo Jeonseo* (hereafter HBJ) duly note, was inserted into the text by the editors themselves (the editors relied on two editions: the Goryeo daejanggyeong edition and the Daeweon-sa 大原寺 edition, dated 1636, housed at Dongguk University). The term, nevertheless, warrants our brief attention. The Chan and Seon traditions abound in metaphors and technical vocabulary for what we now simply refer to in English as a koan (Kr. *gongan*). The practice of singling out an ancient, memorable, and comment-worthy story or koan (Ch. *hua*, Kr. *hwa* 話) seems to be related to the development of new Chan genres such as the transmission of the lamp (Ch. *chuandeng lu* 傳燈錄) and the recorded sayings (Ch. *Yulu* 語錄), which seem to have appeared around the tenth century (the oldest example of these genres is the *Zutang ji* 祖堂集 [Kr. *Jodang jip*] traditionally dated 952). One of the most common metaphors for a story singled out for comment (i.e., a koan) comes from the medieval Chinese legal system, namely "case" (Ch. *ze* 則) and "public case" (Ch. *gongan* 公案). The word koan, in fact, is derived from a transliteration of a Japanese term *kōan*, which in turn comes from the Chinese term *gongan*. The term *gongan*, literally, refers to the desk (Ch. *an*) of the judge or magistrate (Ch. *gong*) and thus carries the connotation of being public and impartial as opposed to private or partial (Ch. *si* 私). The gongan can, therefore, be likened to a case (*ze*) set on the magistrate's desk for review and adjudication. There seem to have been various ways in which task of reviewing the gongans took place. In Chan literature, we find, for instance, the following practices: raise for further comment (Ch. ju, Kr. geo 擧), pick out for comment (Ch. *nian*, Kr. *yeom* 拈), add a verse comment (Ch. *song*, Kr. *song* 頌), add a prose comment (Ch. *pingchang*, Kr. *pyeongchang* 平唱), offer a substitute reply (Ch. *dai*, Kr. *dae* 代), offer a separate reply (Ch. *bie*, Kr. *byeol* 別), adding capping phrases (Ch. *zhuoyu*, Kr. *chag'eo* 著語) etc. As noted above, traces of these practices can be seen in the *Zutang ji*, but this source must

had already completed the task of saving people.[2]

be used with caution as Yanagida Seizan's widely accepted dating of this text to 952 has recently been subjected to critique; see Albert Welter, *Monks, Rulers, and Literati: The Political Ascendancy of Chan Buddhism* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2006), pp.63–64. (Hereafter, references to the *Zutang ji* will follow the format [ZTJ section/folio/line] of Yanagida Seizan ed., *Sodōshū sakuin* 祖堂集索引, 3 vols [Kyoto: Kyoto daigaku jinbun kagaku kenkyūjo, 1980]). Whatever and whenever the true origins of the varous practices related to gongans may be, evidence of a mature phase in the growth of these practices can perhaps be seen in the appearance, sometime during the Song dynasty (960–1279), of a collection of verses attributed to Xuedou Chongxian 雪竇重顯 (980–1052) known more commonly as the *Xuedou heshang baize songgu* 雪竇和尚百則頌古 (compiled in 1026 by Xuedou's disciple Yuanchen 遠塵; hereafter *Xuedou songgu*). No source, however, has received as much attention in this respect as Yuanwu Keqin's 圜悟克勤 (1063–1135) collection of capping phrases and prose comments on the *Xuedou songgu* known as the *Foguo Yuanwu chanshi biyan lu* 佛果圜悟禪師碧巖錄 (hereafter *Biyan lu*). There has been no shortage of studies on gongans, but for a particularly useful overview of the gongan form in English, see T. Griffith Foulk, "The Form and Function of Koan Literature: A Historical Overview," in *The Kōan: Texts and Contexts in Zen Buddhism*, edited by Steven Heine and Dale S. Wright, pp. 15–45 (New York: Oxford University Press, 2000); and for more information on the function of gongans and their significance as a new style of thinking, see Robert H. Sharf "How to Think with Chan *Gong'an*," in *Thinking with Cases: Specialist Knowledge in Chinese Cultural History*, edited by Charlotte Furth, Judith T. Zeitlin, and Ping-chen Hsiung, pp. 205–243 (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2007). As for the provenance of the gongan form, the specific conditions under which it arose remains a matter of debate, but Robert E. Buswell, Jr. has argued that koans may be a product not of external (i.e., social or historical) pressures but of the internal dynamic and evolution of Chan's subitist rhetoric in his article, "The 'Short-cut' Approach of K'an-hua Meditation: The Evolution of a Practical Subitism in Chinese Ch'an Buddhism," in *Sudden and Gradual: Approaches to Enlightenment in Chinese Thought*, edited by Peter N. Gregory, pp. 321–377 (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1987). Others, however, have tried to approach this issue by looking at the rise of closely related genres such as the recorded sayings. No work has been more influential in this repect than Yanagida Seizan's lengthy study on the recorded sayings genre, namely his "Goroku no rekishi: Zenbunken no seiritsushiteki kenkyū 語録の歴史一禅文献の成立史的研究," *Tohō gakuhō* 57 (1985): 211–663. In English, Mario Poceski has recently argued that the gongan form cannot be dated any earlier than the mid-tenth century since that is when we find the earliest instance of its use in the *Zutang ji*; see his article "*Mazu yulu* and the Creation of the Chan Recorded Sayings," in *The Zen Canon: Understanding the Classic Texts*, edited by Steven Heine and Dale S. Wright, pp. 52–79 (New York: Oxford University Press, 2004). An attempt to provide a more precise definition of the recorded sayings genre can be found in Morten Schlütter,

世尊, 未離兜率, 已降王宮; 未出母胎, 度人已畢.

"The *Record of Hongzhi* and the Recorded Sayings Literature of Song-Dynasty Chan," in *The Zen Canon: Understanding the Classic Texts*, edited by Steven Heine and Dale S. Wright, pp. 181–205 (New York: Oxford University Press, 2004). The most comprehensive treatment of the recorded sayings genre to date can be found in Albert Welter, *The Linji Lu and the Creation of Chan Orthodoxy: The Development of Chan's Records of Sayings Literature* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008).

2 The source from which this case was originally extracted remains unknown, but in structure and content Hyesim's 慧諶 (1178–1234) *Seonmun yeomsong* 禪門拈頌 (compiled in 1226) is not without precedent. The practice of collecting and arranging cases and verse comments on these cases (*songgu* 頌古) into an order that is clearly modeled after the genealogical tree of the transmission of the lamp (Ch. *chuandeng lu*, Kr. *Jeondeungnok* 傳燈錄) texts—Hyesim makes this connection himself in his preface to the *Seonmun yeomsong*—can also be witnessed in at least three other important Song dynasty case collections known respectively as the *Zongmen tongyao ji* 宗門統要集 (issued in 1093 and expanded republished as the *Zongmen tongyao xuji* 宗門統要續集 in 1324), the *Donglin heshang Yunmen anzhu songgu* 東林和尚雲門庵主頌古 (preface dated 1133), and *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* 禪宗頌古聯珠通集 (compiled by Faying Baojian 法應寶鑑 in 1175, expanded by Lu'an Puhui 魯庵普會 who wrote a preface dated 1318, and reprinted in 1392); Yanagida Seizan has also pointed out the similarity between Hyesim's text and the *Zongmen tongyao ji* ("Zenseki kaidai," in *Zenke goroku*, vol. *2*, edited by Nishitani Keiji and Yanagida Seizan, pp. 445–514 [Tokyo: Chikuma shobō, 1974], p. 509). For the historical significance of the *Zongmen tongyao ji*, see Ishii Shūdō, "K'ung-an Ch'an and the Tsung-men t'ung-yao chi," translated by Albert Welter, in *The Kōan: Texts and Contexts in Zen Buddhism*, edited by Steven Heine and Dale S. Wright, pp.110–136 (New York: Oxford University Press, 2000). A Song dynasty edition of the *Donglin heshang Yunmen anzhu songgu* is currently housed at Seikidō bunko 成簣堂文庫 in Japan. This text was also published as part (volume 47) of a larger collection of Chan recorded sayings known as the *Guzunsu yulu* 古尊宿語錄 (XZJ 118). Donglin here refers to Zhu'an Shigui 竹庵士珪 (1083–1146) and Yunmen an to Dahui Zonggao 大慧宗杲 (1089–1163). The *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* was included in the Ming dynasty (1368–1644) Southern Canon 南藏 printed at Baoen Monastery 報恩寺. The above gongan does not appear in the *Zongmen tongyao ji* but it does appear in the *Donglin heshang Yunmen anzhu songgu* (XZJ 118.795b4–6). There is little reason to doubt that the gongan was in circulation in its current form during the Song dynasty; for instance, see a reference to this case in the *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* 圓悟佛果禪師語錄 (T 1997.47.761b20–21 and 800c17–18), *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* 大慧普覺禪師語錄 (T 1998A.47.826c24–25, 831b28–29, 832b17–18, 842c9–10, 850c8–9, and 887c18–19), and *Shuzhou Longmen Foyuan heshang yulu* 舒州龍門佛眼和尚語錄 in the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.522b9–10). See also the *Yunfeng Yue chanshi zhu Cuiyan yulu* 雲峰悅禪師初住翠巖語錄 also in the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.677b1–2).

[Explanation of the gongan[3]]

Greatly Enlightened, World Honored One, Śākyamuni Buddha

Greatly Enlightened: is this the permanent awakening from the great dream of life and death? This is still partial. Because one awakens for oneself and awakens others, and because the practice of awakening is full and complete, it is called great enlightenment. Therefore it is said, this is "just like awakening from a dream" and "just like a blossoming lotus flower."[4]

World Honored One: *World* (世) means "constant change" (遷流) and *Honored One* (尊) means "not change constantly."[5] Within constant change he does not change constantly. Is this the reason he is called the World Honored One. The reason he is called the World Honored One is because he is the most blessed and wise of humans. Therefore the sixth patriarch[6] said, "His wisdom transcends the three realms. There are none that can compare

---

3 The "explanation of the gongan" (*seolhwa* 說話) is attributed to Hyesim's otherwise little-known disciple Gag'un 覺雲. As we shall see, the explanation provides what amounts to a line-by-line analysis of the case and associated verse comments. The oldest extant copy of the *seolhwa* is dated 1538. The editors of the HBJ relied on four editions of the *seolhwa:* (1) an edition whose printing began at Seonjeong-am 禪定庵 on Mt. Myohyang in 1684 and finished the next year at Gomyobul-dang 古廟佛堂 in Anju (currently housed at Seoul National University), (2) an edition printed at Boryeon-gak 寶蓮閣, (3) Neungga-sa 楞伽寺 edition dated 1707, and (3) an undated edition housed at the National Library. Here, I insert the term *seolhwa* in the original text for the sake of consistency and clarity.

4 Our text seems to be referring to a passage from the *Fodi jing lun* 佛地經論; see T 1530.26.291b13–14. For an English translation of this text, see John Keenan's doctoral thesis, "A Study of the Buddhabhumyūpadeśa: The Doctrinal Development of the Notion of Wisdom in Yogācāra Thought" (Ph.D. thesis: University of Wisconsin Madison, 1980).

5 *Qianliu* 遷流, here translated as "constant change," also often refers to "changing [places]" as in the case of "day and night constantly change places" (*Za ahan jing* 雜阿含經; T 99.2.284c23) and "winter and summer change places" (*Da foding rulai miyin xiuzheng liaoyi zhu pusa wanxing shoulengyan jing* 大佛頂如來密因修證了義諸菩薩萬行首楞嚴經, hereafter *Shoulengyan jing*; T 945.19.110b9). Regardless, the term seems to necessarily imply, literally, a flow of time and the change that ensues.

6 The sixth patriarch refers to Huineng 惠能. For more information on Huineng and his legend, see John Jorgensen, *Inventing Hui-neng, the Sixth Patriarch: Hagiography And Biography in Early Ch'an* (Leiden: Brill, 2005).

to him. His virtue is unsurpassed, so everyone respects him."

Śākyamuni: this means "able to care for others, serene, and silent."[7] An interpretation of this says, "The surname Śākya (釋迦) means 'to be able to care for others.' The name muni (牟尼) means 'to be serene and silent.'" As for "able to" (能), this is none other than the superb expedients of the buddhas. As for "care for others" (仁), this is the compassion of the buddhas. Also, "able to care for others" refers to the ability to respond to things with great compassion. "Serene and silent" is the illumination of Principle with great wisdom. Again, "able to care for others, serene, and silent" is the generic term for serene illumination (寂照)[8]. Since no mark (無相) is a mark,[9] (the mind) is serene and yet it constantly illuminates (all dharmas).[10] That is, because his mark transcends marks, [the mind] illuminates and yet it is constantly serene. The World Honored One had received prediction of this name from the buddha Dīpaṃkara. In other words, [the mind] is serene and yet it constantly illuminates and it illuminates and yet it is constantly serene. This means serenity and illumination are simultaneously wiped out and serenity and illumination are simultaneously perfected. *Buddha*: in its complete form this reads Bulta (佛陀). It means "enlightenment" (覺). This is to transcend enlightenment and yet be enlightened, which refers to the mysterious function of illuminating all dharmas.

---

7 Cf. *Fanyi mingyi ji* 翻譯名義集 (compiled in 1143): "This means 'able to care for others, serene, and silent.' Because he is serene and silent he does not dwell in life and death (i.e., *saṃsāra*), but because he cares for others he does not dwell in nirvana" (T 2131.54.1059a27–28).

8 Otherwise known as zhiguan 止觀 ("calming and contemplation") or, in Sanskrit, as śamatha and vipaśyanā.

9 Most likely an reference to a passage from Śikṣānanda's translation of the *Dafangguang fo huayan jing* 大方廣佛華嚴經 or *Huayan jing* for short (T 279.10.85a28). "Mark" is also translated as characteristics or attributes.

10 *Ji er chang zhao* 寂而常照, here translated as "serene and yet constantly illuminates (all dharmas), is a common gloss for contemplation or *vipaśyanā*; for instance, see the gloss in Zhiyi's 智顗 (538–597) magnum opus *Mohe zhiguan* 摩訶止觀: "serene and yet constantly illuminating (all dharmas) is called contemplation" (*Mohe zhiguan*; T 1911.46.2a1). This gloss is also cited in the *Zongjing lu* (T 2016.48.526a13).

大覺者, 生死大夢永覺耶. 此猶是單偏, 自覺, 覺他, 覺行圓滿, 故名爲大覺也. 故云, 如睡夢覺 如蓮花開也. 世尊者, 世者, 遷流義, 尊者, 不遷流義. 遷流中有不遷流義, 故云世尊耶. 福慧兩足爲世所尊, 故名爲世尊也. 故六祖云, 智慧超三界, 無有能及者, 德尊更無上一切咸恭敬也. 釋迦牟尼者, 此云能仁寂默也. 釋之者云, 釋迦姓, 此云能仁, 牟尼名, 此云寂默. 能者, 即佛善權, 仁者, 即佛慈悲也. 又云能仁者, 大慈應物, 寂默者, 大智明理也. 又能仁寂默, 即寂照之通稱也. 無相即相故, 寂而常照, 即相離相故, 照而常寂. 世尊於過去然燈佛所, 蒙受此號, 則寂而常照, 照而常寂, 寂照俱泯, 寂照俱圓之義也. 佛者, 具云佛陀, 此云覺也. 則離覺而覺, 照諸,法之幽邃之謂也.

This gongan (Kr. *hwa* 話)[11] renders into narrative form and thereby explicates the scattered passages on the ten subtle destinies (十種微細趣) in the "Transcending the World Chapter" from the *Huayan jing* (Flower Garland Scripture).[12]

Dosol[13] (S. Tuṣita 兜率): in its complete form it reads *Dosolta* 兜率陀 and also *Dosata* 覩史陀. It means "satisfaction" (喜足) and also "sublime satisfaction" (妙足).[14] "Satisfaction" refers to the production of a satisfied

11 See the explanation in note 1 above.

12 The ten subtle destinies (of the bodhisattva) appear in Buddhabhadra's translation of the *Huayan jing* (T 278.9.666c18–26). These destinies are made apparent, we are told, while the bodhisattva is dwelling in his/her mother's womb. The ten destinies are: (1) from giving rise to *bodhicitta* up to and including receiving consecration with ambrosia (*chufa putixin zhi xin naizhi ganlu guanding shouji zhi di* 初發菩提之心乃至甘露灌頂授記之地); (2) dwelling in Tuṣita Heaven (*chu doushuaituo* 處兜率陀天); (3) birth (*chusheng* 出生); (4) attainment of the youthful stage (*tongzi di* 童子地); (5) the pleasures of the palace (*gongdian sewei zhi jian* 宮殿色味之間); (6) leaving home (*chujia* 出家); (7) ascetic practices and attaining perfect enlightenment (*kuxing wangyi daochang chengdeng zhengjue* 苦行往詣道場成等正覺); (8) turning of the wheel (*zhuan falun* 轉法輪); (9) *parinirvāṇa* (*daban niepan* 大般涅槃); (10) the great subtle destiny (*daweixi* 大微細).

13 From this point on, unless otherwise indicated, *dosol* and all other transliterations will, for the sake of convenience, be "translated" into their Sanskrit equivalent.

14 Cf. the same gloss in the *Da zhidu lun* 大智度論 (T 1509.25.443b17), *Yiqie jing yinyi* (T 2128.54.359b2, 622a24, and 776b22), *Fanyi mingyi ji* (T 2131.54.1077b9–15), and also Gyeongheung's 璟興 *Sam Mireuk gyeong so* 三彌勒經疏 (T 1774.38.305c7–8).

mind towards all desires and happiness.

It also (refers to) gaining small delight and (yet) being satisfied without having to seek for more. Why do buddhas, when they appear in the world, all descend from Tuṣita Heaven and attain rebirth in Jambudvīpa?[15] Because Tuṣita Heaven is the middle heaven within the six heavens of the desire realm, it is always situated in the middle way, not biased or stagnant, and not tainted or attached to any of the objects of the desire (realm). The above is what (we) mean by "sublime satisfaction."

Here "palace," "Tuṣita," "saving people," "leaving the womb" are four scenes from the eight scenes of the life of the Buddha (八相).[16] The eight scenes are "dwelling in Tuṣita" (住兜率), "descending into the palace" (降王宮), "dwelling in the womb" (住胎), "leaving the womb" (出胎)," "leaving home" (出家), "attaining the Way" (成道), "subduing demonic forces" (降魔

15 One of the four "continents" in Buddhist cosmology. It is the southern continent and originally probably referred to the Indian sub-continent, but later it referred to the whole world.

16 These are the so-called eight major scenes or phases (Ch. *baxiang*, Kr. *palsang* 八相) of the life of the Buddha. For a discussion of the eight scenes, see Akira Hirakawa, "Hassō jōdō to hassō jigen" *Nanto bukkyō* 66 (1991): 1–22. These eight scenes are to be distinguished from the eight major miracles performed by the Buddha, which form an important theme in Buddhist art. For the latter, see John C. Huntington, "Sowing the Seeds of the Lotus: A Journey to the Great Pilgrimage Sites of Buddhism," pts. 1–5, *Orientations* 16, no. 11 (Nov. 1985): 46–61, 17; no. 2 (Feb. 1986): 28–43; 17, no. 3 (March 1986): 32–46; 17, no. 7 (July 1986): 28–40; and 17, no. 9 (Sept. 1986): 46–58. See also his "Pilgrimage as Image: The Cult of the Aṣṭamahapratiharya, Part I," *Orientations* 18, no. 4 (1987): 55–63 and "Pilgrimage as Image: The Cult of the Aṣṭamahapratiharya, Part II," *Orientations* 18, no. 8 (1987): 56–68. Art historians have come to debate the nature of the artistic representations of the eight great miracles. Given the lack of the anthropomorphic representations of the Buddha in some early Indian Buddhist images such as the panels at Bharhut, some art historians have come to claim that there was an "aniconic" period in Buddhist art where a taboo against the anthropomorphic representation of the Buddha was in place. This has led some to argue that what we have is not a representation of the Buddha but of the pilgrimage site where the miracle is believed to have taken place. For the nucleus of the debate, see Susan L. Huntington, "Early Buddhist Art and the Theory of Aniconism," *Art Journal* 49, 4, New Approaches to South Asian Art (Winter, 1990); Vidya Dehejia, "Aniconism and the Multivalence of Emblems," *Ars Orientalis*, Vol. 21, (1991): 45–66; and Huntington's rejoinder to Dehejia's article, "Aniconism and the Multivalence of Emblems: Another Look," *Ars Orientalis* 22 (1992): 111–156 and 401–408.

軍), "turning the wheel of the Dharma" (轉法輪), and "entering nirvana" (入涅槃). This is nine scenes in all. Why then do you refer to it as eight scenes? In the Great Vehicle there is no "subduing demonic forces" because demons are themselves the dharma realm. In the Lesser Vehicle there is no "dwelling in the womb" because the womb is like empty space. If so, the Great and the Lesser Vehicles each are deprived of one, which makes it eight scenes. Again, the *Qixin lun* 起信論 states, "From Tuṣita he moved down to the palace etcetera."[17] Buddhas, when they appear in the world, all attain the Way in eight scenes.

Why (then) does (the above story read) "without leaving Tuṣi(ta) etcetera"? The sequence of the attainment of the Way in eight scenes is the convoluted view of the śravakas. According to the *Huayan jing* (Flower Garland Scripture), the eight scenes are simultaneous and without a

17 Although not an exact match, this quote seems to be alluding to a passage from Paramārtha's (499–569) "translation" of the *Qixin lun* 起信論 (Awakening of Faith): "Namely, moving down from Tuṣita, entering the womb, dwelling in the womb, leaving the womb, leaving home, attaining buddhahood, and entering nirvana" (*Qixin lun*; T 1666.32.581a7–8); cf. the corresponding passage in Śikṣānanda's (less popular) "translation": "(The eight scenes) refer to (the act) of coming down from Tuṣi(ta) to the palace and entering the womb, dwelling in the womb, leaving the womb, leaving home, attaining buddhahood, turning the wheel of the Dharma, and *parinirvāṇa*" (T 1667.32.589b20). However, the *Qixin lun*'s list differs, as we can see, from the list provided in the above seolhwa. Whereas the *Qixin lun* includes "entering the womb" and excludes "entering the palace" and "subduing demonic forces," the *seolhwa*'s list above includes "entering the palace" but excludes "entering the womb" and "subduing demonic forces." There are significant variations in the list of the eight scenes in the various scriptural sources, but the locus classicus (in China) for the eight scenes seems to have been the list from Zhiyi's *Sijiao yi* 四教儀; see Zengaku daijiten hensanjo ed. *Shinpan Zengaku daijiten* 新版 禅学大辞典 (Tokyo: Taishūkan shoten, 1985; hereafter ZGD), p. 1028. According to the *Sijiao yi*, "the so-called eight scenes of attaining the Way are (1) (coming) down from Tuṣita Heaven; (2) dwelling in the womb; (3) birth; (4) leaving home; (5) subduing demons; (6) attaining the Way; (7) turning the wheel of the Dharma; (8) entering nirvana" (*Sijiao yi*; T 1929.46.745c5–7). Also, according to Zhipan's 志磐 (n.d.) *Fozu tongji* 佛祖統紀 (completed in 1269), the *Qixin lun* offers a description of the Mahāyāna version of the eight scenes, which "preserves 'dwelling in the womb' but did away with 'subduing demons,' " and the *Sijiao yi* offers a description of the Hīnayāna version of the eight scenes, which "preserves 'subduing demons' but did away with 'dwelling in the womb'" (T 2035.49.141b11–13).

sequence (that posits) a before and after. Therefore the *Qingliang shu*[18] states, "the Buddha's body is devoid of obstruction and the Dharma is self-so."[19]

Layman Wujin's[20] *Zhaohua yuan ji* states,[21] "What the *Huayan jing* takes as essence (體) is from beginning to end one thought-moment. The past and the present are a single moment. The ten directions are one kṣetra. The three realms are one body (體). That very body is manifest before (us) and does not entail discursive understandings."[22] Among the ten non-obstructions (十無礙) [the above corresponds to] the non-obstruction in time and space (時處無礙).[23] "Without leaving Tuṣita etcetera" is the non-obstruction of space (處無礙). "Without leaving the womb etcetera" is the non-obstruction of time

---

18 The *Qingliang Commentary* (*Qingliang shu* 清涼疏), refers to the *Da fangguang fo huayan jing shu* 大方廣佛華嚴經疏 (T 1735.35) by Chengguan 澄觀 (738–839), also known as National Teacher Qingliang 清涼國師.

19 Source unclear.

20 Wujin 無盡 is the dharma name of the famed Song dynasty statesman Zhang Shangying 張商英 (1043–1122). For more on Zhang, See Robert M. Gimello, "Chang Shang-ying on Wu-t'ai Shan," in *Pilgrims and Sacred Sites in China*, edited by Susan Naquin and Chün-fang Yü (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1992), pp. 89–149.

21 *Zhaohuayuan ji* 昭化院記 is no longer extant. According to Zhang Shangying's *Changzhe kanji* 長者龕記 (dated 1088), Zhaohua Cloister on Mt. Fang 方山 was established by the layman Li Tongxuan 李通玄 (635–730). Zhang Shangying is said to have visited the temple and acquired the writings of Li such as the *Lueshi xin huayan jing xiuxing cidi jueyi lun* 略釋新華嚴經修行次第決疑論. The *Changzhe kanji* can be found in the *Shanyou shike congpian* 山右石刻叢編, vol. 17. A summary in a post-face by Zhang is found in his post-pace to *Lueshi xin huayan jing xiuxing cidi jueyi lun* (T. 1741.36.1049a19ff.).

22 Partial citation of this passage also appears in Li Tongxuan's *Lueshi xin huayan jing xiuxing cidi jueyi lun* (T 1741.36.1049a21).

23 According to Fazang's 法藏 (643–712) *Huayanjing tanxuan ji* 華嚴經探玄記, the ten non-obstructions are: "(1) non-obstruction of manifest phenomena (*qingshi wuai* 情事無礙); (2) non-obstruction of principle and phenomena (*lishi wuai* 理事無礙); (3) non-obstruction in mutual entry (*xiangru wuai* 相入無礙); (4) non-obstruction in mutual identity (*xiangji wuai* 相卽無礙); (5) non-obstruction in multiple manifestations (*chongxian wuai* 重現無礙); (6) non-obstruction of subject and object (*zhuban wuai* 主伴無礙); (7) non-obstruction of essence and function (*tiyong*

(時無礙). In other words, in the boundless *kṣetra* realms there is not [even] a hairbreadth's distance between self and other. The past and the present of ten worlds, from beginning to end, do not transcend this very thought-moment (right now).

This is scriptural exegesis. Why is it cited and taken as a gongan? An ancient said, "If not for the *Huayan jing*, the explanation of Principle (理) would never have been complete. Students bury themselves in texts, letters, meaning, and principle."[24] They are unable to forget (discursive) thought and understand the mind. Therefore, Bodhidharma came from the West, directly pointed to the mind of people, had them see their own self-nature and attain buddhahood. Thus, in the Seon 禪 (houses) we *practice* "the non-obstruction of all phenomena" (事事無礙) and in Doctrinal 教 (houses) they *explain* "the non-obstruction of all phenomena." The Doctrinal houses (教家) simply explain and cannot attain through *practice*; the Seon houses (禪家) directly make use of what they come across in every potential (機) and every object (境). As it is said, "tossing the great thousandfold world out of the universe and inserting Mt. Sumeru into a mustard seed—these are all part of our usual endowment (常分) and not a borrowing of some extrinsic technique."[25] Again, it is said, "tossing the great thousandfold world out of the universe is

wuai 體用無礙); (8) non-obstruction of concealment and disclosure (*yinxian wuai* 隱顯無礙); (9) non-obstruction in time and place (*shichu wuai* 時處無礙); (10) non-obstruction of composition and decomposition (*chenghuai wuai* 成壞無礙)" (T 1733.35.160b11–25). Fellow Huayan exegete Chengguan offers a slightly different list in his *Qingliang shu:* "(1) non-obstruction of principle and phenomena (*lishi wuai* 理事無礙); (2) non-obstruction of composition and decomposition (*chenghuai wuai* 成壞無礙); (3) non-obstruction of greater and lesser (freedom) (*guangxia wuai* 廣陜無礙); (4) non-obstruction in mutual entry (*xiangru wuai* 相入無礙); (5) non-obstruction in mutual identity (*xiangji wuai* 相卽無礙); (6) non-obstruction of the subtle (*weixi wuai* 微細無礙); (7) non-obstruction of concealment and disclosure (*yinxian wuai* 隱顯無礙); (8) non-obstruction in multiple manifestations (*chongxian wuai* 重現無礙); (9) non-obstruction of subject and object (*zhuban wuai* 主伴無礙); (10) non-obstruction in time and place (*shichu wuai* 時處無礙)" (T 1735.35.576a27-b13).

24 Source unknown.

25 Source unknown.

as commonplace as walking out the gate three times a day and inserting Mt. Sumeru into a mustard seed is as commonplace as putting tares and millet into storage."[26]

An ancient one said,[27] "If we are to discuss the unsurpassed true Principle, how could the *Huayan jing* not be its utmost perfection! If so, what need was there for Bodhidharma to come from the West and have branches and shoots grow on top of more branches and shoots? How could you know that this is not the truth (道理) behind Bodhidharma's coming from the West?"[28] Thus, unobstructed phenomena cannot not be taken as the ultimate truth in calculation.[29]

An ancient one in verse said, "Śākyamuni did not appear in this world[30] (出

---

26 Exact source unknown, but these expressions also appears in Pei Xiu's 裴休 (791–864) preface to the *Zhu Huayan fajie guanmen* 注華嚴法界觀門 (T1884.45.683c14–15), Zhenjing Kewen's 真淨克文 (1025–1102) recorded sayings in the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.713b1–2), and the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.877a19 and b4). See also the *Foguo Keqin chanshi xinyao* 佛果克勤禪師心要 (XZJ 120.744.18–745a1).

27 Here, I use the literal translation "ancient one" for *guren* 古人. Another possible translation would be ancient virtuoso.

28 Source unknown.

29 Here, the term for "calculation" (Ch. *shangliang*, Kr. *sangnyang* 商量) may, as Koga and Iriya point out, also mean something like "consult" or "negotiate"; see Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 217. But *shangliang*, as we learn in the *Zuting shiyuan* 祖庭事苑, may also refer to a merchant ("*shang*"-*gu*) who "calculates" or "measures" ("*liang*"-*du*) items on a scale so as not to lose equilibrium; see *Zuting shiyuan* (XZJ 113.11b18; cited in Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 217). In this sense the term may also be likened to the English expression, "weigh one's options." Similarly, in the Chan context, the term is often used in the derogatory sense of weighing one's option (too much) or (over)-intellectualizing while investigating a koan.

30 Here, the term for "appearing in this world" or "going out into the world" (Ch. *chushi*, Kr. *chulse* 出世) is probably being used as a pun to refer to both the literally appearance of the Buddha in this world and the beginning of the his career as a teacher (this is usually how the term is used in Chan literature). As an extension of the latter sense of the term, *chushi* is also used in other contexts to refer specifically to someone becoming an abbot for the first time during his career as a monk; see Yi Fa, *The Origins of Buddhist Monastic Codes in China: An Annotated Translation and Study of the Chanyuan qinggui* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2002), p. 214.

世) and yet preached for forty-nine years. Bodhidharma did not come from the West and yet Shaolin monastery has a wondrous formula."[31] Thus, each and every person is like a thousand-foot-high cliff,[32] has already completed their self-cultivation even before the existence of all the eons as great in number as all the particles in the universe, and has also completed the attainment of buddhahood. There is no other face on which they could add rouge and facial powder.[33]

---

31 In his prose comments recorded in case 28 of the *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.168c17), Yuanwu attibutes this verse to Xiu shanzhu 修山主 or Longji Shaoxiu 龍濟紹修 (d.u.) who is a dharma heir of Luohan Guichen 羅漢桂琛 (867–928). Xiu shanzhu served as abbot on Mt. Longji 龍濟 in present day Fujian province. In an ascending the hall sermon, Lingyuan Weiqing also attributes this verse to Xiu shanzhu; see his sermon in the *Jiatai pudeng lu* 嘉泰普燈錄 (completed in 1204; XZJ 137.113b7–8). The verse in question seems to have been well known during the Song; see the *Fayan chanshi yulu* 法演禪師語錄 (T 1995.47.649c7–8; cf. XZJ 118.412n5–6), *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.725a27–28, 730b11–12), *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.18a18–19, 58b4–5), *Changling Shouzhuo chanshi yulu* (XZJ 120.316a2–4), etc. Xiu shanzhu's biography can be found in fascicle 24 of the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.400c9–401a25).

32 A thousand-foot-high cliff or, more accurately, a cliff that stands eight-thousand feet high (Ch. *bili qianren*, Kr. *byeongnip cheon-in* 壁立千仞, a *ren* was about eight Chinese feet, so a fathom) often appears with another well-known term in Chan, namely "on a lump of red flesh" (Ch. *chirou tuanshang*, Kr. *jeogyuk dansang* 赤肉團上); see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.298b21–23); and also *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.725c29 and 755a26). The lump of red flesh is often associated with this famous passage from the recorded sayings of Linji: "on the lump of red flesh there is a true man with no rank, constantly entering and exiting the openings of your face" (*Zhenzhou Linji Huizhao chanshi yulu* 鎮州臨濟慧照禪師語錄; T 1985.47.496c10–11). The man with no rank here seems to be functioning as a metaphor for the buddha-mind; see Robert H. Sharf's study on the *Baozang lun* 寶藏論, Coming to *Terms with Chinese Buddhism*: *A Reading of the* Treasure Store Treatise, Kuroda Institute Studies in East Asian Buddhism 14 (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2005), p. 187. Similarly, the thousand-fathom-high cliff seems to be functioning as a metaphor for the precarious (or inconceivable?) seat of the buddha-mind. The same is true for another well-known Chan metaphor, the hundred-foot pole (Ch. *baichi gantou*, Kr. *baekcheok gandu* 百尺竿頭); see *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* 建中靖國續燈錄 (XZJ 136.252b6–7). The *Jianzhong Jingguo xudeng lu* was compiled by Foguo Weibai 佛國惟白 (d.u.) with a preface by Emperor Huizong 徽宗 (r. 1100–1126) dated 1101.

33 Rouge and facial powder here seem to be metaphors for literally flowery language or excessive thought. The absence of a face, needless to say, is a metaphor for no self. This idea can also be seen in the *Zutang ji* (ZTJ 3/43/12).

To raise the gongan this way is to explain it in terms of "the first phrase" (最初句). Although such explanations of the meaning of scripture are very subtle, they are empty, distant, and lack vitality. They are overextended and lack intelligibility. Had the lineage masters not cited the teachings and turned it into the meaning of a gongan, what then?

Yuantong Shan's 圓通善 (d.u.)[34] capping phrase[35] for *without having yet departed Tuṣita* reads, "a moon in Heaven" (一月在天); his capping phrase for *had already descended into the palace* reads, "(its) shadow contains the myriad waters"[36] (影含衆水); his capping phrase for *without having yet left his mother's womb* reads, "heaven and earth are under control"[37] (乾坤把定); his capping phrase *for had already completed the task of saving people* reads, "who would not benefit from this blessing" (誰不蒙恩).[38]

You can take these eight scenes and arrange them into "realization" (證) and "salvation" (化), but in their entirety they become eight scenes. *Without having yet departed Tuṣita is realization. Had already descended into the palace*

---

34 Unfortunately, little is known about Yuantong. According to the *Wudeng huiyuan xulue* 五燈會元續略 he is said to be the dharma heir of a certain Fojue 佛覺 of the Yunmen lineage and seems to have maintained close relations with Wanyan Yong 完顏雍 (r. 1161–1189) or Emperor Shizong 世宗 of the Jin 金 dynasty (1115–1234); see XZJ 138.933b9–934a13.

35 A capping phrase is a word, phrase, or saying that is appended as a note or comment to a case and/or verse. For a good sense of how capping phrases were used (at least in Japan), see William M. Bodiford, *Sōtō Zen in Medieval Japan*, Kuroda Institute Sutides in East Asian Buddhism 8 (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1993), esp. pp. 143–162. See also the comprehensive treatment of this subject in Victor Hōgen Sori trans., *Zen Sand: The Book of Capping Phrases for Kōan Practice*, Nanzan Library of Asian Religion and Culture (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2003).

36 The two capping phrases, "A moon in Heaven" and "[its] shadow contains the myriad waters" 一月在天影含衆水 also appear in a verse by Wuzu Fayan in the *Fayan chanshi yulu* (T 1995.47.666b16; cf. XZJ 118.447b13). See also *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.143b8).

37 *Bading* 把定, as Koga and Iriya point out, means something like "hold firmly" and also "pin down," "immobilize," or "control," and in the latter sense *bading* (often paired with its antonym *fangxing* 放行 or "release") is used interchangeably with *bazhu* 把住 (Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 374). See also the account in Hori, *Zen Sand*, pp. 712–713.

38 The source of these capping phrases is unclear.

is salvation. But this gate of salvation also has a realization and salvation. "Dwelling in the womb" is realization. "Leaving the womb, "leaving home," and "attaining the Way," "subduing demonic forces," and "turning the wheel of the Dharma" are salvation. "Entering nirvana" is also realization. *Had already completed the task of saving people* is nirvana.

This is what Yuanwu meant by "From beginning to end a single thread." In abbreviation, there are four scenes. In *without having yet departed Tuṣita* and *had already descended into the palace* salvation arises from realization. In *without having yet left his mother's womb* and *had already completed the task of saving people* salvation is collected and returned to realization. This is referred to as coming and going being consistent in the past and the future. All of this is called (in Kunshan's verse) "standards." Here, "*without having yet left Tuṣita … had already completed the task of saving people*" are, (according to Yuanwu's verse), "from begging to end a single thread" and "there was no coming or going from the outset." Realization and salvation thus perish. (As Kunshan's verse puts it), one must "receive the words and understand the source."

Dahui said, "The last phrase[39] had already been completely exposed even before it was expressed in a voice. It covers Heaven and covers Earth; it covers voice and covers form. The gold-faced old man[40] was able to make a critical move[41] and said etcetera."[42] *Had already completed the task of saving beings* is none other than *the* last phrase used as a critical move. To refer to

---

39 "The last phrase" or "the last word" (Ch. *mohouju*, Kr. *malhugu* 末後句) quite literally means to have the last word in an exchange, debate, or discussion and could also function as a final farewell; see Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 436.

40 This indicates the Buddha who was said to have a golden complexion and body, which is why statues of the Buddha were gilded.

41 "Critical move" (Ch. *zhuozi*, Kr. *chakja* 著子), as Kogo and Iriya point out, is a term borrowed from the classical Chinese chess game *qi* 棋 (Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 16). In the Chan context, the term seems to refer more specifically to a suitable or advantageous move.

42 This seems to be a reference to a *shizhong* 示衆 ("instructions the assembly") sermon in the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.842c8–9). Mario Poceski claims that *shizhong* or "instructing

this as the last phrase used as a critical move is permissible, but to refer to it as the last phrase is not permissible. Let's say you point to a mountain and ask, "is this a mountain?" To answer, "It is a mountain," is permissible. In the mountain there is grass, trees, dirt, and stones and they are all raised together. But let's say you point to a stone in the mountain and ask, "Is this a mountain?" To answer, "It is a mountain," is not permissible. How could you take the example a stone in the mountain and call it a mountain? Therefore, Songyuan ascended the hall and said what he said.[43] This is also why Changling said, "*Without having yet left Tuṣita* etcetera." If this is true and you "try to reach that place where you come out of emptiness, enter existence, and undergo endless transformations," you will be able to turn yourself around[44] and exhale the vital breath.[45]

Even if you understand the last phrase it is still a move that lacks understanding! What then could it ultimately be? "Principle, in its exalted form, forgets emotions and locutions. How could there be an adequate analogy? Finally the moon appears on a chilly night and falls capriciously into a nearby creek."[46]

---

the assembly" and *shangtang* were used interchangeably; Poceski, "Chan Rituals of the Abbots' Ascending the Dharma Hall to Preach," in Steven Heine and Dale S. Wright eds., *Zen Ritual: Studies of Zen Buddhist Theory in Practice* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), p. 91.

43 That is, Songyuan's sermon quoted later; and see also fascicle two of the *Songyuan Chongyue chanshi yulu* (XZJ 121.605a9–11).

44 *Zhuande shen* 轉得身, here translated as "turning yourself [lit. the body] around," means something like to move up to a whole new level that is a step or cut above the normal; see Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 329.

45 "To turn oneself around and exhale the vital breath" or, better still, "let out a sigh of relief" (*zhuanshen tuqi* 轉身吐氣) seems to have been a set phrase that was used to express a changing of one's fate (for the better). Exhaling the vital breath, among other things, may be sign of new life. A telling example of how *zhuan* 轉 can be used as a pun to mean both literally turning around and turning one's life around also appears in case 75 of the *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.202c15 and also 206a3, 211a17, etc).

46 Although this verse (with slight variation) is also found in the recorded sayings of Fayan Wenyi

However, if you look for a separate last phrase outside of (such) a critical move how could this not be, again, a betrayal of the former sages? (Have you) not seen what the ancient one said, "I will explain the last phrase for you: it is the occasion on which illumination and darkness become a pair"?[47] Moreover, are the first phrase and the last phrase the same or different? If the masters and good teachers (善知識) test their skill (機) in the first phrase, then all they will do is hand out a phrase with no reason (道理). Since it is a phrase with no reason and cannot be clearly analyzed, students may take their own limited estimations. Some construct understandings of the unconditioned (無為) and doing nothing (無事) and some have eyes with more sophisticated attachments such as our tradition's going beyond.[48] (Thus)

法眼文益 (885–958) (T 1991.47.591a08–9), we should be cautious about attributing the verse to Fayan. As Yanagida Seizan points out, there are two extant versions of his recorded sayings extant (one from the *Xukai guzunsu yulu* and the other from the *Wujia yulu*) and their source(s) is/are unclear; see *Zenseki kaidai*, p. 476. It should be noted here, however, that the *Biyan lu* also attributes this verse to Fayan; see T 2003.48.173b15–16. For an alternative English translation of the entire verse, see Thomas F. Cleary and J. C. Cleary trans., *The Biyan lu* (Boston: Shambhala, 1992), pp. 214–215. In translating the verse above, I have chosen to follow the wording of the version found in the *Biyan lu*. (I therefore substitute *you* 有 for *hua* 話 and *yu* 喻 for *yu* 諭.) The last line of the verse was used as a capping phrase and collected in capping phrase anthologies; see Hori, *Zen Sand*, p. 448.

47 This verse, attributed to Xuedou Chongxian, also appears in case 51 of the *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.186c17–18). he is a dharma heir of Zhimen Guangzuo 智門光祚 (d.u.) of the Yunmen lineage. For over thirty years Chongxian served as the abbot of Zisheng Monastery 資聖寺 on Mt. Xuedou 雪竇山 in Zhejiang province.

48 Despite what is presumably its humble beginning as a word that means something like "go or face upward" (the character *xiang* 向, as Koga and Iriya point out, is grammatically equivalent to the more formal *yu* 於), "going beyond" (Ch. *xiangshang*, Kr. *hyangsang* 向上) has come to carry deeper connotations in the Chan context; see Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, pp. 127–128; see also Urs App trans., *Master Yunmen: From the Record of the Chan Teacher "Gate of the Clouds"* (New York: Kodansha International, 1994), 89, note 1. Reflecting critically on Harold Bloom's ruminations on the anxiety of influence, Dale S. Wright offers an interesting reading of "going beyond" in his book *Philosophical Meditations on Zen Buddhism* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1998), esp. 139–156. See also Hori, *Zen Sand*, p. 653. Generally in Buddhism it refers to improvement spiritually.

becoming the controller[49]—this is what Dahui called a critical move.

Others of mediocre or lesser capacity only recognize the dharma body and go even lower to seeking awakening in the perspective of one form.[50] This too has not yet settled the matter. That is, this is not like the last phrase, which moves from the shallow to the deep and to what is still deeper. This causes a student to exhaust the subtle bondages of the Dharma. This can be a cure for those who lug around the seal of the Dharma.[51]

Yantou (Quanhuo)[52] remarked that Deshan (Xuanjian)[53] did not

---

49 For the "controller" (Ch. *zhuzai*, Kr. *jujae* 主宰) inside the five *skandhas*, see the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.447a22).

50 This seems to be referring to the Here, "the (great) matter of one form" or "the (great) matter of a single color" (*yise bian shi* 一色邊事), is probably referring to the attainment of equanimity. The same idea appears to have been used in this sense in case 13 of the *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.154b8) as noted by Thomas and J. C. Cleary; see Cleary and Cleary, *Blue Cliff Record*, pp. 91 and 93. The character bian 邊, as Koga and Iriya point out, means something like "of this or that house/tradition" or "from this or that perspective"; Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 417; cf. the *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.760a18).

51 The seal of the Dharma (*fayin* 法印) implies a sense of certainty as no mistake can be made if the "seal" (of approval) and its trace are identical. The metaphor of the tally (*fu* 符) is used in a similar manner in Chan literature. Concerns about a premature sense of certainty are a common motif in Chan literature as in the case of the record of Huangbo Xiyun 黃檗希運 (d. 850); see his record in fascicle 8 of the *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* (XZJ 135.664b7–10); also cited in the *Zongjing lu* (T 2016.48.477a14).

52 Yantou Quanhuo 巖頭全豁 (828–887) is said to have received formal transmission from Deshan Xuanjian (see note 53 below). Quanhuo served as abbot in Yantou or Mt. Wolong 臥龍山 near Dongting lake 洞庭湖 in Hunan province.

53 Deshan Xuanjian, a dharma heir of Longtan Chongxin 龍潭崇信 (d.u.), hails from Jiannan 劍南 in Sichuan province. His surname is Zhou 周. He was an expert of the *Diamond Sūtra* and was therefore known as Diamond Zhou (Jin'gang Zhou 金剛周). At the beginning of the Dazhong 大中 era (847–859) he was invited to serve as the abbot of Deshan 德山 in Wuling 武陵, Hunan province. Xuanjian, whose posthumous title is Great Master Jianxing 見性大師, was also a contemporary of Linji Yixuan and there seems to have been a rivalry brewing among their spiritual descendents during the early Song. The lineages that claimed descent from these two figures are known to have produced a collection of recorded sayings for the first four patriarchs of their respective lineages (and

understand the last phrase,[54] and Dahui remarked that "the World Honored One attained the last phrase as a critical move."[55] This is not an instance of taking the World Honored One and Deshan's temporary expedient means (方便) as the truth (實). However, in blaming them (i.e., the World Honored One and Deshan) all he wanted to do was to perfectly construct the last phrase. Because the last (stage) is perfectly formed it is called the last phrase. If you reach utmost perfection, how does this differ from the first phrase! Therefore it is said, "If you want to recognize the last phrase, then look for (your original face) before the time (your parents) were born."[56] This is why Kunshan said "sublime function" [usual endowment[57]] and "supernatural powers" [the present], Yuanwu said "the last (stage)" [*had already descended into the palace* and *had already completed the task of saving people*], Haiyin gave out a "shout" [penetrating the purport of the buddhas and patriarchs], and Songyuan said "in the beginning" [the first phrase].

---

both bore the same title *Sijia yulu* 四家語錄). Unfortunately, the collection produced by Deshan's lineage, which most likely consisted of the recorded sayings of Deshan, Yantou, Xuefeng Yicun 雪峰義存 (822–908), and Xuansha Shibei 玄沙師備 (835–908), is now lost. The other collection, however, is still extant, albeit only in the form of a Ming reprint. For a copy of this collection printed in Japan in 1648, see Yanagida Seizan ed., *Shike goroku, Goke goroku, furoku Hōkoshi goroku, Seppō goroku, Gensha daishi goroku* 四家語録·五家語録·附録龐居士語録·雪峰語録·玄沙大師語録, Zengaku sōsho 3 (Kyoto: Chūbun shuppansha, 1974).

54 For this story, see case 55 of *Wansong laoren pingzhang Tiantong Jue heshang songgu Congrongan lu* 萬松老人評唱天童覺和尚頌古從容菴錄 (hereafter *Congrong lu;* T 2004.48.262a20–c5). See also case 13 of the *Wumen guan* 無門關 (T 2005.48.294b28–c11). The story can be summarized as follows: Chan master Deshan Xuanjian missed his opportunity to have lunch, so he picked up his begging bowls and headed for the saṃgha hall. The cook Xuefeng Yicun witnessed this and said, "the bell hasn't been rung and the drum hasn't been beaten (to announce lunch), where is that old man think he's going?" Deshan immediately returned to his room. Later, Xuefeng told this story to Yantou who in reply said, "Even Deshan, so great, doesn't understand the last phrase."

55 For critical move, see note 41 above.

56 Source unknown.

57 In addition to one's original endowment or condition of life, *benfen* 本分 can in Chan literature also refer to one's responsibility or to the original state of realization itself. See Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, pp. 430–431; and also Hori, *Zen Sand*, pp. 668–669.

此話, 華嚴經離世間品, 十種微細趣散文, 述而爲詮也. 兜率, 具云兜率陁, 亦云覩史陁. 此云喜足, 亦云妙足. 喜足者, 謂於諸欲樂, 生喜足之心, 又得小喜悅爲喜, 更不求餘爲足. 佛佛出世, 皆從兜率天, 降生閻浮者, 何也? 兜率天, 兜欲天中中央天, 常處中道, 而不偏滯, 於諸欲境, 而不染着故. 此上妙足之義也. 此中王宮兜率, 度生出胎, 八相中四相. 八相者, 住兜率·降王宮·住胎·出胎·出家·成道·降魔軍·轉法轉法·入涅槃. 此則九相, 所謂八相者, 何也? 大無降魔, 魔則法界故; 小無住胎, 胎若虛空故. 然則大小乘, 互奪爲八相也. 又起信論云, 從兜率退王宮云云也, 佛佛出世, 皆以八相成道, 未離兜率云云者, 何也? 八相成道次第, 聲聞人曲見, 若約華嚴, 八相一時, 無前後次第. 故清涼疏云, "佛身無礙故, 法自爾故." 無盡居士, 昭化院記云, "夫華嚴之爲體也, 始終一念也, 今昔一時也, 十方一刹也, 三界一體也. 當體現前, 不涉情解." 則十無礙中, 時處無礙也. 未離云云, 處無礙; 未出云云, 時無礙. 則無邊刹境, 自他不隔於毫端; 十世古今, 始終不離於當念也.此是經義, 引以爲話者, 何也? 古人云, "非是華嚴, 說理未盡.但學者汨沒文字義理, 不能忘意了心." 所以達磨西來, 直指人心, 見性成佛. 則禪行事事無礙, 教說事事無礙也. 教家但說而行不得, 禪家一機一境上, 把得便用. 如云, "擲大千於方外, 納須彌於芥中, 皆吾輩之常分, 非假於他術" 又云, "擲大千於方外, 一日三出門外, 納須彌於芥中, 稊稗納於倉廩也." 古德云, "若談無上正理, 華嚴, 豈不圓極哉! 若然者, 何必達磨西來, 枝蔓上更生枝蔓! 達磨西來, 焉知不是這箇道理!" 則不可以事事無礙爲極則商量也. 古德頌云, "釋迦不出世, 四十九年說. 達磨不西來, 少林有妙訣." 則人人箇箇, 壁立千仞, 塵點劫前, 修行亦竟, 成佛亦竟, 更無添脂着粉地面目. 擧唱則此, 約最初句說也. 此說義雖高妙, 虛遠而無氣力, 汎濫而無辨白, 非宗師引教爲話之義, 則如何? 圓通善, 未離兜率, 着語云, '一月在天.' 已降王宮, 着語云, "影含衆水." 未出母胎, 云, "乾坤把定." 度人已畢, 云, "誰不蒙恩." 將此八相, 以配證化, 廣而爲八相. 未離兜率, 證也; 已降王宮, 化也. 就此化門, 亦有證化. 住胎, 證也, 出胎·出家·成道·降魔軍·轉法輪, 化也. 入涅槃, 亦證, 度人已畢, 是涅槃也. 此圓悟所謂始終. 略而爲四相. 離兜率而降王宮, 從證起化, 出母胎而度人已畢, 收化歸證. 此所謂去來通前後, 皆名規矩. 今旣未離至已畢, 則始終一貫, 初無去來, 證化斯亡. 須是不立規矩, 承言會宗, 始得. 大慧云, "末後一句子, 聲前露倮倮, 盖天盖地, 盖聲盖色.黃面老子, 得箇一著子, 便道云云." 已畢則此, 是末後句之一著子也. 謂是末後句之一著則可, 謂是末後句則不可. 指山而問焉曰山乎, 曰山則可. 山有草木土石, 皆擧之也. 指山中之一石, 而問焉曰山乎, 曰山則不可. 何得擧山之一石稱山云者哉! 故松源上堂云云. 又長靈云云, 未離兜率云云. 然則向出空入有變化無方處, 轉

得身, 吐得氣, 便會得末後句, 亦是一著猶欠會哉! 畢竟如何? '理極忘情謂, 如何話諭齊? 到頭霜夜月, 任運落前溪.' 雖然離一著外, 別討末後句, 又却不是大辜負先聖哉! 不見古人道, "末後句爲君說, 明暗雙雙的時節." 且如最初句末後句, 同別如何? 宗師善知識, 若向最初句中對機, 則不過下得沒道理的一句. 旣沒道理, 而無辨白故, 學者以己之局量, 或有作無爲無事會, 或有高著眼, 向宗門向上, 作主宰者, 大慧所謂一著也. 其餘中下之流, 只認得箇法身, 又下而悟得一色邊事, 亦未可定. 則不如末後句, 從淺至深, 以至於深之又深, 使學者, 蕩盡微細法縛, 荷擔法印之爲愈也. 巖頭謂德山不會末後句, 大慧謂世尊得末後句之一著, 非以世尊德山一期方便爲實. 然而歸咎, 只要圓成末後句也. 以末後圓成, 故曰末後句, 至於圓極, 則與最初句, 何以異哉! 故曰, "要識末後句,看取未生時." 崑山妙用<本也> 神通<今也>, 圓悟末後<已降度人>, 海印一喝<透佛祖也>, 松源末上<最初也>

Kunshan Huiyuan's[58] verse

Without having yet departed Tuṣita,
He has already descended into his father's palace,
Although he has already completed the task of saving living beings,
He still dwells in his mother's womb,
Neither does this stem from sublime function,
Nor is it supernatural powers,
Do not establish standards[59] on your own,

58 This refers to Baoben Huiyuan 報本慧元 (1037–1091). He attained awakening under Huanglong Huinan in 1066 and became his dharma heir. Two years later in 1068 he became the abbot of Shousheng Monastery 壽聖寺 in Jiangsu province and later became the abbot of Huiyan Cloister 慧巖院 on Mt. Kun 崑山 in the same province. He later served as the abbot of Baoben Chan Cloister 報本禪院 in Zhejiang province. He posthumously received the title Great Master Zhengwu 証悟大師.

59 *Guiju* 規矩 literally means something like "compasses and squares," and this literal translation may perhaps better capture the poetic spirit of Kunshan's (or Shitou's; see below) verse. But, for clarity's sake, I have decided to use "standards" as a translation for *guiju*. The *Shuowen jiezi* 說文解字 dictionary offers this gloss for *gui:* "legal standards" (*fadu* 法度); see Xu Shen 許慎, *Shuowen jiezi*, reprint (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju 1999), p. 216.

Receive the words and understand the source.[60]

崑山元頌, "未離兜率境, 已降父王宮; 雖度衆生畢, 猶居母腹中. 良由非妙用, 亦不是神通. 勿自立規矩, 承言須會宗."

[Explanation]

Kunshan:[61] *Without having yet left his mother's womb*: is to have not yet done something to have already done it and to have already done something to have not yet done it? (Kunshan) reduplicates the text of the gongan and raises it for comment.

Sublime function: this is to be just so.

Supernatural powers: this is to accomplish (lit. attain *siddhi*) right now. If neither sublime function nor supernatural powers, then you must *not establish standards*. *If you receive words and you must understand the source*: If so, then this comes close to what is said above: "to not yet do something is to have already done it and to have already done something is to have not yet done it."

崑山未離至腹中者, 未然卽已然, 已然卽未然耶? 話文重擧也. 妙用者, 本自如然也. 神通者, 今日成就也. 旣非妙用, 亦非神通, 則須是不立規矩, 承言會宗始得. 然則前云, 已然卽未然未然卽已然之義, 近是.

Yuanwu Keqin's[62] verse[63]

60 The last two lines is most likely a borrowing from Shitou Xiqian's 石頭希遷 (700–790) *Cantong qi* 參同契 (T 2076.51.459b19). They were also cited in Yongming Yanshou's 永明延壽 (904–975) *Zongjing lu* 宗鏡錄, compiled in 961 (T 2016.48.764b10–11).

61 This name and the other names below, as the editors of the HBJ duly note, are not found in all editions of the *Seonmun yeomsong* and its *seolhwa* and were, therefore, inserted into the text by the editors themselves presumably for the sake of clarity.

62 Yuanwu Keqin is a dharma heir of Wuzu Fayan 五祖法演 (1024–1104). Keqin, a Sichuan native, served as abbot of Taiping Xingguo Monastery 太平興國寺 on Mt. Jiang 蔣山 (present-day Nanjing), Tianning wanshou Monastery 天寧萬壽寺 in the Eastern Capital (present-day Kaifeng), Zhenru

The great elephant[64] originally has no shape,
Perfect vacuity embraces all existing things,
He went last but has already passed far by,[65]
Facing South he sees the North Star,
The king's palace and Tuṣita,

Cloister 真如院 on Mt. Yunju 雲居山 in Jiangxi province etc. He was given the posthumous title Chan Master Zhenjue 真覺禪師. For a monograph-length study on Yuanwu in English, see Hsieh, "A Study of the Evolution of K'an-hua Ch'an in Sung China: Yüan-wu K'o-ch'in (1063–1135) and the Function of Kung-an in Ch'an Pedagogy and Praxis" (Ph.D. dissertation, University of California Los Angeles, 1993).

63 For this verse, see also the *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.800c17–21).

64 *Daxiang* 大象 is an epithet for the Buddha; see the *Zongjing lu* (T48.2016.479c05–10). Though I have chosen to translate this literally as "great elephant" the term can also denote something more abstract like the "great schemata"; see the discussion of this term in Sharf, *Coming to Terms with Chinese Buddhism: A Reading of the Treasure Store Treatise* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2005), p. 150. As Sharf points out, the great schemata may be an allusion to two passages from the *Daode jing* 道德經 or Laozi 老子 stanza 35: "Take hold of the great schemata and all under heaven will come to you" (*zhi daxiang tianxia wang* 執大象天下往) and stanza 41: "The great schemata are without form" (*daxiang wuxing* 大象無形). The latter is clearly the reference that Yuanwu had in mind. As for the meaning of the great schemata, Sharf makes a claim that is worth quoting in full:

> While commentaries to the *Daode jing* gloss *daxiang* as an epithet for the Dao itself, a more precise understanding of the term can be found in the *Yijing*. The great schemata are the subject of extended discussion in the third and fourth Wings (*yi* 翼), namely, the *Xiangzhuan* 象傳. Here a distinction is made between the "great images" 大象, that is, the two trigrams of the hexagram taken as wholes, and the "small images" 小象, which are enigmatic references to individual lines attributed to the Duke of Zhou. *Daxiang* is understood as the image or idea of the situation manifest in the overall pattern of the hexagram" (Sharf, *Coming to Terms with Chinese Buddhism*, p. 150).

Here, I have decided to translate *daxiang* as "great elephant" to underscore what appears to be the intended pun—the great elephant (*daxiang*), that is, the Buddha (the subject on which Yuanwu is offering verse comment), like the great schemata (*daxiang*), has no form.

65 This line is most probably an allusion to the well-known phrase: "the first one to go did not yet arrive but the last one to go passed far by" (*xianxing bydao mohou taiguo* 先行不到末後太過); for instance, see *Yangqi Fanghui heshang yulu* 楊岐方會和尚語錄 (T 1994A.47.645a3), *Xutang*

Saving beings and leaving his mother's womb,
From beginning to end a single thread,
No coming or going from the outset,
Sweeping away the footprints, erasing the traces, and doing away with the root,
A lotus flower in the midst of flames[66] has blossomed here and there.

> 圜悟勤頌, "大象本無形, 至虛包萬有. 末後已太過, 面南看北斗. 王宮兜率, 度生出胎, 始終一貫, 初無去來. 掃蹤滅迹除根蔕, 火裏蓮花處處開."

[Explanation]

Yuanwu: *The Great Elephant … perfect vacuity embraces all existing things*: existence is non-existence and non-existence is existence.

He went last … North Star: there is no past, future, north, or south. Therefore he said, *The king's palace … no coming and going from the outset*. That is to say, *sweeping away the footprints, erasing the traces, and doing away with the root*.

A lotus flower in the midst of flames has blossomed here and there: this is auspicious and propitious. Yuantong said, "If heaven and earth are under control, then you sweep away the footprints, erase the traces, do away with the root, and demolish the nests and caves. All the buddhas, living beings, bodhi, and nirvana – an understanding (of such things) cannot be had. If (you)

---

heshang yulu 虛堂和尚語錄 (T 2000.47.987a27–28), and *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* 宏智禪師廣錄 (T 2001.48.41c15) among others. See also Koga Hidehiko and Iriya Yoshitaka's explanation of this phrase in their *Zengo jiten* 禅語辞典 (Kyoto: Shibunkaku, 1991), p. 256. For a useful overview of the content and form of the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu*, see Morten Schlütter, "The *Record of Hongzhi* and the Recorded Sayings Literature of Song-Dynasty Chan."

66 "A lotus flower in the midst of flames" (*huoli lianhua* 火裏蓮花) is a metaphor whose locus classicus is Yongjia Xuanjue's 永嘉玄覺 (665–713) *Zhengdao ge* 證道歌; see T 2076.51.461a. The metaphor itself seems to be an old one. It also appears, for instance, in the *Nirvana Sūtra* (T 374.12.472c20 & T 375.12.715c5) and the *Vimalakīrti Sūtra* (T 474.14.530c3 & T 475.14.550b4).

let (them) go (放行),[67] *a lotus flower in the midst of flames blossoming here and there* will be auspicious and propitious." If so, *sweep away the footprints, erase the traces* is the meaning of Dahui's verse. *A lotus flower in the midst of flames blossoming here and there* is the meaning of Zhu'an's verse. How could it not be the meaning of Changling's "come out of emptiness, enter existence, and undergo endless transformations"? Therefore we can see that "You can try to bore a hole your whole life but the ends won't meet"[68] means "guidelines do not exist."[69]

圜悟: 大象至萬有者, 有卽無, 無卽有也. 末後至北斗者, 無前後南北也. 故云, '王宮至去來', 則 '掃蹤滅迹除根蔕' 也. 火裏至開者, 爲祥爲瑞也. 圓通云, "若把定, 則掃其蹤滅其迹, 除其根蔕, 蕩其窠窟, 諸佛衆生, 菩提涅槃, 了不可得也; 若放行, 則火裡蓮花, 處處開敷, 爲祥爲瑞." 然則掃蹤至蔕者, 大慧頌義也; 火裡至開者, 竹庵頌義也, 豈非長靈出空入有變化無方之義耶! 然平生穿鑿不相關, 則不存軌則之義, 可知也.

67 See note 37 above.

68 See Zhu'an Shigui's verse below. For "bore a hole" (*chuanzuo*); see note 77 below.

69 "Guidelines" (Ch. *guize*, Kr. *gwechik* 軌則). It should be borne in mind that gui 軌 also refers to the distance between cart wheels or the wheel ruts on the road and has by extention come to refer to something like an established way of doing things; cf. Sharf, *Coming to Terms*, p. 157. It is in this sense that I use the word "guideline" or, literally, a line that is being used to guide measurement and thought. The phrase "guidelines do not exist" itself may have been borrowed from the *Xinxin ming* 信心銘 (T 2010.48.376c26 or T 2076.51.1457b15), but a more likely source, perhaps, is the oft-cited teaching, "when the great function is manifest, no guidelines are left behind." In this example what we seem to have is, again, the idea that when the Chan master or sage demonstrates the true function (as opposed to just having and not revealing the true potential, essence, or *ti* 體) he does not therefore leave any guidelines for others to follow. The teaching is cited in the entry for the monk Daan 大安 (793–883) in the *Zutang ji* (ZTJ 5/4/10); also see his entry in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.267c24). Yunmen Wenyan also seems to have been fond of citing this teaching; see *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T 1988.47.554c02 and 571b22). See also the explanation in Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 293. In the Chan and Seon context "guideline" is metaphor for the Dharma or dharma body. For instance, in the *Zongjing lu*, we also find this telling quote from an unnamed ancient one: "As for the dharma body, dharma means 'to abide by the rules.' Rules refer to guidelines. They prevent people from producing individual understandings" (T 2016.48.900b28–29). For "bore a hole" (*chuanzuo*), see note 77 below.

Dahui Zonggao's[70] verse[71]

Honey on a sharp blade should not be licked,[72]
Water from a poison-ridden[73] house should not be tasted,[74]
If neither the rule to not lick nor to not taste is transgressed,
Then you will naturally return home with neat, embroidered clothes.

大慧杲頌, "利刃有蜜不須舐, 蠱毒之家水莫嘗. 不舐不嘗俱不犯, 端然衣錦自還鄉."

---

70 Dahui Zonggao 大慧宗杲 (1089–1163), also known as Miaoxi 妙喜, is a dharma heir of Yuanwu Keqin. He became the abbot of a hermitage named Yunmen an 雲門庵 in 1130. He therefore is often referred to as Yunmen Zonggao. Four years later he moved to Yangyu Hermitage 洋嶼庵 in Fujian province and began to openly criticize what is known as "silent illumination" (Ch. *mozhao* 默照). He also served as abbot of Nengren Chan Cloister 能仁禪院 on Mt. Jing 徑山 and Ayuwang Monastery 阿育王寺 in Zhejiang province. For more on Dahui, see Miriam Levering, "Ch'an Enlightenment for Laymen: Ta-hui and the New Religious Culture of the Sung" (Ph.D. dissertation, Harvard University, 1978).

71 The verse also appears in the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.850c7–10) and in the *Donglin heshang Yunmen anzhu songgu* (XZ J118.795b4–6; cf. note 2 above).

72 This is an allusion to a line from the *Fo benxing ji jing* 佛本行集經 (T 190.3.717c23).

73 *Gudu* 蠱毒 is usually translated as "poison," but it should be borne in mind that the term seems to have originally referred to worms that dwell in the intestines and blood (i.e., tapeworms); for instance, see the explanation in the *Yiqie jing yinyi* 一切經音義 (T 2128.54.417b9): "*gudu* (the first character is pronounced *gŭ* or pronounced *yĕ*. Now we use the former pronunciation. The *Zilin* (dictionary) offers this gloss, 'Worms inside the stomach. Worms (form) lumps and harm people. It is a combined ideogram formed from the characters *xie* and *chong*.'

74 This line most likely refers to a saying that is traditionally attributed to Caoshan Benji 曹山本寂 (840–901): "(Act) as (you would) while passing by a poison-ridden village—don't (let) a single drop of water (from that village) get on (you)." The locus classicus for this quote is the entry for Caoshan in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* 景德傳燈錄, which was compiled in 1004 (T 2076.51.336c1–2). Not surprisingly, the same quote also appears in the *Fuzhou Caoshan Yuanzheng chanshi yulu* 撫州曹山元證禪師語錄 (compiled in Japan in 1766; T 1987A.47.529a23–24 and T 1987B.47.539a8–9), but this source should be used with caution as it appeared relatively late as part of the *Xu guzunsu yuyao* 續古尊宿語要 (compiled ostensibly in 1238) and again as part of the *Wujia yulu* 五家語錄 (compiled in 1630); see the *Xu guzunsu yuyao* (XZJ 118.897a9–10).

Zhu'an Shigui's verse[75]

Entering the sea of right and wrong lying down,[76]
Walking freely amongst the crowd of ravenous tigers,
You must not judge the self against right and wrong,
You can try to bore a hole your whole life but the ends won't meet.[77]

> 竹庵珪頌, "是非海裏橫身入, 豺虎群中自在行. 莫把是非來辨我! 平生穿鑿不相關."

Tianyi Yihuai[78] ascended the hall,[79] raised this gongan, and said, "This

75 This verse also appears in the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* 禪宗頌古聯珠通集 (XZJ 115.15b9–10).

76 In translating *hengshen* 橫身, "lying down," I follow Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, pp. 40 and 115. "Lying down" here denotes a sense of ease, which is consistent with the message of free roaming in the following line of Zhu'an's verse.

77 Here, Zhu'an is using the famous metaphor of "boring a hole" (Ch. *chuanzuo* 穿鑿) to refer to the kind of incongruity that we might associate with the English idiom, "sqaure peg in a round hole." In Chan literature this metaphor is usually used in the pejorative sense to ridicule those who obstinately try to use wrong views and understandings (Ch. *zhijian* 知見) to make sense of a koan or intellectual problem. Consider, for instance, the following reference to *chuanzuo* in the *Biyan lu:* "This matter does not lie in words and phrases. To prevent people later on from [trying to] bore a hole Xuedou drew on …" (T 2003.48.193a13–14). An even more telling example, perhaps, can be seen in the *Zhongguan lunshu* 中觀論疏: the various teachers use to bore a hole and differing theories abound; see *Zhongguan lunshu* (T 1824.42.102c15). One of the famous examples of boring a hole in Buddhism is that of a man who tries, in vain, to dig a hole in the dry earth to find water from the *Miaofa lianhua jing* 妙法蓮華經 (T 262.9.31c10; hereafter *Lotus Sūtra*).

78 Tianyi Yihuai 天衣義懷 (993–1064) is a dharma heir of Xuedou Chongxian. A record of Tianyi's teachings can be found in the *Tianyi Huai heshang yu* 天衣懷和尚語 preserved as part of the *Xu guzunsu yuyao* (XZJ 118.892a15–).

79 "Ascending the hall" (Ch. *shangtang*, Kr. *sangdang* 上堂), which most likely refers to the Chan master ascending the elevated platform in the Dharma hall to deliver a sermon on formal occasions, was one of the most important rituals performed by a Chan master during his tenure as abbot. The ritual seems to date back as early as the Song dynasty. For more on this ritual, see Mario

explanation of the gongan quickly traps people on level ground.[80] From the next visit to Deer Park[81] to the end at the site near the crane trees,[82] in between forty-nine years he cast a wide net. Branches and shoots grow on top of more branches and shoots."[83]

Poceski, "Chan Rituals of the Abbots' Ascending the Dharma Hall to Preach," in Heine and Wright eds., *Zen Ritual: Studies of Zen Buddhist Theory in Practice*, pp. 83–111. For the significance of ascending the hall *as ritual*, see Robert H. Sharf, "Ritual," in Donald S. Lopez, Jr., ed., *Critical Terms for the Study of Buddhism* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2005), pp. 245–269.

80 *Pingdi* 平地 or "level ground" is often used in Chan literature to denote a sense of ease, stasis, and lack of difficulty or challenge. Consider, for instance, the following words of Yunmen Wenyan 雲門文偃 (864–949): "On the level ground dead men are innumerable, but those who are able to pass through a thicket of thorns are skilled hands" (*Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* 雲門匡真禪師廣錄; T 1988.47.554b22–23). A "skilled hand" (Ch. *haoshou* 好手) refers to a skilled swordsman or archer. For instance, according to case 43 of the *Biyan lu:* "When the tip of two swords draw cross each other, there is no need to withdraw; a skilled hand is like a lotus in fire" (T 2003.48.180b3–4). See also Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 131.

81 *Luyuan* 鹿園 (alt. 鹿苑) or *Luyayuan* 鹿野苑 (Sk. Mṛgadāva, P. Migadāya) otherwise known as Sarnath is a small park located North-east of Vārāṇasī in present day Uttar Pradesh, India. According to legend, the Buddha, shortly after his enlightenment, performed the first "turning of the wheel" (Sk. *dharmacakra-pravartana*, P. *dhamma cakka ppavattana*, Ch. *zhuan falun* 轉法輪), that is, his famed first sermon on the middle way and four noble truths to the five bhikṣus at Deer Park. The sermon appears in the *Mahāvagga* portion of the Pāli *Vinaya* (I 10 ff.) and the *Saṃyutta Nikāya* (56.11). For secondary scholarship on this sermon, see Lambert Schmithausen's article "On Some Aspects of Descriptions or Theories of 'Liberating Insight' and 'Enlightenment' in Early Buddhism," in *Studien zum Jainismus und Budhhismus. Gedenkschrift für Ludwig Alsdorf*, edited by Klaus Bruhn and Albrecht Wezler (Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1981), p. 202, note 8. Though early (4–3 B.C.E.), scholars raised doubt as to its claim to be the first, "original" account of the Buddha's enlightenment, citing its sophisticated nature; see Schmithausen "On Some Aspects of Descriptions or Theories of 'Liberating Insight' and 'Enlightenment' in Early Buddhism," p. 203.

82 *Heshu* 鶴樹 or *śāla* trees here refer to the site of the Buddha's *parinirvāṇa* at the outskirts of Kuśinagara. According to legend, as the Buddha approached his final departure the trees, then in blossom, are said to have turned white like white cranes, hence their name. For instance, see the *Daban niepan jing* 大般涅槃經 (hereafter *Nirvana Sūtra;* T 374.12.369b18–19 and T 375.12.608c28–29).

83 *Zhiman* 枝蔓, here translated "branches and shoots," is a metaphor for the trappings of views

天衣懷, 上堂, 擧此話云, "恁麼說話, 早是平地陷人, 其次鹿園, 終乎鶴樹, 於其中間, 四十九年, 張羅布網, 枝蔓上更生枝蔓."

[Explanation]
Tianyi: What sort of opening is this?[84] Was it not mentioned before? "Principle, in its exalted (form), forgets emotions and locutions. How could …"[85]

天衣上堂云云, 是什麼孔竅? 前不云乎, 理極忘情謂, 如何云云?

Cuiyan Wenyue[86] ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and said,[87] "The

---

and of language, which have grown too extensive. The term seems to be used interchangeably with the more commonly used metaphor of the kudzu or wisteria (Ch. *geteng* 葛藤); for instance, see the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* 宏智禪師廣錄 (T 2001.48.109a15–16). Verbose Chan or lettered Chan (Ch. *wenzi chan* 文字禪) was often also referred to as *geteng chan* 葛藤禪. It also seems worth noting here that the *Yiqie jing yinyi* cites the *Maoshi* 毛詩 gloss, "to spread" (*manyan* 蔓延), and also cites the *Guangya* 廣雅 gloss, "growth of sprouts" (*miaochang* 苗長), which, though literal, seems to be largely consistent with the use of the term in Chan literature to refer to overly extended growth; see T 2128.54.392c11. For the expression "branches and shoots grow on top of more branches and shoots," see also Tianyi Yihuai's sermon in the *Xu guzunsu yuyao* (XZJ 118.894a9).

84 Openings (Ch. *kongqiao* 孔竅) typically refer to the eyes, ears, nose, and mouth etc., but in Chan sources it is also used as a metaphor for a critical move or moment; see ZGD, p. 307b; and also Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 125.

85 See note 46 above.

86 Cuiyan Wenyue 翠嵓文悅 (998–1062), otherwise known as Yunfeng 雲峰, is said to have received formal transmission from Dayu Shouzhi 大愚守芝 (d.u.). After Dayu's death Cuiyan served as chief seat (*shouzuo* 首座) at Tongan Cloister 同安院 (in present day Jiangxi province) during Huanglong Huinan's 黃龍慧南 (1002–1069) tenure as abbot. He later went on to become the abbot of Cuiyan Monastery 翠嵓寺 (Jiangxi province), Falun Monastery 法輪寺 on Mt. Nanyue 南岳 (in present day Hunan province), and Yunfeng Monastery 雲峰寺 also on Mt. Nanyue. Following an old custom, Wenyue was also known by the name of the temple and/or mountain on which he served as abbot, that is, Cuiyan, Falun, and Yunfeng. For his recorded sayings, see the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.671b3).

87 This sermon also appears in Cuiyan's recorded sayings preserved as part of the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZ J118.683a5–11)

wheel of the Dharma[88] is here,[89] (and, though I) have a mouth, there is no use for (it). Do all of you people still get it?[90] If all of you get it, (then) the nose[91] of all the old reverends under Heaven are in the palm of your hand. If you do not understand, you may cry till blood flows out of your mouth, but this will be of no use. It is not as good as closing your mouth and enjoying what's left of spring."[92]

---

88 *Falun* 法輪 or "wheel of the Dharma" is most likely being used as a pun here to refer literally to the wheel of the Dharma (i.e., the Buddha's teachings or the truth) and to Cuiyan himself (Falun was also the name of the temple where he probably delivered this *shangtang* sermon while serving as abbot); see note 86 above.

89 "Arriving here" (Ch. *dao zheli* 到這裏) seems to also work very much like the colloquial English expression, "well, here we are (but now what do we do?)."

90 As Koga and Iriya point out, *weixi* 委悉 simply means "to know," but the term usually refers to knowing something thoroughly and completely; see Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 10. But since the term is being used in a colloquial manner here I have chosen to translate the term as "get it" to preserve the colloquial tone of Cuiyan's sermon. Since the set phrase "do you still get it" (Ch. *hai weixi* 還委悉) also often appears without the character *xiang* 相, I take that to mean the character can be ignored; cf. *Yuanwu foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.714c17, 720c29, 723b04 etc.).

91 The term *bikong* 鼻孔 literally means "nostrils," but, as Koga and Iriya rightly point out, *bikong* is better understood as "nose"; see their *Zengo jiten*, p. 392. As Koga and Iriya also point out, in Chan literature the nose is used as a metaphor for one's "original face" (Jp. *honrai no menmoku* 本来の面目); see Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 392. Koga and Iriya, however, do not cite what appears to be the earliest reference to the nose as one's original face preserved in the *Zutang ji:* "Question: Before your parents were born where was your nose?" 問父母未生時鼻孔在什摩處 (ZTJ 4/117/4). It should be pointed out here that there is good reason for this analogy. Consider, for instance, the fact that the *Shuowen*, fascicle 4, offers this gloss for the character *zi* 自 ("self"): "nose" 鼻也 (Xu Zhen, *Shuowen jiezi*, 74). The character itself, we are also told, is a pictograph representing the nose. The phonetic radical *bi* 畀 seems to have been added later to distinguish *bi* 鼻 from *zi*. It seems worth noting here also that *bikong* should in some cases be translated as nostrils and not nose (nor self for that matter); cf. the references to "nostrils let out breath" (T 1998A.47.821a2 and T 2001.48.48c17) and "putting a thread through people's nostrils" (T 1995.47.649c5–6).

92 This is a quote from a poem by the renowned Tang poet Du Xunhe 杜荀鶴 (846–904) entitled "Listening to the Cuckoo" 聞子規 (*Quan Tang shi* 全唐詩 [Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition] 693, 9b):

翠嵓悅, 上堂, 擧此話云, "法輪, 到這裏, 有口無用處. 你等諸人, 還相委悉麽? 若相委悉, 天下老和尙鼻孔, 總在你手裏; 若也不會, 啼得血流無用處, 不如緘口過殘春."

[Explanation]

Cuiyan: *The wheel of the Dharma has reached here … there is no use for it*: this does not simply mean that it cannot be said but that one must do his best to say it.

Do all of you … knowing the Way for each other: to care for others one must be thorough.[93] This can be known from what follows.

翠巖: 到這至用處者, 非但道不得之義, 盡力道得也. 你等至悉麽者, 爲人須爲徹, 下從可知也.

Haiyin Chaoxin[94] ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and said, "Dear friends, speak![95] What has old man Śākyamuni done for forty-nine

In the sky over Chu a full moon forms a wheel
The soul of (the Prince) of Shu cries and cries to let people know
You may cry till blood flows (out of your mouth), but this will be of no use
It is not as (good) as closing (your) mouth and enjoying what's left of spring

楚天空闊月成輪 蜀魄聲聲似告人 啼得血流無用處 不如緘口過殘春

This poem is alluding to an old legend about the exiled Prince of Shu, Du Yu 杜宇, who, having turned into a cuckoo after death, continued to shed tears of blood. The Chinese word for cuckoo (*dujuan* 杜鵑) can also refer to spotted azaleas, a type of red flowering shrub.

93 The phrase "to care for others one must be thorough" (Ch. *weiren xu weiche*, Kr. *wi-in su wicheol* 爲人須爲徹) is sometimes accompanied by the phrase "to kill a person one must see blood" (Ch. *sharen xu jianxie*, Kr. *sarin su gyeonhyeol* 殺人須見血); see *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.765a4–5); *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.170b4); and also *Mi'an chanshi yulu* 密菴禪師語錄 (T 1999.47.958c23).

94 Little is known about Haiyin Chaoxin 海印超信 (d.u.) who is a dharma heir of Langye Huijue 瑯琊慧覺 (d.u.).

95 Here I translate *qiedao* 且道 as "speak!" Using the word *qie* before another word, as Koga and Iriya point out, has the effect of loosening or lightening up the tone and tenor of what one is trying to say

years? Please try to shed some light on this. Anyone? Therefore it is said, 'all buddhas appear in the world, and they deserve a good twenty blows.[96] Bodhidharma came from the West and he deserves a good twenty blows. There still remain another twenty blows, so don't move (動著).[97] Move and I'll strike your waist." And then he let out a shout (喝).[98]

海印信, 上堂, 擧此話云, "諸仁者, 且道! 釋迦老子, 四十九年, 當爲何事? 請試明辨看. 還有麼? 所以道, '諸佛出世, 好與二十棒; 達磨西來, 好與二十捧.' 更有二十棒, 切忌動着! 動着則打折你腰." 喝一喝.

[Explanation]

Haiyin: *Speak! … Bodhidharma came from the West, and he deserves a good*

(Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 187). There is no easy way to translate the word into English, but the colloquial expressions "well then," "anyhow …," "so …" seem to come close. In the present context, it seems best to leave it untranslated.

96 Twenty blows and the oft-cited thirty blows is a metaphor borrowed from the legal system; see Sharf, "How to Think with Chan *Gong'an*," p. 207.

97 For the translation, "move" (Ch. *dongzhuo*, Kr. *dongchak* 動著), which can be translated as "adapt," see Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 346.

98 Here the shout (Ch. *he*, Kr. *hal* 喝), as Bernard Faure, points out should not be transliterated but rather translated as the master "shouted"; see Bernard Faure, *Chan Insights and Oversights: A Epistemological Critique of the Chan Tradition* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1996), p. 69, note 23. Hitting a student before he can say anything or any more than he has already said is a common motif in gongans. According to Yuanwu, Deshan Xuanjian 德山宣鑑 (782–865) is said to have been particularly famous for his blows and Linji Yixuan 臨濟義玄 (d. 867) for his shouts; see the *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.148c28); and also old case 633 and 672 of the *Seonmun yeomsong*. The shout seems to have been a method of taking a preemptive strike at the dualism that is implied in the question itself. For references, see Robert E. Buswell, Jr., "The 'Short-cut' Approach of K'an-hua Meditation: The Evolution of a Practical Subitism in Chinese Ch'an Buddhism," p. 364, n.0 51. The earliest reference to the catchphrase "Linji's shout and Deshan's blow" (*Linji he Deshan bang* 臨濟喝德山棒) seems to appear in Shoushan Shengnian's 首山省念 (926–993) entry in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.304b2). For the significance of this reference, see Yanagida Seizan, *Zen bunken no kenkyū* (*jō*) 禅文献の研究·上, Yanagida Seizan shū 2 (Kyoto: Hōzōkan 2001), p. 386; and also Abe Chōichi, *Zōtei Chūgoku Zenshūshi no kenkyū: Seiji shakaishiteki kōsatsu* 増訂中国禅宗史の研究—政治社会的考察— (Tokyo: Kenbun shuppan, 1986), 285–286. Abe's arguments must be approached with caution.

twenty blows: during the forty-nine years of explaining the Dharma, not a single word was uttered.[99] That the teachings of the buddhas and that of the patriarchs is not without their faults is the meaning of this gongan.

There still remain another twenty blows … let out a shout: you should know that there is only this one opening.

海印: 且道至達磨西來好與二十棒者, 當四十九年說法, 未曾說一字也. 佛教祖教, 未得無過, 卽此話義也. 更有二十棒至喝一喝者, 須知有這一竅, 始得.

99 The claim that the Tathāgata did not utter a single word is well attested in Mahāyāna literature. For instance, we find such a claim being made in the *Lankāvatāra sūtra*, a historically important text for the Chan tradition; see *Lengjiaabaduoluo baojing* 楞伽阿跋多羅寶經 (T 670.16.506c5–6); for an English translation of the passage in question (from the Sanskrit), see D. T. Suzuki trans., *The Lankavatara Sūtra: A Mahayana Text*, reprint (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 2000), p. 167. The claim also appears in two famous passages from the *Tathāgataguhya sūtra*. One of these passages is worth quoting in full:

> O Śāntamati, bewteen the night in which he attained perfect Buddhahood and the night in which he attained parinirvana without remainder, the Tathāgata did not utter a sound. He did not speak, he does not speak, and he will not speak. But all sentient beings, with different dispositions and interests and in accordance with their aspirations, perceive the Tathāgata's diverse teaching as if it were coming forth (from the Tathāgata himself). And each of them thinks, "The Lord is teaching the Dharma to me, and I am hearing the Lord teach the Dharma." But the Lord has no concept of this and makes no distinction. O Śāntamati, this is because the Tathāgata is free from all conceptual diversity, consisting of the traces of the network of concepts and distinctions (translation adopted from Malcolm David Eckel, *To See the Buddha: A Philosopher's Quest for the Meaning of Emptiness* [Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1994], p. 66).

For an alternative English translation of the above passage (cited in the *Prasannapadā*), see Mervyn Sprung trans., *Lucid Exposition of the Middle Way: The Essential Chapters from the Prasannapadā of Candrakīrti* (Boulder, CO.: Prajñā Press, 1979), pp. 262–263. For the corresponding passage in the Chinese translation by Fahu 法護 (963–1058), see *Rulai busiyi bimi dasheng jing* 如來不思議祕密大乘經 (T 312.11.719b20–c3; noted in Sharf, *Coming to Terms*, p. 309, note 62). For a classic study on this topic, see Nagao Gadjin, "The Silence of the Buddha and its Madhyamic Interpretation," in *Studies in Indology and Buddhology Presented in Honour of Professor Susumu Yamaguchi*, edited by Nagao Gadjin and Nozawa Joshu, pp. 137–151 (Kyoto: Hōzōkan, 1955). See also Sharf, *Coming to Terms*, pp. 99–100.

Chengtian Huai[100] ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and said, "Dear friends, let's say it isn't the case that the Buddha had not *already descended into the palace without having yet departed Tuṣita* and then say *without having yet left his mother's womb*, how then could he save people? If you are able to get it, then it can be said that you were able to transcend beyond the three phrases[101] with a single view and a rush flower simply remains in the

100 Little, if anything, is known about Chengtian Huai 承天懷. Could this be Tianyi Yihuai?

101 References to the three phrases or three propositions (Ch. *sanju*, Kr. *samgu* 三句) abound in Chan literature and many Chan masters seem to have devised their own three phrases or propositions for the purpose of instructing their students. The three phrases or propositions are often associated, for instance, with Linji Yixuan and Yunmen Wenyan. The earliest references to the three propositions can be found in the *Zutang ji*. In Yaoshan Weiyan's 藥山惟儼 (745–828) entry in fascicle four of the *Zutang ji* we find, for instance, a reference to the three propositions of Baizhang Huaihai 百丈懷海 (749–814) (ZTJ 1/171/5 & 1/177/7). For an explanation of the three phrases or propositions of Baizhang, see Mario Poceski, *Ordinary Mind as the Way: The Hongzhou School and the Growth of Chan Buddhism* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2007), pp. 207–212. In the *Song gaoseng zhuan* 宋高僧傳 we also find a reference to the three phrases or propositions of Xuansha Shibei (T 2061.50.782c13). For Xuansha's three phrases or propositions, see the *Xuansha Shibei chanshi yulu* 玄沙師備禪師語錄 (XZJ 126.415a4–b4). Although not mentioned by Poceski (I suspect because the relevant sources date only as far back as the Song), the following account of Baizhang's three propositions seems to shed much light on the provenance or, at least, the perceived function of the three propositions:

> The words of the teachings (of the Buddha) are all connected through the three propositions, namely the first, middle, and last good (*chu zhong hou shan* 初中後善). The first directly teaches you to set forth a good mind. The middle destroys (this) good. Only then does the last illuminate the good. "A bodhisattva who is not a bodhisattva is called a bodhisattva" and "the Dharma is neither Dharma nor not Dharma" are all examples of this. If one therefore answers with (just) one phrase he will cause people to enter hell. If he explains all three phrases he himself will enter hell as this bears no relation to the principal matter of the teachings (of the Buddha). It should be known that when the great ancient masters preached the Dharma they all relied on the guidelines of the buddhas and patriarchs. Those who do not know call (these guidelines) superfluous words. The mirror-like awakening of the present—this is the self-as-Buddha; this is the first good. Not obstinately dwelling in the mirror-like awakening of the present—this is the middle good. Also, to neither construct nor obstinately dwell in understandings—this is the last good (*Tiansheng guangdeng lu* 天聖廣燈錄; XZJ 135.671a5–6)

moonlight. If this isn't the case, you may attain the flesh or marrow (of Bodhidharma), but what use would there be for such things? You will miss the road to Caoxi[102] by eight-thousand miles." The master hit the meditation bench.[103]

承天懷, 上堂, 擧此話云, "諸仁者! 未離兜率, 已降王宮, 卽不無. 且道! 未出母胎, 如何度人? 若向這裏搆得去, 可謂一見能超三句外, 蘆花只在月明中. 若也未然, 得皮得髓將安用? 蹉過曹溪路八千." 擊禪床.

[Explanation]

Chengtian: *Without having yet left … how then could he save people*: this is

---

This account also appears in Baizhang's expanded record (XZJ 118.168b6–8). What Baizhang has in mind here seems to be a passage from Asanga's commentary on the *Vajracchedikā-prajñāpāramitā-sūtra* (Diamond sutra or *Jingang banruo boluomi jing* 金剛般若波羅蜜經; T 1510b.25.768b9–769a2 and T 1510b.25.770c3–771a4). As for the *Tiansheng guangdeng lu*, this important transmission history was compiled by the Song literatus Li Zunxu 李遵勗 (988–1038), a relative of the imperial family, and published in 1036. The *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* is particularly noteworthy because it is the first of its kind to receive a preface prepared by an reigning emperor, which in this case happens to be Renzong 仁宗 (r. 1022–1063); for its historical significance, see Welter, *Monks, Rulers, and Literati*, pp. 186–187.

102 Mt. Caoxi 曹溪 is the site of the sixth patriarch Huineng's temple Baolin Monastery 寶林寺. Following an old custom, Huineng was often referred to as Caoxi.

103 As no "meditation benches" or "Chan platforms" (Ch. *chanchuang*, Kr. *seonsang* 禪床) from the Tang or Song dynasty survive to this day, whether these "platforms" should indeed be called platforms, platformes, or something else is difficult to say with certainty. A valuable source in this respect is the *Gozan jissatsu zu* 五山十刹図, a copy of which was preserved at Daijōji 大乗寺 in Kanazawa 金沢, Japan. For partial reproduction, see the "*zuroku* 図録" in ZGD. According to the *Gozan jissatsu zu*, the "platform" or *chuang* seems to have been a bit too big for what we refer to as a platform but smaller than what we refer to as a platform. The *chuang* seems to have been small enough to be able to flip over. From context it seems to at times be equivalent to the chair or platform sat on by the abbot or person who ascended the hall to lecture or give sermons. For example, Linji ascended the hall to give a formal sermon and then descended from the meditation bench. See Ruth Fuller Sasaki, trans., Thomas Yūhō Kirchner, ed., *The Record of Linji* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2009), p. 131. At other times it seems to have been a long bench in the meditation or monks' hall.

an added comment[104] (拈) on the meaning of "saving people." It is also the meaning of *come out of emptiness, enter existence*.

Able to transcend beyond the three phrases with] a single view … in the moonlight: penetrate the three barriers[105] with one arrowhead and that the trail of the arrow is evident.[106]

Attain the skin … eight-thousand miles: Bodhidharma had ordered each of his disciples to explain what they had attained. From (Daofu) who attained his skin to Huike who attained his marrow (each of his disciples attained something, but Huike was made the second patriarch)[107] and the patriarchy continued in succession.[108] This is an internal affair of our tradition. Even so, this misses the Caoxi gate by eight-thousand miles. But we must not miss the road like this by eight-thousand miles. As for the road being eight-thousand miles, this may also point to the fact that India is eighteen-thousand miles away.

---

104 An "added comment" (Ch. *nian*, Kr. *yeom* 拈) refers to the comment that has been added to a saying or a phrase that was "picked up for comment."

105 Three barriers (Ch. *Sanguan* 三關) here must refer to the three phrases in Chengtian's verse. Huanglong Huinan's three barriers, which he is said to have used as a method of instruction during his stay at Jicui an 積翠庵 on Mt. Huangbo 黃蘗山 (Fujian province), seem to have been very popular during the Song dynasty. His three phrases are: "Why does my hand look like the Buddha's hand?" (Ch. *woshou he si foshou* 我手何似佛手), "Why does my leg look like an ass's leg?" (Ch. *wojue he si lujue* 我脚何似驢脚), and "Wherein lies the conditions of your birth?" (Ch. *he shi ru shengyuanchu* 何是汝生緣處); see the account in the *Linjian lu* 林間録 (XZJ 148.588a9–16), preface dated to 1107. For more on Huanglong's three barriers, see Juhn Ahn, "Who Has the Last Word in Chan? Transmission, Secrecy and Reading during the Northern Song Dynasty," *Journal of Chinese Religions* 37 (2009): 1–72.

106 See also *Jingde chuandeng lu* 29 (T 2076.51.452a2).

107 The text seems a bit confused here and I insert the above words cautiously as one possible way of making sense of the text.

108 For the most thorough treatment of the story of Bodhidharma's transmission of his flesh, bone, and marrow, to date, see Ishii Shūdō, *Sōdai Zenshūshi no kenkyū* 宋代禅宗史の研究 (Tokyo: Daitō shuppansha, 1987), pp. 105–122. For a summary of Ishii's argument, see Juhn Y. Ahn, "Malady of Meditation: A Prolegomenon to the Study of Illness and Zen" (Ph.D. Dissertation, University of California Berkeley, 2007), p. 54, note 107.

承天：未離至母胎如何度人者, 度人之義, 拈出也, 亦出空入有之義也. 一見至月明中者, 一鏃破三關, 分明箭後路也. 得皮至八千者, 達磨命門人, 各說所得, 自得皮至慧可得髓, 紹續祖位, 是門內事. 雖然如是, 曹溪門外, 蹉過路八千, 須是不蹉過此路八千, 始得. 路八千者, 亦指西天十萬八千之意.

Changling Shouzhuo[109] ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and said, "As for *without having yet departed Tuṣita, had already descended into the palace*, here the elder Śākyamuni covered his ears and stole the bell.[110] As for *without having yet left his mother's womb, had already completed (the task) of saving people*, although this is true,[111] he is still not a man who quickly puts an end to things. How much more so for also taking seven complete steps and staring at the four directions with his eyes? Where did he go? At that time the Patriarch had already fallen down completely. How could it be any different for his descendants today? If you wish to have your spiritual offspring prosper, then set forth a separate rules of purity (清規).[112] Try

109 Changling Shouzhuo 長靈守卓 (1065–1123) is the dharma heir of Lingyuan Weiqing 靈源惟清 (d. 1117). He first became abbot of Ganlu Monastery 甘露寺 in Anhui province and later served as abbot of Tianning wanshou Chan Monastery in the Eastern Capital (Henan province). Changling's teachings also appears in his recorded sayings, *Changling Shouzhuo chanshi yulu* 長靈守卓禪師語錄 (XZJ 120.307a1–).

110 *Yan er tou ling* 掩耳偷鈴 or *yan er dao zhong* 掩耳盜鐘 is an allusion to the famous story from the Zizhi 自知 chapter of the *Lüshi chunqiu* 呂氏春秋. When the Fan clan was destroyed a commoner wished to steal a great bell in the Fan's residence, but the bell was too big to carry away. The thief then tried to smash the bell into smaller pieces, but as he struck the bell it began to ring and, fearing that others might hear the ringing of the bell, he covered his own ears; see John Knoblock and Jeffrey Riegel trans., *The Annals of Lü Buwei* (Stanford: Standford University Press, 2000), pp. 612–613.

111 Here, *zhirao* 直饒 is a subordinating conjunction that means something like "although, "even though," or "even if." See the explanation in Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 183; and also ZGD, p. 829a. As for *yime* 伊麽, Koga and Iriya point out that the term is used interchangeably with other similar late Tang vernacular expressions such as *renme* 恁麼, *yimei* 異沒, *yimei* 伊沒, and *yume* 与麼, which means something like "like this" or "like that"; see Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, pp. 9, 28, and 460).

112 Whether the "rules of purity" here refers to the Chan monastic regulations known by the same

to reach that place where you come out of emptiness, enter existence, and undergo endless transformations[113] and then produce a turning phrase.[114]

長靈卓, 上堂云, "未離兜率, 已降王宮, 釋迦老子, 向者裏, 掩耳偸鈴. 未出母胎, 度人已畢, 直饒伊麼, 也未是性燥勦絶底漢. 何況更有周行七步, 目顧四方, 向什麼處去也? 祖父當時,旣已和身放倒, 兒孫今日, 又且如何? 欲得昌隆後嗣, 別現清規, 試向出空入有, 變化無方處, 下一轉語!"

---

name is unclear. Rules of purity or pure rules (*qinggui* 清規) is perhaps better translated as rules (*gui*) for the pure congregation (*qingzhong* 清衆). The best treatment of the development and significance of pure rules in English to date are T. Griffith Foulk, "Myth, Ritual, and Monastic Practice in Sung Ch'an Buddhism," in *Religion and Society in T'ang and Sung China*, edited by Patricia Buckley Ebrey and Peter N. Gregory, pp. 147–208 (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1993); and also Yifa, *The Origins of Buddhist Monastic Codes in China: An Annotated Translation and Study of the Chanyuan qinggui* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2002). These two sources disagree on the important issue of whether the development of pure rules can, indeed, be safely attributed to Baizhang Huaihai.

113 *Bianhua wufang* 變化無方 ("undergo endless transformations") is a well-known set phrase from the chapter on Wei 魏 in the *Sanguo zhi* 三国志 (and also from the *Hou Han shu* 後漢書). Cao Cao's 曹操 (155–220) skills in military strategy were so great that the formation of his troops would undergo endless or unrestricted transformations. Chinese Buddhists have used this phrase as an analogy for the liberation from attachments and *saṃsāra;* for instance, see the *Pusa yingluo jing* 菩薩瓔珞經 (T 656.16.99b26).

114 A turning phrase (Ch. *zhuanyu* 轉語) is an important concept in Chan. It usually refers to a reply that defies convention and common sense in a rhetorical way that many would easily identify with Chan. In doing so, a turning phrase is believed to quite literally turn the situation around and, in some cases, place the burden of producing a (better) reply on the one who initiated the Chan encounter; see Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 16 (cf. p. 329). Consider, for instance, the following passage from the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu:* "A monk asked Wuzu (Fayan), 'What is the Buddha?' The patriarch said, 'bare-chested and barefooted.' 'What is the Dharma?' (The patriarch) said, 'A great pardon but no release.' 'What is the Saṃgha?' (The patriarch) said, 'Mr. Xie's third son on a fishing boat.' The master (i.e., Dahui Zonggao) said, these (are) the three turning phrases. Each turn is replete with three mysteries and three essentials, the four determinations, for hosts and guests, the five ranks of Dongshan, the three phrases of Yunmen, the hundreds and thousands of teachings, and the immeasurable subtle meanings.' " (*Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu;* T 1998A.47.842c23–26).

Songyuan Chongyue ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and said,[115] "The gold-faced old man from the very beginning[116] carried a plank on his shoulder and saw only one side.[117] Eventually, although they tried their best to raise their legs, this caused the later generation of descendants to be unable to stand up."

松源, 上堂, 擧此話云, "黃面老子, 末上擔一片板, 只見一邊, 致令後代兒孫, 盡力擡脚不起."

[Explanation]
Changling and Songyuan
The explanation is already in the gongan.

長靈松源上堂, 話中已出.

115 The same sermon also appears in fascicle two of the *Songyuan Chongyue chanshi yulu* 松源崇嶽禪師語錄 (XZJ 121.605a9–11).

116 As Koga and Iriya point out, *moshang* 末上 means something like "from the very beginning" or "the very first"; Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 436. They note an important reference to this term in the *Zutang ji:* "What is the venerable's very first phrase?" (ZTJ 3/134/5).

117 For more on this analogy, see old case 639 of the *Seonmun yeomsong*. Elsewhere translated as "blinkered."

Case 2.
The World Honored One Walks a Circuit
世尊周行

[Old Case]

When the World Honored One was just born he walked a circuit, taking seven steps and gazing[118] in each of the four directions.[119] With one hand he pointed to Heaven and with the other hand he pointed to the earth and said, "I alone am the honored one above and below Heaven."[120] (Yunmen

---

[118] Here, I use the translation "gazing" for *mugu* 目顧, but the term more likely means something like "contemplating" the four cardinal directions.

[119] Here, I insert the terms "each of" into the text to remain consistent with the way in which this gongan is explained in the *seolhwa* 説話 explanation. For a critical reflection on the famous seven steps of the Budha, see Paul Mus, *Barabuḍur: esquisse d'une histoire du bouddhisme fondée sur la critique archéologique des textes*, vol. 1 (Hanoi: Imrimerie d'Extrême-Orient, 1935), pp. 457ff.; and also Alfred Foucher, *La vie du Bouddha d'après les textes et les monuments de l'Inde* (Paris: Adrien Maisonneuve, 1987), pp. 50–52 (both cited in John Strong, *The Buddha: A Short Biography* [Oxford: Oneworld, 2001], p. 157).

[120] This declaration appears in the Chinese translation of the *Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya* (T 1451.24.298a11) and Xuanzang's *Da Tang xiyu ji* (T 2087.51.902a27). What are possibliy earlier accounts offer a slightly different retelling of the Budha's purported first words: "I am chief in the world, supreme in the world, eldest in the world. This is my last rebirth, there will [henceforth for me] be no more re-becoming" (Maurice Walshe trans., *Thus Have I Heard: The Long Discourses of the Buddha* [London: Wisdom Publications, 1987], p. 205; cited in Strong, *The Buddha*, p. 40); cf. the *Chang ahan jing* 長阿含經 (T1.1.4c01–3). For a study of the Buddha's first words, see John Irwin, "The Mystery of the (Future) Buddha's First Words," *Annali del Istituto Universitario Orientale* 41 (1981): 623–653 (cited in Strong, *The Buddha*, p. 157).

Wenyan added a comment,[121] "If I had seen what he did at that time, I would have killed him with a single blow and given him to a dog to eat up. And I would thus attempt to bring great peace to all under Heaven.")[122]

世尊初[123]生下時, 周行七步, 目顧四方, 一手指天, 一手指地云, "天上天下唯我獨尊." <雲門偃拈, "我當時若見, 一棒打殺, 與狗子喫却, 媿[124]圖天下大平." >

[Explanation of the gongan]

This gongan is from a passage in the *Puyao jing*.[125] The sūtra says, "When the Buddha was just born in the kṣatriyan king's home the radiant light of great wisdom illuminated the world in ten directions and from the earth golden lotus flowers sprung forth and spontaneously supported both [of the Buddha's] feet. North, south, east, and west, in each direction he walked seven steps. With each hand he pointed respectively to Heaven and to earth

121 The oldest extant version of this comment by Yunmen appears in fascicle 30 of the *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* (XZJ 135.900b5–7).

122 Like case 1, the source of case 2 is unknown, but it seems worth noting that the case does appear in the following sources: *Zongmen tongyao ji* (Yanagida and Shiina, *Zengaku tenseki sōkan* vol. 1, 6), *Donglin heshang Yunmen anzhu songgu* (XZJ 118.795b7–8), and the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.13a13–17). Both the *Zongmen tongyao ji* and *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* also include Yunmen's added commentary. The same is true for Dahui Zonggao's *Zhengfa yanzang* 正法眼藏 (XZJ 118.364a14–17).

123 I have left this term *chu* 初 untranslated. The term seems to be interchangeable with *cai* 纔 ("just" or "as soon as"); cf. a version of this story in Dahui Zonggao's *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 118. 364a14–17).

124 This character *kui* 媿 has not been translated. In earlier versions, the homonym *gui* 貴, not *kui* 媿, is used, but what is probably the earliest version of Yunmen's comment found in the *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* offers neither character and simply states: "I would attempt to bring great peace to all under Heaven" (*Tiansheng guangdeng lu*; XZJ 135.900b5–7). Here, I follow the *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* version.

125 No corresponding passage actually exists in the *Puyao jing* 普耀經, but one passage comes close: "When the crown prince was just born Heaven and earth shook. He took seven steps and declared, 'above in the heavens and amidst the world I am the most honored one'" (T 186.3.508c25–26).

and made the great lion's roar, 'Up and down and in the four intermediate directions no one is honored like me.'"

Walked a circuit: does this mean that he made a circuit and walked seven steps in all?[126] Since he walked seven steps in each of the ten directions, this means every step in a circuit was like walking seven steps. Making a circuit and taking seven steps corresponds to the seventh position (*wei* 位).[127] Is this why he took seven steps? Is it because in India they take seven as the greatest numerical unit?[128] Do they illustrate the auspicious, sympathetic resonance[129] of the seven factors of enlightenment?[130] The dragon king, when he falls to the earth, takes seven steps. Does the World Honored One take seven steps because he is the dragon king among men?[131] A lion cub, when it falls to the ground, takes seven steps. Does the World Honored One take seven steps because he is the lion among men?[132]

Gazed in the four directions: does it illustrate the four insights (知見)?[133]

---

126 Here, the *seolhwa* is raising a question about the ambiguity of the expression "walking a circuit" (Ch. *zhouxing*; Kr. *juhaeng* 周行) and "take seven steps" (Ch. *qibu*, Kr. *chilbo* 七步). In classical Chinese, this expression could, as the *seolhwa* is rhetorically implying here, be read in two ways, namely the Buddha "walked a circuit in seven steps" or he "walked a circuit and took seven steps (in each direction)." Given the context, the *seolhwa* rightly argues that the more reasonable reading is the latter.

127 What is meant by the seventh position here is unclear.

128 In ancient India, ten—the number of fingers—was actually considered the standard numerical unit as we can see, for instance, in the *Yajurveda*.

129 For sympathetic resonance, see Sharf, *Coming to Terms*, pp. 77–133.

130 The seven factors of enlightenment (Ch. *qi juezhi*, Kr. *chil gakji* 七覺支; S. *saptabodhyangāni*, P. *sattabojjangha*) are right discrimination, vigor, joy (*prīti*), pliancy (*praśrabdhi*), mindfulness (*smṛti*), concentration (*samādhi*), equanimity (*upekṣā*). To date, the best treatment of this subject in English is Rupert Gethin's book, *The Buddhist Path to Awakening: A Study of the Bodhi-Pakkhiyā-Dhammā* (Leiden: Brill, 1992).

130 See the *Nirvana Sūtra* (T 374.12.468a22).

132 See the *Chang ahan jing* (T1.1.5c5) and *Nirvana Sūtra* (T 374.12.431a13).

133 According to the *Zhongguan lun shu* 中觀論疏 (T 1824.42.158c19) and the *Weimo jing lue shu chuiyu ji* 維摩經略疏垂裕記 (T 1779.38.799b27–28), the four insights (Ch. *si zhijian* 四知見) refer

Does it illustrate the bodhi of the four wisdoms?[134] Is it the auspicious, sympathetic resonance of the four noble truths? The "question and answer chapter" (問答章) of the *Fozu chuanxin ji* says,[135] "Question: 'What is the meaning of gazing in the four directions?' Answer: 'It illustrates the wish to transcend the four marks[136] and realizing liberation.' Question: 'What is the meaning of pointing to Heaven with one hand?' Answer: 'It illustrates leaving the three realms and benefiting men and gods.' Question: 'What is the meaning of pointing to earth with one hand?' Answer: 'It illustrates the wish to deliver those in the three destinies and making sure they leave transmigration. It illustrates that this is what we mean by law.'"

Walking a circuit, taking seven steps … pointing to earth: all this wanted to say was the one line, *I alone am the honored one above and below Heaven*. As for putting it in this way, the Buddha said this because if one realizes the true dharma realm, forever cuts off ignorance, and attains utmost, supreme enlightenment then he becomes the utmost honored and utmost valuable one among heavenly beings and men. Therefore it is said, "there is no one like the Buddha above and below Heaven and there is no one from the world in the ten directions who can compare. All that exists in the world I have seen, but nothing is like the Buddha."[137] Dahui said,[138] "The elder Śākyamuni from

---

to the four reasons for which buddhas appear in the world, namely to disclose (Ch. *kai* 開), demonstrate (Ch. *shi* 示), have people awaken to (Ch. *wu* 悟), and enter (Ch. *ru* 入) the truth or enlightenment. See also Zhiyi's influential commentary, *Miaofa lianhua jing xuanyi* 妙法蓮華經玄義 (T 1716.33.682a18–19).

134 The four wisdoms (Ch. *sizhi*, Kr. *saji* 四智; Sk. *catvārijñāna*) refer to the four purified knowledges of wisdoms, namely the great mirror-like wisdom (which allows one to reflect all things in their true nature), wisdom of equality (which allows one to see all things as equal in nature), wisdom of wondrous perception (which removes one from doubt), and accomplishing transformation (which enables one to act on behalf of others).

135 The *Fozu chuanxin jie* 佛祖傳心偈 is no longer extant.

136 The four marks are the characteristics of all dharmas: birth, persistence, difference, and cessation.

137 This seems to be a reference to a verse from the *Fo benxing ji jing* (T 190.3.670a7–8).

138 The following sermon can also be found in the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.832b21–25).

Tuṣita Heaven rode a fragrant elephant[139] as bright as the sun and descended into the womb of Queen Māyā. Basically, this demonstrates the moment of each and every person's birth … . 'When he was just born with one hand he pointed etcetera.' Basically, this also demonstrates the way in which each and everyone is born."

As these revealed facts (消息) are not limited to Siddhārtha alone. Chan master Wuzhen[140] (thus) said, "'That elder Śākya(muni) as soon as (he) was born walked a circuit, taking seven steps (in each direction) etc.' There was such a special (event) (奇特). Anyway,[141] when the chief seat[142] was just born was there something special about it? If you say nothing, then you're avoiding (something that stands) right in front of your face."[143] *I alone*: is this "I" (我)

There are minor variances between the two versions of this sermon in the *seolhwa* and Dahui's recorded sayings and when these variances do occur I have on more than one occasion followed the recorded sayings version.

139 "Fragrant elephant" (Ch. *xiangxiang*, Kr. *hyangsang* 香象; S. *handhahastin*) here represents awesome power and strength and, accordingly, the ability to do as one pleases (cf. *Dazhidu lun* [T 1509.25.75b15–16] and *Shizhu piposha lun* 十住毘婆沙論 [T 1521.26.27a11]). The elephant was an important symbol in ancient India and in Buddhism. Perhaps the most famous elephant in Buddhism is the white, six-tusked elephant that appears in the famous dream of Queen Māyā. The six-tusked elephant is traditional symbol of the *cakravartin* king. Other famous elephants include the auspicious, rain-bringing white elephant in the Viśvaṃtara (P. Vessantara) *jātaka* and also the Buddha's past life as a huge elephant in the elephant *jātaka*; for these *jātakas* (or birth stories) in English, see Peter Khoroche trans., *Once the Buddha was a Monkey: Ārya Śūra's Jātakamālā* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1989), pp. 58–73 and 213–220 respectively.

140 Could this perhaps be Shishuang Chuyuan's student Daowu Wuzhen 道吾悟眞 (d.u.)?

141 As Koga and Iriya point out, *zhiru* 只如 here means something like "take for example" or "by the way" and largely functions as a rhetorical means of changing the topic (Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p.169). In colloquial English, a rough equivalent would be "anyway," hence the translation.

142 During the Song, the chief seat or senior (Ch. *shangzuo*, Kr. *sangjwa* 上座; Ch. *shouzuo*, Kr. *sujwa* 首座) was a high administrative position with the monastery and is often described as sharing teaching duties with or taking it over from the abbot. For the chief seat in Chan monastic codes (i.e., the *qinggui*), see Yifa, *The Origin of Buddhist Monastic Codes in China*, esp. pp. 157–158.

143 Source unknown.

the personal self (人我) or the great self[144] of the dharma body? Besides the "I" of the personal self there is no other great self of the dharma body. That is to say, a five feet tall sack of flesh[145] freely treads the three realms, coming from somewhere and moving over to somewhere else. That is to say, that which completely covers the dharma realm can only be oneself.

An ancient worthy said, "The mountain in the spring is, layer upon layer, dazzlingly green; the water in the fall is, ripple after ripple, flawlessly blue. Standing alone in the vast empty space between Heaven and earth where is the limit of (my) gaze?"[146] A, ha, ha! What is this?[147] North, south, east, and west, it is all just me.

Yunmen said, "*If I had seen what the World Honored One did at that time* etcetera": the World Honored One said what he said and suppressed disorder and returned the world back to order. He achieved great peace, but waves were made to rise where there is no wind and matters were created where there was nothing the matter with the world.[148] He was thus a hero in a disorderly world and a traitor in a peaceful one. That is to say, "Yunmen's vital spirit is like that of a king and yet he lacked the truth of the Buddha-

---

144 "Great self" (*dawo* 大我; S. *mahātman*) is the same as the "self" that is one of the four virtues (eternal, delight, self, and purity) spoken of in the *Daban niepan jing* 大般涅槃經 (Nirvana Sutra) as the self that is divorced from the attachments of the personal self. As the fundamental self that is achieved in nirvana, it is not different from no-self (*anātman*) and has the property of freedom. It is also a different name for the Buddha and indicates the true self of the bodhisattvas who benefit all sentient beings and who remove all views of the personal self. "Because he has the great self, that is named the great nirvana, and because nirvana has no self and is free, it is called great self" (T 374.12.502c15).

145 Sack of flesh or leather bag (Ch. *pinang*, Kr. *pinang* 皮囊) here refers to the body.

146 This verse is traditionally attributed to Xuedou Chongxian and can also be found in the *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.679c14–16).

147 This expression seems to have been well known; for instance, see *Yangqi fanghui chanshi yulu* (T 1994A.47.641c20; XZJ 118.402a5); and also Yunfeng Wenyue's sermon in the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.676b10).

148 The relationship of the Buddha, waves, and wind was mentioned by Seosan Hyujeong西山休靜 (1520–1604) in his *Seonga gwigam* 禪家龜鑑 (Divine Mirror of the Seon School),

Dharma." That is to say, the world is originally peaceful. This unravels the Buddha's origial intentions. Therefore it is said, "with this profound mind … the Buddha's blessing."[149]

Also, great master Changqing Zhaojue[150] ascended the hall and after a while said, "The skill (機) has been exhausted and given to you for you to see.[151] Be as if deaf or mute and only then will the horns[152] (of awakening) be revealed."[153]

Also, one person tried to provide a footnote for what Yunmen could not raise.

Also, (another person said,) "Discern[154] the great matter under your heels[155]

---

with the Buddha "appearing in the world stirring up waves (influencing sentient beings) without wind (producing ignorance)" (HBJ 7.635a5). This may be related to the *Qixin lun*'s explanation of the relation of afflictions (waves), awareness (ocean), and ignorance (wind); see T 1666.32.576c19–15. The Buddha influences without producing ignorance.

149 This seems to be a citation of a verse from the *Shoulengyan jing* (T 945.19.119b15); cf. *Zongjing lu* (T 2016.48.591c23) and *Linji yulu* (T 1985.47.506a03).

150 Changqing Zhaojue 長慶招覺 refers to Changqing Huileng 長慶慧稜 (854–932) who is a dharma heir of Xuefeng Yicun. In 906 Huileng was invited by the governor of Quanzhou in Fujian province to serve as the abbot of Zhaoqing Cloister 招慶院. He later served as abbot of Changqing Cloister in Fuzhou, Fujian province. He received the title Great Master Chaojue 超覺大師.

151 Here I follow the Neungga-sa edition and the National Library edition of the *seolhwa* and substitute *gan* 看 for *chak* 著. The subject of this sentence, as is the case for most sentences in classical Chinese, is not clear. In other words, it is unclear who exhausted his skills (i.e., is it Changqing or the Buddha?).

152 Here I offer a literal translation "horns" (Ch. *toujue*, Kr. *dugak* 頭角) for what may, as I suggest above, in fact refer more metaphorically to the first signs or indications of something great like awakening. The irony or double entendre, however, must not be lost here as the term tends to be used in the negative sense of the proverbial "horns" of a hare in Chan literature (Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 343).

153 Source unknown.

154 For "discern" (Ch. *renzhuo*, Kr. *inchak* 認著), which can also mean something like "recognize," "acknowledge," or "bear witness to"; see Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 366, but usually in a negative sense.

155 The phrase, "matter [beneath] the heels" (Ch. *jijiao zhi shi*, Kr. *jeukkak ji sa* 卽脚之事) seems

and you'll see that (a) when he stands on the ground upright (after) he is born from the right side of his mother underneath the tree of no sorrow in the flower (garden) at Lumbinī this is the first wheel of mind[156] (意輪) and the 'teaching of speaking after a while' (良久門); (b) *He walked a circuit … pointed to the earth* is the second wheel of the body and the teaching of 'showing signs of function' (頭角作用門); and (c) T*he honored one … above and below Heaven* is the third wheel of speech and the teaching of words and letters (言説門). Therefore, Haiyin's verse says, 'As soon as he descended to the palace he displayed his original etcetera.' Also, *just born* is an all-encompassing phrase (摠句). *Walked a circuit, taking seven steps in each of the four direction*s: this is to (sympathetically) resonate in the ten directions with a single body and thus to raise function (用) from essence (體). *Gazed in the four directions*: this is to share the four directions in a single eye and thus to subsume function and return it to essence. With one hand etcetera: this is to support Heaven and support earth and thus the middle phrase (中間句). *Above and below Heaven*: this is the last phrase (末後句)."[157] This explanation interprets the passage with subtlety and skill. The explanation has been perfectly prepared. However, in the work of the specialists of added comment and verse this theory is not found. I fear that it may be a speculative or made-up explanation.

此話, 普耀經文. 本經云, "佛初生下時, 刹帝利王家, 放大智光明, 照十方世界, 地湧金蓮花, 自然奉雙足. 東西及南北, 各行於七步, 分手指天地, 作大師子吼, 上下及四維, 無能尊我者." 周行者, 周而行七步耶? 能於十方, 各行七步, 則周足

to be closely related to the better known expression "the great matter beneath your heels" (Ch. *jiaogenxia dashi*, Kr. *gakkeunha daesa* 脚跟下大事); for the latter, see *Zengo jiten*, p. 84. What is striking about this passage is that it tries to use the above expression rather literally as the matter or story of where and how the Buddha stood just after his birth. The great matter beneath your heels is usually used as a metaphor for the (true) self or "where one stands" (existentially).

156 The significance of this expression, "the wheel of the mind" (Ch. *yilun*, Kr. *euiryun* 意輪), as well as the other subsequent expressions (i.e., wheel of the body and that of speech), is unclear.

157 Source unknown.

而行七步也. 周行七步, 位當第七故, 行七步耶? 西天以七爲數極故耶? 表七覺支瑞應耶? 龍王墮地行七步, 世尊人中龍王故, 行七步耶? 師子墮地行七步, 世尊人中師子故, 行七步耶? 目顧四方者, 表四知見耶? 表四智菩提耶? 四聖諦之瑞應耶? 佛祖傳心偈問答章云, "問, '目顧四方意旨, 如何?' 答, '表離四相, 願證解脫.' 問, '一手指天意旨, 如何?' 答, '表出三界, 利樂人天.' 問, '一手指地意旨, 如何?' 答, '表救三途, 定出輪廻, 表法則如是也.' " 周行七步云云指地者, 只要道箇天上 天下唯我獨尊的一句. 伊麽道得者, 證實法界, 永斷無明, 成最正覺, 天上人間, 最尊最貴故, 如是道得也. 故云, "天上天下無如佛, 十方世界亦無比. 世間所有我盡見, 一切無有如佛者." 大慧云, "釋迦老子, 從覩史天, 乘日輪香象, 降摩耶夫人胎. 只是示見箇人人生相地時節. 及至初生, 一手云云, 只是示見箇人人生相地樣子." 則此箇消息, 非局悉達一人. 故悟眞禪師云, "他釋迦老子. 才生下時, 周行七步云云, 有如是奇特. 只如上座初生下時, 有什麽奇特? 若道無, 當面諱却." 我者, 人我之我耶? 法身大我耶? 人我之我外, 更無法身大我也. 則五尺皮囊, 橫踏三界, 從何處轉何處, 則周羅法界, 唯自一人. 古德云, "春山疊亂青, 秋水漾虛碧. 寥寥天地間, 獨立望何極?" 阿呵呵, 是什麽? 南北東西唯是我. 雲門云我當時若見云云者, 世尊伊麽道, 撥亂返正, 致得太平, 無風起浪, 無事中起 事, 是亂世之英雄, 太平之奸賊也. 則雲門氣宇如王, 都無佛法道理, 則本太平也. 此暢佛本懷也. 故云, "將此深心, 至佛恩." 又長慶超覺大師, 上堂, 良久云, "盡其機, 與伊相看, 如聾若啞, 始露頭角." 又 "雲門提不起, 試註過與." 又 "認着印脚之事, 則藍毘尼苑, 無憂樹下, 從母右脇誕生, 端然立地時, 第一意輪, 良久門; 周行云云指地, 第二身輪, 頭角作用門; 天上天下至尊者, 第三口輪, 言說門. 故海印頌云, '才降王宮示本然云云' 也." 又 "才生下時, 摠句. 周行七步, 一身應於十方, 則從體起用. 目顧四方, 四方共於一目, 則攝用歸體. 一手云云者, 撑天撑地, 則中間句也. 天上天下云云者, 末後句也." 此說釋文巧妙, 說義圓備, 然於拈頌家發揚無此論. 恐是臆斷圖度之說.

Dahong Baoen's[158] verse

North, south, east, and west,

---

[158] Dahong Baoen 大洪報恩 (1058–1111) hailed from Liyang 黎陽 (present day Anhui province) and his surname was Liu 劉. Dahong is a dharma heir of Touzi Yiqing 投子義青 (1032–1083).

Up and below and in the four intermediate directions,[159]
Heaven is high and earth is thick,[160]
The hare runs and the crow flies,[161]

He first served as abbot of Shaolin Monastery 少林寺 near Luoyang. At the height of his career Dahong served as abbot of Lingfeng Monastery 靈峰寺 on Mt. Dahong 大洪, which he converted from a Vinaya monastery into a Chan monastery in 1094. For more on Dahong, see Morten Schlütter, *How Zen Became Zen: The Dispute over Enlightenment and the Formation of Chan Buddhism in Song-Dynasty China* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2008), pp. 79–95. For more on the distinction between Vinaya and Chan monasteries, see Foulk, "Myth, Ritual, and Monastic Practice in Sung Ch'an Buddhism"; see also Schlütter, *How Zen Became Zen*, pp. 31–54.

159 North, south, east, west, up, below, and the four intermediate directions are also simply known as the ten directions (Ch. *shifang*, Kr. *sibang* 十方). In Chan literature, the ten directions, in additions to their literal meaning, can also refer several things such as the public monastery or monastery of ten directions (Ch. *shifang cha* 十方刹) and also the universe. The ten directions, as a list, are often cited in Chan literature; see *Huanglong Huinan chanshi yulu* 黃龍慧南禪師語錄 (T 1993.47.634a9), and *the Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.77a11 and 411a1), and the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.308b9), and *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.348b5).

160 The phrase "Heaven is high and earth is thick" (Ch. *tiangao dihou* 天高地厚) is cited in the *Hou Han shu* (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 90下, 8. The *Hou Han shu* itself traces this phrase back to a poem from the Xiaoya 小雅 or Minor Odes section of the *Shi jing* 詩經 or *Book of Odes*: "We say that Heaven is high and yet dare not but stoop beneath it. We say that earth is think and yet dare not but take short cautious steps upon it"; see the *Maoshi zhushu* 毛詩注疏 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 19, 20a; cf. Arther Waley's classic translation in his *Book of Songs: The Ancient Chinese Classic of Poetry* (New York: Grove Press, 1996), p. 168.

161 This is a well-known metaphor for the relentless passing of time. The hare represents the moon and the crow for the sun. The metaphor is best remembered perhaps as the opening lines of the poem of the ninth-century poet Zhuang Nanjie 莊南傑 (*Quan Tang shi* [Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition] 24, 6b):

> The rabbit walks, the crow flies; they don't see each other.
> Human affairs are vague and uncertain—rapid as lightning.
> While the Queen Mother's bewitching peach flowers open a single time,
> In the jade storied buildings, pink variegated blossoms have changed a thousand times.
> Chariots and racehorses once traversed the Xianyang road;
> Former dwellings of the stone households—now empty wilderness grasses.
> Without passions, auuutumn rain does not regret the flowers;
> One by one, lotus blossoms turn upside down, their fragrance startled.
> I urge you, Milord, do not mistakenly plant briars and thorns,

At the time that he issued the command in Magadha,[162]
He almost lost the chance[163](機) that was right before his eyes,[164] For

Or, like the Illustrious One of the Qin, vainly waste strength sufficient to move a mountain.
His flourishing breath once departed, he never more will speak;
His white bones buried deep, the evening mountains turn cyan.

兔走烏飛不相見 人事依稀速如電 王母夭桃一度開 玉樓紅粉千回變 車馳馬走咸陽道 石家舊宅空荒草 秋雨無情不惜花 芙蓉一一驚香倒 勸君莫謾栽荊棘 秦皇虛費一作負驅山力 英風一去更無言 白骨沈埋暮山碧

The above translation has been adopted from Suzanne E. Cahill, *Transcendence and Divine Passion: The Queen Mother of the West in Medieval China* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1993), pp. 146–147. See also Cahill's explanation of the poem and the expression in question in her book, *Transcendence and Divine Passion*, p. 147.

162 The "command in Magadha" (Ch. *mojie ling*, Kr. *magallyeong* 摩竭令) most likely refers to the story of the Buddha shutting himself in a room in Magadha. The *Zhao lun* 肇論 seems to have played a rather important role in the dissemination of this story. There we find a reference to Śākyamuni shutting himself in a room in Magadha and also to Vimalakīrti shutting his mouth (i.e., maintaining silence) in Vaiśālī; see the *Zhao lun* (T 1858.45.157c13–14); for Viamalakīrti's infamous silence, see *Weimojie suoshuo jing* 維摩詰所說經 (hereafter *Vimalakīrti Sūtra*; T 475.14.551c). A reference to these stories can also be found in the *Baozang lun* (T 1857.45.146b1); cf. Sharf, *Coming to Terms*, pp. 209–210 (Sharf does not make note of the Buddha's story). See also the reference to these stories in the *Fanyi mingyi ji*'s explanation of the term *cakra* 斫訖羅 or "wheel" (T 2131.54.1140b29–1141a24). In Yunmen's entry in the *Zutang ji*, we find a reference to these stories and what appears to be the earliest exant reference to the Buddha shutting himself in a room in Magadha as the "command in Magadha": when asked about the teaching nonduality Yunmen replied, "without honoring the command in Magadha who can discuss (Viamalakīrti's silence) at Vaiśālī" (ZTJ 3/100/14–3/101/1).

163 This term, "opportunity" (Ch. *ji*, Kr. *gi* 機), is very difficult to translate. In addition to its literal meaning of "trigger," the term may also refer, among other things, to "potential," "knack," "(innate) aptitude," "force," "moving power," "device," "chance," "opportunity," "occasion," or "encounter;" see App trans., *Master Yunmen: From the Record of the Chan Teacher "Gate of the Clouds*," p. 83, note 2. In some cases, the term is used to refer to more than one thing as in the case of "having a knack for an encounter," that is, the inherent capacity, potential, skill or ability to carry out this encounter with a Chan or Seon master. The use of *gi* or *giyeon* 機緣 (Ch. *jiyuan*, Jp. *kien*) to refer to the "encounters" (John McRae's translation) has become standard practice since its use by Yanagida Seizan. Although I have decided to translate the term as "chance" here, I would not rule out the possibility that this polyvalent term retains its various connotations in this verse.

164 The idea of the Buddha almost losing a chance that was right before his eyes as he shut

forty-nine years[165] he repeatedly relied on classifications, The Persian is originally a son of Kunlun.[166]
The master thereupon stood up and shouted in a loud voice, "The elder Śākyamuni has come!"[167] Then he looked left and right and said, "Attendant! Make me some tea."

> 大洪恩頌, "東西南北, 上下四維. 天高地厚, 兎走烏飛. 當時摩竭令, 幾喪目前機! 四十九年重指注, 波斯元是崑崙兒." 師乃起立高聲叫云, "釋迦老子來也!" 復左右顧視云, "侍者, 點茶來!"

[Explanation]

Dahong Baoen: *North, south, east, and west … the crow flies*: this is "dharmas dwell in their Dharma position (法位)."[168]

---

himself in a room in Magadha is proabably borrowed from the famous verse exchange between Zhaozhou Congshen 趙州從諗 (778–897) and an unnamed old woman; see the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.263a13). For more on the proverbial old lady in Chan literature, see Ding-hwa E. Hsieh, "Images of Women in Ch'an Buddhist Literature of the Sung Period," in *Buddhism in the Sung*, edited by Peter N. Gregory and Daniel A. Getz, Jr., Kuroda Institute Studies in East Asian Buddhism, pp. 148–187 (Honolulu, University of Hawai'i Press 1999).

165 Forty-nine years here is believed to be how long the Buddha taught and hence represents the entirety of the Buddha's career.

166 The significance of this line is unclear. Kunlun here presumably refers to what is presentday Java, but can also refer to Kailāsa, the Kunlun mountains, that is, the Himālayas. The sons or natives of Kunlun is well-attested in Buddhist literature, but again the significance of this term here is unclear. See also Hori, *Zen Sand*, p. 681.

167 The use of this expression is not unique to Dahong; see *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T47.1988.554c3–4 & 571b24), which was cited in the *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T47.1997.722c7). See also the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T47.1998A.818b13, 831c5, 834b1, 849a13–14).

168 This is most likely a reference to a famous line from the *Lotus Sūtra* (T 262.9.9b10). This line is often used in support of the idea of the one vehicle (Ch. *yisheng*, Kr. *ilseung* 一乘) and the idea that all dharmas share one nature; for instance, see *Zongjing lu* (T 2016.48.454c17–19); cf. *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T 1988.47.558b26–27).

At the time … the chance right before his eyes: this is "the marks of the world constantly abide."[169]

For Forty … a son of Kunlun: each and everyone has originally attained (buddhahood). As in the past, the eyes are horizontal and the nose is vertical,[170] and for forty-nine years this has been repeatedly been clarified.

The master thereupon stood up … make me some tea: this is essentially the last (phrase) said.

Attendant … make me some tea: this truth (道理) is not yet at the stage of being perfectly bright.

大洪: 東西至烏飛者, 是法住法位也. 當時至目前機者, 世間相常住也. 四十至崑崙兒者, 人人箇箇, 本成本就也. 依舊, 眼横鼻直, 則四十九年, 重指注也. 起立至來也者, 只要末後道得也. 侍者點茶來者, 是道理未惺惺地也.

Haiyin Chaoxin's verse[171]

As soon as he descended to the palace he displayed his original form,
He walked a circuit, taking seven steps in each of the four directions, and repeatedly made a declaration,
He pointed to Heaven and pointed to earth but no one understood,
Only the vibrations of his thunder-like sound spread throughout the great chiliocosm,[172]

---

169 Like the reference to the dharma position, this expression is also referring to a famous passage from the *Lotus Sūtra* (see note above).

170 This seems to have been a well-known expression during the Song; see *Mi'an chanshi yulu* (T 1999.47.977b18), *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.111b25), and *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.102b5 and 331b15). This expression is used to refer to one's original endowment which cannot be grasped by discriminatory consciousness.

171 Haiyin's verse appears in fascicle 2 of the *Chazong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.13n9–10).

172 In Buddhist cosmology, a great or major chiliocosm (Ch. *daqian shijie*, Kr. *daecheon segye* 大千世界; S. *mahāsāhasra-lokadhātu*, P. *mahāsahassa-lokadhātu*) is part of a larger universe known as the

At that time, had an unpleased person raised a hair-splitting blade,[173] who would have dared to step forth?

海印信頌, "纔降王宮示本然, 周行七步又重宣. 指天指地無人會, 獨震雷音徧大千. 當時若有不甘者, 略擧吹毛孰敢先!"

[Explanation]

Haiyin: This has already been thoroughly interpreted in the gongan.

At that time … who would have dared to step forth: this is the meaning of Yunmen giving him to a dog to eat up. Baoning's verse below is also this meaning.

海印: 話中已消釋. 當時至孰敢先者, 雲門與狗子喫却之義也. 下保寧勇頌, 亦此義也.

Jingyan Shousui's[174] verse

With the arrival of spring, from the high to the low, everything is fresh and beautiful,
After the rain, in a tall forest a cuckoo sings,

---

trischiliocosm, which consists of three thousand great chiliocosms. In Chinese Buddhism the trischiliocosm is often mentioned in the context of a famous teaching attributed to Zhiyi, namely "the trischiliocosm in a single moment of thought" (Ch. *yinian sanqian* 一念三千), for which see Leon Hurvitz, *Chih-I (538–597): An Introduction to the Life and Ideas of a Chinese Buddhist Monk*, Mélanges chinois et bouddhiques, vol. 12 (Brussels: Institut Belge des Hautes Études Chinoises, 1980), pp. 271–318.

173 The *chuimao* 吹毛 is a legendary blade that is said to be capable of cutting a single strand of "hair that is blown" (*chuimao*) against the blade.

174 Jingyan Shousui 淨嚴守遂 (1072–1147) hailed from Lianxi 蓮溪 of Suining 遂寧 (present daySichuan province) and his surname was Zhang 章. Jingyan is said to have received formal transmission from Dahong Baoen. In 1118, he was officially granted the honorific title Jingyan Dashi or Great Master Jingyan.

One night in an unoccupied, picturesque tower under the bright moon,
I sing with a buzz and drink with delight as flowers fall before me.

淨嚴遂頌, "承春高下盡鮮妍, 雨過喬林呌杜鵑. 人靜畫樓明月夜, 醉歌歡酒落花前."

Baoning Renyong's[175] verse[176]

When Chaos[177] had not yet given way to divisions people were not yet awake,
As soon as heaven and earth were separated the great matter surreptitiously[178] become manifest,
With naturally endowed talent you dazzle and bewilder,
But from the very beginning you (i.e., the Buddha) were defeated[179] by him (i.e., Yunmen) and had thus gone through a round of ridicule.

保寧勇頌, "混沌未分人未曉, 乾坤纔剖事潛彰. 天生伎倆能奇怪, 未上輸他弄一場."

---

175 Baoning Renyong 保寧仁勇 (d.u.) hailed from Siming 四明 in Zhejiang province and his surname was Zhu 竺. Baoning studied under Xuedou Chongxian and later became a dharma heir of Yangqi Fanghui 楊岐方會 (992–1049). He served as the abbot of Baoning Monastery 保寧寺 in Jinling 金陵, Jiangsu province. His teachings are recorded in the *Baoning Yong chanshi yulu* 保寧勇禪師語錄.

176 This verse also appears in the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.13b11–12).

177 Chaos (Ch. *hundun*, Kr. *hondon* 混沌) refers to the primitive state of affairs before the advent of class distinctions; for a concise explanation and sources, see Sharf, *Coming to Terms*, pp. 191–192.

178 In the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji*'s version of Baoning's verse we have "completely" (Ch. *quan* 全) instead of "surreptitiously" (Ch. *qian* 潛).

179 In the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji*'s version of Baoning's verse we have "brass" (Ch. *tou* 鍮) instead of "be defeated" (Ch. *shu* 輸). Clearly, the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji*'s version is corrupted here and mistook *tou* for *shu*.

Zhaxi Riyi's[180] verse

He walked a circuit, took seven steps, and exposed his entire body,
From those who dwell above in the heavens to those who dwell in the realm of humans, he has no equal,
Don't say people won't see if you go at dawn,
You should know that there are people who go in (the middle of) the night.[181]

> 霅溪益頌, "周行七步露全身, 天上人閒絶等倫. 莫道早行人不見, 須知有夜行人."

Cishou Huaishen's[182] verse[183]

With a single flame an iron pellet is made,
Being round it does not require pliers or a hammer,
Pick it up and release it at a ten-thousand-mile-high peak,
And shoot down the white phoenix[184] at the edge of Heaven.

---

180 Zhaxi 霅溪 or Shangfang Riyi 上方日益 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Baoning Renyong.

181 In pre-modern China, cities had a curfew and going out at night was forbidden. But the night watchman was an exception to the rule that ironically helped to enforce it; see Hori, *Zen Sand*, p. 665. See also *Yunmen guanglu* (T 1988.47.562c6).

182 Cishou Huaishen 慈受懷深 (1077–1132) is a dharma heir of Changlu Songxin 長蘆嵩信 (d.u.) of the Yunmen lineage. He first became abbot of Zifu Monastery 資福寺 in present day Jiangsu province in 1113. Later, in 1122, he was invited by the emperor to serve as abbot of Huilin Chan Cloister 慧林禪院 at Xiangguo Monastery 相國寺 in the Eastern Capital, Kaifeng (Henan province). His teachings also appear in his recorded sayings, *Cishou Huaishen chanshi guanglu* 慈受懷深禪師廣錄 (XZJ 126.533aff.).

183 This verse also appears in the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.14a1–2) and the *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.384a12–13).

184 That is, the Buddha.

慈慈受頌, "一火鑄成金彈子! 團都不費鉗鎚. 拈來萬仞峯頭放, 打落天邊白鳳兒."

Cuiyan Sizong's[185] verse[186]

A thousand-year-old stone tiger gives birth to a *qilin* (麒麟),[187]
With a single horn and an entire body shining in five colors,
The golden lock and jade barrier are together torn open,[188]
In Vairocana's realm the drum is sounded at the appearance of the smoke and dust of battle.

"千年石虎産麒麟, 一角通身五彩明. 金鎖玉關渾掣斷, 毗盧界內鼓煙塵."

Foguo Keqin's verse[189]

From the right side (of Māyā) a golden body is born,

---

185 This most likely refers to Wen'an Sizong 聞庵嗣宗 (1085–1153) who is a dharma heir of the younger Hongzhi Zhengjue 宏智正覺 (1091–1157). Wen'an served as abbot on Mt. Cuiyan 翠巖 (Jiangxi province) and Mt. Xuedou 雪竇 (Zhejiang province). See his biography in the *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.201a5–202a5).

186 This verse also appears in the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.14a18–b1).

187 The *qilin* in modern Chinese means a giraffe, but originally it was a mythical animal of omen.

188 Also, more commonly known as the golden lock and the mysterious barrier (Ch. *jinsuo xuanguan* 金鎖玄關). This is a common metaphor for the final barrier or task in one's practice; see Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 93. The jade barrier (Ch. *yuguan* 玉關) can refer to the imperial palace and, more specifically, its gate. Or it could refer to a legendary gate that leads to the heavens and can thus serve as a metaphor for the highest stage in self-cultivation; see ZGD, p. 233c.

189 Foguo 佛果 is the honorific title of Yuanwu Keqin. This verse can also be found in the *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.803b2–6).

The nine dragons spray fragrant water,[190]
He takes lofty[191] steps in the four directions,
Around them lotus blossoms appear,
From the very beginning he demonstrates the finest skill (機),
His exalted style, extending across the past and the present, is lofty,
At that time, had there been someone who could make the truth his own[192] (承當),
He would have easily caught that daylight thief,[193]
Hey![194]

佛果勤頌, "右脇誕金軀, 九龍噴香水. 嶷嶷步四方, 周匝蓮花起. 末上先施第一機, 高風亘古鎮巍巍. 當時有箇承當得, 等閑擒下白拈賊. 咦!"

Changling Shouzhuo's verse[195]

190 See the *Puyao jing* 普曜經 (T 186.3.494b1 and 508c28).

191 Here, I follow the wording of the version in the *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* and read *nini* (or yiyi) 嶷嶷 as *weiwei* 巍巍; see *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.803b5).

192 As Koga and Iriya point out, "make the truth one's own" (Ch. *chengdang* 承當) here also means something like "(personally) undertake," "take up," or "accept (as the truth)"; see Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 213. As we shall see, in Chan texts one also often finds the expression "make the truth your own on the spot" (Ch. *zhixia chengdang* 直下承當). This phrase is often used to refer to the student's ability (or lack thereof) to accept and make what the Chan master just said or did (e.g. critical phrase or shout) as his own. The term is also sometimes translated as "understand."

193 The daylight thief here refers to the Buddha and more generally in Chan and Seon literature to someone who articulates the truth. The analogy of the thief is a popular one in Chan and Seon literature. A good example can be found, for instance, in the *Dahui Pujue chanshi Zongmen wuku* 大慧普覺禪師宗門武庫 (T 1998B.47.956a24–b8).

194 A sound made to attract the attention of people around. It is well known from the three-character/word Chan of Yunmen. "Every time Yunmen saw a monk he looked at him and said, 'Scrutinize,' or 'Hey!' but the recorders wrote, 'Look, scrutinize, and Hey!' (which became the three words)"; see *Rentian yanmu* 人天眼目 (T 2006.48.312b15).

195 This verse can also be found in the *Changling Shouzhuo chanshi yulu* (XZJ 120.324b13–15) and the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.13b15–16).

He walked a circuit, took seven steps, and referred to himself as honored one,
But how could we let the family's shame out the door,
He had already completed the task of saving people in his mother's womb,
Each time you strike you must leave a scar.

> 長靈卓頌, "周行七步便稱尊, 家醜那堪放出門! 只向母胎度人畢, 也須一棒一條痕."

Dahui Zonggao's verse[196]

As soon as the old man[197] was born he kept himself busy,
Like a madman he walked a circuit and took seven steps,
Cheating a limitless number of ignorant men and women,
With open eyes he smugly enters the boiling cauldron[198] in hell.

> 大慧杲頌, "老漢纔生便着忙, 周行七步似顚狂. 賺他無限癡男女, 開眼堂堂入鑊湯."

Zhu'an Shigui's verse[199]

[196] This verse can also be found in the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ115.14a7–8) and also the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T47.1998A.850c11–14).

[197] That is, the Buddha.

[198] References to the "boiling cauldron" (Ch.*huotang* 鑊湯) in hell abound in Buddhist literature. For instance, see the account in the *Da baoji jing* (T 310.11.546b3–8), *Jinglü yixiang* 經律異相 (T 2121.53.135c4) and *Zongjing lu* (T 2016.48.848a5–6)

[199] This verse can also be found in the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ115.14a5–6) and also in the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ118.795b7–11).

The old barbarian[200] could not avoid leaving the womb,
And understod that he had to appear before people this way,
Pointing to earth and pointing to Heaven he referred to himself as number one,
Living beings thus saw nothing but disaster for forty-nine years.

竹庵珪頌, "老胡不免出胞胎, 也解人前伊麼來. 指地指天稱第一, 衆生四十九年災."

Baiyun Zhibing's[201] verse[202]

Beneath the tree of no sorrow[203] a golden body was born,
Walking a circuit and taking seven steps was done anew with a single stroke,[204]
Meeting each other they say that they awoke at dawn,
But who knew? There are others who go at night.

白雲昺頌, "無憂樹下誕金身, 七步周行事斬新. 相見謂言侵早起, 誰知更有夜行人!"

200 That is, the Buddha.

201 Little is known about Baiyun Zhibing 白雲知昺 or Nanhua Zhibing 南華知昺 (d.u.). He is said to have formally received transmission from Fojian Huiqin 佛鑑慧懃 (1059–1117).

202 This verse can also be found in the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.14a3–4).

203 The tree of no sorrow (*wuyoushu* 無憂樹) or *Jonesia aśoka* is named such because the Buddha was born without the sorrow of birth pains; see the account in the *Yiqie jing yinyi* (T 2128.54.371b2–3 and 379b5–6); and also *Zongjing lu* (T 2016.48.853c18). For a reference to this tree in the Buddha's biography, see the *Puyao jing* (T 186.3.491b8–11).

204 This is a tentative translation of (Ch. *zhanxin* 斬新). For "with a single stroke" (*zhan* 斬), see Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 166.

Shichuang Fagong's[205] verse[206]

From the five regions of India a wormwood arrow comes,
And throws all the Chinese soldiers into disarray,
Had it not been for Yunmen's true command (正令),
We almost mistook it for perfect balance on a scale.[207]

> 石窓頌, "五天一隻蓬蒿箭, 攪動支那百萬兵. 不是雲門提正令, 幾乎錯認定盤星."

Songyuan Chongyue's[208] verse[209]

Open your mouth and you will certainly plant some roots,
Pointing to earth and pointing to Heaven he referred to himself as the only honorable one,

---

205 Shichuang Fagong 石窻法恭 (1102–1181), a Zhejiang native, is a dharma heir of Hongzhi Zhengjue. Shichuang served as Hongzhi's chief seat at Mt. Tiantong. In 1153, he assumed his first abbacy at Guangxiao Monastery 光孝寺 in Zhejiang province. He also served as the abbot of Nengren Monastery 能仁寺 and Baoen Monastery 報恩寺, which were also located in the same province. In 1170 he retired to the temple Zhangsheng Monastery 彰聖寺, but the following year he moved to Kaishan Monastery 開善寺.

206 This verse can also be found in the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.14b6–7).

207 That is, the truth or the Dharma. Here "perfect balance on the scale" (Ch. *dingpanxing*, Kr. *jeongbanseong* 定盤星) literally refers to the notchmark on a weighing scale that marks the point of equilibrium or balance, that is, "zero."

208 Songyuan Chongyue 松源崇嶽 (1139–1203) had briefly studied under Dahui Zonggao before he receieved tonsure in 1163. He later declared himself the dharma heir of Mi'an Xianjie 密庵咸傑 (1118–1186). He first became abbot of Chengzhao Chan Cloister 澂照禪院 in Jiangsu province and went on to build an illustrious career as the abbot of several other important public monasteries. His teachings also appears in his recorded sayings, the *Songyuan chongyue chanshi yulu* 松源崇嶽禪師語錄 (XZJ 121.570a1–).

209 This verse is also found in *Songyuan Chongyue chanshi yulu* (XZJ 121.619b10–13).

Forming a crowd and a band we follow him in his errors,
How many men have their wits about them?

> 松源頌, "開口分明便垜根, 指天指地獨稱尊. 成群作隊隨他轉, 幾箇男兒有腦門?"

Layman Wujin's verse[210]

Walking a circuit and taking seven steps he points to Heaven with his hand,
It will be difficult for him to survive the beatings handed out by a patch-robed (Chan) monk,
Since he left his mother's womb what has he accomplished?
How could it compare to what he accomplished before he descended to Jambudvīpa!

> 無盡居士頌, "七步周行手指天, 衲僧棒下命難全. 母胎出後成何事? 爭似閻浮未降前!"

Layman Yuezhai's[211] verse

As soon as he was able to crawl out of and leave his mother's womb,
He dances to the three-step beat[212] on top of golden lotus flowers,
At that time no one understood a single beat,
They were all buried under the Buddha's reference to himself as the only honorable one.

---

210 This verse is also found in the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.13b13–14).

211 Little, if anything, is known about layman Yuezhai 悅齋.

212 The three-step beat (*santai* 三臺) seems to refer to a type of dance and music performed in the Tang imperial palace. The beat seems to have been quite fast; see Hori, *Zen Sand*, p. 718.

悅齋居士頌, "匍匐方纔出母胎, 金蓮花上舞三臺. 當時一拍無人會, 惣向稱尊獨處埋."

[Explanation]

Yuezhai: His intent was to say that these words of the World Honored One simultaneously serve all the people of the great earth. This is what Yuanwu meant by "a sublime dance should etcetera."[213] Even so, Yunmen giving him to a dog to eat up, Haiyin saying, "At that time had an unpleased person etcetera," and Baoning saying, "But from the beginning etcetera," are the opposite. This is to break ice stuck together with a well-baked brick.

悅齋意, 世尊伊麽, 是盡大地人, 一時普接, 所謂妙舞應須云云也. 然則雲門與狗子喫却, 海印云, 當時若有不甘者云云, 保寧云, 末上云云, 反是, 焦磚打着連底凍也.

Xuedou Chongxian raised, "Fayan said, 'Yunmen's imposing manner is so great and yet he still lacks the truth of the Buddha-Dharma.' An old worthy offered a substitute reply[214] and said, 'Mistakenly assuming[215] that no one can

---

[213] See *Yuanwu Fuoguo chanshi yulu*: "A sublime dance should boast of being clapped everywhere, a tune of the three-step beat should be performed in the great houses" (T 1997.47.721b3).

[214] Substitute or alternate replies (Ch. *daiyu*, Kr. *daeeo* 代語) literally refer to a Chan or Seon master offering a reply or answer in place of (*dai* 代) or as a substitute for someone else; see William M. Bodiford, *Sōtō Zen in Medieval Japan* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1993), p. 153. According to the *Fenyang wude chanshi yulu*, if during a request for instruction regarding an old case or gongan in the abbot's quarters the student does not completely understand the point then he or she can ask for a subtitute reply (*dai*) and if the reply is not suitable then a separate reply (*bie*) can be requested, whence we get the terms *dai* and *bie*; see *Fenyang wude chanshi yulu* (T 1992.47.615c13–14; cited in Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 294).

[215] As Koga and Iriya point out, *jiangwei* 將謂 is an old colloquial expression used since the Six Dynasties period (220–589) to refer to the act of wrongly or mistakeningly thinking or assuming something (Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 214). The substitute reply here seems to be trying to say something along the lines of "if Yunmen was right and the Buddha was not suppose to attest to the Dharma and if Yunmen himself could not therefore attest to the Dharma, then who can?" The

attest to the Buddha-Dharma.' A separate reply says,[216] 'Hooked on to a state of no doubting.'"[217] Again, Xuedou raised the present gongan and then also raised Yunmen's added comment. The master said, "Just then he should have immediately flipped over the meditation bench." Fayong said, "Xuedou only sees others' faults."[218]

雪竇顯, 擧法眼云, '雲門氣勢甚大, 要且無佛法道理.' 老宿代云, '將謂無人證明.' 別云, "鉤在不疑之地." 又擧此話, 連擧雲門拈, 師云, "便與掀倒禪床." 法湧云, "雪竇要且只見他非."

[Explanation]

Xuedou: Fayan criticized his great, high and steep life.

An old worthy offered a substitute reply: this substitutes for Yunmen. It refers to *Fayan saw through Yunmen*.[219]

A separate reply said … "Hooked on to a state of no doubting": this is not said with good intentions.

Also, *Xuedou raised … flipped over the meditation bench*: although Yunmen

substitute reply, in other words, seems to be trying to reestablish the traditional host (*zhu* 主) and guest (*bin* 賓) structure of the Chan encounter here.

216 This separate reply appears to be underscoring the irony of Fayan's remark (i.e., doubts about the ability to attest to the Dharma is extended to include Yunmen, but what about Fayan himself?).

217 This comment can also be found in the *Zongmen tongyao ji* (Yanagida and Shiina eds., *Zengaku tenseki sōkan*, vol. 1, p. 6). See also Xuedou's *Puquan ji* 瀑泉集, which, along with other texts attributed to Xuedou, has been included in the *Mingjue chanshi yulu* 明覚禅師語録 of the Taishō canon (T 1996.47.696b29–c5). For a Gozan printing (13 C.E.) of the Song editions of the *Xuedou Xian heshang Mingjue dashi songgu ji* 雪竇顕和尚明覚大師頌古集, *niangu* 拈古, *Puquan ji*, and *Zuying ji* 祖英集, see Yanagida and Shiina eds., *Zengaku tenseki sōkan*, vol. 2 (Kyoto: Rinsen shoten, 1999). For the sermon in question, see Yanagida and Shiina eds., Zengaku tenseki sōkan, vol. 2, 21. For Fayan's remark, see his recorded sayings, *Jinling Qingliang yuan Wenyi chanshi yulu* 金陵清涼院文益禪師語錄 (T 1991.47.592b19–20). This text should also be used with caution as it dates only as far back as the late Ming when it was first published as part of the *Wujia yulu*.

218 Little is known about Fayong 法湧 and the source of this comment is unknown.

219 This seems to be a reference to Jinshan's sermon above.

did put it this way, the meditation bench should have been flipped over and, overall, this does not preserve Yunmen.

Fayong said, "*Xuedou* … ": although Xuedou saw the wrong in others, he was unaware of his own faults and supported Yunmen.

雪竇: 法眼嘖他大高峻生也. 老宿代云者, 代雲門也, 謂破法眼覰破也. 別云, 鈎在不疑之地者, 不是好心也. 又擧至掀倒禪床者, 雲門雖然伊麼道也, 須掀倒, 盖不存雲門也. 法勇云, 雪竇云云者, 雪竇雖見他非, 不知自己有過, 扶起雲門也.

Langye Huijue[220] added a comment,[221] "Yunmen can be said to have used this profound mind to support the (myriad) *kṣetra*s (lands) as numerous as dust. This is precisely what we can call repaying the grace of the Buddha."

瑯琊覺拈, "雲門, 可謂將此深心奉塵刹, 是卽名爲報佛恩."

[Explanation]
Langye: The explanation already appeared in the gongan.

瑯琊: 話中已出.

Jinshan Liaoyuan[222] ascended the hall, raised the present case and then

220 Little is known about Langye Huijue who is a dharma heir of Fenyang Shanzhao 汾陽善昭 (947–1024). For more on Langye, see the *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* (XZJ 135.774a6–11).

221 Langye's comment also appears in the *Zongmen tongyaoji* (Yanagida and Shiina eds., *Zengaku tenseki sōkan*, vol. 1, 6). There, the comment immediately follows the comment by Xuedou as in the case of the *Seonmun yeomsong*.

222 Jinshan Liaoyuan 金山了元 (1032–1098) is said to have received formal transmission of Yunmen's lineage from Kaixian Shanxian 開先善暹 (d.u.). He first became abbot of Chengtian Monastery 承天寺 in Jiangxi province. He also served as abbot of various others temples such as Kaixian Monastery 開先寺 and Guizong Monastery 歸宗寺 on Mt. Lu 廬山 in Jiangxi province. He then served as abbot of Jinshan Monastery 金山寺 in Jiangsu province and also Dayang Monastery 大仰寺 in Jiangxi province. He later served as abbot of Yunju Monastery 雲居寺, also in Jiangxi province. He received the posthumous title Chan Master Foyin 佛印禪師.

also raised Yunmen's added comment. The master said, "When Fayan first heard it sweat immediately began to flow out of his entire body as he misleadingly assumed that Yunmen had slandered the Buddha. Twenty years later, he was able to evaluate it and thus attain great bliss in mind and body. He thereupon ascended the (abbot's) seat and raised, 'Yunmen's vital spirit is like that of a king and yet he lacked the truth of the Buddha dharma.'[223] Yunmen said, 'that Zhe-native saw through the meditative-work that I cultivated my whole life.'"[224] The master said, "Although Fayan saw through Yunmen, in the end he wasn't able to support the other Yunmen." Jinshan said, "'A praying mantis runs facing forward, a goldfinch follows right behind, and in the garden a man armed with mud pellets doesn't realize that his clothes are drenched with dew.'[225] If someone were to examine these words Jinshan would also deserve thirty blows."

金山元, 上堂, 擧此話, 連擧雲門拈, 師云, "法眼初聞, 直得通身流汗, 將謂雲門謗佛. 二十年後覰得, 身心大喜, 乃陞座擧云, '雲門氣宇如王, 且無佛法道理.' 雲門云, '我平生功夫, 被者浙子覰破.' " 師云, "法眼雖覰破雲門, 要且扶他雲門不得. 金山道, '螗蜋前頭走, 黃雀續後隨, 園中挾彈漢, 不覺露濕衣.' 有人檢點得, 金山, 也有三十棒分."

223 See Xuedou Chongxian's sermon above.

224 According to his biography in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.398b2), Fayan Wenyi was a native of Yuhang 餘杭, which was located in the administrative unit known as the Liangzhe lu 兩浙路 circuit during the Song dynasty. This region was named after a famous river called Zhe 浙, hence the name of the province Zhejing 浙江 or Zhe river (which is still used today). The Zhe-native or literally son of Zhe 浙子 here most likely refers to Fayan.

225 This is a reference to a well-known story from fascicle 9 (in a section called "proper remonstration" or *zhengjian* 正諫) of Liu Xiang's 劉向 (79–8 B.C.E.) *Shuo Yuan* 說苑 and other sources such as the *Zhanguo ce* 戰國策. When the King of Wu 吳 tried to invade Jing 荊 the child of an imperial secretariat (or in other versions of this story, the king's own crown prince) wished to remonstrate with the king but not directly lest he be subjected to death. So one day he appeared before the king with drenched clothes and the king asked for an explanation. In response he told the king that he was in the garden behind the palace and noticed a cicada that was singing in a tree unaware of the praying mantis that was lurking nearby to take its life. The mantis in turn was unaware of the goldfinch flying

[Explanation]

Jinshan: *Although Fayan saw through Yunmen, in the end he wasn't able to support the other Yunmen*: you must support Yunmen.

A praying mantis runs facing forward: this refers to the World Honored One.

A goldfinch follows right behind: this refers to Yunmen.

In the garden a man armed with mud pellets: this refers to Fayan. This does not consent to what Jinshan said.

If someone were to … deserve thirty blows: not consenting to what was said above is also not the true meaning. The idea is that although Fayan saw through Yunmen, in the end he wasn't able to support the other Yunmen.

金山: 法眼雖覷破雲門, 要且扶他雲門不得者, 要須扶起雲門也. 螗蜋前頭走者, 言世尊也; 黃雀續後隨者, 言雲門也; 園中挾彈漢者, 言法眼也. 則金山伊麼道, 並不肯也. 有人至棒分者, 前之不肯, 亦非實義也. 前之法眼, 雖覷破雲門, 要且扶他雲門不得之義也.

Zhihai Benyi[226] ascended the hall and said, "If I were to discuss this matter, from the Kingdom of Magadha to the footsteps of Shaoshi Peak[227]

---

nearby and the goldfinch too was unaware of him who stood with mud pellet and bow in hand to shoot it down. Focused on the bird, he himself did not notice his drenched clothes. The story, we are told, is meant to serve as a reminder of how easy it is to loose sight of the dangers that lurk nearby as one sets his eyes on something else. See also the summary of this story in fascicle 4 of the first part of the *Gujin shiwen leiju* 古今事文類聚 by Zhu Mu 祝穆 (d. 1246?) where we find the expression, "doesn't realize that his clothes are drenched with dew" 不覺露濕衣. A similar story is also found in the "Mountain Tree" (*shanmu* 山木) chapter of the *Zhuangzi* 莊子; for the story in English, see Burton Watson trans., *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1968), p. 219.

226 Little is known about Zhihai Benyi 智海本逸 (d.u.), who is a dharma heir of Kaixian Shanxian 開先善暹 (d.u.) of the Yunmen lineage. He assumed his first abbacy at Jianfu Monastery 薦福寺 in Jiangxi province. Zhihai Benyi was also invited by the emperor to serve as the founding abbot of Zhihai Chan Cloister 智海禪院 at Xiangguo Monastery 相國寺 in the Eastern Capital (Kaifeng).

227 Otherwise known as Mt. Shaoshi 小室山. This mountain, located in present day Henan province, is

and Caoxi, the land is flat like the palm of my hand and originally without a single speck of dust. Made of lapis lazuli, it is as slippery as a floor splashed with oil. Who would dare set a single step in here? However, two thousand years ago, there was a bodhisattva named Huming[228] who did not fulfill his duties (original endowment) in the celestial palace and had to leave Tuṣita above and descend down to King Śuddhodana's[229] palace in Jambudvīpa. He descended from the right side of Queen Māya and was born. Nine dragons spewed out water and washed the golden body.[230] The washing was done and this child was extremely lovable and his home was a home of great wealth. In the lapis lazuli hall he walked a circuit, took seven steps … 'I alone am the honored one.' Thereafter he fell to the ground, but for the next two thousand years, from one successive generation to the next, his sons and grandsons supported him but he did not stand up. Among them only Chan master Yunmen courageously expressed resentment and said, 'If I at that time … great peace to all under Heaven.' Fayan heard this and then exclaimed, 'Of all people,[231] it was Yunmen who slandered the Buddha!' Yunmen supported the Buddha half way up, but he was pushed down by Fayan. Up to the present moment the Buddha has been unable to stand up again. Within this assembly is there no Chan guest with great strength? I ask you to lend some help." After a while he said, "If there is no one, then I'd have to say relying on someone else is not as good as taking matters into your own hands." He

---

perhaps best known for its association with the legendary Bodhidharma and the temple Shaolin Monastery.

228 Huming 護明, "Protector of Illumination," or Prabhāpāla was the name of Śākyamuni in Tuṣita Heaven before his earthly incarnation.

229 Śuddhodana, the purported king of a kingdom or city-state known as Kapilavastu, was the father of Gautama Siddhartha, the Buddha.

230 See note 190 above.

231 Here, *daxiao* 大小, as Koga and Iriya point out, probably means something like "even someone like X," "of all people," or "a man of X's standing" (Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 291).

thereupon grabbed his staff, struck the corded chair[232] once, and said, "He stood up! Henceforth protect and take pity on him. Do not have him fall down again. Zhihai's strength alone – what good would that be?" He again struck the corded chair.

智海逸, 上堂云, "若論此事, 自摩竭陁國, 至小室峯前, 曹候 溪上, 地平如掌, 本絶埃塵, 瑠璃所成, 滑如油潑, 誰敢於中輒措一足? 然而二千年前, 爰有菩薩號曰護明, 不向天宮守本分, 上辭兜率下降閻浮, 於淨飯王宮, 摩耶夫人右脇降生, 九龍吐水, 沐浴金軀. 旣沐浴已, 其家巨富, 此子甚嬌, 向瑠璃殿上, 周行七步, <至>唯我獨尊. 自兹倒地, 逮二千年, 積代兒孫, 扶持不起, 於中, 獨有雲門禪師, 勇猛發憤道, '我當時,<至>天下大平.' 法眼聞之, 便謂, '大小雲門! 不合謗佛.' 雲門扶得一半, 又被法眼推倒. 直至千今, 更起不得, 此會之中, 莫有大力禪客? 略請相助." 良久云, "若無, 借人不如自下手." 乃拈拄杖擊繩床一下云, "起也! 而今而後護惜, 莫教再倒. 智海獨力,無如之何." 復擊繩床.

[Explanation]
Zhihai: The point of Zhihai's comment is to prop up Yunmen's intent.

智海: 立在雲門邊, 扶起雲門意也.

Jiangshan Canyuan[233] ascended the hall and said, "The crown prince Siddhārtha, as soon as he left his mother's womb, with one hand pointed to Heaven and with the other hand pointed to the earth and walked a circuit,

---

[232] The corded chair (Ch. *shengchuang*, Kr. *seungsang*, Jp. *jōshō* 繩床), though called a *chuang* ("bench" or "platform"), seems to have been a large chair furnished with a corded or knitted seat made of wooden planks. See ZGD, p. 559; and also see John Kieschnick, *The Impact of Buddhism on Chinese Material Culture* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003), pp. 231–232.

[233] Little is known about Jiangshan Canyuan 蔣山贊元 (d.u.), who is a dharma heir of Shishuang Chuyuan 石霜楚圓 (986–1039). Like the other disciples of Shishuang, Jiangshan seems to have maintained close relations with prominent literati such as Wang Anshi; see *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.317a14-b5).

taking seven steps and gazing in each of the four directions. He espoused[234] the aspirations of a hero and made the lion's roar[235] and said, 'I alone am the honored one above and below Heaven.' How could this not be an example of not following others? At that time, people from all territories, had each and every one of them been able to clearly awaken to this example, then what sort of tricks and skills would the great gentleman Huming have to use to make it work? Alas! But since the conditions for encounter (機緣) have not yet ripened we cannot help but establish the salvation methods (化門) of the former buddhas. Establish the expedient means and set the standards. Hand out distorted[236] views and use expedient schemes according to the circumstances. Open the conjured city[237] and receive the tired and the destitute. Hold up a yellow leaf and entice the sad crying child.[238] Afterwards, people will tally with the truth and have faith and will be able to declare the Way. Accordingly, "in front of the stūpa of many sons"[239] … "entrusted the treasury of the eye of the true Dharma and the sublime

234 The literal translation would be he "cut out" (*pou* 剖) for himself the aspiration of a hero.

235 There have been a number of different theories about what the lion's roar means in the Buddhist context, but the roar can perhaps be best understood, at least in the context of Chan, as a declaration of enlightenment that dispels all doubts. This is in keeping with the way in which the lion's roar functions in the stories about the "foremost of lion's roarers," the arhat Piṇḍola Bhāradvāja; see John Strong, "The Legend of the Lion-Roarer: A Study of the Buddhist Arhat Piṇḍola Bhāradvāja," *Numen* 26, no. 1 (1979): 68–71.

236 "Distorted," upside-down, or perverted (Ch. *zhuandao*, Kr. *jeondo* 顚倒; S. *viparyāsa*) views refer to such views as the misguided belief in permanence and an enduring sense of pleasure, self, and purity. Although the term view (Ch. *zhijian*, Kr. *ji-gyeon* 知見) can in come cases be used in a positive sense, in Chan literature the terms is usually used in its negative sense of holding the mistaken belief in permanence and self as in the case of the Sanskrit word *dṛṣṭi*.

237 The parable of the conjured city can be found in the *Lotus Sūtra* (T 262.9.22a18–27b8). For an English translation, see Leon Hurvitz trans., *Scripture of the Lotus Blossom of the Fine Dharma* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1976), pp. 130–155.

238 This is a parable from the *Nirvana Sūtra* (T 374.12.485c11–13).

239 As T. Griffith Foulk points out, the stūpa of many sons (Ch. *duozita*, Kr. *dajatap* 多子塔) or Bahuputrakacaitya near Vaiśālī appears in several sources. The earliest documented reference to this

mind of nirvana to the honorable Yin'guang."[240] From that moment on twenty-eight Indian patriarchs have succeeded one another in the west, and in the eastern lands the transmission of the lamp has continued for six (generations).[241] How could it not be that the great, imposing chariot cuts through the myriad, deviating sidetracks? The true fountainhead is endlessly vast and penetrates the ten-thousand tributaries, which face the source (宗)."

蔣山元, 上堂云, "悉達太子, 纔離母胎, 一手指天, 一手指地, 周行七步, 目顧四方, 剖丈夫志, 作師子吼言, '天上天下唯我獨尊.' 豈非其事, 不從他得? 此時, 率土之人, 若能各各曉悟去也, 且護明大士, 更作什麼伎倆卽得. 噫! 奈以機緣未濟, 不

---

stūpa can be found in Faxian's 法顯 (traveled 399–414) account of his pilgrimage to India, *Gaoseng Faxian zhuan* 高僧法顯傳 (T 2085.51.861c–862a), and Xuanzang's 玄奘 (600–664) account of his pilgrimage in his *Da Tang Xiyu ji* 大唐西域記 (T 2087.51.908c–909a); see Foulk, "Sung Controversies Concerning the 'Separate Transmission' of Ch'an," in *Buddhism in the Sung*, edited by Peter N. Gregory and Daniel A. Getz, Kuroda Institute Studies in East Asian Buddhism 13, pp. 220–294 (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1999), p. 291, note 82. According to these sources, the stūpa marked the cite of the Buddha's former life as one of the thousand brothers who defended their birth mother, whence the name the stūpa of a thousand sons (*qianzi ta* 千子塔). As Foulk also notes, there is no mention of Mahākāśyapa in these stories, but the *Za ahan jing* does mention an episode wherein Mahākāśyapa tells Ānanda that he had met the Buddha a the stūpa of many sons where he received from the Buddha a robe made of discarded rags (for which Mahākāśyapa became well-known) (T 99.2.303b2). For other sources and what is perhaps the most comprehensive treatment of the topic, see Foulk, "Sung Controversies Concerning the 'Separate Transmission' of Ch'an."

240 Yin'guang 飲光 or "Drinker of Light" is another name for the Buddha's famed disciple Mahākāśyapa; see the account in the *Fanyi mingyi ji* (T 2131.54.1058b6). As T. Griffith Foulk points out, this apocryphal story makes its first appearance in the *Tiansheng guangdeng lu*. An apocryphal sūtra known as the *Dafantianwang wen fo jueyi jing* 大梵天王問佛決疑經 (XZJ 87.606b15–607a2) seems to have been written later to lend further credence to this growing legend; see Foulk, "Sung Controversies Concerning the 'Separate Transmission' of Ch'an," pp. 253 and 276–280.

241 There is a vast amount of secondary literature on the topic of patriarchal succession. Though somewhat outdated, Philip Yampolsky's study in English still remains a must read for students of Chan; see Yampolsky trans., *Platform Sūtra of the Sixth Patriarch* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1968). See also John McRae, *The Northern School and the Formation of Early Ch'an Buddhism*, Kuroda Institute Studies in East Asian Buddhism 3 (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1987) and more recently Wendi Adamek, *The Mystique of Transmission: On Early Chan History and Its Contexts* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2007).

免立先佛化門? 設歐和, 垂軌範, 施顚倒知見, 用權假機謀, 開化城, 接疲乏之徒; 握黃葉, 誘悲啼之子. 爾後, 人符諦信, 道可昌言, 遂於多子塔前, 以至正法眼藏涅槃妙心, 獨付飮光尊者. 自此西天繼踵四七, 東土續焰二三. 得不大駕崢嶸, 截群邪之異徑; 眞源渺漫, 通萬派以朝宗?"

[Explanation]

Jiangshan: The point of Jiangshan's comment is to prop up the World Honored One's intent.

蔣山, 立在世尊邊, 扶起世尊意也.

Baolin Ben[242] ascended the hall and said, "The expedient means of the past and of the present are as numerous as the sands of the Ganges River, but the strangest of them all is 'the old barbarian as soon as he was born … I alone am the honorable one.' However, in using a temporary expedient means, he acted as if there was no one around him. Before anyone saw him open his mouth, one could not help but doubt him. When he finally revealed the facts[243] he thereupon became a man with a dragon's head and a snake's tail. But now, together with you, I shall cut down the last phrase (末後句) and add a separate turning word (一轉語) and thus cause all the sons and grandsons of the Buddha under Heaven to let out their vital energy. How could this not be refreshing!" *Afterwards, he looked left and right and said, "Look! Look!"* and then descended from his seat.

寶林本, 上堂云, "古今方便, 如恒河沙, 最奇怪者, 是老胡纔生下, 至唯我獨尊. 然則一期方便, 大似傍若無人. 看他未開口已前, 不妨敎人疑着, 及乎吐露箇消息, 便乃龍頭蛇尾. 而今與伊截却末後句, 別着一轉語, 令天下兒孫, 大家出氣, 豈不快哉!" 乃顧視左右云, "看, 看!" 便下座.

242 The identity of Baolin Ben is unclear.

243 Here, I translate *tulu ge xiaoxi* 吐露箇消息 as "reveal the facts." As Koga and Iriya point out, *xiaoxi* also means something like "comings and goings," "situation," "actual conditions" (Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten,* p. 216). See also Hori, *Zen Sand*, p. 702.

[Explanation]

Baolin: The point resembles Yunmen's, but it is also different from Yunmen's. His point is simply without limit.

Afterwards, he looked left and right and said, "Look! Look!": the World Honored One said, "I alone am the honored one," this is the original endowment[244] of all people.

寶林: 義似雲門意, 亦非雲門意, 直得無限也. 乃顧視左右云看看者, 世尊云唯我獨尊, 此則諸人分上也.

Yunfeng Wenyue added a comment,[245] "Although Yunmen may have had a strategy for pacifying disorder, he lacked a path to freeing himself."[246]

雲峯悅拈, "雲門, 雖有定亂之謀, 且無出身之路."

[Explanation]

Yunfeng: Read the text and you can understand.

雲峯: 文見可知也.

Letan Hongying[247] added a comment,[248] "The elder Śākyamuni can

244 For "(original) endowment" (Ch. *fenshang*, Kr. *bunsang* 分上); see Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 410.

245 Yunfeng's comment also appears in the *Zongmen tongyaoji* (Yanagida and Shiina eds., *Zengaku tenseki sōkan*, vol. 1, p. 6). There, the comment immediately follows the comment by Langye (see above).

246 Here I translate *chushen zhi lu* 出身之路 as "a path to freeing himself." The character that I translate here as "himself" is actually the character for "body" (Ch. *shen*, Kr. *sin* 身), which can also refer to the self. As Koga and Iriya point out, *chushen* or freeing oneself (lit. "make body leave") means something like "liberation" (Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 205).

247 Letan Hongying 泐潭洪英 (1012–1070), otherwise known as Ying Shaowu 英邵武, was a senior disciple of Huanglong Huinan. For more on Hongying, see fascicle 30 of the *Chanlin sengbao zhuan* 禪林僧寶傳 (XZJ 137.561a3–562a14).

be said to have acted as if no one was around him. At that time, had he encountered a bright-eyed, patch-robed monk he would have been immediately taught that there is no path up to Heaven and there is no gate to enter the earth. Even so, these copper *śāla* basins must be filled with oil."[249] (Miaoxi's[250] capping phrase reads, "High in status he may be and low in status he may be."[251])

泐潭英拈, "釋迦老子, 可謂傍若無人. 當時, 若遇明眼衲僧,直敎他上天無路, 入地無門. 然雖如是, 也須是銅沙羅裏盛油, 始得." 妙喜着語云, "可貴可賤."

[Explanation]

Letan: This is to half consent and to half not consent. Therefore Miaoxi's capping phrase said, "High in status he may be and low in status he may be."

泐潭義, 半肯半不肯也. 故妙喜著語云, "可貴可賤."

Fazhen Shouyi[252] raised the present case and then also raised Yunmen, Xuedou, and Fayong's added comments. The master said, "These few men are just like the praying mantis that doesn't realize, while trying to catch the cicada in front of it, that a goldfinch is lurking right behind and like the

---

248 This comment is also found in the *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 118.53a11–15). In the *Zhengfa yanzang* version, however, Hongying's words are recorded as a *shizhong* ("instructions to the assembly") sermon and not a comment on a picked out passage.

249 Cf. *Fenyang Wude chanshi yulu* 汾陽無德禪師語錄 (T 1992.47.611b19ff).

250 This refers to Dahui Zonggao.

251 This most likely is a reference to a passage from the *Biaoji* 表記 chapter of the *Liji* 禮記. To paraphrase Legge's classic translation from 1885: "The Master said, 'In the service of a ruler, one may be in a high position or a low, rich or poor, to live or to die (according to the will of the ruler), but he should not allow himself to be led to do anything contrary to order or right (James Legge trans., *Li Chi: Book of Rites*, Vol. 2 [Whitefish, MT: Kessinger Publishing Company, 2003], p. 346).

252 Fazhen Shouyi 法眞守一 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Huilin Zongben 慧林宗本 (1020–1099). Fazhen served as the abbot of Benjue Monastery 本覺寺 in Zhejiang province.

goldfinch that doesn't realize, while trying to catch the praying mantis in front of it, that a hunter is lurking right behind. Get it? 'Every year a new branch appears but the wicked winds of spring will not rest.'"[253]

法眞一, 擧此話, 連擧雲門雪竇法湧拈, 師云, "者幾箇漢, 恰似螗蜋捕蟬于前, 不知黄雀在其後; 黄雀捕螗蜋于前, 不知挾彈者在其後. 還知麽? 年年更有新條在, 惱亂春風卒未休."

[Explanation]

Fazhen: Again, read the text and you can understand. The intent is identical to Jinshan's above.

法眞擧, 亦文見可知. 上金山意同.

Haiyin Chaoxin ascended the hall, raised the present case and then also raised Yunmen's added comment. The master said, "Great master Yunmen did his best to speak, but all he could say was half the truth. Even so, he wears a cangue and writes a letter of confession.[254] *Can* (investigate)!"[255]

---

[253] This last line is most likely a reference to a poem written by the famed Tang statesman and poet Luo Yin 羅隱 (833–909) or Luo Zhaojian 羅昭諫 (*Quan Tang shi* [Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition], p. 663, 9b):

> Willow Tree
> A stream of clear smoke enshrouds the jade tower,
> Half hanging down the railings and half hanging down the ravine,
> Next year new branches will again appear,
> (But) the wicked winds of Spring will not rest.
>
> 柳 一簇青煙鎖玉樓 半垂闌畔半垂溝 明年更有新條在 繞亂春風卒未

The last two lines of this poem were also cited verbatim in Xuedou's *Zuying ji* as a comment to the "penetrating the dharma body phrase" 透法身句 (Yanagida and Shiina eds., *Zengaku tenseki sōkan*, vol. 2, p. 82); and also in the *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T 1988.47.567a26).

[254] Yunmen wore a cangue and wrote a letter of confession because he was still guilty of supporting (half of) the actions of the Buddha.

[255] *Can* is an onomatopoeia that functions in many ways like the shout in Chan writings. "Investigate!"

海印信, 上堂, 擧此話, 連擧雲門拈, 師云, “雲門大師盡力道, 只道得一半. 然雖如是, 也是擔枷過狀.” <參!>

[Explanation]

Haiyin: He consents to Yunmen and doesn't consent to Yunmen. The ascending the hall sermons by Jingci, Fotuo, Baoning below do their best to support the view articulated in the World Honored One's baggage.[256]

海印: 肯雲門不肯雲門? 下淨慈佛陁保寧上堂, 世尊行李處, 盡力扶見也.

Jingci Zongben[257] ascended the hall and said, “When all the buddhas appear in the world they skillfully establish salvation methods and respond according to Principle only to make people attain awakening. ‘Two thousand years ago, under the tree of no sorrow, as soon as he left his mother's womb, he walked a circuit, took seven steps … “I alone am the honored one.” ’ All the heavenly beings and wordly people did not comprehend the revealed facts (消息). (All they) say is ‘On the eigth day of the fourth month the Thus Come One was born.’ Did they recognize the Buddha or not? Haven't you heard? ‘If with matter you try to see me and with sound you try to seek me then this person will walk a heretical path and will not be able to see the

256 “Career” (Ch. *xingli*, Kr. *haengni*, Jp. *anri* 行李), like its homonym *xingli* 行履, literally refers to the path on which one trod. It can also refer to the manner in which one trains everyday (*Zengo jiten*, p. 6). The same word (but pronounced *kōri* in Japanese) was also used, as it is today in modern Chinese, to refer to the “luggage” used during travel (or pilgrimage) and by extention to refer to pilgrmage (Ch. *xingjiao*, Kr. *haenggak*, Jp. *angya* 行脚) itself; see Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 132.

257 Jingci 淨慈 or Huilin Zongben was the abbot of Jingci Monastery 淨慈寺 in Hangzhou, whence his name. He is a dharma heir of Tianyi Yihuai. He followed Tianyi from Jingde Monastery 景德寺 in Anhui province to Mt. Tianyi and Jianfu Monastery 薦福寺 in Zhejiang province. In 1083, he was invited by the emperor to serve as the abbot of Huilin Chan Cloister 慧林禪院 at Xiangguo Monastery in the Eastern Capital, Kaifeng. He later received the title Chan Master Yuanzhao 圓照禪師.

Thus Come One.'[258] If you have already been prohibited from seeing with matter or seeking with sound, then speak, where is this fellow?" After a while he said, "Now that you stand magnificently outside the three realms,[259] who will determine the king of Dharmas?

> 淨慈本, 上堂云, "諸佛出世, 巧設化門, 據理而推, 只要令人悟去. 二千年前, 於無憂樹下, 纔出母胎, 便乃周行七步, 至唯我獨尊, 諸天世人, 不會他者箇消息, 便道 '四月八日, 如來降生,' 還識佛也未? 豈不見道? '若以色見我, 以音聲求我, 是人行邪道, 不能見如來.' 旣不許色見聲求, 且道, 他家在什麼處?" 良久云, "堂堂三界外, 孰辨法中王?"

Fotuo Desun[260] ascended the hall, raised the present gongan, and said, "Yunmen cannot be said to be without merit, but what can be done about the one-sidedness of his views and understandings? I would not have done so. 'In coming I come for the sake of living beings, and in going I go for the sake of living beings.' "[261] With the fly whisk[262] he struck the meditation bench.

---

258 This is most likely a reference to a verse from the *Jingang bore boluomi jing* 金剛般若波羅蜜經 (hereafter *Diamond Sūtra*; T 235.8.752a17–18). "Matter" or "form" (*se* 色; S. *rūpa*) here refers to material things.

259 The three realms are the realm of desire (where hell beings, hungry ghosts, humans, demi-gods, and gods dwell), the realm of form (which corresponds to the four meditative absorptions known as *dhyāna*), and the formless realm (which consists of infinite space, infinite consciousness, nothingness, and neither perception nor non-perception).

260 For Fotuo Desun 佛陀德遜 (d.u.) and his teachings, see his entry in the *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.195b6–198b4). Fotuo was a dharma heir of Huanglong Huinan. The emperor invited him to serve as the abbot of Huilin Chan Cloister at Xiangguo Monastery in the eastern capital. He was also officially granted the title Chan Master Fotuo 佛陀禪師 by Emperor Zhezong 哲宗 (r. 1085–1100).

261 These words can also be seen in the entry for Foguang Ruman 佛光如滿 (d.u.) in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.249a7).

262 The "whisk" or "fly whisk" (Ch. *fuzi*, Kr. *bulja* 拂子) served as an important ritual implement in Buddhism. The permission to use animal hair to chase away flies and mosquitos can be found in the

佛陀遜, 上堂, 擧此話云, "雲門不道無長處, 爭奈見解偏枯!山僧卽不然, 來爲衆生來, 去爲衆生去." 以拂子擊禪牀.

Baoning Renyong ascended the hall and said,[263] "As soon as the elder Śākyamuni was born, he walked a circuit and took seven steps and gazed in each of the four directions. At that time, the land was vast and the people were few, so the number of men he met was small. Accordingly, with one hand he pointed to Heaven and with the other hand he pointed to the earth and, telling fortunes here and there in a village of three households,[264] he said, 'I alone am the honored one above and below Heaven.' If the ancestors don't understand, calamity will reach the descendents." He descended from the seat and with his hand hit the meditation bench and told the assembly, "Thirty years from now[265] you must not falsely raise this sermon for comment."

保寧勇, 上堂云, "釋迦老子, 初生下時, 周行七步, 目顧四方. 當伊麽時, 土曠人稀, 相逢者小. 遂以一手指天一手指地, 三家村裏, 東卜西卜, 便道, '天上天下, 唯我獨尊,' 祖禰不了, 殃及子孫." 下座, 以手托禪床, 却召大衆云, "三十年後, 不得錯擧."

Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya; see ZGD, p. 1156.

263 This *shangtang* 上堂 ("ascending the hall") sermon is also found in the *Baoning Yong chanshi yulu*, whose preface is dated 1078 (XZJ 120.358b2–5).

264 This expression was probably borrowed from Yunmen: "In a village of three households one makes a living as a fortune teller and tells fortunes here and there. Suddenly, a fortune may indeed come true." *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi yulu* (T 1988.47.554b28); see also his recorded sayings in the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.354a2–3). Yunmen and his sayings are also cited in the *Yunwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.775a16).

265 Thirty years is said to be the conventional length of a monk's training; see App, *Master Yunmen*, p. 128, note 4.

Yuantong Yuanji[266] ascended the hall, raised the present case, and said, "You can say that he deceived the three realms as if no one was around him. The best was when Yunmen stepped forward and said, ' … great peace to all under Heaven.' However, these two ancient sages are as good as good can be and as splendid as splendid can be in terms of contrivances (建化門).[267] If they are checked against the great matter of one's original endowment (本分事) they still lack a critical move. I dare ask the great assembly, what is the great matter of one's original endowment?" After a while he said, "Embroider a pair of mandarin ducks for others to see, but do not hand over the gold needle to anyone."[268]

圓通璣, 上堂, 擧此話云, "可謂欺視三界, 傍若無人. 最好是雲門出來道, 至天下大平. 然, 此二古聖, 於建化門中, 善則善矣, 美則美矣. 若於本分事中, 檢點將來, 猶欠一着在. 敢問大衆. 作麼生是本分事?" 良久云, "鴛鴦繡出從教[269]看, 莫把金針度與人."

[Explanation]

Yuantong: This is the intent behind Xuedou flipping over the meditation bench above.

266 Yuantong Yuanji 圓通圓機 (1036–1118), also known as Daomin 道旻 and simply "Old Buddha" or Gufo 古佛, is a dharma heir of Huanglong Huinan. After Huanglong's death, he served as chief seat of Huanglong's disciple Donglin Changcong. Yuanji first became abbot on Mt. Cuiyan 翠巖 and later served as abbot of Yuantong Monastery 圓通寺 in Jiangxi province. In 1103, he became the abbot of Baoning Monastery 保寧寺 in Jinling.

267 For more on "contrivances" or "artifices" (*jianhua* 建化) during the Song dynasty, see Juhn Ahn, "Who Has the Last Word in Chan? Transmission, Secrecy and Reading During the Northern Song Dynasty," *Journal of Chinese Religions* 37 (2009): 1–72.

268 *Huanglong Huinan chanshi yulu* (T 1993.47.637a22–23), *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.717c22–23), *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.817b7–8), *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZ J137.109a17–18). The verse seems to have been well known during the Song. It even makes an appearance in the *Zhuzi yulei* 朱子語類 104 as a teaching that represents mystical language of Chan; see Li Jingde ed., *Zhuzi yulei* (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1986), p. 2620.

269 Here, I follow the reading of the above sources (see note 268) and substitute *jun* 君 for *jiao* 教.

圓通義, 上雪竇掀倒禪床之意也.

Chengtian Huai ascended the hall, raised the present gongan [for comment] and said, "Speak! What sort of truth (道理) do you possess that would allow you to tell such a story? Is it because you neither look ahead nor gaze back? Or is it because you act as if no one was around you? Great assembly! Try and judge for yourself. If you are able to judge for yourself you alone will be the honored one not only above and below Heaven but also in the lands of the trischiliocosm as numerous as small particles of dust. There will be no comparison and no match. If you are not able to judge for yourself, then coming and going amidst passers-by will also be your original endowment. Why? Have you not seen what the former sage said? 'Contemplate the Buddha as you would the true mark of the body.'[270] Even so, you must equip yourself with the true eye of the Dharma and then you will be able to contemplate the Buddha.[271] What is the true eye of the Dharma?" He then struck (the platform) with his fly whisk and said, "The stick has an eye as bright as the sun. If you wish to see pure gold, look in the fire."[272]

承天懷, 上堂, 擧此話云,"且道! 具什麼道理, 便能如斯語話? 爲復不瞻前顧後耶? 爲復傍若無人耶? 大衆, 試斷看. 若斷得,非唯天上天下, 便乃三千世界微塵國土, 獨尊獨貴, 無比無儔.若斷未得, 且於行間往來, 亦是本分. 何故? 豈不見先

270 This is probably a reference to a passage from the *Vimalakīrti Sūtra* (T 475.14.554c29) or, perhaps, the *Wenshushili suoshuo mohe bore boluomi jing* 文殊師利所說摩訶般若波羅蜜經 (T 232.8.728a28).

271 According to legend, the (treasury of the) eye of the true Dharma—a view, understanding, or consciousness that is devoid of deflments—is what the Buddha transmitted to Mahākāśyapa before his nirvana on Vulture Peak; see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.206a6) and *Fozu lidai tongzai* 佛祖歷代通載 (T 2036.49.496a21–23). A reference to the eye of the true Dharma is also found in the *Nirvana Sūtra* (T 374.12.596b5–596b8), *Fosuo xingzan* 佛所行讃 (T 192.4.33c8), and other scriptures.

272 This last line is also found in the *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.670b18–19), *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.792c21–26), and *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.160b17 and 195c4).

聖道? '觀身實相, 觀佛亦然.' 然雖如是, 也須具正法眼, 方解觀得.且作麼生是正法眼?" 遂擊拂子云, "棒頭有眼明如日. 要識眞金火裏看."

[Explanation]

Chengtian: His perspective rests in the great matter of the original endowment (分上) of all people. Only the elder Śākyamuni is not like this.

承天: 立處在諸人分上事, 非獨釋迦老子如是也.

Foguo Keqin added a comment,[273] "The phrase that startles the crowd must be picked up in the place for startling crowds and special matters (寄特之事) should be taken out when you meet a special person. The elder Śākyamuni can be said to have startled the crowd and great man Yunmen might as well be special. They set the wheel of the unquantifiable skill (機) in motion on the top of the heads of a thousand sages on the spot. If you personally understand this way,[274] then will you know Śākyamuni and cut off passage through a key vital point. Yunmen knew new his debt and understood how to repay it. Speak! What is Yunmen's point?[275] Get it? 'The staff has an eye as bright as the sun. If you wish to see pure gold, look in the fire.' "[276]

佛果勤拈, "驚群之句, 須向驚群處擧揚; 奇特之事, 須遇奇特人拈出. 釋迦老子, 可謂驚群; 雲門大士, 不妨奇特. 直下以不可測度底機輪, 向千聖頂上撥轉. 若能伊麼體會, 始知釋迦把斷要津, 雲門知恩解報. 且道! 雲門落在什麼處? 還會麼? 棒頭有眼明如日, 要識眞金火裏看."

---

273 This comment is also found in the *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.792c21–26).

274 Here "personally understand" (Ch. *tihui*, Kr. *chehoe* 體會), as Koga and Iriya point out, is to understand through the body, experientially, and personally (Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 287).

275 As Koga and Iriya point out, *luochu* 落處 here means something like "point" or "essential point" (Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 468). In the *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.792c24–25) Yunmen's name is missing, so this point could be the Buddha's or Yunmen's.

276 See note 272 above.

[Explanation]

Foguo: There never was a difference between Śākyamuni and Yunmen's point.

佛果: 釋迦雲門立處, 未嘗有異也.

Dahui Zonggao said,[277] "The last phrase was completely exposed even before it was expressed as sound. It covers Heaven and covers earth; it covers sound and covers matter. The gold-faced elder was able to make a critical move and it is said, 'Without having yet departed Tuṣita, had already descended into the palace and, without having yet left the mother's womb, had already completed the task of saving people'; and up to 'when (the Buddha) was just born a quake shook the net of all worlds, and then with one hand he pointed to Heaven and with the other hand he pointed to earth, made a great lion's roar and said, "I alone am the honored one above and below Heaven."' This was for the sake of bringing the causes and conditions for the one great matter[278] to fruition. Open the insight of the buddhas and demonstrate the insight of the buddhas; awaken to the insight of the buddhas and enter the insight of the buddhas.[279] The Buddha was completely unaware[280] of the fact

277 A part of this *shizhong* ("instructions to the assembly") sermon already appeared in the *seolhwa* for case 1. For sources, see note 42 above. For the full sermon, see *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.842c8–22).

278 The expression "the causes and conditions for the one great matter" (Ch. *yi dashi yinyuan*, Kr. *il daesa inyeon* 一大事因緣) is a reference to a famous passage from the *Lotus Sūtra* (T 262.9.7a21–28). The passage speaks of the one great purpose for which buddhas appear in the world, namely to attain enlightenment and save all living beings.

279 Here Dahui uses a word that normally carries a negative connotation in his writings, "views" (Ch. *Zhijian* 知見), in a positive sense to refer to the correct view (*samyagdṛṣṭi*) or insight of the buddhas (Ch. *fozhijian* 佛知見).

280 As Koga and Iriyia point out, *shubuzhi* 殊不知 here should be translated as "completely unaware" (Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 196).

that he would be confronted by a lame[281] teacher who would have 'killed him with a single blow and given what remains of him to a dog to eat up and would thus attempt to bring great peace to all under Heaven' several thousand years later. Speak! Wherein lies the elder Śākyamuni's fault? Is it him pointing to Heaven and pointing to earth and opening his big mouth? Or is it the fact that he should not have teased the men and women in town? Or is it the fact that he opened the insight of the buddhas, demonstrated the insight of the buddhas, awakened to the insight of the buddhas, and entered the insight of the buddhas? If you make such calculations (商量), not only will you slander him, the elder Śākyamuni, but will also betray great master Yunmen. Having arrived here, if you know Yunmen's point, then you will know your own point. Speak! What is the point?" After a while he said, "Reflection of the moon from empty space in a pond that has been blue since the distant past; only after trying to fish it up again and again did I come to realize that it was just a reflection."[282]

> 大慧杲云, "末後一句子, 聲前露倮倮, 盖天盖地, 盖聲盖色. 黄面老子, 得箇一着子, 便道 '未離兜率, 已降王宮, 未出毋胎, 度人已畢,' 及至初生, 卽震動一切世界網, 便一手指天一手指地, 作大師子吼道, '天上天下, 唯我獨尊!' 爲一大事因緣故, 開佛知見, 示佛知見, 悟佛知見, 入佛知見. 殊不知, 數千年後, 被箇跛脚阿師, '要一棒打殺, 與狗子喫, 貴[283]圖天下大平.' 且道! 釋迦老子, 過在什麽處? 莫是指天指地開大口麽? 莫是不合鼓弄人家男女麽? 莫是開示悟入佛知見麽? 若

[281] This is a reference to a famous legend about Yunmen and his encounter with Muzhou Daoming 睦州道明 or Reverend Chen 陳尊宿 (d.u.). Yunmen is said to have gained an insight when Reverend Chen slammed a door on his leg, which unfortunately resulted him Yunmen becoming lame. See App, *Master Yunmen*, p. 21, note 2.

[282] This verse also appears in several other sources; see *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZ J136.171a8). *See also Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.755b29-c1, 757b18–19, 796b29), *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.72a17), *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.388b6–7), *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 118.122a10), and *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.478b13–14).

[283] Here, we find *gui* in lieu of *kui* (see note 124 above), which seems to indicate that the *seolhwa* was not heavily edited to match the wording of the *Seonmun yeomsong*.

伊麽商量, 不唯謗他釋迦老子, 亦乃辜負雲門大師. 到者裏, 若知雲門落處,卽知自己落處. 且道! 落在什麽處?" 良久云,"萬古碧潭空界月, 再三撈摝始應知."

[Explanation]

Dahui said, "The last phrase etcetera": The meaning of Dahui's saying is identical to the meaning of Yuanwu Keqin's verse in the previous Tuṣita gongan. It is also identical to Chengtian's ascending the hall sermon above.

大慧云, 末後一句子云云, 前兜率話中, 圓悟勤頌義一般, 亦承天上堂義一般也.

Baiyuan Zhibing added a comment, "Yunmen's balance[284] transcends the standards of human beings. 'Like a dragon that has acquired water and a tiger that is nestled in the mountain,'[285] he is as beautiful as beautiful can be. However, he still doesn't know the opening to going beyond. Bright-eyed, patch-robed monks, please try to determine this matter for yourself."

白雲昺拈,"雲門稱提, 超出人表, 如龍得水, 似虎靠山, 美則美矣. 要且, 未知向上一竅在, 明眼衲僧, 試請辨看."

[Explanation]

Baiyun: Opening to going beyond: how could this not be the meaning of Xuedou flipping over the meditation bench?

白雲: 向上一竅, 豈非雪竇掀倒禪床處!

---

284 This refers to Yunmen's added comment. It functions like a balance and weighs the different responses to the above gongan.

285 This appears to be a commonly cited saying in Chan texts; see *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.692–a29); *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.748c23 and 771c18–19); *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.828b28, 846b17, and 921b4); and also *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.33c20).

Case 5.

The World Honored One Picks Up a Flower

世尊拈花

[Old Case]

When the World Honored One was preaching the Dharma on Vulture Peak four types of flowers fell like rain from the heavens. The World Honored One picked up a flower and showed it to the assembly and Kāśyapa smiled faintly. The World Honored One said, "I have the treasury of the eye of the true Dharma, which I entrust to Mahākāśyapa."[286] [According to one book, the World Honored One gazed at Kāśyapa with his blue lotus-like eyes[287] and Kāśyapa smiled faintly.]

世尊在靈山說法, 天雨四花. 世尊遂拈花示衆, 迦葉微笑. 世尊云, "吾有正法眼藏, 付囑摩訶迦葉." <一本, 世尊, 以青蓮目顧視迦葉, 迦葉微笑.>

[Explanation of the gongan]

When the World Honored One was preaching the Dharma on Vulture Peak four types of flowers fell like rain from the heavens: a summary of a passage from

[286] For a discussion of this gongan, see Foulk, "Sung Controversies Concerning the 'Separate Transmission' of Ch'an," p. 257. *Wumen guan* (T 2005.48.293c13–16); *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* (XZJ 135.612a1–4); *Rentian yanmu* (T 2006.48.325b11–14); *Fozu tongji* (T 2035.49.170c13–14); *Fozu lidai tongzai* (T 2036.49.496a20–24); *Seonmun bojangnok* (XZJ 113.985b7–10); and *Donglin heshang yunmen anzhu songgu* (XZJ 118.795b15–17). See also note 271 above.

[287] Blue lotus-like eyes (Ch. Qinglianmu, Kr. Cheongnyeonmok 青蓮目) is an epithet of the Buddha.

the *Lotus Sūtra*.[288]

I have … to Kāśyapa: this is a summary of a passage from the *Nirvana Sūtra*.[289]

The World Honored One picked up a flower and Kāśyapa smiled faintly: is this an incomplete summary of a scripture? Is there no corresponding passage in the scriptures and commentaries? In fact, a record in the *Rentian baojian* reads,[290]

> The Prince of Shu[291] asked Chan master Huiquan,[292] "From what source was the phrase, 'the World Honored One picked up a flower and Kāśyapa smiled faintly,' discussed by the Chan houses taken?' Huiquan said, "It is not recorded in the canon." The king said, "During a recent visit to the Hanlin Academy I chanced upon the *Dafantianwang wen fo jueyi jing* in three fascicles.[293] After I read it, (I noticed that) the scripture's record (of this event) is very detailed. The great Brahma king visited the assembly on Vulture Peak and offered a golden *udumbara* flower to the Buddha.[294] He threw his body down to make a lectern seat and requested

---

288 See *Lotus Sūtra* (T 262.9.2b10).

289 See *Nirvana Sūtra* (T 374.12.377c22–24 and T 375.12.617b24–26).

290 The following passage appears not in the *Rentian baojian* 人天寶鑑 but in the *Rentian yanmu* 人天眼目 (T 2006.48.325b6–15).

291 The Prince of Shu 舒王 here refers to the great Song statesman Wang Anshi 王安石 (1021–1086) who was given this title by Emperor Huizong in 1113.

292 Fohui 佛慧 or Nanming Faquan 南明法泉 (d.u.) is a Chan master of the Yunmen branch. He received transmission from Yunju Xiaoshun 雲居曉舜 (d.u.). He served as the abbot of Daming Monastery 大明寺, Qianqing Monastery 千頃寺, Lingyan Monastery 靈巖寺, Nanming Monastery 南明寺, and Jiangshan Monastery 蔣山寺. He was also invited by the emperor to serve as the abbot of Zhihai Chan Cloister at Xiangguo Monastery in the Eastern Capital, Kaifeng.

293 The same reference is made in the *Fozu tongji* (T 2035.49.170c13–14). For the *Dafantianwang wen fo jueyi jing*, see note 240 above.

294 Udumbara is a legendary flower that falls from Heaven only under special circumstances such asthe birth of the Buddha. It is often used as a metaphor for the difficulty of encountering the truth Dharma; see *Chang ahan jing* (T1.1.25a11) and *Yiqie jing yinyi* (T 2128.54.351c13).

that the Buddha preach the Dharma for the myriad beings. As soon as he mounted the seat, the World Honored One picked up a flower and showed it to (alt. instructed) the assembly. The hundred trillion-fold assembly was all at a complete loss. Only Kāśyapa's entire face broke into a faint smile. The World Honored One said, 'I have the treasury of the eye of the true Dharma etcetera.'" Huiquan was amazed at his erudition.

According to the *Meixi ji*,[295] the above was taken from a passage from the *Da Fanwang wen Fo jueyi jing*. Master Shanqing[296] said, "The number of stories that the Chan house cites from the canon is rather big. Not a few men have secured an awakening by relying on these stories. Take for example 'the World Honored One picked up a flower,' 'Ānanda knocked down the flagpole in front of the gate,'[297] 'the non-Buddhist asked the Buddha whether there are words or not,'[298] 'Mañjuśrī's announcement mallet,'[299] 'two women evaluate a cadaver,'[300] 'a man with five supernatural powers asks the Buddha about the six supernatural powers,'[301] 'Subhuti sits in meditation on a cliff.'[302] Lecturer-types frequently take all these stories and claim that there are no corresponding passages in the scriptures. They

295 The *Meixi ji* 梅溪集 was composed by Wang Shipeng 王十朋 (1112–1171). There is no mention of *Dafantianwang wen fo jueyi jing* in the *Meixi ji* (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition).

296 Muan Shanqing 睦庵善卿 (d.u.) is the author of *Zuting shiyuan.*

297 For this gongan, see the *Wumen guan* 無門關 (T 2005.48.295c12–21).

298 For this gongan, see Case 65 of the *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.195b26–196b20).

299 For this koan, see Case 92 of the *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.216b18–c29) and also Case 33 of the *Seonmun yeomsong* translated below. The announcement mallet (Ch. *baichui*, Kr. *baekchu* 白椎) is, as the name implies, to make an announcement to the assembly; see ZGD, pp. 1051c–1052a.

300 This story is mentioned in the *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.189b19–21). See also Case 18 of the *Seonmun yeomsong* (HBJ 5.31b9–33a14).

301 For this story, see Case 14 of the *Seonmun yeomsong* (HBJ 5.23c18–25c9). It is also mentioned in the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.896a6–9).

302 For this story, see Case 7 of the *Seonmun yeomsong* (HBJ 5.19a3–b17).

arbitrarily doubt and do not trust the veracity of these stories. But ever since our Patriarch, we have never considered words and letters as a way out."[303] At the time of the compilation of the canon the great assembly considered the raising of the flower an adventitious affair and did not include it. Only Mahākāśyapa alone attained the secret tally, which he transmitted to Ānanda and Ānanda to Śāṇavāsa. One succeeding the next, it was transmitted to China and considered a symbol of separate transmission. Why is it necessary to determine whether it is contained in the scriptures and commentaries, either in part or in its entirety, or not? If they are recorded in bamboo slips and tablets, then this would make us completely identical to the Teaching vehicle. In fact, lay attendant Fazong[304] said, "Do not produce doubt because there is no corresponding passage in the scriptures and commentaries. This is a wonder that is transmitted separately by all the buddhas and patriarchs."[305]

> 靈山說法, 天雨四花, 節法華經文. 吾有云云迦葉, 節涅槃經文. 拈花微笑, 節經來未盡耶? 經論無文耶? 又人天寶鑑錄云, "舒王問慧泉禪師曰, '禪家所論, 世尊拈花, 迦葉微笑, 出自何傳?' 泉云, '藏乘所不載.' 王曰, '某頃在翰苑, 偶見大梵天王問佛決疑經三卷, 因閱之, 經中所載甚詳. 大梵天王, 詣靈山會上, 以金色優波羅花獻佛, 舍身爲床座, 請佛爲羣生說法. 世尊才登座, 拈花示衆, 百萬億衆, 悉皆罔措, 獨迦葉破顏微笑. 世尊云, 吾吾有正法眼藏眼云云.' 泉歎其慱究." 出梅溪集. 則大梵天王問佛決疑經文所出也. 善卿師云, "禪家所引, 涉藏乘之緣, 頗多, 由是緣而獲證悟者, 盖不鮮少. 只如世尊拈花·阿難門前倒刹竿·外道問佛有無言·文殊白椎·二女評屍·五通問佛·須菩提巖中宴坐. 似此等緣, 往往講學之輩, 謂爲經論無文, 輙疑而不信. 然而吾祖之來, 未甞以文字言辭爲能事也." 盖當時大衆, 謂爲偶然, 不結集在法藏. 惟大迦葉, 獨得密契, 以此傳阿難, 阿難傳商那和修, 轉展相承, 傳之華夏, 以爲別傳之摽致, 何必徵於經論載不載, 經來盡未盡也! 若在簡牘, 則完同於敎乘矣. 又宗道者云, "莫以經論無文而生疑" 也. 此是諸佛諸祖別傳之妙也.

303 *Zuting shiyuan* (XZJ 113.52b17–53a4).

304 This may be a reference to Xuedou Chongxian's student Touzi Fazong 投子法宗 (d.u.).

305 Source unclear.

The four flowers: they refer to the *mañjūṣaka* flower. Did he pick up a single flower from the ground or was it one of the four types of flowers?

He picked up a flower and showed it to the assembly and Kāśyapa smiled faintly: was it a casual picking up of a flower and a casual faint smile? Was it a simple picking up of a flower and a simple faint smile? Did the World Honored One accord with the potential and point directly and did Kāśyapa accord with the potential and have a complete awakening? An ancient one said, "To accord with the potential and point directly is to have already done it in a roundabout way. To accord with the potential and have a complete awakening is to have already become dim-witted."[306] But this too was just a talk (that was uttered) to sweep away the traces. It bears no relevance to that state in which the World Honored One and Kāśyapa saw each other face-to-face. The elder Śākya remained silent about this essential point for a long time. For forty-nine years and in front of three hundred-or-so assemblies he couldn't raise it and couldn't explain in its entirety. Finally, in front of the assembly on Vulture Peak he was able to raise it and explain it in its entirety. The hundred trillion-fold assembly was at a complete loss. Only Kāśyapa's entire face broke into a faint smile. This is the second transmission of the mind.

I have the treasury of the eye of the true Dharma: sorting out the erroneous is "true," maintaining the guidelines is "dharma," illumination is "eye," and storing away is "treasury." In fact, the true Dharma is like an eye and like a treasury.

Entrusting it to Kāśyapa: the moment when faith was accepted radiance reached the later generations.

四花者, 曼殊沙花云云. 拈起地一枝花耶? 四花中一花耶? 拈花示衆迦葉微笑者, 閑拈花閑微笑耶? 但拈花但微笑耶? 當機直指, 當機悟達耶? 古人云, "當機直指, 早已迂曲了也;當機悟達, 早已鈍痴了也." 然, 此亦拂迹之談, 於世尊迦葉相見處, 了沒交涉. 釋迦老子, 久默斯要, 四十九年三百餘會, 提不起說不盡, 末

306 Source unclear.

後靈山會上, 始提得起說得盡. 人天百萬億衆, 悉皆罔措, 唯大迦葉破顔微笑. 此是第二傳心. 吾有正法眼藏者, 揀邪爲正, 軌持爲法, 照了爲眼, 含攝爲藏. 又正法如眼如藏也. 付囑云云迦葉者, 取信當時, 光揚後世.

Dahong Baoen's verse

Having met face-to-face why hesitate?
In the flash of lightning and drift of a comet you're already ten thousand miles away.
A fragrant wind circles the earth and blows inconsistently.
An *udumbara* flower appears in the world of human beings.
[Try to smell it and your brain will be torn apart.]

> 大洪恩頌, "覿面相呈何所擬? 電閃星流千萬里. 香風匝地吹無時, 優曇花現人閒世." <齅着則腦裂.>

Nanming Faquan's[307] verse[308]

A chilly wind scrapes the earth and sweeps away the withered plant roots,
Who is aware that the Lord of the East's command (i.e., spring) has already returned?
First exposed by the plum blossoms of the Yu mountain range,[309]
A single branch blossoms in the snow.

> 南明泉頌, "霜風刮地掃枯荄, 誰覺東君令已廻? 唯有嶺梅先漏洩, 一枝獨向雪中開."

---

307 See note 292 above.

308 This verse is also found in the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.59a4–5).

309 The Yu mountain range is famous for its plum blossoms. Because it splits the northern and southernhalves of the continent, by the time the flowers in the south begin to wither those in the north begin to blossom.

[Explanation]

Dahong and Nanming: They clarified that state in which the World Honored One and Kāśyapa saw each other face-to-face.

Try to smell it and your brain will be torn apart: this means it does not leave behind guidelines.[310]

大洪南明, 明世尊迦葉相見處也. 齅著則腦裂者, 不存軌則也.

Yunju Liaoyuan's[311] verse

The World Honored One picked up a flower and Kāśyapa smiled faintly,
Fish in water and birds in the sky above,[312]
Guanyin is mistaken for Maitreya,
You don't iron and make tea with the same pot.[313]

雲居元頌, "世尊拈花迦葉微笑, 水底魚兮天上鳥. 誤將彌勒作觀音, 慰斗煎茶不同銚."

---

310 The expression "does not leave behind guidelines" often appears in tandem with the expression "the great function manifests before you" (*dayong xianqian* 大用現前); see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51. 267c23, 323c15, and 385A11), *Yunmen guanglu* (T 1988.47.554c2 and 571b22), *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.891a8), and *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.142c5–6 and 205b26). Simply put, the great function or, in our case, the expression, "try to smell it and your brain will be torn apart," leaves no trace behind for others to imitate or understand discursively.

311 This is Jinshan Liaoyuan; see note 222 above. Liaoyuan seems to have been particularly fond of this gongan. The famed artist Li Gonglin is known to have resonded to his friend Liaoyuan's request to draw a portrait of the Chan master as the Buddha holding up the flower and smiling. For the portrait, Liaoyuan offered an inscription; see An-yi Pan, *Painting Faith: Li Gonglin and Northern Song Buddhist Cultur*e (Leiden: Brill, 2007), p.114.

312 This is an oft-used metaphor for the workings of everyday life and natural order of things. In other words, Liaoyuan is saying that there is nothing exceptional or special about the Buddha raising the flower and faintly smiling at Kāśyapa.

313 In other words, Guanyin and Maitreya are identical but different.

[Explanation]

Yunju: The *World Honored One … birds in the sky above*: as it says elsewhere, "In the rivers and lakes they forget each other; in the clouds and Heaven they can do as they please."[314]

(Guanyin) is mistaken for … in the same pot: as it is said, "Hesitate even a bit and one confrontation (will remove you from the truth) by a thousand miles."[315]

雲居: 世尊至天上鳥者, 如他處云, '江湖相忘雲天得志也.' 誤將至同銚者, 如云, '擬心一絲對面千里也.'

Jianfu Benyi's verse

The World Honored One picked up a flower with his own hand,
Kāśyapa's entire face broke into a faint smile,
The two old (worthies) were like a pair of awls,[316]
They still didn't know the passage through which they could go beyond (向上).

薦福逸頌, "世尊自手拈花, 迦葉破顔微笑. 二老一雙古錐, 未知向上一竅."

[Explanation]

Jianfu: What sort of passage is *the passage through which they could go beyond*? Speak! The World Honored One and Kāśyapa—did they or didn't they know such a passage exists? If you say they didn't know, then you'll fail to live up to expectations of the sages. If you say they did know, then you'll

314 *Hongzhi guanglu* (T 2001.48.22b16).

315 *Hongzhi guanglu* (T 48.2001.22b16–17).

316 An awl (Ch. *zhui*, Kr. *chu* 錐) is a oft-used metaphor in Chan for the ability to get right to the essential point.

betray our descendants. Jianfu's intentions when he ascended hall is identical to those of the above verse.

> 薦福: 向上一竅, 是什麽孔竅?且道! 世尊迦葉, 知有不知有? 若言不知有, 辜負先聖; 若言知有, 喪我兒孫. 薦福上堂, 前頌意一般也.

Again, his verse[317]

The most extraordinary thing about the separate transmission outside of teachings
Is when (the Buddha) raised the flower with his *tūla* silk-like hands,[318]
Had the old man on Vulture Peak (i.e., Kāśyapa)[319] not been in the assembly,
To whom would the clear and boundless fragrance be entrusted?

> 又頌, "教外別傳事最奇, 兜羅綿手擧花時. 會中不得雞峰老, 無限清香付與誰?"

Dinghui Chaoxin's[320] verse

The warm winds of spring have finally returned,[321]
The underground channels of water know it first.[322]

317 For this verse, see also *Chanong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ115.59b14–15).

318 One of the eighty minor marks of the Buddha; see *Foben xingji jing* (T 190.3.692c28–29); and *Zhong ahan jing* 中阿含經 (T 26.1.493c29 and 686b8–9). *Tūla* is a kind of cotton.

319 Kāśyapa is identified with Vulture Peak because he was instructed to stay on the peak until the arrival of Maitreya; see *Zeng yi ahan jing* 增壹阿含經 (T 125.2.789a5–10).

320 Dinghui Chaoxin 定慧超信 (d.u.) or Haiyin Chaoxin is a dharma heir of Langye Huijue.

321 The warm winds of spring refer to the Buddha raising the flower.

322 The underground channels refer to Kāśyapa who understood why the Buddha raised the flower.

The plum blossoms on the Yu mountain range have already burst open in the snow,
But the other hundred flowers await the brilliance of spring,[323]
Kāśyapa! Kāśyapa!
Know it or not, it looks like you've fallen into a convenient opportunity.[324]

> 定慧信頌, "暖氣方歸, 地脉先知. 嶺梅已向雪中綻, 百花猶自待春輝. 迦葉波迦葉波! 知不知也似落便宜."

Donglin Changcong's verse[325]

He put (the Dharma) into motion in full force outside of teachings only then was there a separate transmission,
The Drinker of Light (i.e., Kāśyapa) closed his eyes and smiled without a word,
How pitiful are the ten thousand beings on Vulture Peak!
They don't get the profundity of the critical move right in front of their eyes.
Huh!

> 東林惣頌, "教外全提始別傳, 飲光閉目笑無言. 可憐十萬靈山衆! 不薦當頭一着玄." 咄!

Fazhen Shouyi's verse

Who can match the blink of the lotus-like eyes?

---

323 From the context, it seems clear that the plum blossoms on the Yu mountain range refers to Kāśyapa and the other hundred flowers to the others in the assembly.

324 The last line here seems to be warning against making any hasty interpretations of the Buddha's gesture and Kāśyapa's smile.

325 For this verse, see also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.59a10–11).

Among the million beings only the Drinker of Light could do it.
The transmission of the eye of the Dharma has not yet been cut off,
The continuous stretch of the earth is as long as Heaven.

法眞一頌, "蓮眸一瞬孰能當? 百萬衆中唯飲光. 法眼至今傳不絕, 綿綿地久與天長."

Baoning Renyong's verse[326]

Our Buddha who picked up the flower was on Vulture Peak,
The ascetic Kāśyapa suddenly broke into a smile.
He personally entrusts the secret words from the golden mouth,[327]
Not only in the realm of heavenly beings but also in the realm of humans.

保寧勇頌, "拈花我佛在靈山, 迦葉頭陁忽破顏. 金口密言親付囑, 不唯天上與人間."

Kunshan Huiyuan's verse

Kāśyapa was not alone in making a faint smile,
The World Honored One looked gently at the crowd of sages,
If you say the essentials of the mind are transmitted by meeting eye-to-eye,
Can speaking of food ever make you full or not?[328]

崑山元頌, "迦葉微微笑不孤, 世尊聊眄聖賢徒. 若言目擊傳心要, 說食還曾飽也無."

326 For this verse, see also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.59a8–9).

327 The golden mouth is a common metaphor for the Buddha and his teachings.

328 This idea also appears in the vulgate edition of the *Platform Sūtra* (T 2008.48.350a16–17).

Zhaxi Riyi's verse

On Vulture Peak he picked up a flower and showed it to those of superior capacity,
This is as rare as a blind turtle encountering a piece of wood floating in the ocean,[329]
Had the Drinker of Light not smiled faintly,
To whom would the clear and boundless fragrance be entrusted?[330]

> 霅溪益頌, "靈鷲拈花示上機, 肯同浮木接盲龜. 飲光不是微微笑, 無限清香付與誰?"

Chengtian Huai's verse

The Well Gone One (i.e., the Buddha)[331] raised a flower and demonstrated the sublime function,
The Drinker of Light smiled faintly and exposed the mechanisms of Heaven (天機),
From this moment on it spread in the eastern and western lands,
Dragging ordinary beings into the trap of right and wrong.

> 承天懷頌, "善逝拈花施妙用, 飲光微笑洩天機. 從茲流落東西土, 引得平人陷是非."

Foyan (Qing)yuan's verse[332]

329 For this famous metaphor, see the *Za ahan jing* (T 99.2.108c6–20) and the *Nirvana Sūtra* (T 374.12.372c22–23, 498c25–26).

330 See Jianfu Benyi's verse above.

331 Well Gone One (S. Sugata) is one of the ten epithets of the Buddha.

332 For this verse, see also *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.591b6–7).

Millions of humans and heavenly beings were expecting a homily,
(But) a flower is picked up and a faint smile is made—a great, persistent mistake,
How vast and obscure karmic consciousness is!
Working hard to ask about (the smile), they fume like boiling water.

佛眼遠頌, "百萬人天望擧揚, 拈花微笑大乖張. 幾多業識茫茫者! 問着勞生沸似湯."

Fojian Huiqin's verse

When he raised a flower with his radiant wheel-covered-hands,[333]
Only the golden ascetic was all smiles,
How laughable are the ten million in the assembly on Vulture Peak!
How many know the sumptuous fragrance right in front of their face?
How many?
He has, in fact, allowed you to scrutinize,
That old and aged awl of Vulture Peak (i.e., Kāśyapa).[334]

佛鑑勤頌, "光明輪手擧花時, 金色頭陁獨展眉. 堪笑靈山千萬衆! 紅香撲面幾人知? 幾人知? 却許伊勘破, 雞峯老古錐."

Changling Shouzuo's verse[335]

The World Honored One picked up a flower

---

[333] This is not part of the standard list of the thirty-two major or eighty-one minor marks of the Buddha. A reference to wheel-covered hands can be found, however, in the *Shoulengyan jing* (T19.945.110c9).

[334] This, of course, refers to Kāśyapa.

[335] For this verse *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.59b1–2). The last three lines are not included in the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji*.

Kāśyapa smiled faintly,
It falls on neither the *gong* nor the *shang* note,[336]
What sort of melody could this be?
The wind in the old ravine is clear,
The moon in the cold pond is bright,
I am letting you know,
Once the necessary awakening is complete,
You will be the bird with the most beautiful voice on Rong Peak.[337]

> 長靈卓頌, "世尊拈花, 迦葉微笑. 不落宮商, 是何曲調? 古洞風清, 寒潭月皎. 報君知, 須曉了, 融峯最好音聲鳥."

Foji Qi's verse[338]

When the lord Śākya was instructing the assembly on Vulture Peak,
A flower different from the rest was raised and a wide-open smile was made,
Who knows the true facts revealed inside the smile?
The boundless forces of nature have been exhaustively entrusted to him.

> 佛跡琪頌, "釋主靈山示衆時, 異花拈處笑開眉. 誰知笑裏眞消息? 無限風光盡囑伊."

Chongsheng Yuangong's[339] verse

---

336 Traditional Chinese music often used a pentatonic scale with the five notes *gong* 宮, *shang* 商, *jue* 角, *zhi* 徵, *and yu* 羽.

337 Rong Peak is the highest peak on Mt. Heng 衡山 in Hunan province.

338 The identity of Foji Qi 佛跡琪 is unclear.

339 Little is known about Chongsheng Yuangong 崇勝院珙 (d.u.) who is a dharma heir of Baiyun Shouduan.

The Greatly Enlightened One raised a flower—
Empty sounds of telling fortunes with a scoop,[340]
The Drinker of Light smiles faintly—
Like a lofty mountain on the flat earth,
Treasury of the eye of the true Dharma—
Rancid rice and left over soup,
Entrusting (the Dharma) to Kāśyapa—
A broken leg and leaking pot.

崇勝珙頌, "大覺拈花兮! 杓卜虛聲. 飲光微笑兮! 平地崢嶸. 正法眼藏兮! 餿飯殘羹. 分付迦葉兮! 折脚漏鐺."

Yunmen Zonggao's verse[341]

Raising a single flower,
A classy style flowed out of our house.
If you speak of entrusting the teaching of the mind,
And the matters under Heaven will become like tangled hemp.[342]

雲門杲頌, "拈起一枝花, 風流出當家. 若言付心法, 天下事如麻."

Zhu'an Shigui's verse[343]

340 According to the *Zuting shiyuan*, tossing a scoop (on the ground or in a body of water?) to tell fortune was a folk custom; see *Zuting shiyuan* (XZJ 113.174a12).

341 For this verse, see also *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.850c16–17).

342 That is to say, the original transmission will become buried under misleading views and understandings.

343 For this verse, see also *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.796a1–2).

The ocean's water flips over in the air and gushes down below,[344]
Fish, snakes, shrimp, crab in full tide sink and float,[345]
How pitiful is the golden ascetic!
Even to this very moment the smile has not yet come to rest.

> 竹庵珪頌, "海水飜空衮底流, 魚龍蝦蟹信沈浮. 可憐金色頭陁子! 直至如今笑未休."

Muan Fachong's verse

Revealing the true potential by raising a flower and smiling faintly,
Only the virtuosos know the secret tally and single transmission,
Reel in the direct intention (端的意) on a hook,
When the scale is in equilibrium what further doubt could there be?

> 牧庵忠頌, "拈花微笑顯眞機, 密契單傳作者知. 領取鉤頭端的意, 定盤星上復何疑!"

Yuwang Jiechen's[346] verse

In the wide sky wild geese have already come at the break of a frosty dawn,
In a thousand forests yellow leaves commit themselves to the moss,
A lonesome chrysanthemum by the eastern fence,[347]

---

344 I take *gun* 滾 for *gun* 衮.

345 Here I read *xin* 信 as "in full tide."

346 Wushi 無示 or Yuwang Jiechen 育王介諶 (1080–1148) is a dharma heir of Changling Shouzhuo. He served as the abbot of Ayuwang Monastery in Zhejiang province.

347 This is an allusion to a famous poem by Tao Yuanming 陶淵明 (365–427), "Picking chrysanthemums beneath the eastern fence," and the use of chrysanthemums in alcohol to aid

Is not put into the chalice after the royal descendant becomes drunk.

> 育王諶頌, "霜曉長空鴈已來, 千林黃葉委莓苔. 東籬寂寞一枝菊! 不入王孫醉後盃."

Baiyun Zhibing's verse[348]

He raised the flower and showed it to the assembly, but who got it?
The ascetic Kāśyapa alone broke into a smile,
The boundless white clouds (i.e., Baiyun) cannot be hidden,
They again follow the flowing water and fall into the realm of human beings.

> 白雲昺頌, "擧花示衆誰相委? 迦葉頭陀獨破顔. 無限白雲藏不得, 又隨流水落人間."

Wuweizi's[349] verse[350]

The World Honored One raised a flower,
Kāśyapa smiled faintly,
Calamity reached the descendents,
(Because) the former patriarchs did not get it done.

---

longevity. See James R. Hightower, "T'ao Ch'ien's 'Drinking Wine Poems'" in Chow Tse-tung, ed., *Wen-lin: Studies in the Chinese Humanities* (University of Wisconsin Press, 1968), pp. 12–16; and also A. R. Davis, "The Double Ninth Festival in Chinese Poetry: A Study on Variations upon a Theme," in the same volume, p. 49.

348 For this verse, see also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.59b5–6).

349 Wuweizi 無爲子 is the pen name of the eminent statesman and Buddhist layman Yang Jie 楊傑 (d.u.).

350 This verse is also found in the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.59a14).

無爲子頌, "世尊擧花, 迦葉微笑. 殃及子孫, 上祖不了."

Layman Wujin's verse[351]

The World Honored One and Kāśyapa do not know each other,
They each prepared a device to trap a tiger,[352]
The true eye and the wonderful mind are true marks (of reality),
To whom were they entrusted in the assembly on Vulture Peak?

無盡居士頌, "世尊迦葉不相知, 陷虎機關各自施. 正眼妙心眞實相! 靈山會裏付他誰?"

Layman Yuezhai's verse

They cast aside their grandfather's great heirloom bamboo mat,
And picked up a flower and made it the true transmission,
Their descendants were dragged into trouble and became poor to the bone,
They borrow grandmother's skirt and offer her a bow.[353]

悅齋居士頌, "抛他祖父大家筵, 拈出花枝作正傳. 帶累兒孫貧到骨, 借婆裙去拜婆年."

Jianfu Benyi ascended the hall, raised this story, and said, "Although master and disciple meet like a needle that hits a mustard seed, there is still

---

351 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.59b3–4).

352 The Buddha set his trap by raising a flower and Kāśyapa set his trap by smiling.

353 My translation of this last line is tentative. The expression also appears in the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.874b6 and 885a23), *Hongzhi guanglu* (T 2001.48.12c15), and *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.30a15, 361b3, 476a17, and 505a17).

no path to free oneself. Why? Escaping the self through the teaching gate (門裏出身) is easy and escaping the teaching gate through oneself (身裏出門) is difficult.[354] Now, in this assembly is there a patch-robed monk who can escape the (teaching) gate through himself/his body? Prove it to the assembly." After a while he said, "I almost had a thief destroy the house!"[355] And he let out a shout.

薦福逸, 上堂, 擧此話云, "雖則師資會遇, 針芥相投, 要且, 未有出身之路. 何也? 門裏出身易, 身裏出門難. 今此會中, 莫有身裏出門底衲僧麼? 對衆證據." 良久云, "幾乎敎賊破家!" 喝一喝.

Dinghui (Haiyin) Chaoxin in an informal sermon raised this story and said, "From the Western heaven to this land, the patriarchs and the old venerables under Heaven have not yet made a judgment on this public case (公案). I will risk losing my eyebrows and make a judgment for all of you tonight.[356] Eight blows for the World Honored One and thirteen blows for Kāśyapa. Speak! Wherein lies their fault? Those with an eye for the truth, please try it out for yourself.

定慧信, 小參, 擧此話云, "自西天洎此土, 祖師天下老和尙, 未斷此箇公案. 山僧今夜, 不惜眉毛, 爲諸人斷却. 世尊八下, 迦葉十三. 你且道! 過在什麼處? 具眼者, 試驗看."

[Explanation]

---

354 *Hongzhi guanglu* (T 2001.48.45b18, 47a12, 52c18, and 108a12), *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.99c20ff.), and *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 118.86b8).

355 A similar expression—"invite a thief to destroy the house" (*gouze pojia* 勾賊破家)—can be found in the *Linji lu* in the *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* (XZJ 135.685b10) and the *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.179b19, 188b22, 197c29, and 218c15).

356 In the Chan context, to risk losing one's eyebrows (Ch. *buxi meimao* 不惜眉毛) means one is willing to risk the penalty for slandering the Dharma and say something about the ineffable Dharma; see ZGD, p. 1047d.

Dinghui Chaoxin's informal sermon

Eight blows for the World Honored One and thirteen blows for Kāśyapa: the source for the number of blows is not known but these blows mean that (the World Honored One and Kāśyapa) have been judged to be at fault.

Speak … wherein lies their fault: this means, what fault is there?

定慧: 世尊八下, 迦葉十三者, 棒數出處未知, 義則與過也. 且道至麼處者, 有什麼過.

Huanglong Zuxin added a comment, "Bore holes through the skull of the patch-robed monks and change their eyeballs.[357] You face danger but do not fear others.[358] Where will you see the elder Śākya?"[359]

黄龍心拈, "穿過衲僧髑髏, 換却衲僧眼睛! 臨危不在悚人, 向甚處見釋迦老子?"

[Explanation]

Huanglong: The skull is the nest of consciousness. Eyes are the place where there is no consciousness. The World Honored One picked up a flower to bore through and change each and every one.

A person who faces danger but does not fear others: I suspect this might be a misprinting of "you fear others but not because you face danger."

黄龍: 髑髏則情識窠窟也, 眼睛則無情識處也. 世尊拈花, 則一一穿却換却也. 臨危不在悚人者, 疑悚人不在臨危之誤也.

---

357 As Koga and Iriya, p. 67 point out, this expression means something like "changing the eyes of patch-robed monks so that they can see the truth."

358 The Buddha, in other words, is not afraid of offering teachings; see the *Zongmen niangu huiji* 宗門拈古彙集 (XZJ 115.980a9).

359 For this common expression, see also the *Chanlin leiju* (XZJ 117.229a1–2).

Haihui Shouduan[360] added a comment, "Kāśyapa examined well the winds and the clouds and distinguished the forms of vapor (氣). Although this is true, does he realize how heavy the top of his head has become?"[361]

海會端拈, "迦葉, 善觀風雲別氣色. 雖然如是, 還覺頂門重麼?"

[Explanation]

Haihui Shouduan: *How heavy the top of his head has become*: this and likewise for what (Yuwang Jiechen) said, "the head is heavy and the tail light," cannot but get turned upside down.

海會: 頂門重者, 如云, '頭重尾輕, 未免顚墜也.

He again raised this story and said,[362] "Up to this very day transmission has flowed from one generation to the next preventing it from getting cut off. Great assembly! As for the treasury of the eye of the true Dharma, the elder Śākya himself was not worthy. What, then, did he entrust and what did he transmit? Why is it put this way? And what's more, resting on top of everyone's endowment there is the treasury of the eye of the true Dharma, which arises everyday. Right and wrong, the division of north and south, and various expedient acts are all radiant reflections of the treasury of the eye of the true Dharma. When this eye opens, heaven and earth, the great earth (大地), and the vast array of phenomena will be right in front of your face but

360 Baiyun Shouduan 白雲守端 (1025–1072) is a dharma heir of Yangqi Fanghui. He served as the abbot of Chengtian Chan Cloister 承天禪院 and Yuantong chongsheng Chan Cloister 圓通崇勝禪院 in Jiangxi province and Xinghua Chan Cloister 興化禪院, Zhengdao Chan Cloister 証道禪院 on Mt. Fahua 法華 (Anhui province), Qianming Chan Cloister 乾明禪院 on Mt. Longmen 龍門 (near Luoyang, Henan province), and Haihui Chan Cloister 海會禪院 on Mt. Baiyun 白雲 (Anhui province).

361 For this comment, see also the *Chanlin leiju* (XZJ 117.228b18–229a1).

362 For Haihui Shouduan's sermon, see also the *Baiyun Shouduan chanshi guanglu* 白雲守端禪師廣錄 (XZJ 120.410a5–b1).

not a hair's breadth of difference will exist among their forms. When this eye is not yet open, everything will remain inside your eyeballs. Today those who have already opened them will not be bound to such limits. For those who have not yet opened them, I will not spare my hands. I will open this treasury of the eye of the true Dharma for all of you to see." And then he raised his hands, set two fingers up straight, and said, "Look! Look! If you were able to see, then we are serving the same house. If not, then I cannot but speak again and recite a verse:

> Everyone's treasury of the eye of the Dharma,
> The thousand sages are no match for it;
> I'll throw you a line,
> Its brilliant radiance will fill the great Tang empire;
> Mt. Sumeru runs into the ocean,
> Harsh frost falls in the sixth lunar month;
> Although I[363] say this,
> There are no phrases on which to make calculations.

Great assembly! Having said a mouthful, why do I say that there are no phrases on which to make calculations?" He then let out a shout and said, "Try to split yourself and stand in two places."[364]

> 又擧此話云, "次第流傳, 無令斷絶, 至于今日. 大衆, 若是正法眼藏, 釋迦老子自無分, 將箇什麽分付, 將箇什麽流傳? 何謂如此? 況諸人分上, 各各自有正法眼藏, 每日起來, 是是非非, 分南分北, 種種施爲, 盡是正法眼藏之光影! 此眼開

363 Literally, Fahua 法華. Fahua was the name of the mountain where Baiyun Shouduan taught; see note 362 above.

364 This is an expression that can also be found in the recorded sayings of other Linji branch members. For instance, see *Yangqi Fanghui heshang yulu* (T 1994A.47.641a29 and 646c29–647a1), *Yuanwu yulu* (T 1997.47.731a28), *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.811c9). The expression, like many other Chan expressions, is probably a pun that paradoxically implies both the impossibility of approaching gongans with duality and the necessity of doing so.

時, 乾坤大地, 日月星辰, 森羅萬像, 只在面前, 不見有毫釐之相, 此眼未開時, 盡在諸人眼睛裏. 今日已開者, 不在此限, 有未開者, 山僧不惜手, 爲諸人開此正法眼藏看." 乃擧手竪兩指云, "看看! 若見得去, 事同一家, 若也未然, 山僧不免重說偈言. 諸人法眼藏, 千聖莫能當. 爲君通一線, 光輝滿大唐. 須彌走入海, 六月降嚴霜. 法華雖恁道, 無句得商量. 大衆! 旣滿口道了, 爲什麽却無句得商量?" 乃喝云, "分身兩處看."

[Explanation]

He again raised this story: *Everything will remain inside the globes of your eyes*: this means the treasury of the eye of the true Dharma is not limited to Śākyamuni and Kāśyapa. Each and everyone's endowment is originally equipped with it.

Raised his hands and set two fingers up straight: the treasury of the eye of the true Dharma and the vast array of phenomena rest between two fingers of one hand. And therefore it is said, "we are serving the same house."

Everyone's treasury of the eye of the Dharma … are no match for it: this means that it is thick and dense but hard to see.

I'll throw you a line … the great Tang empire: this means it is noticeably manifest everywhere.

Mt. Sumeru runs into the ocean: Sumeru's form has been so exhausted even the name is lost. The ocean here is the ocean of life and death. Nirvana itself is life and death.

The sixth month etcetera: the sixth month means burning hot but if harsh frost falls then the cold is showing its might. Life and death are themselves are nirvana. In reality they are all unborn.

Although I … calculations: this means he preaches all day but nothing has ever been preached.

As for shouting and then saying *try to split yourself and stand in two places*: this means that whether spoken or not spoken everything is but a shout. The setting up of his two fingers above and this splitting oneself and standing in two places are not equivalent in their depth. The meaning of Haihui's added comment above dismisses not only "The World Honored One picked up a

flower and Kāśyapa smiled faintly" but also "The World Honored One bade Kāśyapa to share his seat" as well.[365] It points to that passage through which one can go beyond. What he showed the assembly was that when the two met face-to-face on these two occasions there was nothing that was not a single shout.

> 又擧: 盡在諸人眼睛裏者, 若是正法眼藏, 非局釋迦迦葉, 人人分上本自具足也. 擧手竪兩指者, 正法眼藏, 森羅萬象, 一手之兩指也. 故云, '事同一家' 也. 諸人法眼藏, 至能當者, 密密難見也. 爲君至大唐者, 堂堂成現也. 須彌走入海者, 須彌相盡名亡, 海則生死海, 則涅槃卽生死也. 六月云云者, 六月鬧熱義, 降嚴霜則寒威威地. 生死卽涅槃, 其實皆無生也. 法花至商量者, 終日說末曾說也. 喝云分身兩處看者, 道不道, 皆是一喝也. 前竪兩指, 此兩處分身, 深淺不同也. 前之拈義, 非但拈花微笑, 分坐令坐, 亦不許, 指向上一竅也. 則此示衆, 二處相見, 無非一喝也.

Kumu Facheng[366] ascended the hall, raised this story, and said, "All you Chan worthies, speak! Was there or was there not something that was entrusted? If you say there was something that was entrusted, I'd say everyone is equipped with the wondrous mind of nirvana. Why again turn to the gold-faced old man for something new? If there isn't something to transmit, I'd say how could the transmission from one patriarch to the next

365 For picking up the flower and sharing his seat, see the anecdotal account in the *Liandeng huiyao* 聯燈會要 (XZJ 136.440b18–441a7). Although they appear together in this anecdote, the story of the Buddha sharing his seat with Kāśyapa developed separately; for instance, see *Da zhidu lun* (T 1509.25.354c16–17), *Ayuwang zhuan* (T 2042.50.104b20–21), and *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* (XZJ 135.611a4–5).

366 Kumu Facheng 枯木法成 (1091–1128) is a dharma heir of Furong Daokai 芙蓉道楷 (1042–1118). He assumed his first abbacy on Mt. Xiang 香山 in Henan province in 1107. He was invited by the emperor to serve as the abbot of Jingyin Chan Cloister 淨因禪院 in 1112. He also became the abbot of Miyin Monastery 密印寺 on Mt. Wei 潙山 and Guanghui Monastery 広慧寺 on Mt. Daolin 道林山 in Hunan province, Baolin Monastery 寶林寺 on Mt. Nanhua 南華山 in Guangdong province, and Puji Monastery 普濟寺 on Mt. Jiao 焦山 in Jiangsu province.

and the continuation of one lamp to the next have been in vain? Today I've spread out on my stand merchandise that hasn't sold for ages. Is there no one in the assembly willing to accept them?" After a while he said, "Who says Bian He's jade can't be appraised.[367] I say the black dragon's pearl shines everywhere."[368]

枯木成, 上堂, 擧此話云, "諸禪德, 且道! 有分付無分付? 若言有分付去, 涅槃妙心, 人人具足, 又何假黄面老子, 特地新條! 若言無分付, 二千餘年, 祖祖相傳, 燈燈相續, 豈可徒然! 山僧, 今日, 將多年滯貨, 攤向人前. 衆中莫有承當得底麼?" 良久云, "誰言卞璧無人鑑? 我道驪珠到處晶."

[Explanation]

Kumu: He directly pointed to treasury of the eye of the true Dharma above everyone's endowment.

枯木: 直指諸人分上正法眼藏也.

Caoxi Ming[369] ascended the hall and said, "The World Honored One raised a flower and Kāśyapa smiled faintly. The treasury of the eye of the true Dharma and the wondrous mind of *nirvāṇa* have been entrusted with both hands therein. Even to this very moment those under Heaven who one after another rush to the south and run to the north to search for *Chan*

367 Bian He 卞合 stumbled upon a large stone containing jade. When he presented the jade to the king of Chu the king punished him for presenting fake jade and had his left foot amputated. Later, Bian He presented the jade to the next king when he assumed the throne, but the jade was again judged to be a fake and as a result he lost his right foot. But when the king heard that Bian He wept blood, he had the jade reappraised and finally realized that the jade was a rare treasure. For this story, see Burton Watson, *Han Fei Tzu: Basic Writings* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1964), pp. 80–83.

368 The *lilong* 驪龍 or black dragon is a mythical beast who carried under his chin a great pearl. See Burton Watson, T*he Complete Works of Chuang Tzu*, p. 360.

369 The identity of Caoxi Ming is unclear.

禪 and look for *Dao* 道 are as numerous as the sands in the Ganges river, but they will mutually resonate with neither. When would this possibly be accomplished? I always teach them to just rest and relax and make this truth their own. These words will also bury them (in vain hopes)."

曹溪明, 上堂云, "世尊拈花, 迦葉微笑, 正法眼藏, 涅槃妙心, 於是乎兩手分付. 直至如今, 天下紛紛, 犇南走北, 尋禪覓道, 數如恒沙, 轉不相應, 有何了日! 山僧, 尋常只敎他, '休去歇去, 直下承當去.' 伊麽說話, 也是埋沒他了也."

[Explanation]

Caoxi's intensions: He feared that everyone would misunderstand the picking up of the flower and the faint smile as the original intent of the World Honored One and Kāśyapa. What, then, was the original intent of the World Honored One and Kāśyapa?

曹溪意, 恐諸人錯會, 拈花微笑, 世尊迦葉本意也. 則世尊迦葉本意, 作麽生?

Foyan Qingyuan[370] ascended the hall and said, "The World Honored One picked up a flower and Kāśyapa smiled faintly. It's a perfect fit! A perfect fit! It is the essential point in itself! The essential point in itself! If the eyes keep moving or if they remain still, you're way off! Way off! To repay the debt of the former beings, don't just go round in circles. Why? The text cannot be punctuated.[371]

佛眼遠, 上堂云, "世尊拈花, 迦葉微笑, 親切親切, 省要省要, 眼目定動, 料料掉掉, 爲報先生. 莫打之遶! 何也? 文不加點."

370 Foyan Qingyuan 佛眼淸遠 (1067–1120), a native of Luoyang, is a dharma heir of Wuzu Fayan. He served as the abbot of Tianning wanshou Monastery, Longmen Monastery 龍門寺, and Baochan Monastery 褒禪寺 in Anhui province. Along with Fojian Huiqin 佛鑑慧懃 (1059–1117) and Yuanwu Keqin, he is known as one of Three Buddhas of East Mountain.

371 *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.500b4–6). This means the text or story is so perfect that not even a punctuation mark is allowed.

[Explanation]

Foyan: Perfect fit (親切): this means that (the story) perfectly hit home with me and that it balanced itself on impartial words.

The essential point in itself: this means that it is kept at a minimum and yet essentially wondrous. It is to point to its essence. A perfect fit and an even better fit. The essential point in itself and an even more essential point in itself. This fact does not transcend picking up a flower and smiling faintly. Therefore it is said, the text cannot be punctuated. If you hesitate further, you will not be able to avoid going round in circles.

佛眼: 親切者, 親親切切, 約中間言也. 省要者, 省略而要妙, 指其體也. 親切而又親切, 省要而又省要, 這箇消息, 不離拈花微笑處也. 故云, '文不加點.' 更若擬議, 未免打之遶.

Yuwang Jiechen added a comment, "What needs to be entrusted has already been entrusted, but what can be done about the fact that the head is heavy and the tail light? Why is this so? On Vulture Peak he (i.e., Kāśyapa) only knew how to doze off and in front of (Maitreya's) dragon-flower assembly he surreptitiously showed off his supernatural powers. He was able to knock down the flagpole,[372] but he wasn't all smiles. Pilgrim! Why don't you try to discern the eyes that I (Xianning) have prepared for you."

育王諶拈, "分付則分付了也, 爭奈頭重尾輕! 何故? 雞足峰前, 只知瞌睡; 龍華會上, 謾逞神通. 雖然倒却刹竿, 要且, 眉頭不展. 行脚人, 試向者裏, 辨顯寧爲人眼看."

Yuwang: *Head is heavy and tail light*: has already appeared above.

Doze off: this means to enter meditative absorption.

Supernatural powers: this means engaging in play.

Only knew how to … surreptitiously showed off: this all means he did not establish.

---

372 This denotes the end of a formal sermon, that is, the end of the transmission of the Dharma

Knocked down a flagpole: this means he did not establish transmission.

He wasn't all smiles: this means that although he did not establish transmission, he was not idle. The meaning of the aforementioned *head is heavy and tail light* has finally been determined succinctly here.

Why don't you try … the eyes that I (Xianning) have prepared for you: it may seem as if there are no eyes that he prepared for others and that is why it is necessary to actively tell them apart.

育王: 頭重尾經, 已出上. 瞌睡者, 入定也. 神通者, 遊戲也. 只知謾逞者, 皆不立也. 倒却刹竿者, 不立傳受也. 眉頭不展者, 雖然不立傳受, 亦未穩也. 前云頭重尾經之義, 至此方略辨也. 顯寧爲人眼看者, 似無爲人眼看也, 須辨取始得.

Case 33.

The World Honored One and the Confessional

世尊自恣

[Old Case]

The World Honored One, because it was the day of the confessional ceremony,[373] had Mañjuśrī spend the summer retreat at three places. Kāśyapa [according to one version, Upāli[374]] wished to expel him with the announcement mallet. As soon as he picked up the mallet he saw a hundred-trillion Mañjuśrīs. Kāśyapa used all his supernatural power, but the mallet could not be raised. The World Honored One then asked Kāśyapa, "Which Mañjuśrī will you expel?" Kāśyapa had no reply. [This is virtually identical to the other version.][375]

世尊因自恣日, 文殊三處過夏, 迦葉<一本, 優波離> 欲白椎擯出, 纔拈椎, 乃見百千萬億文殊. 迦葉盡其神力, 椎不能擧. 世尊遂問迦葉, "汝擬貶那箇文殊?" 迦葉無對.<有本大同小異.>

[Explanation of the gongan]

This is a passage from the *Baoqieyin duoluoni jing* 寶篋印多羅尼經.[376]

---

373 The day for confession (S. *pravāraṇa*) comes at the end or dismissal of the summer retreat.

374 One of the ten major disciples of the Buddha famous for strictly keeping the precepts.

375 Different versions can be found in the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.27c9–13); *Xu guzunsu yuyao* (XZJ 119.89b11–13); *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.439b13–15); *Wudeng huiyuan* (XZJ 138.4b7–10).

376 No corresponding passage is found in the *Baoqieyin duoluoni jing*, but a similar passage does appear

Confessional ceremony (自恣): this is to lay out one's sins oneself (自) and follow the judgment of others (恣). The *Shoujing* says, "One's sins are left to the judgment of others."[377]

Three places: one month was in the queen's palace, one month in the learning hall for boys, and one month in the whorehouse. They are, in other words, greed, hatred, and ignorance. Dwelling in these three places, he made sure that the five hundred women in the palace, five hundred boys in the learning hall, and the five hundred whores in their private quarters do not retrogress from *annuttarasamyaksambodhi* (unexcelled perfect enlightenment) and that they dwell in the unexcelled, perfect Way etcetera.

Spend the summer retreat at three places: this means that greed is itself the Way and that this is also true for hatred and ignorance. These three matters possess immeasurable Buddha dharmas. The whole world, in other words, is a golden world system.[378] The whole world is Mañjuśrī. When the three poisions of greed, hatred, and ignorance refer to truth and nature this is the realm of the great beings Mañjuśrī and Samantabhadra. Kāśyapa: this is not Mahākāśyapa. It is one of the three *Kāśyapas*.

According to one version, Upāli wished to expel him with the announcement mallet, but couldn't do it: the realm of a great being is not something that beings of the lesser vehicle can weigh and measure, so this is a question about the meaning of *Chan*.

Kāśyapa wished to expel him with the announcement mallet: Wansong (Xingxiu)[379] said, "I visualize the great assembly as the sea purifying itself through evaporation. Only Mañjuśrī has interrupted his summer retreat

---

in the *Dafangguang baoqie jing* 大方廣寶篋經 (T 462.14.474a20–b9).

377 It is unclear what the *Shoujing* refers to, but a similar passage appears in the *Yulanpen jing shu* 盂蘭盆經疏 (T 1792.39.510b22) by Guifeng Zongmi 圭峰宗密 (780–841).

378 The golden world system (S. Suvarṇaloka) is the buddha realm of Mañjuśrī; see the *Huayan jing* (T 278.9.418b19).

379 This is Wansong Xingxiu 萬松行秀 (1166–1246). He is a dharma heir of a certain Xueyan Man 雪巖滿 of Daming Monastery 大明寺 in Hebei province. In 1193 he was invited by the Jin Emperor

and threw the crowd into disarray. Kāśyapa was in charge of the rules and regulations of the Chan grove, so he couldn't just let it go."[380] Again he said, "Gautama should have been expelled with him at the same time and leave only Kāśyapa to watch the hall. In other words, this means also hit the Buddha and also hit the patriarchs. Stop telling lies in front of a perfected one."[381]

He thereupon saw a hundred-trillion etcetera: this means the Buddha is also at peace and the patriarchs are also at peace and that the inside of the bellies of the patch-robed monks are as vast as the sea. Therefore, it is not that the three places from the three places that Mañjuśrī spent his summer retreat has no meaning. They are the emperor's chariot in the imperial palace, the hustling and bustling main street, and the top of a lonely peak. In the realm of a great man, brightness and darkness complement each other.

Kāśyapa could not raise the mallet: Wansong said, "You may have planned to set the true style as tall as a wall, but you might as well hold up the Buddha and the patriarchs with expedients. Have you not seen someone say, 'The less you damage the flower the more honey will you acquire'?"[382] These words of Wansong implicate Kāśyapa and the story is split on two pegs. If we are to rely on the interpretation of Yuanwu and Tiantong,[383] then for this commentary we must take Kāśyapa's not swinging the mallet as a loss and lack of nerve.

Zhangzong 章宗 (r. 1188–1208) to offer a sermon in the capital. Afterwards, he served as abbot of Qiyin Monastery 棲隱寺 on Mt. Yang 仰山 in Jiangxi province and Baoen Monastery 報恩寺 in Zhejiang province. In 1230 he became the abbot of Tianning Wanshou Monastery in Beijing.

380 See *Wansong laoren pingchang Tiantong Jue heshang niangu qingyi lu* 萬松老人評唱天童覺和尚拈古請益錄 (hereafter *Qingyi lu:* XZJ 117.813b2–3). Here, Chan grove (*conglin* 叢林) refers to large Chan monasteries, but the term probably also retained its older meaning of *samgha*.

381 *Qingyi lu* (XZJ 117.813b17–18).

382 *Qingyi lu* (XZJ 117.813b17–814a1).

383 Tiantong refers to Hongzhi Zhengjue. Hongzhi is a dharma heir of Danxia Zichun 丹霞子淳 (1064–1117). In 1121, Hongzhi became Danxia's chief seat and later that same year became the abbotof Puzhao Monastery 普照寺 in Anhui province. In 1127, he assumed the abbacy of Taiping

Mu'ŭija's (Jin'gak Hyesim) verse reads,

The Wonderful and Auspicious One (i.e., Mañjuśrī) who spent the summer retreat in three places,
Made the *kṣetras* as numerous as motes of dust and the gold world system completely manifest,
The elder of Vulture Peak (i.e., Kāśyapa) who has a head but lacks a tail,
Needlessly stirs up a round of the Chan house's ridicule.
If you examine this verse you can see why Kāśyapa could not raise the mallet.

寶篋印多羅尼經文. 自恣者, 自陳己過, 恣任僧擧. 手鏡云, '自己之過, 恣他所擧也.' 三處者, 一月王后宮, 一月童子學堂, 一月婬女舍坊, 卽貪瞋癡也. 三處居住, 令宮中五百女人, 學堂五百童子, 舍坊五百婬女, 不退阿耨菩提, 住於無上正道云云. 三處過夏者, 貪欲卽是道, 恚癡亦復然. 如是三事中, 具無量佛法, 則偏界是金色世界, 遍界是文殊師利. 貪瞋癡三毒, 稱眞稱性, 文殊普賢大人境界也. 迦葉, 非摩訶迦葉, 三迦葉中之一也. 一本云, 優婆離, 欲白椎擯出而不得者, 大人境界, 非小乘人而能測量, 禪義何也. 迦葉欲白椎擯出者, 萬松云, "吾觀大衆, 如海澄清, 唯文殊破夏破羣. 迦葉旣掌叢林規矩, 又不可放過." 又云, "和瞿曇, 一時擯出, 獨留迦葉看堂." 則佛也打, 祖也打, 眞人面前, 休說假也. 乃見百千萬云云者, 佛也安, 祖也安, 衲僧肚裏如海寬. 然則三處過夏地, 三處義不無. 皇都帝輦, 紫陌紅塵, 高岑頂上也. 此是大人境界明暗相叅. 迦葉椎不擧者, 萬松云, "旣圖壁立眞風, 不妨權留佛祖. 不見道, '花又不損, 蜜又得成.' 萬松伊麽道, 累他迦葉, 話作兩橛. 若據圓悟天童義, 則以迦葉不下此椎, 爲落節, 爲無膽, 此論始得. 無衣子頌云, "三處安居妙吉祥! 刹塵金色界全彰. 有頭無尾雞峰老! 空惹禪家笑一場." 看此頌則知迦葉椎不擧.

Monastery 太平寺 in the same province. In 1129, he developed a small temple on Mt. Tiantong in Zhejiang province into a grand monastery. Hongzhi played an important role in the Caodong revival of the twelfth century; for more on this topic, see Morten Schlütter, *How Zen Became Zen: The Dispute Over Enlightenment and the Formation of Chan Buddhism in Song-Dynasty China* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press 2008).

Yuanwu Keqin's verse

A great elephant does not travel on a hare's path,[384]
How could the sparrow understand the swan?
Acting in accordance with the command is itself a fully formed style,
Hitting the target is just like snatching the approaching arrowhead with your teeth,
The whole world is Mañjuśrī,
The whole world is Kāśyapa,
They treat each other with solemn dignity,
Where would you exact punishment by raising the mallet?
What a good catch!
The golden ascetic already suffered a loss.[385]

> 圜悟勤頌, "大象不遊兎徑, 鷰雀安知鴻鵠? 據令宛若成風, 破的渾如囓鏃. 徧界是文殊, 徧界是迦葉. 相對各儼然, 舉椎何處罰? 好一劄! 金色頭陁曾落節."

[Explanation]

Yuanwu: The great elephant refers to the realm of the great being Mañjuśrī. Because this is not something that Kāśyapa can gauge, hence he *does not travel on a hare's path. Hare's path*: this refers to Kāśyapa.

Swan: this refers to Kāśyapa raising the true command high. This is not something that Mañjuśrī can reach. Therefore he says, *How could the sparrow understand?*

Sparrow: this refers to Mañjuśrī.

Acting in accordance with the command etcetera: this refers to Kāśyapa.

Hitting the target etcetera: this refers to Mañjuśrī. Accordingly, the whole

---

384 For this expression, see the *Zhengdao ge* (T 2014.48.396c27).

385 The golden ascetic refers to Kāśyapa who in one of his past lives was rewarded with a golden body for repairing a buddha's stūpa; see the *Fozu tongji* (T 2035.49.169b19–24).

world is Mañjuśrī and there is no Kāśyapa outside of Mañjuśrī. The whole world is Kāśyapa and there is no Mañjuśrī outside of Kāśyapa.

圜悟: 大象, 言文殊大人境界, 非迦葉所能測量故, 不遊兎徑. 兎徑迦葉也. 鴻鵠, 言迦葉高提正令, 非文殊所可弋邈, 故言燕雀安知. 燕雀文殊也. 據令云云者, 謂迦葉也;破的云云者, 謂文殊也. 然則遍界是文殊, 文殊外無迦葉;遍界是迦葉, 迦葉外無文殊也.

Xuedou Faning's[386] verse

At that time Kāśyapa was not yet a great man,
He put mallet down and couldn't do anything about the ten-thousand Mañjuśrīs,
He had hoped to expel them all,
Speak! Is there someone who can accomplish this?

雪竇寧頌, "迦葉當時未丈夫, 下椎不奈萬文殊. 要須祖佛都盧遣, 且道吾門着得無?"

Xinwen Tanfen's[387] verse[388]

It is not difficult to manifest (oneself) in each and all of the lands as numerous as motes of dust,
How could Upāli be so deceived by him?

386 Little is known about Xuedou Faning 雪竇法寧 (d.u.) who is a dharma heir of Baoning Ziying 保寧子英 (d.u.).

387 Wannian 萬年 or Xinwen Tanfen 心聞曇賁 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Changling Shouzhuo's disciple, Jiechen 無示介諶 (1080–1148). Xinwen served as the abbot of Ruiyan Monastery 瑞巖寺, Jiangxin Monastery 江心寺, and Wannian Monastery 萬年寺 in Zhejiang province.

388 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.29b11–12).

If the seduction had been discussed in detail at the time,
They would have tried not to take Gautama as the Buddha.

心聞賁頌, "刹刹塵塵現不難, 波離何苦被渠謾? 當時若論收姦細, 莫把瞿曇做佛看."

Layman Yuezhai's verse

Mañjuśrī is manifest everywhere in a hundred-thousand bodies,
In the end there was no one who could recognize the true (Mañjuśrī),
Thankfully Fenyang[389] has pointed it out,
"The chrysanthemum is fresh on the ninth day of the ninth month."[390]

悅齋居土頌, "文殊徧現百千身, 畢竟無人識得眞. 多謝汾陽爲指出, 重陽九日菊花新."

Haiyin Chaoxin added a comment, "If you want to know the path to the dried up sea, you have to be someone who has already been there."[391]

海印信拈, "欲知旱海路, 須是去來人."

[Explanation]
Haiyin: This means the realm of Mañjuśrī and Kāśyapa can only be known by those who have attained realization.

海印義, 文殊迦葉境界, 證者方知.

---

389 Fenyang Shanzhao 汾陽善昭 (947–1024) was a dharma heir of Shoushan Shengnian. He served as the abbot of Taizi Cloister 太子院 in Fenyang, Shanxi province.

390 This is a quote from the *Fenyang Wude chanshi yulu* 汾陽無德禪師語錄 (T 1992.47.597b8). For the festival of the Double Ninth and the chrysanthemum, see note 347.

391 This comment also appears in the *Cishou Huaishen chanshi yulu* 慈受懷深禪師廣錄 (XZJ 126.554b4).

Again he ascended the hall, raised this story, and said, "Will the great assembly please try to provide a turning word? If you can say it, then you will be a leader not only of those of Kāśyapa's time but later beings as well. *Can* (Investigate)!"

又上堂, 擧此話云, "請大衆, 於此下一轉語看! 若也道得, 非唯迦葉當時, 亦作後人領袖." 參!

[Explanation]

Again, ascending the hall: *Will the great assembly please … turning word*: a person who understands what to say looks for a way to be able to say it.

又上堂, 請大衆至轉語者, 解道得地人, 索得作麼生道得.

Kumu Facheng ascended the hall, raised this story, and said, "Everyone! Brother Kāśyapa knew only how to ride the tiger's head and not how to collect its tail.[392] At that time had he thoroughly carried out the Law, what hundred-trillion Mañjuśrīs would there have been to speak of? Even the gold-faced old man would have had nowhere to place his feet. If someone were to ask me (lit. Xiangshan) at the present moment, 'Where will you spend this summer retreat,' I would tell him, 'One month in the emperor's chariot in the imperial capital, one month perched over the hustling and bustling mainstreet, and yet another month on top of a lonely peak.' Is there anyone at the present moment who can wash away the golden ascetic's (Kāśyapa's) shame? Why don't you come out and meet me face-to-face?" After a while he said, "I almost extended my wisdom while locked up in prison."[393]

---

392 Riding the tiger is a common Chan expression. Riding the tiger is a metaphor for the student's ability to rise up to the challenge and collecting its tail is a metaphor for the student's ability to "go beyond" (*xiangshang*). The student's inability to "collect the tiger's tail" is thus a metaphor for his inability to go beyond.

393 Another common Chan expression; for instance, see *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.682c4),

枯木成, 上堂, 擧此話云, "諸仁者, 迦葉師兄, 只解騎虎頭, 不解收虎尾. 當時盡法而行, 說什麽百千文殊? 和者黄面老漢, 也無措足之地. 如今或有人問香山, '仁者, 今夏安居何處?' 香山對他道, '一月在皇都帝輦, 一月登紫陌紅塵, 一月在孤峯頂上.' 如今還有爲金色頭陀, 雪屈出者麽? 何不出來, 與香山相見?" 良久云, "洎合停囚長智."

[Explanation]

Kumu: Brother Kāśyapa knew only how … collect its tail: because he didn't execute the command.

If someone were to ask me … on top of a lonely peak: this is, within the gate of expedients, the expedient for realization.

Is there anyone … wash away the shame: this is this a view that supports the golden ascetic's position? It is a view that supports the position that one must establish oneself firmly.

Extended my wisdom while locked up in prison: at the time of Emperor Guangwu[394] of the Latter Han, Du Du, style Jiya, committed a crime and was locked up in prison.[395] There he met the death of the minister of war Wu Han 吳漢. Emperor Guangwu decreed that all the scholars prepare an eulogy. The text that Du prepared in prison was the best. The emperor considered it exceptional, bestowed honors upon him, and released him from his sentence. ("Extending my wisdom while locked up in prison") refers the existence of a path to free oneself.

枯木: 迦葉師兄, 至收虎尾者, 令不行故也. 或有人問香山, 至孤峯頂上者, 化門證化也. 還有, 至雪屈者麽者, 扶見金色頭陁立處耶? 自固立處也. 洎合停囚長智

Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu (T 1998A.47.828a18 and 846b9), *Guzunsu yulu* (XZ J118.746b16–17) etc.

394 The text, which gives Emperor Yuan 元 (r. 49–33 B.C.E.) for Emperor Guangwu 光武 (r. 25–57 C.E.), is in error here.

395 This story can be found in the biography of Du Du 杜篤 (d. 78) in the *Hou Han shu* (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 110, 1.

者, 後漢元帝時, 杜篤, 字季雉,[396] 有罪囚獄, 會司馬吳漢夢.[397] 高祖帝,[398] 詔諸儒謀[399] 之, 篤獄中文辭最高. 帝異之, 優賞贖刑. 言自有出身之路也.

Tiantong Zhengjue added a comment,[400] "The golden ascetic has the mind but not the nerve. At that time had he thoroughly carried out the Law, not to mention the hundred-trillion Mañjuśrīs but even the gold-faced Gautama should have been expelled (from the saṃgha). If this is the case, not only did he set the true style as tall as a wall but also caused later beings to know that the patch-robed monks under our Chan gate can't attach themselves to idle buddhas and patriarchs."

天童覺拈, "金色頭陁, 有心無膽. 當時盡令而行, 莫道百千萬億文殊, 秖者黃面瞿曇, 也與擯出. 若能如是, 不唯壁立眞風, 亦令後人知, 我衲僧門下着你閑佛祖不得."

[Explanation]
Tiantong: See the text.

天童: 文見.

Changlu Zongze raised this story, picked up his staff, and said, "The ten directions in the three times are all on top of this staff. Everywhere is Mañjuśrī and everywhere is a three-month retreat. Although Mahākāśyapa's catching and releasing was quite a show, Mañjuśrī was set free. If it were up

396 Following the *Hou Han shu*, here I substitute *ya* 雅 for *zhi* 雉.

397 Following the *Hou Han shu*, here I substitute *hong* 薨 for *meng* 夢.

398 Following the *Hou Han shu*, here I substitute Guangwu for Gaozu.

399 Following the *Hou Han shu*, here I substitute *lei* 誄 for *mou* 謀.

400 See the *Qingyi lu* (XZJ 117.813a8–12).

to me (Xinruo) it would not be so. It must have been two guilty verdicts on one sheet of paper." He struck the meditation bench.

長盧賾, 擧此話, 乃拈起柱杖云,"如今十方三世, 摠在拄杖頭上. 一切處, 文殊師利;一切處, 三月安居! 大迦葉, 雖然縱奪可觀, 放過文殊師利. 若是新羅卽不然, 直須一狀領過." 擊禪床.

[Explanation]

Changlu: *Picked up his staff etcetera*: the realm of Kāśyapa, which covers everything in the ten directions and the three times, lies here. This is precisely the realm of Mañjuśrī. There is no other realm. Therefore, everywhere is Mañjuśrī and *everywhere is a three-month retreat* is not without fault and Mahākāśyapa is also not without fault. Therefore, he said, *guilty verdicts on one sheet of paper*. Beyond this is there yet a higher critical move? The state of picking up the staff works like this.

長蘆:拈起柱杖云云者, 迦葉境界, 盡十方三世, 在這裏, 則文殊境界, 更無第二也. 然則, '一切處, 文殊師利;一切處, 三月安居.' 未得無過, 大迦葉, 亦未得無過. 故云, 一狀領過也. 此外謂更高一着耶? 拈柱杖處如是.

Yuanwu Keqin added a comment,[401] "If the bell is not struck it will not reverberate and if it is not hit it will not resound. Kāśyapa has already cut off the strategic point and Mañjuśrī thereupon chopped off the ten directions. A good Buddhist ceremony was held at the time. But what a pity! A critical move has been sacrificed. The elder Śākyamuni, who had been waiting, said, 'Which Mañjuśrī do you wish to expel?' Strike with the mallet and see how he brings the matter to a conclusion."

圜悟勤拈"鍾不擊不響, 鼓不打不鳴. 迦葉旣把斷要津, 文殊乃十方坐[402] 斷. 當

---

401 For this comment, see also *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.792a16–20).

402 I substitute *cuo* 挫 for *zuo* 坐.

時好一場佛事, 可惜放過一着. 待釋迦老子道, '欲擯那箇文殊?' 便與擊一槌, 看他作麼生合殺."

[Explanation]

Yuanwu: *If the bell is not struck etcetera*: Mañjuśrī and Kāśyapa beat the drum and played the flute.

Kāśyapa … chopped off the ten directions: is a first-rate iron mallet without a hole for the handle.[403] What can be done about the golden ascetic's loss of profit? Therefore he said, *But what a pity! A critical move has been sacrificed*.

圓悟: 鍾不擊云云者, 文殊迦葉打鼓弄云云也. 迦葉至坐斷者, 一等無孔鐵槌也. 爭奈金色頭陁落節, 故云, 可惜放過.

Again, during an informal sermon he said, "The bodhisattva Mañjuśrī spent the summer in three places. One month in the palace of demons, one month at the home of a householder, and another month in the whorehouse. Having spent the summer in three places, he also entered the World Honored One's assembly for the dismissal of the summer retreat. This is extremely unfair. Therefore Kāśyapa wished to expel Mañjuśrī with the announcement mallet. As soon as he raised this thought, he saw in the assembly immeasurable Śākyamunis, immeasurable Mañjuśrīs, immeasurable Kāśyapas, and immeasurable mallets. When Kāśyapa saw this he was dumbstruck. Why? People beyond measure have views without measure and function without measure. Although the golden ascetic reached this state, he couldn't close his hands or open them. Anyway, when it's like this, is this within great perfect enlightenment or is it outside of great perfect enlightenment? It has to be a virtuoso adept at everything and only then can one attest to it. Why? This is the realm of the great beings Mañjuśrī and Samantabhadra. If you are able to investigate the realm of Mañjuśrī

[403] This is a metaphor for a teaching or critical saying (i.e., iron mallet) that is literally difficult to grasp; see ZGD, p. 1202; and also *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.448a22–23).

and Samantabhadra, then the boundless ocean of fragrant water[404] will be exhausted; the *buddhakṣetras* as immeasurable and innumerable as tiny motes of dust will all become a place for summer retreat; and the boundless body will manifest. Everywhere you walk, stand, sit, or lie down you will be without obstruction and without the need to intervene. In this very moment a sympathetic friend would understand whatever is raised. Although I (Tianning) have spent ninety days in summer retreat with the great assembly, does everyone here ultimately understand? If everyone here penetrates from top to bottom, then this is precisely the realm of Mañjuśrī and Samantabhadra. If you don't penetrate from top to bottom, then this is precisely the realm of Kāśyapa. If you transcend Mañjuśrī and Kāśyapa and reap in the resulting single phrase, what does it say? Do you get it? The ninety-day work has now been fulfilled.[405] Open your calico sacks wide and be carefree."[406]

又小參云,"文殊菩薩, 一夏三處度夏. 一月在魔宮, 一月在長者家, 一月在婬坊. 旣三處度夏, 却入世尊會中解制, 極爲不平. 所以, 迦葉欲白槌擯出文殊. 纔擧此念, 見會中有無量釋迦, 無量文殊, 無量迦葉, 無量犍槌. 迦葉旣見伊麼, 直得目瞪口呿. 何故? 過量人, 有過量見, 有過量用. 雖金色頭陁, 到者裏, 縮手不得, 展手不去. 只如伊麼時, 是大圓覺裏耶? 大圓覺外耶? 須是通方作者, 始能證明. 何故? 此是文殊普賢大人境界. 若參得文殊普賢境界, 則盡無邊香水, 無量無數微塵佛刹, 悉爲安居處, 乃至現無邊身, 處處行住坐臥, 亦不相妨, 亦不犯手. 正當伊麼時, 若是知音者, 擧起便知. 所以天寧, 雖與大衆, 九十日安居, 畢竟諸人還知麼? 諸人, 若透頂透底去, 卽是文殊普賢境界; 若不透頂透底去, 卽是迦葉境界. 離却文殊迦葉, 收因結果一句, 作麼生道? 還委悉麼? 九十日功今已滿, 豁開布袋各優遊."

404 According to traditional Buddhist cosmology, the ocean of fragrant water, as the name implies, refers to the great fragrant ocean that surrounds Mt. Sumeru.

405 The ninety-day work refers to the summer retreat.

406 See also *Yuanwu foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.762c9–10). Opening the calico sack seems to refer to the end of pilgrimage and beginning of one's career as a teacher; see *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.200b18–201a1).

[Explanation]

Again, the informal sermon: This is about *the realm of Mañjuśrī*.

Transcend Mañjuśrī and Kāśyapa etcetera: because previously he made it seem as if there is superiority and inferiority, transcending superiority and inferiority is the cause and the absence of superiority and inferiority is the fruit.

The ninety-day work etcetera: acting as before is the realm of Mañjuśrī and Samantabhadra.

又小參, 現文殊大人境界也. 離却文殊迦葉云云者, 前云文殊迦葉, 似有優劣故. 離却優劣是因, 無優劣是果也. 九十日功云云者, 依舊是文殊普賢境界也.

Foyan Qingyuan, during an informal sermon for the dismissal of the retreat, raised this story and said,[407] "Great assembly! What a pity! At that time, they let him off and willingly indulged in an inferior dharma. Had he swung the mallet, the elder Śākyamuni, not to mention Mañjuśrī, would have been unable to place to shelter himself. Everyone! Do you know the mallet's ultimate point of resolution (落處)? If you do, then all the living beings on this great earth, the four modes of birth, and the six paths[408] will crumble like tiles and melt like ice and not even one iota of it will be seen. If a patch-robed monk were to come out and say, 'Will the venerable please put his hand to it,' then I would tell him, 'Movement is not as good as stillness—I'll let you take back a critical move.'[409] Why? 'Evening clouds descend and fly along together with a lonely wild duck; autumn's waters coalesce in a single

407 For this sermon, see also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.558b2–7).

408 The four modes of birth for sentient beings in the sixth paths are (1) birth from the womb (i.e., viviparous birth), (2) birth from an egg (i.e., oviparous birth), (3) birth from water (e.g. fish), and (4) birth by metamorphosis as in the case of insects and their chrysalis or gods and hell beings; see *Zengyi ahan jing* (T 125.2.632a8–18), The six paths of rebirth in the desire realm are (1) gods, (2) asuras, (3) humans, (4) animals, (5) hungry ghosts, and (6) hell beings.

409 Letting the opponent take back a critical move is an expression borrowed from the traditional Chinese game *weiqi* 圍棋. This allows the oppoent to avoid what would otherwise be certain death.

shade with the outstretched heavens.'"[410]

佛眼遠, 解夏小叅, 擧此話云, "大衆! 當時可惜放過, 甘爲樂小法者. 若下得者一椎, 莫道文殊, 假使釋迦老子, 亦無容身之處. 諸人, 還知者一椎落處麼? 若知得, 盡大地一切衆生, 四生六道, 一時瓦解氷消, 無絲毫可見. 或有箇衲僧出來道, '請和尚試下手看.' 即向他道, '動不如靜, 放過一着.' 何故? 落霞與孤鶩齊飛, 秋水共長天一色."

[Explanation]

Foyan's minor sermon: Not even one iota of it will be seen: this means that the mallet must be swung and command executed thoroughly.

Movement is not as good as stillness: swinging the mallet is also movement and is not as good as letting him take back a critical move. Therefore, Mañjuśrī and Kāśyapa are like evening clouds descend etcetera.

佛眼小叅: 無絲毫可見者, 下一椎令盡行, 始得. 動不如靜者, 下這一椎, 亦是動也, 不如放過一着也. 然則文殊與迦葉, 是落霞與云云也.

Yunmen Zonggao, at the beginning of the summer retreat, ascended the hall, and said,[411] "Mañjuśrī spent his summer retreat in three places and master Baozhi[412] is not a laidback reverend. Kāśyapa wished to execute the true command, but couldn't avoid seeing ghosts in front of his very eyes.

410 The ending quote is from Wang Bo's 王勃 (649–676) *Teng'wang-ge xu* 滕王閣序 (in *Quan Tang wen* 全唐文 181.19a.). I borrow the translation in Victor H. Mair ed., *The Shorter Columbia Anthology of Chinese Literature* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2000), p. 336.

411 For this sermon, see also the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.828c24–26).

412 For Jinling Baozhi's 金陵寶(保)誌 (d. 514) biography, see *Gaoseng zhuan* (T 2059.50.394a15–395b5). The Buddhist thaumaturge Baozhi was famous for being an idiosyncratic and carefree individual who grew his hair long and ate whenever he wanted. He also carried a staff and on top of this staff he hung a pair of scissors, a mirror, and a strip of silk. For an English translation of Baozhi's biography, see Alan J. Berkowitz, "Account of the Buddhist Thaumaturge Baozhi," in *Buddhism in Practice* edited by Donald S. Lopez Jr. (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1995) , pp. 578–585.

Speak! My (Jingshan) disciples! What do you think of the great matter of the present moment? After you descend from the seat, everyone touch-bows[413] three times."

雲門杲, 結夏, 上堂云, "文殊, 三處安居;誌公, 不是閑和尚; 迦葉, 欲行正令, 未免眼前見鬼. 且道! 徑山門下今日事, 作麽生? 下座後, 大家觸禮三拜." 行令

[Explanation]

Yunmen: *Mañjuśrī … seeing ghosts*: none of them let him off.

Master Baozhi is not a laidback reverend: what this is trying to say is that if Baozhi was not a laidback reverend then why did he recklessly run around?

Everyone touch-bows three times: what fault do Mañjuśrī and Kāśyapa have? They enter the forest and yet the grass does not move; they enter water and yet do not create ripples.

雲門: 文殊三處至見鬼者, 皆不放過也. 誌公不是閑和上者, 不是閑和上, 爲什麽亂走之義也. 大家觸禮三拜者, 文殊迦葉, 有什麽過? 入林不動草, 入水不揚波也.

Mi'an Xianjie[414] raised this story and then in continuation raised a later venerable worthy's added comment, "He should have given a good swing of the mallet but he let him go and delightfully became a man of the lesser vehicle."[415] The master said, "These words of the venerable worthies are like a

---

413 A touch-bow (Ch. *chuli* 觸禮) is performed by folding the seating mat and touching it with one's forehead during a bow, hence the name touch-bow; see ZGD, p. 766.

414 Mi'an Xianjie 密庵咸傑 (1118–1186) is a dharma heir of Ying'an Tanhua 應菴曇華 (1103–1163). He served as abbot of Qianming Chan Cloister 乾明禪院 on Mt. Wuju 烏巨山 in Zhejiang province and Taiping xingguo Monastery on Mt. Jiang (present day Nanjing). He also served at Xiangfu Monastery 祥符寺 and Huazang Monastery 華藏寺 in Jiangxi province. He later served as the abbot of major monastic centers Nengren Monastery 能仁寺 on Mt. Jing 徑山, Lingyin Monastery 靈隐寺, and Tiantong Monastery 天童寺, which were all located near present-day Hangzhou.

415 It is unclear whose added comment this is. It may be a summary of the comments above.

blind man touching an elephant. I (Chief Seat Jie) began the summer retreat at Mt. Jiang this summer,[416] quit midway at Mt. Baochan, and ended it at Huazang.[417] Speak! Mañjuśrī and I, are we the same or not? If someone says we're the same, I'll admit that he is equipped with a pair of eyes, but if he says we're different, I'll still admit that he is equipped with a pair of eyes. If suddenly someone who does not accept this were to step forward and say, 'The abbot is also very confused,' I would just say to him, 'There is awakening in confusion.' Quickly, hear me now!

He moved between three places and tried to determine right and wrong,[418]

His steadfast mind did not see even a hair's breadth of change,[419]

Who can I rely on to understand this gibberish?

Even a man with an iron forehead and copper head would knit his brows."[420]

密庵傑, 擧此話, 連擧後來尊宿拈, '好一槌, 又却放過, 甘作小乘人.' 師云, "尊宿伊麽, 也是盲人摸象. 傑上座, 今夏蔣山結夏, 褒禪破夏, 華藏終夏. 且道! 與文殊, 是同是別? 若道是同, 許他具一隻眼; 若道是別, 也許他具一隻眼. 忽有箇不受人瞞底出來道, '長老也好漚滴.' 只向他道, '漚滴中有箇分曉處.' 急須聽取! 三處移場定是非, 頑心全不改毫釐. 胡言漢語憑誰會? 鐵額銅頭也皺眉."

416 Mi'an served as the chief seat for his teacher Ying'an on Mt. Jiang in Sichuan; see note 414 above.

417 Mt. Baochan 褒禪山 is an old name of Mt. Hua 華山 in Anhui Province. Huazang 華藏 may be a pun here, referring to both a temple (perhaps Huazang Monastery in Jiangxi province where Mi'an served as abbot) and the Lotus Matrix (Ch. Lianhuazang 蓮花藏) realm of Vairocana.

418 Cf. *Fayan chanshi yulu* (T 1995.47.657b6).

419 Cf. *Fayan chanshi yulu* (T 1995.47.657b6).

420 See *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.759a2). Someone with an iron forehead and copper head seems to refer to an ignoramous and stands in stark contrast to the buddhas and patriarchs. Not surprisingly, in Chan, the person with an iron forehead and copper head—someone, for instance, who can't tell right from wrong—is ironically said to be superior to the buddhas and patriarchs; see *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.806a5–6). For the entire verse, see *Mi'an heshang yulu* (T 1999.47.963b5–6); and also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.29b15–16).

[Explanation]

Mi'an: *I began the summer retreat at Mt. Jiang this summer … ended it at Huazang*: this is like the statement *the first month in the imperial capital and one month in the hustling and bustling main street* above. Therefore, as for *Mañjuśrī and I, are we the same or not*, you can say we are the same and also say we are different.

He moved between three places etcetera: because he moved between three places there is right and wrong.

His steadfast mind etcetera: this means he is thoroughly steadfast and foolish.

Gibberish etcetera: this means he is running on the land of barbarians and on the land of the Han. Barbarians and the Han are also realization and salvation.

Iron forehead etcetera: this means you can have an iron forehead and copper head, but nothing can be done.

密菴: 今夏蔣山, 至華藏終夏者, 上一月皇都, 一月紫陌之義也. 然則與文殊, 同耶別耶? 同亦得, 別亦得也. 三處移場云云者, 三處移傳故, 有是非也. 頑心云云者, 徹底頑愚也. 胡言云云者, 指胡地上行, 漢地上走. 胡漢亦證化也. 鐵額云云者, 雖是鐵額銅頭, 奈何不得也.

Case 44.

The Nirvana Sūtra and the Drum Lathered with Poison

涅槃塗毒

[Old Case]

The *Nirvana Sūtra* reads, "The intentions of my teachings are like a drum lathered with poison. Beat it once and those far and near who hear it will lose their lives."[421] When Yantou raised this story, the chief seat Xiaoyan asked, "What is the drum lathered with poison?" The master took his two hands, massaged his knees, bent his body over, and said, 'Han Xin recives an appointment at court.'"[422]

涅槃經云, "吾教意, 如塗毒鼓擊一聲, 遠近聞者皆喪." 巖頭, 擧此話時, 有小嚴上座問, "如何是塗毒鼓?" 師以兩手, 按膝亞身云, "韓信臨朝底."

[Explanation of the gongan]

This story cannot be subsumed under either three vehicles or one vehicle, so must the path to go beyond be known?

Chief seat Xiaoyan asked etcetera: Han Xin received an appointment at

421 See T 374.12.420a8–15; cf. T 375.12.661a21–28 and T 376.12.893b24–29.

422 Han Xin 韓信 (d. 196 B.C.E.), the Marquis of Huaiyin 淮陰侯, is a famous military strategist who played a critical role in the founding of the Han dynasty. His biography in the *Shiji* 史記 (Record of the Historian) contains a famous story about Han Xin, when young, crawling between the legs of a local butcher to avoid unnecessary confrontation; see Burton Watson trans., *Records of the Grand Historian: Han Dynasty I*, Revised Edition (New York: Columbia University Press, 1993), p. 164.

court and (the Lord of) Guangwu[423] asked Han Xin, "Where must the general go to have accomplishments?" Han Xin said, "When a general received an appointment at court, issues commands to all under Heaven, and blows a long whistle his aspiration has no match. He can head to the state of Ji or to Lu. Where could he not go?" Thus one can dot (the map) in the east and the west. One can dot the top and also in between the pair of eyes on Mahēśvara. Each and each one of these dots is a drum lathered with poison. The *Nirvana Sūtra* reads, "The Buddha said, 'This can be compared to a good physician who combines various medicines and lathers a great drum with them. If there are living beings engaged in battle, if the drum is beat even once, those far and near who hear it will all lose their lives'" etcetera.[424]

此話, 三一不相攝, 須知向上路耶? 小嚴上座問云云, 韓信臨朝地, 廣武問韓信, "將軍何往而有功?" 韓信曰, "將軍臨朝, 號令天下, 長嘯一聲, 志若無人焉, 適齊也得, 適魯也得, 何往而不可?" 則東方下一點也得, 西方下一點也得, 上方下一點也得, 摩醯首羅一隻眼也得, 一一是塗毒鼓. 涅槃經云, "佛言, 比如良醫, 和合諸藥, 塗其大鼓, 若有衆生, 鬪戰之時, 才擊一聲, 遠近聞者, 皆喪云云."

Yuanwu Keqin's verse[425]

Heaven is high and earth thick,
The water is broad and the mountain distant,
Xiao He compiled the legal code,[426]

[423] The lord of Guangwu 廣武君 refers to Li Zuoche 李左車, a strategist from the kingdom of Zhao. He offered Han Xin advice after the fall of Zhao.

[424] There is no corresponding passage in the *Nirvana Sūtra*, but a similar analogy (i.e., physician) is made in the sūtra (T 374.12.394b13 and 441c16–18).

[425] For this verse, see also the *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.805a23–24).

[426] Xiao He 蕭何 (d. 193 B.C.E.), like Han Xin, played a critical role in the founding of the Han dynasty. Xiao He is said to have set the nine-article code, which was largely a simplified version of

Han Xin had an appointment at court,
A drum lathered with poison,
Has to be assumed as one's responsibility before it is beaten.

圜悟勤頌, "天高地厚, 水闊山遙. 蕭何制律, 韓信臨朝. 塗毒鼓, 未擊已前宜薦取."

[Explanation]

Yuanwu: *Heaven is high … had an audience at court*: this dharma dwells in the position of the dharma and this is to permanently dwell in worldly marks (世間相).[427] If so, like a drum lathered with poison, this is on the contrary a leftover Dharma[428] and thus it is said, "Has to be assumed as one's responsibility before it is beaten."

圜悟:天高至臨朝者, 是法住法位, 世間相常住也. 然則如擊塗毒鼓, 反是剩法. 故云, "未擊已前宜薦取."

the previous Qin legal code, and was appointed prime minister after he successfully quashed Han Xin's revolt.

427 This is a reference to a passage in the *Lotus Sūtra* (T 262.9.9b10).

428 A leftover Dharma refers to a truth gained from words and understandings, see the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.453c1–2).

Case 65.

Mañjuśrī Gathers Medicine

文殊採藥

[Old Case]

Mañjuśrī one day ordered Sudhana to gather some medicine and then said, "Gather and bring back something that is not medicine." Sudhana said, "In the mountain there is nothing that is not medicine." Mañjuśrī said, "Gather and bring back something that is medicine." Sudhana picked up a plant that was on the ground and handed it over to Mañjuśrī. Mañjuśrī, having received it, showed it to the assembly and said, "This medicine can both kill a person and bring him back to life."

文殊, 一日, 令善財採藥次云, "不是藥者, 採將來." 善財云, "山中無不是藥者." 文殊云, "是藥者, 採將來." 善財, 於地上, 拾得一莖草, 度與文殊. 文殊接得, 示衆云, "此藥, 亦能殺人, 亦能活人."

[Explanation of the gongan]

The source of this gongan is unknown. On the day of Sudhana's birth seven jewels suddenly filled the room and he was therefore called Sudhana ("Good Wealth"). A scripture in the canon says, "A long time ago there was a man who paid a visit to a good physician and learned medicine for many years. When his skills were perfected he wished to leave. His teacher said, 'Then, you find me a plant that is not medicine.' He thereupon gained a sabbatical. A year had passed and this person sought every plant he could find under Heaven, but all of them could be used as medicine. Even after a long time had passed, he was unable to oblige (his teacher), so he returned

to the teacher and informed him (of his failure to secure a non-medicinal plant). The teacher said, 'Your medical skills have been perfected, but I put it to the test. If you truly understood medicine there is nothing that cannot be used as medicine.'"[429]

Mañjuśrī said, "Gather and bring back something that is not medicine": he just asked for medicine.

In the mountain there is nothing that is not medicine: it is therefore said, *gather and bring back something that is medicine*, that is, there is no plant that Jīvaka pulls that is not medicine.[430]

This medicine can both kill a person etcetera: "the numinous spear-tip and precious sword is always exposed and manifest right before you and can both kill a person and bring him back to life."[431]

此話出處未詳. 善財初生日, 七寶忽然滿室, 故名善財. 藏經云, "昔有一人, 詣良醫所, 學醫多年, 藝成欲去. 其師云, '且汝與我, 覓非藥之草.' 乃得休去. 其人經年, 遍求天下所見之草, 皆堪爲藥. 旣久不遂, 却來白師. 師云, '汝醫述成矣, 相試也. 若實解醫, 無物不藥.' " 文殊云, 不是藥者, 採將來者, 只要藥得. 山中無不是藥者, 故云, 是藥者採將來, 則耆婆攬草, 無非妙藥. 此藥亦能殺人云云者, 靈鋒寶劒, 常露現前, 亦能殺人, 亦能活人也.

Dajue Huailian's[432] verse

[429] This story appears in the *Huayan jing xingyuanpin shuchao* 華嚴經行願品疏鈔 (XZJ 7.870b18–871a4). The *Huayan jing xingyuanpin shuchao* itself attributes this story to the *Wuliangyi jing* 無量義經, but this appears to be a mistake.

[430] For this line, see the *Jinguangming jing wenju* 金光明經文句 (T 1785.39.59c13). Jīvaka is a legendary physician who attended the Buddha. For more on Jīvaka, see Kenneth G. Zysk, *Asceticism and Healing In Ancient India: Medicine in the Buddhist Monastery* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1991).

[431] See *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.351b9–10); *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 118.6b1); *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A47.844b22–23); cf. *Fenyang Wude chanshi yulu* (T 1992.47.617a4).

[432] Dajue Huailian 大覺懷璉 (1008–1090) is a dharma heir of Letan Huaicheng 泐潭懷澄 (d.u.) of the Yunmen lineage. He was the abbot of Ayuwang Monastery in Zhejiang province.

Hoping to gather the numinous sprout that grows around the boundaries of the earth,
The Wonderful and Auspicious One (i.e., Mañjuśrī) picked up a stalk of weeds that bring men back to life,
At that time had the drum lathered with poison been beaten,
The trichiliocosm would have directly reverberated with a single sound.

大覺璉頌, "欲採靈苗匝地生, 吉祥拈起活人莖. 當時若也翻塗毒, 直下三千震一聲."

[Explanation]

Dajue: Why speak of a plant that can kill a person or bring him back to life? If the drum lathered with poison is beaten, your life will be lost on the spot.

大覺: 說什麽殺人莖活人莖? 若也擊塗毒鼓, 當下喪却.

Dahong Baoen's verse

Right or wrong—why so careless?
It can kill or bring back to life—how preposterous!
A new branch will be there next year,
The wicked winds of spring will not rest,[433]
The master suddenly picked up his staff and said, "What will you do?"

大洪恩頌, "或是或非何草草! 能生能殺謾悠悠. 來年更有新條在, 惱亂春風卒未休." 師驀拈起拄杖云, "甚麽處去也?"

[Explanation]

Dahong: The same as the verse above.

大洪: 上頌一般也.

Jianfu Benyi's verse[434]

Trusting the hand will pick up a plant that is most numinous,
A single branch can kill and bring one back to life,
Mañjuśrī opened his golden mouth,
Even to this very moment it serves as medicine.

薦福逸頌, "信手拈來草最靈, 一枝能殺亦能生. 曼殊室利開金口, 迄至如今藥道行."

Baoning Renyong's verse[435]

The illness of the living beings of the great earth is as resilient as hemp,
The Wonderful and Auspicious One's numinous medicine is demonstrated endlessly,
While he is doing so it is difficult to distinguish killing from bringing back to life,
This again is like affixing flowers to your eyes.[436]

保寧勇頌, "大地蒼生病似麻, 吉祥靈藥示無涯. 其間殺活難分辨, 又是重添眼裏花."

Donglin Changcong's[437] verse[438]

433 This is a quote from Luo Yin's poem, see note 253.

434 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.28a16–17).

435 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.28a18–b1).

436 That is, this is like not seeing the real thing.

437 Donglin Changcong 東林常總 (1025–1091) is a dharma heir of Huanglong Huinan. He became the abbot of Donglin Monastery 東林寺 in Jiangxi province. He received the title Guanghui chanshi 広慧禪師 and Zhaojue chanshi 照覺禪師. For more on Donglin Changcong, see Ahn, "Who Has the Last Word in Chan?"

Medicine and prohibited substances[439] cure and harm each other and become all the more praiseworthy,
As a test of skill, the hair-splitting blade is drawn to kill or give life,
The sea of Vairocana is vast and mist and waves are calm,
Who will take the long fishing pole and catch the giant sea turtle?[440]

東林揔頌, "藥忌相治貶更褒, 當機生殺按吹毛. 毗盧海闊烟波靜, 誰把長竿釣巨鼇?"

Fazhen Shouyi's verse

Enter a rough mountain and make no selections,
Trusting the hand will pick up medicine,
Killing and bringing back to life all depend on the person,
Facing opportunity (or *chan* skill) it must not be misused.

法眞一頌, "入荒山不擇, 信手拈來藥. 殺活總由人, 臨機莫教錯."

Chongsheng Yuangong's verse

Mañjuśrī, who was gathering medicine, called for Sudhana,
Sudhana immediately picked up a plant,
In instructing the assembly Mañjuśrī truly has no match,
How deceptive are his numerous responses—killing and bringing back to

438 For this verse, see also the *Chanlin leiju* (XZJ 117.159a13–14).

439 Prohibited substances (Ch. *ji* 忌) refer to things that one cannot consume while taking medicine. If a critical word (Ch. *zhuoyu*) can be likened to medicine, then a turning phrase (Ch. *zhuanyu*) can be likened to a prohibited substance that neutralizes the effects of this "medicine."

440 The giant seat turtle or *ao* 鼇 is a legendary beast of cosmic proportions. According to the *Record of the Historian*, Nüwa took its legs to support the four corners of the earth; see the *Sanhuang benji* 三皇本紀 in the *Bu Shi ji* 補史記 chapter of the *Shi ji* 史記 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition), 2.

life!
Fall arrives and the lonely moon shines on every home,
Spring comes and the hundred flowers blossom everywhere,
Zihu's ferocious dog no longer has teeth,[441]
And the old woman on Mt. Wutai has stopped making fun of foolishness.[442]

崇勝珙頌, "採藥文殊召善財, 善財枝草便拈來. 文殊示衆誠無敵, 殺活多應謬翦裁! 秋至家家孤月白, 春來處處百花開. 紫胡獰狗已無齒, 臺嶠老婆休弄獃."

Wuzu Shijie[443] took Sudhana's words and said, "Embarrasing!"[444]

五祖戒, 出善財語云, "慚愧!"

[Explanation]
Wuzu: *Embarrasing*: if you care for others like that embarrassments will not be few.

五祖: 慚愧者, 伊麼爲人, 慚愧不少.

Shoushan Shengnian[445] added a comment, "Mañjuśrī greatly resembles

---

441 Zihu's 紫胡 dog is a oft-discussed topic in Chan; see *Fenyang Wude chanshi yulu* (T 1992.47.612c8–12); *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.163a20–23 and 219c2–5); *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.349a6–7); and *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.186a8–13). See Case 417 note 1125.

442 This old case appears in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.277b4–10) and *Wumen guan* (T 2005.48.297a8–13). An older version of the same story that differs to some degree from the above two examples can also be found in the *Zutang ji* (ZTJ5/46/10–5/47/1). For the trope of the old woman, see note 164 above.

443 Wuzu Shijie 五祖師戒 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Shuangquan Shikuan 雙泉師寬 (d.u.) of the Yunmen lineage.

444 For this comment, see the *Chanlin leiju* (XZJ 117.158b13).

445 Shoushan Shengnian is a dharma heir of Fengxue Yanzhao 風穴延沼 (896–973). Shengnian

someone who covers his ears and steals the bell."[446]

首山念拈, "文殊大似掩耳偸鈴."

Langye Huijue[447] added a comment,[448] "Mañjuśrī may have made an earnest comment, but his forehead was covered in sweat and his mouth was glued shut."

瑯瑘覺拈, "文殊, 可謂誠實之言, 要且額頭汗出, 口裏膠生."

Baoning Faxiu[449] added a comment, "Had I (lit. Qixian) witnessed it at the time, I would have snatched (the plant) away, stomped on it with my feet, and prevented him from raising it. Later a monk asked Beichan,[450] "What is killing?" Beichan said, "Sanping arrived at Shigong." "What is bringing back to life?" Beichan said, "Dadian is at Chaozhou."[451] The master said, "Although

established a temple on Mt. Shou 首山 in Henan province and also served as the abbot of Guangjiao chanyuan 廣教禪院 and Baoying chanyuan 寶應禪院.

446 For the story of the bell, see note 110 above.

447 Langye Huijue 瑯瑘慧覺 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Fenyang Shanzhao 汾陽善昭 (947–1024). Huijue became the abbot of Mt. Langye in Anhui province. He received the title Chan Master Guangzhao 広照禪師.

448 For this comment, see the *Chanlin leiju* (XZJ 117.158b14–15).

449 Fayun 法雲 or Yuantong Faxiu 圓通法秀 (1027–1090) is a dharma heir of Tianyi Yihuai of the Yunmen lineage. He served as abbot of Qixian Monastery 棲賢寺 on Mt. Lu 廬山 in Jiangxi province and also Zhongshan Monastery 鐘山寺 and Baoning Monastery in Jiangsu province. He was also asked by the emperor to serve as abbot of Chongfu Chan Cloister 崇福禪院 in Changlu 長蘆, Jiangsu province. In 1084, he also became the founding patriarch of Fayun Monastery 法雲寺 in the Eastern Capital.

450 Beichan 北禪 may refer to Beichan Zhixian 北禪智賢 (d.u.) of the Yunmen lineage.

451 Beichan here is offering a comment on the story of Sanping Yizhong's 三平義忠 (d.u.) encounter with his teacher Shigong Huizang 石鞏慧藏 (d.u.) who was once a hunter. Shigong, we are told, used to welcome students with arrow and bow in hand. When Sangping arrived he exposed his chest and asked Shigong about the life-giving arrow. Shigong is said to have pulled the string on the bow

this is the case, as a temporary expedient means they are not inadmissible, but when examined carefully they are all but bamboo-leaf spirits dwelling on grass and trees. I (Qixian) would not have done so." He thereupon set his staff straight up and said, "Can you see this? If you're able to see it your entire body is far from harm, but if you're unable to see it your life will be hard to preserve." He took his staff and struck the meditation bench.

保寧秀拈, "捿賢當時若見, 便奪來踏在脚下, 教伊提不起. 後有僧擧問北禪, '如何是殺?' 禪云, '三平到石鞏.' '如何是活?' 禪云, '大顚在潮州.' " 師云, "雖然如是, 一期方便, 卽無不可, 若字細撿點, 摠是依草附木竹葉精靈. 捿賢卽不然." 乃竪起拄杖云, "還見麽? 若也見得, 全身遠害; 若也不見, 性命難存." 以拄杖擊禪牀.

[Explanation]

Baoning: *Snatch it away, stomp on it*, etcetera: this is a state before killing and bringing back to life.

Sanping arrived at Shigong … Taidian is at Chaozhou: killing and bringing back to life each have their own reasons and must not dare be taken lightly.

If you're able to see it etcetera: see it or not you can't avoid this blow.

保寧: 便奪來踏在脚下云云者, 殺活前頭也. 三平到石鞏太顚在潮州者, 殺活各有來由, 不敢輕忽也. 若也見得云云者, 見不見未免此棒也.

Weishan Muzhe[452] added a comment, "Sudhana was able to gather it and Mañjuśrī used it well. When they arrive at Mañjuśrī's place, not only the bedridden Vimalakīrti in Vaiśāli but also all the people of this great earth

---

thrice in response. Sanping later raised this incident before Dadian Baotong 大顚寶通 (732–824) and received another teaching about the life-giving arrow. This story can be found in the biography of Sanping in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.316b20–28).

452 Weishan Muzhe 潙山慕喆 (d. 1095) is a dharma heir of Cuiyan Kezhen 翠巖可真 (d. 1064). He served as the abbot of Yuelu Monastery 岳麓寺 and Dawei Monastery 大潙寺 in Hunan province. In 1094 he received the title Chan Master Zhenru 真如禪師.

who live with a terminal illness will cast off their bodies. Why? There is no need for a razor-sharp blade to understand how to use medicine. Why would you need a ninefold reverted elixir to extend life?[453]

潙山喆拈, "善財能採, 文殊善用. 非但寢疾毗耶, 直饒盡大地人, 抱必死之疾, 到文殊所, 教佗箇箇脫體而去. 何故? 解用不須霜刃劒, 延齡何必九還丹!"

[Explanation]

Weishan: *Was able to gather it* and *used it well*: this means the plant for bringing people back to life has arrived.

Not only the bedridden (Vimalakīrti) in Vaiśāli etcetera: this medicine is a strong remedy for Vimalakīrti's illness. Silence is a terminal illness, but they arrive here and cast off their bodies.

There is no need for etcetera: this is because Mañjuśrī understood how to use this medicine.

潙山: 能採善用者, 活人莖到底也. 非但寢疾毘耶云云者, 此藥强療維摩之疾, 黙然則必死之疾, 到此一一脫體而去也. 解用不須云云者, 盖爲文殊解用此藥故也

Kaiyuan Ziqi[454] requested a medicinal pill from the great assembly, ascended the hall, raised this story, and said, "The medicinal pill that I (Kaiyuan) requested from the great assembly today can neither kill nor bring someone back to life. It can only cure the illness of all living beings. When the illness is cured the medicine is taken away. Speak! How far removed am I from Mañjuśrī? Those with eyes should tell us apart!

453 For more on the ninefold reverted elixir, see Fabrizio Pregadio ed., *Encyclopedia of Daoism* (London: Routledge, 2008), pp. 498–500.

454 Kaiyuan Ziqi 開元子琦 (d.u) studied under Cuiyan Kezhen 翠巖可真 (d. 1064) and became a dharma heir of Huanglong Huinan. Ziqi became the founding abbot of Kaiyuan Monastery 開元寺 in Quanzhou 泉州, Fujian province. He was posthumously granted the title Great Master Juezhao 覺照大師. For Kaiyuan's biography, see *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.88b3–15).

開元琦, 請大衆丸藥, 上堂, 擧此話云, "開元今日, 請大衆丸藥, 亦不殺人, 亦不活人. 但治衆生一切病, 病旣愈, 藥還祛. 且道! 與文殊相去多小? 具眼者, 辨取."

[Explanation]

Kaiyuan: It is not necessary to give life to people, it is not necessary to kill people. Simply remove all illnesses and ultimately there will be no illness and also no medicine.

開元: 不要活人, 不要殺人, 但除一切病, 畢竟無病, 亦無藥也.

Chengtian Huai ascended the hall and said, "This morning of the Double Fifth Festival (i.e., fifth day of the fifth lunar month) is truly the time to gather medicine.[455] I remember how extremely unusual Sudhana's response to Mañjuśrī's words was. (He says) nothing in front of his eyes was not medicine and just picks up a plant. Although it can either kill a person or bring him back to life, who would know this revealed fact? From that point on it has transcended past and present, who would not doubt when they see it? Only those equipped with true eyes can decide what is and is not (medicine). Is there anyone who possesses true eyes?" He thereupon set his staff straight up and said, "Try saying something here. If you can say something, 'the Buddha illness and patriarch illness will all be cured.'[456] If you can't say something, 'worldly physicians will fold their arms.'"

承天懷, 上堂云, "今朝端午節, 正是採藥時. 記得文殊語, 善財應最奇. 目前無不是, 拈來草一枝. 雖然能殺活, 消息有誰知? 自後超今古, 何人見不疑! 除是具正眼, 方能決是非, 而今還有正眼者麼?" 乃竪拂云, "試向這裏道看! 若道得, 佛病祖病皆愈; 若道不得, 世醫拱手."

---

[455] This gongan is thus often raised on the day of the Double Fifth Festival; for instance, see *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.829a3–6).

[456] *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* 天聖廣燈錄 (XZJ 135.798b10–11 and 807b10–12); *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T 1988.47.548c25).

[Explanation]

Chengtian: He only clarified how to use medicine to bring someone back to life.

承天: 但明活人藥之用也.

Cishou Huaishen ascended the hall, raised this story, and said,[457] “This sort of truth (道理) can only be known by a virtuoso. If it is not iron eyes and copper pupils, then it will often pass by right in front of your face. Although this is the case, Sudhana gathered medicine the way he did because he only knew one; Mañjuśrī discerned the medicine the way he did because he only knew the other.” He then picked up his whisk and said, “Is there anyone who recognizes this medicine? Those who can will live long and if you eat it you will become immortal. Even Shennong[458] does not know its name and Jīvaka[459] can’t find it anywhere. It destroys the Buddha illness and patriarch illness and sweeps away the afflictions of ignorance. Each and every thing fails to cover up and hide it. Who is aware of its numinous radiance and penetrating brilliance?”

慈受深, 上堂, 擧此話云, “者般道理, 作者方知. 若非鐵眼銅睛, 往往當面蹉過. 雖然如是, 善財伊麽採藥, 只知其一; 文殊伊麽辨藥, 只知其二.” 遂拈起拂子云, “還識者箇藥麽? 得者長生, 服之不死. 神農不知名, 耆婆無處討. 破除佛病祖病, 掃蕩無明煩惱. 物物頭頭不覆藏, 靈光洞耀何人曉?”

[Explanation]

Cishou: *This sort of logic* etcetera: this profoundly clarified the state of Mañjuśrī’s function. *Picked up his whisk … this medicine*: this refers to a whisk.

457 For this sermon, see also *Cishou Huaishen chanshi guanglu* (XZJ 126.555a17-b4).

458 Shennong 神農 (“divine farmer”) is a legendary sage king who purportedly introduced agriculture, domesticated animals, and medicine to China.

459 See note 430 above.

Those who can will live long … can't demand for it anywhere: this explains the whisk.

It destroys the Buddha illness and patriarch illness: there is not a single thing that can serve as the cause or the object; that is to say, it is a whisk.

Each and every thing … hide it: each thing manifests itself and every thing manifests itself, but they do not transcend the function of essence. Therefore, what killing medicine and bringing-back-to-life medicine is there to demand?

慈受: 者般道理云云者, 深明文殊用處也. 拈起拂子至藥麽者, 一條拂子也. 得者長生至無處討者, 明一條拂子也. 破除佛病祖病者, 無一物爲緣爲對, 卽一條拂子也. 物物至藏者, 頭頭現物物現, 不離體之用也. 然則討什麽殺人藥活人藥.

Baiyun Zhibing added a comment, "Sudhana trusted his hand to pick it up. He wasted not even one iota of energy. Mañjuśrī could discern killing and bringing back to life. You must know that the medicine has a special spiritual efficacy."

白雲昺拈, "善財信手拈來, 不費絲毫氣力; 文殊能辨殺活, 須知別有神功."

[Explanation]

Baiyun: *Sudhana trusted his hand etcetera*: he did not expend too much effort—how could this not be the blade that kills people?

Mañjuśrī could discern etcetera: it allows for numerous spiritual efficacies—how could this not be the sword that brings people back to life?

白雲: 善財信手云云者, 無許多功用, 豈非殺人刀! 文殊能辨云云者, 有許多神功, 豈非活人劒!

Venerable Kongsou Zongyin[460] ascended the hall, raised this story, and

[460] Kongsou Zongin 空叟宗印 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Zhuoan Deguang 拙庵德光 (1121–1203).

then in continuation raised Weishan Mutie's added comment.[461] The master said, "Sudhana concealed a great deal from us and Mañjuśrī added the wrong commentary. Weishan followed their lead and openly adopted what they said. All three of them lack awakening." He suddenly picked up the staff, struck the table once, and said, "Is there anyone who has awakened to this matter?" Again he struck the table and said, "Sticking an artemesia cone on top of a moxa sore."

空叟和尙, 上堂, 擧此話, 連擧潙山喆拈, 師云, "善財大瞞頇, 文殊錯指注, 潙山隨摟揪. 三人惣欠悟." 驀拈拄杖, 卓一下云, "莫有向這裏, 悟得底麼?" 又卓一下云, "灸瘡瘢上著艾炷."

[Explanation]

Kongsou: *Sudhana concealed a great deal etcetera*, because this is like dragging mud and carrying water, *picking up the staff and striking the table once* is like the blade that kills people. As for *moxa sore etcetera*, so-and-so saying this is also a leftover Dharma. In other words, where do Kongsou's intentions lie?

空叟: 善財大顢頇云云者, 似乎拖泥帶水故. 拈拄杖卓一下者, 似殺人刀也. 灸瘡云云者, 某甲伊麼道, 亦是剩法也, 則空叟意, 落在什麼處.

He served as the abbot of Chongguang baoshou cloister 崇光保壽院 and Ayuwang Monastery in Zhejiang province.

461 Cf. *Huanglong Huinan chanshi yulu* (T 1993.47.630b28); and *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 118.113b10).

Case 74.

Bhīṣmottara Gathers Medicine

毗目執手

[Old Case]

When the immortal Bhīṣmottara[462] grasped Sudhana's hand, Sudhana immediately saw his body go to the *buddhakṣetras* (Buddha lands) in the ten directions where all the buddhas as numerous as motes of dust are and also saw kalpas (eons) as numerous as the inexplicably inexplicable number of motes of dust go by.[463] When the immortal let go of his hand, he immediately saw his body return to exactly where it originally was.[464]

毗目仙人, 執善財手, 善財, 卽時自見其身, 往十方佛刹微塵數諸佛所, 乃至經不可說不可說微塵數劫. 仙人放手, 卽見自身, 還在本處.

[Explanation of the gongan]

Bhīṣmottara in full reads, Bhīṣmottara-nirghoṣa, and in our tongue reads, "A Voice to Be Feared," that is, the sound that comes out of him alarms and frightens the myriad evildoers. He is a good teacher (善知識) who resides in

[462] Bhīṣmottara or Bhīṣmottara-nirghoṣa is one of the fifty-five good teachers (Ch. *shanzhishi* 善知識) that Sudhana visited during his legendary pilgrimage in the *Huayan jing* (Avatamsaka sūtra, T 279. 10.345a12–346a24).

[463] The inexplicably inexplicable number (Ch. *bukeshuo bukeshuo* 不可說不可說, S. *anabhilāpyānabilāpya*) is one of the ten types of great numbers in Buddhism; see the *Huayan jing* (T 279.10.346a4–5).

[464] This story is from the *Huayan jing* (T 279.10.345c20–346a13).

the eighth abode of the youth (童眞住).[465]

The *Layman's Treatise*[466] says: "*Grasped his hand … kalpas (eons) as numerous as the inexplicably inexplicable number of motes of dust go by*: this means by entering the first stage his perfect wisdom was further illuminated and that he has the same perspective as a buddha. On account of the power of his *samādhi* all the immeasurable kalpas are simultaneously manifest in a single thought. *Return as he was before*: he entered the first stage and a part of it was further illuminated. With the help of the empowerment[467] extended to him by the sage he saw the realms of all the buddhas. When he reached buddhahood and his work came to an end, the ten directions were constantly present right before his eyes and there is thus no need for empowerment."[468] Again, it says, "Empowered by the power of wisdom, he entered the Dharma. Having attained the Dharma, his power constantly remained in that state. Although he returned to the sage and left the sage's empowerment, with one view he saw that they were not different. This is like a man who, having crossed the river, does not carry the boat on his back."[469] In other words, with the immortal's empowerment he saw the realms of all the buddhas. He left the sage's empowerment, but his power constantly remained in that state.

Again, *he saw his body … kalpas as numerous as the inexplicably inexplicable number of motes of dust go by*: this means "he went from humble to extravagant. This is like taking gold as the earth … "[470]

He immediately saw his body etcetera: this means "he went from extravagant to humble. In this state *mountains are mountains …* "[471] Folding the palms

465 This is the eighth of the ten abodes of the bodhisattva. As its name implies, it represents an early stage in one's maturity in buddhahood. See the *Huayan jing* (T 279.10.87c6–15).

466 This refers to famous commentary on the *Huayan jing* (Flower Garland Scripture) by Li Tongxuan.

467 Here I substitute *jiachi* 加持 for *jiadai* 加待.

468 See *Lueshi xin Huayan jing lun* 略釋新華嚴經論 (T 1741.36.1029c16–19).

469 See *Xin huayan jing lun* 新華嚴經論 (T36.1739.963c23–24).

470 Here, Gag'un is borrowing the words of Jin'gak Hyesim; see *Seonmun yeomsong* (HBJ 5.45a18).

471 Here, Gag'un is again borrowing the words of Jin'gak Hyesim; see *Seonmun yeomsong* (HBJ 5.45a20–21).

together means pull in and take hold of (each other's hand). As for grasping the hand, an ancient one said, "Control your thoughts for a moment and this is the place of Maitreya. There is not a gate that does not have Sudhana."[472] Again, "control your thoughts and the doors to the tower shall open at the snap of the fingers."[473]

Let go of his hand, he immediately saw his body return exactly where it originally was: in an instant emotions rise and, as before, mountains, rivers, dirt, trees, and tiles become obstructions. Again, if there is hesitation, then the Sumeru Lamp King's lion seat will not enter Vimalakīrti's room.[474]

Again, *he saw himself … where all the buddhas are*: this means that he is not obstructed by space (處無礙).

And even kalpas as numerous as motes of dust inexplicably go by: this means that he is not obstructed by time (時無礙). This is similar to "Like the boundless kṣetras (lands) …"[475]

He immediately saw his body return exactly where it originally was: Foyan Qingyuan said, "In the four modes of birth and the six paths it is precisely self nature.[476] In each of the three destinies and eight difficult circumstances it manifests as a material body (色身). It dwells within the lotus matrix sea and resides inside the inconceivable. For men like us, this point is our permanent endowment. Can you believe this?" It is not that there is a separate lotus matrix world system that transcends our original place. It is not that there is a separate original place that transcends the lotus matrix world system. The way-things-always-are and the inconceivable traverse the same path. An ancient one has three verses that say,

---

472 *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.716a24).

473 A similar passage can be found in *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.765b25–26); and also *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.865a28–29 and 903b23).

474 For the Sumeru Lamp King Buddha, see Burton Watson trans., The *Vimalakirti Sūtra* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1997), pp. 76–77.

475 *Xin huayan jing lun* (T 1739.36.721a20–21).

476 For the four modes of birth and the six paths, see note 408 above.

When the immortal Bhīṣmottara grasped the hand,
There is not a place in the ten directions that did not follow,
Upon his return he took a nap in the soughing of pines,
Only he knows the limitless coolness for himself.

The ten directions are all manifest in the tip of a hair,
In the lotus matrix (world system) the heavily layered Indra's net,[477]
Goodbye Sudhana, where have you gone?
A clear breeze in the evening shakes the green langgan stones.[478]

In the adorned lotus matrix world system,
How many layers are there in a single mote of dust?
I suddenly charged out and lifted the eyes to see,
Like before the wind at dawn moves through the sparse hanging screen.

毘目, 具云, 毘目瞿沙, 此云, 出聲可畏, 謂所出之音, 衆邪驚怖也. 華嚴第八, 童眞住善知識. 長者論云,"執手至劫者, 以初入地位, 正智增明, 與佛同見. 於一念中, 以三昧力, 一切無量劫, 一時并現也. 還復如舊者, 初至地位, 一分增明, 以假聖所接引加待, 見諸佛境界, 至佛功終, 十方常在目前, 無勞所加持也." 又云, 智力加持入法, 旣得法已, 自力常然. 雖復聖者, 捨其加持, 一見見無異. 如人濟渡於河, 不可負舟而去.' 則被仙加持, 見諸佛境界, 捨其加持, 自力常然也. 又自見其身至劫者, 從儉入奢, 黃金爲地云云. 即見自身云云者, 從奢出儉, 山是山云云. 又手以攀攬爲意, 則執手處. 古人云,"暫時歛念, 是處是慈氏, 無門無善財. 又歛念, 則樓閣之門, 彈指即開也." 放手處, 即見自身, 還在本處者, 瞥爾情生, 依舊山河土木瓦礫. 又議[479] 心, 則燈王之座, 不入維摩之室. 又自見其身至佛所者, 處

---

[477] The lotus matrix world system according to the *Huayan jing* is a pure land that appears due to the vow of the Vairocana Buddha. Indra's net has a gem at every knot in the net that reflects every other gem in the net infinitely. For this see Francis H. Cook, *Hua-yen Buddhism: The Jewel Net of Indra* (State Park and London: Pennsylvania University Press, 1977).

[478] This verse is attributed to Letan Hongying 泐潭洪英 (1012–1070) in the *Linjian lu* 林間錄 (XZJ 148.606b15–16). There are some minor differences. *Langgan* stones resemble jade.

[479] Here, I substitute *niyi* 擬議 for *yi* 議.

無礙; 乃至經不可說至劫者, 時無礙. 如無邊刹境云云. 即見自身, 還在本處者, 佛眼遠云, "四生六道, 即心自性; 三途八難, 普現色身;居華藏海之中, 住不思議之內. 如斯之旨, 乃吾輩之常分耳, 還信得及麼?" 非離本處, 別有華藏世界, 非離華藏世界, 別有本處. 所謂平常不思議, 一途而行. 古人有三頌云, "毘目仙人執手時, 十方無處不追隨. 歸來一枕松風在, 無限清凉只自知," "十方齊現一毛端, 華藏重重帝網寒. 邇重善財何處去? 清宵風撼碧琅玕," "華藏莊嚴世界中, 一塵中有幾重重. 忽然排出擡眸看, 依舊疏簾動曉風."

Huanglong Sixin[480] added a comment, "I won't ask you about the letting go of the hand. What can you say about the state of grasping the hand?"

黃龍心拈, "放手卽不問爾, 執手處作麼生道?"

[Explanation]

Huanglong: *I won't ask you about the letting go of the hand* etcetera: this is not a question about the state of grasping the hand that transcends the state of letting go of the hand. If you can understand the state of grasping the hand, then the same goes for the state of letting go of the hand. This is the so-called the everyday and the inconceivable traverse same path. This is the intent of the following ascending the hall sermon by Foyan.

黃龍: 放手卽不問云云者, 非離放手處, 問執手處. 若會得執手處, 則放手處亦如是. 所謂平常不思議, 一途而行也. 下佛眼遠上堂, 卽此意.

Foyan Qingyuan at the dismissal of the summer retreat ascended the hall and said,[481] "The immortal Bhīṣmottara grasped Sudhana's hand and

---

480 Huanglong 黃龍 or Sixin Wuxin 死心悟新 (1043–1114) became the dharma heir of Huitang Zuxin 晦堂祖心 (1025–1100) while studying at Huanglong Monastery 黃龍寺. In 1092, Wuxin assumed his first abbacy at Yunyan Monastery 雲巖寺 in Jiangsu province. Later in 1097 he served as the abbot of Cuiyan Monastery in Jiangxi province. Sometime in the beginning of the Zhenghe 正和 reign period (1111–1118) he also served as the abbot of Huanglong Monastery.

481 For this sermon, see also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.507b14–508a3).

Sudhana suddenly saw all the buddhas of the past as numerous as motes of dust. And then when he let go of the hand it was as if he returned to the way he was before. I (abbot Longmen) led the great assembly to this place and set up the restrictions of the retreat and then when I ended the summer retreat it was just the way it was before. All the buddhas as numerous as motes of dust are subsumed within and return to that state in which Sudhana was before. The way the great assembly was before for three months or ninety days should be collected without leaving a trace. Do you understand? The land and sea are hidden in the tip of a hair and Mt. Sumeru is contained in a mustard seed. While not transcending the objects that are seen and heard, climb up to the tenth stage in one big jump. In the four births and the six paths it is precisely self-nature of the mind. In the three destinies and eight difficult conditions[482] it manifests as a material body everywhere. It dwells within the lotus matrix sea and resides inside the inconceivable. For men like us, this is our permanent endowment. Can you believe this?"

佛眼遠, 解夏, 上堂云, "毗目仙人, 執善財手, 頓見過去微諸佛, 及其放手, 宛然依舊. 龍門長老, 領諸大衆, 爰於此地, 結足安居, 及其解夏, 宛然依舊. 善財依舊處, 微塵諸佛, 含攝有歸; 大衆依舊處, 三月九旬, 斂收無迹. 還會麽? 毛端藏刹海, 芥子納須彌, 不離見聞緣, 超然登十地. 四生六道, 卽心自性; 三途八難, 普現色身, 居華藏海之中, 住不思議之內. 如斯之旨, 乃吾輩之常分耳, 還信得及麽?"

Juefan Huihong[483] said,[484] "Zhu Shiying[485] raised this story and had

[482] The three destinies (Ch. *santu* 三途) or three evil destinies are rebirth in hell, rebirth as a hungry ghost, and rebirth as an animal. The eight difficult circumstances that severally limit the possibility of learning from the Buddha are (1) rebirth in Uttara-kuru (the northern continent where it is always pleasant); (2) rebirth before and after a buddha's lifetime; (3) rebirth as hell being; (4) as hungry ghost; (5) as an animal; (6) as a long-lived celestial being; (7) as a disabled being (i.e., deaf, blind, dumb, and mute); (8) or as a worldly philosopher.

[483] Juefan Huihong 覺範慧洪 (1071–1128) is a dharma heir of Zhenjing Kewen. He served as the abbot of Qingliang Monastery 清涼寺 in Jiangxi province. Juefan had to repeatedly suffer imprisonment and even exile. During his exile, he received the support of his close friend, the famed

once asked me about it. 'How do you make sense of the meaning of this passage?' I said, 'It is all schemata.' When his hand was grasped and he thus immediately entered the adsorption of contemplating the Dharma, Sudhana saw that 'there is not even a hair's breadth gap between self and other … from beginning to end he never left this thought.'[486] *When the immortal let go of his hand* and he immediately left this absorption (samādhi), Yongming said, "So know that one does not move from one's original position. The *kṣetras* (lands) far and near are plainly apparent. A single thought-moment does not go by and time long and short appear the same."[487] The World Honored One used the analogy of a lotus. No one in this world knows it but me. When the lotus is just about to blossom in it there is already a seed and in the seed there is already a lotus root. In cause there is effect and in effect there is cause. The three times are one time. The seeds may have been disseminated, but again they come together and continue without being cut off. They are not separated from the ten directions.

覺範曰, "朱世英, 擧此話, 嘗問予, '此一段義, 何以明之?' 予云, '皆象也.' 方執其手, 卽入觀法之時, 見自他不隔於毫端, 始終不移於當念, 及其放手, 卽是出定之時. 永明曰, '是知! 不動本位, 遠近之刹歷然; 一念靡移, 延促之時宛爾.' 世尊, 盖以蓮爲譬, 而世莫有知者, 予特知之. 夫蓮方華時, 中已有子, 子中已有薹. 因中有果, 果中有因, 三世一時也. 其子分布, 又會屬焉, 相續不斷, 十方不隔也."

statesman Zhang Shangying 張商英 (1043–1122). Juefan left many writings such as the *Linjian lu*, *Lengzhai yehua* 冷齋夜話, and *Shimen wenzi chan* 石門文字禪. For Juefan, see the doctoral thesis by George Albert Keyworth III, "Transmitting the lamp of learning in classical Chan Buddhism: Juefan Huihong (1071–1128) and literary Chan," University of California, Los Angeles, 2001.

484 For this sermon, see Juefan Huihong's *Linji zongzhi* 臨濟宗旨 (XZJ 111.174b18–175a6).

485 Zhu Shiying 朱世英 (d.u.) or Zhu Yan 朱彥 (*jinshi* 1076) was a lay follower and friend of Zhenjing Kewen and his dharma heir Juefan Huihong.

486 *Xin huayan jing lun* (T 1739.36.721a21–22).

487 *Zongjing lu* (T 2016.48.500c22–23).

Case 98.

Bodhidharma and the Noble Truth

達磨聖諦

[Old Case]

Bodhidharma was asked by Emperor Wu of Liang,[488] "What is the ultimate meaning of the noble truths?" He said, "Unrestricted and not noble." The emperor said, "Who is facing me?" The patriarch said, "I don't know him." This did not sit well with the emperor, so the patriarch crossed the river and went to Wei [Fenyang Shanzhao in substitution said, "My wisdom is shallow."] Emperor Wu raised this story and asked master Baozhi[489] and master Baozhi said, "Your majesty, do you know this person or not?" The emperor said, "I don't know him." Master Baozhi said, "This is the bodhisattva Guanyin[490] who transmitted the Buddha's mind seal." The emperor was regretful and so he dispatched an emissary to decree his return. Master Baozhi said, "Even if everyone in the whole country, not to mention your majesty's decree, were to go he would still not return."

達磨大師, 因梁武帝問, "如何是聖諦第一義?" 曰, "廓然無聖." 帝云, "對朕者

488 Emperor Wu of Liang 梁武帝 (464–549) founded the Liang dynasty and ruled from 502 until his death. He is arguably one of the most famous patrons of Buddhism.

489 For Baozhi, see note 412 above.

490 "The bodhisattva Guanyin" is in fact the "great being" Guanyin. "Great being" (Ch. *dashi*, Kr. *daesa*) is one of the translations for S. *mahāsattva*. Usually in translations of sutras into Chinese the terms bodhisattva and mahāsattva are combined as in *pusamohesa*菩薩摩訶薩 (Kr. *bosal mahasal*) or *pusa dashi* 菩薩大士.

誰?” 祖曰,“不識.” 帝不契, 祖遂渡江至魏.<汾州昭, 代云,“弟子智淺.”> 武帝, 擧問誌公, 誌公云,“陛下, 還識此人不?” 帝云,“不識.” 誌公云,“此是觀音大士, 傳佛心印.” 帝悔, 當遣使詔之, 誌公云,“莫道陛下詔, 闔國人去, 他亦不迴.”

[Explanation of the gongan]

The original source reads, “Master Bodhidharma floated across several seas for over three cycles of heat and cold (i.e., three years) and arrived in Nanhai. The provincial governor of Guangzhou Xiao Ang greeted him with the respect due to a lord and submitted a memorial to inform Emperor Wu. The emperor inspected the memorial and dispatched an emissary with gifts and a decree inviting him (to his capital). On the twenty-first day of the ninth month of the first year of the Datong era (527), when he first arrived in Jinling, the emperor asked, ‘After my enthronement I have constructed temples and copied scriptures and arranged the ordination of monks in numbers too many to remember. What merit does this have?’ He said, ‘No merit at all.’ The emperor said, ‘Why is there no merit?’ He said, ‘They are the cause of the contamination of men and gods. Like shadows they follow form. Although they exist, they are not real.’ ‘What is true merit?’ He said, ‘True wisdom is wonderful and perfect and its essence is empty and serene. Merit like this cannot be sought through worldly means.’ Again the emperor asked, ‘What is the highest meaning of the noble truths?’ He said, ‘Unrestricted and not noble’ … ”[491] This is the second dialogue.

The ultimate meaning of the noble truths: noble (聖) means proper (正). Truth (諦) means real (實). In other words, it is the *ultimate meaning* of “the proper and real.” Moreover, the meaning of the truths realized by the sages is called the *ultimate meaning of the noble truths*. Furthermore, the truths were realized by the noble ones and therefore called *noble truths*. It is the most honored and unsurpassed (meaning) and therefore called *ultimate*.

Why did Emperor Wu ask about this? During the Yao-Qin era (384–417) “all the houses of Buddhism penetrated the ultimate truth (第一義諦) and

---

491 *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.219a13–27).

said, 'It is unrestricted, empty, and serene. There are no noble ones.' "[492] At that time the emperor of Qin asked Dharma master Sengzhao[493] about these words: "These words are 'wild and wide of the mark, never coming near human affairs.'[494] If there are no noble ones who is it that knows that there aren't any?"[495] The dharma master humbly received the imperial order and said, "Truly, it is just as the brilliant imperial order says—if there are no noble ones, then who will roam with the Way?"[496] This is a discussion from the Yao-Qin era. Is it a response to the discussions of that era? The *Blue Cliff Record* reads, "Emperor Wu donned *kaṣāya* robes and lectured on *Fangguang bore jing*.[497] In a miraculous response flowers from Heaven scattered everywhere and the earth turned into gold. He dismissed Daoist teachings and honored Buddhist teachings. He decreed all under Heaven (i.e., the empire) to construct temples, ordain monks, and cultivate themselves according to the teachings. People at the time referred to him as Prince of Heaven, Buddha Mind. Again, the emperor discussed the two truths, absolute and conventional, with Dharma Master Louyue, Layman Fu, and Prince Zhaoming, and said, 'The absolute truth clarifies "it is not existence" and conventional truth clarifies "it is not nonexistence." The nonduality of absolute and conventional is itself the ultimate truth.' This is the extremely wonderful and thoroughly mysterious aspect of the Doctrinal houses. The emperor added comment on this ultimate principle and asked Bodhidharma,

---

492 *Zhao lun* (T 1858.45.157b14–15).

493 Sengzhao 僧肇 (374–414) was the student of the famed Kuchean monk Kumārajīva (344–413). Sengzhao is famous for authoring several treatises on the perfection of wisdom, emptiness, and other related ideas, which can be found in his *Zhao lun* 肇論. Other texts such as the *Baozang lun* 寶藏論 are also attributed to Sengzhao.

494 "Wild and wide of the mark" (Ch. *jingyan* 徑廷) is a quote from the *Zhuangzi;* see Watson, *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu*, p. 33.

495 *Zhao lun* (T 1858.45.157b15–16).

496 *Zhao lun* (T 1858.45.157b17).

497 The *Fangguang bore jing* 放光般若經 or *Emission of Light Prajñāpāramitā Sūtra* is an abridged translation of the *Pañcaviṃśati-sāhasrikā-prajñāpāramitā-sūtra.*

'What is the ultimate meaning of the noble truths?'"[498] This is because it was the foremost topic of discussion at the time. The words, *unrestricted and not noble*, were different from and not identical to the common ideas that were discussed during the Yao-Qin era.

Fushan Fayuan[499] said, "The ultimate truth was debated by the various houses. Some say one vehicle and others say three. If you rely on Bodhidharma's words, *unrestricted and not noble*, and also his words, I don't know, who cares whether it is three or one! He also discussed directly pointing to the mind's source, originally there is not a single thing, there is no difference between ordinary beings and noble ones, past and present just the same, and no cessation and no extinction."[500]

Again, the *Biyan lu (Blue Cliff Record)* reads, "None of the patch-robed monks under Heaven can leap out of this. Bodhidharma cut it in two in a single blow for him. Today many people misunderstand."[501] It would be good not to misunderstand (Bodhidharma).

Who is facing me: Wansong said, "I can make out tusks in your noses."[502]

I don't know: this is analogous to *unrestricted and not noble*. To work for other people you must be thorough.

This did not sit well with the emperor: this means "a square peg can't fit into a round hole."[503]

Crossed the river and arrived in Wei: this means he did not meet a sympathetic friend. From this moment forward, the sympathetic friend's intention "blithely enters the reeds without even a nod" [from a poem that

---

498 *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.140b6–17).

499 Fushan Fayuan 浮山法遠 (991–1067) was the dharma heir of Yexian Guixing 葉縣歸省 (d.u.), who in turn is a dharma heir of Shoushan Shengnian. The famed statesman Ouyang Xiu 歐陽脩 (1007–1072) studied under Fushan Fayuan who served as abbot of a temple on Mt. Fu in Anhui province. He was officially granted the title Chan Master Yuanjian 圓鑑禪師.

500 Source uknown.

501 *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.140b17–19).

502 This capping phrase can be found in the *Congrong lu* (T 2004.48.228b13).

503 This capping phrase can also be found in the *Congrong lu* (T 2004.48.228b13–14).

sings about herons].[504]

Even if everyone in the whole country were to go he will still not return: not only did (Baozhi) know that (Bodhidharma) would not come back, but he also analyzed the revealed facts in *Unrestricted and not noble* and *I don't know*.

Master Baozhi was born in the beginning of the Taishi era (465–471) of the Song and entered into extinction in the thirteenth year of the Tianjian era (514).[505] Thirteen years after master Baozhi's extinction Bodhidharma came. How could he and Bodhidharma be contemporaries? The stele inscription for the Great Virtue Ijeong[506] says, "Master Baozhi came to Gaeseon Monastery in Yangju[507] [in Silla], stayed sometimes for a month and other times for a year, and sat across from Ijeong." Considering this record, it is difficult to say the birth and death of the sage (Baozhi) with any certainty.

本篇云, "達摩師泛重溟, 凡三周寒署, 達于南海. 廣州刺史蕭昂, 具主禮迎之, 表聞武帝. 帝覽奏, 遣使賫詔迎請. 大通元年, 九月二十一日, 初至金陵. 帝問, '朕, 卽位以來, 造寺寫經度僧, 不可勝記, 有何功德?' 曰, '並無功德.' 曰, '何以無功德?' 曰, '此是人天有漏之因, 如影隨形, 雖有非實.' '如何是眞功德?' 曰, '正智妙圓, 體自空寂. 如是功德, 不以世求.' 又問, '如何是聖諦第一義?' 曰, '廓然無聖.' 云云. 此是第二問也. 聖諦第一義者, 聖者正也, 諦者實也, 則正實第一義. 又聖人之所諦證之義曰, 聖諦第一義. 又聖人所證之諦, 故曰, 聖諦. 最尊無上, 故

504 See Shi Qingchen's 施清臣 (d.u.) poem in the *Quan Song shi* 全宋詩 62.

With a straw rain coat and bamboo hat on a lonely boat,
I roam the vast mountains and rivers by myself.
If a certain person were to ask me about worldly affairs,
I would blithly enter the reeds without even a nod.

一蓑一笠一孤舟 萬里江山独自游 有人問我紅塵事 笑入蘆花不點頭

505 The text seems to be in error here. In 466 or 467 Baozhi began to display the eccentric behavior that made him famous. In a certain sense the Taishi era marks the "birth" of Baozhi's career.

506 Ijeong 理貞 (alt. 理貞; d.u.) is a Korean monk who was active in the ninth century. He is known as one of the founders of Haein Monastery 海印寺.

507 Yangju 楊州 was the name of the area around present-day Seoul.

曰, 第一. 武帝伊麽問何也? 姚秦之時, 諸家通第一義諦云,“廓然空寂, 無有聖人.” 時, 秦皇持此語, 問肇法師,“此語大甚徑庭, 不近人情. 若無聖人, 知無者誰?” 法師奉詔云,“實如明詔聖諦.[508] 若無聖人, 誰與道遊?” 知無者誰, 則姚秦之時所論, 當時所論對辯耶? 碧巖云,“武帝被袈裟, 自講放光般若, 感得天花亂墜, 地變黃金, 辦道奉佛, 詔天下起寺度僧, 依教修行, 時人謂之佛心天子. 又帝與婁約法師·傅大士·昭明太子, 持論眞俗二諦云, ‘眞諦以明非有, 俗諦以明非無, 眞俗不二處, 是第一義諦.’ 此是教家極妙窮玄處, 帝拈此極則處, 問達摩, ‘如何是聖諦第一義?’ ” 則當時極論故問也. 廓然無聖語, 則姚秦之時所論一般意, 則逈異不同也. 浮山遠云,“第一義諦, 諸家所論, 或一或三. 若依達摩所道廓然無聖, 又道不識, 則何關三一! 而論直指心源, 本來無物, 凡聖無殊, 亘古亘今, 無斷無滅.” 又碧巖云,“天下衲僧跳不出, 達摩與他一刀兩斷, 如今多少人錯會也.” 然則莫錯會好. 對朕者誰者, 萬松云,“鼻孔裏認邪.” [509] 不識者, 廓然無聖一般, 爲人須爲徹. 帝不契者, 方木不入圓竅. 渡江至魏者, 不値知音, 自今已後, 知人意深[510] 入, 蘆花不點頭<詠鷺詩>. 誌公云, 闔國人去, 他亦不迴者, 非唯知他不來, 廓然無聖不識處消息, 重爲他分拆. 誌公, 生宋太始初, 入滅於天鑑十三年. 誌公滅後十三年, 達摩始來, 達摩同時, 何也? 新羅利貞大德碑銘云,“誌公, 於楊州開善寺<在新羅>, 或一月或一年來, 坐對利貞.” 見之則聖人出沒難定也.

Xuedou Chongxian's verse

The noble truth is unrestricted,
How could it be discerned?
Who is it that faces me?
And he says, "I don't know him,"
Because of this he crossed the river in the dark,

---

508 In deference to the emperor, the *Zhao lun* repeats the phrase "it is just as the brilliant imperial order says" (Ch. *shi ru mingzhao* 實如明詔). The *Zhao lun* does not contain the term "noble truth" (Ch. *shengdi* 聖諦). I have therefore chosen not to include the latter in my translation above.

509 Here, I substitute *ya* 牙 for *xie* 邪; see the capping phrase in *Congrong lu* (T 2004.48.228b13).

510 Here, I substitute *xiao* 笑 for *shen* 深.

How could he avoid the brambles?
Everyone in the country can chase after him but he will not come back,
Vainly and continuously recollecting for a thousand or ten thousand years,
Stop the continuous recollecting!
When a clear wind circles the earth what limit could it have?
The master looked right and left and said, "Are there any patriarchs here?"
The master himself said, "There is. Call him here and have him wash my feet."

雪竇顯頌, "聖諦廓然, 何當辨的? 對問[511] 者誰, 還云不識. 因玆暗渡江, 豈免生深棘! 闔國人追不再來, 千古萬古空相憶. 休相憶! 淸風匝地有何極!" 師顧視左右云, "者裏還有祖師麼?" 自云, "有! 喚來與老僧洗脚."

[Explanation]
Xuedou: *The noble truth is unrestricted … continuous recollecting*: this is a profound clarification of the unrestricted nature of the noble truths and also the intention behind the words *I don't know him*. Hence, *When a clear wind circles the earth what limit could it have?*

Are there *any patriarchs here etcetera*: even if you have a pair of eyes, you still wouldn't understand. This is the intention behind Yunju's "only the king of Liang was a hero" below.

雪竇: 聖諦至相憶者, 深明聖諦廓然, 又道不識之意. 然則淸風有何極? 這裏還有祖師麼云云者, 若也着得眼睛, 便不是了也. 下雲居, 只有梁王是丈夫之意.

Dahong Baoen's verse[512]

511 I substitute *zhen* 朕 for *wen* 問.

512 For the full account, see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 207651..220b05). As noted by Philip Yampolsky, the story of Bodhidharma and his shoe first appears in the *Chuan fabao ji* 傳法寶紀 and also appears in the *Shenhui yulu* 神會語錄 and *Lidai fabao ji* 歷代法寶記; see Yampolsky, *The Platform Sūtra of the*

The noble truth is unrestricted
How could it be determined?
A perfect fit here and a perfect fit there,
In a hundred trillion ways,
A single phrase has been deceivingly transmitted from one generation to the next,
For nine years he vainly faced a wall,
When the excitement was gone he reminisced about the old days of roaming,
In the dark he picked up a shoe and returned to the Western region.
Put the straw shoe on tight![513]

> 大洪恩頌, "聖諦廓然, 如何辨識? 築著磕著! 百千萬億, 一句謾相傳, 九年空面壁. 興盡還思舊日遊, 暗携隻履歸西國. 緊悄[514] 草鞋."

Yunju Liaoyuan's[515] verse

Tsk, tsk. You blue-eyed barbarian from the West!
So many plans behind (your words) unrestricted and not noble,
Sitting up straight for nine years until the fishing lamp has been exhausted,
Only the king of Liang was a hero.[516]

Sixth Patriarch, p. 41. According to the story, a single straw sandal was found in his tomb, a motif drawn from the Daoist immortals. Later, the Northern Wei emissary Song Yun supposedly encountered Bodhidharma in the Pamir Mountains. Bodhidharma was wearing only one sandal.

513 This is an oft-used phrase in Chan literature. For instance, see *Fayan chanshi yulu* (T 1995.47.655a10), *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.840b1), *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.345b12–13, 392b2, 423b15–16) and *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.830a7). The straw shoe is an important Chan symbol of a monk who goes on pilgrimage in search of the Dharma.

514 I substitute *qiao* 峭 for *qiao* 悄.

515 For Jinshan Liaoyuan, see note 222 above.

516 Here I substitute *zhi* 只 for *ren* 人. See the comments on Xuedou's verse below.

雲居元頌, "咄咄西來碧眼胡! 廓然無聖更多圖. 九年端坐撈籠盡, 人有梁王是丈夫."

Jianfu Benyi's verse[517]

Unrestricted—an arrow flies far in sky,
I don't know him—repeatedly thrusting an awl down,
The emperor of Liang is not aware of where he went,
For a thousand years or ten thousand years there are no revealed facts.

薦福逸頌, "廓然一鏃遼空, 不識重下錐剌. 梁帝不知何處去, 千古萬古無消息."

Fazhen Shouyi's verse

To test his skill (Bodhidharma) raised (a gongan) right in front of his face,
Emperor Wu of Liang still seems a bit confused,
With a shoe he heads back,
And returns through the Pamir Mountains to the West.

法眞一頌, "當機覿面提, 梁武尚猶迷. 隻履空歸去, 還從葱嶺西."

Tiantong Zhengjue's verse[518]

Unrestricted and not noble,

---

517 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.65b3–4).

518 For this verse, see also the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.18c8–11).

The opponent's skill was wild and wide of the mark,[519]
Attainment is like the swinging of a hatchet without hurting the nose,[520]
Loss is like dropping a cauldron and not looking back,[521]
All alone, he coolly sat in meditation at Shaolin,[522]
Quietly he put the true command into motion in full force,
The clear moon in autumn rotates like a wheel of frost,
The Milky Way is fresh and the big dipper lowers its handle into the night,
Continuously the robes and bowls are entrusted to descendants,[523]
From this medicine and illness formed among men and gods.

> 天童覺頌, "廓然無聖, 來機徑廷. 得非犯鼻而揮斤, 失不迴頭而墮甑. 寥寥冷坐小林, 默默全提正令. 秋清月轉霜輪, 河淡斗垂夜柄. 繩繩衣鉢付兒孫, 從此人天成藥病."

Baoning Renyong's verse[524]

Roast until its red and hit with the mallet,
In circles countless sparks fly,

519 For "Wild and wide of the mark" see note 494 above.

520 This is a reference to the famous story of a plasterer who had a carpenter take off mud that he smeared on his nose with a hatchet in the *Zhuangzi;* see Burton Watson, *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu*, p. 269. The story serves as an allegory for the coming together of two cool, talented people.

521 This is a reference to the famous story of Meng Min 孟敏 who dropped a cauldron and did not look back. When asked why he didn't look back, Meng is known to have said, "The cauldron has shattered, so what use is there in looking back?" See Meng Min's biography in the *Hou Han shu* 68.2229.

522 See the *Song gaoseng zhuan* (T 2061.50.789c8–9).

523 For a discussion of the robe and bowl as symbols of transmission, see Adamek, *The Mystique of Transmission*, pp. 128–189.

524 For this verse, see also the *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.382a7–8).

A perfectly formed, fine *vajra* auger,
Who will you sell it to by hanging it in front of the door?

> 保寧勇頌, "燒得通紅打一鎚, 周遭無數火星飛. 十成好箇金剛鑽, 攤向門前賣與誰?"

Zhaxi Ruyi's verse[525]

The ultimate truth!
Vast and lonesome, it transcends the *Di* of schemata,[526]
For many years I haven't looked at a calendar,
How could I determine the spring equinox and summer solstice?
The white crane of Liaodong is gone and left no trace,[527]
The Three Mountains[528] vainly fall beyond the blue skies.

> 霅溪益頌, "第一義! 廓兮寥兮超象帝. 不把多年曆日看, 爭辨春分幷夏至? 遼東白鶴去無蹤, 三山空落青天外."

Chengtian Huai's verse

The bodhisattva from southern India with blue eyes,

---

525 For this verse, see also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.65b13–15).

526 The Di of schemata (*xiangdi* 象帝) is from the *Laozi*, stanza 4. Traditional commentaries do not necessarily read the two characters together; see Moss Roberts trans., *Dao de jing: The Book of the Way* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001), p. 195. *Di* is the name of the supreme deity in Heaven.

527 This is a story that can be found in Tao Qian's 陶潛 (365–427) *Sou shen houji* 搜神後記 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1981), p. 1. The white crane of Liaodong refers to Ding Lingwei 丁令威 who became a transcendent (*xian* 仙) and returned to home in Liaodong a thousand years later as a white crane. A boy tried to shoot him down, so he flew away.

528 The three mountains refer to Mt. Penglai 蓬萊山, Fangzhang 方丈山, and Yingzhou 瀛洲山. These mountains are associated with immortals or transcendents.

The wise sovereign of the lands of Liang has a pair of bright eyes,
Where the words "I don't know him" and "unrestricted" are of no use,
Leaving behind lonely footprints he shamefully left the western capital (Chang'an).

承天懷頌, "南天大士雙眸碧, 梁土賢王隻眼明. 不識廓然無用處, 孤蹤慚愧過西京."

Fojian Huiqin's verse[529]

Just as you begin to hear the sound of the bell in the pavilion,
The sun's warmth puts the dark blue dragon into a deep sleep,[530]
The drum atop the phoenix platform is again struck,[531]
The auspicious *luan* simurgh has yet to flutter in the middle of the night,
The emperor's foundation is as firm as a boulder,
The barbarian monk exhausted a lifetime's worth of energy,
Pointing to Shaolin from afar, he redirected his footsteps,
Where the spring winds pass by flowers lie scattered about.

佛鑑勤頌, "始聞[532] 樓閣一聲鐘, 日煖[533] 蒼龍睡正濃. 再擊鳳凰臺上鼓, 夜半祥鸞未飛舞. 帝基永[534] 固如磐石, 胡僧費盡[535] 平生力. 遙指小林歸

[529] A different version of this verse can be found in the *Wujia zhengzong zan* 五家正宗贊 (XZJ 135.944b11–13).

[530] The dark blue dragon may be referring to Emperor Wu of Liang.

[531] The Phoenix Platform refers to the palace where Emperor Wu of Liang and Bodhidharma exchanged questions and answers.

[532] The *Wujia zhengzong zan* version has *ming* 鳴 for *wen* 聞. The line would thus read: "Just as the sound of the bell in the pavilion begins to ring."

[533] The *Wujia zhengzong zan* version has *wu* 午 for *nuan* 煖. Here, I follow the *Seonmun yeomsong* version.

[534] The *Wujia zhengzong zan* version has *gong* 鞏 for *yong* 永. Here, I follow the *Seonmun yeomsong* version.

去來, 春風一徑花狼藉."

Hunchengzi's verse

There are few who believe in "unrestricted and not noble,"
The repetition of "I don't know him" made them lose their great opportunity,
The unjust suffering of sitting in front of a wall for nine years reached its extreme,
How could you take a shoe and return west?

混成子頌, "廓然無聖信人稀, 不識重敎失大機. 面壁九年寃苦極, 那堪隻履又西歸?"

Jiangshan Faquan[536] added a comment, "It's obvious that this fool doesn't know him. Speak! Is it the guest who does not know or the host who does not know? Even if they were to discern each other clearly their noses would be in the palm of my hands."

蔣山泉拈, "灼然, 者漢不識! 且道. 賓家不識, 主家不識? 直饒辨得分明, 鼻孔在我手裏."

[Explanation]

Jiangshan: *It's obvious that this fool doesn't know him*: all the buddhas of the three times and the successive generations of patriarchs couldn't even take a peep at this logic. It's obvious that Bodhidharma didn't know him.

Speak … not know: the guest is Emperor Wu and the host is Bodhidharma. This means that there is nothing beyond one's endowment, not to mention

---

535 The *Wujia zhengzong zan* version has *wangfei* 枉費 for *feijin* 費盡.

536 This refers to Nanming Faquan, see note 292 above.

the endowment of guest and host.

Even if they were to discern each other clearly etcetera: even if you were able to clearly discern this revealed fact you wouldn't be able to lift your legs and go. Therefore it is said, t*heir noses would be in the palm of my hands*. The spiritual state of being able to see clearly is (symbolized by) the nose.

蔣山: 灼然這漢不識者, 到這裏, 三世諸佛, 歷代祖師, 窺覰不得故, 達摩灼然不識也. 且道至不識者, 賓家則武帝, 主家則達摩也. 非但主家分上, 賓家分上, 亦沒分外也. 直饒辨得云云者, 直饒分明辨得如是消息, 擡脚不起. 故云鼻孔在我手裏. 見得分明處, 是鼻孔.

Huanglong Sixin raised this story and asked a monk,[537] "There is clearly something right in front of Bodhidharma's face. What is the logic behind saying 'I don't know him?'" The monk said, "I don't know him." The master picked up his whisk and said, "Bodhidharma is right here."

黃龍心, 擧此話, 問僧, "分明有箇達磨面前, 作麽生說箇不識底道理?" 僧曰, "不識." 師拈起拂子曰, "達磨在者裏."

[Explanation]

Huanglong: *Huanglong … the logic behind saying "I don't know him?"*: if this matter was clearly right in front of Bodhidharma's face then what is the logic behind saying *I don't know him?*

The monk said, "I don't know him": all the buddhas of the three times would not know either.

The master picked up his whisk etcetera: this means that there can be nothing besides this single whisk. He simply destroyed this monk's sickness of rushing[538] into the empty and distant.

---

537 For this comment, see also the *Baojue Zuxin chanshi yulu* 寶覺祖心禪師語錄 (second part of the *Huanglong sijia lu* 黃龍四家錄; XZJ 120.235a14–16).

538 Here I substitute *wu* 騖 for *wu* 鶩.

黃龍云云至道理者, 若是此事, 分明在達摩面前, 如何說箇不識地道理? 僧曰不識者, 三世諸佛亦不識. 拈起拂子云云者, 不可離却一條拂子, 別有在處, 但破這僧鶩於虛遠之病.

Baiyun Fayan[539] ascended the hall and raised this story up to *I don't know* and then he raised,[540] "Huangmei's[541] purport … I don't understand the Buddha dharma."[542] The master said, "Of all people! The patriarchs, when asked, they just say 'I don't know him' or 'I don't understand.' How did their descendants spread all over the earth?" And he thereupon said, "One person transmits the false and everyone transmits the real."[543]

白雲演, 上堂, 擧此話, 至不識, 連擧黃梅意旨, 至不會佛法, 師云, "大小大, 祖師! 問着底, 便是不識不會, 爲什麽却兒孫遍地?" 乃云, "一人傳虛, 萬人傳實."

[Explanation]

Baiyun: Of all people! The patriarchs … spread all over the earth: as soon as they are asked they just say "I don't know him" or "I don't understand." There is, then, nothing transmitted and nothing received. Why do they have descendants?

One person transmits the false and everyone transmits the real: "I don't know him" and "I don't understand" are instances of one person transmitting the false and "their descendants are spread everywhere" is an instance of

539 Baiyun or Wuzu Fayan studied under Huilin Zongben, Fushan Fayuan 浮山法遠 (991–1067), and Baiyun Shouduan. Fayan eventually became Baiyun Shouduan's dharma heir. He first served as abbot of a temple on Mt. Simian 四面山 in Anhui province and then at Taiping si. He subsequently became the abbot of Haihui chanyuan on Mt. Baiyun in Anhui province. Later, he moved to Mt. Wuzu 五祖 in Hubei province.

540 For this sermon, see also *Fayan chanshi yulu* (T 1995.47.650c4–8).

541 Huangmei refers to the fifth patriarch Hongren 弘忍 (601–674).

542 *Platform Sūtra* (T 2008.48.358a10–12).

543 From *Jingde chuandeng lu*, "Biography of Longhua Lingzhao," cited in Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 23a–b.

everyone transmitting the real. In terms of their meaning "I don't know him" and "I don't understand" were said in response to "I know" and "I understand." This is like a numinous turtle that wags its tail to wipe away its footsteps but ends up leaving a trace.[544]

白雲: 大小大祖師, 至遍地者, 旣是才問着, 便道不識不會, 則是無傳無受, 爲什麽却有兒孫. 一人傳虛, 萬人傳實者, 不識不會, 是一人傳虛;兒孫遍地, 是萬人傳實. 則義謂不識不會, 猶是對識得會得云也. 如靈龜曳尾, 拂迹成痕.

Fojian Huiqin ascended the hall and raised, *When Bodhidharma first had an audience with Emperor Wu the emperor asked, "What is the ultimate meaning of the noble truths?" … Master Baozhi said, "This is the bodhisattva Guanyin who transmitted the Buddha's mind seal to help the Buddha proselytize."*[545] The master said, "Paint it but it cannot be painted. Model it in clay but it cannot be modeled. Why did it not sit well with Emperor Wu and why did Bodhidharma cross the river? Do you understand? Emperor Wu did not understand Bodhidharma's barbarian tongue and Bodhidharma didn't comprehend the emperor's Chinese, so they saw each other face-to-face but were as far apart as Hu and Yue.[546] Although master Baozhi was skilled at translation, it's as if he suppressed the commoners and turned them into low castes, so he painted a tiger but ended up with a wild cat. Although this is the case, how will all of you see Bodhidharma? If you are able to see him face-to-face, then you'll know that what I am saying now is in part Chinese and in part barbarian tongue. If this is not the case, where the white clouds are cut off are the green mountains and the pilgrim walks beyond the green mountains."

佛鑑勤, 上堂, 擧, 達磨初見武帝, 帝問, '如何是聖諦第一義?' 至誌公云, '此是觀音大士, 傳佛心印, 助佛揚化.' 師云, "畫也畫不成, 塑也塑不就. 因何武帝不契,

544 Cf. *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.209c10).

545 The last few words do not appear in the *gongan*.

546 *Hu* refers to the barbarians in the north and Yue to a region in the south.

達磨渡江? 會麽? 盖武帝不會達磨梵語, 達磨不曉武帝唐言, 致見覿面胡越. 誌公雖善翻譯, 剛然壓良爲賤, 致見畫虎成狸. 雖然如是, 諸人向什麽處見達磨? 若也當面見得, 方知道山僧如今, 一邊唐言, 一邊梵語. 如或未然, 白雲斷處是青山, 行人更在青山外."

[Explanation]

Fojian: *Paint it but it cannot be painted*: this applies to Bodhidharma.

Model it in clay but it cannot be modeled: this applies to Emperor Wu of Liang. The text below clarifies this.

Bodhidharma's barbarian tongue is none other than *unrestricted and not noble*. To not know the *unrestricted and not noble* is what is meant by *paint it but it cannot be painted*. But to just know the *unrestricted and not noble is* to not comprehend *Bodhidharma's barbarian tongue*.

Emperor Wu's Chinese is referring to none other than *Who is facing me?* To not know *who is facing me* is what is meant by *model it in clay but it cannot be modeled*. But to just know *who is facing me* is to not understand *Emperor Wu's Chinese*. Therefore they *saw each other face-to-face but were as far apart as Hu and Yue*.

Although master Baozhi was skilled at translation etcetera: t*his is the bodhisattva Guanyin who transmitted the Buddha's mind seal and help the Buddha proselytize* is the translation of Bodhidharma's *unrestricted and not noble*. Although master Baozhi translated it this way, he implicated Bodhidharma by splitting the story in two. His words make it seem as if Emperor Wu originally didn't comprehend Chinese, but he has now come to comprehend it. This leads us to the conclusion that Emperor Wu does not comprehend Chinese. Therefore it is said, *he suppressed the commoners and turned them into low castes*. This is precisely what is meant by *he painted a tiger but ended up with a wild cat*.

If you are able to see him face-to-face: if you were to see him from the perspective of the person who is facing him and were thus able to see (what is meant by) *model it in clay but it cannot be modeled*, then what need would there be to see Bodhidharma from the perspective of the *unrestricted and not noble?*

I … in the barbarian tongue: Chinese here is none other than *who is facing me* and nothing else. Barbarian tongue here is none other than *unrestricted and not noble* and nothing else. Chinese and the barbarian tongue are both *I*. In the former part, he raised the barbarian tongue first and Chinese second. In the latter part, he raised Chinese first and the barbarian tongue second. This is reasonable.

佛鑑: 畫也畫不成者, 屬達摩邊也. 塑也塑不就者, 屬武帝邊也. 下文明之. 達摩梵語, 即廓然無聖. 是不知廓然無聖, 是畫也畫不成. 只知廓然無聖, 是不曉是達摩梵語. 武帝唐言, 即對朕者誰. 是不知對朕者誰, 是塑也塑不就. 只知對朕者誰, 是不會是武帝唐言也. 故對面成胡越也. 誌公雖善飜譯云云者, 觀音大士, 傳佛心印, 助佛揚化, 是飜譯達摩廓然無聖也. 誌公雖然伊麽飜譯, 累他達摩, 話作兩橛. 其言似武帝本不曉唐言, 而今始令曉, 是達他武帝不曉唐言, 故云, 壓良爲賤也. 則此謂畫虎成狸也. 當面見得者, 若也向對朕地, 見得塑也塑不就地消息, 何必向廓然無聖處, 見得爲達摩也. 山僧至梵語者, 唐言卽對朕者誰, 此外無餘也, 梵語卽廓然無聖, 此外無餘也. 然則唐言梵語, 一一是山僧也. 前頭, 則先擧梵語, 而後擧唐言;後頭, 則先擧唐言, 而後擧梵語, 亦有攸當.

Changlu Tanfen[547] ascended the hall and said,[548] "Bodhidharma had an audience with the sovereign of Liang who asked him about the noble truths. All he said was 'I don't know him.' When the sixth patriarch had an audience with Huangmei[549] and was entrusted the robes and the bowls all he said was 'I don't understand.' All the old reverends under Heaven simply take this 'I don't know him' and 'I don't understand' and test the patch-robed monks. All the patch-robed monks under Heaven have their eyes transformed and noses threaded by this 'I don't know him' and 'I don't understand.' If you think you know or understand what I am saying, then this will transform your eyes and thread your noses. How should one say the phrase that frees oneself? If you

547 For Changlu or Xinwen Tanfen, see note 387 above.

548 There is a slightly different version of this sermon in the *Xu guzunsu yuyao* (XZJ 119.60a14–b1).

549 This refers to the fifth patriarch Hongren 弘忍 (601–674).

have high fame there is no need to engrave your name in solid stone, for the mouths of passersby are a stele."

長蘆賾, 上堂云, "達磨, 見梁王問聖諦, 只道得箇不識; 六祖, 見黃梅付衣鉢, 只道得箇不會. 天下老和尚, 秖將者不識不會, 勘驗衲僧; 天下衲僧, 被者不識不會, 換却眼睛, 穿却鼻孔. 長蘆伊麽道, 是識了也, 是會了也, 是被換却眼睛, 穿却鼻孔了也. 如何道得出身一句? 名高不用鐫頑石, 路上行人口是碑."

[Explanation]

Changlu: *All the old reverends under Heaven … the patch-robed monks*: this is because all the patch-robed monks under Heaven have not yet reached this level of understanding.

What I just said … thread your noses: if you arrive at the level of understanding of "I don't know him" and "I don't understand," then this is to know and understand. Your noses will then be threaded and your eyes will be transformed.

If you have high fame there is no need to etcetera: to not know him or understand is to have high fame. What need is there to further engrave it in solid stone and establish a separate logic?

長蘆: 天下老和尚, 至衲僧者, 天下衲僧, 不敢到此見解故. 長蘆伊麽, 至鼻孔了也者, 又作不識不會見解, 是識了也, 會了也, 則被它穿却鼻孔, 換却眼睛也. 名高不用云云者, 不識不會是名高, 何必更鐫頑石, 別作箇道理.

Mingjiao Qisong's *Zhendi wusheng lun* says,[550] "What is the absolute truth? It refers to the extremely wonderful realm of the ultimate (絶對). What is a noble one? It refers to divinely wise, conditioned action (有爲). Conditioned action is another word for the expedient. The ultimate is another way of arriving at the real. There is the real because the mind is

---

550 *Zhendi wusheng lun* 眞諦無聖論 or *Treatise on the Absolute Truth is Not Noble* can be found in a collection of Qisong 契嵩 (1007–1072) writings, the *Tanjin wenji* 鐔津文集 (T 2115.52.664b11–664c12).

complete and the traces of the expedient have been washed away. There is the expedient because it collects the branches and returns them to the root. How could hesitation between the two be allowed? It casually tries fables to clarify its profundity. Absolute truth is the original mind of the myriad beings. It is the reality limit (實際) of the many sages. It is thusness, not thusness, and not not-thusness. It hides the myriad minds and yet it is not dark. It manifests noble wisdom and yet is not flashy. Its divine brilliance cannot be measured and its complicated reasoning cannot be exhausted. Therefore the *Pore jing* says, 'The absolute truth has no becoming and no attainment.'[551] If we are to speak of its essence and how it exists, it is pure and unrestricted. In it the distinction between sages and ordinary beings has been wiped out. If we are to speak of its illumination and how it functions, it is completely twisted around the ten thousand things of existence. In it the myriad things move with the drumming and dancing. Therefore, essence and being are like its root. Illumination and function are like its branches. When the mind is in harmonious union with the root it is pure. The noble one is cut off and wisdom abandoned.[552] This is still appropriate.

That which is called the ultimate truth is unrestricted, empty, and serene. There are no noble ones. How, then, could one be mistaken about it? And yet a person from Qin thought, "How incredibly remote and inapproachable to the human intellect! If there are no noble ones who is it that knows that there aren't any?"[553] Even this does not yet tell its subtle purport. The perceptions of ordinary beings and noble ones are but shadows and echoes of the absolute truth and the cognized objects of a deluded mind. If they are shadows and echoes, then one is bogged down in names and numerical categories. If they are cognized objects, then one is besotted with discriminations. Therefore, one is not noble and yet noble, and a noble one

---

551 The *Zhao lun* (T 1858.45.152b11) also attributes this quote to the *Fangguang bore jing*. There is no exact match in any of the existing perfection of wisdom scriptures.

552 *Laozi*, stanza 19.

553 See the explanation of the gongan below.

is therefore a great noble. One does not know and yet knows, so his true knowing therefore becomes a universal knowing. A person from the past asked another from the past, "What is the ultimate truth?" In reply he said, "Unrestricted and not noble." The questioner also said, "Who is facing me?" In reply he said, "I don't know him." However, this person was not in the dark about the noble one and yet maintained that he did not know him. This is because he did not wish people to use formed words to seek the absolute truth. And yet because the questioner was not yet awakened, he said what he said. Like a notch on the side of the boat that was marked to locate the sword that was thrown overboard, it becomes all the more distant.[554] A finger points at the moon and what that finger is pointing to is in the moon.[555] Words are used to represent the Way and what the words are trying to represent is in the Way. If you gaze at the words and not at its Way, then you do not know the Way. If you look at the finger and not at the moon, then you do not know the moon. Therefore a perfected being always has a wondrous awakening in the exterior surface of words and schemata and only has attainment on the outside of the physical body. Vimalakīrti revealed with silence and Mañjuśrī praised him.[556] Kongsheng ("Born of Emptiness"; i.e., Subhūti) preached without preaching and Indra heard without hearing.[557] Is this not so?

嵩明教, 眞諦無聖論云,"眞諦者何? 極妙絶對之謂也. 聖人者何? 神智有爲之謂也. 有爲則以言乎權, 絶對則以詣乎實. 實之所以, 全心而泯迹;權之所以, 攝末而趍本. 然則眞諦也者, 豈容擬議於其間哉! 聊試寓言, 以明其蘊耳. 夫眞諦

554 The locus classicus for this story is the *Lüshi chunqiu;* see Knoblock and Riegel, *The Annals of Lü Buwei*, pp. 370–371.

555 This analogy appears in the *Zuochan sanmei jing* 坐禅三昧經 (T 614.15.284a10–11). We also find a reference to this analogy in the *Dazhidu lun* (T 1509.25.125b2–5, 726a3, and esp. 375A23–28), the translation of which was completed in 405. See also the reference in the *Shoulengyan jing* 首楞嚴經 (T 945.19.111a8–13).

556 See Burton Watson trans., *The Vimalakirti Sūtra*, p. 110.

557 See *Fomu chusheng bore boluomi jing* 佛母出生 三法藏般若波羅蜜多經 (T 228.8.593b17–24).

者, 群生之元心也, 衆聖之實際也, 如也非如也, 非非如也. 隱群心而不昧, 現聖智而不曜, 神明不能測, 巧曆不能窮. 故般若曰, '第一眞諦, 無成無得.' 言其體而存之, 則清淨空廓, 聖凡泯然;言其照而用之, 則彌綸萬有, 鼓舞群動. 然則體而存之, 若其本乎;照而用之, 似其末乎. 當其心冥於至本也, 黙乎清淨, 而絶聖棄智, 是亦宜爾. 所謂第一義諦, 廓然空寂, 無有聖人, 孰爲謬乎! 而秦人以爲, '大甚徑廷, 不近人情. 若無聖人, 而知無者誰歟?' 是亦未諭其微旨也. 若夫凡聖知覺者, 眞諦之影響, 妄心之攀緣耳. 存乎影響, 則凝滯於名數;以乎攀緣, 則眩惑於分別. 是則非聖而聖, 而聖人所以大聖, 無知而知, 其眞知所以遍知. 昔人有問於昔人曰, '云何是第一義諦?' 應曰, '廓然無聖.' 問者或曰, '對朕者誰?' 應曰, '不識.' 然斯人也, 非昧聖而固不識也, 盖不欲人以形言, 而求乎眞諦者也. 而問人不悟, 乃復云云. 刻舟求劒, 遠亦遠矣. 以指標月, 其指所以在月; 以言喻道, 其言所以在道. 顧言而不顧其道, 非知道也;視指而不視其月, 非識月也. 所以至人, 常妙悟於言象之表, 而獨得于形骸之外. 淨名黙示, 而文殊稱善;空生以無說而說, 天帝以無聞而聞, 不其然乎!"

The *Linjian lu* says,[558] "Lecturers in Wu[559] often mockingly boasted that there is no one who could interpret the transmission verses of the various patriarchs. A man of Chan debated with them but lost his point and gave them enough reason to heavily ridicule him. Chan master Daguan Tanying[560] referred to this and said, 'This is what the Bodhidharma said for the second patriarch. What need is there for a person to interpret it? This is just like

558 See *Linjian lu* 林間錄 (XZJ 148.594a13–18).

559 Wu 吳 refers to an area in Jiangsu province.

560 Daguan Tanying 達觀曇穎 (989–1060). Juefan Huihong, the author of the *Linjian lu*, showed great interest in Daguan and especially in the latter's collection of the teachings of the so-called five houses of Chan known as the *Wujia zongpai* 五家宗派; for instance, see the *Linjian lu* (XZJ 148.592a9 and 646a3–4). Daguan's motivation for compiling this collection may have something to do with his decision to change lineage affiliation mid-career. Daguan had first studied under Chan master Dayang Jingxuan 大陽警玄 (943–1027) but later became a dharma heir of Chan master Guyin Wencong 谷隱蘊聰 (965–1032), who belonged to a different Chan lineage; see Daguan's entry in the *Chanlin sengbao zhuan* (XZJ 137.548b5–550a3) and the *Jianzhong Jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.84a6–85b2).

the time when Emperor Wu of Liang first saw him and asked, 'What is the ultimate meaning of the noble truths?' He said, 'Unrestricted and not noble.' The emperor said, 'Who is facing me?' The patriarch said, 'I don't know him.' Had Bodhidharma not been proficient in our language, how could he have done that at that time?' The lecturers did not dare say another word."

林問錄云, "吳中講師, 多譏諸祖傳法偈無譯人, 禪者與之辯失其眞, 適足以重其謗. 達觀穎禪師, 諭之曰, '此, 達磨爲二祖言者也, 何須譯人耶? 如梁武帝初見之, 卽問, 「如何是聖諦第一義?」 答曰, 「廓然無聖.」 進云, 「對朕者誰?」 又曰, 「不識.」 使達磨不通方言, 則何於是時, 便能爾耶?' 講師不敢復有辭."

Case 108.

The Fourth Patriarch's Liberation Teaching

四祖解脫

[Old Case]

The fourth patriarch Daoxin asked the third patriarch, "I beseech your reverence to show compassion and beg you to give me liberation teaching." The third patriarch said, "Who has bound you?" The fourth patriarch said, "No one has bound me." The third patriarch said, "Why then further seek liberation?" At these words the fourth patriarch had a great awakening.[561]

四祖信大師問三祖曰, "願和尚慈悲, 乞與解脫法門." 三祖曰, "誰縛汝?" 四祖曰, "無人縛." 三祖曰, "何更求解脫乎?" 四祖於言下大悟.

[Explanation of the gongan]

There are two types of liberation, (1) transcending impurities and (2) self-nature.[562]

Who has bound you: the binding is the binding of the mind and liberation is the liberation of the mind. Binding and liberation are both from the mind and does not concern any other source.

561 Different versions of this story can be found in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.221c19–21); *Fozu lidai tongzai* 佛祖歷代通載 (T 2036.49.562a28–b2); *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* (XZJ 135.642b15–18); *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.42a17–18).

562 Liberation through the transcendence of impurities is mentioned in the *Lotus Sūtra* (T 263.9.68a16) and *Huayan jing* (T 278.9.414b7). Liberation through self-nature is mentioned in the *Laṅkāvatāra Sūtra* (T 670.16.499b1).

No one has bound me: this means he is originally pure and originally liberated. This, in other words, is self-nature liberation. Therefore it is said, *Why then further seek liberation?*

At these words he had a great awakening: does this mean that he was immediately (即) liberated and understood or that he transcended (離) liberation and understood? The Dharma master Bianzhen said, "In the mundane this is called binding and in the Way this is called liberation."[563] Mu'uija's (Jin'gak Hysim) verse reads, "You can bind the wind and catch the sky, but who can bind this one thing?"[564] The Sengcan chapter reads, "In the *renzi* year, twelfth year of the Kaihuang era of the Sui (592), the *śrāmaṇera* Daoxin, then fourteen years old, came and paid his respects" etcetera.[565] Yunju's verse reads, "Even if he didn't receive the edict of Emperor Wenhuang, he still was a man from Guangji of Qizhou."[566] The *Jingde chuandeng lu* reads, "In the *guimao* year of the Zhenguan era (643) Emperor Wenhuang revered the master for (having experienced) a taste of the Dharma wished to take a look at his awe-inspiring mien, so he decreed that the master come and serve as the state preceptor. The master submitted a memorial and politely declined the invitation. They corresponded back and forth three times, but in the end, citing illness, he declined. On the fourth attempt he issued an order to the envoy, 'If he does not stand, then bring me his head.' The envoy arrived at the mountain and conveyed the imperial order. With a stern face the master pulled out his neck and touched it to the blade. The envoy considered this exceptional and returned and informed the

---

563 *Guang hongming ji* 廣弘明集 (T 2103.52.317a29).

564 *Jin'gak guksa eorok* (HBJ 6:49a15). The "one thing" was a topic in later versions of the *Platform Sutra,* such as the vulgate edition: "The master said, 'What thing comes in this way?' 'If you speak of it as one thing you do not hit the mark.'" (T 2008.48.357b21). See also the first lines of Hyujeong's Seonga gwigam in the Hyujeong volume in this series.

565 *See Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.221c18–19).

566 Source unknown.

emperor of this in a letter … "[567] The master's family name was Sima. For generation they dwelled in Henei[568] but later moved to Guangji county in Qizhou.

解脫有二種, 離垢自性. 誰縛者, 縛從心縛, 解從心解, 解縛由心, 不管餘處. 無仁[569] 縛者, 元清淨本解脫, 即自性解脫. 故云何更求解脫. 言下大悟者, 即解脫而會耶? 離解脫而會耶? 辨眞法師云, '在俗謂之縛, 在道謂之脫也.' 無衣子頌云, '風可繫空可捉, 此一物誰能縛?' 僧璨篇云, '隋開皇十二年壬子歲, 沙彌道信, 年始十四, 來禮' 云云. 雲居頌云, '直饒不受文皇詔, 也是蘄州廣濟人.' 傳燈云, '貞觀癸卯歲, 太宗文皇帝, 嚮師法味, 欲瞻風彩, 詔赴京師, 師上表遜謝. 前後三返, 竟以疾辭. 第四度命使曰,「果然不起, 即取首來.」使至山諭旨, 師乃引頸就刃, 神色儼然. 使異之回, 以狀聞, 帝云云.' 師姓司馬氏, 世居河內, 後徙蘄州廣濟縣.

Yunju Liaoyuan's verse

No binding—how clear is the liberated self!
On the hills of the Western Mountain a single flower announces the arrival of spring,
Even if he didn't receive the edict from Wenhuang,[570]
He still was a man from Guangji of Qizhou.[571]

雲居元頌, "無縛明明解脫身! 西山堆裏一花春. 直饒不受文皇詔, 也是蘄州廣濟人."

---

[567] *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.223b23–27).

[568] This refers to an area in Henan province.

[569] Here I substitute *ren* 人 for *ren* 仁.

[570] Wenhuang 文皇 refers to Taizong 太宗 (r. 626–649) of the Tang.

[571] This is the name of an area in Hubei province.

[Explanation]

Yunju: *No binding—how clear is the liberated self … a single flower announces the arrival of spring*: this means a single flower announces the arrival of boundless spring and a single drop contains the great sea. In other words, beyond the liberation of no binding what else could there be?

Even if he didn't receive the edict from Wenhuang etcetera: this means that even if you are said to have transcended the Dharma body of Vairocana you do not transcend this revealed fact.

雲居: 無縛明明至一花春者, 一花無邊春, 一滴大海水, 則無縛解脫外, 更有什麽? 直饒不受文皇詔云云者, 雖曰超毘盧越法身也, 不離這箇消息.

Tianning Xuzhao's verse[572]

Setting his mind on seeking liberation,
Who has bound you?
Up to this very moment,
Monks everywhere make this mistake.

天寧照頌, "志求解脫, 阿誰縛汝. 直至如今, 諸方錯擧."

[Explanation]

Tianning: Those who do not *make this mistake* are also difficult to encounter.

天寧: 不錯擧者, 也難得.

572 Tianning Xuzhao 天寧虛照 (d.1252) is a dharma heir of a certain Xianyan De 僊巖德 (d.u.) of the Caodong lineage; see *Wudeng quanshu* 五燈全書 (XZJ 141.305b4–13).

Case 110.
The Wind and the Banner
風幡

[Old Case]

When the sixth patriarch, the great master Huineng, was part of Dharma master Yinzong's[573] assembly he saw two monks arguing about the wind and a banner. One monk said, "The wind moves." The other monk said, "The banner moves." The patriarch said, "It is not the wind that moves and it is not the banner that moves. It is your mind that moves." The two monks were scared witless.

六祖慧能大師, 在印宗法師會下. 見二僧爭風幡, 一僧曰, '風動.' 一僧曰, '幡動.' 祖曰, "不是風動, 不是幡動. 仁者心動." 二僧悚然.

[Explanation of the gongan]

One said the wind moves and the other said the banner moves: is this like the non-Buddhists who say causes and conditions moved it or it moved of its own accord?[574]

The wind moves: water is wet and earth is hard, the fire burns, and the wind moves. Movement is the nature of wind. This is a monk who is attached to nature (性).

---

573 Yinzong 印宗 (627–713) was officially appointed as abbot of Jing'ai Monastery 敬愛寺 in Luoyang in 670. Later, he offered lectures on the *Nirvana Sūtra* at Faxing Monastery 法性寺 in Guangdong province and there he met the future sixth patriarch, Huineng.

574 For these two theories of causality, see the *Lengyan jing* (T 945.19.117b15–23)

The banner moves: although the nature of wind is to move, only by means of the banner does it move. This is a monk who is attached to form (相).

It is neither the wind moving nor the banner moving etcetera: as it is said elsewhere, "the ten-thousand dharmas are originally idle and it is only the people themselves who are rowdy."[575] Is this what it meant by *it is your mind moving in delusion?* It is not. An ancient one said, "The wind moves and the mind shakes a tree. The clouds rise and nature gives rise to dust."[576] In other words, the wind moves and the banner moves, but it is only the one mind that moves.[577]

An ancient one discussed this and said, "The sixth patriarch's intention does not cease at the one mind that moves. It is not the wind that moves. It is not the banner that moves. It is also not the mind that moves." Again, "It is the wind that moves, the banner that moves, and the mind that moves." Like hair rolled up in a spiral topknot, even the eyes of a falcon lose the trail. As good as these words are, like line-by-line commentary they do not recognize the intent of the patriarchs. How can it be simply said to be the one mind that moves? Therefore Juefan said, "It is the wind or banner that moves—one cover's his own eyes. It is not the wind or banner that moves—the mind is thus clearly manifest. This is the explicit formula and essential point of Caoxi."[578] He put it this way only because he feared that line-by-line commentary is unavoidable, but this meaning has not yet been eliminated. Since line-by-line commentary is not allowed, how then are we to understand the logic behind 'this meaning is not yet nonexistent.' In an encomium for the sixth patriarch Juefan said, "It is the wind or banner that

575 See the *Zongjing lu* (T 2016.48.423c16).

576 These are the first two lines of a verse by Xiushanzhu; see *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.369b13).

577 For a similar argument, see *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.871b28–29); cf. *Wumen guan* (T 2005.48.296c21).

578 *Linjian lu houji* 林間錄後集 (XZJ 148.649b2–3).

moves—one cover's his own eyes etcetera." Chongjue Kong's[579] verse reads, "It is not the wind, it is not the banner. The flagpole's tip slightly touches the great empty sky. Jiangnan's willow trees are in bloom in the second and third month, the tower stands as far as they eye can see in a cloud of mist."[580]

一云風動, 一云幡動者, 外道因緣動, 自然動耶? 風動者, 水濕地堅火熱風動, 動是風性, 則執性僧也. 幡動者, 風性雖動, 必因幡而動, 則執相僧也. 不是風動不是幡動云云者, 如他處云, "萬法本閑, 唯人自鬧." 則仁者心妄動耶? 非也. 古人云, "風動心搖樹, 雲生性起塵." 則風動幡動, 只是一心動也. 古人論此云, "六祖意非止一心動也, 不是風動, 不是幡動, 亦不是心動." 又, "是風動, 是幡動, 是心動." 如螺紋髻角, 鶻眼迷蹤, 善則善矣也. 似分踈不識祖師意, 爭如只道得箇一心動! 故覺範云, "是風幡動, 眼自遮覆, 非風幡動, 心即現露, 此是曹溪顯決要旨." 如今伊麼道, 但恐未免分踈故云爾, 亦未甞泯然無此義也. 旣不許分踈, 又如何會得, 未甞無此義地道理? 覺範六祖讚云, 是風幡動, 眼自遮覆云云, 崇覺空頌云, "不是幡兮不是風, 刹竿頭點太虛空. 江南楊柳二三月, 極目樓臺烟靄中."

Xuedou's verse[581]

It is not the wind and it is not the banner,
The patch-robed monks spread this all about,
Using a raft to cross the river is a common affair,
Coal burns on the Southern Mountain and the Northern Mountain glows in red.

雪竇顯頌, "不是幡兮不是風, 衲僧於此作流通. 渡河用筏尋常事, 南山燒炭北山紅."

---

[579] Chongjue Kong 崇覺空 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Huanglong Sixin; see *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.163a6–13).

[580] Source unknown.

[581] For this verse, see also *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.707a2–3).

[Explanation]

Xuedou: *Coal burns on the Southern Mountain* etcetera: this too is the wind moves and the banner moves.

雪竇: 南山燒云云者, 亦是風動幡動也.

Again his verse[582]

If not the wind or banner where does it adhere?
The virtuoso of Xinkai has already grasped its essence,[583]
Today the stupid and ignorant Chan monks,
Mistakenly say that the mystery of mysteries (玄玄) stands alone.

> 又頌, "不是風幡何處着? 新開作者曾拈却. 如今懵懂癡禪和, 謾道玄玄爲獨脚!"

[Explanation]

Again his verse: *It is the mind that moves* should also not remain.

又頌: 心動, 亦不存.

Dahong Baoen's verse

It is not the wind and it is not the banner,
The passers-by are already blocked by two sets of barriers,
The road to Chang'an is there so they should arrive,

---

582 For this verse, see also *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.707a4–5).

583 The virtuoso of Xinkai refers to Baling Haojian 巴陵顥鑑 (d.u.) who served as the abbot of Xinkai Cloister 新開院 in Baling, Hunan province. Baling Haojian is a dharma heir of Yunmen Wenyan. See his added comment below.

But pay no heed to the Kunlun's (i.e., Bodhidharma) story of his arrival and departure.

大洪恩頌,"不是風兮不是幡, 行人曾滯兩重關. 長安道在應須到, 莫聽崑崙叙往還."

Again his verse

It is not the banner and it is not the wind,
Gazing at this from the peak of Mt. Shicheng,[584] how remote this is!
The stars in Heaven above circle around the north star,
There is no water in the realm of human beings that does not flow east.[585]

又頌,"不是幡兮不是風, 石城山頂望何窮! 天上有星皆拱北, 人閒無水不朝東."

Again his verse

It is neither the wind nor the banner—what are they getting at?
It is the wind or the banner must also be abandoned,
There is no use in following this (approach),
Even if a single phrase tests skill this is still a big mistake,
A mistake! A mistake!
You can lift your noses up to Heaven but they will still be pierced.

又頌,"不是風幡何處着? 是風幡兮亦拈却. 隨他去也大無端, 一句當機還大錯. 錯錯! 鼻孔撩天也穿却."

---

584 The significance of Mt. Shicheng 石城山 is unclear. Mt. Shicheng here probably refers to the western gate of Mt. Tiantai 天台山.

585 For these last two lines, see also the *Huanglong Huinan chanshi yulu* (T 1993.47.635b2) and *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.715b21–22 and 740b17–18).

Langye Huijie's verse[586]

It is not the wind and it is not the banner,
It cannot be explained by the loquacious ācārya,
If you try to use cunning words and seek mysterious understandings,
A thousand mountains separated even more by ten-thousand mountains.

> 瑯瑘覺頌, "不是風兮不是幡, 多口闍梨不可詮. 若將巧語求玄會, 特地千山隔萬山

Tianyi Yihuai's verse[587]

It is not the wind and it is not the banner,
These words, as they took shape, spread in the realm of human beings,
You wish to figure out where old Lu ends,[588]
There are ten-thousand layers of mountains between Tiantai and Nanyue.[589]

> 天衣懷頌, "不是風兮不是幡, 斯言形已播人間. 要會老盧端的處? 天台南岳萬重山."

Again, his verse

It is not the wind and it is not the banner,
The barbarian recites a spell and talks gibberish,[590]

586 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ115.78a10–11).

587 For this verse see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ115.77a5–6).

588 Old Lu 老盧 here refers to Huineng whose surname is Lu.

589 Mt. Tiantai is in Zhejiang province and Nanyue 南岳 or Mt. Heng 衡山 is in Hunan province.

590 Huineng was often called an illiterate, southern barbarian. For this line, see also the *Rentian yanmu*

With the announcement of spring in the first month of the year,
The faint color of the thousand peaks are as blue as indigo.

又頌, "不是風兮不是幡, 胡人持呪口喃喃. 報道孟春正月節, 千峯隱隱色如藍."

Yantang Quan's[591] verse

It is not the wind and it is not the banner,
The two ends of the scythe that mows down the stalks of grain are bent,
Who understands the patriarch's purport,
Ten million mountains between Nanyue and Tiantai.

鴈蕩泉頌, "不是風兮不是幡, 刈禾鎌子兩頭彎. 祖師的旨何人會! 南岳天台千萬山."

Again, his verse

It is not the banner and it is not the wind,
South of Zhaozhou and north of Stone Bridge,[592]
If you don't turn your head away from the top of the flagpole,
Then you will betray the pestle-pounding old man of Huangmei.[593]

人天眼目 (T 2006.48.305b6).

591 The identity of Yantang Quan is unclear.

592 This is a quote from the sayings of Zhaozhou Congshen; see *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.334a6); *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.748a9); *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T 1988.47.561c25). "South of Zhaozhou and north of Stone Bridge" refers to differing views of the same truth. The Stone Bridge was a famous curved bridge on the outskirts of the town of Zhaozhou; considered an engineering marvel and an aesthetic scene.

593 Huineng used to pound grain with a pestle at the fifth patriarch's monastery in Huangmei, Hubei province; see Yampolsky, *Platform Sūtra of the Sixth Patriarch*, p. 128.

又頌, "不是幡兮不是風, 趙州南畔石橋東.[594] 剎竿頭上不迴首, 辜負黃梅踏碓翁."

Ruilu Benxian's[595] verse[596]

It is neither the wind nor the banner but your mind that moves,
From ancient times to the present moment this was transmitted from one generation to the next,
From now on monks in training who wish to have an awakening,
Know that the patriarchs are truly your sympathetic friends.

瑞鹿先頌, "非風幡動仁心動, 自古相傳直至今. 今後水雲人欲曉, 祖師眞是好知音."

Chengtian Chuanzong's[597] verse

Shake the wind and banner and make it clear and bright,
Every calculation is made but in the end you do not know,
Guests in the assembly of the numerous patriarchs,The horns on your head must mean that you are the sons of a *qilin*.[598]

594 Here I substitute *bei* 北 for *dong* 東.

595 Ruilu Benxian 瑞鹿本先 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Tiantai Deshao 天台德韶 (891–972). According to the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.426a14–24), Tiantai Deshao helped Ruilu attain awakening with the wind and the banner koan and in response Ruilu composed the following verse; cf. *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.77a1–2).

596 For this verse, see also the *Chanlin sengbao zhuan* 禪林僧寶傳 (XZJ 137.473a18–b1) and *Wudeng huiyuan* (XZJ 138.374b5–6).

597 Chengtian Chuanzong 承天傳宗 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Xuedou Chongxian. He served as the abbot of Chengtian Monastery 承天寺 in Fujian province.

598 See note 187.

承天宗頌, "風幡搖動拂晴暉, 展事商量卒未知. 多少祖師門下客! 頭角須是麒麟兒."

Zishou Jie's[599] verse

When the wind moves the banner waves and when it's calm it droops,
A black donkey gives birth to a white mule,
As the ninth day of the ninth month approaches the winds from the West become tense,
Cicadas fill the locust trees in the courtyard and the chrysanthemums fill the hedge.

資壽捷頌, "風動幡搖靜則垂, 黑驢生得白騾兒. 重陽日近西風緊, 蟬滿庭槐菊滿籬."

Yuantong Faxiu's verse[600]

It is not the wind and *It is not the banner*,
This has been clarified but awakening oneself to the mind is difficult,
Stop seeking for it in babbling nonsense,
Look nonchalantly at the top of the flagpole.
[Do not err]

圓通秀頌, "不是風兮不是幡, 於斯明得悟心難. 胡言漢語休尋覓, 刹竿頭上等閑看." <且莫錯認.>

---

599 Zishou Jie 資壽捷 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Tianyi Yihuai. Zishou Jie served as the abbot of Zishou Cloister 資壽院 in Fujian province.

600 For this verse, see also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.77.a9–10).

Xuefeng Daoyuan's[601] verse[602]

It is not the wind and It is not the banner,
As usual white clouds cover the green mountain,
As the years pass we all grow old and weak,
So we take a small break from the bustle.

雪峯圓頌, "不是風兮不是幡, 白雲依舊覆青山. 年來老大渾無力, 偸得忙中些子閑."

Haiyin Chaoxin's verse

Neither wind nor banner moves—only the mind moves,
Why was one saying split into two stories?
I cannot tolerate the arrogance of old Lu,
The ācārya and chief seat have both been deceived by him.

海印信頌, "風幡不動唯心動, 一語如何話兩般? 叵耐老盧大傍若! 闍梨座主被欺謾."

Fachang Yiyou's[603] verse[604]

601 Xuefeng Daoyuan 雪峯道圓 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Huanglong Huinan. He served as the abbot of a temple on Mt. Xuefeng in Fujian province.

602 For this verse, see also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.77a13–14); *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.93a1–2); *and Linjian lu* (XZJ 148.634b17–18).

603 Fachang Yiyou 法昌倚遇 (1005–1081) studied under various teachers such as Fushan Fayuan, Beichan Zhixian 北禪智賢, and Shishuang Chuyuan. When he became the abbot Fachang Chan Cloister 法昌禪院 in Jiangxi province he formally announced himself to be a dharma heir of Beichan Zhixian.

604 For this verse, see also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ115.77a3–4).

It is not the wind and It is not the banner,
A tabby cat has a striped face,
Travelers in the night just desire a bright moon,
Without realizing it they cross the cold river with their clothes on.

> 法昌遇頌, "不是風兮不是幡, 黑花猫子面門斑. 夜行人只貪明月, 不覺和衣渡水寒."

[Explanation]

Fachang: *A tabby cat* etcetera: this means there is brightness in darkness. That is to say, where the one mind moves there is the wind that moves and the banner that moves. *Travelers in the night* etcetera: this only recognizes the one mind that moves. On the one hand, it is to desire a bright moon. On the other hand, it is to cross the cold river with one's clothes on.

法昌: 黑花猫云云者, 暗中有明, 謂一心動處, 有風動幡動也. 夜行人云云者, 只認一心動, 是貪明月, 反是和衣渡水寒.

Baoning Renyong's verse[605]

A clear and open stretch of government road,
From dusk till dawn there has never been a curfew,
It is not that they all did not advance forward,
But there was nothing they could do about the brambles in front of the gate.

> 保寧勇頌, "蕩蕩一條官驛路, 晨昏曾不禁人行. 渾家不是不進步, 無奈當門荊棘生!"

Fazhen Shouyi's verse

[605] For this verse, see also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.77a7–8).

A long time ago the old man of Baling added a comment,[606]
If neither the wind nor the banner, where could it be?
In the hustle and bustle the third child of the Wang family plays the bamboo shawm,
At a Persian banquet we dance to a three-step beat.[607]

法眞一頌, "巴陵老作昔拈來, 不是風幡安在哉? 閙裏王三吹觱篥, 波斯筵上舞三臺."

Changlu Zongze's verse

It is not the wind and *It is not the banner*,
Look nonchalantly at the top of the flagpole,[608]
Yuantong's Buddha dharma did not beget many sons,[609]
As before, your nose is right in front of your eyes.
[Raise together with Yuantong Faxiu's verse[610]]

長蘆賾頌, "不是風兮不是幡, 刹竿頭上等閑看. 圓通佛法無多子, 鼻孔依前在目前." <兼擧圓通秀頌.>

Chengtian Huai's verse

The wind moves and *The banner waves* is as close as you can get to the purport,

606 For Baling's comment, see below.

607 The three-step beat (*santai* 三臺) see note 212 above.

608 See Yuantong Faxiu's verse above.

609 Zongze received tonsure from Yuantong Faxiu.

610 See Yuantong Faxiu's verse above.

Why did old Lu put it as *The mind moves?*
At that time had there been someone with cakra eyes,[611]
We cannot necessarily say that the robe and bowl were not entrusted to someone.

> 承天懷頌, "風動幡搖旨最親, 老盧心動若爲陳? 當時果有迦羅眼, 未必衣盂不付人."

Foyin Zhiqing's[612] verse

The wind and the banner are the mind—what other words could there be?
The exhortation to rest and relax the six gates[613] has been transmitted from the past to the present,
If you establish even an iota of (discrimination), then like before you will be separated (from the truth),
The chiliocosm is in the tip of a hair.

> 佛印清頌, "風幡是心更何言? 六門休歇古今傳. 若立絲毫仍舊隔, 大千沙界一毛端."

Cuiyan Sizong's verse[614]

It is neither wind nor the banner and it is not the mind,

---

611 *Shuojiaoluoyan* 爍迦羅眼 or cakra eyes are eyes that are as solid as diamond. They always discern right and wrong or gain and loss accurately.

612 Foyin Zhiqing 佛印智清 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Huanglong Huinan's disciple, Yunju Yuanyou 雲居元祐 (1027–1092). Foyin was invited by the emperor to serve as the abbot of Zhihai Chan Cloister in the Eastern Capital.

613 The six gates refer to the six sense organs, that is, eyes, ears, nose, tongue, body, and consciousness.

614 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.78a16–17).

The true eyes of the patriarchs is simply the way things are right now,
If you don't know the way things are right now, then the mountains and rivers will be impediments,
If you know the way things are right now, then the seas and the mountains will fall apart.

> 翠嵓宗頌, "不是風幡不是心, 祖師正眼只如今. 如今不識山河礙, 識得如今海嶽沉."

Fojian's Huiqin's verse[615]

It is neither wind nor the banner and it is not the mind,
How many people notch the side of the boat and seek for the sword that was thrown overboard,
I clearly entrust these sayings to all the Chan guests,
Since ancient times true copper was not bartered for gold.[616]

> 佛鑑勤頌, "不是風幡不是心, 幾人遺劍刻舟尋? 分明寄語諸禪客, 自古眞鍮不博金."

Foyan Qingyuan's verse[617]

Neither wind nor banner moves—only the mind moves,
The billows in the great sea are always surging up violently,

---

615 Cf. *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.77b12–13).

616 According to the *Yiqijing yinyi*, Tibetans use copper as medicine and there are two different types of chalcopyrite or copper ores, namely whitish ones and golden ones. The latter—also called "true copper"—is considered superior in quality and hence, we are told, the folk saying, "true copper is not bartered for gold"; see T 2128.54.710a24–b1.

617 For this verse, see also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.591b12–14).

The fish and the dragons appear and disappear, floating and sinking at will,
There is no difference between life and death or noble ones and ordinary beings,
To have no differences—what could this be?
The patriarchs and buddhas watch on the sideline and pointlessly join their palms.

佛眼遠頌, "非風幡動唯心動, 大海波瀾常洶湧. 魚龍出沒任升沈, 生死聖凡無別共. 無別共底怎摸樣? 祖佛傍觀空合掌."

Chongsheng Yuangong's verse

The wind moves, the banner moves—opinions come from east and west,
Your minds are neither different nor identical,
Fools show their skill but they are never enlightened,
Patriarchs point it out but the illness of perverted views invade,
Even if you've mastered the *Śūraṃgama*'s bright and dark or blockage and opening,[618]
How could you avoid Xuansha's mute, blind, and deaf men?[619]

崇勝珙頌, "風幡動兮自西自東, 仁者心兮非異非同. 獃漢呈機兮未曾發蒙, 祖師指示兮轉見病攻. 縱了首楞兮明暗塞通, 争免玄沙兮瘖啞盲聾!"

618 See *Lengyan jing* (T 945.19.123b21–c12). The passage in question speaks about transcending dualities (e.g. bright and dark, blockage and opening, perceiving subject and perceived object etc.) and attaining awakening.

619 This is a reference to Xuansha Shibei's 玄沙師備 (835–908) famous "three kinds of sick people" (*sanzhong bingren* 三種病人) gongan; see Xuansha Shibei *chanshi yulu* 玄沙師備禪師語錄 (XZJ 126.415b8–15).

Changling Shouzhuo's verse[620]

Dreaming of traveling to Huading and past the Hill of Cinnabar,[621]
I set my feet firmly in the chilly clouds and rest against the stone tower,
Tempted by the waterfall gushing out of the cliff,
How could I have known that I've already arrived at the blue river?

長靈卓頌, "夢遊華頂過丹丘, 躡盡寒雲倚石樓. 貪看瀑泉瀉崖壁, 豈知身在碧江頭."

Xinwen Tanfen's verse

Smoke rises by the edge of the water and the branches of the poplar tree droop gracefully,
The cloud is thick in the bamboo forest and the old house looks even lower,
The mountains and streams are covered in green and spring is on its way out,
Flowers from the cypress tree fill the ground as the cuckoo sings.

心聞賁頌, "水邊煙膩垂楊裊, 竹裏雲深古屋低. 綠遍山川春事過, 桐花滿地子規啼."

Cihang Liaopo's[622] verse

620 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.77b18–78a1).

621 Huading is the name of the central peak of Mt. Tiantai. The Hill of Cinnabar is the name of a legendary land inhabited by immortals and is mentioned in the poem "Far Roaming" (Yuanyou 遠游) in the *Chuci* 楚辞; see Paul W. Kroll trans., "An Early Poem of Mystical Excursion," in *Religions of China in Practice*, edited by Donald S. Lopez, Jr. (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1996), p. 159.

622 Cihang Liaopo 慈航了朴 (d.u.), like Xinwen Tanfen, is a dharma heir of Wushi Jiechen. Cihang served as the abbot of a temple on Mt. Tiantong in Zhejiang province.

It is neither wind nor the banner and it is not the mind,
The handful of dirt grasped nonchalantly turns out to be gold,
The single road to Caoxi is as flat as a whetstone,
A limitless number of normal beings were drowned in the midst of dry land.[623]

> 慈航朴頌, "不是風幡不是心, 等閑握土是黃金. 曹溪一路平如砥, 無限平人被陸沉."

Songyuan Chongyue's verse[624]

It is not the wind and *It is not the banner*,
A barrier in ten thousand layers has been clearly shred to pieces,
Who knew? You use all your might,
And acquire vain fame only to fall into the mundane realm.

> 松源頌, "不是風兮不是幡, 分明裂破萬重關. 誰知用盡腕頭力, 惹得閑名落世間."

Miaozhi Congkuo's[625] verse

It is not the wind and *It is not the banner*,

---

623 "Drowning oneself in the midst of dry land" is probably a reference to a story in the *Zhuangzi* about a man from Chu who, despite being the disciple of a sage, hid himself among his servants and did not seek fame and fortune; see Burton Watson, *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu*, p. 286.

624 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ115.79a18–b1).

625 Yuwang 育王 or Miaozhi Congkuo 妙智從廓 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Dayuan Zunpu 大圓遵璞 (d.u.), a dharma brother of Dahui Zonggao. Congkuo took over the abbacy of Ayuwang Monastery in Zhejiang province when Dahui became the abbot of Nengren Monastery on Mt. Jing. Congkuo was imperially granted the title Miaozhi.

The numinous spear-tip, all by itself, exposes the coldness of its jewel-like radiance,
No one in the boundless universe understands me,
So I pointlessly rest against the tower and gaze at the flagpole.

妙智廓頌, "不是風兮不是幡, 靈鋒獨露寶光寒, 茫茫宇宙無知己, 空倚危樓望刹竿."

Jiean Zhipeng's[626] verse

Neither the wind nor the banner is it,
Your mind is also not it,
The broken stele lies sideways on the old path,
Underneath it is a stone tortoise.[627]

介庵朋頌, "風幡俱不是, 仁者心亦非. 斷碑横古道, 下有石烏龜."

Xuefeng Yicun[628] added a comment, "Of all people! It is the patriarch who has the head of a dragon and the tail of a snake and deserves twenty blows." Chief seat Fu,[629] who was in attendance, ground his teeth at these

626 Jiean Zhipeng 介庵智朋 (d.u.) first studied under Baofeng Weizhao 寶峰惟照 (1084–1128) and later under Kumu Facheng. Both Baofeng and Kumu are dharma heirs of Furong Daokai. Jiean eventually reached awakening under Kumu's guidance, but he became the dharma heir of Baofeng. Jiean served as the abbot of Tianning Monastery in Zhejiang province, Qingliang Cloister in Jiangsu province, and Ruiyan Monastery in Zhejiang province.

627 It was common for stelae to be mounted on plinths carved in the shape of a tortoise. The previous line appears in *Wuzu Fayan yulu* (T 1995.47.655c8).

628 Xuefeng Yicun is a dharma heir of Deshan Xuanjian. Yicun's temple on Xianggu Peak 象骨峰 in Fujian province was granted the plaque bearing the name Yingtian Xuefeng Monastery 應天雪峯寺 in 874. Later, in 881, he was imperially granted the title Great Master Zhenjue 真覺大師 and a purple robe.

629 Little is known about chief seat Fu 孚上座. He is a dharma heir of Xuefeng Yicun and is often

words. Xuefeng said, "Me saying this also deserves twenty blows." [Yunmen Zonggao said, "Do you wish to understand chief seat Fu? A rhinoceros plays with the moon and decorations appear on its horn. Do you wish to understand Xuefeng? An elephant is startled by thunder and flowers[630] appear on its tusks.[631]]

雪峯存拈, "大小祖師! 龍頭虵尾. 好與二十棒." 孚上座侍立次, 咬齒. 峯云, "我伊麼道, 也好與二十棒." <雲門杲曰, "要識孚上座麼? 犀因翫月紋生角;要識雪峯麼? 象被雷驚花入牙." >

[Explanation]

Xuefeng: *Of all people! It is the patriarch* etcetera: this means that *The mind moves* does not work either.

Ground his teeth at these words: this means he disagreed with Xuefeng.

Me saying this etcetera: this means he had the uneasy mind of a thief.

The head of a dragon and tail of a snake: this means that *it is not the wind that moves* and it is not the banner that moves is the head of a dragon and it is your mind that moves is the tail of a snake. Together they deserve twenty blows.

Yunmen (Zonggao)'s rhinoceros plays with the moon etcetera: this means that although chief seat Fu was bright he never left darkness and although Xuefeng was in the dark he never left brightness.

雪峯: 大小祖師云云者, 心動亦不立. 咬齒者, 不肯雪峯也. 我伊麼道云云者, 作賊人心虗. 然龍頭蛇尾者, '不是風動, 不是幡動', 是龍頭, '仁者心動', 是蛇尾, 此合喫二十棒處. 雲門, 犀因翫月云云者, 孚上座雖明, 未甞離暗; 雪峯雖暗, 未甞離明.

referred to as chief seat Fu of Taiyuan 太原 in Shanxi province.

630 That is, traces of lightning.

631 See the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.31c14 and 58b1–2); and also *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 138a7–8).

Baofu Congzhan added a comment, "The mind of a thief is uneasy. It has to be someone like Xiao He to compile a legal code."[632]

保福拈, "作賊人心虛, 也是蕭何置律."

[Explanation]

Baofu: T*he mind of a thief is uneasy*: this means the patriarch's *it is the one mind that moves* is originally not his true intention.

It has to be (someone like) Xiao He to compile a legal code: this means *it is the one mind that moves* is his true intention.

保福: 作賊人心虛者, 祖師一心動, 元非實意也. 是蕭何置律者, 一心動, 亦是實意.

Baling Haojian added a comment, "The patriarch said, *It is not the wind that moves and it is not the banner that moves*. If it is neither the wind nor the banner, then what position should one take? Is there a person here who will play host with the patriarch? Then step forward and see me face-to-face."

巴陵鑒拈, "祖師道, 不是風動, 不是幡動, 旣不是風幡, 向什麽處着? 有人與祖師作主, 出來與巴陵相見."

[Explanation]

Baling: *The patriarch said it is not the wind that moves … are they getting at*: the wind and the banner—what are they getting at? Apart from the wind or the banner what else can one rely on? His intent is to say that apart from the wind or the banner there is a separate thing that one can rely on.

Is there a person here who will play host with the patriarch etcetera: this means he made *the one mind moves* the controller (主宰).

Then step forward and see me face-to-face: what fault is there in saying the

632 For Xiao He and the legal code, see note 426 above.

wind or the banner moves?

巴陵: 祖師道不是風動云云, 至麼處著者, 風幡向什麼處著耶? 離風幡外向什麼處寄著也. 意謂離風幡外, 別有什麼寄着處. 有人與祖師作主云云者, 於一心動, 作主宰者. 出來與巴陵相見者, 風幡動有什麼過.

Qingliang Wenyi[633] ascended the hall and said,[634] "Dear chief seats. Do not take this nonchalantly. I encourage you to rely on the ancient sage's gate of compassion. The various realms seen by the ancient sages—it is just their own minds that they saw. The patriarch said, *It is not the wind that moves and it is not the banner that moves. It is your mind that moves.* It is best to simply understand it this way. There is nothing more intimate than this intimate point."

清涼益, 上堂云, "諸上座! 且莫將爲等閑. 奉勸, 且依古聖慈悲門好. 他古聖所見諸境, 唯見自心. 祖師道, '不是風動, 不是幡動, 仁者心動.' 但且伊麼會好. 別無親於親處也."

Wuzu Shijie added a comment, "What is the basis (of the Patriarch's claim)?"

五祖戒拈, "着甚來由?"

[Explanation]

Wuzu: *What is the basis* etcetera: Wuzu disliked the patriarch's *it is the one mind that moves.*

---

633 Qingliang or Fayan Wenyi 清涼文益 (885–958) is a student of Luohan Guichen 羅漢桂琛 (867–928). He was invited to serve as the abbot of Chongshou Cloister 崇壽院 in Jiangxi province. He was later invited by a powerful patron named Li Jing 李璟 (916–961) to serve as the abbot of Baoen Chan Cloister 報恩禪院 and, later, Qingliang Cloister 清涼院 in Jinling (Jiangsu province) and was granted the title *Chan Master Jinghui* 淨慧禪師.

634 For this sermon, see also the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.448b14–17).

五祖云云者, 嫌他祖師一心動也.

National Master Tiantai Deshao in his instructions to the assembly said,[635] "The expedient means of the ancient sages are as numerous as the sands of the Ganges River. The sixth patriarch said, *It is neither the wind nor the banner that moves. It is your mind that moves. This is the unsurpassed mind seal and the utmost wondrous teaching*. How should we, learned men who claim to be the disciples of the patriarchs, make sense of this? Some say, the wind and the banner do not move and it is your mind that moves in delusion. Some say, do not push aside the wind and banner; rather seek penetration in the wind and banner. Some say, the wind or banner moves but what could this mean? Some say, rely on objects to clarify the mind but do not mistake the objects themselves for the mind. Some say, matter is itself emptiness, or say, it is neither the wind nor the banner that moves and this must be approached with wondrous understanding. (But) none of this bears any relevance to the Patriarch's intention. If not through these various understandings, then how is one suppose to get it? If done with the true view, then what teaching would not be clear? Even a hundred thousand expedient means of all the buddhas would be simultaneously and thoroughly comprehended."

天台韶國師, 示衆曰, "古聖方便, 猶如河沙. 六祖曰, '非風幡動, 仁者心動.' 是爲無上心印, 至妙法門. 我輩稱祖師門下士, 何以解之? 若言, 風幡不動, 汝心妄動; 若言, 不撥風幡, 就風幡處通取;若言, 風幡動處, 是什麽?;若言, 附物明心, 不須認物;若言, 色即是空;若言, 非風幡動, 應須妙會. 與祖師意旨, 了沒交涉. 旣非種種解會, 合如何知悉? 若眞見去, 何法門不明? 雖百千諸佛方便, 一時洞了."

[Explanation]
Tiantai: Only a father can give birth to a son.

---

635 A slightly different version of this sermon can be found in the *Wujia zhengzong zan* (XZJ 135.993a12-b1).

天台: 非父, 不生其子也.

Xuedou Chongxian raised the added comment by Baling and said,[636] "It is the wind or the banner—what are they getting at? Is there a person here who will play host with Baling? Then you too should step forward and see me face-to-face."

雪竇顯, 擧巴陵拈, 師云,"風動幡動, 旣是風幡, 向甚處着? 有人與巴陵作主, 亦出來與雪竇相見."

[Explanation]

Xuedou: *The wind moves and the banner moves*: this means Baling takes *the wind moves and the banner moves* as the tenet.

It is the wind or the banner—what are they getting at?: this means apart from the one mind that moves what else can one rely on?

Is there a person here who will play host with Baling?: this means he made *the wind moves and the banner moves* the controller (主宰).

Then step forward and see me face-to-face: what fault is there in saying the one mind moves? Chief seat Fu and Xuefeng contrasted "it is not the wind that moves, it is not the banner that seems to move, and it is not the mind that moves" with "it is the wind that moves, it is the banner that moves, it is the mind that moves," whereas Baling and Xuedou contrasted "the wind moves and the banner moves" with "the one mind moves."

雪竇: 風動幡動者, 巴陵則以風動幡動爲宗. 旣是風幡, 向什麽處着者, 離一心動外, 向什麽處寄着也. 有人與巴陵作主者, 於風動幡動, 作主宰者也. 出來與雪竇相見者, 一心動有什麽過也. 雪峯孚上座, 不是風動不見幡動不是心動, 是風動是幡動是心動爲對;巴陵雪竇, 以風動幡動一心動爲對.

Haiyin Chaoxin added a comment, "Of all people! It is the patriarch who

636 For Xuedou's sermon, see also the *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.688a17–19).

cut the story in two and thus deserves thirty blows. There is one more, so don't move."

海印信拈, "大小祖師, 話成兩截, 好與三十棒. 更有一个, 切忌動着."

[Explanation]

Haiyin: *Cut the story in two*: *The wind or The banner moves* and *It is your mind that moves* are the two.

*Together they deserve thirty blow*s: the remaining extra blow—how could this be the passage through which they could go beyond?

海印: 話成兩截者, 風幡動心動, 是兩截也. 是合喫三十棒處, 更有一棒, 豈向上一竅耶?

Jiangshan Faquan[637] raised this story during an informal sermon and then raised the added comments by Baling and Xuedou and said,[638] "Do you want to know the essential point of the two worthies? I will use an analogy and explain it for you. Imagine a family that, since the time of their ancestors, had accumulated a vast estate. There were two brothers who fought with each other to spend it. The older one used five hundred copper cash and the younger one an entire string of coins.[639] For days and months they endlessly fought to spend it. Accordingly, the vast estate of their ancestors was all used up in a single moment. They troubled their children and grandchildren and deprived them of a way to settle down and go on with their life's pursuit. One day a friend saw their children and grandchildren orhpaned and unsheltered, so he lent them their ancestor's residence to live in. During this period the children and grandchildren thus thought to themselves, 'How did

637 This refers to Nanming Faquan, see note 292 above.

638 For this sermon, see also the *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.361a14–b5).

639 An entire string of coins is one thousand copper cash; see Frederick Mote, *Imperial China 900–1800* (Cambridge: Harvard Univerity Press, 1999), p. 116.

our old ancestral estate come to belong to someone else? We must figure out a way to reclaim the original deeds and then there will be some results. If we spend our days following what is right before our eyes, we may be just fine but we won't be able to avoid dwelling here under someone else's roof.' Great assembly, I have used an analogy as an explanation. Now I will ask all of you, how can they figure out a way to reclaim the original deeds?"

> 蔣山泉, 小叅, 擧此話, 連擧巴陵雪竇拈, 師云, "要知二尊宿落處麼? 蔣山爲你說箇譬喩. 一似箇人家祖上, 從來極有涯業, 有二兄弟, 各各鬪使. 大者使五百, 小者使一貫, 日往月來, 鬪使不已, 遂將祖父涯業, 一時蕩盡, 累他子孫, 無安身立命處. 忽有一親友, 見其子孫孤露, 遂將伊家祖上宅舍, 借伊居止. 其間子孫須念, '舊時祖業, 如何却屬他人? 須作方便, 討得當時契書, 方爲究竟. 若趂目前過日, 得則得, 未免住在他人屋下.' 大衆, 蔣山爲你說譬喩了也. 且問, 諸人, 作何方便, 討得當時契書?"

[Explanation]

Jiangshan: *Imagine a family … a vast estate*: this refers to the patriarch. The two brothers refer to Baling and Xuedou. There were two brothers who fought with each other to spend it.

The older one used five hundred copper cash and the younger one an entire string of coins: since Baling's "the wind and the banner moves" differs from what the patriarch said it is half a string of coins, and since what Xuedou and the Patriarch said are identical it is a whole string of coins.

For days and months … go on with their life's pursuit: the two venerable worthies failed to understand the patriarch's intent, so they used up the family estate. Later generations follow the words and make calculations like familiarity and neglect, and gain and loss. This is to trouble the children and grandchildren and deprive them of of a way to settle down and go on with their life's pursuit.

One day a friend … to live in: could this one friend be (Jiangshan) himself?

The children and grandchildren thus thought to themselves … results: the original deeds are none other than the patriarch's purport.

蔣山: 一似箇人家, 至極有涯業者, 言祖師也. 二兄弟, 謂巴陵雪竇. 大者五百, 小者一貫者, 巴陵出風幡動, 與祖師言異故, 一貫之半也, 雪竇與祖師言同故, 一貫之全也. 日往月來至立命處者, 二尊宿, 皆不會祖師意, 蕩盡家業也. 後人隨言有親疎得失商量, 是累他子孫, 無安身立命處也. 忽有親友至居止者, 一友豈自謂耶? 子孫須念至究竟者, 當時契書則祖師宗旨也.

Kumu Facheng ascended the hall, raised this story, and said, "Everyone! The Patriarch temporarily established contrivances to express his intent. Do all of you want to understand how the Patriarch directly cared for others?" After a pause he said, "The wind, the banner, and the mind move and do not move are still delusions. Do you want to understand the crossbar for the Patriarch's gate? In front of a cliff I hear the cuckoo sing."

枯木成, 上堂, 擧此話云, "諸仁者, 祖師權時施設, 用作指歸. 諸人要會祖師端的爲人處麽?" 良久云, "風兮幡兮心兮, 動與不動, 還迷. 要會祖師關捩子? 嵓前時聽子規啼."

[Explanation]

Kumu: *The wind … still delusions*: this means one follows words and dashes forward, hence delusion.

Do you want to understand the patriarch's … the cuckoo sing: this means *The wind* or *The banner moves* is none other than the one mind moves.

枯木: 風兮至還迷者, 隨言走殺故迷. 要會祖師至子規啼者, 風幡動即一心動.

Jingci Zongben in an informal sermon said, "When the sixth patriarch was a postulant he joined Dharma master Yinzong's assembly and one day saw two monks staring at the wind and the banner and engage each other in a debate. One said, *The wind moves*. The other said, *The banner moves*. Going back and forth, their arguments were muddled and confused and utterly without rhyme or reason. At that time, while on the road, the sixth patriarch saw this inconsistency and thus said, *It is not the wind that moves and it is not*

the banner that moves. It is your mind that moves. Although this is the case and old Lu was not without a temporary means of guiding students, he was unable to shut the mouths of later generations. In that situation I would not have reacted so. At that time had I seen those monks I would have told them, 'You loafers. What are you calling the wind and the banner?' Speak! Is this identical to or different from what the Patriarch said? Those with bright eyes should try to scrutinize."

淨慈本, 小叅云, "六祖作行者時, 到印宗法師會下, 忽見二僧因覩風幡, 共相論議. 一云風動, 一云幡動, 往復紛紜, 皆未中理. 他家當時, 路見不平, 便道 '不是風動, 不是幡動. 仁者心動.' 然雖如此, 老盧一期接引則不無, 又且未能塞斷後人口. 山僧者裏即不伊麽. 當時若見者僧, 只向伊道, '瞌睡漢! 你喚什麽作風幡?' 且道! 與祖師道底, 是同是別? 明眼底鑒看."

[Explanation]

Jingci: Because the wind and the banner moves the mind moves. If the wind and the banner do not move, the mind also does not move.

淨慈: 有風幡動故, 心動, 無風幡動則, 亦無心動.

Fazhen Shouyi raised this story and then raised the added comments by Baling and Xuedou and said, "Speak! Do the two old worthies say the same thing or something different? If you've made up your mind, then step forward and see me face-to-face."

法眞一, 擧此話, 連擧巴陵雪竇拈, 師云, "且道! 二老宿語, 是同是別? 若定當得, 出來, 與山僧相見."

[Explanation]

Fazhen: Either way, he does not care.

法眞: 兩頭不干.

Huanglong Sixin asked Fachang Yiyou, "'It is not the wind … cold river with their clothes on'—is this not your reverence's verse?" Yiyou said, "I, indeed, used these words." Sixin said, "It is extraordinary." Yiyou said, "You tell me. Did the Patriarch care for others with the former statement or the latter statement?"[640] He replied, "The Patriarch in the end did not speak recklessly." Yiyou said, "What do you mean?" He replied, "Did you not hear him say, 'It is not the wind that moves and it is not the banner that moves.' " Yiyou said, "Like a fox crossing water, how can this be spontaneous and lively?"[641] Sixin said, "What does the master think?" Yiyou took his fly whisk and shook it. Sixin said, "This too is like drawing legs on a snake." Yiyou said, "Why make a fuss about it?" Sixin said, "It has to be someone like your reverence (to be able to say that)."

> 黄龍心, 問法昌遇曰, " '不是風兮, 至渡水寒.' 豈不是和尚偈耶?" 遇曰, "然. 有是語." 心曰, "也大奇特." 遇曰, "汝道祖師, 前叚爲人, 後叚爲人?" 對曰, "祖師, 終不妄語." 遇曰, "意作麽生?" 對曰, "豈不見道, 不是風動, 不是幡動?" 遇曰, "如狐渡水, 有甚快活?" 心曰, "師意如何?" 遇以拂子搖之, 心曰, "也是爲蚰畫足." 遇曰, "亂統作麽?" 心曰, "須是和尚, 始得."

[Explanation]

Huanglong Sixin and Fachang Yiyou: Huanglong's intent is to argue that everything moves. Therefore he said, *The patriarch in the end did not speak recklessly*.

The former statement etcetera: *The wind moves* and *The banner moves* is what is meant by *the former statement*. The one mind moves is what is meant by *the latter statement*.

Like a fox crossing etcetera: this is because (Sixin's reply reflects) a one-sided view.

---

640 The text here mistakenly gives *jia* 叚 for *duan* 段.

641 A fox is believed to be a suspicious animal. According to the *Biyan lu*, like a wild fox that is so suspicious that it listens for water before it walks on ice, a student who is as suspicious as a fox will not find tranquility (T 2003.48.162b24–26).

Took his fly whisk and shook it: this is to show how the wind and the banner move. A fly whisk is just a fly whisk.

The latter statement etcetera: Huanglong was not without his strong points, but what could he do to outdo Fachang who is a virtuoso teacher of our tradition?

> 黄龍意, 一切動處主張, 故云, 祖師終不妄語也. 前段云云者, 風動幡動是前段, 一心動是後段也. 如狐渡云云者, 只見一邊故也. 以拂子搖云云, 風動幡動之樣子. 拂子則一條拂子也. 下節云云, 黄龍不無長處, 爭柰法昌是作家宗師.

Caoxi Ming ascended the hall and said, "It is not the banner and it is not the wind. Why bother ringing the bell after the maigre feast? An antelope hangs by its horns and no one sees it. Why forcibly point to its tracks?"[642] And then he raised, *The Sixth Patriarch one day saw two monks arguing about the wind and a banner … the two monks thereupon had an awakening*. The master said, "Great assembly! Based on this story if you say the two men of the Way were thus awakened, you will enter hell as fast as a flying arrow. If you're a man with blood under your skin and heard them say, It is not the wind that moves and it is not the banner that moves. It is your mind that moves, you would have said, 'Huh! What are you saying?' At that time had there been someone who went 'Huh!' then he would have had the one path to turn himself around.[643] Have you not heard the ancient virtue say, 'It is not

---

642 Chan masters used this analogy to speak of the futility of following the literal meaning of a text. Like the antelope that hangs on the branches of a tree by its horns, the "true" intent of a Chan text or gongan does not leave any "traces" or even a "scent"; see in *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T2076.51.328b7–9 and 335b8–10); *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.139c19 and 217c9–10). Also noted by Richard John Lynn, "The Sudden and the Gradual in Chinese Poetry Criticism: An Examination of the Ch'an-Poetry Analogy," in *Sudden and Gradual: Approaches to Enlightenment in Chinese Thought*, edited by Peter N. Gregory (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1987), p. 420, note 78.

643 "The one path to turn oneself around" (Ch. *zhuanshen yilu* 轉身一路) refers to the path that allows one to procure life from (great) death, that is, from the hasty attachment to one's initial awakening; see *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.166c12–14).

the mind, it is not the Buddha, and it is not a thing'?[644] What then should we call it?" He thereupon threw his fly whisk down and said, "Today all of you have seen right through me."

曹溪明, 上堂云, "不是幡兮不是風, 何煩齋後却聲鐘! 羚羊掛角無人見, 剛被渠儂强指蹤." 乃擧六祖大師, 一日, 見二僧爭風幡, 至二僧因而省悟, 師云, "大衆, 據此, 二員道人, 伊麽悟去, 入地獄如箭射. 若是皮下有血漢, 見他道, 不是風動, 不是幡動, 是汝心動, '咄! 是何言歟?' 當時, 若下得者一咄, 方有轉身一路. 君不見, 古德有言兮, 不是心, 不是佛, 不是物. 畢竟喚作箇什麽?" 遂擲下拂子云, "老僧今日, 被諸人勘破."

[Explanation]

Caoxi: *It is your mind that moves* is like *ringing the bell after the maigre feast*. Moreover, if taken as a debasement, then *it is the wind that moves* and *it is the banner that moves* are like *ringing the bell after the maigre feast*. If taken as praise, then an *antelope hangs by its horns … why forcibly point to its tracks?*

Enter hell etcetera: the one mind moves because karmic consciousness has not yet been cut off.

A man with blood under his skin … a thing: this is the aforementioned antelope hanging by its horns.

Throwing down the fly whisk: what sort of entry point (孔竅) is this?

曹溪: 仁者心動, 是齋後聲鍾也. 又下而對, 則風動幡動, 是齋後聲鍾, 上而對, 則掛角羚羊强指蹤也. 入地獄云云者, 一心動, 猶是業識未斷故也. 皮下有血云云, 至是物者, 前所言掛角羚羊也. 擲下拂子, 是什麽孔竅?

Shangfang Riyi raised this story and in continuation raised the added comment by Baling and Xuedou and said, "One dog barks at its shadow and a hundred dogs bark.[645] At that time, had it been the gold-faced ascetic

644 *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.246a22).

645 This common saying is from Wang Fu's 王符 (ca. 78–163) *Qianfu lun* 潛夫論 (Wenyange

(Kāśyapa), he would have knocked down the flagpole in front of the gate and prevented the Chan monks in the North and in the South dashing around in pursuit of the wind and the banner.[646] Even if this is the case, you may be able to play host against the gold-faced ascetic, but you don't have what it takes to see me face-to-face."

上方益, 擧此話, 連擧巴陵雪竇拈, 師云, "一犬吠形, 百犬吠聲. 當時, 若是金色頭陁, 倒却門前刹竿, 也免得南北禪和被風幡走殺. 然雖如是, 爲金色頭陀作主, 則可, 要與法雲相見, 未在."

[Explanation]

Shangfang: *One dog barks* etcetera: this means the patriarch and also Baling and Xuedou are like this.

At that time had it been … dashing around in pursuit of the wind and the banner: things like knocking down the flagpole do not happen so often like this.

May be able to play host against the gold-faced ascetic … don't have what it takes: what fault is there in saying the wind and the banner moves and the one mind moves?

上方: 一犬吠形云云者, 祖師與巴陵雪竇如此. 當時若是至走殺者, 倒却刹竿處, 無如此許多也. 爲金色至未在者, 風幡動一心動, 有什麼過.

Baiyun Zhibing raised this story and in continuation raised the added comment by Baling and Xuedou and said, "Baling said, 'It is neither the wind nor the banner—what are they getting at?' Xuedou said, 'It is the wind and the banner—what are they getting at?' If so, water can't wash water and

---

sikuquanshu edition) 1, 16. Wang Fu commented, "This illness has long been in the world. It saddens me that people do not examine what is true and what is false."

646 For knocking the flagpole down in front of the gate (traditionally, a signal for the end of the sermon or gathering), see *Chuanxin fayao* (T 2012A.48.384a6).

gold can't be bartered for gold. Had there been a man who did not cherish his life, he would have cut the two old men at the heels[647] and also prevented the mundane truth from spreading."

白雲昺, 擧此話, 連擧巴陵雪竇拈, 師云, "巴陵云, '旣不是風幡, 向什麽處着?' 雪竇云, '旣是風幡, 向什麽處着?' 然則水不洗水, 金不博金. 忽有箇不惜性命底漢, 截斷二老脚跟, 也免得世諦流布."

[Explanation]

Baiyun: If you cut the two old men at their heels and cannot but do it unevenly, then conventional truth will spread. If you cut the two old men at their heels, then gold cannot be bartered for gold and water cannot wash water.

白雲: 若截斷二老脚跟, 不得宛, 是世諦流布, 若截斷脚跟, 金不博金, 水不洗水.

Foyan Qingyuan ascended the hall and said, "In the past when the sixth patriarch became a layman he hid in Dharma master Yinzong's assembly at Faxing Monastery in Guangzhou. One night in the corridor he saw two monks having a dispute over the wind and a banner. They did not exhaust its principle. The Patriarch stepped forward and said, 'Will you permit a mundane layman to join this exalted discussion?' And then he proceeded to tell them that it is neither the wind nor the banner that moves but rather one's mind that moves. Great assembly! Only since last night has the wind been blowing. Speak! Is it the wind that moves or not? You may say it is not the wind that moves, but it touches the screen, moves the door, tosses the earth up, and raises dust. What do you mean by it is not the wind that moves? Can you determine this? I would say, it is neither the wind that moves, the banner that moves, nor the mind that moves. Is there anyone who

647 Chan texts often use the heels as a metaphor for a firm grasp of matters at hand. Conversely, it could also stand for the attachment to a particular understanding.

understands? The green mountain is limitlessly splendid, but all you say is that it is not as good as going home."

佛眼遠, 上堂云, "昔日, 六祖大師, 作居士時, 隱於廣州法性寺印宗法師席下. 遇夜廊廡間, 有二僧風幡競辯, 未盡厥理. 祖師躡步而謂曰, '可容俗士得預高論不?' 直以非風幡動仁者心動告之. 大衆, 秖如夜來風起. 且道! 是風動, 不是風動? 若道不是風動, 如此觸簾動戶, 簸土揚塵, 作麼生不是風動? 還斷得出麼? 山僧道, 也不是風動, 也不是幡動, 也不是心動. 有人識得麼? 青山無限好, 猶道不如歸."

[Explanation]

Foyan: When he was faced with *The wind moves* and *The banner moves* he said *it is neither the wind that moves, the banner that moves*, nor the mind that moves. That is, be it the wind that moves or the banner that moves, t*he green mountain is limitlessly splendid*. What else could he be getting at?

佛眼: 當風動幡動, 也不是風動, 也不是幡動, 也不是心動也. 則風動幡動, 青山無限好, 更敢何歸.

Yuwang Jiechen raised this story and in continuation raised the added comment by Baling and Xuedou and said, "As for these three venerable worthies, one released it (放行) like a rock falling off a crumbling cliff, another had it under control (把定) like the great sea swallowing the waves, and the other sat up straight and did not move like Mt. Sumeru. These words of mine (Xianning) completely ignore the clauses and chapters of the Law."

育王諶, 擧此話, 連擧巴陵雪竇拈, 師云, "此三尊宿, 一人放行, 如頹崖裂石;一人把定, 如大海呑潮; 一人端坐不動, 如須彌山. 顯寧伊麼說, 大殺不顧條章.

[Explanation]

Yuwang: *Sat up straight and did not move* etcetera: this refers to the sixth patriarch.

One let go etcetera: this refers to Baling.

Another had it under control etcetera: this refers to Xuedou.

From beginning to end there is no sense of order. What is the intention of Yuwang? One phrase contains the three phrases.[648] This is Fayan's so-called "as it has always been."[649]

育王: 端坐不動云云, 謂祖師也. 一人把定云云, 謂巴陵也. 一人放行云云, 謂雪竇也. 今顚末無次序, 育王意如何? 一句中具三句, 法眼所謂仍舊也.

Yunmen Zonggao in a general sermon raised this story and said,[650] "Once I asked an abbot for help and questioned him about (the sixth patriarch's) intent. The abbot shook his sleeve, caused the wind to move, and said, 'What is this?' How painful! How painful! I was dumbstruck and taken for a fool. Some say, 'It is not the wind that moves. It is not the banner that moves. It must be the mind that moves.' I usually ask students, what does it mean to say, 'It is not the wind that moves. It is not the banner that moves. It is not the mind that moves.' How could one be permitted to blink here!"

雲門杲, 普說, 擧此話云, "山僧曾請益一箇長老, '意旨如何?' 長老將衫袖搖, 作風動勢云, '是什麽?' 苦哉! 苦哉! 慚惶殺人, 鈍置殺人. 有者道, '不是風動, 不是幡動, 定是心動.' 山僧尋常問學者, '不是風動, 不是幡動, 不是心動, 作麽生?' 者裏豈容眨眼!"

[Explanation]

Yunmen Zonggao: *Shook his sleeve* etcetera: this means *it is the wind that moves* and *it is the banner that moves*.

It must be the mind that moves: this means *it is the mind that moves.*

How could one be permitted to blink: picking up the highest crossbar on (the patriarch's) gate.

648 Cf. *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.168a10, 185b12, 189c19).

649 See *Jinling Qingliang yuan Wenyi chanshi yulu* 金陵清涼院文益禪師語錄 (T 1991.47.590c16–28).

650 For this sermon, see also the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.871b25–c1).

雲門: 衫袖搖云云者, 是風動幡動義也. 定是心動者, 是心動義也. 豈貶眼者, 拈起上頭關捩子.

Case 118.

Daoming's Original Face

道明本來面目

[Old Case]

Chan master Daoming was told by the sixth patriarch who was at Dayuling,[651] "Do not think of good or evil! At that very moment what is the original face of chief seat Daoming?" The master had a great awakening.[652]

道明禪師, 因六祖在大庾嶺頭云, "不思善, 不思惡! 正當伊麼時, 阿那箇是明上座本來面目?" 師卽大悟.

[Explanation of the gongan]

When he follwed the traces of the patriarch to Dayuling[653]: he thought of evil.

I've come in search of the dharma etcetera[654]: he thought of good.

Do not think of etcetera[655]: be it good or evil, think of neither and naturally you will be able to enter the essence of the pure mind—this is the original

651 The Dayuling mountain range covers the area between Jiangxi and Guangdong province.

652 This story is found in the vulgate edition of *Platform Sūtra*, where we are told that Daoming (later known as Huiming) was in pursuit of Huineng who had just received a kaṣāya robe and bowl from the fifth patriarch as symbols of transmission. This story does not appear, however, in the Dunhuang version of the *Platform Sūtra*; see Philip Yampolsky, *The Platform Sūtra of the Sixth Patriarch*, pp. 110 and 134; and also Welter, *Monks, Rulers, and Literati*, p. 73. See also *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.232a10–11).

653 See Daoming's biography in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.232a6).

654 *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.232a6).

face of all people.

躡迹追逐至嶺時, 是思惡也;我來求法云云, 是思善也. 不思云云, 善惡都莫思量, 自然得入清淨心體, 是諸人本來面目也.

Congxian[656] of Guanyin Cloister added a comment,[657] "Today, I wouldn't say that. Return chief seat Daoming to me."

觀音院, 從顯拈, "今日不伊麽道. 還我明上座來."

[Explanation]

Congxian: The original face may appear to have subject and object, but even this does not compare to the saying, *return chief seat Daoming to me*, which fundamentally has no subject and object.

從顯: 本來面目, 則似有能所, 不如道, '還我明上座來.' 本無能所也.

Danxia Zichun ascended the hall, raised this story, and said, "Look at how the former patriarch cared for others. In the end he was not willing to come to this side.[658] Do all of you understand? Before the star appears a person lies down in a room of a thousand peaks[659]; the buddhas and patriarchs have no way to recognize him."[660]

---

655 Jingde chuandeng lu (T 2076.51.232a10).

656 Congxian 從顯 (906–983) is a dharma heir of Fayan Wenyi. He first served as abbot of Miaoguo Cloister 妙果院 in Jiangsu province and later became the abbot of Guanyin yuan 觀音院 in Jiangxi province.

657 For this comment, see also the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.417b26–27).

658 This side probably refers to the position of ineffability and silence.

659 The room of a thousand peaks may be referring to Mt. Sumeru (i.e., the immovable center, one's original face, or the ultimate truth), which is surrounded by silver mountains and iron walls.

660 Part of this sermon (from "Do all of you understand" to "recognize him") also appears in the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.17a14–15).

丹霞淳, 上堂, 擧此話云, "看他先祖爲人, 終不肯過這邊來. 諸人還會麽? 星前人臥千峯室, 佛祖無因識得渠."

[Explanation]
Danxia: *Before the star appears a person lies down* etcetera: this is a profound explication of what the sixth patriarch was able to say.

丹霞: 星前人臥云云者, 深明六祖道得處也.

Foyan Qingquan ascended the hall, raised this story, and said, "Great assembly! Do you understand this story? 'At that very moment' for successive eons you've never been deluded. In each and every step you take you shall transcend the three realms and return home where all doubts are instantly cut off."

佛眼遠, 上堂, 擧此話云, "大衆! 還會者話麽? 正當伊麽時, 歷劫不曾迷. 步步超三界, 歸家頓絶疑."

[Explanation]
Foyan: His intent is the same as above.

佛眼意上同

Case 161.

Mazu's Single Gulp

馬祖一口

[Old Case]

Mazu[661] was asked by the layman Pang,[662] "What sort of person does not become the companion of the ten-thousand dharmas?"[663] The master said, "I'll wait till you completely swallow all the water of West River[664] with one gulp and then tell you." At these words the layman was able to understand.[665]

馬祖, 因龐居士問, "不與萬法爲侶者, 是什麼人?" 師云, "待汝一口吸盡西江水, 卽向汝道." 居士言下領解.

661 Mazu refers to Mazu Daoyi 馬祖道一 (709–788). He is traditionally considered a dharma heir of the sixth patriarch Huineng's Nanyue Huairang 南嶽懷讓 (677–744). Mazu served as the abbot of several temples including the Kaiyuan Monastery 開元寺 and Baofeng Monastery 寶峰寺 on Mt. Shimen 石門山 in Jiangxi province. He later received the official title Chan master Daji 大寂禪師. For more on Mazu, see Poceski, *Ordinary Mind as the Way*; and also Jinhua Jia, *The Hongzhou School of Chan Buddhism in Eighth- through Tenth-Century China* (Albany: SUNY Press, 2006).

662 Layman Pang 龐居士 or Pang Yun 龐蘊 (d. 808?) is a famous lay disciple of Mazu Daoyi and Shitou Xiqian.

663 That is, what is is like to transcend the perspective of subject (person) and object (dharmas)?

664 The West River (Xijiang 西江) is a tributary of the Pearl River that flows east through Guangdong.

665 See *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.263b14–16) and *Pang jushi yulu* 龐居士語錄 (XZJ 120. 55a13–15).

[Explanation of the gongan]

Does not become the companion of the ten-thousand dharmas: the (*Pang*) *jushi benlu* says, "First, he consulted Shitou and asked, 'What sort of person does not become the companion of the ten thousand dharmas?' Shitou covered the layman's mouth with his hand. The layman thus had a great awakening. Shitou one day asked the layman, 'Since you've seen me, how have your daily affairs been?' The layman said, 'If you ask me about my daily activities on that spot I am at a loss for words.' Shitou said, 'Knowing that you are like that, I thought I'd ask you.' The layman thereupon presented a verse:

There is nothing extraordinary about daily activities,
Nothing more than me myself seamlessly taking part in them.
Whatever it may be, nothing is taken or discarded,
Wherever it may be, do not assert or oppose.
Vermillion and purple—to whom do these titles belong?[666]
The hills and the mountains have not a single speck of dust.
Supernatural powers and the sublime activity,
Fetching water and gathering firewood."[667]

Next, he asked Mazu (the same question) to present what he had already seen.[668] An ancient one said, "He first consulted Shitou and suddenly interfused with the objects before him; later he consulted Mazu and once again sealed his original mind."[669]

I'll wait till … with one gulp: is this because the layman had already transformed the mountains and rivers and returned them to the self that

---

666 Vermillion and purple were the colors of the robes worn by Tang officials.

667 *Pang jushi yulu* (XZJ120.55a5–11); see also *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T51.2076.263b3–12). For English translation, see Ruth Fuller Sasaki, Iriya Yoshitaka, and D. R. Fraser, *The Recorded Sayings of Layman P'ang: A Ninth-Century Zen Classic* (Tokyo: Weatherhill, 1971), p. 46.

668 This is the *gongan* above.

669 Source unknown.

the master had him turn the self back into mountains and rivers? Or did the master mean, 'even if horses grew horns and jars grew roots I would not lightly explain it away for you'? It is none of the above. Although it is said, "He suddenly interfused with the objects before him," the understanding of sudden interfusion is as vast as the West River. Water from the West River still remains, so the master asked him to swallow all of it until there wasn't a single drop left. Because this was able to truly illuminate what is meant by *does not become the companion of the ten-thousand dharmas* when he later consulted Mazu he once again sealed his original mind. An ancient one said, "What did lord Pang's mouth swallow completely? Who under Heaven did master Mazu's feet stomp to death?"[670] Because it is a revealed fact that cannot be said in a single breath, when you test skill and point directly you will not fall into a special state. To not leave behind the understanding of awakening is to attain awakening.

不與萬法爲侶者, 居士本錄云, "初參石頭問云, '不與萬法爲侶者, 是什麼人?' 頭以手掩居士口, 居士於此, 豁然大悟. 頭一日, 問居士曰, '子自見老僧已來, 日用事作麼生?' 士曰, '若問某甲日用事, 直下無開口處.' 頭云, '知子伊麼, 方始問看.' 士乃呈偈曰, '日用事無別, 唯吾自偶諧. 頭頭非取捨, 處處勿張乖. 朱紫誰爲號? 丘山絶點埃. 神通幷妙用, 運水與槃柴.' 次問馬祖者, 呈似已見也. 古人云, "初參石頭, 頓融前境;後參馬祖, 復印本心." 待汝一口云云者, 前轉山河歸自己故, 令他轉自己成山河耶? 馬頭生角瓮生根, 終不爲君輕說破耶? 皆非也. 雖曰, '頓融前境.' 頓融之解, 大如西江, 西江水猶在故, 令他吸盡無涓滴也. 此眞實明得不與萬法爲侶, 則後參馬祖, 復印本心. 古人云, "龐公口, 卽西江吸盡箇什麼? 馬師脚, 卽天下踏殺箇什麼?" 一口道不得底消息故, 當機直指, 不落別處. 悟解不遺, 悟得處也.

[670] This is a reference to a legendary prophecy made by Prajñātāra. Nanyue Huairang was told by his teacher Huineng that Prajñātāra had made a prophecy about the appearance of a colt (i.e., Mazu) who would stomp to death everyone under heaven; see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.240c15–16) and *Platform Sūtra* (T 2008.48.357b24–25).

Touzi Yiqing's[671] verse[672]

Separated from our parents since beginningless time,
To serve them one must do one's best,
A wooden man[673] speaks in the middle of night,
Do not let others know.

投子青頌, "父母曠來別, 得奉當竭力. 木人半夜言, 莫使外人識."

[Explanation]

Touzi: The first two lines: when he first said, does not become the companion of the ten-thousand dharmas, this is to serve our ancestors. When he now says, does not become the companion of the ten-thousand dharmas, this is to serve them with filial piety to the best of one's ability.

The wooden man … in the middle of the night: it is not something that can be reached with consciousness. How then could discriminative thoughts be permitted?

投子: 上二句, 前來不與萬法爲侶, 是得奉也, 今日不與萬法爲侶, 是竭力奉孝也. 木人半夜云云者, 非情識到, 豈容思慮.

---

671 Touzi Yiqing 投子義青 (1032–1083) had studied under Fushan Fayuan as the latter's disciple. But Fushan transmitted to Touzi not his own Linji lineage but his dead friend Dayang Jingxuan's (942–1027) Caodong lineage. Touzi thus became a dharma heir of Dayang. In 1073, Touzi became the abbot of Haihui Chan Monastery 海會禪寺 on Mt. Baiyun 白雲 in Anhui province. Eight years later he moved to the nearby Mt. Touzi. For more on Touzi's lineage, see Schlütter, *How Zen Became Zen*, pp. 79–81 and 86–95.

672 For this verse, see also the *Touzi Yiqing chanshi yulu* 投子義青禪師語錄 (XZJ 124.465b15).

673 This refers to a totem, which serves as a symbol of insentience or the lack of discriminating consciousness.

Shimen Yuanyi's[674] verse[675]

Allow me to ask he who walks alone on heaven and earth,
With full force he issues the order to become close.
The West River completed swallowed without a single drop left,
Who understands that the throat is a closed strategic ford?

> 石門易頌, "借問乾坤獨步人, 全提分付大言親. 西江吸盡無涓滴, 誰解喉門鑠要津?"

Tiantong Zhengjue's verse[676]

"Completely swallow the West River and then I'll tell you,"
Master Ma was not willing to fall into the weed patch.[677]
Autumn has arrived in the three thousandfold (great thousandfold) worlds and oceans,
The bright moon and the corals illuminate each other in a frigid way.

> 天童覺頌, "吸盡西江向汝道, 馬師不肯落荒草. 三千剎海一成秋, 明月珊瑚冷相照."

[Explanation]

---

[674] Shimen Yuanyi 石門元易 (1053–1137) is a dharma heir of Furong Daokai. In 1110, Yuanyi first became abbot at Zhaoti Monastery 招提寺 in Henan province. He also served as abbot of ten other temples including Shimen Monastery 石門寺 in Hubei province.

[675] For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.158b14–15).

[676] For this verse, see also the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.36b3–4); and also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115, p. 158, b6–7).

[677] That is, Mazu didn't reveal the truth directly, using the language of the scriptures. For more on the weed patch (Ch. *huangcao* 荒草) metaphor, see Ruth Fuller Sasaki trans., and Thomas Yūhō Kirchner ed., *The Record of Linji* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2009), pp. 124–125.

Tiantong: The fourth line also possesses a revealed fact that is radiant and brilliant.

天童: 四句, 亦有光明燦爛地消息也.

Again his verse[678]

"Completely swallow the West River and then I'll tell you,"
There's not a trace of carelessness in Master Ma's family style.
A single stroke cuts the stream and disperses the misty cold,
Heaven and water are both clear, vast, and indistinct in autumn.

又頌, "吸盡西江向汝道, 馬師家風不草草. 截流一棹破煙寒, 天水同秋清渺渺."

Baoning Renyong's verse[679]

A cadaver exposed in the blowing wind and shining sun,
In tears I ask a mountain dweller to find a place to bury him.[680]
With a smile a helplessly chattery old man says,
Be it yin or yang, we can't arrange for your burial anywhere.

保寧勇頌, "風吹日炙露屍骸, 泣問山人覓地埋. 忍俊不禁多口老, 陰陽無處可安排."

---

678 For this verse, see also the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.51b25–26); and also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.158b6–7).

679 For this verse, see also the *Baoning Renyong chanshi yulu* (XZJ 120.373a1–2); *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.382a13–14); and also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.158b4–5).

680 In one version we find transcendent or immortal (Ch. *xianren* 仙人) instead of mountain dweller (Ch. *shanren* 山人); see *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.158b4–5).

Baiyun Fayan's[681] verse

Completely swallow all the water of the West River with one gulp,
The peonies of Luoyang have exposed their pistils.
Clearing away the dirt and blowing away the dust it is nowhere to be found,
I raise my head and bump into it exactly where it's supposed to be.

白雲演頌, "一口吸盡西江水, 洛陽牡丹新吐蘂. 簸土颺塵勿處尋, 擡頭撞着自家底."

Yunmen Zonggao's verse[682]

Completely swallow all the water of the West River with one gulp,
A, B, C, D, E, F, G,[683]
Huh! Huh! Huh!
Luo! Luo! Li!

雲門杲頌, "一口吸盡西江水, 甲乙丙丁庚戊己. 咄, 咄, 咄! 囉囉哩!"

Zhu'an Shigui's verse[684]

The waves in the ocean are shallow,
The heart of a petty person is deep.

681 Before moving to Mt. Wuzu in Hubei province, Fayan had served as abbot of the famous Haihui Chan Cloister on Mt. Baiyun in Anhui province.

682 For this verse, see also the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.855a15–16).

683 The original texts reads "*jia*, *yi*, *bing*, *ding*, *geng*, *wu*, *ji*." Here, Dahui has changed the conventional order of the heavenly stems to maintain, it seems, the rhyme (i.e., *ji* and *li*).

684 This entire verse or poem was actually composed by the Tang poet Du Xunhe; see the *Quan Tang shi* (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 693, 1.

"When the ocean dries up its floor becomes visible,
When a person dies his mind cannot be known."

竹庵珪頌, "大海波濤淺, 小人方寸深. 海枯終見底, 人死不知心."

[Explanation]

Zhu'an: If I were to speak of that which Layman Pang attained, then I would have to immediately say it was limitless. One book calls it the essence of what it means "to be able to understand at these words."

竹庵: 言龐居士所得, 直得無限也. 一本云, 言下領解之要.

Mi'an Xianjie's verse[685]

Having completely swallowed the West River without remainder,
A great man suddenly emerges and is majestically manifest everywhere,
Everyone in this world says that the barbarian's beard is red,
(But) you should know that there is also a red-bearded barbarian.

密庵傑頌, "西江吸盡了無餘, 突出堂堂大丈夫. 盡道世間胡鬚赤, 須知更有赤鬚胡."

Jiean Zhipeng's verse

He who does not become the companion of the ten thousand dharmas,
Come and see how he came to be what he is,[686]

685 For this verse, see also the *Mi'an heshang yulu* (T 1999.47.976c15–17); and *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.159b3–4).

686 What I translate here as "how he came to be what he is" (Ch. *babi* 巴鼻) means "cause," "reason," "basis," or "how one comes to do or becomes something." The term also has the meaning of clue or method.

As soon as you hear it the wind blows and the grass moves,
Immediately, a commotion in the Chan grove,
Cease the commotion!
A partridge sings in the midst of a thick bed of flowers.[687]

介庵朋頌,"不與萬法爲侶, 看來有甚巴鼻! 纔聞風吹草動, 直得叢林鼎沸. 休鼎沸! 鷓鴣啼在深花裏."

Xinwen Tanfen's verse

Completely swallow the entire West River with one gulp,
An ignorant man scoops water out of the pond at night,
Pang miraculously transformed like snow on a burning furnace,
Mazu returned to the grass and hid himself,
The waves are vast and indistinct and its water boundless,
It is best that the man on a wooden raft does not look back,
Even if the sun rises and shines on Fusang.[688]

心聞賁頌,"一口吸西江, 癡人戽夜塘. 龐公化作紅爐雪, 馬祖身歸草裏藏. 波渺渺水茫茫, 好是乘槎人不顧. 從教日出照扶桑."

[Explanation]

Xinwen: *Completely swallowing it all with one gulp*: this is like an ignorant man scooping water out of the pond at night.

---

687 The last line is often attributed to a verse by Xuedou Chongxian; see *Jinling Qingliang yuan Wenyi chanshi yulu* (T 1991.47.591c18); *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.823a16–17); *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.147c17–18); and *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.458b14–15).

688 Fusang 扶桑 is the name of a mythical land located far to the east of China and Japan. In 499 a Buddhist monk named Huishen 慧深 arrived in China allegedly from Fusang and claimed that his native country is 20,000 li to the east of the kingdom of Da Han 大漢, which is located to the north-east of Japan; see *Liang shu* 梁書 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 54, 34.

The third line: (Layman Pang) does not truly exist.

The fourth line: Mazu does not have this limit and is completely engaged in discriminations.

The fifth line: this is about the billows of life and death.

The sixth line: the billows of life and death are a state of freedom in which one swims effortlessly.

The seventh line: the sun that rises and shines on Fusang is referring to Layman Pang.

心聞: 龐居士一口吸盡, 是癡人戽夜塘也. 三句, 非實有也. 四句, 馬祖不在此限, 全在差別也. 五句, 生死波瀾也. 六句, 生死波瀾, 優游自在地也. 七句, 日出照於扶桑, 謂龐居士也.

Layman Benran's[689] verse

The river water flows east,
I know your mouth is narrow,
Master Ma has said everything,
Will you only come to understand in the year of the ass?[690]
The doubt that kills everyone under Heaven,
It is basically this case.

本然居士頌, "江水向東流, 知君口門窄. 馬師道了也, 驢年還會得? 疑殺天下人, 只是遮一則."

Baoning Faxiu added a comment, "Although Master Ma brought the faculty of thought under control, he was pressured lightly by a vulgar man and was defeated. Speak! Wherein does his fault lie? Those who have eyes

689 Almost nothing is known about Layman Benran other than the fact that he was a follower of Yuanwu Keqin.

690 The year of the ass does not exist. In other words, will you ever understand?

should try to discern this.

保寧秀拈, "馬大師, 雖然把定意根, 被箇俗漢輕輕拶着, 便見敗闕. 且道! 過在什麼處? 具眼者, 辨看!"

[Explanation]

Baoning: *Although Master Ma … was defeated*: not only Lord Pang but also Master Ma was not without fault.

Speak etcetera: what other fault could there be?

保寧: 馬大師雖然至敗闕者, 非但龐公, 馬師亦不得無過. 且道云云者, 又有什麼過.

Donglin Changcong ascended the hall, raised this story, and then raised, "A monk asked Fengxue (Yanzhao), 'What sort of person does not become the companion of the ten thousand dharmas?' Fengxue said, 'I place my hand on my forehead to shade my eyes from the sun and gaze at Fusang. The man on the wooden raft does not look back.' "[691] The master said, "Among the assembly there are those who say, 'Great master Ma, with these words of deprecation, did not even leave him (Layman Pang) with the space to breathe. Fengxue, with these words of praise, made it seem fresh everytime he raised it for comment.' This criticism is also not immune to the inspection and blame of the masters everywhere. These two old men only knew how to use the matter on top of the blade's edge.[692] They did not understand how to hide themselves in the blade (the gongan). I (Baofeng) would not do the same. What sort of person does not become the companion of the ten-

[691] See *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* (XZJ 135.734a8–9); cf. *Fenyang Wude chanshi yulu* (T 1992.47.600a4–5).

[692] The matter on top of the blade's edge (劒刃上事) seems to refer to the ability to produce *chan* 禪, that is, point directly to the mind without having recourse to conventional words or letters; for instance, see *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.827a25–29); and also *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.565a3–12); cf. Sasaki and Kirchner, *The Record of Linji*, p. 137.

thousand dharmas? Nine before and nine after."[693]

東林揔, 上堂, 擧此話, 連擧僧問風穴, '不與萬法爲侶者, 是什麽人?' 風穴云, '斫額望扶桑, 乘槎人不顧.' 師云, "衆中道, '馬大師, 是貶底語, 教伊無出氣處;風穴, 是褒底語, 一廻擧着一廻新.' 與麽批判, 亦未免諸方檢責. 此二老, 只解用劒刃上事, 不解向劒刃裏藏身. 寶峯卽不然. '不與萬法爲侶者, 是什麽人?' '前三三, 後三三.' "

[Explanation]

Donglin: *I place my hand on my forehead to shade my eyes from the sun and gaze at Fusang*: this refers to gazing at the critical move of going beyond (向上一著).

The man on the wooden raft does not look back: this means the man on the wooden raft does not look back at Fusang, for this is a very good example of a person who does not become the companion of the ten-thousand dharmas.

Fengxue, with these words of praise … the matter on top of the blade's edge etcetera: Fengxue neither transgresses nor touches (the truth) and leaves us wanting.

Hiding themselves in the blade: this means they are not hindered by the fact that they are companions of the ten-thousand dharmas.

Nine before and nine after: what fault would the ordinary men and sages have for being the companion of the ten-thousand dharmas? There is a small difference between this and Xinwen's "The man on a wooden raft does not look back."

東林: 斫額望扶桑者, 謂望向上一著也. 乘槎人不顧者, 謂乘槎人不顧扶桑, 則此不與萬法爲侶甚好故. 風穴褒地語, 一回擧著, 至劒刃上事云云者, 不犯不觸, 有趣向處也. 劒刃裏藏身者, 不妨與萬法爲侶也. 前三三後三三者, 萬法爲侶, 則

693 Here nine has the connotation of completeness. "Nine before and nine after" presumably denotes the perfect state before and after awakening. Cf. *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.285b16–18); *Fenyang Wude chanshi yulu* (T 1992.47.609c22–610a6); and *Yangqi Fanghui heshang yulu* (T 1994A.47. 645c10–12). See also Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 260b.

凡聖有什麼過. 前心聞乘槎人不顧, 與此小異.

Zhenjing Kewen ascended the hall, raised this story, and said, "The Chan tradition has created many special calculations and sublime understandings. Again, have you not seen Great master Ma freely exhibiting his august radiance and trimming the long to supplement the short?"

眞淨文, 上堂, 擧此話云, "禪門多作奇特商量, 玄妙解會. 又不見馬大師, 威光自在, 裁長補短."

[Explanation]

Zhenjing: *Has created many special calculations and sublime understandings*: this is because they have fixed their eyeballs on the state where one can completely swallow all the water of the West River with one gulp. Great master Ma's intention was to trim the long and supplement the short and that's it. But, not being limited to this, he freely exhibited his august radiance.

眞淨: 多作奇特至解會者, 謂一口吸盡西江水處, 著得眼睛故也. 馬師意, 但裁長補短爾, 不止如此, 威光自在也.

Baiyun Fayan ascended the hall, raised this story, and said, "He completely swallowed all the water of the West River with one gulp and the bottom of the ten-thousand feet deep pond was exposed. A log bridge is not the (famous stone) bridge of Zhaozhou.[694] How could the bright moon and

[694] This refers to a dialogue of Zhaozhou about the famous stone bridge in the town that was like a tourist attraction. "A monk asked, 'I have long heard of the stone bridge of Zhaozhou, but coming here I see only a single-log bridge.' The master said, 'You only saw a single-log bridge, you did not see the Zhaozhou bridge.' The monk said, 'What is the Zhaozhou bridge?' The master said, 'Cross over it!' Again there was a monk who asked the same question and Zhaozhou gave the same answer. The monk said, 'What about the Zhaozhou bridge?' The master said, 'It carries donkeys and carries horses.' The monk asked, 'What about the single-log bridge?' The master said, 'It carries people across one by one.'" See *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.277c12ff.)

clear wind even compare!"

白雲演, 上堂, 擧此話云, "一口吸盡西江水, 萬丈深潭窮到底. 略彴不是趙州橋, 明月清風安可比!"

[Explanation]

Baiyun: A single gulp … the bottom exposed: the root and origin have been thoroughly exposed and hence there are no other matters to attend to.

Log bridge etcetera: just as a log bridge cannot match a real bridge, (the truth) too cannot be compared even to the bright moon or clear wind. In addition, the wind and moon were used to as a metaphor for the guest and host.

白雲: 一口至到底者, 徹根徹源, 更無後事也. 略彴云云者, 橋非略彴所可及, 亦非明月清風所可比. 況風月謂賓主也.

Foguo Keqin, in his *Xinyao*, raised this story, and said,[695] "This old man may appear to have stomped everyone under Heaven to death, but all he did was nonchalantly spit out some words and bring forth limitless views. If there is someone who can make sense of and trim this old man's kudzu-like words, then I kindly request that you excuse yourself from further investigation (of gongans).[696]

佛果勤, 心要, 擧此話云, "信此老踏殺天下人, 只等閑出一語, 便令作無限知見. 若有解截這老漢葛藤, 便請罷參."

[Explanation]

---

695 *Foguo Keqin chanshi xinyao* (XZJ 120.732b3–5).

696 *Basan* 罷參 here literally means "stop investigation" of gongans or "stop consultation" of Chan masters. It refers to the completion of one's training and hence the absence of any further need for further investigation or consultation.

Yuanwu: Although Mazu did say these words, if one brings forth limitless views, then this is not a complete understanding. One has to cut off kudzu-like words and only then will one know how to stomp everyone under Heaven to death three times and raise the commonly accepted grand intent of the story.

佛果: 馬祖雖有此語, 若作無限知見, 便不是了也. 直須絕斷葛藤, 方知踏殺天下人三度, 舉此話大意一般.

Again he raised this story and said, "This public case, many wade through it as if it were a lip-flapping calculation and create understandings of potential and object, but you will certainly not receive the tenet. It must necessarily be someone cast out of iron and only then will one be able to go against the current and transcend realization and thereby understand how to flip over the iron ships of the two old men. Only if one stands at the ten-thousand-mile-high cliff[697] can one know that engaging in the myriad affairs is unnecessary."[698]

又舉此話云, "此个公案, 多有涉唇吻商量, 作機境解會, 殊不稟宗猷也. 要須是个生鐵鑄就底, 方能逆流超證, 乃解翻却二老鐵船, 始到壁立萬仞處, 方知無許多事."

Again, he raised this story and said, "With so many shortcuts and essential points why go to the trouble of making the truth your own (承當) this way? Moreover, if you enter the sayings of others, then you will never ever escape life and death. Students with many views seek a perfect fit only in speculations and appended words (下語). How could this be the views and understandings of someone who has escaped life and death? If you wish to

697 To stand at the ten-thousand-mile-high cliff is to prepare for the great death, that is, for seeing one's own nature and mind directly without having recourse to conventional words or letters; for instance, see *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.731c24–732a7 and 744c4–23).

698 See *Foguo Keqin chanshi xinyao* (XZJ 120.737a12–15).

escape life and death it is only possible if the mind ground is opened. This public case is the key to opening the mind ground. Essentially, the point of all this is clear: receive the tenet outside of words and only then will you arrive at the state of no doubt."[699]

又擧此話云, "多少徑截省要, 何不便與麽承當? 更入他語言中, 則永不透脫. 多見學者, 只麽卜度下語, 要求合頭. 此豈是透生死見解! 要透生死, 除非心地開通. 此箇公案, 乃是開心地鑰匙子也. 只要明了, 言外領旨, 始到無疑之地."

Again, in an informal sermon,[700] he raised this story and said, "I will briefly expose and reveal a fact. To serve others one must be thorough and to kill others one must see blood. Make the truth your own (承當) on the spot and you've already slipped into the second moon (i.e., delusion).[701] Speak! What is the first moon? Huh!"

又小叅, 擧此話云, "山僧略露个消息. 爲人須爲徹, 殺人須見血. 直下便承當, 已落第二月. 且道! 如何是第一月? 咄!"

Foyan Qingyuan asked a monk, "What do you make of 'Layman Pang asked Great master Ma, "What sort of person does not become the companion of the ten thousand dharmas?" He offered his own substitute reply and said, 'I have already answered your reverence."

佛眼遠, 問僧, "龐居士問馬大師, 不與萬法爲侶者, 是什麽人, 如何?" 自代云, "某甲已答和尙了也."

---

699 See *Foguo Keqin chanshi xinyao* (XZJ 120.753a7–11).

700 See *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T47.1997.765a4–6).

701 A second moon is a virtual image. The unique moon that floats in the sky is the first moon; the second moon is the moon seen next to the first moon when you press on your eyes with your fingers or misperceived due to an eye illness.

[Explanation]

Foyan: *I have already answered your reverence*: what other meaning could there be besides *he who is not the companion of the ten-thousand dharmas*? Therefore he said that he had already answered.

佛眼云云, 某甲已答和尚了也者, 不與萬法爲侶外, 更有什麽意? 故云答了也.

Case 165.

Mazu's Circle Image

馬祖圓相

[Old Case]

When Mazu noticed that a monk had come for consultation he drew a circle image[702] and said, "If you enter I shall strike you and if you don't enter shall strike you." As soon as the monk entered, the master immediately hit him. The monk said, "Your reverence should not strike me." The master leaned on his staff and took a rest.[703]

馬祖因見僧參, 畫一圓相云, "入也打, 不入也打." 僧便入, 師便打. 僧云, "和尚打某甲不得." 師靠却拄杖, 休去.

---

702 For a broad overview of the circle image and its relation to the Weiyang house, see Murakami Shun, *Tōdai Zen shisō kenkyū:* Kenkyū hokoku 4 (Hanazono Kokusai Zengaku kenkyūsho: Kyoto, 1996) esp. pp. 583–643. Murakami's untimely death unfortunately left his research on this topic incomplete. The use of circle images is also well attested in the *Zutang ji;* for instance, see ZTJ 4/41/7–8 and 4/49/5–6. For Yangshan Huiji's 仰山慧寂 (803–887) use of the circle, see ZTJ 5/55/1–5. A systematic analysis of the various circles can also be found in the entry for Yangshan's Korean disciple Sunji 順之 (d.u.), which seems to suggest that these circle diagrams were anything but a thing of the moment; see ZTJ 5/113/2–5/137/4. For an English translation of Sunji's entry, see Buswell, "The Life of Sunji" and "Summary of Sunji's Teachings" in *Sourcebook of Korean Civilization, Volume 1: From Early Times to the Sixteenth Century*, edited by Peter H. Lee, 228–241. New York: Columbia University Press, 1993.

703 This story also appears in the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.28c29–29a2); and also *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.488a11–12).

[Explanation of the gongan]

Drew a circle image: ordinary men and sages have the same source, namely a circle image that has sublime form and is devoid of content.

Enter or not enter: some say, "To enter is to be awakened and to not enter is to be deluded," but this is not true. Others say, "To enter is our present state and to not enter is our original endowment." Striking the monk in each and every case means that neither the present state nor the original endowment has been established. This is how to uphold the decree. To enter is to enter the circle image and to understand precisely in circle form. To not enter is to not enter the circle image and to understand in non-circle form. Be it entering or not entering, neither tallies with the master's intentions. Therefore he said, *if you enter I shall strike you and if you don't enter shall strike you*. If so, how should we understand Mazu's intentions?

The monk entered: it is difficult to determine whether he was someone with an eye for the truth or not.

Strike him: the master wished to discern whether he was authentic or not.

Your reverence should not strike me: as expected he is an empty headed fellow.

Leaned on his staff and took a rest: this was done simply to show that the monk was leaning towards one side.

畫一圓相者, 凡聖同源, 妙體無物, 一圓相也. 入不入者, 或云, 入則悟, 不入則迷云者, 非也. 或有云, '入則今時, 不入則本分.' 一一打者, 今時本分, 皆不立, 是擧令也. 入則入圓相, 卽圓相而會也;不入則不入圓相, 離圓相而會也. 入不入, 皆不契師意, 故云, '入也打, 不入也打.' 然則怎生會馬祖意? 僧便入者, 具眼不具眼, 難定也. 便打者, 要辨眞假也. 和上打某甲不得者, 果然是虛頭漢也. 靠却拄杖休去者, 只靠一邊故.

Xuedou Chongxian added a comment, "Neither got it. The monk said, 'Your reverence should not strike me.' The master then leaned on his staff. If he hesitates too much, immediately strike him on his back."

雪竇顯拈, "二俱不了, '和尙打某甲不得.' 靠却拄杖, 擬議不來, 劈脊便打."

[Explanation]

Xuedou: The moment the circle diagram was drawn he should have been struck on his back. If this is not done how could be called "the colt that stomped everyone under Heaven to death"[704]?

雪竇: 畫圓相處, 須是劈脊便打. 若不如是, 何名馬駒踏殺天下人云云也.

Tiantong Zhengjue added a comment,[705] "A skill (機) at the threshold and intention inside the room. Those who have an eye for the truth, try to clearly tell them apart!"

天童覺拈, "跨門之機, 室中之意. 具眼者, 分明辨取!"

[Explanation]

Tiantong: *Skill at the threshold*: this means he looks like he is leaving and also like he's entering.

Intention inside the room: leaving or entering does not matter.

Those with an eye for the truth etcetera: this means one should discern the intent inside the room.

天童: 跨門之機者, 似出似入也. 室中之意者, 不干出入者也. 具眼云云者, 辨取室中之意也.

Fazhen Shouyi added a comment, "Xuedou only knew one and not two. The monk from the very beginning did not fear for his life and immediately entered. This is like a patch-robed monk who waits until the master strikes, catches the staff, flips it around and gives it back. How could this not be a virtuoso? If he doesn't know, this fellow is just a piece of red meat under a naked sword."

---

704 For the colt, see note 670 above.

705 For this comment, see also the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T48.2001.29a2–3).

法眞一拈, "雪竇只知其一. 者僧當初不惜命便入也, 恰似个衲僧. 待他打時, 接住拄杖, 倒與一送, 豈不是作家! 他旣不知, 只是个赤肉, 挨白刃底漢."

[Explanation]

Fazhen: He stands on the side of the monk and praises the monk's behavior.

法眞: 立在這僧邊, 讚助這僧行李也

Case 177.

Baizhang's Wild Duck

百丈野鴨

[Old Case]

Chan master Baizhang Huaihai[706] was walking along with Mazu and saw a wild duck fly by. Mazu said, "What is that?" The master said, "A wild duck." Mazu said, "Where is it going?" The master said, "It is flying away." Mazu thereupon twisted the master's nose. The master moaned in pain. Mazu said, "When did it ever fly away?"[707]

> 百丈懷海禪師, 隨馬祖行次, 見野鴨子飛過. 祖云, "是什麽?" 師云, "野鴨子." 祖云, "什麽處去也?" 師云, "飛過去也." 祖遂扭師鼻頭, 師作忍痛聲. 祖云, "何曾飛過去?"

[Explanation of the gongan]

Saw a wild duck … fly by: this means that the objects and conditions that you encounter all throughout the twelve hours of the day, once converted (轉), return to the self. If you understand this, then you will freely enjoy everything along the way. But if you don't understand, then the mundane

---

706 Baizhang Huaihai (749–814) is a dharma heir of Mazu Daoyi. Huaihai became the founding abbot of a new temple on Mt. Daxiong 大雄山 in Hongzhou (Jiangxi province), the Baizhangshan dazhi shousheng Chan Monastery 百丈山大智壽聖禪寺. The first Chan monastic rules or *qinggui* 清規 is traditionally attributed to Huaihai

707 The same case appears in the *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.188a5–8).

truth (世諦) will spread.[708] This is what is referred to as the "entrance into non-duality nature."

見野鴨子至過去者, 十二時中, 遇境逢緣, 宛轉歸就自己也. 會則途中受用, 不會則世諦流布. 此謂無二性得入.

Xuedou Chongxian's verse[709]

Wild duck, do you know where you're going?
Mazu saw you come and shared a word with you,
He spoke exhaustively of the sentience of mountains, clouds, ocean, and moon,
As before, you don't understand and fly away.
If it wishes to fly away, then grab on to it.
Speak! Speak!

雪竇顯頌, "野鴨子, 知何許? 馬祖見來相共語. 話盡山雲海月情, 依前不會還飛去. 欲飛去, 却把住. 道道!"

[Explanation]

Xuedou: The first line is referring not only to Baizhang but also to the wild duck.

The sentience of mountains, clouds, ocean, and moon: this is the original habitat of the wild duck.

708 "Freely enjoying everything along the way" and "spreading the mundane truth" are also discussed in the *Yunmeng Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T 1988.47.549c18–20) and *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.148a20–29). The former ("freely enjoying everything along the way") seems to refer to the original and natural state of being and the latter ("spreading the mundane truth") to those who take this state for granted.

709 For this verse, see the *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.188b1–6); *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.109b5–6); and also *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.377a16–17).

As before, you don't understand: this is referring to Baizhang's *It is flying away*. How could Mazu not *grab on to it?*

Speak! Speak!: this is referring to Mazu twisting the master's nose.

雪竇: 上句, 非但百丈, 盡是野鴨子也. 山雲海月情者, 野鴨本來行李處也. 依前不會云云者, 飛過去也. 豈不是把住! 道道者, 扭師鼻頭也.

Foyin Zhiqing's verse[710]

Master and disciple were idly walking in a field of grass,
A wild duck flies by and cries and a thought suddenly arises.
A nose was twisted and this (original), what matter was accomplished?
At midday the bell is struck in Silla to announce the third watch of the night.[711]

> 佛印清頌, "師資閑向草中行, 野鴨飛鳴意忽生. 鼻孔扭翻成底事, 新羅日午打三更."

Shangfang Riyi's verse[712]

Flowing water has either east or west,
The reed has no front and back.
A bird in the sand suddenly flies in,
A fisherman is startled by its singing in the night.
Who says moonlight is nowhere to be sought?
It's been there on the autumn river all along.

---

710 *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.109b7–8).

711 The disconnect between the midday bell and the third watch of the night seems to be a metaphor for the disconnect between Baizhang and Mazu.

712 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.109b9–10).

上方益頌, "流水有西東, 盧[713]花無背向. 沙鳥忽飛來, 漁人驚夜唱. 誰道月明無處尋? 元來只在秋江上."

Chongsheng Yuangong's verse

A duck is not a duck,
A person is not a person.
Its cry is fresh in both the past and the present,
Zhaozhou and Wenyuan both debate over who is more inferior,[714]
Old Wang has not a single person to whom he can sell himself.[715]
Because of the intercalary month every three years,
One year we encounter two rounds of spring.

崇勝珙頌, "鴨非鴨, 人非人. 嗳嗳之聲今古新. 趙州文遠同鬭劣, 王老無人獨賣身. 只因三歲閏之餘, 一年翻遇兩廻春."

Jiangshan Keqin's verse[716]

Wild ducks pass by the creek,

---

[713] I substitute *lu* 蘆 for *lu* 盧.

[714] Zhaozhou and his disciple Wenyuan engaged in a debate about who was inferior. The person who was superior would be determined as the loser of the debate. The loser, they agreed, would have to buy the winner a rice cake. Zhaozhou made the first move and said he was an ass. Wenyuan replied that he is the ass' stomach. Zhaozhou then said he was the ass' shit. Wenyuan replied that he is an insect inside the shit. Zhaozhou then asked him what he was doing in there and Wenyuan replied that he was spending the summer retreat there. At that point Zhaozhou asked Wenyuan to bring him a rice cake. For the debate, see *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.330a1–4).

[715] Old Wang refers to Mazu Daoyi's (709–788) dharma heir Nanquan Puyuan 南泉普願 (748–834). See case 204 below.

[716] For this verse, see the *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.801b4–6); and also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.109b11–13).

The thousand peaks display their chilly colors,
I look around but do not know where they return,
I cannot help but depend on a strike (from a master),
Twist away the ball of doubt and the kudzu-like words melt away,
Bring the wind directly to dirt and it streaks up to the clear sky,
Clouds, mountains, ocean, and moon are messy things,
A single saying returns to the source and the ten-thousand (i.e., all) kingdoms pay tribute.

> 蔣山勤頌, "野鴨過前溪, 千峯凜寒色. 相顧不知歸, 未免資傍擊. 扭破疑團葛怛銷, 捎風直土透青霄. 雲山海月渾餘事. 一語歸宗萬國朝."

Fojian Keqin's verse

Master Ma took pity on you for your lack of knowledge,
He borrowed a wild duck and connected you to the revealed facts,
Immediately fetid blood flows from the nose,
The old lady exhausted all her strength.[717]

> 佛鑒勤頌, "馬師憫汝無知識, 借來鴨子通消息. 直得鼻頭羶血流, 費盡老婆多少力."

Foyan Qingyuan's verse[718]

In the grass there are usually thousands upon thousands of (wild ducks),
He reports, 'it flew away,' how could this be in vain?

---

717 The old lady here probably refers to Mazu. For the trope of the old woman in Chan literature, see note 164 above.

718 For this verse, see the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.591b18–592a1); and also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.109b16–17).

The nose is an extremely useless piece of flesh,
Vertically and horizontally pierce it however you like.

> 佛眼遠頌,"草裏尋常萬萬千, 報云飛去豈徒然! 鼻頭是甚閑皮草, 十字縱橫一任穿."

Case 181.

Baizhang Revisits Mazu for a Consultation

百丈再參

[Old Case]

Baizhang revisited Mazu for a consultation. Mazu raised his fly whisk. The master said, "Is this its function or beyond its function?" Mazu hung his whisk back in its old spot. The master paused for a while. Mazu said, "Later when you open your lips how will you care for (i.e., teach) others?" The master thereupon snatched the whisk and raised it. Mazu said, "Is this its function or beyond its function?" The master also hung the whisk back up. Mazu immediately gave out a shout. The master thus became deaf for three days.

[Later, Huangbo[719] arrived on Mt. Baizhang. One day he bid farewell and tried to go and pay his respects to Mazu. Baizhang said, "Mazu has already passed away." Huangbo said, "What did Mazu say?" Baizhang thereupon raised the account of him revisiting Mazu for a consultation and said, "At that time I received a shout from Mazu and thus became deaf for three days." Huangbo heard what was raised and he inadvertently stuck out his tongue (in astonishment). Baizhang said, "Later will you or will you not succeed Mazu?" Huangbo said, "I won't. Because of what the master raised today I was able to

719 This is Huangbo Xiyun who is a dharma heir of Baizhang Huaihai. Sometime in the early ninth century Xiyun became the abbot of Daan Monastery 大安寺 in Hongzhou 洪州, Jiangxi province. There he met the official Pei Xiu 裴休 (797–870) who built Xiyun a new temple. This new temple was named Huangbo 黃檗. He received the posthumous title Chan Master Duanji 斷際禪師.

see the functioning of Mazu's great skill (大機之用). But I do not recognize Mazu. If I succeed Mazu, I will bring ruin to my descendants."][720]

> 百丈再叅馬祖, 祖竪起拂子, 師云, "即此用, 離此用?" 祖掛拂子於舊處, 師良久, 祖云, "你已後, 開兩片皮, 將何爲人?" 師遂取拂子竪起, 祖云, "即此用, 離此用?" 師亦掛拂子於舊處, 祖便喝. 師直得三日耳聾. <後黄蘗到百丈, 一日辭, "欲禮拜馬祖去." 丈云, "馬祖已迁化也." 蘗云, "未審馬祖有何言句?" 丈遂擧再叅因緣云, "我當時被馬祖一喝, 直得三日耳聾." 黄蘗聞擧, 不覺吐舌. 丈云, "子已後, 莫承嗣馬祖否?" 蘗云, "不然. 今日因師擧, 得見馬祖大機之用, 且不識馬祖. 若嗣馬祖, 已後喪我兒孫." >

[Explanation of the gongan]

Baizhang revisited Mazu for a consultation[721]: this means Baizhang had become an abbot but later *revisited* Mazu for a consultation. This is because the Dharma that he attained while engaging the assembly everyday is not like what he had attained before. Therefore it is said that he revisited Mazu for a consultation. This, for instance, is like the Buddha holding assembly twice at Puguang.[722]

In the Chan grove lecturers make calculations about this story and say, "What Mazu raised was a whisk with long hair. *Is this its function*: this means 'Is this the fly whisk's function or beyond the fly whisk's function.' In other words, it is the neither-ignore-nor- confront barrier (背觸關).[723]

---

720 An earlier and significantly shorter version of this story can be found in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.249c13–17). A more developed version can be found in the *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* where Baizhang's story and Huangbo's story are presented separately (XZJ 135.655b7–11 and 656a8–12). A version of the story similar to the version used in the *Seonmun yeomsong* can be found in the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.848c24–849a5); cf. *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.151b27–c11).

721 The text is corrupted here and reads Yangshan (Huiji) revisited Weishan (Lingyou) for a consultation.

722 The *Huayan jing* was delivered on nine different occasions at seven different locations. Puguang hall was the second and the seventh location.

723 This is from the *Baojing sanmei* (T 1986A.47.515a19–20).

Mazu hung … place: this transcends ignoring and confronting. *The master thereupon snatched the whisk and raised it* and also *hung the whisk back up*: this is like water being transferred from one container to another."[724] Lecturers thus draw simple straight lines and say that this is a theory that remains unchanged since the past and up to the present.[725]

I do not think so. Why? Baizhang at that time had not yet illuminated the great matter. So it could not be the case that he was able to immediately turn the "neither-ignore-nor-confront" barrier into a question as soon as he saw Mazu raise the fly whisk. Moreover, the "neither-ignore-nor-confront" barrier is what the masters of our tradition with an eye for the truth perceive and put to use and not the stuff of normal behavior. If water was, indeed, just transferred from one container to another, then he who has already penetrated the barrier would not have any further matters to which to attend. Again, it could not, then, be the case that Baizhang received a shout and afterwards completed (the great) matter. Please discern this carefully.

What Mazu raised was a fly whisk. But it is not something to be discussed beyond the level of a long-haired whisk. Raising it was done to respond to the opponent's skill. In other words, it is "release" (放行). Hanging the whisk back up is to not respond to the opponent's skill. In other words, it is "control" (把定).

Is this its function or beyond its function: one book says, "Is this it? Is there anything else?"[726] That is, *Is this its function* denotes the state of raising the whisk and *beyond its function* denotes the state of hanging the whisk back up.

Paused for a while: this is the short break in the middle of a sermon.

Later when you … care for others: the last point about caring for others is subtle guidance.

---

724 In Chan the metaphor of transferring water from one container to another is used to emphasize the fact that the master's realization was transmitted in its entirety and without alteration to the disciple; for instance, see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.206a18–20).

725 See Yuanwu Keqin's verse comment below.

726 Source unknown.

The master raised the fly whisk and also *hung the whisk back up*: although he had not been able to completely get Mazu's intention as if water was transferred from one container to another, he did not just learn it that day (when he revisited Mazu) either. If he had just learned it that day, then it would not make sense to say that he was able to ask, *Is this its function or beyond its function*, as soon as he saw the whisk raised.

He heard the wild duck's cry and his nose was twisted by Mazu.[727] He thereupon had a realization. When Mazu happened to ascend the abbot's seat the next day Baizhang rolled up his worship mat.[728] This demonstrates that he has already seen the truth. His intent was to say, "There are no living beings that can be saved and so what is the point of ascending the seat"? Mazu descended from the seat and returned to the abbot's quarters. He asked, "Just now, before I even began to expound on the dharma why did you roll up your worship mat?" The master said, "My nose was twisted by you." Mazu said, "Yesterday, what was on your mind?" The master said, "Today, my nose is not in pain again." Mazu said, "You have profoundly illuminated the great matter of the present moment (今日事)." The master thereupon bowed … As for "Today, my nose is not in pain again," its intent was to say, "Although this is something I originally possess I must take advantage of new opportunities." As for returning to the attendants' quarters and suddenly crying at one moment and suddenly smiling at another, yesterday his nose was in pain so he cried and today his nose was no longer in pain so he smiled. This is because he is equipped with both the great matter of the present moment and the great matter of one's original endowment and what he has thus seen is not one-sided. Therefore, as soon as he saw Mazu raise the whisk he said, *Is this its function or beyond its function*. If he had not attained anything how could this be so? Although this is the case, he was

727 See old case 177 above.

728 For this story, see the *Biyan lu* (T2003.48.188a24–28); and also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.161b18–162a7).

equipped with essence but his subtlety had not reached its utmost. Therefore Zhenjing Kewen said, "The consciousness of a guest changes with every step he takes and person he meets. He possesses a great, authoritative radiance but cannot manifest it."[729]

Mazu immediately gave out a shout, this one shout is none other than the pattern-less seal of the primordial buddha.[730] With a single seal it sealed (the mind). One book says, "With all his might he gave out a single shout."[731] This means he used all his strength to lift it up.

Became deaf for three days: what had been attained before was shaken off one by one. Arriving here, he personally understood the final twist (末後曲折) and profoundly got Mazu's intention. This is what Yangshan meant by "Baizhang attained the great skill and Huangbo attained the great function."[732] However, this is not an understanding of the great skill and great function beyond the raising of the whisk as "release" and hanging of the whisk as "control." It is to release and control and thus to understand. An ancient one said, "I'll explain the last phrase for you—it is the moment when light and dark go side-by-side."[733] This is what I mean.

So then if Baizhang had deeply understood Mazu's intention in raising the whisk and hanging up the whist at the start, what would he plan to do beyond controlling and releasing? Because Baizhang was unable to do so, Mazu immediately wielded a shout, so you should know that "if you cut down the cassia tree on the moon, the clear moonlight will be even brighter."[734]

---

729 See Zhenjing's verse below.

730 Literally "beyond the eon of the King of Awesome Sound." See Case 988, note 230.

731 See *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.151c7).

732 *Yuanzhou Yangshan Huiji chanshi yulu* 袁州仰山慧寂禪師語錄 (T 1990.47.587b18).

733 The ancient one is Xuedou Chongxian; see *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.186c17).

734 This is a line from a poem by Du Fu 杜甫 (712–770), "One hundred and five days facing the moon" 一百五日夜對月 (*Quan Tang shi* 224, 71):

> Homeless and facing cold food
> He shed tears like the golden waves (of the moonlight).

But in that case Baizhang and Huangbo cannot but have intimately inherited Mazu's one shout. Why? Huangbo said, "If I succeed Mazu I will bring ruin to my descendants."[735] He said this, and for no other reason, because he was only able to illuminate the great function. If he had not intimately inherited Mazu's one shout how could it be called great skill and great function? Therefore, Baizhang only attained the great function and had no further need for the great function. Huangbo only attained the great function and had no further need for the great skill. Those who have no methods of their own generally say, "There is great function within great skill and great skill within great function." If this is the case, how could they ever dream of seeing Baizhang and Huangbo? At this moment, an ancient one would have simply said, "A blade that kills and a sword that gives life."[736]

仰山再叅潙山者, 住方後再叅也. 此則常在會中, 所得法與昔不同. 故曰再叅也. 例如佛重會普光也. 叢林中商量此話云, "馬祖竪起地, 毛毶毶地拂子也. 即此至用者, 即此拂子用, 離此拂子用, 即背觸關. 祖掛至處者, 背觸俱離也. 師遂取拂子竪起, 又掛拂子於舊處者, 如水傳器." 講若畫一云云, 此古今不易之論. 愚以爲不然. 何者? 百丈, 當時未明大事矣, 才見馬祖竪起拂子, 直以背觸關爲問, 無有是處. 又背觸關, 具眼宗師受用, 非行李邊事也. 若也如水傳器, 已透得關, 更

If he cut away the cassia trees in the moon,
The clear light will shine even more.
Even though separated (from them) the reeds blooms.
Still he thinks of the image of the dark eyebrows knit.
The oxhereder and (weaver) girl were full of sad longing,
But still on the autumn equinox (7th day of 7th month) they cross the Milky Way.

無家對寒食 有淚如金波 斫卻月中桂 清光應更多 仳離放紅蕊 想像嚬青蛾 牛女漫愁思 秋期猶渡河

The reference to cutting down the cassia tree was used in Chan as a metaphor for opening up the clear eyes that would see reality if you removed the attachments that stick to a framework. I thank John Jorgensen for this reference and translation.

735 *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.592b3–4).

736 See *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.689b15); *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.720b19, 748a04, 779a13, 789c26, 794a26, 797a14); and *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.152c14, 170b10, 188c9).

無後事, 被一喝然後事畢, 亦無有是處. 請詳辨之. 馬祖竪起地, 一條拂子也. 然非離毛毿毿地外別討也. 竪起則接待來機, 即放行也;掛拂子則不待來機, 即把定也. 即此用, 離此用者, 一本云,"只這箇, 別更有在?" 則即此用, 指竪起拂子處;離此用, 指掛拂子處. 良久者, 說法須臾之間也. 你已後, 至爲人者, 末後爲人, 曲折推徵也. 師竪起拂子, 又掛拂子者, 雖未盡得馬祖意, 如水傳器, 又非今日方始學得也. 若也今日學得, 才見竪起拂子, 便問即此用離此用, 無有此理. 聞野鴨子聲, 被馬祖扭得鼻孔, 遂有省, 値陞座, 出捲拜席, 是呈似已見也. 意謂無有衆生可度, 陞座圖箇什麽也. 祖下座歸方丈, 問曰,"我適來未曾說法, 你爲什麽捲却拜席?" 師曰,"被和尙扭得鼻孔." 祖曰,"你昨日, 向什麽處留心?" 師曰,"今日鼻孔又不痛." 祖曰,"你深明今日事." 師乃作禮云云. 今日鼻頭又不痛者, 意謂雖是本有, 必借新熏也. 却歸侍者寮, 忽然哭, 又忽然笑者, 昨日鼻頭痛故哭;今日鼻頭又不痛故笑. 盖今日本分, 俱備見處, 不偏枯故也. 是以, 才見馬祖竪起拂子, 便道即此用離此用. 若也無所得, 爭能伊麽? 雖然如是, 具體而微, 未臻其極. 故眞淨文云,"客情步步隨人轉, 有大威光不能現." 祖便喝者, 這一喝, 直在威音那畔, 無文印子, 一印印破也. 一本云, '振威一喝者' , 盡力提持也. 三日耳聾者, 前來所得, 一一撲落, 到此, 體會末後曲折, 深得馬祖意. 仰山所謂, '百丈得大機, 黃蘗得大用.' 然非離竪拂放行, 掛拂把定, 會得大機大用, 即此把定放行而會得. 古人云,"末後句爲君說, 明暗雙雙地時節." 盖此義也. 然則當初百丈, 若於馬祖竪拂掛拂處, 深得其意, 把定放行外, 圖箇什麽? 百丈旣不能故, 馬祖直得振威一喝, 信知斫却月中桂, 淸光應更多. 然則百丈黃蘗, 莫不親承馬祖一喝. 何故? 黃蘗云,"若承嗣馬祖, 已後喪我兒孫." 此無他, 但明得大用故云耳. 若不親承馬祖一喝, 何名大機大用? 故百丈只得大機, 更不要大用;黃蘗只得大用, 更不要大機. 有一般無巴鼻地道,"大機中有大用, 大用中有大機." 若伊麽, 何曾夢見百丈黃蘗. 到這時節, 古人, 只道得箇殺人刀活人劍.

Fenyang Shanzhao's verse[737]

Everyday without causing any trouble I attended the master,
The master pointed to the whisk hanging on the corner of the corded chair,

---

737 See *Fenyang Wude chanshi songgu daibie* 汾陽無德禪師頌古代別 (T 1992.47.608a7–8).

He raised it and put it down so I returned to my original place,
The shout can still be clearly heard even to this very day.
[The book (reads), "Baizhang revisited the master for a consultation and stood in attendance. The master placed his gaze upon the whisk hanging on the corner of the meditation bench. Baizhang said, 'Is this its function or beyond its function?' Mazu said, 'Later when you open your lips how will you care for others?' The master snatched the whisk and raised it. Mazu said, 'Is this its function or beyond its function?' Baizhang hung the whisk back up. Mazu authoritatively gave out a shout."[738]]

> 汾陽昭頌, "每因無事侍師前, 師指繩床角上懸. 擧放却歸本位立, 分明一喝至今傳." <此本, 百丈再叅侍立次, 祖以目視禪床角拂子. 丈曰, "即此用, 離此用?" 祖曰, "你向後, 開兩片皮, 將何爲人?" 丈取拂子竪起. 祖曰, "即此用, 離此用?" 丈掛拂子於舊處, 祖振威一喝.>

[Explanation]

Fenyang: *He raised it and put it down so I returned to my original place* etcetera: he stood the whisk up and put it down and there are none who did not intimately inherit the authoritative shout.

汾陽: 擧放却歸本位立云云者, 竪拂放拂, 無不親承振威一喝也.

Dajue Huailian's verse

The *yu* note is hit and the *shang* note resonates—whatever you touch works,
Master and disciple mutually displayed the lineage style (宗風).
Give out an authoritative shout—frost descends and whirlwinds rise,

738 Cf. *Fenyang Wude chanshi songgu daibie* (T 1992.47.608a3–6), which reverses the order of the verse and the story.

Even though (the shout) manifests refinement he does not hear it.[739]

大覺璉頌, "叩羽鳴商觸處通, 師資交互現宗風. 振威一喝霜飈起, 任是昭文也不聽."

Jianfu Benyi's verse[740]

When they met again on Great Hero's Peak,[741]
Grass had grown thick on the path that they tread together.
Heaven and earth grow dark as he turns his head and gives out a shout.
Deaf in both ears, he is aware of nothing.

薦福逸頌, "大寂雄峯再會時, 相將行處草離離. 迴頭一喝乾坤黯, 兩耳都聾摠不知."

Jiangshan Faquan's[742] verse

He releases and collects—who says there is no slandering and deceiving!
Have you seen the mechanism (機關) that was leaked?
The thunder-like shout hurts anyone who hears it.
Three days of being deaf is not all that long.

蔣山泉頌, "放收誰道沒謷訛! 漏洩機關見也麽? 一喝如雷聞者喪, 耳聾三日未爲多."

739 For manifest refinement (*zhaowen* 昭文), see *Zuo zhuan jishi benmo* 左傳紀事本末, Duke Huan 桓公, year 2 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 34, 2: "The fire, dragon, and noble designs displayed upon his attire all manifest his refinement 火龍黼黻昭其文也"

740 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.107a18–b1).

741 Great Hero's Peak (Daxiongfeng 大雄峯) is another name for Mt. Baizhang.

742 This refers to Nanming Faquan, see note 292 above.

Haiyin Chaoxin's verse[743]

Those in the Chan grove who can discern the shout are rare,
In the past and in the present they try to force their needles into deaf ears.[744]
The lantern claps its hands and laughs, *ha*, *ha*.
The exposed pillar lowers its head and raises its eyebrows.[745]

海印信頌, "一喝叢林辨者稀, 耳聾今古强針錐. 燈籠撫掌呵呵笑, 露柱低頭却皺眉."

Zhenjing Kewen's verse[746]

The consciousness of a guest changes with every step he takes and person he meets.
He possesses a great, authoritative radiance but cannot manifest it.
A sudden shout and both ears go deaf.
Naṭa's eyes open on Huangbo's face.[747]

眞淨文頌, "客情步步隨人轉, 有大威光不能現. 突然一喝雙耳聾, 那吒眼開黄蘗面."

743 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ115.107b2–3).

744 Needles here are referring to medical treatment and serve as a metaphor for Chan teaching mechanisms.

745 The exposed pillar (*luzhu* 露柱), which may sometimes more specifically refer to the dragon-shaped ornament at the top, as well as the lantern are often used as metaphors for the monastery. See the note in Ruth Fuller Sasaki and Thomas Yūhō Kirchner, *Record of Linji*, p. 298.

746 For this verse, see the *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.383b6–7); *Xu chuandeng lu* 續傳燈錄 (T 2077.51.644c10–11); and also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.107b10–11).

747 In Chan and Zen, Naṭa, a protector god, is usually known as the son of Vaiśravaṇa. See also Edward L. Davis, *Society and the Supernatural in Song China* (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 2001), pp. 48–49; and also Ho Kin-chung, "Nezha: Figure de l'enfant rebelle," *Études chinoises* VII, no. 2 (1988): 7–26.

[Explanation]

Zhenjing: *A sudden shout … on Huangbo's face*: this means Huangbo attained the great function.

眞淨: 突然一喝至黄蘗面者, 黄蘗得大用也.

Baoning Renyong's verse[748]

The wooden horse stomped the people of Jambudvīpa to death,[749]
The clay dragon drank up the water of the vast ocean.
A thunderbolt fills the empty mountain and the marchmount crumbles,[750]
Take a look at the waves rising on level ground.

保寧勇頌, "木馬蹋殺閻浮人, 泥龍飲竭滄溟水. 霹靂滿空山岳摧, 看看平地波濤起."

Donglin Changcong's verse[751]

Having not yet illuminated the great wisdom he revisits Mazu for a consultation,
They each take turns giving and taking but their function was not arbitrary.
Slice the waves and cut the flows and the whole body manifests.[752]

748 For this verse, see the *Baoning Renyong chanshi yulu* (XZJ 120.372b15–16); and also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.107b14–15).

749 The wooden horse here refers to Mazu; see note 670 above.

750 The thunderbolt here most likely refers to Mazu's shout.

751 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.107b8–9).

752 The waves and flows are metaphors for the incessant flow of ignorance and delusion. The whole body refers to the true self that has freed itself from ignorance and delusion.

Deaf for three days—who understands his tune (知音)?[753]

> 東林總頌, "未明大智再參尋, 相逐相隨用不任. 斷浪截流全體現, 一聾三日孰知音!"

Shangfang Riyi's verse[754]

The rainy day is clearing up but the clouds have not yet gone back.
A sudden crack of thunder on a clear day.[755]
The plum blossoms of the Yu mountain range have already received news (消息) of spring.
This cannot be compared to the mountain peach flowers that blossom all at once.[756]

> 上方益頌, "雨霽遊雲尚未歸, 晴空忽地一聲雷. 嶺梅已得春消息, 不比山桃一例開."

Foyin Zhiqing's verse[757]

Mazu intimately transmitted the mind of the old buddhas,
Huaihai of Great Hero's Peak is his sympathetic friend (知音).[758]
A single shout at that time made him deaf for three days.
Not seeing and not hearing continues even to this day.

---

753 The last line is a pun and can also be rendered, "Deaf for three days—who is (Mazu's) sympathetic friend?" See Foyin's verse below.

754 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.107b18–108a1).

755 Again, thunder here is most likely referring to Mazu's shout.

756 The mountain peach flowers, which blossom all at once, is a metaphor for Mazu's shout.

757 For this verse, see also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.107b16–17).

758 The *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* version has Baizhang of Haichan 海禪 (XZJ 115.107b16).

佛印淸頌, "馬祖親傳古佛心, 大雄懷海是知音. 當時一喝聾三日, 無見無聞直至今."

Chongsheng Yuangong's verse

A single shout turns things over and causes him to be deaf for three days,
When they met who would have known that he was a great virtuoso?
Although the spring sunlight does not possesses a personal force,
Why does it cause the face of the flower to gradually blush?
And does it gradually blush!
The third son of the Xie family is no longer an old fisherman.[759]

崇勝珙頌, "一喝翻令三日聾, 相逢誰識大家公? 春陽雖有無私力, 花臉寧敎取次紅? 取次紅! 謝三不是釣魚翁."

Foyan Qingyuan's verse[760]

Deaf after being scolded for hanging the fly whisk,
How could a patch-robed monk testify to the style of the lineage (宗風)?
Pull out the iron rod from the back of the Vajrasattva's head,[761]
The three peaks of Mt. Hua stand upside down facing the sky.

佛眼遠頌, "掛拂遭呵耳便聾, 衲僧奚若驗宗風? 金剛腦後抽生鐵, 華岳三峯倒卓空."

759 The third son of the Xie family refers to Xuansha Shibei; see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.343c28).

760 For this verse, see the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.592a14–15); and also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.108a10–11).

761 Here, Qingyuan may be citing a verse by Wuzu Fayan; see *Fayan chanshi yulu* (T 1995.47.655b8).

Again, his verse[762]

When the house is well off it produces filial sons,
When the country is powerful there are wise advisors,
A blow to the mouth,
And it will never have to come to not having descendents.
[This verse is about Huangbo sticking out his tongue in astonishment]

> 又頌, "家肥生孝子, 國霸有謀臣. 拳頭劈口搥, 未到無兒孫." <此頌黃蘗吐舌>

Cishou Huaishen's verse[763]

Father and son meet each other and they smell alike,
Sharpen the precious dragon spring sword again,[764]
If you wish to clarify Mazu's shout of those years,
The great earth, mountains, and rivers will all become deaf.

> 慈受頌, "父子相逢臭味同, 龍泉寶劔再磨礱. 要明馬祖當年喝, 大地山河盡耳聾."

Jiangshan Keqin's verse[765]

---

762 For this verse, see also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.109a15–16).

763 See *Cishou Huaishen chanshi guanglu* 慈受懷深禪師廣錄 (XZJ 126.610a3–4); and also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.108b2–3).

764 The dragon spring sword is a legendary sword from the ancient state of Chu; for more on this sword, see Edward H. Schafer, *Pacing the Void: T'ang Approaches to the Stars* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1977), pp. 148–160.

765 There are minor differences between this version and the version found in the *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.798b18–21).

Stand the fly whisk upright and hang it back up,
Skill (機) in its entirety appears and disappears,
"Is this it or beyond this?"
Lecturers thus draw simple straight lines,
Right on the top of the head a thunderbolt booms,
Extract the needle from the gaohuang pressure point and rid yourself of the terminal illness,[766]
Make the shout your own (承當) and become deaf for three days,
With divine authority the lion, doing as he pleases,[767] pounces and twirls,
Pure gold refined a hundred times over loses its color,
Again I say, "Is there one?" "Is there one?"
Huh!

> 蔣山勤頌, "立拂掛拂, 全機出沒. 即此離此, 講若畫一. 頂門當下轟霹靂, 鍼出膏肓必死疾. 承當一喝聾三日, 師子神威資返擲. 百鍊眞金須失色." 復云, "有麼? 有麼? 咄!"

[Explanation]

Jiangshan: *With divine authority the lion, doing as he pleases, pounces and twirls*: this means he attained the secret of a lion pouncing and twirling.

Pure gold refined a hundred times etcetera: under Mazu's shout even pure gold refined a hundred times over should lose its color.

Is there one? Is there one?: this means, is there anyone like Baizhang?

Huh!: this means even if there was one he would still be useless.

蔣山: 師子神威資返擲者, 得獅子返擲決也. 百鍊眞金云云者, 馬祖喝下百鍊眞金, 也須失色. 有麼有麼者, 如百丈子, 有麼也. 咄者, 設有, 也無用處.

766 The *gaohuang* is located below the heart and above the diaphragm. Illnesses that appear in this region of the body are considered incurable as ingestible medicines and needles cannot reach it. For its locus classicus, see the *Zuo zhuan jishi benmo*, Duke Cheng 成公, year 10 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 31, 28b–29a.

767 Here I follow the *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.798b20) and use *zi* 恣 in place of *zi* 資.

Yunmen Zonggao's verse[768]

The colt shouted and harmed the lineage style,[769]
This revealed fact has reached everywhere within the four seas,
Dredging up the moon from raging flames,
Loftily sitting alone on Great Hero's Peak.[770]

> 雲門杲頌, "馬駒喝下喪家風, 四海從玆信息通. 烈火燄中撈得月, 巍巍獨坐大雄峯."

Zhu'an Shigui's verse[771]

Jiangxi's (Mazu's) shout shook heaven and earth,
Great function and perfected skill is the gate to extinction,
Three days of deafness goes by like wind passing by a tree,
Huangbo got involved and ruined his descendants.

> 竹庵珪頌, "江西一喝動乾坤, 大用全機是滅門. 三日耳聾風過樹, 累他黃蘗喪兒孫."

Baiyun Bing's verse[772]

The great skill and great function is not transmitted lightly,

---

768 For this verse, see the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.851a5–6); and also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.108a14–15).

769 The colt here refers to Mazu; see note 670 above.

770 Sitting alone on Great Hero's Peak itself became a gongan; for instance, see *Biyan lu* (T 2003. 48.166c26).

771 See *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.108a12–13). See also the *Donglin heshang Yunmen anzhu songgu* (XZJ 118.797b11–12).

772 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.108a8–9).

The fly whisk is hung and he is berated—how could it be a coincidence?
After the painted vase is shattered,
Darkness is extended endlessly for all eternity.

> 白雲昺頌, "大機大用不虛傳, 掛拂遭呵豈偶然! 打破畫甁歸去後, 從敎千古黑漫漫."

Xinwen Tanfen's verse

The dragon winds itself around the twilight and returns to the grotto palace (洞府),
The wild goose drags the fall colors and passes by Hengyang,[773]
A mountain pass where one could not bear to turn one's head,
The leaves fall and the gibbons cry[774]—how truly heartbreaking!

> 心聞賁頌, "龍帶晩煙歸洞府, 鴈拖秋色過衡陽. 不堪迴首關山路, 木落猿啼正斷腸!"

The August Emperor of Great Song's verse[775]

The fly whisk on the corner of the bench,
Raise it or put it down—both are already wrong,
How dimwitted is Baizhang,
After a shout he enters into subtlety.

---

773 Hengyang is in present-day Hunan province.

774 Both are motifs borrowed most likely from the poet Xie Lingyun 謝靈運 (385–433) who used them to sing about the lineliness of the traveler; see David Hinton trans., *The Mountain Poems of Hsieh Ling-yün* (New York: New Direction Books, 2001), pp. 56–57.

775 The emperor here is Xiaozong 孝宗 (r. 1162–1189); see *Lichao shishi zijian* 歷朝釋氏資鑑 (XZJ 132.217a3).

大宋皇帝頌, "牀頭一拂子, 舉放已皆非. 百丈何遲鈍, 一喝入精微."

Layman Wujin's verse[776]

A single shout takes down Great Hero's Peak,
Deaf in both ears of the skull for three days,
As soon as he hears the account, Huangbo sticks his tongue out in astonishment,
With this Jiangxi was able to establish his family style.

無盡居士頌, "一聲喝倒大雄峯, 三日髑髏雙耳聾. 黃蘗纔聞驚吐舌, 江西從此立家風."

Layman Benran's verse

What a great shout!
Just like shooting a thousand pounds of cross-bow arrows,
Incredibly difficult to make the shout your own on the spot,
Not a cloud for ten-thousand miles, look at the expansive sky,
The whisk, once raised, has the power to take or give life.

本然居士頌, "好一喝! 似把千鈞弩機撥, 直下承當也大難. 萬里無雲見空闊, 拂子拈來有殺活."

---

776 For this verse, see the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.108a4–5); and also *Xu chuandeng lu* (T 2077.51.644c1–3). A different version of this verse can be found in the *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.320b5–6):

Mazu's shout on Great Hero's Peak
The sound enters the skull and he's deaf for three days
Huangbo hears (the account) and sticks his tongue out in astonishment
With this Jiangxi was able to advance his lineage style

馬師一喝大雄峰 聲入髑髏三日聾 黃檗聞知驚吐舌 江西從此振宗風

Layman Yuezhai's verse

Extraordinary ways of toying around with a fly whisk,
Its warp and weft are known by few,
Just as the lotus withers at the end of autumn,
It's the tenth month when the green tangerines become yellow and ripe.

> 悅齋居士頌, "拂子偏他弄得奇, 絲來線去少人知. 恰如秋盡芙蓉老, 橘綠棖黃十月時."

Weishan asked Yangshan,[777] "In the account of Baizhang revisiting Mazu for a consultation and Mazu raising the fly whisk, what was the intent of these two venerable worthies?" "This is a manifestation of the function of great skill." Weishan said, "Mazu produced eighty four good teachers—how many of them acquired great skill?" Yanghsan said, "Baizhang acquired great skill, Huangbo the great function, and the rest are all proselytizers." Weishan said, "Quite so, quite so."

潙山問仰山, "百丈再叅, 馬祖竪拂因緣, 此二尊宿意旨如何?" 仰山云, "此是顯大機之用." 潙山云, "馬祖出八十四人善知識, 幾人得大機? 幾人得大用?" 仰山云, "百丈得大機, 黃蘗得大用, 餘者盡是唱道之師." 潙山云, "如是, 如是."

[Explanation]

Weishan and Yangshan's dialogue has already been cited in the explanation of the gongan. As for 'proselytize," it should be *changdao* 唱導 (and not *changdao* 唱道). This is to chant out loud the Principle of the Dharma and guide the myriad beings."

777 For this sermon, see *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* (XZJ 135.656a14–18); *Yuanzhou Yangshan Huiji chanshi yulu* 袁州仰山慧寂禪師語錄 (T 1990.47.587, b15–23); *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.109a10–14); *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.163a15–b1); *Baizhang Huaihai chanshi yulu* 百丈懷海禪師語錄 (XZJ 119.818a17–b3) etc.

潙仰問答話中, 已引入. 唱道者, 當作導, 敷唱法理, 開導羣生也.

Xuedou Chongxian added a comment,[778] "Great Chan virtuosos, how odd! Nowadays those who line up their branch lineages are many, but those who investigate their origins are very few. They all say Baizhang had a great awakening because of a shout, but is really the case or not? Although *diao* (刁) and *dao* (刀) are similar, *yu* (魚) and *lu* (魯) are at variance. If it is a clear-eyed fellow, he cannot be fooled even for a bit. Take, for example, 'Mazu said, "Later when you open your lips how will you care for others." Baizhang raised the fly whisk.' Is this either like insects leaving patterns on wood or a hen and chick pecking simultaneously at the eggshell? Do all of you wish to understand being deaf for three days? Gold refined by a great goldsmith will never change color."

雪竇顯拈, "奇恠, 諸禪德! 如今列其派者, 甚多;究其源者, 極少. 惣道百丈於喝下大悟, 還端的也無? 然刁刀相似, 魚魯參差, 若是明眼漢, 謾他一點不得. 只如馬祖道, '你他後, 開兩片皮, 將何爲人?' 百丈豎起拂子, 爲復如蟲禦木? 爲復啐啄同時? 諸人要會三日耳聾麼? 大冶精金, 應無變色."

[Explanation]

Xuedou: Nowadays those who line up their branch lineages … are very few: he was able to say this because, as he says later, gold refined by a great goldsmith will never change color.

雪竇: 如今列其派至極少者, 下云大冶精金應無變色故, 如是道得也.

Fenyang Shanzhao added a comment, "Once awakened then you rest.

[778] For this sermon, see the *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.360b2–8); and also *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.685b25–c2). Gold here refers to someone with great skill (i.e., Baizhang) and great goldsmith to a great teacher (i.e., Mazu).

What is this about being deaf for three days?"[779]

汾州昭拈, "悟去便休得, 說什麽三日耳聾?"

[Explanation]

Fenzhou: Do not establish a gate to awakening with the great matter of the present moment.

汾州: 不立今日悟門.

Shimen Wencong[780] said, "If he had not become deaf for three days how could he have attained awakening?" Fenyang heard this and said, "If you compare what I said earlier with what Shimen said there is a half-month gap."[781]

石門聰云, "若不三日耳聾, 何得悟去?" 汾州聞云, "我與麽道, 較他石門, 半月程."

[Explanation]

Shimen: What he meant was that one must rely on the gate to awakening with the great matter of the present moment.

What I said earlier etcetera: this is because Shimen has the stronger point.

---

779 See the *Chanlin leiju* 禪林類聚 (XZJ 117.190a15). The *Chanlin leiju* was edited together by Zhijing 智鏡, Daotai 道泰, and others during the Yuan dynasty and published in 1307. Like the *Seonmun yeomsong*, the *Chanlin leiju* is largely a collection of Chan sayings, verses, and commentaries. But the *Chanlin leiju* is unique in that it neatly arranges the collection into typologies (*leiju* 類聚).

780 Shimen or Guyin Wencong, like his Dharma brother Fenyang Shanzhao, is a dharma heir of Shoushan Shengnian. Wencong continued study under several teachers after his awakening under Shoushan until he assumed his first abbacy on Mt. Shimen 石門山 in Jiangxi province in 1006. Fourteen years later in 1020, Wencong became the abbot of Taiping xingguo Monastery on Mt. Guyin 谷隱. He was later granted the official title Chan Master Cizhao 慈照禪師.

781 See *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.494b–8).

石門意, 須借今日悟門也. 我伊麼道云云者, 石門却有長處故也.

Donglin Changcong raised this story and then raised Fenyang and Shimen and said, "If you speak, you cannot avoid the danger of having your tongue cut; if by a stove you cannot avoid the danger of being burned by sparks. How could the Buddha dharma be bent to conform to the whims of people? Today I will enter the cave of the legendary black dragon and snatch away the jewel.[782] It is not that Baizhang did not go deaf for three days. How can Fenyang and Shimen, either man, avoid the fate of becoming blind fellows? In fact, have these three old men attained awakening or not? After a pause he said, "A patriarch fails to perform the ancestral rites and calamities reach his descendants."[783]

東林揔, 擧此話, 連擧汾州石門拈, 師云,"當言不避截舌, 當爐不避火迸. 佛法豈可曲順人情? 東林今日, 向驪龍窟內爭珠去也. 百丈, 不無他三日耳聾, 汾州石門, 爭免箇二俱瞎漢! 只這三箇老, 還曾悟也無?" 良久云,"祖禰不了, 殃及兒孫."

[Explanation]

Donglin: How can Fenzhou and Shimen, either man, avoid etcetera: one (raised) the great matter of the present moment and the other (raised) the great matter of one's original lot. Both are blind fellows.

Have these three old men attained awakening or not: Fenzhou, Shimen, and Baizhang are the three.

A patriarch fails to perform the ancestral rites and calamities reach his descendants: the patriarch Baizhang fails to perform and therefore calamities reach his descendants Fenzhou and Shimen.

東林: 汾州石門爭免云云者, 今時本分揔是瞎漢也. 只這三箇老還曾悟也無者,

782 For the black dragon and its jewel, see note 368 above.

783 See *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 118.106b1–5).

汾州石門并百丈, 爲三箇. 祖禰不了殃及兒孫者, 祖百丈是不了故, 殃及兒孫汾州石門也.

Changlu Zongze raised this story and said, "This public case has spread for quite a while now. Only Huangbo and Yangshan got it entirely. I will not hide from ridicule and try to pass a judgment. At that time Baizhang raised the fly whisk and just attained Mazu's great skill but he hung the whisk back in its old spot and did not attain Mazu's great function. Do you wish to understand Mazu's shout? Not only is it a blade that kills but it is also a sword that gives life. Do you wish to understand going deaf for three days? Baizhang only understood Mazu's 'release' (放行) and not his 'control' (把定)."

長蘆賾, 擧此話云, "這个公案, 流布來多時也, 唯黃蘗仰山, 深相委悉. 山僧不避譏嫌, 試爲斷看. 當時百丈, 竪起拂子, 只得馬祖大機, 却掛拂子於舊處, 不得馬祖大用. 要會馬祖一喝麼? 非但殺人刀, 亦乃活人劍. 要會三日耳聾麼? 只知馬祖放行, 不知馬祖把定."

[Explanation]

Changlu: His intent was to say that (Baizhang) did not consider the articles and chapters of the law at all.

長蘆意, 大殺不顧條章.

Tiangtong Zhengjue, at an informal sermon, was asked by a monk, "Mazu gave out a shout and Baizhang went deaf for three days—what does this mean?" The master said, "Sound lies in the ear and the ear lies in sound." The monk said, "This can be called sloughing off objects and sense organs and flattening out the revealed facts." The master said, "Never force needles in."[784]

The master again said, "Take Mazu's shout for example. Is this a matter that is beyond our endowment? Is there a place to create meaning beyond

784 See *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.58c29–59a3).

our endowment? Even if at that time Baizhang had made the shout his own (承當) and not been careless karmic consciousness would have still flown back in. If he had been able cut it off or pry (the shout) open, not allowing even a single thread or grain of rice to stand therein, then what does it mean to say that he revisited Mazu for a consultation? In this space not a single strand of hair is allowed. If he had applied himself even a bit beyond his endowment, we cannot say he went deaf for three days. Have you not heard Xuedou say, 'Gold purified by a great goldsmith never changes color'? But today there are run-of-the-mill fellows who have not had a realization and have not seen thoroughly and (thus) use hooks and needles to fabricate the truth. They bury themselves and drag in the former teachers of our tradition. If one does not clean oneself until one's pure and liberate oneself thoroughly, then another layer (of misleading interpretation) will be added. We can say this is like washing a lump of dirt in mud."[785]

天童覺, 小叅, 僧問, "馬祖一喝, 百丈三日耳聾, 作麼生?" 師云, "聲在耳處, 耳在聲中." 僧云, "可謂塵根脫落, 消息平沈去也." 師云, "切莫强針錐." 師又云, "只如馬祖一喝, 還分外着得事麼? 還分外有造道理處麼? 若也个時承當不下, 草草地, 又是業識流注; 若是坐[786]得斷幹得開, 一絲一糁立不得, 喚什麼作, 再叅馬祖? 其閒毫髪不容, 若分外着得些子, 不喚作三日耳聾. 不見雪竇道, '大冶精金, 應無變色.' 而今有般漢體不到, 見不徹, 使鈎使錐, 作道作理, 埋沒自己, 帶累先宗. 若是洗不淨潔, 脫不了當, 又向這裏, 添一重去也, 喚作泥裏洗土塊."

[Explanation]
Tiantong's informal sermon: See the text.

天童小叅, 文見.

785 See *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.59a10–19).

786 Here I substitute *cuo* 挫 for *zuo* 坐.

Longmen Wuxin[787] ascended the hall and said, "It is difficult for a message to reach the lofty summit of an imposing peak; a light shout tests skill and the ears go deaf. For three days it is unknown where he went, but tonight as usual he spreads the true tenet. A long time ago Baizhang visited Mazu again for a consultation and later Xuedou said, 'Great Chan virtuosos, how odd … Gold refined by a great goldsmith will never change color.'" The master said, "Today I (Yunyan) saw something unjust on the road and wish to ask Xuedou.[788] If this is gold refined by a great goldsmith, there should be no change in color. Why then did Baizhang go deaf for three days? Do you understand? 'No one ever sees the hard-working horse. All they do is repeatedly discuss the merits of the hero.'"[789]

龍門新, 上堂云, "雄峯孤頂信難通, 輕喝當機耳便聾. 三日不知何處去, 今宵依舊播眞宗. 昔日百丈再叅, 至三日耳聾. 後來, 雪竇道, '奇恠諸禪德, 至應無變色.' " 師云, "雲嵓今日, 路見不平, 要問雪竇. 旣是大冶精金, 應無變色, 百丈爲什麽, 三日耳聾? 還會麽? 從前汗馬無人見, 只要重論蓋大[790]功."

[Explanation]

Longmen: It *is difficult for a message to reach the lofty summit of an imposing peak*: this refers to the state of Baizhang going deaf for three days.

No one ever sees the hard-working horse: because of what Xuedou said Baizhang's merit for going deaf for three days has become all the more higher.

龍門: 雄峯孤頂至播眞宗者, 言百丈三日耳聾處也. 從前汗馬云云者, 因雪竇伊麽

787 For Longmen, Yunyan, or Sixin Wuxin, see note 480 above. Why he is referred to as Longmen here is unclear.

788 Cf. *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.381a17).

789 This last quote here appears to be a quote from Xuedou Chongxian; see *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.690b16–17).

790 The text appears to be corrupted here and should probably read *gaidai* 蓋代 ("matchless," i.e., hero).

道, 百丈三日耳聾之功轉高.

Foyan Qingyuan ascended the hall, raised this story, and said,[791] "Great assembly! What are we calling going deaf in both ears for three days? As soon as I (Longmen) beat the drum and ascend the hall, the entire great assembly gathers like clouds; the monks' hall cuts across and swallows the buddha hall. The exposed pillar hangs upside down on the lantern. Heaven is high and the earth is thick. The moon is bright and the wind is clear. The rain is orderly and the wind is well regulated. The river is clear and the ocean is calm. When hungry I eat bitter vegetables with you. When thirsty I drink the cold spring water with you. Even if it rains flowers somewhere at the outskirts of Heaven, how could this compare to returning to the hall and drinking some tea?"

佛眼遠上堂, 擧此話云, "大衆! 說甚三日耳聾? 直得龍門打鼓上堂, 大衆盡皆雲集, 僧堂橫呑佛殿, 露柱倒掛燈籠. 天高地厚, 月白風清. 雨順風調, 河清海晏. 飢則共君餐苦菜, 渴則與子飮寒泉. 直饒天外雨花飛, 爭似歸堂喫茶去!"

[Explanation]

Foyan: *I beat the drum … gathers like clouds*: this is how it was done back then.

The monks' hall cuts across and swallows the buddha hall etcetera: this is inconceivable.

Heaven is high and the earth is thick: this is the state of being ordinary.

Even if it rains etcetera: this is the state of being exceptional.

How could this compare to returning to the hall etcetera: this is the matter of one's original endowment in the ordinary state. In that case going deaf for three days is a new article of law devised for a special purpose.

佛眼: 龍門打鼓至雲集者, 當時事. 僧堂橫呑佛殷云云者, 不思議也. 天高地厚云

791 For this sermon, see the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.504a8–12).

云者, 平常也. 直饒云云者, 希奇也. 爭似歸堂云云者, 平常本分事也. 然則三日耳聾, 特地新條.

Jiangshan Keqin raised this story and then raised Fenyang, Shimen, and Xuedou's added comment. The master said,[792] "In that case the virtuosos each gave a lecture sermon. Although each had their own way of caring for (i.e., teaching) people, they were only able to clarify Mazu and Baizhang's great skill and have not yet clarified Mazu and Baizhang's great function. I will risk losing my own eyebrows and reveal the facts. I also wish to have the teachers everywhere examine and reproach me for what I have to say. Do you know this shout? It is just like resounding thunder and a bolt of lightning. Those who hear it will be scared out of their wits and lose their souls. Do you wish to understand going deaf for three days? It is just like striking the poisoned drum.[793] Those who hear it lose their lives." He raised a fly whisk and said, "If someone asks, 'Is this its function or beyond its function,' hit him as you hear him say this and afterwards give him a shout." Again he said, "Have you now seen Mazu and Baizhang?"

蔣山勤, 擧此話, 連擧汾州石門雪竇拈, 師云, "然則作家共相提唱, 不妨各有爲人眼, 要且, 只明得馬祖百丈大機, 未明馬祖百丈大用. 不惜眉毛, 露个消息, 也要諸方檢責. 還知這一喝麽? 直似奮雷霹靂, 聽者喪膽亡魂. 要會三日耳聾? 正如擊塗毒鼓, 聞者喪身失命." 擧拂子云, "或有个問, '即此用, 離此用?' 和聲便打, 隨後與喝." 復云, "還見馬祖百丈麽?"

[Explanation]

Jiangshan: He simply clarified the simple shortcut. The great function is the simple shortcut. What further need is there to discuss the great function? Although he gave out an authoritative shout, it still does not transcend this.

Hit him as you hear him say this: be it its function or beyond its function,

792 For this sermon, see also the *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi* yulu (T 1997.47.789a2–9).

793 For the poisoned drum, see old case 44 above.

this means use all your might and raise it.

Afterwards give him a shout: how could this not be Mazu's?

Have you now seen Mazu etcetera: this means where would you seek it?

蔣山: 但明直截. 大用直截, 則更討什麽大機? 雖是振威一喝, 亦不越此也. 和聲便打者, 當即此離此, 盡力提持也. 隨後與喝者, 豈非馬祖地. 還見馬祖云云者, 向什麽處尋討.

Yunmen Zonggao grasped the fly whisk and raised up to Huangbo's "I will bring ruin to my descendants." The master said,[794] "Baizhang was shouted at and immediately went deaf for three days. When Huangbo heard what Baizhang raised he inadvertently stuck out his tongue. Baizhang wondered whether Huangbo would succeed Mazu. Later, when Linji asked the grand intent of the Buddha dharma on three different occasions he was given sixty blows. Just then Baizhang, who had gone deaf for three days, could exhale and Linji thereupon understood that the staff that struck him is just like a fly whisk made of a wormwood branch. I ask the great assembly, if there is a common basis to what is transmitted between masters, then why is it that their functions are so different? Do you understand? Had the waves from Caoxi been identical limitless numbers of ordinary beings would have been buried alive."

雲門杲, 秉拂舉, 至黃蘗喪我兒孫, 師云,"百丈被喝, 直得三日耳聾, 黃蘗聞舉, 不覺吐舌, 百丈疑其承嗣馬祖. 後因臨濟, 三度問佛法大意, 三度打六十棒, 便與三日耳聾出氣, 臨濟始覺如蒿枝拂相似. 敢問大衆. 旣是師承有據, 因什麽, 用處不同? 會麽? 曹溪波浪如相似, 無限平人被陸沈."

[Explanation]

Yunmen: *Baizhang was shouted at … went deaf for three days*: this means he has attained great skill.

794 For this sermon, see also the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.849a5–11).

Huangbo inadvertently stuck out his tongue: this means he has attained the great function.

Baizhang wondered whether he would succeed Mazu: this means he feared that Huangbo would simply inherit Mazu's shout.

Later Huangbo gave Linji sixty blows: this function is the great function and what enabled Baizhang to exhale.

Linji etcetera: in an informal sermon Linji said, "When I was at my master's place … "[795] Even if he were struck again this would be as if he were struck with a whisk made of a wormwood branch. In that case the function of Mazu, Baizhang, Huangbo, and Linji were different and not like Qingyuan, Shitou, and their descendants who were only able to clarify the matters (raised by) honorable beings. For this they are called a junk store.[796]

The waves from Caoxi etcetera: the various waves are not all alike but they are all water from Caoxi.

雲門: 百丈被喝至三日耳聾者, 得大機也. 黃蘗不覺吐舌者, 得大用也. 百丈疑其承嗣馬祖者, 恐黃蘗一向承嗣馬祖一喝也. 後來黃蘗, 打臨濟六十棒, 是用大用, 則與百丈出氣. 臨濟云云者, 臨濟示衆云, "我於先師處云云" 又打一棒, 是蒿枝拂子也. 然則馬祖百丈黃蘗臨濟, 用處不同, 非如清源石頭子子孫係, 只明得尊貴人邊事也. 此則所謂雜貨鋪也. 曹溪波浪云云者, 千波萬浪盡皆不同, 然俱是曹溪水也.

Baiyun added a comment, "Mazu's shout came straight out of the matter before the primordial Buddha. Although Baizhang had gone deaf for three days, in the end he has only made half of the truth his own (承當)."

白雲昺拈, "馬祖一喝, 直出威音王已前. 百丈雖則三日耳聾, 要且, 只承當得一半."

---

795 See *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.291a6–8); and also old case 607 below.

796 For junk store (Ch. *zahuopu* 雜貨鋪); see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.282c24); and also *Yuanzhou Yangshan Huiji chanshi yulu* (T 1990.47.587b18). For their emphasis on essence, Yangshan Huiji likened Shitou Xiqian's descendents to a store that sells pure gold (Ch. *zhenjinpu* 真金鋪). For their emphasis on function, Yangshan likened Mazu's descendents to a junk store.

[Explanation]

Baiyun: All he was able to illuminate was Mazu's authoritative shout.

白雲: 但明得馬祖振威一喝也.

Case 184.

Baizhang's Wild Fox

百丈野狐

[Old case]

Every day Baizhang ascended the hall. Each time an old man would always listen to the sermon and leave when the assembly left. One day he did not leave. The master thereupon asked, "Who is this standing before me?" The old man said, "I used to dwell here on this mountain during the time of Kāśyapa Buddha. There was a student who asked, 'Is a person with great cultivation still subject to karma or not?" I answered, "He is not subject to karma." I (consequently) fell into the body of a wild fox. Today I ask your reverence to say a turning phrase on my behalf." The master said, "Then ask." The old man asked again, "Is someone with great cultivation still subject to karma or not?" The master said, "He is not in the dark about karma." At these words the old man had a great awakening. He bid farewell and said, "I have already been released from the body of a wild fox, which remains behind the mountain. I beseech you to cremate it as you would for a deceased monk's funeral." The master ordered the rector (維那) to strike the announcement mallet and inform the assembly that after the maigre feast everyone is invited (普請) to a deceased monk's funeral. The great assembly couldn't figure out what was going on. At the evening consultations the master raised a story from the past: ["Huangbo asked Baizhang, 'An ancient one answered with the wrong turning phrase and fell into the body of a wild fox. Today if someone were to not make that mistake at every turn what would happen then?' Baizhang said, 'Come closer and I'll tell you.' Huangbo advanced forward and gave the master a slap. Baizhang laughed out loud 'Ha! Ha!'

and said, 'I had assumed that the barbarian's beard was red, but there is also a red-bearded barbarian!'[797] " At that time Weishan was serving as the cook under Baizhang. Sima, the ascetic, raised (this story) and asked, "What does the cook think?" Weishan thereupon shook the door panel three times. Sima said, "Quite rough!" Weishan said, "The truth of the Buddha dharma is not so."][798]

百丈, 每日上堂, 常有一老人聽法, 隨衆散去. 一日不去, 師乃問, "立者何人?" 老人云, "某甲於過去迦葉佛時, 曾住此山, 有學人問, '大修行底人, 還落因果也無?' 對云, '不落因果.' 墮在野狐身. 今請和尚代一轉語." 師云, "但問." 老人便問, "大修行底人, 還落因果也無?" 師云, "不昧因果." 老人於言下大悟, 告辭云, "某甲已免野狐身, 住在山後, 乞依亡僧燒送." 師令維那, 白槌告衆, '齋後普請送亡僧.' 大衆不能詳, 至晚叅, 師擧前因緣.<黃蘗問百丈, "古人錯答一轉語, 墮在野狐身, 今人轉轉不錯時, 如何?" 丈曰, "近前來! 向汝道." 蘗近前, 打師一掌. 丈呵呵大笑云, "將謂胡鬚赤, 更有赤鬚胡." 時, 潙山在百丈會下, 作典座. 司馬頭陁擧問, "典座作麼生?" 潙乃撼門扇三下. 司馬云, "大麤生." 潙云, "佛法不是這箇道理.">

[Explanation of the gongan]

A person with great cultivation—is this a person of the present moment (今日人) or the original person (本來人)? If it is the original person why is it called "cultivation"? The person of the present moment cultivates himself according to Principle. Therefore we call it *great cultivation*.

---

797 Chan masters often used this statement to compliment a student and liken him to Bodhidharma. In the context of this koan, the statement, as Robert Sharf argues, appears to contain a pun: the word for barbarian (*hu* 胡) is homophonous with the word for fox (*hu* 狐); see Sharf "How to Think with *Chan Gong'*an," p. 227. See also *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.164a1–4); cf. *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T 1988.47.552c11); *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.799c21); *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.827a4–5).

798 For this story, see the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.163b11–164a6); case 8 of the *Congrong lu* (T 2004.48.231c25–232b24); and also *Wumen guan* (T 2005.48.293a15–b3); cf. Sharf "How to Think with Chan *Gong'an,*" pp. 226–227.

Karma: a good cause bears good fruit and an evil cause bears evil fruit. Some say, "Causes of the dharma realm, fruits of the dharma realm,"[799] but going too far (like this) is just like not doing enough.

Is someone with great cultivation still subject to karma or not?: a student raised this doubt and asked a question. Why? If you say he is subject to karma, then when have Xianzi and Budai ever been subject to karma?[800] If you say he is not subject to karma, like Venerable Siṃha and the great master second patriarch who have clearly paid back their debt,[801] how could this be a case of not being subject to karma? The old man answered that he is not subject to karma and fell into the body of a wild fox.

Later, Baizhang said, *He is not in the dark about karma*, and at these words he was released from the body of a wild fox. Why? The fox is a beast whose nature is to be full of doubt. When crossing a frozen river the fox listens after each step.[802] That is, before he met Baizhang the old man raised doubt and spoke; he therefore fell into the body of a wild fox. After he met Baizhang the old man cut off his doubt and spoke; he was therefore released from the body of a wild fox. Therefore an ancient virtue said, "Do you wish to know what it was like before he met Baizhang? Amidst the plates at a seated gathering (the image of) a bow (hanging on the wall) falls into a glass of wine (and is mistaken for a snake). Do you wish to know what it was like after he met Baizhang? Again, amidst the plates at a seated gathering a bow

799 See *Seonmun bojangnok* 禪門寶藏錄 (XZJ 113.988b13).

800 For Xianzi 蜆子, an eccentric disciple of Dongshan Liangjie 洞山良价 (807–869), see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.338a27-b6). For Budai 布袋, the potbellied laughing buddha and avatar of Maitreya, see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.434a19–b28). Xianzi and Budai are being invoked here because of their reputation as eccentric men who did not live according to the norms of society or the monastery and could transgress without commiting sin.

801 For Shizi or Siṃha bhikṣu who was beheaded, see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.215a16–18). For the second patriarch Huike who paid back the debt incurred by taking students away from a rival, see also *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.221a11–15).

802 For the analogy of the fox crossing a frozen river, see note 641 above.

falls into a glass of wine."[803]

Again, "Because he did not understand the sublime matter that precedes skill before he met Baizhang he fell into the body of a wild fox. Because he understood the sublime matter that precedes skill after he met Baizhang he was released from the body of a wild fox."[804]

Again, "If something is gained from a sermon, this is none other than the cry of a wild wolf (野干) and if nothing is gained from a sermon this is the roar of a lion."[805] The words may differ, but their truth remains the same. Wansong (Xingxiu) said, "Truly, this is due to the old man himself leaning against a fence and staying stuck to a wall as he sent others to fall into moats and pits. He saw Dazhi's (Baizhang) method of pulling out nails and extracting a wedge, so he abandoned himself and followed another person. He requested Dazhi for a substitute turning phrase. With fearless discerment Dazhi casually turned the words around and said, 'He is not in the dark about karma.' "[806] This is to attain the sublime by going with the flow. 'Dark' means to not have (無). Before Baizhang spoke the old man was glued to flesh and bound to bones[807] for five hundred rebirths for saying, *He is not subject to karma,* so Baizhang had to say, *He is not in the dark about karma,* and destroy his conceptual trap. Therefore Zhenjing Kewen's verse says, "Not allowing you to fall prey to the hidden spear-tip or to be in the dark about

803 This is a reference to a famous story from the *Fengsu tongyi* 風俗通義 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 9, 1b–2a. Du Xuan 杜宣 received a glass of wine and mistook the reflection of a bow hanging on the wall for a snake and got sick after drinking the wine. Later the local magistrate offered him another glass of wine and explained the situation. He was then cured of his illness. The ancient virtue here may be Huanglong Huiji 黄龍晦[誨]機 (d.u.); see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.391c8–10).

804 Source unknown.

805 These are the words of Nanyang Huizhong 南陽慧忠 (675–775); see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.244b24–25); see also Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten,* p. 456.

806 See *Congrong lu* (T 2004.48.232a9–12).

807 "Glued to flesh and bound to bones" (Ch. *nianpu zhugu* 粘皮著骨) is an idiom that is used in the context of referring to someone who is unrelenting or caught in an unrelenting (unfortunate) situation; for instance, see *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.796c15–16) and *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.200b21).

your original endowment, Baizhang thereby wished him to be released from the body of a fox."[808] However, even if he had said, *He is not in the dark about karma,* before meeting Baizhang he would have fallen into a different type of rebirth. After meeting Baizhang he would have certainly said, *He is not subject to karma.* In that case, whether you say karma exists or not there is a path to free yourself.

Fell into the body of a wild fox: when did he ever fall into the body of a wild fox?

Released from the body of a wild fox: when was he ever released from the body of a wild fox?

Gave the master a slap: this is to overturn the error and be free of error.

Shook the door panel three times: this is the original endowment of the one slap. (Baizhang) laughing out loud 'Ha! Ha!' is precisely this. Three times make one, so it is not one slap.

Quite rough: this is just like differentiation (差別).

The truth of the Buddha dharma is not so: here how can one speak of smoothness and roughness?

大修行地人者, 今日人耶? 本來人耶? 若是木來人, 何名修行? 今日人, 稱理修行, 故云大修行也. 因果者, 善因善果, 惡因惡果, 都擧也. 或云, '法界之因, 法界之果' 者, 過猶不及. '大修行地人, 還落因果也無?' 學人伊麽起疑致問者, 何也? 若道落因果, 蜆子布俗, 何曾落因果? 若道不落因果, 如師子尊者, 二祖大師, 灼然償債, 豈是不落因果? 對之不落因果, 墮野孤身, 後百丈云, '不昧因果.' 於此脫野狐身, 何也? 狐之爲獸, 其性多疑, 過氷河一步一聽. 則前百丈起疑, 而道得故, 墮野狐身;後百丈絶疑, 而道得故, 脫野狐身也. 故古德云, "要識前百丈麽? 對坐盤中弓落盞. 要識後百丈麽? 再坐盤中弓若盞." 又, "前百丈, 不會機前妙故, 墮野狐身; 後百丈, 會機前妙故, 脫野狐身." 又, "說法有所得, 斯則野干鳴;說法無所得, 是名師子吼." 言雖其異, 其實一也. 萬松云, "良由自己倚牆貼壁, 送人墮坑落塹. 見大智有抽釘拔楔地手段, 舍己從人, 請大智代一轉語. 大智施無畏辨, 輕輕撥轉道, '不昧因果.' " 是隨流得妙也. 昧者無也. 前百丈道, 不落因果, 五百生粘皮著骨故, 須道不昧因果, 破他窠窟也. 故眞淨文頌云, "不落藏鋒不昧

808 See *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.751b3).

分, 要伊從此脫狐身." 然前百丈, 倘或言不昧因果, 墮在異類;後百丈, 必須道不落因果. 然則, 道有也, 有出身之路;道無也, 有出身之路. 墮也, 何曾墮? 脫也, 何曾脫? 一箇野狐, 全身出沒, 脫體卷舒. 打師一掌者, 是轉轉不錯也. 撼門扇三下者, 一掌本具地, 下呵呵大笑即此也. 三下成一, 即一掌者, 非也. 大麁生者, 似乎差別也. 佛法不是云云者, 這裏, 是什麽說麁說細.

Dahong Baoen's verse[809]

Not subject to karma and not in the dark about it,
Drawing crowds and making groups,
The lion bites the person,
The Han hound chases after a lump of dirt.[810]
[This verse is about not being subject to karma]

大洪恩頌, "不落不昧! 成群作隊. 師子咬人, 韓獹逐塊." <此頌不落.>

Again his verse

Not subject to karma and *not in the dark about it*,
Pointlessly toiling away and making deliberations,
Making the truth your own on the spot,
There are no ropes and yet one binds oneself.
[This verse is about not being in the dark about karma.]

又頌, "不昧不落! 謾勞斟酌. 直下承當, 無繩自縛.<此頌不昧.>

---

809 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.112b8).

810 The lion that bites people is a metaphor for someone of high capacity. The Han hound that chases after a lump of dirt is a metaphor for someone of low capacity; see the *Seonmun bojangnok* 禪門寶藏錄 (XZJ 113.1003b17–18). The locus classicus is *Nirvaṇa Sūtra* 25, "All ordinary beings only look at the result, they do not look at the cause, just like a dog chasing a clod and not chasing the person (who threw it)" (T 374.12.516b12).

[Explanation]

Dahong: If you follow the wording and decide on the meaning this is the Han hound chasing after the lump of dirt and also having no ropes and yet binding oneself.[811] If you understand Baizhang's intent this is the lion that bites the person (who threw the lump of dirt).

大洪:若隨言定旨, 是韓逐塊, 亦無繩自縛也. 若會得百丈意, 是獅子咬人也.

Jianfu Benyi's verse

Not subject to karma and *not in the dark about it*,
Before and after encountering Baizhang's words,
Deemed to lack half a *jin*,[812]
Eight *liang* is relatively better.[813]
The relatively small surplus,
Is raised by patch-robed monks everywhere under Heaven.

薦福逸頌, "不落與不昧! 先後百丈語. 半斤秤不足, 八兩較些子. 較些子留與, 天下衲僧擧."

[Explanation]

Jianfu: Half a *jin* and eight *liang*. They are about the same weight. Before meeting Baizhang he was deemed lacking and after meeting Baizhang he had a relatively minor (breakthrough).

薦福: 半斤八兩, 是一般. 在前百丈, 是秤不足, 後百丈, 則較些子也.

---

811 For the Han hound that chases after a lump of dirt, see note 810 above.

812 A *jin* 斤 (or catty) is about half a kilogram.

813 A *liang* 兩 is about 50 grams, so eight *liang* is about 400 grams. As the *seolhwa* explains (see below), eight *liang* and half a *jin* are roughly the same weight.

Zishou Jie's verse

The causes and conditions of earlier generations manifest in later generations,
The numinous tortoise drags its tail and leaves a trace that extends long and far,
Suddenly thoughts of Nanquan rise in Huainan,[814]
Prepare the leaves of the olive tree for tea and the fragrance disperses everywhere.

> 資壽捷頌, "前代因緣後代彰, 靈龜曳尾迹横長. 淮南瞥起泉南思, 橄欖煎茶分外香."

Haiyin Chaoxin's verse

Not subject to karma and *not in the dark about it,*
Both are mistaken,
Taking and discarding have not yet been forgotten,
Ordinary consciousness makes speculations,
Grasping at verbal explanations,
There are no ropes and yet one binds oneself,
So vast and empty,
Where would you feel about and look for it?
Spring arrives and flowers open,
Autumn comes and tree leaves fall,
A mistake! A mistake!
Who knew the meaning of Puhua ringing the bell?[815]

---

814 The significance of this line is unclear. Both Huainan and Mt. Nanquan are both located in Anhui province. Nanquan's name is also given as Quannan 泉南.

815 Puhua 普化 (d.u.) is famous for his eccentricity and his friendship with Linji Yixuan. He sang and danced and rung his bell when he saw other people. As he rung the bell, Puhua is known to have sung:

海印信頌, "不昧不落, 二俱是錯. 取捨未忘, 識情卜度, 執滯言詮, 無繩自縛. 廓爾大虛, 何處摸揉! 春至花開, 秋來木落. 错错! 誰知普化搖鈴鐸?"

[Explanation]

Haiyin: *'Not subject to karma' and 'Not in the dark about it' … one binds oneself*: Before consulting Baizhang he was like this. After he consulted Baizhang (his position was), *So vast and empty where would you feel about and look for it?*

Spring arrives and flowers open: This means he is not in the dark.

Autumn comes and tree leaves fall: This means he is not subject to karma.

A mistake! A mistake!: Not subject to karma is mistake and not in the dark is also a mistake. This is the meaning of Puhua ringing the bell.

海印: 不落不昧至自縛者, 如前百丈則如此, 若後百丈, 則廓爾大虛, 何處摸索也. 春至花開者, 不昧也; 秋來木落者, 不落也. 错错者, 不落也错, 不昧也错, 摠是普化搖鈴鐸也.

Donglin Changcong's verse[816]

Great Hero's Peak (Baizhang) has already decided on the cause behind his rebirth as a wild fox,
Five hundred rebirths ago he made a mistake and fell into this body,
Not subject to karma and *not in the dark about it* have not yet come to light,
How many years must pass before it does?

Coming as brightness, I hit the brightness;
Coming as darkness, I hit the darkness;
Coming from the four quarters and eight directions, I hit like a whirlwind;
Coming from the empty sky, I lash like a flail (Sasaki and Kirchner, *The Record of Linji,* p. 36).

See also *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.280b14); cf. *Linji yulu* (T 1985.47.503b20). For Haiyin's verse, see also *Luohu yelu* 羅湖野錄 (XZJ 142.999a4–6).

816 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.112b9–10).

東林摠頌, "大雄曾决野狐因, 五百生前錯墮身. 不落不昧如未曉, 年華又歷幾秋春?"

Zhengjing Kewen's verse

Not allowing you to fall prey to the hidden spear tip or to be in the dark about your original endowment,
(Baizhang) thereby wished him to be released from the body of a fox,
Everyone he met said they had quit their posts,
But have you seen a single person in the forest?[817]

眞淨文頌, "不落藏鋒不昧分, 要伊從此脫狐身. 相逢盡道休官去, 林下何曾見一人?"

Zhenru Mutie's verse[818]

A great smith's burning furnace,[819]
Boil the Buddha alive and boil the patriarchs alive,
Customs and standards smelt completely,
Those who know are at a complete loss.

眞如喆頌, "大冶洪爐, 烹佛烹祖. 規模鎔盡, 識者罔措."

Kunshan Huiyuan's verse

817 Going in the forest is another way of saying one has retired from his post. See *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.391a3ff.).

818 For this verse, see the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.113a1); and also *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 118.143a1–2).

819 The great smith (*daye* 大冶; i.e., the Creator) and his furnace (i.e., heaven and earth) are also mentioned in the *Zhuangzi*; see Watson, *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu,* p. 85.

In karma the first signs of concern arises,
Since the past and up to the present conscious calculations are made a hundred-thousand times over,
The numinous sea turtle has already penetrated through the dragon gate,
The fisherman toils away with fishing rod in hand.

> 崑山元頌, "因果之中發問端, 古今情計百千般. 靈鼇已透龍門去, 漁者徒勞把釣竿."

Fotuo Desun's verse

Not subject to karma and *not in the dark about it* determine whether you are close or distant,
With the trivial reply he fails to avoid the spirit of a wild fox,
The Great Hero's Peak is too steep for anyone to climb,
Throughout the ages the creek and the mountain face the moonlight.

> 佛陁遜頌, "不落不昧定疎親, 區區未免野狐精. 雄峯峭絕人難到, 千古谿山對月明."

Fazhen Shouyi's verse

Not subject to karma,
Not in the dark about karma,
Demolish the Sanguan[820] and nothing cannot be done,
Don't mistake a perfect balance on the scale (for the real thing),
This is like fleeing from drowning and jumping into a flame.

820 Sanguan 散關 is a strategic pass located in Shaanxi province. There were four key passes that protected Guanzhong 關中 ("within the passes"): Hangguguan 函谷關 (east), Wuguan 武關 (south), Xiaoguan 蕭關 (north), and Sanguan (west).

法眞一頌, "不落因果, 不昧因果, 打破散關無不可. 莫教错認定盤星, 恰似避溺還投火."

Tiantong Zhengjue's verse[821]

Foot-long water and ten foot-long waves,
Nothing could be done in the previous five hundred rebirths,
Not subject to karma and *not in the dark about it* are calculations,
As before he runs into the nest of kudzu(-like words),[822]
Ha! Ha! Ha! Do you understand?
If you can consistently brush it all away,
Then there is no harm in me going "*duo duo he he*" (like a baby),
Let the spirits sing and dance and a melody will naturally appear,
So clap on the beat and sing tra la la.

天童覺頌, "一尺水一丈波! 五百生前不柰何. 不落不昧商量也, 依前撞入葛藤窠. 阿呵呵會也麼? 若是你灑灑落落, 不妨我哆哆啝啝. 神歌社舞自成曲, 拍手其間唱哩囉."

[Explanation]

Tiantong: *A foot-long water … lifetimes*: Falling into the body of a wild fox for five hundred lifetimes means that he has given rise to deluded thoughts where there are no deluded thoughts.

Not subject … nest of kudzu(-like words): Although he is not in the dark, he could not avoid falling into the body of a wild fox.

If you can brush … mumbling away: Having completely escaped from the sense organs and the objects of perception, the revealed facts have completely

821 For this verse, see *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.47.19a25–28); and also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.114b5–8).

822 This a metaphor for words, clichés, and/or discursive thought, which are difficult to escape from once one is entangled.

submerged. If the wash is clean and the escape permanent, then there is no harm in saying either *Not subject to rebirth* or *Not in the dark*. That is to say, *Let the spirits sing and dance and a melody will naturally appear, so clap on the beat and sing tra la la.*

天童: 一尺水云云至生前云云者, 五百生前墮野狐身, 是無妄想處, 起妄想也. 不落至藤窠者, 雖然不昧, 亦不免墮野狐身也. 若是你灑灑至啝啝者, 根塵脫盡, 消息併沉, 洗得淨潔, 脫得可常, 則不落不昧, 亦不妨. 則神歌社舞自成曲, 拍手其間唱哩囉.

Chengtian Huai's verse

For five-hundred lifetimes he is reborn as a wild fox,
Were fish eyes mistaken for pearls?
You must know the difference between being subject to karma and being in the dark about it,
Open your mouth and we can tell whether you're fine or coarse.

承天懷頌, "五百生來在野狐, 爲將魚目作珠呼? 須知落昧爭多少, 開口知君精與麁."

Xuedou Faning's verse

The old subject in the previous five-hundred rebirths,
Great Hero's Peak (Baizhang) pointed out how to escape the body of a fox,
The monks at the monastery (叢林) are still unaware of the sublime matter before skill (機),
Flipping back and forth between and making calculations about being subject to karma and being in the dark about it they lose sight of the true.

雪竇寧頌, "五百生前舊主人, 大雄指示脫狐身. 叢林未曉機前妙, 昧落商量轉失眞."

Shangfang Riyi's verse

Not subject to karma and *not in the dark about it*,
The gongan has been clearly explained,
The moon illuminates the cold pond,
The wind stirs near the old juniper tree,
A speedy hawk soars through the sky,
A mad dog chases after a lump of dirt,[823]
In your speech you make few mistakes,
In your actions you have few regrets.[824]

> 上方益頌, "不落不昧, 分明話會. 月照寒潭, 風生古檜. 快鷂冲天, 狂狗趁塊. 言寡尤, 行寡悔."

Again his verse[825]

North and South of the river they ask about the wild fox,
Because they vacillate between he is subject to karma and in the dark about it,[826]
Give the great gate a kick and open the doors,
Who among you is a hero?

> 又頌, "江北江南問野狐, 只因昧落兩踟躕. 鴻門一踏開雙扇, 那个男兒是丈夫?"

823 See note 810 above.

824 The phrase, "In your speech you make few mistakes; in your actions you have few regrets," was borrowed from the *Analects* 2.18.

825 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.113b2–3).

826 The *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* version is slightly different: "Because they have disagreements about whether he is subject to karma or in the dark about it" (*zhi yin meiluo you chashu* 只因昧落有差殊; XZJ 115.113b2).

Lingyuan Weiqing's[827] verse

He clearly said, *Not subject to karma,*
Where did the old man go wrong?
He clearly said, *Not in the dark about karma,*
When did Baizhang understand?
Did he not understand or could it be that the old man was not wrong?
A complete muddle announces sublime enlightenment.[828]
Not subject to karma and *Not in the dark about it,*
Such excellence signals the true position (正位),
The karma of perfected skill (全機) has a provenance,
It casts off the body, sinks, floats, and avoids nothing.
What is wrong is just wrong, but when you're right who is it that is right?
Because of words one misconstrues the tenet and cogitates,
He asks again for another teaching to be raised for consideration,
The secret contemplation is thorough and gives rise to wind and thunder,
Headwind blows back and the sound of thunder is cut off,
Hold your breath, go back to somewhere deep, and hide the shameful and awkward.
How will he later raise this case?
Great Hero's Peak props up the moon in the autumn sky.

> 靈源清頌, "明明道不落, 老人何處錯? 的的言不昧, 百丈幾時會? 不會將不錯! 渾然宣妙覺. 不落與不昧! 卓爾標正位. 全機因果有來由, 脫體升沈無忌諱. 非自非是誰是? 言下迷宗生擬議, 再問重教擧一迴. 潛觀徹底起風雷, 逆風轉喝雷聲絕. 飮氣深歸藏醜拙, 他日如何擧似人? 雄峯撐破秋天月."

827 Lingyuan Weiqing 靈源惟清 (d. 1117) is a dharma heir of Huitang Zuxin. Weiqing served as the abbot of Taiping Chan Cloister 太平禪院 in Anhui province and restored Chongen Monastery 崇恩寺 on Mt. Huanglong.

828 Here the word for complete muddle, *hunran* 渾然, also means absolutely or completely. The line, perhaps a pun, could thus be rendered, "Sublime enlightenment is announced in its entirety."

Chongsheng Yuangong's verse

Mt. Baizhang! Mt. Baizhang!
It makes so sense at all to say it/he was there in Kāśyapa Buddha's time.
The great cultivation and great result, how could it be easily done?
Not subject to karma and Not in the dark are onerous and difficult.
How onerous! How onerous!
How could one read scripture with no letters?
How difficult! How difficult!
The ten-thousand, tall pines take away years of cold.

> 崇勝珙頌, "百丈山百丈山! 迦葉佛時大無端. 大行大果豈容易? 不落不昧成艱難. 艱艱! 無字之經若爲看? 難難! 萬木高松奪歲寒."

Cishou Huaishen's verse[829]

Not subject to karma and *Not in the dark about it,*
Before and after encountering Baizhang's words,
If there is even a hair's breadth of margin,
Iron mountains lie across the road,[830]
How could you not have seen the man from Lantian (in Shaanxi) who shot down a tiger that year?[831]
The first shot went in all the way to its feathers,
But upon closer inspection it turns out to be a rock,
He wished to try to shoot it again but the shot would not go in,

829 For this verse, see also the *Cishou Huaishen chanshi guanglu* 慈受懷深禪師廣錄 (XZJ 126.608a2–5).

830 Here iron mountains refer to a mental obstacles or gongans that have not yet been penetrated.

831 This is a reference to the legendary archer and Han dynasty general Li Guang李廣 (d. 119 B.C.E.) who mistook a rock for a tiger but managed to shoot an arrow into it. For Li Guang's biography, see the *Shi ji* 史記 109.2867–2876; Burton Watson, *Record of the Grand Historian of China* 2: 141–152.

He almost cheated General Li,
Throughout the ages and up to present people sigh in vain.

> 慈受頌,"不落與不昧! 前後百丈語. 毫髮若參差, 鐵山橫在路. 豈不見, 藍田當年人射虎? 初時一箭沒其羽, 子細看來元是石. 再欲射時射不入, 幾乎賺殺李將軍. 千古今人空嘆息."

Jiangshan Keqin's verse[832]

Fish swim and water becomes sullied,
Birds fly and feathers fall,
It is difficult to escape from the mirror's reflection,
The great void is empty and open,
Reborn into five hundred far and remote lives,
He simply engaged in the great cultivation of karma,
The swift thunder topples the mountain and wind shakes the ocean,
Gold that is refined a hundred times over does not change color.

> 蔣山勤頌,"魚行水濁, 鳥飛毛落. 至鑒難逃, 大虛寥廓. 一往迢迢五百生, 只緣因果大修行. 疾雷破山風振海, 百煉精金色不改."

Foyan Qingyuan's verse[833]

I become drunk and I sleep, I become sober and I lie down, and I do not return home,
I wander alone to a far away place,
I stop at the stage of the buddhas and patriarchs but cannot stay,
Evening comes and as usual I spend the night in a field of reeds.

832 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.113b13–15).

833 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.113b16–17).

佛眼遠頌, “醉眠醒臥不歸家, 一身流落在天涯. 祖佛位中留不住, 夜來依舊宿蘆花.”

Again his verse

A single question tests skill and cuts off the duality of same and different,
With the arrow that levels heaven and earth the merits of his deeds are tested,
A resounding slap falls on his cheek,
How laughable is the old man of Great Hero’s Peak!
[This verse is about Huangbo’s slap]

又頌, “一問當機絕異同, 定乾坤箭驗勳功. 轟轟一掌腴腮下, 笑殺雄山這老翁.” <此頌黃蘗打一掌.>

Again his verse

Spring has arrived and flowers bloom,
But where has your youthful complexion gone?
How pitiful are the colors of the garden!
They do not enter the reflection in the mirror.
[This verse is about Weishan shaking the door panel three times]

又頌, “春至是花開, 朱顏安在哉? 可怜園裏色! 不入鏡中來.” <此頌潙山撼門扇三下.>

Dahui Zonggao’s verse

Not subject to karma and *Not in the dark*,
A stone and lump of dirt,
They meet each other on the road,

And silver mountains are broken apart.[834]
He claps his hands and laughs Ha! Ha!
In Mingzhou there is a simple-minded fellow with a leather satchel.[835]

雲門杲頌, "不落不昧, 石頭土塊. 驀路相逢, 銀山粉碎. 拍手呵呵笑一場, 明州有个憨皮袋."

Zhuan Shigui's verse

Baizhang's wild fox,
Wild goose with a rush leaf in its mouth,[836]
Li Guang's divine arrow,[837]
And Mad Zhang's grass script.[838]

竹庵珪頌, "百丈野狐! 塞鴈啣蘆, 李廣神箭, 張顚草書."

Yuwang Jiechen's verse

Not subject to karma and he falls into the body of a wild fox,
Not in the dark and he escapes from the body of a wild fox,
There is no wind and grass moves of its own accord,

834 Here silver mountains refer to mental obstacles or gongans that have not yet been penetrated.

835 See *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.114a13–14) where the last line has Budai (d. 916) instead of "leather satchel" (*pidai* 皮袋). Budai lived in Mingzhou.

836 Wild geese were known to have used rush leaves to protect themselves from attack; see the *Huainan hongliejie* 淮南鴻烈解 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 19, 10b.

837 For Li Guang, see note 831 above.

838 Here Mad Zhang refers to Zhang Xu 張旭 (fl. eighth century), a famous calligrapher from the Tang dynasty. According to legend, he used to get drunk, untie his hair and use it as a brush. For more on Zhang Xu, see Hsiung Ping-ming, *Zhang Xu et la Calligraphie Cursive Folle* (Paris: Collège de France, Institut des hautes études chinoises, 1984).

A jeweled dish full of ghee,
It should be that after the clouds disperse on Great Hero's Peak,
The high and steep, thousand-mile high peaks pierce through the empty sky.

育王諶頌,"不落墮野狐, 不昧脫野狐. 無風自動草, 寶器盛醍醐. 好是大雄雲散後, 嶄嶄千仭插空虛."

Xinwen Tanfen's verse

Not subject to karma and *Not in the dark*,
I pick up your cunning.
Once fallen (into the body of a wild fox) and once released,
Who is it that lets free and who captures?
On the summit of Baizhang Peak an old mirror is bright,
Limitless ghosts lose their nests and burrows.

心聞賁頌,"不落不昧, 拈君狡獪. 一墮一脫, 是誰縱奪? 百丈峯頭古鏡明, 無限天精失窠窟."

Mi'an Xianjie's verse[839]

A mistake is made five-hundred lifetimes ago,
A great misunderstanding is had five-hundred lifetimes later,
A great misunderstanding indeed!
Who says that the auspicious *qilin* only has one horn?

密庵傑頌,"五百生前失却, 五百生後大錯. 大錯! 誰道祥麟只一角?"

[839] For this verse, see also the *Xu guzunsu yuyao* 續古尊宿語要 (XZJ 119.39a14).

Hunchengzi's verse

The wild fox wants to chew wild fox slobber,[840]
It will take from the year of the ass to the year of the horse to understand,[841]
A skilled hand takes ice and makes snow,
In the end ice and snow are both empty transmissions.

混成子頌, "野狐要嚼野狐涎, 若會驢年至馬年. 妙手將氷削成雪, 到頭氷雪是虛傳."

Again his verse

You wild fox who's fond of this mind!
Right now you're as rowdy as the market.
What five hundred lives do you speak of?
Even if you understand I would not allow it.

又頌, "愛是心野狐! 如今鬧如市. 說甚五百生? 會也不相許."

Layman Wujin's verse[842]

He transforms his form, comes back, and asks about the great cultivation,
On the spot (Baizhang) operates on his eyes with a golden scalpel,[843]

840 For wild fox slobber and Baizhang's wild fox, see *Congrong lu* (T 2004.48.231c27 and 232a6).

841 The year of the ass or the horse do not exist, so Hunchengzi is saying that one will never understand.

842 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.113b11–12).

843 The golden scalpel (used for removing cataracts) is used as a metaphor for the teachings of the Buddha. Like a scalpel, the teachings of the Buddha clear away the delusions that prevent living beings from seeing the truth, see *Nirvana sūtra* (T 374.12.411c20–21).

A wild wolf (野干)[844] transformed into Baizhang,
Late at night as usual he makes the wild wolf cry.

無盡居士頌, "化形來問大修行, 當下金篦刮眼睛. 轉得野干成百丈, 夜深依舊野干鳴."

Layman Yuezhai's verse

Both figures had the body of a wild fox,
They fell in between (two bodies) and have not yet transcended the dusts (of affliction),
Directly strike and flip over the crowd,
The neighbor's rooster crows thrice and urges the passersby on.

悅齋居士頌, "兩頭俱是野狐身, 落在中間未離塵. 直下撞飜群隊去, 隣雞三唱促行人."

Weishan raised and asked Yangshan about Huangbo and Baizhang's dialogue concerning the wild fox gongan.[845] Yangshan replied, "Huangbo always used such skill." Weishan said, "Was it endowed by Heaven or learned from a person?" Yangshan said, "It is both something he inherited from his teacher and also a tenet that he penetrated with his self nature." Weishan said, "Quite so, quite so."

潙山, 擧黃蘗問百丈野狐話, 問仰山, 仰云, "黃蘗常用此機." 潙云, "天生得, 從人得?" 仰云, "亦是禀受師承, 亦是自性宗通." 潙云, "如是, 如是."

Tianyi Yihuai ascended the hall. A monk asked, 'Is a person with great cultivation still subject to karma or not?" The master said, "You have

---

844 According to the *Yiqie jing yinyi* (T 2128.54.390b2), a fox is a kind of wild wolf. The same text also distinguishes the two species, see *Yiqie jing yinyi* (T 2128.54.575c8).

845 For this sermon, see also the *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* (XZJ 135.657a10–12).

only heard of people becoming ghosts. You haven't seen cranes becoming transcendents." Tianyi continued, "What did the ancients say?" The master said, "Use the gongan itself to make sense of it!"[846] The master thereupon said, "Baizhang's wild fox gongan has spread widely in the world. Arriving at the line about escaping from the body of a wild fox, all the Chan virtuosos today consistently say, 'A person with great cultivation is squarely within karma. Before (he consulted Baizhang), the old man said this person is not subject to karma and ignored karma. He therefore fell into the body of an old fox. After (he consulted Baizhang), he came to say this person is not in the dark about karma and was able to escape. Before (he consulted Baizhang), he ignored karma; after (he consulted Baizhang), he was not in the dark about karma. Make such calculations and then not a single good teacher (善知識) anywhere on this great earth will be able to attain the body of a human being. They will all necessarily become wild foxes. In fact, a monk asked Zhaozhou, 'Does a dog also have buddha nature or not?' Zhaozhou said, 'Doesn't have it' (無).[847] Again he asked, 'Does a cypress tree also have buddha nature or not?' Zhaozhou said, 'Does have it' (有).[848] If he did say this, Zhaozhou too will have certainly become a wild fox. Again, someone asked National Master Huizhong, 'Is there or is there not karma at work when one is reborn in heaven and hell?' The national master said, 'There isn't' (無). Later, someone again asked Jingshan Faqin,[849] 'Is there or is there not karma at work when one is reborn in heaven and hell?' Jingshan said, 'There

---

846 For up to this part of Tianyi Yihuai's sermon, see also *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.59a13–15).

847 See case 471.

848 The *Guzunsu yulu* version of this dialogue differs from the one cited above; see XZJ 118.321b14–16.

849 Jingshan Faqin 徑山法欽 (714–792), also known as Daoqin 道欽, is a dharma heir of Xuelin Xuantai of the Niutou 牛頭 lineage. He served as the abbot of a temple on West Mountain 西山 (or Mt. Jing 徑山) in Zhejiang province. In 768 he received the official title Great master Guoyi 國一大師 and his temple received an official plaque bearing the name Jingshan Monastery 徑山寺. He was posthumously granted another official title, Chan master Dajue 大覺禪師, by emperor Dezong 德宗 (r. 779–805).

is' (有).[850] In fact, between these two ancient virtues who deserves to become a wild fox? Again, a monk asked venerable Junji,[851] 'What is a person of great cultivation like?' Junji said, 'He wears a cangue and is bound by chains.' 'What is a person of great karma like?' Junji said, 'He practices meditation and enters absorption.'[852] This is a case of a single person answering with two turning phrases. Are they in disagreement? If there is a disagreement, then he will certainly become a wild fox. If there is no disagreement, then where is the one principle that they have in common? Just put aside the thousand questions and ten-thousand answers (and answer me this), how should we speak of the person of great cultivation? If you follow the literal wording and determine its meaning, then you will be bogged down by phrases and led astray; moreover, discriminative thought will remain and consciousness will become attached to dusts of the dharma. If you become the teacher of men and gods this way, then your own words will be unaware of their ultimate point (落處). Not only do you lack eyes but you will also blind others as well. How painful! How painful! All you Chan virtues! A pilgrim should necessarily be equipped with the eye of the true dharma. Do not learn an ersatz prajñā."[853]

天衣懷, 上堂, 僧問, "大修行底人, 還具因果也無?" 師云, "只聞人作鬼, 不見鶴成仙." 進云, "古人, 又作麼生?" 師云, "且識取前話!" 師乃云, "百丈有野狐話, 大

850 Source unclear. But a similar dialogue does appear in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.252b9–16).

851 Little is known about Junji 峻極 other than the fact that he was a dharma heir of the Northern School monk Pozao Duo 破竈墮 (fl. early eighth century). Both men seem to have served as the abbot of Mt. Song 嵩山.

852 See also *Jiaowai biechuan* 教外別傳 (preface dated 1633): "A monk asked, 'What is a person who cultivates the good?' The master replied, 'He wears a cangue and is bound by chains' The monk asked, 'What is a person who does evil deeds?' The master said, 'He practices meditation and enters absorption' 僧問如何是修善行人 師曰擔枷帶鎖 曰如何是作惡行人 師曰修禪入定 (XZJ 144.64a15–16). An exchange closer to what we have above is also found in the *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136. 469a11–12) where it is attributed to Junji's teacher Pozao Duo.

853 An ersatz prajñāpāramitā refers to the cultivation of the perfection of wisdom with a mind of attachment, see *Dazhidu lun* (T 1509.25.542a18–20).

行於世, 至便脫野狐身, 諸禪德, 如今盡道, '大修行人, 正在因果. 前來却道, 不落因果, 成撥無因果, 所以墮野狐中;後來道, 不昧因果, 他便得脫去.' 若也前是撥無因果, 後是不昧因果, 作如此商量, 盡大地善知識, 無一个得人身, 惣作野狐, 始得. 秖如僧問趙州, '狗子, 還有佛性也無?' 州云, '無.' 又問, '栢樹子, 還有佛性也無?' 州云, '有.' 若恁麽道, 趙州亦須作野狐, 始得. 又問忠國師, '天堂地獄因果, 是有是無?' 國師云, '無.' 後來又問徑山欽, '天堂地獄因果, 是有是無?' 徑山云, '有.' 秖如此二古德, 教誰作野狐即是? 又僧問峻極和尙, '如何是大修行底人?' 極云, '擔枷負鎖.' '如何是大作業底人?' 極云, '修禪入定.' 此是一人對兩轉語. 還有相違處麽? 若有相違, 亦須作野狐;若無相違, 那裏是一理相貫處? 千問萬對且置, 作麽生說个大修行底人? 若以即言定旨, 滯句迷封, 蓋爲情存分量, 識附法塵. 若如是, 作人天師, 自語尙不知落處, 非唯自家無眼, 亦乃瞎却他人. 苦哉, 苦哉! 諸禪德, 夫行脚人, 須具正法眼, 始得, 莫學相似般若."

[Explanation]

Tianyi: *You have only heard of people becoming ghosts* etcetera: Why would a transcendent crane become a transcendent again?

Use the gongan itself to make sense of it: How could the gongan itself ever have (calculations such as) subject to karma and not subject to karma? None of the kudzu-like words that cite many public cases escape this meaning.

天衣: 只聞人作鬼云云者, 仙鶴何更成仙? 且識取前話者, 前話何曾有落因果, 不落因果? 許多葛藤下, 多引公案, 皆不出此義.

Dahong Baoen added a comment, "After a word comes out even a team of horses will have a hard time chasing it.[854] Calamity and good fortune have no entrance. It is just people who bring that upon themselves. However, if you are going to travel all over don't say Dahong said these words."

大洪恩拈, "一言已出, 駟馬難追. 禍福無門, 唯人自召. 雖然, 若到諸方, 莫道 '大洪有此語.' "

854 This is an allusion to a line from the *Analects* 12.8 ("A team of horses cannot catch up with one's tongue").

[Explanation]

Dahong: *After a word … hard time chasing it*: Not subject to karma is the one word.

Calamity and good fortune … bring that upon themselves: It is only because you have deluded yourself that you fall into the body of a wild fox.

However: For, it may appear that there is calamity and good fortune, delusion and awakening, and gain and loss.

大洪: 一言至難追者, 不落因果一言也. 禍福至自召者, 只爲自迷, 墮野狐身也. 雖然如是者, 前言似有禍福迷悟得失地故也.

Cuiyan Sizong added a comment, "When one is not subject to karma what (destiny) do they fall into? When one is dark about karma where do you escape to? All of you—have you grasped the critical point yet? If you have grasped the critical point, your views will be identical to those of a wild fox. If you haven't grasped the critical point, your views won't even be as good as those of a wild fox. Speak! Ultimately what is it? There is only self-invited good and bad luck. There are no portents or signs. Don't bother taking a tortoise shell and asking Sun Bin."[855]

翠嵓宗拈, "不落因果時, 墮在什麽處?;不昧因果時, 脫在什麽處? 諸人, 還定當得麽? 若定當得, 見解共野狐一般;若定當不得, 見解不如野狐. 且道! 畢竟如何? 但自吉凶無卦兆, 休將龜殼問孫賓."

[Explanation]

Cuiyan: Be it *Not subject to karma* or *Not in the dark,* if you make calculations of gain and loss, then you will not be able to avoid falling to the body of a wild fox.

翠巖意, 不若不昧, 得失商量, 則未免墮野狐身.

---

855 Sun Bin 孫賓 was a famous diviner who lived during the Warring States period (fourth and third centuries B.C.E.). He was hired by the King of Wei as a military strategist.

Foyan Qingyuan raised the story of Weishan shaking the door panel three times. The master said, "You speak! When he was asked about the story of the wild fox, he just shook the door panel three times. Speak! Where is the essential point? You want to know? Everyone is the son of a gold-haired lion—do not transmigrate along the way.

佛眼遠, 擧潙山撼門扇三下因緣, 師云, "你道! 問他野狐話, 他却撼門扇. 且道! 緊要在什麽處? 要會麽? 盡是金毛師子子, 莫於中路却輪迴."

[Explanation]

Foyan: The state of shaking the door panel three times is where everyone is the son of a gold-haired lion. This is called the essential point.

佛眼: 撼門扇三下處, 盡是金毛師子子, 此謂緊要處也.

Yuwang Fozhi ascended the hall and raised, "A monk asked, 'Before the old man consulted Baizhang about 'Is a person of great cultivation still subject to karma or not?' Baizhang said,[856] *He is not subject to karma.*" The master said, "Wrong!" "After he consulted Baizhang, he was told, *He is not in the dark about karma.*" The master said, "Wrong! If today a person were to ask me, 'Is he not subject to karma or is he not in the dark about karma?,' I would reply, Wrong! Wrong! Speak! How do I compare with Baizhang?" After a while he said, "Put drops of oil on an arrow with a gold arrowhead and shoot right through a jade *qilin.*"

育王佛智, 上堂, 擧僧問先百丈, '大修行人, 還落因果也無?' 丈云, '不落因果.' 師云, "錯!" 後百丈云, '不昧因果.' 師云, "錯!" "今日忽更有人, 問育王, '不落因果是, 不昧因果是?' 對云, '錯, 錯!' 且道! 與百丈有優劣也無?" 良久云, "滴油金鏃箭, 射透玉麒麟."

856 Here the text appears to be corrupted. The following reply was offered by the old man and not Baizhang.

[Explanation]

Yuwang: *Not subject to karma* and *Not in the dark about karma* are placed left and right.

He is not subject to karma etcetera: When he says "Wrong" every time in this sentence he means "untenable."

Put drops of oil on etcetera: Put drops of oil on a gold arrowhead and it becomes sharp and slippery.

Shoot right through etcetera: This means shoot right in between "not subject (to karma)" and "not in the dark."

育王: 不落因果, 不昧因果, 左右也. 不落因果是云云者, 中間皆云錯者, 皆不立也. 滴油云云者, 金鏃上更油滴, 銳而滑也. 射透云云者, 不落不昧中間, 亦透過也.

Yunmen Zonggao ascended the hall and a monk asked, "'Is a person of great cultivation still subject to karma or not?' Before he consulted Baizhang, the old man said, *He is not subject to karma.* Why did he fall into the body of a wild fox?" "The master said, "If you meet someone just raise what you just said for comment." And then the monk said, "But what about, after he consulted Baizhang, the old man being told, *He is not in the dark about karma*? Why did he escape from the body of a wild fox?" The master said, "If you meet someone just raise what you just said for comment." He then said, "A person of great cultivation is subject to karma." With a fly whisk the master struck the meditation bench once and said, "This too does not transcend the revealed fact." "A person of great cultivation is not subject to karma." Again, he struck the meditation bench once and said, "This too does not transcend the revealed fact." "Subject or not subject to karma is but a phrase written with a single brush stroke. What, then, is that we are calling karma?" Again, he struck the meditation bench once and said, "This too does not transcend the revealed fact." He thereupon raised the whisk and summoned the great assembly and said, "What we have here is a fact revealed five-hundred lives ago. You must not go out of your way to seek it with the intellect."

雲門杲, 上堂, 僧問, "大修行底人, 還落因果也無? 前百丈云, '不落因果.' 爲什麽

墮野狐身?" 師云, "逢人但恁麼擧." 進云, "只如後百丈道, 不昧因果, 爲甚麼脫野狐身?" 師云, "逢人但恁麼擧." 進云, "或有人問徑山, 大修行底人, 還落因果也無? 未審和尚, 向他道什麼?" 師云, "向他道, 逢人但恁麼擧." 乃云, "大修行人, 落因果." 以拂子擊禪床一下云, "也不離這个消息. 大修行人, 不落因果." 又擊禪床一下云, "也不離這个消息. 落與不落, 一筆句下, 却喚什麼作因果?" 又擊禪床一下云, "也不離這个消息." 乃擧起拂子, 召大衆云, "五百生前消息在, 不須意下別搜求."

[Explanation]

Yunmen Zonggao: *If you meet someone just raise what you just said for comment*: An excellent revealed fact.

Does not transcend this revealed fact: Beyond what was just said what else is there to discuss?

He thereupon raised the whisk … a fact revealed: falling into and escaping (the body of a wild fox) are revealed facts that are both originally empty.

雲門: 逢人但伊麼擧者, 好箇消息也. 不離這箇消息者, 但伊麼道外, 更討什麼? 乃擧起拂子至消息在者, 墮脫本空地消息.

Again, he raised this story and said, "*Not subject to karma* and *Not in the dark about it*—half clear, half dark. *Not in the dark about karma* and *Not subject to it*—both are empty trembling. A wild fox five-hundred rebirths ago today calmly and slyly follows behind!" He gave out a shout and said, "If there is a guest from Jiangnan at the gathering stop crying like a partridge in front of the wine jar."

又擧此話云, "不落與不昧! 半明兼半晦;不昧與不落! 兩頭空索索. 五百生前个野狐, 如今冷地謾追呼." 喝一喝云, "座中旣有江南客, 休向樽前唱鷓鴣."

[Explanation]

Again Yunmen raised: *Not subject to karma* and *Not in the dark about it* etcetera: after he consulted Baizhang, *Not in the dark about karma* and *Not*

subject to karma both (turn out to be) *empty trembling*.

Trembling [*sj* + *ieng*][857] means "scattered" and "exhausted."

A wild fox five-hundred rebirths ago … slyly follows behind: falling into and escaping (the body of a wild fox) are both originally empty.

He gave out a shout etcetera: you should know that there is also this one shout.

又擧: 不落與不昧云云者, 至後百丈, 不昧因果處, 不落因果, 亦空索索也. 索<昔名切>, 散也盡也. 五百生至謾追呼者, 墮脫本空也. 喝一喝云云者, 更須知有這一喝.

Baiyun Zhibing added a comment, " 'Gather the ten-thousand schemata and harmonize existence and nonexistence. Mix the past and future and seal the present.'[858] 'When there is no fatigue in one's eyes dreams vanish of themselves. If the mind is not divided, then the ten-thousand dharmas will be the one suchness.'[859] Those in the assembly who have been on pilgrimage a bit all say 'I completely understand,' but when they reach the point of questioning this public case they cannot but fall again and again. Looking for a fellow who has cut off all defilements is like trying to pick the moon up from the sky. Do you wish to know what 'enter the water to know who's the better person'[860] means? 'A coin dropped in the river must be retrieved from the river.'[861] "

白雲昺拈, "會萬像齊有無, 混去來印今古. 眼若不睡, 諸夢自除;心若不異, 萬法一如. 衆中稍稍行脚人, 惣道 '會了也.' 及至問着這个公案, 不免落七落八. 討个絕滲漏底漢, 如天上揀月. 要知入水見長人? 河裏失錢河裏摝."

857 The reconstruction of middle Chinese seems to be in error here. It should be *sak* 索 and not *sj* [*ek*] 昔 + [*mj*]*ieng* 名.

858 This is a quote from Li Tongxuan's *Xin Huayan jing lun* (T 1739.36.758c26–27).

859 This is a quote from the *Xinxin ming* (T 2010.48.376c22).

860 *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T 1988.47.574a4).

861 This was Yunmen's answer to 'Why did Bodhidharma come from the West?' See *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T 1988.47.545c9–10); and also *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.358c28–29).

[Explanation]

Baiyun

Gather the ten-thousand schemata … seal the present etcetera: originally, all such kudzu-like (words) do not exist.

Fall again and again: there is delusion and there is awakening up to and including calculations such as *Not subject to karma* and *Not in the dark about it*.

Do you wish to know what 'enter the water: existence, nonexistence, past, future, present—such discriminations refer to the fact that both *Not subject to karma* and *Not in the dark about karma* offer a path to freeing oneself.

白雲: 會萬像至印古今云云者, 本無如是多般葛藤也. 落七落八者, 有迷有悟, 乃至不落不昧商量也. 要知入水云云者, 當有無去來古今, 不落如是差別, 則不落因果, 也有出身之路; 不昧因果, 也有出身之路.

Xinwen Tanfen ascended the hall, raised this case, and said, "There are many in the Chan grove who make calculations about this gongan. And yet all this does is add to the growing crowd. Many of them fail to escape their original bodies with the help of the gongan's words. Today, for all of you here, I (Ruiyan) will run the risk of creating the karma of speech and clearly explicate this gongan. Do you wish to understand it? He endured the humiliation of five-hundred rebirths only because he did not recognize the character *luo* 落 ("subject to"). He competed with the hundred-thousand assemblies only because he did not recognize the character *mei* 昧 ("in the dark about"). The deceitfulness of the two characters almost always pushes many straight and naïve men into a trap. Today, do you wish to recognize the essential point of these two characters?" The master thereupon struck once with the staff and gave out a shout and said, "You've escaped! You've escaped! Reflect carefully on the controller (主宰)!"

心聞賁, 上堂, 擧此話云, "這一則話, 叢林商量甚衆. 要且, 只添得群隊, 多不能於言下, 脫得本體. 瑞嵓今日, 不惜口業, 爲你諸人, 分明說破. 要會麽? 五百生中受屈, 只緣不識个落字; 千百衆中較量, 只緣不識个昧字. 都來兩字諵訛, 陷却多小平直. 而今, 要識這兩字落處麽?" 乃卓拄杖一下, 復喝一喝云, "脫也, 脫也! 照顧主宰."

[Explanation]

Xinwen: *There are many in the Chan grove that make calculations* etcetera: delusion and awakening are calculations.

He endured the humiliation of five-hundred rebirths … push many straight and naïve men into a trap: this simply refers to the fact that they rush to their deaths by following words.

The master thereupon struck once with the staff: *Not subject to karma* and *Not in the dark about it.*

Gave out a shout without having transcended *struck once*: in order to understand the shout one must necessarily discern whether the one strike and the one shout are same or different.

You've escaped! You've escaped!: this belongs to the one strike.

Reflect carefully on the controller!: this belongs to the shout.

心聞: 商量甚衆云云者, 迷悟商量也. 五百年中至多少平直者, 只爲隨言走殺也. 卓柱杖一下者, 不落不昧也. 不離一下, 喝一喝者, 要須會取一喝, 一下與一喝, 是同是別? 脫也脫也者, 屬一下也. 照顧主宰者, 屬一喝也.

The *Linjian lu* says,[862] "Chan master (Xuefeng) Daoyuan heard that Chan master (Huanglong) Huinan was in residence at Jicui Hermitage on Mt. Huangbo, so he went there and became his student. One day, while serving as the head seat (下板) during seated meditation, he heard two monks raise the story of Baizhang's wild fox. One monk said, 'But what about him saying, *Not in the dark about karma,* and still failing to escape from the body of a wild fox?' The other monk replied, 'Even if he had said, *Not subject to karma,* when did he ever fall into the body of a wild fox?' Daoyuan was dumbstruck and felt these words exceptional. Unconsciously, he stood up and, intent on walking up towards the hermitage, he passed the mountain stream. He suddenly had a great awakening. He saw master Huinan and described what just happened, but before he could finish tears rolled down his chin. Master Huinan ordered him to seek good rest on the attendant's bed. He suddenly

862 See *Linjian lu* (XZJ 148.634b9–16).

stood up and composed a verse that read:

Not subject to karma and *Not in the dark about it!*
There is nothing for the monks and laymen to consider taboo.
A hero's vital spirit is like that of a king,
How could it be hidden in a pocket or covered up?
Letting the wooden staff go where it may,
The wild fox jumps in a pride of gold-haired lions.
Master Huinan gave out a great laugh.

林間錄云, "道圓禪師, 聞南禪師, 居黃蘗積翠庵, 往依之. 一日燕坐下板, 聞兩僧, 擧百丈野狐因緣, 一僧曰, '只如不昧因果, 也未脫得野狐身.' 一僧應聲曰, '便是不落因果, 亦何曾墮野狐身耶?' 圓悚然異其語, 不自覺其身之起, 意行上庵頭, 過澗忽大悟. 見南公敍其事, 未終涕交頤, 南公令就侍者榻熟寐, 忽起作偈曰, '不落不昧! 僧俗本無忌諱. 丈夫氣宇如王, 爭受囊藏被盖? 一條榔栗任縱橫, 野狐跳入金毛隊.' 南公大笑."

[Explanation]

Linjian lu: *When did he ever fall into … to consider taboo*: this is based on the circumstances of cremating and sending off a dead monk. The rest does not need to be analyzed in detail.

林間錄: 何曾墮至忌諱者, 依亡僧燒送來由, 餘無銷釋分

Case 204.

Nanquan Sells His Body

南泉賣身

[Old case]

Nanquan instructed the assembly (示衆) and said, "I (Master Wang) am selling off my body. Is there anyone who'd like to buy it?" One monk emerged from the assembly and said, "I will buy it." The master said, "It is neither cheap nor expensive. What will you pay for it?" The monk was speechless.[863]

[Zhaozhou said, "Next year I'll have a cloth jacket made and sent to you."[864] Wolong[865] offered a substitute reply and said, "Your reverence belongs to me."[866] Heshan[867] offered a substitute reply, "What is the meaning

863 For this story, see also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.290a15–17); *Wujia zhengzong zan* (XZJ 135.910b4–6); *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.362b7–9) etc.

864 See *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.258a21); *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.489b1); and also *Chanlin leiju* (XZJ 117.125a10).

865 Wolong Huiqiu 臥龍慧球 (d. 913) is a dharma heir of Xuansha Shibei. When Xuansha passed away in 908 he was invited by the king of Min to serve as the abbot of Anguo Cloister 安國院 on Mt. Wolong 臥龍山 in Fujian province.

866 See *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.258a21); *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.489b2); and also *Chanlin leiju* (XZJ 117.125a10–11).

867 Heshan Wuyin 禾山無殷 (884–960) received tonsure from Xuefeng Yicun and became a dharma heir of Jiufeng Daoqian 九峰道虔 (d.u.). He served as the abbot of Dazhi Cloister 大智院 on Mt. He 禾山 in Jiangxi province. With the support of a powerful patron he became the abbot of Xiangguang Cloister 祥光院 in Jiangsu province and Cuiyan Cloister 翠巖院 in Jiangxi province. In 951 he became the abbot of Huguo Monastery in Jiangxi province. He later received the official title Chan Master Chengyuan 澄源禪師.

of this?"[868] As a substitute reply, Mingzhao[869] patted the monk next to him on the back and said, "Just right and not right."]

> 南泉示衆曰, "王老師, 賣身去也, 還有人買麽?" 一僧出衆云, "某甲買." 師云, "不作貴, 不作賤, 作麽生買?" 僧無語.<趙州云, "明年, 與和尚, 作一領布衫." 臥龍代云, "和尚屬某甲." 禾山代, "是何道理?" 明招代, 便拍傍僧背云, "好着不着去." >

[Explanation of the gongan]

I am selling off my body etcetera: with his entire body Nanquan entrusts (this teaching:) "I am liberated and roam freely. Whatever direction it may be I offer a good deal for this graceful lifestyle. Who will give rise to the intent to buy it and become free of sorrow like me?"[870]

It is neither cheap nor expensive etcetera: rich, humble, ordinary, and noble are neither cheap nor expensive. Only when all (thoughts) of the the karmic merits and actions of the ordinary and the noble are lost can the intention of Nanquan be had. And then you will know that the three hundred and sixty joints and eighty-four thousand pores have already been scattered simultaneously into everyone's bosom.

Zhaozhou's *Next year I'll have a cloth robe made and sent to you* etcetera: since what Nanquan said is bare-nakedly pure and immaculately exposed he cannot but wear a robe.

Wolong: he has already bought it, which means he understands Nanquan's intentions.

Heshan's *"What is the meaning of this?"*: he won't allow it.

Mingzhao's *"Just right and not right"*: this means he agrees and does not agree.

---

868 See *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.258a21); and also *Chanlin leiju* (XZJ 117.125a11).

869 Mingzhao Deqian 明招德謙 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Luoshan Daoxian 羅山道閑 (d.u.). He served as the abbot of Mt. Mingzhao in Zhejiang province for over forty years.

870 Here, the *Seonmun yeomsong* is citing Jinling Baozhi's *Dasheng zan* 大乘讚 in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.449c8–9). For Baozhi, see note 412 above.

王老師賣身去云云者, 全身分付, 解脫逍遙自在, 隨方賤賣風流, 誰是發心買者, 亦得似我無憂? 不作貴云云者, 貴賤凡聖, 不作貴, 不作賤, 喪盡今時凡聖因果功行, 於此始得南泉意, 方知三百六十骨節, 八萬四千毛孔, 一時撒向諸人懷裏了也. 趙州明年與和上云云者, 南泉道地, 淨裸裸赤灑灑故, 直須披衣也. 臥龍, 已買得了也, 則知南泉意也. 禾山是何道理者, 不放過也. 明招好著不好著者, 肯不肯.

Dajue Huailian's verse

Old Wang is selling his body and it's neither cheap nor expensive,
The person next to him opens his big mouth in vain to offer payment.
After he puts on the cloth jacket the price became perfectly appropriate,
The invincible Kunlun (Nanquan) runs all exposed.

> 大覺璉頌, "王老賣身非貴賤, 傍人酬價虛開口. 布衫披後正相當, 全勝崑崙露形走."

[Explanation]
Dajue: (This is based on) the words of Zhaozhou.

大覺頌, 趙州語也.

Foyin Liaoyuan's[871] verse[872]

Old Wang very clearly wants to sell his body,
In an instant he hands it over to the person next to him.
How pitiful are all those under Heaven who fight to offer payment.
[Please try to finish (this verse) with a turning phrase.]

---

871 This is Jinshan Liaoyuan, see note 222 above.

872 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.123a4–5).

佛印頌, "王老明明要賣身, 一時分付與傍人. 可憐天下爭酬價." <請續此一轉語.>

[Explanation]
Foyin: *Please try to finish (this verse) with a turning phrase*: how could Foyin not have known how to finish the verse with a phrase? And yet he left it for everyone to finish. What was his intention? Do not say that Foyin is not saying (the last line) is good. You must examine it in detail and must not be muddleheaded.

佛印: 請續此一轉語者, 佛印豈不知續得一句! 也留與諸人續得意, 作麼生? 莫言佛印不道得好, 大須審細, 不得顢頇.

Haiyin Chaoxin's verse

It is difficult to assess the value of Old Wang's body,
Cheap and expensive, neither will do and so it is not easy to make an offer.
If (the monk) did not want to leave any regrets at that time,
He should have summoned and handed over (the body) to the garden chief.[873]

海印信頌, "賣身王老難爲價, 貴賤俱非不易酬. 若使當時無退悔, 喚來分付與園頭."

[Explanation]
Haiyin: *He should have summoned and handed over the body to the garden*

873 Here, Nanquan is likened to an ox who should have been sold to the garden chief to be used to till the land or gardens of the monastery; see *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.306b6). For Haiyin's verse, see also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.123a10–11).

chief: he would have been able to buy it cheap.

海印: 喚來分付與園頭者, 作賤買得也.

Baoning Renyong's verse[874]

Old Wang, how pitiable! He won't spare his body.
Facing death whom will you sell it to?
Had it not been for the bright kid who offered a small payment,
Every year he would have let springtime pointlessly go by.
[This record is to be raised together with Zhaozhou's substitute reply.]

保寧勇頌, "王老哀哉不惜身! 臨危將賣與何人? 若無令子輕酬價, 往往一年空過春." <此錄, 兼舉趙州代語.>

Hunchengzi's verse

Old Wang is selling his body but there is no way to reach a deal,
An ignorant person wishes to buy it but it is difficult to offer payment.
East or west, both sides run into exposed pillars,[875]
The mosquito for no reason at all bites the iron ox.[876]

混成子頌, "王老賣身無着處, 癡人欲買價難酬. 東西兩个撞露柱, 蚊子無端咬鐵牛."

874 For this verse, see the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.123a12–13); and also *Baoning Renyong chanshi yulu* (XZJ 120.373b18–374a1).

875 East and west here refer to the administrative and non-administrative wings of the monastery.

876 The mosquito may refer to the monk who was willing to buy Nanquan's body and the iron ox, like the exposed pillars, to Nanquan or his conundrum (i.e., purchasing a body that is neither cheap nor expensive and hence unnegotiable). The last two lines of Hunchengzi's verse may thus refer to the impossibility of penetrating Nanquan's conundrum.

Xuedou Chongxian raised this gongan and then raised Wolong, Heshan, and Zhaozhou's (substitute) replies. The master said,[877] "Although virtuosos compete to purchase it, in the end they do not understand the transmission of his skills. Speak! Would Nanquan have approved? I am also considering the option of offering payment and causing Nanquan to have no gate to which he can proceed and no place to which he can retreat. 'It is neither cheap nor expensive. What will you pay for it?' (I would reply,) 'Nowhere else would be able to accept your reverence's offer.'"

雪竇顯, 擧此話, 連擧臥龍·禾山·趙州語, 師云, "雖然作家競買, 要且, 不解輸機. 且道! 南泉還肯麼? 雪竇也擬酬个價, 直令南泉, 進且無門, 退亦無地. '不作貴, 不作賤, 作麼生買?' '別處容和尙不得.' "

[Explanation]

Xuedou: *Would Nanquan have approved*: Nanquan's intention is utterly without limit and therefore none can attain Nanquan's approval.

Nowhere else would be able to accept your reverence's offer: this too also lacks function.

雪竇: 南泉還肯麼者, 南泉意直得無限故, 皆不得南泉肯也. 別處容和尙不得者, 也無用處.

Doushuai Hong[878] raised Haiyin's verse. The master said, "The old virtuoso Dinghui (Haiyin), although he decisively settled the difficult public case of the ancient one, could only discern the monk's failure to come up with a payment to offer.[879] But what can be done about Zhaozhou's disgrace? I would not have done so." Again he said, "Old Wang sells his body and

---

877 For this sermons, see the *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.690a6–9); and also *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.362b10–13).

878 The identity of Doushuai Hong is unclear.

879 See Haiyin Chaoxin's verse above.

asks for double its price. The price is neither cheap nor expensive and in the end difficult to determine. (Like) the powerful army of Qin that completely surrendered to the Han, how laughable, Nanquan gave in to Zhaozhou!"

兜率鴻, 擧海印頌, 師云, "定慧老作, 雖善定奪古人難底公案, 只辨得這僧不解酬價, 爭奈屈着趙州? 兜率不爾." 復云, "王老賣身重定價, 價非貴賤卒難酬. 强秦戈甲盡歸漢, 堪笑南泉屬趙州."

[Explanation]
Doushuai: This is a supportive reading of Zhaozhou's intent.

兜率: 扶見趙州意也.

Kaiyuan Ziqi ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and said, "Since this story was first told the calculations and speculations among the assembly and discriminations of truth and falsehood have yet to cease. Today I will stamp them out for you. Why did the old man Zhaozhou not say at that time, 'You belong to me' and force Nanquan to have no road to rise to Heaven and no gate through which to enter earth and cut off the tongues of all under Heaven? Speak! Thirty years later[880] will these words of mine be able to avoid being determined right or wrong?" After a pause he said, "What in here do we have that can be determined right or wrong?"

開元琦, 上堂, 擧此話云, "似此因緣, 衆中商量卜度, 是非未息. 開元今日, 與諸人剿絕却. 趙州老漢, 當時何不道, '已屬某甲了也.' 待伊上天無路, 入地無門, 坐斷天下人舌頭去. 且道! 開元恁麼道, 三十年後, 還免是非也無?" 良久云, "者裏是什麽所在, 說是說非!"

[Explanation]
Kaiyuan: His intention was established thirty years after (he spoke).

880 Thirty years is said to be the conventional length of a monk's training, see note 265 above.

Will these words be able to avoid being determined true or false etcetera: although it is thirty years after (he spoke), it still cannot but bear the traces of right and wrong.

What in here do we have etcetera: there is no right and wrong.

開元意, 立在三十年後也. 還免是非云云者, 雖在三十年後, 亦未免是非之蹤也. 這裏什麽云云者, 無是非也.

Foyan Qingyuan ascended the hall, raised this case, and said,[881] "Ah! How amusing! There were several venerable worthies who added a capping phrase for this monk. Zhaozhou said, *Next year I'll have a cloth jacket made and sent to you.* Another said, *What is the meaning of this?* Another said, *Your reverence belongs to me.* Later, Xuedou said, 'Nowhere else will accept your reverence's offer.' Great assembly! Numerous venerable worthies fought to make the purchase and, to do so, they had to spread their own family wealth. Old master Wang did not dare hand over his body indiscriminately before the transaction was sealed and so few have seen such a commodity in the past or in the present. Today I (Longmen) too will sell my body. I have something expensive and something cheap. When cheap it isn't worth a penny and when expensive gold and jade can't compare. If you purchase it, it belongs to you; even if you don't purchase it, it still belongs to you.

If you are able to understand me, then I will become your companion in the Way. Be it in a place where there are people or not, when the mind stirs and thoughts rise I will be able to think of you. If good, then I'll order you to proceed; if evil, then I'll order you to stop. Even if you experience the three destinies and eight difficulties,[882] I will not be apart from you even a single step and always serve as your companion in the Way.

If you are not able to understand me, then I will become your adversary. I will make you leave home (to become a monk), have you go on pilgrimage,

---

881 For this sermon, see also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.518b5–519a5).

882 See note 482 above.

force you to seek a master, send you off to observe and examine closely, but I will then prevent you from understanding and force you to remain ignorant. I will force you to look for discursive understandings (解會) and manufacture truth (道理). I will then cause the pure and sublime realm to become dirt, rocks, mountains and rivers. I will cause the dharma body of eternal bliss to become the affliction of ignorance. You will never become free and will always backslide. I will not be apart from you even a single step and will always be your adversary. Great assembly! It has been a while since I have come to belong to all of you. Understand me and I am a companion of the Way; not understand me and I am your adversary. Is there anyone here who can clarify the meaning of this?"

He thereupon picked up the staff, made a dot in the air, and said, "One is a companion of the Way and the other is an adversary. It runs smoothly backwards and forwards and widespread like the sands of the Ganges River. If your eyes are empty and the cataracts in your eyes are like flowers, you will get my Way boundlessly." He then let go of the staff and said, "I've been showing off a bit. Please return to the hall."

佛眼遠, 上堂, 擧此話云, "嗯, 笑殺人! 有數尊宿, 爲此僧着語. 趙州云, '明年與和尚, 作一領布衫.' 一人道, '成何道理?' 一人道, '和尚屬某甲.' 後來雪竇道, '別處容和尚不得.' 大衆, 許多尊宿, 爭頭競買, 也要運出自己家財. 王老師, 交關未成, 不敢胡亂分付, 這般行貨, 古今亦少見之. 龍門今日, 亦賣身去也. 然則有貴有賤, 賤則分文不直, 貴則金玉難階.[883] 你買也屬你, 不買也屬你. 若識得龍門, 龍門與你作道伴. 有人處無人處, 起心動念, 摠知得你, 善則令汝行, 惡則令汝止. 縱經三途歷八難, 一步不相捨離, 常與你作道伴. 你若不識龍門, 龍門與你作寃家, 教你出家, 使汝行脚, 令汝尋師, 遣汝體究, 遂教你不會, 令汝茫然, 令汝求覓解會, 令汝巧作道理, 遂令淨妙國土, 而作土石山河, 常樂法身, 而作無明煩惱, 成不自在, 常生退失, 一步不放捨, 常與你作寃家. 大衆, 龍門屬你諸人來多時, 識得是道伴, 不識是寃家. 還有人明得此旨麼?" 乃拈拄杖, 點一下曰, "一道伴二寃家, 通逆順遍河沙. 眼是空, 翳是花, 得龍門, 道無涯." 遂放下拄杖子曰, "少賣弄, 歸堂去."

883 The *Guzunsu yulu* has *xie* 偕 for *jie* 階. I follow the *Guzunsu yulu*.

[Explanation]
Foyan: Expensive or cheap, it is just Longmen.

佛眼: 或貴或賤, 只是龍門也.

Case 207.

Nanquan Cuts the Cat in Two

南泉斬猫

[Old case]

One day, because the monks of the east and west halls were fighting over a cat, Nanquan picked it up and said, "Great assembly! If you are able to speak, then it will be saved, but if you are unable to speak, then I will cut it in two." The assembly had no response. [Fazhen Shouyi offered a substitute reply and said, "(Say)'A thief has stolen something from another thief'[884] and then give him a slap."] The master cut it into two pieces. Again, he raised the above story and asked Zhaozhou. Zhaozhou immediately took off his straw sandal, placed it on top of his head, and left. The master said, "Had you been there, we would have definitely been able to save the cat."[885]

南泉, 一日, 因東西堂, 爭猫兒, 師遂提起云,"大衆, 道得則救取, 道不得即斬却也." 衆無對<法眞一, 代云," '賊偸賊物.' 便與一掌."> 師斬爲兩段. 復擧前話, 問趙州, 州便脫草鞋, 於頭上戴出. 師云,"子若在, 恰救得猫兒."

[Explanation of the gongan]

The monks of the east and west halls … cat: is this a fight over the east or west hall's cat? Gucaotang 古草堂 said, "Nanquan's chief seat (第一座) raised

[884] This expression was used by others as well; for instance, see *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.313b7–8).

[885] For this story, see also Case 63 of the *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.194c7–11).

a cat. It broke the leg of a neighbor's bench and this caused the fight."[886] Did he, then, establish principle with a cat and make calculations about whether it has buddha nature or not? I'm not sure which is true.

Nanquan picked it up etcetera: Can one speak if one is able to understand that the nature of sin is fundamentally empty? Is this like the licentiousness of lady Vasumitra from the *Huayan jing*,[887] the fire king Sweet Dew killing out of anger,[888] the heretical views of the Brahmin Shengre,[889] which have no greed, hatred, or ignorance but only the function of true wisdom? Not only the cat but also the entire great earth and its sentient and insentient beings will grasp Nanquan's hand and beg for life. If the great assembly had known how to speak, then would he not have cut it up? If there is a verbal command, then the servant must carry it out. The cat must be cut up.

Zhaozhou immediately took off his straw sandal etcetera: the *Book of Rites* says, "Even if a shoe is new, do not put it on top of your head. Even if a cap is old, do not put it on your feet."[890] In other words, to place straw sandals on top of one's head is to securely grasp each and every one. Therefore it is said, "Had you been there, we would have definitely been able to save the cat."

Fazhen caught Nanquan. To give him a slap is to simultaneously collect the head and tail of a tiger.

---

886 Source unknown. The identity of Gucaotang is also unclear.

887 See *Huayan jing* (T 279.10.365a28–366a24).

888 See *Huayan jing* (T 279.10.712b28–c6). This is King Anala.

889 See *Huayan jing* (T 279.10.346b18–20). The Brahmin is Jayoṣmāya.

890 This quote is not from the *Book of Rites* (*Li ji* 禮記). It is based on a passage from the *Shi ji* that contains a debate between two ministers about the mandate of Heaven. One of the ministers, Huang Sheng, said, "A hat, no matter how old, belongs on the head, and shoes, no matter how new, belong on the feet!" 冠雖敝必加於首履雖新必關於足 (Burton Watson trans., *Records of the Grand Historian, Han Dynasty II,* Revised Edition [New York: Columbia University Press, 1993], p. 363); see also *Shi ji* 121, 8b. What Huang Sheng was trying to say was that the mandate of Heaven does not change. Statements that are closer to the quote that we have above can be found in the *Taiping guangji* 太平廣記 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 117, 5 and the *Fenmen gujin leishi* 分門古今類事 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 19, 8.

東西云云兒者, 是東堂地, 是西堂地, 爭之耶? 古草堂云, "南泉第一座, 養猫兒, 隣床折脚, 因此爭之." 則猫兒上立理 有佛性無佛性商量耶? 未知孰是. 師遂提起云云者, 會得罪性本空道得耶? 如花嚴波須密女之婬, 甘露火王之嗔殺, 勝熱波羅門之邪見, 無貪嗔癡, 唯眞智用耶? 非但猫兒, 盡大地情與非情, 向南泉手下, 拱手乞命. 大衆若解道得, 則不斬却耶? 旣有號令, 事須施行, 也須斬却也. 趙州便脫草鞋云云者, 禮記云, '履雖新, 不加於頂;冠雖舊, 不加於足.' 則戴草鞋於頂上者, 一一安著也. 故云, '子若在, 恰救得猫兒.' 法眞, 捉敗南泉也. 與一掌者, 虎頭虎尾, 一時收也.

Xuedou Chongxian's verse[891]

Both halls are equally full of phony Chan monks,[892]
They stir up smoke and dust but can't get it done,
Fortunately they have Nanquan who is able to uphold the command,
With a single stroke of a blade he cuts it into two pieces and leaves it obliquely askew.

> 雪竇顯頌, "兩堂俱是杜禪和, 撥動煙塵不奈何. 賴得南泉能擧令, 一刀兩段任偏頗."

Again his verse[893]

With a public case he makes the perfect approach and asks Zhaozhou,

891 For this verse, see also the *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.195a1–5); and also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.120b8–9).

892 I follow Koga and Iriya and take *duchanhe* 杜禪和 to be *duzhuan chanhe* 杜撰禪和, meaning phony or bogus Chan monks; see Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 235.

893 For this verse, see also the *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.195b4–8); and also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.120b10–11).

Who is left to roam freely in the city of Chang'an.
He wears a straw sandal on top of his head but no one understands,
Upon his return to his home mountain he takes a break.

又頌, "公案圓來問趙州, 長安城裏任閑遊. 草鞋頭戴無人會, 歸到家山便卽休."

[Explanation]

Xuedou: The first verse by Xuedou is a verse about Nanquan. The next verse is a verse about Zhaozhou.

雪竇: 前頌, 頌南泉;後頌, 頌趙州.

Dajue Huailian's verse

The two halls bitterly arguing over the cat Five White,[894]
Old Wang (Nanquan) cut it into two pieces with a single stroke of a blade,
When Zhaozhou was able to connect the two pieces and bring it back to life,
Its teeth and nails were as chilling as ice and snow.

大覺璉頌, "兩堂五白苦相爭, 王老一刀成兩截. 趙州續得再活時, 牙爪生獰似冰雪."

---

894 This is probably an allusion to the poem, "Offering to a Cat" (Jimao 祭猫), by Mei Yaochen 梅堯臣 (1002–1060). The first part of this poem reads:

Since I got my cat Five White,
The rats never bother my books.
This morning Five White dies,
I make offerings of rice and fish

David Palumbo-Liu, *The Poetics of Appropriation: The literary theory and practice of Huang Tingjian* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1993), p. 76.

Touzi Yiqing's verse[895]

If you face danger then you must know how to push others down,
If you seek talent, then first reveal your own sharpness,
The fishermen all say they are well versed in the power of the wind,
But when the wind finally arrives they lose their way in the waves.
Dejected Zhaozhou may be a skilled hand,
The bell rings, the meal is over, and he shows up late.
Do you wish to know the Jiazhou path to the great image?[896]
An iron ox firmly guards the western pass to the Shaanxi circuit.[897]

> 投子青頌, "臨險推人事要知, 求材[898] 先自露針錐. 釣魚盡說諳風勢, 及至風來波路迷. 潦倒趙州雖好手, 鍾鳴齋後赴來遲. 要知大像嘉州路? 鐵牛鎮斷陝關西."

Zishou Jie's verse

After Nanquan cuts it up Zhaozhou saves it,
In a lion's cave there are no other beasts.
In Indian Sanskrit it is Amitābha,
In Chinese it is Immeasurable Life.
[This record says, "When Nanquan ascended the hall a cat jumped onto the Dharma seat. Nanquan picked it up, showed it to the assembly, and

---

895 For this verse, see also the *Linquan laoren pingchang Touzi Qing heshang songgu konggu ji* 林泉老人評唱投子青和尚頌古空谷集 (hereafter *Konggu ji*; XZJ 117.558b17–559a3).

896 The great image in Jiazhou refers to the Great Buddha of Leshan樂山大佛 in Sichuan, which was carved out of a cliff face during the Tang dynasty.

897 According to legend, the iron ox was cast by Great Yu 大禹 to conquer the floods in Henan; see *Henan tongzhi* 河南通志 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 52, 615.

898 The *Konggu ji* has *cai* 財 for *cai* 材.

said, 'If there is someone who can speak, then I will not cut it in two. If there is no one who can speak, then I will cut it in two.' The chief seat made the noise of a cat and so Nanquan cut the cat in two.]

> 資壽捷頌, "南泉斬後趙州救, 師子窟中無異獸. 西乾梵語阿彌陁, 東震唐言無量壽." <此錄云, "南泉上堂, 有猫兒跳上法座, 泉提起示衆云, '有人道得不斬, 道不得即斬.' 首座作猫叫, 南泉便斬." >

[Explanation]
Zishou: *In Indian Sanskrit* etcetera: are they the same or different?

資壽: 西乾梵語云云者, 是同是別?

Tiantong Zhengjue's verse[899]

The monks in training (雲水) of the two halls all take sides and try to take it,
But old master Wang is able to verify true and false,
With a sharp blade he cuts it up and both sides disappear,
Throughout all the ages he makes people adore a virtuoso.
This Way has not yet been lost,
A sympathetic friend is indeed exemplary.
A tunnel was dug through a mountain that led all the way to the ocean,
Only because of the honorable great Yu.
A stone was polished to support Heaven,
Only because of the wise Nüwa.[900]
Old Zhaozhou had a (brilliant) career,
Putting the straw sandal on this head made it relatively better.

---

899 For this verse, see the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.19b5–9); and also *Congrong lu* (T 2004.48.232c26–233a3).

900 For this legend regarding Nüwa, see the *Huainanzi* or *Huainan honglie jie* 淮南鴻烈解 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 6, 9b.

He came from a different mix and yet possessed a bright mirror,[901]
This is because real gold does not mix with sand.

> 天童覺頌, "兩堂雲水盡分拏, 王老師能驗正邪. 利刀斬斷俱亡象, 千古令人愛作家. 此道未喪, 知音可嘉. 鑿山透海兮, 唯尊大禹;鍊石補天兮, 獨賢女媧. 趙州老有生涯, 草鞋頭戴較些些. 異中來也還明鑒, 秪箇眞金不混沙."

Boaning Renyong's verse[902]

The radiance of the icy cold blade shoots all the way to the Big Dipper and Herdboy,
Not only Heaven and earth but also the ghosts and spirits are anxious,
The life faculty fell into the hands of Nanquan,
Just take a look at the two pieces and rest!

> 保寧勇頌, "雪刃含光射斗牛, 不唯天地鬼神愁. 命根落在南泉手, 直下看看兩段休."

Again his verse[903]

Horns re-appear on top of the wild cat's head,
Old Wang paces in front of the gate late at night.
Day breaks and it is unclear where he went,
Mt. Chu, stretched endlessly, is deceptively lofty.

---

901 Bright mirror is a metaphor for the inherently pure mind.

902 For this verse, see the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.120b18–121a1); and also *Baoning Renyong chanshi yulu* (XZJ 120.374a4–5).

903 For this verse, see the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.121a2–3); and also *Baoning Renyong chanshi yulu* (XZJ 120.374a8–9).

又頌,"狸奴頭上角重生, 王老門前獨夜行. 天曉不知何處去, 楚山無限謾崢嶸."

Donglin Changcong's verse[904]

Nanquan's command cuts it in two with a single stroke of the blade,
How high is Zhaozhou's barrier laid out right before your eyes!
If one does not possess a true eye for the tenet right in front,
He again will flow downstream and fall into the realm of human beings.

東林惣頌,"一刀兩段南泉令, 當頭高着趙州關! 劈面若無宗正眼, 又隨流水落人間."

Zhaxi Riyi's verse

East and West halls are both arable fields,
Grains of rice are sown but there is nothing to reap,
What a pity, a cat is cut in two so carelessly,
To this very day mice make a racket going squeak squeak.

霅溪益頌,"東西兩畔盡田疇, 粒米拋來惣不收. 可惜猫兒輕斬却! 至今老鼠鬧啾啾."

Again his verse

He returns barefoot having vanquished the west of Huai River,
Cold snow shines radiantly all throughout Heaven,
The victory song has not yet reached the ears of the barbarian troops,

904 For this verse, see the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.121a4–5).

They still guard the flag in front of the encampment.

又頌, "打破淮西赤脚歸, 一天寒雪熠光輝. 凱歌不到胡兵耳, 猶向軍前守信旗."

Cuiyan Sizong's verse[905]

Who will discern the gold hidden in stone?
The traveler just sees traces of it left in spots,
It is rather the stone man who pries into him,
He enters Mt. Dongting on an iron ship.

翠嵓宗頌, "石裏藏金誰辨別? 游人但見蘇痕斑. 却被石人窺得破, 鐵舩載入洞庭山."

Chongsheng Yuangong's verse

Old master Wang—a man of clean liberation and sharp skills,
What need was there for the two halls to fight over a cat?
Indeed, when questioned no-one says a word,
Why did the cutting not put the doubts to rest?
Since old Zhao had shown the precipitous danger,
The old awl as before (serves as) the bowl striker (和羅槌).
A bowl striker!
The tiles are all broken and the tortoise shell is completely punctured.

崇勝珙頌, "脫灑機鋒王老師! 兩堂何必競猫兒? 果然問處都無語, 一斬如何未息疑? 趙老旣呈崖險事, 古錐依舊和羅槌. 和羅槌! 打盡瓦兮鑽盡龜."

905 For this verse, see the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.121b14–15).

Foyan Qingyuan's verse[906]

They fight over a wild calico cat with all their might,
When finally they draw their swords it's as if they were all born blind,
The body was split in two to care for both sides,
Immediately a wind of compassion stirs from the earth.

> 佛眼遠頌, "五色狸奴盡力爭, 及乎按劍盡生盲. 分身兩處重相爲, 直得悲風動地生."

Again his verse

The duty of pacifying the country and home does not belong to soldiers,
Lu Zhonglian's arrow is full of passion,[907]
The three-thousand guest swordsmen—where are they now?
Only Zhuang Zhou was able to establish Great Peace.[908]

> 又頌, "安國安家不在兵, 魯連一箭亦多情. 三千劍客今何在? 獨許莊周致大平."

Baiyun Zhibing's verse

Old Wang could blow the hole-less flute,
Zhaohou was adept at playing the string-less zither,
No matter who hears the clamorous tune,

---

906 For this verse, see the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.121a16–17); and also *Guzusu yulu* (XZJ 118.594a18–b1).

907 For the story of Lu Zhonglian 魯仲連 and how he thwarted the Yan 燕 invasion in 284 B.C.E with a letter tied to an arrow, see the *Shi ji* 83, 1–11.

908 This is from the chapter "Discoursing on Swords" from the *Zhuangzi.* For an English translation, see Watson, *Complete Works of Chuang Tzu,* chapter 30.

The smile on the exposed pillars and lanterns deepens ever more.

> 白雲昺頌 "王老能吹無孔笛, 趙州善撫沒絃琴. 誼轟曲調憑誰聽? 露柱燈籠笑轉深."

Layman Wujin's verse

Nanquan sternly grasps skill (in *chan*) as an expedient,
He thrust at both sides with this thing (the cat) and posed a question,
(Zhaozhou) Congshen takes a sandal off and places it on his head,
It's become all the less clear as to whether the cat will be alive or dead.

> 無盡居士頌, "南泉凛凛握機權, 一物全提問兩邊. 諗子脫鞋頭上戴 猫兒生死更茫然."

Layman Benran's verse

Not withdrawing from what has already begun to unfold, he cuts it up,
Father and son meet each other and bring it back to life,
How pitiful is the traveler outside the gate,
All he can do is to trace things out exactly,
He is a kind of spirit that toys with the soul,
And puts strain on the eyes inside the skull.

> 本然居士頌, "已展不縮便斬却, 父子相逢救得活. 可憐門外有遊人! 秖解依模畫渾脫. 一種弄魂精! 髑髏努眼睛."

Hunchengzi's verse

Moved by the force of the wind, they appear together,
The cat was cut up but this becomes yet another disgrace,

The patriarchs have been paragons in the past and the present,
The old lady selling fans blocks the sun with her hand.[909]

混成子頌, "風力所轉共平出, 猫兒斬斷還成屈. 祖師今古作標儀, 賣扇老婆手遮日."

Layman Yuezhai's verse[910]

What's raised is clear and the cutting is familiar,
Falling flowers and flying pollen throw themselves at the passers by,
He goes out the gate with straw sandals on his head,
Each and every leaf of the round lotus in April is fresh.

悦齋居士頌, "提起分明斬處親, 落花飛絮撲行人. 草鞋頭上[911] 出門去, 四月圓荷葉葉新."

Baofu Congzhan added a comment, "Although this may be the case, they were still just a pair of shabby straw sandals."[912]

保福展拈, "雖然如是, 也即是破草鞋."

[Explanation]
Baofu: What Zhaozhou had were shabby straw sandals and Nanquan a dead cat.

909 This last line was also used by Fenyang Shanzhao's disciple Daoyi 道一 (d.u.) of Taizi Cloister 太子院 in Fenyang; see *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* (XZJ 135.760a11). See also *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.825a20–21).

910 For this verse, see the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.122a6–7).

911 In the third line of the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* version of this verse, the order of "straw sandals" (*caoxie* 草鞋) and "on his head" (*toudai* 頭戴) are reversed.

912 See the *Congrong lu* (T 2004.48.233a22–23).

保福: 趙州地, 是破草鞋;南泉地, 是死猫兒.

Cuiyan Shouzhi[913] added a comment, "Zhaozhou of all people! All he can save is himself."[914]

翠嵓芝拈, "大小趙州! 秖可自救."

[Explanation]
Cuiyan: Zhaozhou was able to acquire just one peg.

翠嵓: 趙州, 只得一橛也.

Dahong Baoen added a comment, "What use is there in saving the cat? As a matter of fact, it is Nanquan and Zhaozhou who need to be saved." He thereupon raised his hand as if he were pinching something and said, "Nanquan and Zhaozhou's lives are all in here. If you allow it, then there is room for neither approval nor disapproval. If you do not allow it, there is no need even for a pinch," and clapped once.[915]

大洪恩拈, "猫兒救得何用? 却須救取南泉趙州." 乃擧手作捏勢云, "南泉趙州性命, 總在這裏. 若放過, 則無可不可;若不放過, 不消一捏." 拍一拍.

[Explanation]
Dahong: *He thereupon raised his hand as if he were pinching something*: He did not leave Nanquan and Zhaozhou be.

---

913 This refers to Dayu Shouzhi, a dharma heir of Fenyang Shanzhao. Dayu first served as the abbot of Xingjiao Cloister 興教院 on Mt. Dayu 大愚 in Jiangxi province and later moved to Mt. Cuiyan in the same province.

914 See the *Congrong lu* (T 2004.48.233a24).

915 Here, Dahong appears to be alluding to a similar sermon delivered by Huangbo Xiyun; see *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi yulu* (T 1988.47.560a5–7); *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.181a13–15); and also *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.548b1–4).

Clapped once: the same is true here.

If you allow it, then there is room for neither approval nor disapproval: one should leave Nanquan and Zhaozhou be. This is the meaning of "saving the cat" in the first line.

大洪: 擧手作揑勢者, 南泉趙州不放過. 下拍一拍, 亦然. 放過則無可不可者, 也須放過南泉趙州也. 最初云猫兒救得, 卽此義也.

Zhenjing Kewen ascended the hall and said,[916] "Nanquan cutting the cat in two along with Guizong cutting the snake in two[917] are (subjects of) calculation among the Chan grove. Is it or is it not the case that one is superior and the other inferior? Stop trying to decide which is superior and which is inferior, and tell me, what about Zhaozhou putting his sandals on his head and leaving? If you are able to clarify this matter, what fault could there be in Deshan scolding the buddhas and chewing out the patriarchs?[918] If you are not able clarify this matter, (you'll share the fate of) the cloister chief (院主) whose eyebrows[919] fell off when he criticized Danxia (Tianran)[920]

916 For this sermon, see the *Zhu Lushan Guizhong yulu* 住廬山歸宗語錄 in the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.724a7–11).

917 Guizong refers to Guizong Zhichang. According to legend, a lecturer came by when Guizong was cutting grass. At that moment they saw a snake Guizong cut the snake. Afterwards, the lecturer accused Guizong of being coarse. In some versions of this legend Guizong, in turn, accused the lecturer of being coarse. When the lecturer conversely asked him what is fine Guizong made the gesture of cutting a snake. When the lecturer hastily accepted Guizong's reply as the truth Guizong asked the lecturer, "Where did you see me cut the snake?" And the lecturer remained silent. For this story, see case 255 of the *Seonmun yeomsong; Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.256a23–25); *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 118.14b9–13); and also *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.498b3–7).

918 See *Jiangzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.48b15).

919 For the significance of losing one's eyebrows, see note 356 above.

920 Danxia Tianran 丹霞天然 (739–824) is said to have studied under both Mazu Daoyi and Shitou Xiqian and is considered the dharma heir of Shitou. Danxia lived in various locations such as Huading Peak on Mt. Tiantai, Huilin Monastery 慧林寺 in Henan province where he burned the wooden Buddha, and Mt. Danxia 丹霞山, which is also located in Henan province.

for setting the wooden Buddha ablaze.[921] Therefore (it is said) 'fortune and misfortune have no gate—people simply bring it upon themselves.'" He gave out a shout.

眞淨文, 上堂云, "南泉斬猫兒, 與歸宗斬虵, 叢林中商量, 還有優劣也無? 優劣且止, 只如趙州戴靸鞋出去, 又作麼生? 若也於此明得, 德山呵佛罵祖, 有什麼過? 於此不明, 丹霞燒木佛, 院主眉鬚落. 所以禍福無門, 唯人自召." 喝一喝.

[Explanation]

Zhenjing: *Nanquan cutting the cat in two along with Guizong cutting the snake in two*: are they of the same kind? If they are of the same kind, then there can be no place for calculations about superiority and inferiority between them.

What about Zhaozhou etcetera: if you get Nanquan cutting up the cat, Guizong cutting up the snake, and Zhaozhou putting his sandals on his head, how could (you say that) they are different teachings? Accordingly, Deshan scolding the buddhas and chewing out the patriarchs has no fault. If calculations are made about gain and loss or superiority and inferiority, then the cloister chief's eyebrows fell off when he criticized Danxia for setting the wooden Buddha ablaze because he had brought this upon himself.

He gave out a shout: arriving here, what superiority or inferiority and gain or loss could there be?

眞淨: 南泉斬猫, 歸宗斬虵, 一般耶? 若是一般, 有優劣無優劣商量, 無有是處也. 只如趙州云云者, 若知南泉斬猫, 歸宗斬虵, 趙州戴草鞋, 豈是別法? 然則德山呵佛罵祖, 也無過也. 若也得失優劣商量, 丹霞燒木佛, 院主眉鬚墮落, 是由自召也. 喝一喝者, 到這裏, 有什麼優劣得失?

Cuiyan Yuanji[922] ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and said, "When

---

921 For the story of Danxia Tianran setting the wooden Buddha ablaze, see case 321 below.

922 This is Yuantong Yuanji; see. note 266 above.

old man Nanquan temporarily used an expedient means this is just like a father who does not realize his shameful appearance while caring for his son. Worldly emotions look for the warm and the cold; people's will follow the high and the low.[923] What lies ahead resembles silver mountains and iron walls—there is no gate through which you can proceed; what remains behind you is mixed with water and mud— a complete mess. How could you (Nanquan) not know that after years and years you would become a cause for ridicule among later generations? Had it been me it would not be so. Even if he were to put a pair of sandals on his head and leave, you should still cut it up. Why? If you do not sever what needs to be severed, you will instead invite chaos. I dare ask all of you—then how are we supposed to calculate this public case? If you are able make a calculation, the Nanquan of old will still be here with us today; if you are not able to make a calculation, today I will briefly expose a sharp plan so please listen carefully." After a pause he said, "The blue mountains merely waste the time away; when has the flowing water ever washed away right and wrong?"[924]

翠嵓璣, 上堂, 擧此話云, "南泉老人一期方便, 大似憐兒不覺醜. 世情看冷暖, 人意逐高低. 前似銀山鐵壁, 進而無門, 退而無路;背後合水和泥, 一場狼藉. 殊不知, 千古之下, 與後人作笑端. 若是翠嵓卽不然. 直饒兩隻履戴頭上出去, 也須斬却. 何故? 當斷不斷, 返招其亂. 敢問諸人. 秖如今日一場公案, 作麽生商量? 若也商量得出, 昔日南泉, 今朝猶在;若商量不得, 翠嵓今日, 略露鋒規, 諸人諦聽." 良久云, "青山秖解磨今古, 流水何曾洗是非."

[Explanation]

Cuiyan: *Old man Nanquan … the high and the low*: the gongan has been divided into two pieces.

---

923 Here, Yuanji appears to be citing his teacher Huanglong Huinan; see *Huanglong Huinan chanshi yulu* 黃龍慧南禪師語錄 (T 1993.47.632b24).

924 This last line is probably a quote. The same quote can be found in the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.823c19); *Xu guzunsu yuyao* (XZJ 118.960a6); and *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.364a13).

What lies ahead resembles silver mountains etcetera: this refers to the cutting up of the cat in the first part of the story.

What remains behind you is mixed with water etcetera: this means saving the cat will do just fine.

Before I said, the gongan was divided into two pieces and therefore it is said, *after years and years you would become a cause for ridicule among later generations.*

Even if he were to put a pair of sandals on his head etcetera: the command is carried out thoroughly.

I dare ask all of you … waste the time away etcetera: if today you say this and say that, then there will again be right and wrong. Therefore one must steadfastly uphold the command and strengthen the tenet himself.

翠巖: 南泉老人, 至高低者, 話作兩橛也. 前似銀山云云者, 前頭斬猫兒也. 背後合水云云者, 恰好救得猫兒也. 前云, 話作兩橛, 故云, 千古之下, 與後人作笑端也. 直饒兩隻履云云者, 令盡行也. 敢問諸人, 至今古云云者, 若也今日如何若何道得, 則又是非生矣. 然則一向據令, 自固其宗也.

Cuiyan Sizong added a comment, "Do you wish to know Nanquan's livelihood (活計)? It's simply this dead cat. Do you wish to know Zhaozhou's strategy for life? It's simply these worn-out straw sandals. None of you should ever lay a hand on them and pick them up. If you do pick them up, then they will soil your hand."

翠嵓宗拈, "要識南泉活計麽? 只這死猫兒是. 要識趙州活計麽? 只這破草鞋是. 諸人, 第一不得着手拈. 若也拈着, 汚却你手."

[Explanation]

Cuiyan: Nanquan and Zhaozhou—put up with neither.

翠巖: 南泉趙州, 皆不放過也.

Zhu'an Shigui raised this gongan up to "he cut it up' the master said,

“Promtly! Promptly! In accordance with the statues and ordinances!”[925] He again raised (this gongan). Arriving at (the point in the gongan) where it speaks of saving the cat, the master said, “This is exactly a case of a person from Puzhou chasing a thief.”[926]

竹庵珪, 擧此話, 至遂斬却, 師云, “急急如律令.” 復擧, 至恰救得猫兒, 師云, “正是普州人送賊.”

[Explanation]

Zhu’an: *Hurry! Hurry! Obey the law!*: this means raising high the true command and method is the all important essential point.

This is exactly etcetera: this means one cannot but follow what others do.

竹庵: 急急如律令者, 高提正令手段, 大殺緊要也. 正是云云者, 未免隨他伊麼去也.

---

925 This expression “Promptly! Promptly! In accordance with the statues and ordinances!” (*jiji ru luling* 急急如律令) is a stereotypical formula for issuing official statues and ordinances used during the Han. It became a standard feature of many religious statutes and ordinances, both Buddhist and Daoist, in East Asia.

926 A person from Puzhou refers to a thief. Puzhou has been known to harbor many thieves; see ZGD, p. 1074.

Case 250.

Panshan's Moon-Mind

盤山心月

[Old case]

Panshan[927] while instructing the assembly said, "The radiance of the moon-mind, round-perfect all by itself, swallows the ten-thousand schemata. Its radiance does not illuminate objects; the objects, too, do not exist. Radiance and objects are both lost; what else could it be?" Dongshan[928] said, "If radiance and objects are not yet lost, what then could it be?"[929]

盤山, 示衆云, "心月孤圓, 光呑萬象. 光非照境, 境亦非存, 光境俱亡, 復是何物?" 洞山云, "光境未亡, 復是何物?"

[Explanation of the gongan]

The *Qingliang shu*[930] says, "It is called the *moon-mind* because the

927 Panshan Baoji 盤山寶積 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Mazu Daoyi. Baoji served as the abbot on Mt. Panshan 盤山 in Hebei province.

928 Dongshan Liangjie (807–869) is a dharma heir of Yunyan Tancheng 雲巖曇晟 (782–841). Liangjie was invited to serve as the abbot of a new temple named Guangfu Monastery 広福寺 (alt. Puli Chan Cloister 普利禪院) on Mt. Dong 洞山. He posthumously received the title Chan master Wuben 悟本禪師.

929 See the *Zongjing lu* 宗鏡錄 (T 2016.48.944c16–17); and also *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.354c3–4).

930 Unclear as to which commentary this refers to or where the quote ends. Usually Qingliang refers to Chengguan (738–839) and his commentary on the *Huayan jing* (Flower Garland Scripture).

actualization of enlightenment (始覺) is perfectly full like the bright moon. It is *round all by itself* because in the mind there is no duality, no mixing (with anything else), and no virtue that is not perfect. *Radiance* is the shining of wisdom. *Swallowing* is the attainment of realization (得證). It is called the *ten-thousand schemata* because within the three realms everything is an immeasurable teaching. This is none other than the realm of attainment of all the buddhas. Therefore an ancient one said, 'The myriad dharmas are immovable and originally tranquil.'[931] The *radiance that does not illuminate objects* is the wisdom that realizes because it does not possess the sign of discursive understandings. The *objects that also do not exist* belong to the realm of the object of realization because they, too, do not possess signs. *Radiance and objects both lost* means the subject of realization and the object of realization are both lost. *What else could (the mind) be* means when they are both lost there is nothing of which we can speak." I wonder if it is the case here that Panshan quoted a passage from scripture and turned it into a Chan gongan. An ancient one said, "The quality of a copper (mirror) is the essence of self-nature; the brightness of a copper (mirror) is the function of self-nature. The image manifested by the brightness is function that follows conditions."[932] In other words, the moon-mind is the essence of self-nature, the radiance is the function of self-nature, and the ten-thousand schemata are the function that follows conditions.

Round-perfect all by itself: it is high and far and without comparison and therefore it is *all by itself*. There is no virtue that is not round and therefore it is *round-perfect*.

Its radiance swallows the ten-thousand schemata: when the moon first appears barely in the clear sky at that moment the image in of the empty sky contains the ten-thousand schemata.

Its radiance does not illuminate objects etcetera: radiance and objects each take the other away, hence *radiance and objects are both lost*.

---

931 Source unknown.

932 This is a quote from the *Zhonghua chuanxindi chanmen shizi chengxi tu* 中華傳心地禪門師資承襲圖 (XZJ 110.874b5–6).

What else could (the mind) be: radiance and objects are both lost. Is this, therefore, why "there is nothing of which we can speak"? The moon-mind is also lost.

If radiance and objects are not yet lost etcetera: what need is there (to choose between) "radiance and objects are both lost" or "radiance and objects are not yet lost"? There is no second option.

清凉疏云, "心月者, 始覺圓滿如明月故. 孤圓者, 心獨無二無雜, 無德不圓故. 光者, 智照也. 呑者, 得證也. 萬像者, 三世間皆是無量法門故, 斯乃諸佛所證境也. 所以古人道, '諸法不動本來寂.' 光非照境者, 能證之智, 無有解相故. 境亦非存者, 所證之境, 亦無有相故. 光境俱亡者, 能證所證俱亡也. 復是何物者, 俱亡當時, 不可言其某物也." 則疑盤山引經文爲禪話. 古人云, "銅之質自性體, 銅之明自性用, 明所現影隨緣用." 則心月自性體, 光自性用, 萬像隨緣用也. 孤圓者, 逈然絶對故孤, 無德不圓故圓. 光呑萬像者, 青天寥寥月初生, 此時影空含萬像. 光非照境云云者, 光境互奪也, 則光境俱亡也. 復是何物者, 光境俱亡故, 不可言其某物耶? 心月亦亡也. 光境未亡云云者, 何必光境俱亡, 光境未亡, 更無第二.

Jingyan Shousui's verse

The dense phenomenal array that fills the eyes are thoroughly empty,
Both lost and not yet lost are the same.
No need to use names and letters in this instance,
The patriarch's style continues to resonate throughout all the ages.

淨嚴遂頌, "滿目森羅徹底空, 俱亡還與未亡同. 箇中不用安名字, 千古由來振祖風."

[Explanation]

Jingyan: Both lost and not yet lost are not different teachings. Approach with elevated eyes and the patriarch's style will resonate.

淨嚴: 俱亡未亡, 非是別法, 於此高著眼, 方振祖風.

Songyuan Chongyuan's verse

The copy is not done and the drawing is not done,
The crouching dragon has long feared the clarity of the green pool,
Piece it together with a deliberating mind but in the end understanding is difficult,
An accomplished one will certainly be scared in the dark.

> 松源頌, "描不成兮畫不成, 臥龍長怖碧潭清. 擬心湊泊終難會, 達者應須暗裏驚."

[Explanation]
Songyuan: *The copy is not done* etcetera: radiance and objects are both lost. The next two lines: radiance and objects have not yet been lost.

松源: 描不成云云者, 光境俱亡也. 下二句, 光境未亡也.

Yunmen Wenyan raised Panshan's saying and said,[933] "The entire great earth is radiance. What are we calling the self (自己)? If you are able to recognize the radiance, then objects, too, cannot be acquired. What sort of shit is this radiance and objects? If radiance and objects cannot be acquired, what else could there be?" Again, he said, "This is an explanation told repeatedly by an ancient one out of compassion. Here it is casual and clear, but allowing it will not do. If you do not allow it … " He raised his hand and said, "*sulu, sulu*."

雲門偃, 擧盤山語云, "盡大地是光, 喚什麽作自己? 你若識得光去, 境亦不可得, 有什麽屎光境! 光境旣不可得, 復是何物?" 又云, "此是古人慈悲之故, 重話會語, 這裏倜儻分明去, 放過則不可. 若不放過." 擧手云, "蘇嚕, 蘇嚕!"

933 For this sermon, see also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.356a3–7).

[Explanation]

Yunmen: *The entire great earth is radiance … what else could there be*: self is none other than the moon-mind. If radiance and objects cannot be had, then the self, too, cannot be attained.

Again … explanation told repeatedly by an ancient one: this is talk that fell into the weeds out of compassion.[934] This is called an *explanation told repeatedly*. From this we can tell that Panshan had raised a passage from scripture and used it for his own purpose. Is this not so for what is said in the gongan?

Here it is casual etcetera: although it is casual and clear, it cannot be allowed.

sulu, sulu: a single mantra that is also used for warding off the strange.

雲門: 盡大地至何物者, 自己則心月也. 光境旣不可得, 亦無自己可得也. 又云至會語者, 慈悲之故, 有落草之談也. 此云重話會. 以此故知盤山擧經文, 作自己用也. 話中云云, 不其然乎! 這裏倜儻云云者, 雖然倜儻分明, 不可放過也. 蘇嚕蘇嚕者, 一道眞言, 亦是遣恠也.

---

934 This refers to the teachings that Chan masters offer to students according to their potential. The expression can be found in the *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T 1988.47.554a4–9): Because of their compassion, all the venerables since olden days held conversations that fell into the weeds; through their words you will know what they are about. You would not be in that position had they [only] held talks that left the weeds. So there are collected and condensed anecdotes. Haven't you read the following story:

> Reverend Yangshan asked a monk, "Where have you just come from?"
> "From the Lu mountains," replied the monk.
> Yangshan said, "In that case, did you visit the Five Elders Peak?"
> "I've never been there," answered the monk.
> Yangshan rejoined, "You've never even been to the mountain!"

Master Yunmen said: "These words are all [examples of] having conversations in the weeds out of compassion." (Urs App, *Master Yunmen: From the Record of the Chan Teacher "Gate of the* Clouds" [New York: Kodansha America, 1994], pp. 157–158). As App points out, "Falling into the weeds' is a vernacular expression referring to a teacher who lowers himself compassionately into the weeds of delusion and ignorance."

Again he raised, “Radiance and objects are both lost, what else could it be?” The master said, “Even if this is what was said, there is still half way to go. It is not yet a straight road to liberation. A monk thereupon asked, “What is a straight road to liberation?” The master said, “Huading Peak of Mt. Tiantai and the stone bridge of Zhaozhou.”

又擧, ‘光境俱亡, 復是何物?’ 師云, “直饒伊麼道, 猶在半途, 未是透脫一路.” 僧便問, “如何是透脫一路?” 師云, “天台華頂, 趙州石橋.”

[Explanation]

Again he raised: *Huading Peak of Mt. Tiantai* etcetera: discriminating between this and that.

又擧云云: 天台華頂云云者, 彼此差別也.

Again he said,[935] “Radiance and objects are both lost, what else could it be?” Hiding the body in the eastern sea; riding a horse on top of Mt. Sumeru.” The master struck the bench once with the staff. The great assembly looked around (in bewilderment). The master thereupon picked up the staff and shooed them away, saying, “I assumed they were quick-witted, these lacquer buckets!”

又云, “光境俱亡, 復是何物? 東海裏藏身, 須彌山上走馬.” 師以拄杖打床一下, 大衆眼目定動. 師乃拈拄杖趁散云, “將謂靈利, 這漆桶!”

[Explanation]

Again he said: *Hiding the body in the eastern sea*: the eastern sea is discrimination. Hiding the body is concealing the body without leaving a trace.

Mt. Sumeru etcetera: the peak of Mt. Sumeru is where marks (相) are exhausted and names are lost. Riding a horse is lively function (活用).

935 For this sermon, see also the *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T 1998.47.554c28-a2).

Struck the bench once etcetera: how could striking the bench once not be "radiance and objects both lost"?

Picked up the staff and shooed them away etcetera: to care for (i.e., teach) others one must be thorough. First, do not allow them to do as they want (discriminations). Second, take a big step (toward discriminations). This is to not have discriminations in discriminations and to have discriminations in no discriminations.

又云云: 東海裏藏身者, 東海則差別, 藏身則隱身沒蹤迹也. 須彌云云者, 須彌山頂, 則相盡名亡, 走馬則活用也. 打床一下云云者, 打床一下, 豈不是光境俱亡地! 拈柱杖趂散云云者, 爲人須爲徹也. 第一, 不放過;第二, 闊一步. 此則差別中無差別, 無差別中有差別也.

Kumu Facheng ascended the hall and said, "Panshan acted as if he were guiding people to the gate and the door. If it were me (Xiangshan) I would not have done so. 'The lamp emits radiance, which beats down on the skull of patch-robed monks. The staff jumps up and blocks the patriarch's nose.'" He thereupon picked up the staff and said, "Only this dark cane covered in black lacquer also can emit radiance and shake the earth." He threw down the staff.

拈木成, 上堂云, "盤山, 大似引人向門頭戶底, 若是香山卽不然. 燈籠放光, 照破衲僧髑髏;拄杖跤跳, 築著祖師鼻孔." 乃拈拄杖云, "秖遮黑漆烏藤, 也解放光動地." 擲下拄杖.

[Explanation]

Kumu: *The lamp emits radiance*: it has a luster.

Beats down on the skull of patch-robed monks: "radiance and objects are both lost" above is an exposed pillar.

The staff jumps up etcetera: it beats down on skulls, but there is also the patriarch's nose. Because the staff has the lively function (活用) of pointing east and marking west it *blocks.*

Only this dark etcetera: how could something that cannot illuminate anything be what "radiance and objects both lost" refers to above? This too

also can *emit radiance and shake the earth*. But what fault is there in the skull of patch-robed monks that would, then, require the lamp to emit radiance and beat down on it?

枯木:燈籠放光者, 有光彩也. 照破至髏者, 前光境俱亡處, 乃是露柱也. 柱杖跋跳云云者, 照破髑髏, 則又有祖師鼻孔, 在柱杖, 則指東畫西有活用故, 築著也. 秪這黑云云者, 無照燭的, 豈是前光境俱亡的! 這的亦解放光動地也. 然則衲僧髑髏, 有什麽過, 則何必燈籠放光照破.

Baolin Ben ascended the hall and said, "'Its radiance does not illuminate objects; the objects, too, do not exist. Radiance and objects are both lost.' (These words) all refer to the one staff. The ancient one, arriving here, why didn't he know?" He thereupon picked up the staff and said, "Look! Look! Panshan's nose has been pierced by me (Shuanglin). Do all of you get it?" After a while he said, "Three thousand in the morning and eight hundred at night." He struck the meditation bench.

寶林本, 上堂云, "光非照境, 境亦非存, 光境俱亡, 都來是一條拄杖子. 古人, 到遮裏, 因什麽不識?" 乃拈起拄杖云, "看看! 盤山鼻孔, 今日被雙林穿却了. 你等諸人, 還委悉麽?" 良久云, "朝三千暮八百." 擊禪床.

[Explanation]

Baolin: *(These words) all refer to the one staff*: it points to the east and marks out the west.

The ancient one … why didn't he know: the ancient one refers to Panshan. Panshan recognized this staff and therefore it is said, *Panshan's nose has been pierced through by me.*

Three thousand in the morning and eight hundred at night: the lively function of the staff.

寶林: 都來是一條柱杖者, 指東畫西也. 古人至不識者, 古人謂盤山. 盤山有識這个柱杖子, 故云, '盤山鼻孔, 今日被雙林穿却了也.' 朝三千云云者, 柱杖子之活用也.

Huanglong Weiqing[936] ascended the hall, raised Panshan's saying, and said, "As soon as I saw him say this, just then I gave him a call to the back of his head. I waited till he turned his head and then asked 'What else could it be'? Even if it is difficult to justify this on the spot, I'm sure he will deeply embrace this debt."

黄龍清, 上堂, 擧盤山語云, "才見伊麽道, 便與腦後一箚, 待他轉頭來, 却問復是何物, 從教直下難分雪, 管取恩深懷抱中."

[Explanation]

Huanglong: *I gave him a call to the back of his head*: he destroyed a conceptual trap (窠窟).

What else could (the mind) be: this is "both lost" and "are not yet lost." Therefore it is said, *Even if it is difficult to justify this on the spot*.

I'm sure etcetera: this favor is immensely great.

黄龍: 腦後一箚云云者, 破他窠窟也. 復是何物者, 是俱亡未亡也. 故云, '從教直下難分雪' 也. 管取云云者, 此恩重大也.

Yunmen (i.e., Dahui) Zonggao ascended the hall and raised this gongan. The master said, "The white egret that landed on the field is like a thousand dots of snow; the yellow oriole that flied to the top of the tree is like a flower."[937]

雲門杲, 上堂, 擧此話, 師云, "白鷺下田千點雪, 黄鸎上樹一枝金." [938]

[Explanation]

Yunmen Zonggao: *The white egret* etcetera: this refers to Dongshan's state.

936 This is Lingyuan Weiqing, see note 827 above.

937 *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.813c16).

938 I follow the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* version and substitute *hua* 華 for *jin* 金.

The yellow oriole etcetera: this refers to Panshan's state.

雲門: 白鷺云云者, 謂洞山地也. 黃鶯云云, 謂盤山地也.

Again, he raised Panshan's saying and said, "A monk for a day in a monastery that lasts a thousand years."[939]

又擧, 盤山語云, "千年常住一朝僧."

[Explanation]

Again he raised: This clarifies Panshan and Dongshan's state. The above statement clarifies that outside of Panshan's state there is no Dongshan's state and outside of Dongshan's state there is no Panshan's state. This statement clarifies there can be no gap between the state of the two masters.

又擧: 此明盤山洞山地也. 前明盤山地外, 無洞山地; 洞山他外, 無盤山地. 此明二師地, 去離不得也.

Xinwen Tanfen ascended the hall, raised Panshan's saying and said, "Panshan lost his step at a ferry in Caishi[940]; I (Wannian[941]) tried to seize the opportunity and chase the monkey (who tried to scoop up the moon) into the water. Do all of you recognize the moon-mind? 'The thief may be a petty but his wisdom surpasses that of the gentleman.'[942] "

939 These words are also attributed to Dongshan Xiaocong 洞山曉聰 (d. 1030) in the *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* (XZJ 135.827a7–8) and elsewhere.

940 Caishi 采石 is a famous cliff in Anhui province. It is known as the location where Li Bo 李白 fell into the water while trying to scoop up the moon.

941 Xinwen Tanfen served as abbot of Wannian Monastery and was thus known as Wannian; see note 387 above.

942 This is a quote from the *Zhenzhou Linji Huizhao chanshi yulu* (T 1985.47.505b14).

心聞賁, 上堂, 擧盤山語云, "盤山, 采石渡頭失脚;萬年, 乘勢赶猿猴入水. 汝等諸人, 還識心月麼? 賊是小人, 智過君子."

[Explanation]

Xinwen: *The ferry in Caishi*: unknown. I wonder if this is the place where the monkey tried to scoop up the moon. In another source it says, "There was a maiden by the water who drowned trying to grab a stone and was reborn a son of good family (善男子). If so, this refers to Panshan trying to seize the moon-mind and unwittingly losing his step.

Seize the opportunity and chase etcetera: the mountain monk is also like the monkey who fell into the water trying to grab the moon.

The thief may be a petty etcetera: the mind of a thief is uneasy.

心聞: 采石渡頭, 未詳, 疑是猿猴捉月處. 又他處云, '有一水婼女, 沉水取石, 則生善男子.' 然則謂盤山採取心月, 不覺失脚也. 乘勢赶云云者, 山憎亦如猿猴, 入水採月也. 賊是小人云云者, 作賊人心虛也.

Miaozhi Congkuo ascended the hall and raised this gongan. The master said, "These two venerable worthies spoke this way and fell right into radiance and objects. If you examine them, they both lack awakening. If it were me (Yuwang), I would not have done so." He raised the fly whisk straight up and said, "Do you understand? Taihu is thirty-six thousand-*qing*[943] wide. Who would you tell that the moon is (actually) in his (own) mind?"

妙智廓, 上堂, 擧此話, 師云, "此二尊宿, 恁麼說話, 正墮光境中. 撿點將來, 俱欠悟在. 若是育王則不然." 竪起拂子云, "還會麼? 大湖三萬六千頃, 月在波心說向誰?"

943 A *qing* 頃 is approximately 6.67 hectares, so thirty-six thousand qing is about 2,401.2 km^2. Taihu lake today covers an area about 2,250 km^2.

[Explanation]

Miaozhi: *These two worthies … into radiance and objects*: *both are lost* and *are not yet lost* all do not transcend the scope of (discursive thinking).

He raised the fly whisk straight up etcetera: this one moon has not intermingled with anything else. But if you understand *radiance and objects are both lost* what else could be the matter?

妙智: 二尊宿至境中者, 俱亡未亡, 皆未離規模也. 竪起拂子云云者, 這一月卽不混也. 然則會得光境俱亡, 更有什麽事.

Case 261.

Guizong Raises His Fist

歸宗起拳

[Old case]

Guizong[944] was asked by Li Bo,[945] "What matter was clarified in the teachings of the great tripiṭaka?" The master raised his faist and said, "Do you understand?" Li said, "I don't understand." The master said, "Vainly reading ten-thousand scrolls of text when he can't even recognize a fist!"

歸宗, 因李渤問, "一大藏教, 明什麽邊事?" 師竪起拳云, "會麽?" 李云, "不會." 師云, "空讀萬卷書, 拳頭也不識."

[Explanation of the gongan]

Raising a fist: the teachings of the great tripiṭaka only speak of this.

Vainly reading … can't even recognize a fist: releasing it was dangerous and collecting it was quick.

起拳者, 一大藏教, 只說這箇也. 空讀云云至不識者, 放去大危, 收來大速.

Jiangshan Faquan's[946] verse[947]

944 This is Guizong Zhichang.

945 Li Bo 李渤 (773–831) is a famous official from the Tang dynasty. He maintained close relations with Chan monks in Jiangxi province where he was stationed as governor.

946 This refers to Nanming Faquan, see note 292 above.

He let it (his fist) go (放開) and the sun and moon are bright,
He holds on to it firmly (把定) and heaven and earth are black.
A call (to the back of his head) but he does not turn his head,
Brambles grow all over the ground.
Even the dragon palace's ocean storehouse is not as full.
A spark or a flash of lightning is not as fast.
Did you see it?
By the pond for washing inkstones under Zixiao peak,[948]
The eight stallions (of King Mu of Zhou 周穆王) are like dragons but they cannot catch up to it.

蔣山泉頌, "放開日月明, 把定乾坤黑. 一箚不迴頭, 滿地生荊棘. 龍宮海藏兮非多, 石火電光兮未急. 君不見? 紫霄峰下墨池邊, 八駿如龍追不及."

[Explanation]
Jiangshan: *Raising the fist*: letting it go (放行).
Vainly reading ten-thousand scrolls of text etcetera: holding on to it firmly (把定).
A call (to the back of his head) but he does not turn his head: it is not the case that the state of raising the fist does not exist.
Brambles grow all over the ground: this refers to vainly reading ten-thousand scrolls of text. You progress but do not get the intent (意).
The rest clarifies what is means to hold on to it firmly.

蔣山:竪起拳頭, 放行;空讀萬卷書云云, 把定也. 一劄不回頭者, 竪起拳頭處不無也. 滿地生荊棘者, 謂空讀萬卷書也. 又進前不得意也. 下皆明把定也.

947 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.132a1–3).

948 Zixiao Peak 紫霄峰 refers to the north peak of Mt. Lu in Jiangxi province. Guizong Monastery 歸宗寺 where Zhichang served as abbot was located on Zixiao Peak. The pond for washing inkstones was probably located inside Guizong Monastery.

Case 284.

Fenzhou's Deluded Thoughts

汾州妄想

[Old case]

Whenever he received questions from students Chan master Fenzhou Wuye[949] often answered them by saying, "Do not have deluded thoughts."[950]

汾州無業禪師, 凡學者致問, 師多答之云, "莫妄想."

[Explanation of the gongan]

Juefan Huihong said, "The *Faju jing* says, 'If you give rise to the mind of zeal, this is delusion and not zeal.'[951] The *Yuanjue jing* says, 'All living beings of the final age, if their minds do not give rise to delusions, the Buddha preached that such people will become bodhisattvas in the present age.'[952] This is all gossip about (original) nature and the gate to enter the Way. But students take these words for granted and erroneously seek the mysterious

949 Fenzhou Wuyue 汾州無業 (760–821) is a dharma heir of Mazu Daoyi. He first became abbot at Kaiyuan Monastery 開元寺 in Fenzhou 汾州 (Shanxi province). He posthumously received the title National master Dada 大達國師.

950 For this story, see also the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.257a25).

951 *Faju jing* (T 2901.85.1435a20). This quote appears in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* where it is also attributed to the *Faju jing*; see the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.234b27). In Juefan Huihong's *Linjian lu,* however, the quote is attributed to the *Fahua jing* 法華經; see *Linjian lu* (XZJ 148.624a17–18).

952 *Yuanjue jing* (T 842.17.917b23–24).

sublime. How laughable!"

覺範云, "法華[953]經云, '若起精進心, 是妄非精進.' 圓覺經云, '末世諸衆生, 心不生虛妄, 佛說如是人, 現世卽菩薩.' 此乃稱性之談, 入道之門. 而學者易其語, 反求玄妙, 可笑."

Zhimen Guangzuo's[954] verse

Mazu was able to produce a Fenzhou,
Deluded thoughts, like thunder, spread through the nine provinces,
If you do not have the eyes of a patch-robed monk while investigating *Chan*,
Often it is like looking for bubbles on the ocean.[955]

知門祚頌, "馬祖出得一汾州, 妄想如雷播九州. 參禪若無衲子眼, 多於海上覓浮漚."

[Explanation]

Zhimen: The first two lines: this is the state that Fenzhou called deluded thoughts. The state of all the buddhas of the three ages and generations of patriarchs do not surpass this.

The last two lines: to seek beyond this and produce views of the mysterious sublime is to look for bubbles on the ocean.

智門: 上二句, 汾州莫妄想地, 三世諸佛, 歷代祖師地, 無越於此也. 下二句, 此外强作玄妙知見, 是海上覓浮漚也.

---

953 Here, *hua* 華 should read *ju* 句; see note 951 above.

954 Zhimen Guangzuo 智門光祚 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Yunmen Wenyan's disciple Xianlin Chengyuan 香林澄遠 (908–987). He first served as abbot of Shuangquan Monastery 雙泉寺 in Hubei province and later moved to Zhimen Monastery 智門寺 in the same province.

955 Bubbles on the ocean is a common Buddhist metaphor for impermanence. The verse is also found in the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.669a3–4).

Chongsheng Yuangong's verse

Fenzhou tells us not have deluded thoughts,
If a boat is to sail the tide must be high.
All those who come boast that they can do it,
How many people can relieve an itch?[956]
Relieving an itch is the real deluded thought.
They fall into a moat or pit with a thud.
They don't know how to use the thousand-pound bow for shooting tigers,
But they say a great accomplishment is worthy of receiving an award.

崇勝珙頌, "汾州莫妄想, 航行須水長. 來者盡誇能, 幾人抓着癢? 抓着癢眞妄想, 墮塹落坑撾地響. 不知射虎弩千鈞, 却道大功能受賞."

National master Tiantai Deshao while instructing the assembly raised this gongan and said, "All of you say, 'There is no need for *Do not have deluded thoughts*.' If you do not recognize the source of deluded thoughts, then everything will become an artificial construction. It is neither to discern nor to judge it. What else is there to judge? Everyone! Generally speaking, when on pilgrimage one must be equipped with eyes (of appreciation). If you look for words and sayings then there will be no place of function. Do not conjecture or deliberate. Examine it in an instant. Activity is not as good as quietude. You must quickly investigate it."

昭國師, 示衆, 擧此話云, "諸仁者, 惣云, '不消个莫妄想.' 若也不識妄想根源, 惣成造作也. 不是判他, 不是斷他, 又斷个什麼? 諸仁者! 大凡行脚, 也須具眼, 始得. 若更尋言尋語, 並無用處. 不用卜度思量, 一時驗取! 動不如靜, 快須究取."

[Explanation]
National master Deshao: His intent is that one must recognize the source

956 Relieve an itch here probably refers to the attainment of awakening.

of deluded thoughts. Beyond this, there is no intimate place that is more intimate.

昭國師意, 須是識取妄想根源, 此外別無親於親處也.

Cishou Huaishen ascended the hall and said, "In the past whenever Reverend Fenyang[957] saw a monk approach him he would say, *Do not have deluded thoughts*. Whenever some one asked him a question he would always say, *Do not have deluded thoughts.* The prior said, 'People spread the rumor that your reverence's Buddhist teachings consist only of one phrase. Henceforth please stop.' From that point on whenever Fenyang saw someone approach him all he said was 'Stop.'" The master then said, "The ancient one did not wish his students to value what they heard over what they had attained and therefore did not dare use flowery language or artificial understandings. He went straight to the point and told you *Do not have deluded thoughts* or 'Stop.' Have all of you stopped? Everyday all of you, from the moment you open your eyes to the moment you close them, whatever actions you make there is none that is not deluded thoughts. Even when you dream during sleep this is also deluded thoughts. When one deluded thought arises distorted views develop into ten-thousand threads of upside-down (views). This opens the gate to defilements and throws the realm of purity into disarray. If you are able to recognize the source of deluded thoughts and directly rest and relax, then there is no Buddha to seek above, no demon to fear below, and no living being to love in between. There is also no death to fear. This is the fundamental source of purity and original, sublime Way. If you do not recognize the source of deluded thoughts, you shall transmigrate in the three realms, slip into the four modes of birth,[958] and escape here and enter there without rest. I have always been a man of many words. This morning we meet on this narrow path and I urge all of you to (do the following). Bear in

957 This refers to Fenzhou Wuye. Fenyang is another name for Fenzhou.

958 For the four modes of birth, see note 408 above.

mind this one account about Fenyang and to recite my (Huilin) two clumsy verses and you will be able to make a small place for rest on this path of gods and men. From age to age and rebirth to rebirth, I wish for us to always meet at the same dharma assembly. The verses read,

Investigate *Do not have deluded thoughts* well,
We do not know for whom we're so busy all day,
If you know the true revealed facts amidst all this busy work,
A lotus flower will appear in boiling water.

Rest well we did indeed,
But a hundred years of superfluous illusions and bubbles in water,
The true Buddha is in one's own home,
By all means avoid frivolously seeking it elsewhere.

慈受, 上堂云, "昔有汾陽和尚, 凡見僧來, 便云, '莫妄想.' 凡有所問, 皆云, '莫妄想.' 監院云, '人傳和尚佛法, 只有一句子, 今後休得也.' 自後汾陽, 凡見人來, 只云休得也." 師云, "古人不欲學者, 所聞勝如所得故, 言不敢華, 解不敢作, 直截向你道, 莫妄想休得也. 諸人還休得也未? 諸人每日, 自開眼至合眼, 所作所爲, 無非妄想, 至於睡夢之中, 亦是妄想. 妄想一起, 顚倒萬端, 開塵勞門, 迷清淨界. 若能識得妄想根源, 直下休歇去, 上無佛求, 下無魔怖, 中無生戀, 亦無死畏, 便是清淨本源, 天眞妙道. 若下識妄想根源, 輪廻三界, 汨沒四生, 出此入彼, 未有休息. 山僧自來多口, 今朝狹路相逢, 普勸諸人. 記取汾陽一段因緣, 誦取慧林兩首拙偈, 可以向人天路上, 做得箇小歇場, 願世世生生, 常同法會. 偈云, '莫妄想好參詳! 不知終日爲誰忙. 若知忙裏眞消息, 一朶蓮花生沸湯.' '休得也便好休, 百年浮幻水中漚. 自家屋裏天眞佛, 切忌區區向外求."

[Explanation]
Cishou: See the text above.

慈受: 上文見.

Case 294.

Fubei's "I Have Nothing Left to Say"

浮盃無剩語

[Old case]

An old temple lady named Ling made obeisance to Reverend Fubei[959] and asked, "To whom was the phrase that cannot be said even if one strives one's hardest entrusted?" The master said, "I have nothing left to say." The old lady said, "Had you not arrived, there would have been no harm in continuing to doubt." The master said, "If you have any other good points to raise you might has well raise them now." The old lady put her hands together, cried, and said, "O Heaven![960] There is still injustice and misery." The master was speechless. The old lady said, "Words do not know provisional or Real.[961] The Principle does not know distorted or heretical. Caring for people will give rise to calamities."

Later a monk raised this before Nanquan and Nanquan said, "How painful! Fubei was manhandled one round by this old lady." The old lady heard this, laughed, and said, "Old master Wang (Nanquan) still has a few mechanisms (機關) left." At that time there was Chan guest named Chengyi from Youzhou[962] who thereupon asked the old lady, "Why does Nanquan

959 Fubei 浮盃 is said to have been a disciple of Mazu Daoyi.

960 The word here is literally "deep blue sky" (蒼天).

961 Different combinations of the Real and the provisional make up the five positions (*wuwei* 五位) of Dongshan Liangjie.

962 Youzhou is a province in north Hebei and Liaoning.

have a few mechanisms?" The old lady cried and said, "How sad! How painful!" Chengyi was at a loss as to what to do. The old lady thereupon asked, "Do you understand?" Chengyi put his palms together and stood up. The old lady said, "There are as many Chan monks on the verge of death as sesame seeds and grain."

Later, Chengyi raised this before Zhaozhou and Zhaozhou said, "Had I seen this old stinky lady I would have questioned her and shut her up." Chengyi said, "I wonder what your reverence would have asked her?" Zhaozhou immediately struck him. Chengyi said, "Why do you strike me?" Zhaozhou said, "If I don't strike this Chan monk on the verge of death how long should I wait to do it?" The old lady retorted, "Zhaozhou needs a taste of the stick in my hand." Zhaozhou heard this and cried, saying, "How sad! How painful!" When the old lady heard this and exclaimed, "The radiance of Zhaozhou's eyes shine to all four continents under Heaven." Zhaozhou heard this and had someone go to her and ask, "What are Zhaozhou's eyes?" The old lady raised her fist. When Zhaozhou heard this he composed a verse and sent it to her. The verse read:

To test her skill I try to go face-to-face,
Going face-to-face I test her skills swiftly,
I answer you old temple lady Ling,
How could there be loss or gain in the sound of weeping?
The old lady replied:
The sound of weeping has been exposed by the master,
But who understands what has already been exposed?
When the command was issued at Magadha,[963]
The skill in front of our eyes was almost lost.[964]

963 The Buddha remained silent for 21 days after his enlightenment in Magadha. See note 162.

964 For this gongan, see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.262c18–263a13).

浮盃和尚, 因凌行婆來, 作禮問, “盡力道不得底句, 分付阿誰?” 師云, “浮盃無剩語.” 婆云, “未到浮盃, 不妨疑着.” 師云, “別有長處, 不妨拈出.” 婆歛手哭云, “蒼天! 中間更有寃苦.” 師無語. 婆云, “語不知偏正, 理不知倒邪, 爲人卽禍生.” 後僧擧似南泉, 泉云, “苦哉! 浮盃被這老婆摧折一上.” 婆聞笑云, “王老師, 猶少機關在.” 時有幽州澄一禪客, 乃問婆, “南泉爲甚少機關?” 婆哭云, “可悲可痛!” 澄一罔措, 婆乃問, “會麼?” 澄一合掌而立. 婆云, “倚死禪和, 如麻似粟.” 後澄一擧似趙州, 州云, “我若見這臭婆, 問教口啞.” 澄一云, “未審和尚作麼生問他?” 州便打澄一云, “爲甚却打某甲?” 州云, “似這倚死禪和不打, 更待何時!” 婆聞却云, “趙州合喫婆手中棒.” 州聞哭云, “可悲可痛!” 婆聞乃嘆云, “趙州眼光, 爍破四天下.” 州聞令人去問云, “如何是趙州眼?” 婆乃竪起拳. 州聞乃作頌送云, “當機覿面提, 覿面當機疾. 報你凌行婆, 哭聲何得失!” 婆答云, “哭聲師已曉, 已曉復誰知? 當時摩竭令, 幾喪目前機.”

[Explanation of the gongan]

Fubei's *I have nothing left to say*: if you say the phrase that cannot be said even if one strives one's hardest, then once it is entrusted it becomes something left to say.

Had you not etcetera: frustration for Fubei. What follows is also frustration for Nanquan. Fubei is not muddled, but there is a place where the staff (should be used).

Nanquan says *How painful* etcetera: Nanquan's intent was to say that there is a place where (the phrase) is entrusted.

The old lady heard this, laughed, and said … mechanisms left: again, frustration for Nanquan.

Chengyi put his palms together and stood up: this is somewhere in between.

There are as many Chan monks on the verge of death etcetera: again, frustration for Chengyi.

Zhaozhou immediately struck him: not falling into either extremes.

Zhaozhou needs … the stick in my hand: again, because this was not the old lady's intent.

The radiance of Zhaozhou's eyes etcetera: escape through the three phrases.[965]

965 For the three phrases, see note 101 above.

Zhaozhou and the old lady put this in verse. Each state their own intent.

浮盃無剩語者, 若道盡力道不得底句, 分付便爲剩語也. 未到浮盃云云者, 折挫也, 下亦折挫也. 浮盃非懵懂, 也有主丈處. 南泉云苦哉云云者, 南泉意, 有分付處. 婆聞笑云至關在者, 亦折挫也. 澄一合掌而立者, 是中間也. 倚死禪和云云者, 亦折挫也. 州便打者, 兩頭不落也. 趙州合至棒者, 亦不是婆子意故. 趙州眼光云云者, 透脫三句下, 趙州婆子頌之, 各言其意也.

Yunmen Zonggao's verse[966]

Having never seen a *maṇi* jewel in your palm,
Who can safeguard the trousers that they wore since birth?[967]
Fubei did not understand the old lady's *chan,*
And up to the present he suffers a bit of defilement.
[An old lady named Ling … will give rise to calamities]

雲門杲頌, "掌內摩尼曾不顧, 誰能護惜孃生袴! 浮盃不會老婆禪, 直至如今遭點汚." <浮盃下至卽禍生.>

[Explanation]

Yunmen Zonggao: *A* maṇi *jewel in your palm*: the barbarian manifests and the Chinese manifests. This is in between words and silence.

The trousers that they wore since birth: this refers to Fubei's words. If we are to speak of the old lady, she has not yet even gazed at the *maṇi* jewel, so how much more unlikely at the trousers that were worn since birth?

雲門: 掌內摩尼, 則胡現漢現, 語黙中間也. 孃生袴, 則浮盃語也. 若據婆子, 則掌內摩尼, 尚猶未顧, 何況孃生袴乎!

---

966 For this verse, see also the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.855b26–27)

967 The trousers that one wore since birth is a metaphor for one's original self. See case 64.

Again, his verse[968]

A spark and flash of lightning are slower still,
How could a Chan monk on the verge of death know?
Turning his head and squinting to look for it,
The setting sun has already past the lush branches in the West.
[Later a monk raised this before Nanquan … how long should I wait to do it]

> 又頌, "電光石火尚猶遲, 倚死禪和那得知? 轉面迴頭擬尋討, 夕陽已過綠梢西." <南泉下至待何時.>

[Explanation]

Again his verse: *A spark and flash of lightning*: the sublime purport is fast and falls into neither words nor silence.

Chan monk on the verge of death: the place where Chengyi stands. In between (words and silence) a spark and flash of lightning are slower still, so how much more so in the case of a Chan monk on the verge of death?

又頌: 電光石火者, 妙旨迅速, 語黙不落也. 倚死禪和者, 澄一立處也. 中間, 電光石火, 尚猶遲滯, 況倚死禪和乎!

Again, his verse[969]

The radiance of his eyes shine to all four corners under Heaven,
The old lady's fists have no seam,
To test skills I try to go face-to-face—what sort of matter is this?
Who straddles the spine of a fierce tiger?

968 For this verse, see also the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.855c8–9).

969 For this verse, see also the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.855c17–18).

[The old woman heard this … The skills right in front of our eyes was almost lost]

> 又頌, "眼光爍破四天下, 婆子拳頭沒縫罅. 當機覿面事如何? 猛虎脊梁誰解跨?<婆聞下至目前機.>

[Explanation]

Again his verse: *The radiance of his eyes* etcetera: this refers to Zhaozhou.

The old lady's etcetera: this is the old lady.

The next two lines: the tiger's head and the tiger's tail were simultaneously collected.

又頌: 眼光云云者, 謂趙州也. 婆子云云者, 婆子也. 下二句, 虎頭虎尾一時收也.

Zhifeizi's[970] verse

The neighbor to the west comes and helps cry "O Heaven!,"
I hear a person from the house to the east met a sudden death.
How lamentable, Fubei has nothing left to say,
The way he tests skills does not compare to the old lady's *chan*.
[An old temple lady named Ling … O Heaven]

> 知非子頌, "西隣來助哭蒼天, 聞道東家人溘然. 堪嘆浮盃無剩語, 當機不似老婆禪." <浮盃下至蒼天.>

Layman Wujin's verse

Copper eyeballs and iron eyes on old lady Ling,

---

970 Zhifeizi 知非子 is the style name of Zhao Bian 趙抃 (1008–1084), also known as Yuedao 悅道. Zhifeizi was a prominent official of the Northern Song and was a lay disciple of Yuantong Ju'ne 圓通居訥 (1010–1071).

Many tricks to manhandle Fubei,
There was nothing she could do about not being able to fool Zhaozhou,
Everyone blames the Chan monk (on the verge of) death.

> 無盡居士頌, "銅睛鐵眼老凌婆! 折浮盃伎倆多. 無奈趙州謾不過, 大家埋取死禪和."

Layman Yuezhai's verse

The old granny cries over not having a home,
Zhaozhou stirs emotions for home a thousand miles away,
Later people cry unconsolably over not having a teaching method (巴鼻),[971]
(But they are) vainly making the oriole's cry to imitate the crane's voice.

> 悅齋居士頌, "老媼無家哭一聲, 趙州千里動歸情. 後人哭殺無巴鼻, 空作鶯啼效鶴鳴."

[971] *Babi* 巴鼻 literally refers to the nose ring used to domesticate cows, but here it refers to the methods used by Chan masters to guide students.

Case 312.

Pang Yun's Ten Directions

龐蘊十方

[Old case]

Layman Pang's verse reads:

From ten directions they gather together,
Each learn effortless action,
This is the place for selecting buddhas,
Empty the mind, take first place, and return home.[972]

龐居土頌云, "十方同共聚, 箇箇學無爲. 此是選佛場, 心空及第歸."

[Explanation of the gongan]

From ten directions they gather together etcetera: the layman said, "I only wish to make all that exists empty. Never regard that which does not exist as real." This is also the meaning of this (verse). Dahui said, "If you take your own self and own mind as the ultimate intent, then you must have other things and other beings as an antidote."[973] Therefore, as for what the layman's verse says, although it speaks of effortless action, it must be thoroughly

972 For this verse, see also the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.416b28–29). This verse reflects the fact that Layman Pang had passed the civil-service examinations, which are here used as a metaphor for becoming Buddha.

973 See *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.914b23–24). Dahui himself attributes this saying to an unnamed ancient one.

effortless action; although it speaks of emptying the mind, the mind must be thoroughly empty. Then one's own self and own mind will not further need other things and other beings as an antidote.

十方共聚云云者, 居士云, "但願空諸所有, 愼勿實諸所無." 亦此義也. 大慧云, "若取自己自心, 爲究竟意, 必有他物他人作對治." 所以, 居士頌云, 則雖曰無爲, 徹底無爲, 雖曰心空, 徹底心空, 卽自己自心, 更無他物他人作對治也.

Xinwen Tanfen's verse[974]

The wind, the moon, the mountains, and rivers together form one family,
Who will come and determine what is dragon and what is snake?
Taibai[975] did not enter the rest hall,
A flower appears by itself on the tip of the brush.[976]

心聞賁頌, "風月山川共一家, 誰來語下定龍蛇? 太白不曾登便殿, 筆頭昨夜自生花."

[Explanation]

Xinwen: The first line is about *From ten directions they gather together … Empty the mind, take first place, and return home.* The second line is about not being able to make distinctions. The last two lines are about Li Bai who dreamt that a flower appeared by itself on the tip of his brush. From commoner status he became a Hanlin academician.[977] Pang's *Empty the mind*

974 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.162a1–2).

975 Taibai 太白 is the courtesy name of the great Tang poet Li Bai 李白 (701–762).

976 This is an allusion to the legend of Li Bai, who purportedly became a great poet after having a dream about flowers growing from the tip of his brush; see *Ganzhu ji* 紺珠集 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 1, 29; *Kaiyuan Tianbao yishi* 開元天寶遺事 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 2, 10; and *Li Taibai jizhu* 李太白集注 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 36, 1.

977 Li Bai was appointed to the Hanlin academy in 742 by Emperor Xuanzong 玄宗 (r. 712–756).

and take first place is also like this. Li Bai, when he was young, dreamt that a flower appeared on the tip of the brush that he used. His natural talent was awe-inspiring. He stood out from the rest of his fellows and his fame was widespread. Later, the emperor summoned Bai and had him prepare a few imperial orders. The day was cold and the brush froze, so the emperor had eighteen people grab the brush and blow on it and present it to Bai. After this, from commoner status Bai become a Hanlin academician.

> 心聞: 上句, 十方同共聚云云, 心空及第處也. 二句, 分辨不得也. 下二句, 李白夢裏, 筆頭生花, 白衣得翰林. 龐公心空及第, 如是也. 李白, 少時夢裏, 所用筆頭生花, 自然天才凛秀, 拔乎其萃, 名聞天下. 後帝使白, 命詔數書, 天寒筆凍, 使十八人, 執筆呵之而奉. 從此, 白衣得翰林也.

Tiantong Zhengjue ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and said,[978] "If it is effortless action, what need is there to learn? If the mind is also empty what again is taking first place? Do you get it? If not, I will spell it out for you. Drink the great ocean dry and push over Mt. Sumeru. Who, moreover, is it that is open and spiritually accomplished? Fragrant is the elegant forest and its sandalwood branch; with a roar out from the cave comes the lion's cub. The three-thousandfold (great thousandfold) worlds manifest in the snap of a finger; the eighty (four)-thousand (dharma) gates open in the blink of an eye. Do you know this or not? Will you do this or not? The Way fills the ten directions of empty space; the mind surpasses the hundred million kalpas. The shadow flows into the ten-thousand schemata; vital energy splits into its two modes (of yin and yang).

> 天童覺, 上堂, 擧此話云, "既[979]是無爲, 作麼生學! 若也心空, 又作麼生及第! 還相委悉麼? 其或未然, 天童又爲分疏去也. 飲乾巨海, 推倒須彌. 廓大靈通更是誰? 馨香秀林栴檀枝, 哮吼出窟師子兒. 三千界現一彈指, 八萬門開雙用眉. 知不知? 爲不爲? 道滿十虛兮, 心超億劫;影流萬象兮, 氣分二儀."

---

978 For this sermon, see also the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.47b4–10).

979 I follow the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* version and substitute *ji* 既 for *ji* 卽.

[Explanation]

Tiantong: *Drink the great ocean dry … Sumeru*: the mountains of wisdom and the ocean of wisdom are also pushed over.

What follows makes it clear that emptying the mind and taking first place leaves no doubt whatsoever and also that there are no other matters that need to be done.

天童: 飮乾至須彌者, 智之山智之海, 亦推倒也. 下明心空及第, 徹底無疑, 更無後事也.

Lingyuan Weiqing raised this gongan and said,[980] "To speak in such a way is really like cowering of one's own accord and using the self to ridicule others. Although this is the case, among the contrivances (建化門) this is the true expedient means. Why? A literatus who already has a seat in the jade hall (i.e., main palace) does not register for the civil examination, but those fellows who have yet to find their names on the golden billboard[981] must take the examination. This morning the great assembly has gathered here at the place for selecting buddhas. Each of you is to write an exam on the 'original' topic. If you wish to empty the mind and take first place, then you must meet the 'original endowment' examiner. If you meet the 'original endowment' examiner, then speak! What is your proof? If you undergo a transformation directly with one word, then you will be able to determine what is fish and what is dragon as quick as the sound of thunder."

靈源淸, 擧此話云, "恁麽說話, 大似自生退屈, 以己方[982]人. 雖然如是, 建化門中, 是眞方便. 何也? 已坐玉堂之士, 不在登科, 未升金牓之流, 要須入試. 大衆今朝, 同會選場, 各賦本來題目. 必欲心空及第, 須逢本分試官. 若逢本分試官, 且道, 以何爲驗? 直下一言通變化, 迅雷聲裏辨魚龍."

---

980 For this sermon, see also the *Xu guzunsu yuyao* (XZJ 118.870a17-b3).

981 The golden billboard (*jinbang* 金牓) was the billboard announcing the names of successful candidates who passed the civil service examination.

982 I follow the the *Xu guzunsu yuyao* and substitute *fang* 妨 for *fang* 方.

[Explanation]

Lingyuan: *Of one's own accord … ridicule others*: this simply points out the emptiness of mind. The meaning of the rest of the sermon is the same as Tiantong's above.

If you undergo a transformation directly etcetera: this speaks of its lively function (活用)

靈源: 自生至方人者, 但指出心空也. 下大義, 天童上堂同也. 直下一言云云者, 言其活用也.

Yuanwu Keqin raised this gongan and said, "A great man is equipped with determination, passion, ambition, and vital energy. He is noble and full of heroic spirit. He tramples on the phantom city[983] and makes the truth his own (承當) on the spot. Externally he does not hold the view that there are all these realms. Internally, he does not hold the view that there is a self. Above, he does not hold the view there are all the sages. Below, he does not hold the view that there are ordinary beings or fools. He is bare-nakedly pure and immaculately exposed. Not a single thought arises. The bottom of the bucket has fallen out. How could this not be the emptiness of the mind? Arriving here, would a blow or the shout still be allowed? Would the mysterious sublime or nature of principle still be allowed? Would self and other or right and wrong still be allowed? If you directly become just like a snowflake on a burning stove, how could you not be the one who stands out in the place for selecting buddhas? Even if this is the case, examine yourself carefully and (notice that) you are still involved in taking gradual steps. Then how is one to say the one phrase that is not involved in taking gradual steps? Do you get it? The thousand sages do not remain and do not leave behind traces. In a gathering of ten-thousand people it snatches away the highest

983 For the parable of the phantom city, see the *Lotus Sūtra* (T 262.9.22a18–27b8); and also Burton Watson trans., *The Lotus Sutra* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1993), pp. 117–142.

mark."[984]

Again, there was a verse that reads,

While dwelling in the mountain the only important thing is to get along with the assembly.

To be thoroughly clear inside and out, you must be orderly.

A pot with a broken leg is fortunately not unsalvageable.

Relying on one another, they guide each other.[985]

圜悟勤, 擧此話云, "大丈夫, 具決烈志氣, 慷慨英靈, 踏破化城, 直截承當. 外不見有一切境界, 內不見有自己, 上不見有諸聖, 下不見有凡愚. 淨躶躶赤洒洒, 一念不生, 桶底剔脫, 豈不是心空! 到箇裏, 還容棒喝麼? 還容玄妙理性麼? 還容彼我是非麼? 直下如紅爐上, 一點雪相似, 豈不是選佛場中, 擎頭戴角! 雖然如是, 子細檢點將來, 猶涉堦梯. 且不涉堦梯一句, 作麼生道? 還委悉麼? 千聖下留無朕迹, 萬人叢裏奪高標." 復有頌云, "住山只貴衆和諧, 表裏通明應整齊. 折脚鐺[986]兒幸無恙, 相憑出手共提携."

[Explanation]

Yuanwu: *A great man … the one who stands out in the place for selecting buddhas*: this makes clear the intent behind emptying the mind and taking first place.

The thousand sages do not remain … the highest mark: beyond going beyond there is yet another critical move.

While dwelling in the mountain … they guide each other: the method used to care for others. The verses by Tiantong and Lingyuan above first restrain and then later promote; here, Yuanwu first promotes and then later restrains and thereby manifests his own intent.

圜悟: 大丈夫至頭戴角者, 明心空及第之意. 千聖不留至高標者, 向上更有一著

984 See *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.749a4–13).

985 See *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.749a13–15).

986 The *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* has *lan* 濫 for *cheng* 鐺. But I follow the *Seonmun yeomsong* version.

也. 住山至提携者, 爲人手段也. 前天童靈源, 先抑而後揚, 此先揚而後抑, 以現己意.

Songyuan Chongyue ascended the hall, raised this gongan, let out a shout, and said,[987] "There was still this. In my assembly monks have gathered from the ten directions, but everyone is going about as usual. When you're cold you surround the furnace facing the fire and when hot each of you avail yourself of the shade. This can be compared to saying the world in a jar is eternal."[988] He (then) let out a shout.

松源, 上堂, 擧此話, 喝一喝云, "猶有這箇在. 薦福門下, 十方同聚會, 一切卽尋常. 寒則圍爐向火, 熱則各自乘凉, 信道壺中日月長." 喝一喝.

[Explanation]

Songyuan: *The world in a jar is eternal*: this too is an otherworldly universe.

The first shout: shouting down Pang.

The second shout: seeing the place of one's own intent.

Everyone is going about as usual … avail yourself of the shade: no birth is birth.

松源: 壺中日月長者, 亦是別乾坤也. 前一喝, 喝破龎公;後一喝, 見己意處也. 一切卽至乘凉者, 無生卽生也.

Mi'an Xianjie raised the phrase, *From ten directions they gather together*. The master said,[989] "Iron walls and silver mountains." For "Each learn

987 For this sermon, see also the *Songyuan Chongyue chanshi yulu* 松源崇嶽禪師語錄 (XZJ 121.590a5–7).

988 For the story of the world in a jar, see *Hou Han shu* 112 下, 15. See also Robert F. Campany, *To Live as Long as Heaven and Earth: A Translation and Study of Ge Hong's Traditions of Divine Transcendence* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002), pp. 161–168.

989 For this sermon, see also the *Mi'an heshang yulu* 密菴和尚語錄 (T 1999.47.959b16–21).

effortless action" the master said, "The sun and moon shine down on us." For *This is the place for selecting buddhas,* the master said, "Dragons and snakes are mixed up." For *Empty the mind, take first place, and return home,* the master said, "Ordinary beings and sages live together." Suddenly, he picked up the staff, held it horizontally, and said, "Layman Pang is sitting right here, have you seen him yet?" He then tossed the staff aside and said, "It'll take you three rebirths and sixty kalpas."[990]

密庵咸傑, 擧十方同聚會, 師云, "鐵壁銀山." 箇箇學無爲, 師云, "日月照臨." 此是選佛場, 師云, "龍蛇混雜." 心空及第歸, 師云, "凡聖同居." 驀拈拄杖橫按云, "龐居士, 在這裏坐地, 是汝諸人, 還見麽?" 遂擲下拄杖云, "三生六十劫."

[Explanation]

Mi'an: The four-phrase capping phrase in all turns Pang's intent upside down. *Layman Pang is sitting right here* etcetera: a magnificent and clear-cut matter.

It'll take you three rebirths and sixty kalpas: if you understand it that way, then you are mistaken.

密庵: 四句著語, 皆飜却龐公意也. 龐居士在這裏云云者, 堂堂現成事也. 三生六十劫者, 伊麽會, 又却不是也.

990 Three rebirths and sixty kalpas refer to the time it takes for a śrāvaka to attain arhatship; see *Tiantai sijiao dayi* 天台八教大意 (T 1930.46.769c5–6).

Case 313.

The Layman and Washing Vegetables

居士洗菜

[Old case]

One day Danxia (Tianran) paid Layman Pang a visit when Pang was not home. Danxia saw Lingzhao washing vegetables and asked, "Is the layman out?" Lingzhao put the vegetables down in a basket, placed her hands together, and stood up. Again, he asked, "Is the layman out?" Lingzhao picked the basket up and walked away.[991] Danxia headed back. When the layman returned from his trip Lingzhao raised her previous encounter (with Danxia). The layman said, "Is Danxia here?" Lingzhao said, "He left." The layman said, "Applying red dirt to a milky (persimmon)."[992] [One book reads, "This bastard will bring our house style to ruin."]

龐居土, 一日不在, 丹霞來訪, 見靈照洗菜次問, "居士在否?" 照放下菜籃, 斂手而立. 又問, "居士在否?" 照提籃便行, 霞便廻. 士從外歸, 照擧似前話. 士云, "丹霞在麽?" 照云, "去也." 士云, "赤土塗牛妳." <一本云, "這寃家子, 喪我門風.">

[Explanation of the gongan]

Put the vegetables down in a basket, placed her hands together, and stood up: the layman's face has been shown.

---

991 A different version of this story can also be found in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.310c25–27).

992 Here, I take *niunai shi* 牛嬭柹 for *niunai* 牛妳. For this story, see also *Pang jushi yulu* (XZJ 120.56a13–17); *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.743a2–5); *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.169b4–7).

Again, he asked, "Is the layman out?": the (true) face that has been shown is not the layman's.

Picked the basket up and walked away: releasing it was dangerous and collecting it was quick.

Applying red dirt etcetera: the *Daguan bencao*[993] says, "The people of Chu apply red dirt to the small milky persimmon and sell it." This is to mock your own master.

One book reads, "This bastard will bring our school's style to ruin": the *Shanhai jing zhu* says, "From the shadow of the western mountain spring water gushes forth and in this water flows ocher [red dirt]. If you apply this to a cow, then there is no illness."[994] In other words, if you apply the red dirt to the cow's teats, then you can repel plague among cows and horses. Quanshi[995] said, "A person of great method[996] can go out without using the door.[997] With eyes all over her body, how could she see just through an opening? Picking the basket up and letting the basket go; activity and quietude do not transcend their original position. Emerging from the mountain and entering the mountain; there is not even a hair's breadth gap between self and other. The real and the provisional change places right in front of your face. Lingzhao and Danxia do not reveal their (true) face. Speak! Where do Danxia and Pang meet? If you seek understanding in that place/spiritual state where she lets go of the basket and places her hands together, then this is exactly the misrecognition of the slave as the master; if not, then this is like carrying your mother on your back and looking for her. 'It was just one night of rain that fell on the flowers, but the water that flows through the city is fragrant.'"[998]

---

993 For a brief description of the *Daguan bencao,* a pharmacopoeia, see the *Wenxian tongkao* 文獻通考 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 222, 12.

994 Source unknown.

995 The identity of Quanshi 泉石 is unclear.

996 A man of great method (*dafang zhi jia* 大方之家), see Watson, *Complete Works of Chuang-tzu,* p. 175.

997 *Analects* 11.17.

998 This last quote seems to be a common quote in Chan sayings; for instance, see *Jiatai pudeng lu*

放下至立者, 居士面目呈似也. 又問至否者, 呈似地, 不是居士也. 提籃便行者, 放去大危, 收來大速也. 赤土云云者, 大觀本草云, "牛嫲小柿, 楚人以赤土塗之, 賣也." 則謔你老爺. 一本云, "這寃家子, 喪我門風." 則山海經注云, "西山之陰, 灌水出焉, 水中有流赭<赤土> 以塗牛焉, 則無疾." 則赤土塗牛嫲, 以攘牛馬之灾疾. 泉石云, "大方之家, 出不由戶. 通身之眼, 見豈窺觀! 提籃放籃兮, 動靜不離於本位;出山入山兮, 自他不隔於毫端. 正偏覿面回互處, 靈照丹霞不露顏. 且道! 那裏是丹霞龐公相見處? 若向放籃歛手處會, 正是認奴作郎;不伊麽, 還是背孃尋娘. 只因一夜落花雨, 贏得滿城流水香."

Zhihai Zhiqing's[999] verse

The old buddha Danxia Tianran,
The *saindhava* Lingzhao,[1000]
Suddenly they meet on the road,
The dragon cries and the tiger roars.
Yunju[1001] only praises placing the hands together,
Wuwei[1002] only praises letting the basket go,
There is also Pang who talks in his sleep,
In the end who will know each other well?

> 智海清頌, "古佛天然, 仙陁靈照! 驀路相逢, 龍吟虎嘯. 雲居只稱歛手, 無爲唯讃放籃. 更有龎公寱語, 畢竟誰人相諳."

(XZJ 137.117a4 and 258a3); *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.299a3); *Wudeng huiyuan* (XZJ 138.551b5) etc.

999 For Zhihai or Foyin Zhiqing, see note 612 above.

1000 A *saindhava* is someone who knows the price of salt, horses, etcetera. Here, this term is being used as a way to indicate Lingzhao's skillful use of *Chan* means.

1001 Yunju here is probably a pun referring to Zhiqing's teacher Yunju Yuanyou and also someone who "dwells in the clouds" (*yunju* 雲居).

1002 As in the case of Yunju, this is probably a pun, but it is unclear who Wuwei is.

[Explanation]

Zhihai:Yunju and Wuwei: unknown.

There is also Pang talking in his sleep: applying red dirt to a milky (persimmon). The grand intent is to say that nothing is allowed.

智海: 雲居無爲, 未詳. 更有龐公寐語者, 赤土塗牛妳也. 大意, 皆不放過也.

Again his verse

Placing the hands together, carrying the basket, and when they meet,
Heading back and returning home what else is there to doubt?
The house style is defeated and what we have are muddled and idle affairs,
Danxia's skill in going beyond is lost.

> 又頌, "斂手携籃相見時, 迴來歸去又何疑? 家風喪却渾閑事, 輸了丹霞向上機."

[Explanation]

Again his verse: The grand intent (of the verse) is to say that when he first asked whether or not the layman was home the meaning (of this question) is absolutely limitless.

又頌: 大意, 初問居士在否, 是其意直得無限也.

Zhaxi Riyi's verse

They reveal their heads and reveal their faces and then banter with each other,
They are used to appearing before others and are not shy,
The woman has good skin and bones,
She is stylish even without rouge and powder,

Well-groomed boy, well-groomed boy!
A perfect fit for a family of good-standing,
How pitiful! Red dirt is applied to the milky persimmon,
Tiles are shattered and tortoise shells are cracked but the divinations are illegible.

> 雪溪益頌, "露頭露面便相酬, 慣出人前不怕羞. 自是奴奴肌骨好, 不施紅粉也風流. 白面郎, 白面郎! 從來門戶恰相當. 可憐赤土塗牛嬭, 打瓦鑚龜亂度量."

[Explanation]

Zhaxi: The first two lines: he knew no shame in picking up and letting go of the basket.

The next two lines: what use was there in Pang saying "this bastard"?

雪溪: 上二句, 提籃放籃, 不識羞恥也. 下二句, 龎公何用道箇寃家子.

Chongsheng Yuangong's verse

The girl (Lingzhao) is asked twice but not a word,
How wonderful! She lets it go, picks it up, and walks away.
The boy's (Danxia) generosity has always been insignificant,
If you apply (red) dirt to a milky (persimmon) when will it appear ripe?

> 崇勝珙頌, "兩問丫娘不作聲, 奇哉放下復提行. 男兒慷慨從來少, 牛嬭土塗何日平?"

Dawei Mutie added a comment, "Of all people! Danxia! Scrutinized by the layman's daughter.[1003] At that time, were I Danxia, I would have simply laughed out loud—Ha! Ha!—and waited for her to ask, 'Dear abbot, why do

1003 For this part of the comment, see also the *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.743a6).

you laugh?' I would have then told her, 'Had we not been enemies, we would not have met.' "[1004]

大潙喆拈, "大小丹霞! 被居土女子勘破. 山僧當時, 若作丹霞, 但與呵呵大笑, 待他問, '長老, 笑个什麽?' 却向道, '不是寃家不聚頭.' "

[Explanation]

Dawei: *Laughed out loud—Ha! Ha!*: when she lets go of the basket—this revealed fact is precisely it.

When Danxia again asked, "Is the layman out?": this is where she saw right through him.

Had we not been enemies, we would not have met: there is no second option behind the state where she let the basket go.

The layman's daughter is the daughter of layman (Pang).

大潙: 呵呵大笑者, 放下籃子時, 只是這箇消息也. 丹霞又問, 居士在否, 是被勘破處也. 不是寃家不聚頭者, 放籃處, 更無第二也. 居士女子者, 居士之女子也.

Fazhen Shouyi added a comment, "The girl Lingzhao at first did well, but a child like that would not have been born had it not been a father like him. She later missed. This is just like having the head of a dragon but the tail of a snake. The layman said, 'Is Danxia here?' All she did was place her hands together, approach, and greet him. How could this not be a person who surpasses her predecessors and descendents? If she were not like this, then the layman, too, is like a fierce tiger who does not eat its own cubs.[1005] If you examine her carefully, Lingzhao also most certainly deserves a good blow of

---

1004 For Dawei Mutie's comment, see also *Chanlin leiju* (XZJ 117.220a6–8). This last quote is also found in the *Baiyun Shouduan chanshi guanglu* 白雲守端禪師廣錄 (XZJ 120.423b16–17); and also the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.822a10).

1005 Fazhen Shouyi is probably paraphrasing Xuedou Chongxian here; see *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.690b20–21 and 694a24–25).

the bamboo rod."

法眞一拈, "靈照女子, 前來却得, 蓋非是父, 不生其子. 後底打不着, 大似龍頭虵尾. 居士云, '丹霞在麼?' 但歛手近前相挹,[1006]豈不是絶後光前! 彼旣不然, 居士亦猛虎不食其子. 若點檢將來, 靈照也好與一頓笊籬柄, 始得."

[Explanation]

Fazhen: *At first did well*: she demonstrated the state of letting the basket go with all her might.

If she were not like this: when the layman did not give her a blow of the bamboo rod this is like a fierce tiger not eating her cubs.

法眞: 前來却得者, 放下籃子處, 盡力呈似也. 彼旣不然, 居士不與一頓笊籬柄, 是猛虎不食其子也.

1006 I substitute *yi* 揖 for *yi* 挹.

Case 321.

Danxia Sets the Buddha Ablaze

丹霞燒佛

[Old case]

Danxia (Tianran), while passing through Huilin Monastery, happened to be freezing cold, so he took the wooden Buddha that he saw in the hall and set it ablaze. The cloister chief happened to see this and berated him, saying, "Why are you setting our wooden Buddha ablaze?" The master poked around in the ashes with his staff and said, "I set it ablaze to get relics." The cloister chief said, "How could a wooden Buddha have relics?" The master said, "If there are no relics, then please take the two flanking icons and also set them ablaze." The cloister chief later lost his eyebrows and beard.[1007]

丹霞, 因過慧林寺, 值凝寒, 遂於殿中見木佛, 乃取燒火. 院主偶見呵責曰, "何得燒我木佛!" 師以杖子撥灰云, "吾燒取舍利." 主曰, "木佛何有舍利!" 師云, "旣無舍利, 更請兩尊再取燒之." 主自後眉鬚墮落.

[Explanation of the gongan]

Set the wooden Buddha ablaze: a lofty and superior perspective.

The cloister chief happened to see this and berated him, saying, "Why are you

[1007] See *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.310c13–16); *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.742a16–b1); *Wudeng huiyuan* (XZJ 138.166b18–167a3). For more on Danxia and his evolving biography, see Jia, *The Hongzhou School of Chan Buddhism,* pp. 26–28. See also the discussion of this story in John Kieschnick, *The Impact of Buddhism on Chinese Material Culture* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003), p. 76.

setting our wooden Buddha ablaze?": because he slandered the great (perfection of) wisdom his eyebrows and beard fell off.

Baiyun Zhibing said, "Believable and reliable. It is the cloister chief who behaves like a different kind of person!"[1008]: although he is a dead snake, play around with it and it will come back to life.[1009]

燒木佛者, 高勝眼目也. 院主偶見呵責曰, 何得燒我木佛云云者, 謗大般若故, 眉鬚墮落也. 白雲昺云, 可信可憑, 院主却行異類者, 雖是死蚍, 解弄却活.

Touzi Yiqing's verse[1010]

The old cliff is full of moss and the cold invades through the door panel,
Things that fly are startled and things that run are confused,
The night deepens and grows cold and a fire burns on an islet in a stream,
The fisherman who slept in is frantic with self-doubt.

> 投子青頌,"古嵓苔閉冷侵扉, 飛者驚危走者迷. 夜深寒爇汀洲火, 失曉漁家忙自疑."

[Explanation]

Touzi … *The fisherman who slept in is frantic with self-doubt*: this is the cloister chief.

投子云云, 失曉漁家者, 院主也.

Kunshan Huiyuan's verse

Carefully contemplating the Buddha's transformation bodies,

1008 Source unknown.

1009 Cf. *Yuanwu Keqin chanshi xinyao* (XZJ 120.766a17–18).

1010 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.168b17–18).

Its numbers are as many as fine dust,
Having not yet understood the falsehood of truth,
The disciple cultivates the cause of the stages of realization,
Although he knows what to place on top of the jeweled table,
And is also aware of how to untie the decorative headdress,
He may still with old man Danxia,
Sort of become neighbors.

崑山元頌, "諦觀化佛身, 其數若微塵. 未了眞時僞, 徒修果地因. 雖知凭寶机, 更悟解花巾, 堪與丹霞老, 依俙作近隣."

[Explanation]

Kunshan: The first two lines: if transformation bodies of the Buddha are like this, then how much more so for a wooden Buddha?

The next two lines: Because he has not yet understood the falsehood of truth the disciple cultivates the cause of the stages of realization.

The next two lines: the jeweled table and the decorative headdress are all adornments on the recompense and transformation bodies. Although you know how respectable the recompense body is and is also aware of what to place on top of the jeweled table and how to undo the decorative crown, you must know that there is a Dharma body. At this point, you may become neighbors with Danxia.

崑山: 上二句, 化佛如此, 況木佛乎! 次二句, 未了眞時之僞故, 徒修果地因也. 次二句, 寶机花巾, 皆報化之莊嚴也. 雖知報身尊貴, 凭寶机著花冠, 更悟去寶机解花冠, 須知有法身, 始得. 到伊麼時, 堪與丹霞作隣也.

Chongsheng Yuangong's verse

Danxia lit a flame on a wooden Buddha,
The cloister chief immersed his head in a bowl of resin,
The funeral falls on the house to the east but they wail at the house to the west,

A rain shower falls on the southern peak and twilight at the northern peak,
Clouds and smoke clear away and the moon (appears before) each and every house,
Frost and snow melt away and spring arrives everywhere,
Everyone says there is nothing to do when you see him face to face,
He does not come and still you think of the lord, who knew?

崇勝珙頌, "丹霞木佛火初焚, 院主剃頭入膠盆. 東舍暴喪西舍哭, 南山驟雨北山昏. 煙雲散去家家月, 霜雪消來處處春. 盡道相見猶無事, 誰知不來還憶君."

Yuwang Jiechen's verse

All the buddhas of the ten directions emit an illumination,
Not a single strand from his eyebrows or beard left on the cloister chief,
Picking it up equally (in each hand) to whom do you wish to present it?
(Will you present it) even if the patch-robed monks fight over it?

育王諶頌, "十方諸佛放光明, 院主眉鬚無一莖. 平等拈來欲誰與? 從教衲子競頭爭."

Xinwen Tanfen's verse

The village cloister has no firewood so they chop the Buddha and set him ablaze,
Without reason the hair on your brow falls off of its own accord,
Late at night you are able to avoid the freezing cold,
You've already seen the height of the strategies of your entire life.

心聞賁頌, "村院無柴劈佛燒, 無端汝自落眉毛. 夜深免得遭寒凍, 已見平生作略高."

Cihang Liaopo's verse

The western wind blows over the Wei River,[1011]
Chang'an is full of dead leaves,
If not a sympathetic friend,
The disciple will frivolously complain about the cold season.[1012]

慈航朴頌, "西風吹渭水, 落葉滿長安. 不是知音者, 徒勞話歲寒."

Layman Wujin's verse

The snow gathers around the mouth of the cave on the cliff and the ice does not melt,
A wooden Buddha was chopped and made into firewood,
How pitiful! The cloister chief's eyebrows fell off,
The people in your house were burned to death.[1013]

無盡居士頌, "雪擁巖扉凍不春, 一尊木佛劈爲薪. 可憐院主眉毛落, 燒殺儂家屋裏人."

1011 The western wind refers to the autumn winds. The Wei River 渭水 is one of the largest tributaries of the Yellow River that originates in Gansu province.

1012 These last two lines are commonly used in Chan texts; for instance, see *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.287a6); *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.699a16–17); *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.208a9); *Chanlin sengbao zhuan* 禪林僧寶傳 (XZJ 137.551a6); and *Wudeng huiyuan* (XZJ 138.713a14).

1013 There is a different version of this verse in the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.169a1–2):

The snow gathers around the mouth of the cave
on the cliff and the ice does not melt,
A wooden Buddha was chopped and made into firewood,
Where the eyes move eyebrows fell off,
One will slander the Tathāgata
and the wheel of the true dharma.

雪擁嵓扉凍不春 一尊木佛劈爲薪 眼睛動處眉毛落 爲謗如來正法輪

Baoning Faxiu added a comment, "In that case, within principle there is no loud voice. If you examine carefully, this is just like making effort and having no success.[1014] Do you understand? Behind injustice there is a perpetrator and behind debt there is a debtor."

保寧秀拈, "然則有理不在高聲, 若也子細點撿將來, 大似勞而無功. 還會麼? 寃有頭債有主."

[Explanation]

Baoning: *Within principle there is no loud voice*: the cloister chief said, *Why are you setting our wooden Buddha ablaze?*

Making effort and having no success: eyebrows and beard fall off.

Behind injustice etcetera: the cloister chief is standing on firm ground.

保寧: 有理不在高聲者, 院主云, 何得燒我木佛也. 勞而無功者, 眉鬚墮落也. 寃有頭云云者, 院主有立處也.

Tiantong Zhengjue, to celebrate the starting up of the furnace,[1015] ascended the hall.[1016] A monk asked, "Danxia set the wooden Buddha ablaze. What was his intent?" The master said, "When the weather is cold go to the fire, wrap yourself with a fine fur blanket, and sit tight." The monk said, "The night is cold and growing colder, we'll have to burn another icon." The master said, "You should take good care of your eyebrows." The monk said, "When the whole body is burnt crisp only then will he be a sympathetic friend." The master said, "Because of this idle matter ignorance continues." The monk said, "Anyway, why did the cloister chief lose this eyebrows and beard?" The master said, "His sickness is the same as the chief seat's." The monk said, "Not

1014 "Making effort and having no success" is a quote from the *Zhuangzi*; see Watson, *Complete Works of Chuang Tzu,* p. 160.

1015 This is performed on the first day of the tenth month when the furnace is lit to prepare for the winter, see *Chanyuan qinggui* 禪苑清規 (XZJ111.898b16).

1016 For this sermon, see also the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T48.2001.49b2–13).

understanding how to play the role of guest troubles the host." The master said, "It has to be the methods of a man who shows his true form." He then said, "The wind and rain on the first day of the tenth month announces Heaven's will to start the cold. The earth-pit furnace for the Chan grove was started up today and we do not have time to deliberate over setting the Buddha ablaze. Great assembly! Danxia did not have time to deliberate, but why did the cloister chief not have time to deliberate?" The master again said, "I should stop here but I can't help but add a footnote for all of you. Danxia takes a mistake to deal with a mistake and the cloister chief's eyebrows and beard fell off. It's as if they're deaf and blind. The great old men annoy you to death, but do not think them evil."

天童覺, 開爐上堂, 僧問, "丹霞燒木佛, 意旨如何?" 師云, "天寒宜向火, 擁毳任堆堆." 僧云, "夜冷更深, 更爇一軀去也." 師云, "也須照管眉毛, 始得." 僧云, "通身紅爛去, 方始是知音." 師云, "爲他閑事長無明." 僧云, "只如院主, 爲什麽眉鬚墮落?" 師云, "也與上座病痛一般." 僧云, "不解作客, 煩勞主人." 師云, "還他本色漢手段, 始得." 乃云, "十月朔風雨, 肇寒天意, 作叢席地爐, 今日開, 免燒木佛無斟酌. 大衆, 丹霞無斟酌, 何似院主無斟酌?" 師復云, "本合便恁麽休却, 天童忍俊不禁, 爲你諸人, 下个注脚. 丹霞將錯就錯, 院主眉鬚墮落, 如聾如盲. 大家翁, 攪擾殺你, 不要惡."

[Explanation]

Tiantong: *When the weather is cold … sit tight*: this is a normal affair and nothing particularly special.

The night is cold etcetera: if this is the case, another icon will be set ablaze.

You should take good care etcetera: if you consistently do this, then you will not able to avoid losing your eyebrows and beard.

When the whole body is burnt crisp etcetera: the whole body must be burnt crisp. In other words, the destruction of the form body must be like this.

Because of this idle matter etcetera: this means he did it again.

His sickness is the same as the chief seat's: he only knew that the form body is to be burnt crisp and did not know that the form body is firm.

Not understanding … the host: the cloister chief got roped in and lost his

eyebrows and beard.

It has to be the methods of a man who shows his true form: host and guest must both be equipped with true form.

Danxia did not have time to deliberate: he simply sets the wooden Buddha ablaze and did not have time to deliberate.

The cloister chief not have time to deliberate: he asked, "Why are you setting our wooden Buddha ablaze," but did not have time to deliberate.

Danxia takes a mistake to deal with a mistake: since neither had time to deliberate how could he be deaf or blind?

The great old man etcetera: one must not think Danxia did something evil.

天童: 天寒至堆堆者, 也是常事, 別無特地也. 夜冷云云者, 若伊麽, 一軀亦燒却也. 也須照管云云者, 一向伊麽, 又未免眉鬚墮落也. 通身紅爛云云者, 也須通身紅爛, 謂色身破壞, 須是伊麽, 始得. 爲他云云者, 又向伊麽去也. 也與至一般者, 只知色身紅爛, 不知色身堅固也. 不解至主人者, 累他院主眉鬚墮落也. 還他本色云云者, 主客俱是本色, 始得. 丹霞無斟酌者, 只燒木佛無斟酌也. 院主無斟酌者, 何得燒我木佛, 無斟酌也. 丹霞將錯至墮落者, 俱是無酙酌故, 爭似如聾如盲! 大家翁云云者, 不要丹霞攪擾作惡也.

Baoning Renyong ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and said,[1017] "Great assembly! I'll leave the cloister chief losing his eyebrows and beard alone. Speak! Does Danxia have his eyebrows or not? If you see them, then you'll join the ranks of the old buddhas. If you don't see them, then you must not deny causality.[1018] Later, a monk asked Reverend Tianzhu,[1019] "What was Danxia's intent in setting the wooden Buddha ablaze?" Tianzhu said, "If you're cold surround the furnace and face the warm fire. If you're warm sit by

1017 For this sermon, see also the *Baoning Renyong chanshi yulu* (XZJ 120.351a11–17).

1018 For the problem of denying causality, see the *Abhidharmakoṣa* (T 1558.29.89a2–5).

1019 This is Tianzhu Ziyi 天竺子儀 (d. 986) also known as Great master Xinyin Shuiyue 心印水月大師. He is a dharma heir of Xuefeng Yicun's disciple Gushan Shenyan 鼓山神晏 (d.u.). Tianzhi Ziyi served as abbot on Mt. Tianzhu in Hangzhou.

creek in a bamboo forest."[1020] Today I do not have a wooden Buddha to set ablaze with all of you. In the hall there is a fire that produces no smoke and burns by itself. If you want to face it, then face it. If you want to push it aside, then push it aside. Speak! Is this consistent or inconsistent with (the intent) of the ancients? He thereupon said, "In the upper half of the hall there are many monks; in the lower half of the hall there are few monks."

保寧勇, 上堂, 擧此話云, "大衆, 院主眉鬚墮落, 即且置. 且道! 丹霞眉毛在也無? 若也見得, 與古佛同叅;若也不見, 切忌撥無因果. 後有僧問天竺和尙, '丹霞燒木佛意旨, 如何?' 笁云, '寒即圍爐向煖火, 熱即竹林溪畔坐.' 保寧, 如今, 也無木佛, 與諸人燒, 堂中自有無煙火. 要向即向, 要撥即撥. 且道! 與古人, 是同是別?" 乃云, "上閒僧多, 下閒僧少."

[Explanation]

Baoning: *Does Danxia have his eyebrows or not*: Danxia is not immune.

If you're cold surround the furnace and face the fire: Danxia setting the wooden Buddha ablaze is a normal affair and nothing special.

Today I do not have etcetera: Danxia and Tianzhu are not the same.

In the upper half of the hall there are many monks etcetera: Danxia and Tianzhu's state is precisely this.

保寧: 丹霞眉毛在也無者, 丹霞亦未免也. 寒則圍爐向火云云者, 丹霞燒木佛, 也是常事, 別無特地也. 保寧如今云云者, 丹霞與天笁不同也. 上間僧多云云者, 丹霞天笁地即是也.

Zhenjing Kewen ascended the hall and said,[1021] "Danxia set the wooden Buddha ablaze and the cloister chief lost his eyebrows and beard. Again, the teaching says, 'I have not yet seen the self make (karma) and the other reap it

1020 See also *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.687a12–13).

1021 For this sermon, see also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.716a4–8).

or the other make it and the self reap it.'[1022] If so, then the Chan gate and the Teaching vehicle are equals but different. Therefore, it may have been Danxia who set the wooden Buddha ablaze but it was the monk next to him that fell victim to the calamity. What ever is the principle behind this? Is there anyone who will clarify this? After a pause he said, "If there is no one, then there is only chief seat Cheng who is profoundly clear about this principle. I hope all of you high virtuosos visit him day and night and knock it out of him. Follow it and make sense of it."

眞淨文, 上堂云, "丹霞燒木佛, 院主眉鬚落. 又教中云, '未見自作他受, 他作自受.' 若爾則禪門與敎乘, 敵體相違. 故丹霞自燒木佛, 傍僧受殃. 未審此理如何? 莫有人明得麼?" 良久云, "若無人, 唯澄公首座, 深明此理, 希諸高德, 旦暮親而扣之, 就而明之."

[Explanation]

Zhenjing: The cloister chief says Danxia is slandering the Buddha. But how could this not be a case of reaping what you sow? You have to understand Danxia's intent.

眞淨: 院主謂丹霞謗佛, 豈不是自作自受, 直須會取丹霞意, 始得.

Again he ascended the hall and raised,[1023] "Danxia set the wooden Buddha ablaze and the cloister chief lost his eyebrows and beard." The master suddenly picked up the staff and said, "Is this not a wooden Buddha?" He immediately tossed it aside and said, "Who dares set it ablaze? If you hesitate, then your eyebrows and beard will fall off. If you don't hesitate, what then?" He then called for the attendant in a loud voice, picked up the staff, and stepped down from the seat.

1022 See *Abhidharmavibhāṣā* (T 1545.27,76b24–c14).

1023 For this sermon, see also the *Zongjian falin* 宗鑑法林 (XZJ 116.710a8–10).

又上堂, 擧丹霞燒木佛, 院主眉鬚落, 師驀拈拄杖云, "不是木佛!" 便擲下云, "誰敢燒? 你擬卽眉鬚墮落, 不擬又且如何?" 遂高聲叫行者, 拈起拄杖, 下座.

[Explanation]

Again he ascended the hall: *Picked up the staff* etcetera: he grabbed it and immediately used it.

Who dares set it ablaze?: the more you try to set it ablaze the more it doesn't work.

If you hesitate then your eyebrows and beard will fall off: if you hesitate and consider, then in what kalpa will you attain awakening?

If you don't hesitate, what then?: if you don't consider carefully then eventually it will be crass. You must neither ignore nor confront it.[1024]

Picked up the staff: it is just called a staff.

又上: 拈柱杖云云者, 把得便用也. 誰敢燒者, 燒也燒伊不著也. 擬則眉鬚墮落者, 擬思量何劫悟. 不擬又且如何者, 不思量終莽鹵. 須是離却背觸. 拈起柱杖者, 但喚作柱杖也.

Changlu Zongze during an informal sermon raised, "An official asked Zhaozhou, 'When Danxia set the wooden Buddha ablaze, why did the cloister chief lose his eyebrows and beard?' Zhaozhou said, 'Who in the official's house turns the raw into the cooked?' The official said, 'The house servant.' Zhaozhou said, 'It would be him who would know.' "[1025] "Everyone! Danxia set the wooden Buddha ablaze because the weather was cold and the cloister chief lost his eyebrows and beard (because) those with a coarse mind lose them. Zhaozhou's insight (on this gongan) is thoroughly the (kind) mind of an old lady. If someone were to suddenly ask me, 'Danxia set the

1024 See also *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.513b2).

1025 *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.308a18-b2). There is a minor difference between the version that we have above and the version in the *Guzunsu yulu*. In the latter, Zhaozhou's last reply is given as "It is he who is the skilled hand" (*que shi ta haoshou* 却是他好手).

wooden Buddha ablaze, so why is it that the cloister chief lost his eyebrows and beard?,' I would simply tell him, 'It cannot be without reason.' Patch-robed monks with eyes should carefully examine this."

長蘆賾, 小叅, 擧, 官人問趙州, '丹霞燒木佛, 院主爲甚眉鬚墮落?' 州云, '官人宅中, 甚麽人變生造熟?' 官人云, '所使.' 州云, '是他却會.' "諸仁者, 丹霞燒木佛, 蓋爲天寒, 院主眉鬚墮落, 心麁者失. 趙州見處, 徹底老婆心. 忽有人問山僧, '丹霞燒木佛, 爲什麽院主眉鬚墮落?' 只向他道, '必不空然.' 具眼衲僧, 子細點檢."

[Explanation]

Changlu: *Zhaozhou said, "It would be him who would know"*: there is nothing special about this. It is like daily function. If the kindness of Zhaozhou's old lady-like mind produces a different understanding, then it will be lost to those with a coarse mind.

It cannot be without reason: if you're attached to causality, then causality is not empty.

長蘆: 州云是他却會者, 別無特地, 日用如是. 趙州老婆心切, 別生異解, 心麁者失也. 必不空然者, 若執因果, 因果不空也.

Baiyun Zhibing added a comment, "Difficult to comprehend and difficult to discuss. The state where Danxia stands is remote. Believable and reliable! But it is the cloister chief who walks the path of a different life form![1026] There are average fellows whose opinions do transcend external influences and whose eyes can't tell east and west apart. But they say that the cloister chief saying, *How could a wooden Buddha have relics,* itself ended up slandering the Buddha. Therefore his eyebrows and beard fell off. How could you not know? Your own life is in the hands of others. Do you get it? 'If you

1026 Alternative manifestation (*yilei* 異類) refers to a bodhisattva who manifests him or herself not in some transcendent realm (say, buddhahood) but rather in *saṃsāra* in the form of a living being.

don't understand how to play the role of guest, then you trouble the host.'"[1027]

白雲昺拈, "難思難議, 丹霞立處孤危!;可信可憑, 院主却行異類! 有般漢, 見解未超影響, 眼目不辨東西, 便道, '院主云,「木佛豈有舍利!」却成謗佛, 所以眉鬚墮落.' 殊不知, 自己性命, 已在別人手裏了也. 還委悉麼? 不會作客, 勞煩主人."

[Explanation]

Baiyun: *The state where Danxia stands is remote*: not a single mote of dust is allowed in the realm of the reality limit as principle.[1028] If you make the calculation of loss and gain, then *your own life is in the hands of others.*

If you don't understand how to play the role of guest etcetera: Danxia roped in the cloister chief, but he ended up slandering the Buddha and therefore fell victim to this calamity.

白雲: 立處孤危者, 實際理地, 不受一塵也. 可信可憑者, 佛事門中, 不舍一法也. 若也得失商量, 自己性命在別人手裏也. 不會作客云云者, 丹霞累他院主, 反成謗佛, 以受其殃也.

1027 This last line is a common quote, but its origin is unclear; see *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.675b12); *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* (XZJ 135.888a16–17); *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.244a12); and *Konggu ji* (XZJ 117.560b4–5).

1028 The realm of the reality limit as principle (*shiji lidi* 實際理地) is a realm of absolute purity and nonduality. In this realm or ultimate state there is no room for expedient means. For instance, see *Zongjing lu* (T 2016.48.553c29–554a1 and 720b11); *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.265a1–2, 369b17–18, 395a28–29) and *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* (XZJ 135.788b3 and 840b18–841a1).

Case 324.

Yaoshan's Three Vehicles

藥山三乘

[Old case]

Chan master Weiyan[1029] of Mt. Yao in Fengzhou asked Shitou (Xiqian), "I have a rough understanding of the three vehicles and the twelve divisions of the teaching, but I once heard of the southern teaching of directly pointing at the mind of people, seeing into one's own nature, and attaining buddhahood and do not truly comprehend it yet. I beseech your reverence to compassionately offer guidance." Shitou said, "It is so will not do and it is not so will not do. It is and it is not so – neither will do. What then?" The master immersed himself in deep thought. Shitou said, "You have no karmic connection here." In Jiangxi there is Great master Mazu (Daoyi), you should go to him. He will certainly explain it for you." The master went there and asked what he asked before. Mazu said, "On certain occasions I say, one must raise his eyebrows and blink his eyes. On other occasions I do not say, one must not raise his eyebrows and blink his eyes. To tell a student on certain occasions that he must raise his eyebrows and blink his eyes will do and to tell him on other occasions to raise his eyebrows and blink his eyes will not do." The master thereupon had an awakening and made obeisance. Mazu

---

1029 Yaoshan Weiyan 藥山惟儼 (745–828), we can observe in the following story, had studied under both Shitou Xiqian and Mazu Daoyi, but he later became a dharma heir of Shitou. Having served Shitou for thirteen years, Weiyan became the abbot on Mt. Yao 藥山 in Fengzhou 澧州, Hunan province. He posthumously received the title Great Master Hongdao 弘道大師.

said, "What truth have you seen?" The master said, "When I was at Shitou's it was as if I were a mosquito (trying to draw blood from) an iron ox." The master said, "You are indeed at such a state. Guard it well."[1030]

澧州藥山, 惟儼禪師問石頭, "三乘十二分教, 某甲粗知, 嘗聞南方直指人心, 見性成佛, 實未明了. 伏望和尚慈悲指示." 頭云, "恁麽也不得, 不恁麽也不得, 恁麽不恁麽摠不得. 汝作麽生?" 師佇思, 頭云, "子因緣不在此. 江西有馬大師, 子往彼去, 應爲子說." 師至彼, 准前請問. 馬祖云, "我, 有時, 教伊揚眉瞬目;有時, 不教伊揚眉瞬目. 有時, 教伊揚眉瞬目者, 是;有時, 教伊揚眉瞬目者, 不是." 師於是有省, 便禮拜. 祖曰, "子見箇什麽道理?" 師云, "某甲, 在石頭時, 如蚊子上鐵牛." 祖曰, "汝旣如是, 宜善護持."

[Explanation of the gongan]

Three vehicles and the twelve divisions of the teaching: this has been explained before.

It is so will not do and it is not so will not do. ¬It is and it is not so – neither will do. What then?: "Our teachings were transmitted by former buddhas. Regardless of meditative absorption and vigorous effort, they are simply the views of one who has attained buddhahood."[1031] It is like peeling off a fine lychee and placing it immediately in his mouth.[1032]

You have no karmic connection here: not only has the time for awakening the Way not arrived, but this is possible only if he sees Mazu.

On certain occasions I say, one must raise his eyebrows and blink his eyes: this is *It is so will do.*

On other occasions I do not say, one must raise his eyebrows and blink his eyes:

1030 For this story, see the *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 118.82a15–b5); and also *Chanlin leiju* (XZJ 117.137b10–138a1).

1031 These appear to be the words of Shitou Xiqian; see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.309b13–14).

1032 A similar analogy was also used by Dahui Zonggao to instruct his disciple Jinli 近禮 who hails from Fuzhou where lychees grow in abundance. Dahui told Jinli that helping him tackle a difficult gongan would be similar to cutting off a fine lychee with its shell intact and shoving it in his mouth; see *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.882a13–16).

this is *It is not so will do.*

To tell (a student) on certain occasions … will not do: has the aforementioned *On certain occasions I say … On other occasions I do not say …* been completely clarified? No. The meaning of this is *It is so and it is not so—both will do.* Mazu said, "Shitou runs a pure gold store, I myself run a junk store."[1033]

The master thereupon had an awakening and made obeisance: did this happen at a pure gold store or a junk store?

When I was at Shitou's it was as if I were a mosquito (trying to draw blood from) an iron ox: this does not mean that when Yaoshan was at Shitou's he could not attain awakening as if he were a mosquito (trying to draw blood from) an iron ox. Rather, only at this point was he able to attain awakening and realize that attaining the Way of Shitou is as difficult as a mosquito trying to insert his mouthpart into an iron ox.

You are indeed at such a state. Guard it well: Mazu's *It is so will do and it is not so will do. It is so and it is not so—both will do* is precisely what Shitou meant by *It is so will not do and it is not so will not so. It is so and it is not so—neither will do.*

三乘十二分教者, 已如前釋. 伊麼也不得云云者, 吾之法門, 先佛傳受, 不論禪定精進, 唯達佛之知見也. 如將名品荔枝, 和皮殼剝了, 一時送到他口邊子. 因緣不云云者, 非唯悟道時未至, 須是見馬祖, 始得. 我有時教伊至目者, 伊麼也得也; 有時不教至目者, 不伊麼也得也. 有時教伊云云者, 上云, '教伊云云不教云云之義' 全明也? 非也. 伊麼不伊麼, 摠得之義. 馬祖云, '石頭是純金鋪, 我這裏是雜貨鋪.' 於是有省便作禮者, 是雜貨鋪耶? 是純金鋪耶? 某甲在石頭云云者, 非是在石頭時, 悟不得, 如蚊子上鐵牛也. 於此方始悟得, 石頭道得, 如蚊子上鐵牛, 插觜不得. 汝旣如是云云者, 馬祖伊麼也得, 不伊麼也得, 伊麼不伊麼摠得, 卽是石頭伊麼也不得, 不伊麼也不得, 伊麼不伊麼摠不得也.

Changling Shouzhuo's verse[1034]

1033 For this saying, see note 796 above.

1034 For this verse, see also *Changling Shouzhuo chanshi yulu* (XZJ 120.325a17–18).

Chilly is the clear wind blows from all directions,
Mighty is he who straddles the iron ox,
For him the diamond eyes are opened,
The skull is squeezed open and he knows for himself.

長靈卓頌, "凜凜清風八面吹, 雄雄獨跨鐵牛兒. 爲公剔起金剛眼, 拶破髑髏應自知."

[Explanation]

Changling: The first line refers to Mazu's state. The second line refers to Yaoshan's state. As for the last two lines, "him" is Yaoshan, which means Mazu's state is like having diamond eyes. The skull refers to the previous misrecognition at Shitou's. Because he had an awakening here (at Mazu's) it is said that the skull was squeezed open.

長靈: 上句, 馬祖地也, 二句, 藥山地也. 下二句, 公則藥山, 謂馬祖地, 是金剛眼睛也. 髑髏則前石頭處錯認, 到此有省故, 是拶破髑髏也.

Yunmen Zonggao's verse

What a good basis for a gongan!
Who can raise it?
Raise it well,
And still it will not be received favorably.

雲門杲頌, "好个話端! 阿誰解擧? 擧得十分, 未敢相許.

[Explanation]

Yunmen: If this is how (the gongan) is understood everywhere, then it is not being comprehended well.

雲門: 諸方若伊麼會, 便不是了也.

Zhu'an Shigui's verse

The beacons of war are silent everywhere,
News from the central plains travels without difficulty,
Toss away the three-foot sword,
And stop toying with the longbow.
[This text, as in the case of Yunmen Zonggao's text, is only raising Shitou's words.]

> 竹庵珪頌, "四海狼煙靜, 中原信息通. 罷拈三尺劍, 休弄一張弓." <此錄, 與雲門杲錄, 但舉石頭語.>

[Explanation]

Zhu'an: This is how (the gongan) is understood everywhere and that will do.

竹庵: 諸方伊麽會, 方是也.

Xinwen Tanfen's verse

Harmonious is the warm air as if it were spring,
Suddenly, a wind stirs and again it becomes chilly,
How amusing! The white plum flower can withstand the cold,
For whom do you blossom and fall on the edge of the fence?
[This verse raises the story of raising the eyebrows and blinking the eyes.]

> 心聞賁頌, "融融和氣似春天, 驀忽風生又凜然. 堪笑玉梅能忍凍! 爲誰開落向籬邊?" <此舉揚眉瞬目因緣.>

[Explanation]

Xinwen: *Harmonious … becomes chilly*: what Mazu said is even more poisonous. The last two lines speak of Shitou.

心聞云云, 又凛然者, 馬祖伊麽道, 尤更毒害也. 下二句, 言石頭也.

Songyuan Chongyue's verse

Cutting away a path of a thousand peaks,
Pierce through the blue sky,
How could you be allowed to ask the ins and outs (of the Way),
The ins and outs are right before your skull.

> 松源頌, "坐[1035]斷千峯路, 穿開碧落天. 那容問端的! 端的髑髏前."

Wuweizi's verse

If nothing will do then there is no rhyme or reason,
How could an old bumpkin know that the world is vast?
Even if he counts up to eight, nine, and ten,
Home is still one double barrier away.

> 無爲子頌, "摠不得大無端, 野老焉知天地寬? 直饒數到八九十, 家山猶隔一重關."

Baoning Faxiu added a comment, "Shitou had a good iron mallet without a hole for the handle that could not be entrusted (to another).[1036] Although Yaoshan crossed the river and had an awakening, what could be done about his legs getting tangled up on level ground?[1037] How could one help him

1035 Here I take *cuo* 挫 for *zuo* 坐.

1036 For the iron mallet without a hole for the handle, see note 403 above.

1037 According to Dahui Zonggao, spreading words of attachment will cause one's legs to get tangled up on level ground; see *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.814a12).

up?[1038] I (Qixian) would not have done the same. It is so will do. It is not so will do. It is so and it is not so—both will do. (It is so) will do and (it is not so) will do and this (too) will do. Speak! Which 'will do' (*de* 得) will you use and try to discern for yourself?"

保寧秀拈,"石頭好个無孔鐵鎚, 大似分付不着. 藥山雖然過江悟去, 爭奈平地喫交, 有什麼扶策處! 栖[1039]賢卽不然. 與麼也得, 不與麼也得, 與麼不與麼摠得. 得得得. 且道! 使那个得字, 試爲辨看?"

[Explanation]

Baoning: *Shitou had a good iron hammer* … : Yaoshan only understood Shitou's words and not his intent.

Although Yaoshan crossed the river … : although he understood Mazu's words, he again did not understand Mazu's intent.

It is so will do … *both will do*: this is what Mazu meant when he said, "On certain occasions I say, one must … "

(It is so) will do and (it is not so) will do: the ins and outs of (the Way) are contained therein.

Which 'will do' will you use: this means using one of the three will dos is not a case of choosing (one over the other). It is to use each and every "will do."

保寧: 石頭好个云云者, 藥山只知石頭語, 不知其意故也. 雖然過江云云者, 雖會馬祖語, 又不會其意也. 伊麼至摠得者, 馬祖云, 我有時敎伊云云之義也. 得得者, 倶端的也. 使那箇得者, 謂於三得中, 使那箇得字非取捨也. 一一使得也.

Jiangshan Faquan ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and said, "Great assembly! Although Shitou had charisma, what could be done about his straightening out the crooked? If it were me (Nanchan) I would not have done the same. It is so will do. It is not so will do. It is so and it is not so will

[1038] For this part of Faxiu's comment, see also the *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.372a2–3).

[1039] I substitute *qi* 棲 for *qian* 栖.

both do. Everything is a single emptiness. What north, south, east, and west is there to discuss? Every year summer is hot and winter is cold. Everywhere the mountains are lush and the water is clean. When you become hungry you open your mouth and eat. When you become tired you stretch out your legs and rest. Everyone! If old Yama were to suddenly appear and ask you for lunch money, what would you tell him? *Hūm!* I almost passed through without asking!"

蔣山泉, 上堂, 擧此話云, "大衆, 石頭雖然性氣, 爭奈拗曲作直! 若是南禪即不然. 恁麽也得, 不恁麽也得, 恁麽不恁麽摠得. 都來一箇虛空, 討甚東西南北! 年年夏熱冬寒, 處處山青水綠, 飢來開口喫飯, 困來伸脚偃息. 諸仁者, 忽若閻老來, 索飯錢, 向他道甚麽即得? 吽! 洎不問過."

[Explanation]

Jiangshan: Considering his intent below, Jiangshan only raised Shitou's intent.

It is so will do … stretch out your legs and rest: his body has been turned around and vital energy made to flow freely by him (Shitou).

If old Yama were to suddenly appear and ask you for lunch money, what would you tell him: if you do so (when tired stretch your legs out), then he cannot but ask you for lunch money.

Hūm: a single syllable mantra (true word).

It is so will do …: at that time how will that not do?

I almost passed through without asking: if you are like this, then why worry about being asked for lunch money?

蔣山: 下意考之, 但擧石頭意也. 伊麽也得至伸脚偃息者, 爲他轉身通氣也. 閻老來至什麽即得者, 若伊麽, 似不免他索飯錢也. 吽者, 一道眞言也. 伊麽也得云云時, 何奈不得也. 洎不問過者, 若如此, 則何患索飯錢也.

Chengtian Ziqi[1040] ascended the hall and said, "An ancient one said, 'It is

---

1040 This is Kaiyuan Ziqi, see note 454 above.

so will not do' and 'It is not so will not do,' and 'It is so and it is not so both will not do.' When the ancient one said this, he was (full of himself) as if no one was around him. I ask all of you, what is this matter of 'it is so'? Is there anyone in the assembly who has something to say? Try for yourself and speak up! If no one is willing to say anything, I (Kaiyuan) will speak on your behalf. 'That which is long is the long dharma body. That which is short is the short dharma body.'"[1041]

承天琦, 上堂云 "古人道, 恁麼也不得, 不恁麼也不得, 恁麼不恁麼俱不得.' 古人恁麼道, 大似傍若無人. 敢問諸人, 如何是恁麼底事? 衆中還有道得底麼? 試出來道看. 若無人道得, 開元爲諸人道. 長者長法身, 短者短法身."

[Explanation]
Chengtian: Shitou's "It is so will not do …" already implies "it is so will do."

承天: 石頭, 伊麼也不得云云時, 早是伊麼也得云云也.

Wuzu Fayan ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and said,[1042] "When I was once part of an assembly I heard my fellow brethren make calculations and say, 'The mind is the Buddha won't do and the mind is not the Buddha won't do either.' If you say such things how could you call yourself a Chan guest? Why? How could you not know that old man Shitou was equipped with both the civil and the martial and perfected in both strength and strategy? If this is something I can see, then everyone must also know. All you see are the waves rushing forth. You do not see the dragon palace in the sea."

五祖演, 上堂, 擧此話云, "山僧在衆日, 聞兄弟商量道, '卽心卽佛, 亦不得; 不卽心卽佛, 亦不得.' 若恁麼說話, 敢稱禪客! 何故? 殊不知, 石頭老人, 文武兼備, 韜略雙全. 若是五祖見處, 也要諸人共知, 只見波濤湧, 不見海龍宮."

[1041] This last line appears to be a quote; for instance, see *Yangqi Fanghui heshang yulu* 楊岐方會和尚語錄 (T 1994A.47.641c28–29); *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.480a15); and also *Qingyi lu* (XZJ 117.894a12).

[1042] For this sermon, see also the *Fayan chanshi yulu* (T 1995.47.651a24–28).

[Explanation]

Wuzu: This too only raises the words of Shitou.

Old man Shitou was equipped with both the civil and the martial … : Shitou also intended "it is so will do …"

If this is something I can see … the dragon palace in the sea: again, having arrived at the state of "it is so will do" once again it is overturned. You should know that there is the state of "it is so will not do …" If so, Shitou and Mazu are in reality the same.

五祖: 此亦但擧石頭語也. 石頭老人, 文武云云者, 亦有伊麼也得云云之意也. 若是五祖至龍宮者, 又向伊麼也得處著倒, 又不是, 也須知有伊麼也不得云云也. 然則石頭馬祖, 其實一也.

Yuanwu Keqin raised this gongan and said,[1043] "Today, within the assembly fellow brethren say, 'Shitou just stood at the edge of a thousand-fathom high cliff and therefore he (Yaoshan) did not understand. Mazu threw him a line and he thereupon had an awakening. How could you not know that what Shitou said was already a slip and what Mazu said—this one (critical) move—was even more poisonous? Why did Yaoshan attain an awakening? Speak! How did this happen? To arrive at this state one has to be an iron-strong man. Therefore it is said, 'This matter lies neither in words nor in letters.' Look at the way he asked his question. After he asked Shitou he then went to Mazu and asked the same question. This person has a body and mind of iron and stone. Today, if there is a person who possesses such a mind, what concern could he not stamp out?"

圜悟勤, 擧此話云, "今時, 衆中兄弟便道, '石頭, 一向壁立千仭, 所以他不會;馬祖, 放開一線, 他乃悟去.' 殊不知, 石頭恁麼道, 已是漏逗了也;馬祖道處, 這一着, 尤更毒害. 因什麽, 藥山得悟去? 且道! 因什麽如此? 到此, 須是生鐵鑄就底漢, 始得. 所以道, '此事, 不在語言上, 不在文字上.' 看他置箇問頭, 問石頭了, 及至馬祖處, 亦如是問. 此人是箇鐵石身心 如今若有如是心底人何憂不徹?"

1043 For this sermon, see also the *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.772a27–b6).

[Explanation]

Yuanwu: Shitou's state (of realization) had never transcended Mazu's state. Mazu's state had never transcended Shitou's state. If your awakening is like this, then you are a skilled hand. If it is not like this, what are you calling awakening? Yaoshan was precisely such a person.

圜悟意, 石頭地未嘗離馬祖地, 馬祖地未嘗離石頭地, 伊麼悟去, 方是好手也. 若不如此, 則何名悟去? 藥山是其人也.

Foyan Qingyuan ascended the hall and said, "An ancient one (Mazu) said, *On certain occasions I instruct one to raise his eyebrows and blink his eyes … will not do*. A person today does not get it and makes separate understandings and says, 'Those who have attained awakening can say will do and will not do.' If you ask him what sort of person has attained awakening, he says, 'Speaking of his original endowment, one does not say attainment or non-attainment. Attainment is good and non-attainment is good.' " The master thereupon let out a deep sigh and said, "What more is there to discuss (with such a person)? In fact, as the ancient one (Shitou) says, *It is so will not do and it is not so will not do …. neither will do*, what about that? He replies, 'These are words for sweeping away traces. They sweep away the old grandfather and grandmother of your own tradition.'[1044] Again I ask him, 'If they are words for sweeping away traces, then what are words for not sweeping away traces?' He replies, 'It is so will do and it is not so will do. It is so and it is not so will both do. This is called words for constructing the truth. They take the grandpa and grandma of your own tradition as truth.' " The master let out two long breaths and said, "What more is there to discuss (with such a person)? A patch-robed monk should tell stories that befit a patch-robed monk. What would all of you do? Do not say, 'Longmen (Foyan) does not acknowledge me. He buries me. His mind is freely responding to me. He

1044 The source of the expression "old grandfather and grandmother of your own tradition" (*ni wuli laoye laoniang* 你屋裏老爺老孃) appears to be Yunmen Wenyan; for instance, see the *Jingde chandeng lu* (T 2076.51.358b15–16); and also the *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T 1988.47.552a13).

is judging me.' Me doing this—is this because I want you to make it or not make it? It would serve you well to examine (what I have said) carefully."

佛眼遠, 上堂云, "古人道, '我, 有時, 揚眉瞬目, 至不是.' 如今人, 不委得了, 便別作解會說道, '得底人, 道是也得, 不是也得.' 問伊, '作麼生是得底人?' 便道, '他分上不說, 得與不得, 得也好, 不得也好.' " 乃長噓一聲曰, "有什麼共語處? 秖如古人道, '恁麼也不得, 不恁麼也不得, 至摠不得.' 又作麼生? 他便道, '此是拂迹語, 拂你屋裏老爺老孃.' 又問伊, '此是拂迹語, 不拂迹語, 如何?' 便道, '與麼也得, 不與麼也得, 與麼不與麼摠得. 此喚作實頭語, 實你屋裏老爺老孃.' " 師復吁兩聲曰, "有什麼共語處? 夫爲衲僧, 須作衲僧說話, 你等合作麼生? 莫道, '龍門, 不肯我, 埋沒我, 心行我, 壓良我.' 龍門與麼, 是要你到? 不要你到? 也須子細看詳好."

[Explanation]

Foyan's intent: If you ask Mazu why he said what he said, then you don't understand Mazu's intent. If you ask Shitou why he said what he said, then you don't understand Shitou's intent. You have to take the two sayings and consider it a single line and only then will you understand Mazu and Shitou's intent. This is the intent behind both the first deep sigh and the second two long breaths. As for the first deep sigh, this refers to the destruction of Mazu's state with Shitou's state. As for the second two long breaths, this refers to the destruction of Shitou's state with Mazu's state.

Do not say, 'Longmen … judging me': this means Longmen is like this.

Me doing this—is this because I want you to make it or not make it: there is neither making it nor not making it. Making it and not making it are the great matter of the present moment (今日事).

佛眼意, 問馬祖伊麼道, 不會馬祖意, 問石頭伊麼道, 不會石頭意也. 將兩件語, 作一句看, 方始會得馬祖石頭意故, 前長噓一聲, 後復吁兩聲, 盖此意也. 所以前噓一聲者, 以石頭地, 破馬祖地;後吁兩聲者, 以馬祖地, 破石頭地也. 莫道龍門至壓良我者, 謂龍門如是也. 龍門伊麼是要你云云者, 亦無到不到, 到不到, 是今日事也.

Yunmen Zonggao asked a monk,[1045] "It is so will not do and it is not so will not do. It is so and it is not so—neither will do, what then?" The monk replied, "Both will do." The master said, "Having abandoned the sweet peach tree you've found a sour pear in the lush mountain."

雲門杲, 問僧, "恁麼也不得, 不恁麼也不得, 恁麼不恁麼惣不得, 作麼生?" 僧云, "惣得." 師云, "拋却甜桃樹, 緣山摘醋梨."

[Explanation]

Yunmen: *Asked a monk … both will do*: it is as if everything will do except for "will not do." If so, then one cannot but be satisfied with "will do." Therefore it is said, *Having abandoned the sweet peach tree you've found a sour pear in the lush mountain.*

雲門: 問僧云云摠得者, 猶是不得外摠得也. 然則不得不得恰好, 故云, '拋却甜桃樹云云' 也.

1045 For this exchange, see also the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.850a8–11).

Case 351.

Tianhuang's "I Feel Great!"

天皇快活

[Old case]

All his life Tianhuang (Daowu) always cried out, "I feel great! I feel great!" On his sickbed, as he was about to enter into extinction, he said, "So painful! So painful! Cloister chief, bring me some wine to drink! Bring me some meat to eat! Old Yama is coming to get me!" The cloister chief said, "Reverend, all your life you cried out about how good you felt and now why do you cry out about how much pain you have?" The master said, "Speak! Was I right back then or am I right now?" The cloister chief was speechless. The master pushed away his wooden pillow and entered into extinction.[1046]

天皇一生, 常呌快活快活, 欲入滅臥疾中呌云, "苦, 苦! 院主, 把酒來我與我喫,

1046 Whether this is the story of Nanquan Puyuan's disciple Baima Tanzhao 白馬曇照 (d.u.) or Tianhuang Daowu 天皇道悟 (748–807) is the subject of controversy; see Jia, *The Hongzhou School of Chan Buddhism,* pp. 22–26. As Jinhua Jia points out, Tanzhao's story, which appears in the *Zutang ji* and *Jingde chuandeng lu,* seems to have been turned into Tianhuang's story to invent a new identity for Tianhuang. For Tanzhao's story; see the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.276a29–b4); *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* (XZJ 135.871a7–11); and *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.195b4–8). According to legend, Baima Tanzhao used to always cry out, "I feel great! I feel great!" At the time of his death, however, he cried out "So painful! So painful!" And he also said, "King Yāma is coming for me." The cloister chief asked him why someone, who didn't show any fear when he was tossed into water by the military commissioner, would behave this way. Tanzhao raised his wooden pillow and asked the cloister chief whether he was right back then or right now. The cloister chief was speechless.

將肉來與我喫. 閻老子來取我也." 院主云, "和尚一生呌快活, 如今爲什麼呌苦?" 師云, "且道! 當時是, 如今是?" 院主無語, 師推出枕子, 便告寂.

[Explanation of the gongan]

I feel great! I feel great!: happiness at its utmost.

So painful! So painful!: suffering at its utmost.

Was I right back then or am I right now?: there is no happiness outside of suffering. There is no suffering outside of happiness.

The master pushed away his wooden pillow: suffering and happiness have the same source.

快活云云者, 樂到底也;苦苦者, 苦到底也. 當時是如今是云云者, 苦外無樂, 樂外無苦也. 推出枕子者, 苦樂一源處也.

Ciyun Yuanzhao's[1047] verse[1048]

Sweet, sweet, so absolutely sweet,
Painful, painful, so fundamentally painful,
When I put away the wooden pillow,
In Silla they sound the drum to announce nightfall.
[This record is from Baima (Tanzhao's) record.[1049]]

圓照頌, "甛甛徹底甛, 苦苦連根苦. 拈起枕頭時, 新羅夜打鼓." <此錄白馬.>

1047 Ciyun Yuanzhao 慈雲圓照 or Xiuhui 修惠 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Yunju Xiaoshun. He served as the abbot of Ciyun Cloister 慈雲院 in Jiangxi province.

1048 For this verse, see the *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.384b6).

1049 See note 1047 above.

[Explanation]

Yuanzhao: Suffering at its utmost. Happiness at its utmost.

Silla lies in the East Sea.

They sound the drum to announce nightfall: there is brightness in darkness.

圓照: 苦到底, 樂到底也. 新羅在海東, 夜打鼓, 則暗中有明也.

Baoning Faxiu added a comment, "What he said is acceptable, but if you examine this man carefully you'll see he was dilly-dallying while alive and careless and sloppy after death. If you want to lift your nose up to Heaven, put aside the ceramic bowl, bamboo utensils, leftover soup, and rancid rice. The rice cake roasting on the stove—if you want it, then ask for it. Humans have no roots and thus take food as a means of life."

保寧秀拈, "得卽得, 點撿將來, 這漢, 生前顢顢頇頇, 死後莽莽鹵鹵. 若要鼻孔撩天, 瓦椀竹筯, 殘羹餿飯, 拈放一邊, 熱爐餬餅, 要請便請. 還會麼? 人無根株, 以食爲命."

[Explanation]

Baoning: Tianhuang's *leftover soup and rancid rice* is like rice cake on a stove with no flame.

Rice cake is the root of life (or life faculty). That said, did you know that leftover soup and rancid rice is also the root of life?

保寧: 天皇殘羹餿飯, 似無熱爐胡餅. 胡餅乃命之根株, 又焉知殘羹餿飯, 亦是命之根株."

Case 359.

Weishan's No Mind

潙山無心

[Old case]

Weishan was asked by a monk, "What is the Way?" The master replied, "No mind is the Way." The monk said, "I don't understand." The master said, "Why do you not understand that it is best to take that which you do not understand?" The monk replied, "What is it that I do not understand?" The master replied, "It is you and not someone else." The master again said, "People today, all they do is directly experience that which they do not understand as their Buddha and as their minds. If you seek knowledge and understanding outside yourself and call it the Chan Way, then this will prove to be pointless. This is called moving shit in and not moving shit out. You will pollute your mind-ground and this, therefore, is not the Way."[1050]

潙山因僧問, "如何是道?" 師云, "無心是道." 僧云, "某甲不會." 師云, "何不會取, 不會底好?" 僧云, "如何是不會底?" 師云, "祇是你, 不是別人." 師又云, "今時人, 但直下體會取不會底, 正是你佛, 正是你心. 若向外求, 一知一解, 將謂禪道, 且沒交涉, 名運糞入, 不名運糞出, 污你心田, 所以不是道."

[Explanation of the gongan]

No mind is the Way: "When the Way is mindless it unites with people.

[1050] For this story, see also the *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.546a4–8); *Wudeng huiyuan* (XZJ 138.318a5–10); and *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.183a12–17).

When people are mindless they unite with the Way."[1051] Consider the following: "A monk asked Baizhang, 'What does it mean to constantly try to clear away shit for twenty years?'[1052] Baizhang replied, 'Just put to rest the view of existence and non-existence and see all desires. For each and every object, try to penetrate through the three phrases. This is called eliminating shit. Right now, you seeking the Buddha, seeking bodhi, and seeking all dharmas is called moving shit in and not moving shit out. Right now, you creating views about the Buddha and creating understandings about the Buddha is just your views, your pursuits, and your attachments. In the end, it is sophistry."[1053]

無心是道者, 道無心合人, 人無心合道也. 下如文. 僧問百丈, "二十年中, 常令除糞, 意旨如何?" 丈云, "但息有無知見, 見一切貪求, 箇箇透過三句外, 是名除糞. 只如今求佛, 求菩提, 求一切法, 是名運糞入, 不名運糞出. 只如今, 作佛見, 作佛解, 但有所見, 所求所著, 盡是戲論也."

Fazhen Shouyi added a comment, "Weishan's explanation is also case of moving shit into the mind-field. How could it not pollute!" The master used his staff to draw a line and said, "I've moved your shit out."

法眞一拈, "潙山與麼說話, 亦是運糞入心田, 爭得不汚!" 師以拄杖一畫云, "與你運出了也."

[Explanation]

Fazhen: The state of *directly experiencing that which they do not understand*: this is *moving shit into the mind-field.*

1051 These are two lines from a verse by Dongshan Liangjie; see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.452c21).

1052 "Clearing away shit for twenty years" is a line from the *Lotus Sūtra* (T 262.9.17a27); see Watson, *The Lotus Sutra,* p. 84.

1053 For this exchange, see the *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* (XZJ 135.677b8–13); and *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.174b11–16).

The master used his staff to draw a line: one must also draw a line and cut it off.

法眞: 體會取不會底處, 此是運糞入心田也. 以柱杖一畫者, 亦須畫斷也.

Xinwen Tanfen added a comment, "What Weishan said is precisely a case of moving shit in and not called moving shit out. I (Wannian) said, 'It is not the mind. It is not the Buddha.' There is no further need to understand that which you do not understand. Speak! Can you move the shit out? This is also a case of leaving Caomen to go to Zhengzhou."[1054]

心聞賁拈, "大潙恁麽說, 正是運糞入, 不名運糞出. 萬年道, '不是心, 不是佛.' 不會底, 更不須會. 且道! 還運糞得出麽? 也是鄭州出曹門."

Xinwen: *What Weishan said … not called moving shit out*: see the explanation above.

I said … that which you do not understand: one must also turn (the view above) on its head.

Can you move … go to Zhengzhou: if you turn (the understanding) on its head, then this too is not a complete understanding. But if you thoroughly (investigate) that which you do not understand, then there will be nothing else left to do.

心聞: 至運糞出者, 如前話中所釋也. 萬年至更不須會者, 亦須轉却也. 還運糞得出麽云云者, 若轉却則又便不是了也. 然則不會處徹底, 更無後事也.

1054 Caomen 曹門 or the Cao Gate was the north gate and meat marketing district of the Northern Song capital Bianliang 汴梁 (present-day Kaifeng). Zhengzhou 鄭州 was the provincial capital of Henan province, which is located to the south of Bianliang. Xinwen Tanfen is saying that trying to understand that which one does not understand is as paradoxical as leaving the north gate to go the city in the south.

Case 399.

Huanzhong Knows Illness

寰中識病

[Old case]

Chan master Huanzhong[1055] of Mt. Daci ascended the hall and said, "I do not know how to answer gongans. All I know is illness." At that time a certain monk stepped forward (to ask a question) and the master returned to the abbot's quarters.[1056]

大慈山寰中禪師, 上堂云, "山僧不解答話. 只是識病." 時有僧出, 師便歸方丈.

[Explanation of the gongan]

Illness: this refers to the Buddha illness and patriarch illness.

A certain monk stepped forward: is he ill or not ill?

The master returned to the abbot's quarters: is this someone who knows illness or not?

病者, 佛病祖病等也. 有僧出者, 是病不是病? 便歸云云, 是識病不是識病?

1055 Daci Huanzhong 大慈寰中 (780–862) is a dharma heir of Baizhang Huaihai. Huanzhong served as abbot on Mt. Daci 大慈山 near Hangzhou. He posthumously received the title Great Master Xingkong 性空大師.

1056 For this story, see the *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.549b6–7); *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.686c28–29); and also *Xutang heshang yulu* (T 2000.47.1021b13–14). In these sources, Huanzhong made this statement about illness not in an ascending the hall sermon but while instructing the assembly (*shizhong* 示眾). The *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.266c24–26) version, however, places the statement in an ascending the hall sermon.

Fayan (Wenyi) added a comment, "Some in the assembly remarked, 'Illness is right before his eyes, but (Huanzhong) does not know it.'"[1057]

法眼拈, "衆中喚作, 病在目前不識."

[Explanation]

Fayan: What Daci did may make it seem as if he does not know illness. But such an understanding is not Daci's intent.

法眼: 大慈伊麽, 似不識病, 伊麽會, 不是大慈意也.

Xuanjue[1058] inquired,[1059] "Speak! Does Daci[1060] know illness or not? Is the monk who stepped forward ill or not ill? If you say he is ill, then quotidian actions like walking and standing cannot all be illnesses. If you say he is not ill, then how should we make sense of his stepping forward?"[1061]

玄覺徵, "且道! 大慈識病不識病? 此僧出來, 是病不是病? 若言是病, 每日行住, 不可惣是病; 若言不是病, 出來, 又作麽生?"

[Explanation]

Xuanjue: *Does Daci know illness or not?*: This also means Daci was

1057 Here, illness is probably referring to the monk who stepped forward. For this comment, see also the *Jinling Qingliangyuan Wenyi chanshi yulu* 金陵清涼院文益禪師語錄 (T 1991.47.593a16–17); and also the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.266c26).

1058 This is Baoci Wensui 報慈文遂 (d.u.), a dharma heir of Fayan Wenyi. Wensui served as abbot of Zhiguan Monastery in Jiangxi province. In 964 he became abbot of Changqing Monastery 長慶寺 in Jinling and, later, Qingliang Monastery 清涼寺 in Jinling (present-day Nanjing). He also served as abbot of Baoci Monastery 報慈寺 in Zhejiang province.

1059 For this comment, see the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.266c26–27).

1060 This refers to Huanzhong.

1061 For Xuanjue's comment, see the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.266c26–27); *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.189a9–12); and *Wudeng huiyuan* (XZJ 138.124b2–3).

dispensing medicine according to the illness.

Is the monk who stepped forward ill or not ill?: If you say he is ill, then what illness does this monk have? If you say he was not ill, then Daci's return to the abbot's quarters is not a case of him knowing illness. How, then, should we make sense of Daci returning to the abbot's quarters?

玄覺: 識病不識病者, 亦有應病與藥之義也. 此僧云云者, 若言是病, 這僧有什麼病? 若言不是病, 大慈歸方丈, 不是識病, 大慈歸方丈, 又作麼生?

Xuedou Chongxian added a comment, "In general, to establish a tradition (宗乘) one must determine gain and loss. Daci knew illness and did not answer gongans. At that time a certain monk stepped forward and Daci returned to the abbot's quarters. I know illness and do not answer gongans. Should a monk step forward I would strike him on his back. Should a monk step forward, masters everywhere who know illness and who do not answer gongans, will certainly have their own unique way of (responding). Should there be any change in the Great Tang there can only be three sons of Heaven."[1062]

雪竇顯拈, "大凡扶竪宗乘, 須辨个得失. 且大慈識病不答話, 時有僧出, 便歸方丈. 雪竇識病不答話, 或有僧出, 劈脊便打. 諸方識病不答話, 有僧出, 必然別有長處. 敢有一个動着, 大唐天子只三人."

[Explanation]

Xuedou: *I would strike him on his back*: there appears to be no reason behind Daci returning to the abbot's quarters and therefore gain and loss must be determined.

1062 My translation of the last line is tentative. As evinced in the commentary below, this last line was anything but clear. For the entire comment by Xuedou, see also the *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.686c29–687a4); *Qingyi lu* (XZJ 117.876b17–877a4); and *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.549b8–11).

Masters everywhere who know … their own unique way of (responding): there has to be a third public case (i.e., a synthesis to the thesis and antithesis). Haiyin Chaoxin's later response, "Go have some tea," is an example of this.

Should there be any change in the Great Tang there can only be three sons of Heaven: unclear. The twenty-third page of the *Zuting shiyuan* says, "*There can only be three*: for *Chan* there is Dawei,[1063] for poetry there is (Zhou) Po, and the Great Tang's son of Heaven—there are only (these) three. See Zhou Po's *Biwang chaoyu xiaoshuo*."[1064] This is referring to Li (Bai) and Du (Fu)."[1065]

雪竇: 劈脊便打者, 大慈歸方丈, 似乎無辨白故, 此須辨得失也. 諸方識病至長處者, 須有第三公案, 下海印信云, '喫茶去.' 是也. 大唐天子云云者, 未詳, 祖庭二十三丈云, "禪是大潙詩是朴, 大唐天子只三人. 見周朴辟王巢語小說." 云李杜也.

Dayu Shouzhi added a comment, "This monk stepped forward and Daci returned to his abbot's quarters. Neither is coherent. What state is the state of knowing illness? Examine carefully right now."

大愚芝拈, "這僧出來, 大慈便歸方丈, 並無个道理. 什麼處是識病處? 如今也須子細."

[Explanation]

Dayu: *The master returned to the abbot's quarters*: it may seem as if (this action) lacks coherence, but if you say he does not know illness then you would betray expectations of Daci.

[1063] This probably refers to Weishan Lingyou.

[1064] There are several problems with this commentary on Xuedou's comment. For the citation; see *Zuting shiyuan* (XZJ 113.38b16–17). The citation in question is found in its second fascicle. The significance of the number twenty-three is unclear. What the *Biwang chaoyu xiaoshuo* 辟王巢語小說 refers to is also unclear. Zhou Po 周朴 (d. 878) was a poet of the Tang dynasty who lived in seclusion on Mt. Song 嵩山 and died during the Huang Chao 黄巢 rebellion (878–884). Therefore this book would seem to refer to a story about avoidance of serving under Huang Chao.

[1065] The meaning of this statement is unclear.

大愚: 歸方丈, 似無道理也, 若言不識病, 辜負大慈.

Haiyin Chaoxin ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and then raised Xuedou's words, *strike him on his back.* The master said, "I would not have done the same. If a certain monk were to step forward, I (Jianfu) would tell him to go have some tea."

海印信, 上堂, 擧此話, 連擧雪竇云, '劈脊便打.' 師云, "薦福卽不然. 忽有人出來, 向道喫茶去."

Huanglong Zuxin raised this gongan and said,[1066] "What a pity! Letting him off the hook like that. Back then had (Huanzhong) struck him on his back as soon as he stepped forward and waited until he understood where the blow came from, (Huanzhong) could have avoided the fate of being scrutinized for a thousand years. Today, I know illness and can also answer gongans. If a certain man were to step forward, I would flip over the corded chair. In this situation how should he turn things around? The chief seat should try to come up with a turning phrase as a substitute reply."

黃龍心, 擧此話云, "可惜, 放過! 當時, 若見伊才出來, 劈脊便打, 待他得知行棒來處, 免見千古之下, 遭人點檢. 黃龍今日也識病, 會答話. 忽若有个漢出來, 掀倒繩床, 者裏合作麽生支遣? 請上座, 試代一轉語."

[Explanation]

Huanglong: *Struck him on his back as soon as he stepped forward*: this is to determine gain and loss. It is to know illness.

Today, I know illness and can also answer gongans: to know illness is to dispense medicine according to the illness. To answer gongans is to put the true command (正令) into motion in full force.

I would flip over the corded chair: this is to root each and every one out.

1066 For this teaching, see also the *Baojue Zuxin chanshi yulu* (XZJ 120.230b11–15).

Come up with a turning phrase as a substitute reply: give him thirty blows and kick him out. Does he tally with Huanglong's (understanding)? Tiantong's intent below is the same.

黃龍: 劈脊云云者, 辨箇得失也, 是識病也. 黃龍今日云云者, 識病則應病與藥, 答話則全提正令也. 掀倒禪床者, 一一掃蕩也. 代一轉語者, 打三十棒趂出去. 還契得黃龍麽? 下天童意, 與此同.

Tiantong Zhengjue while instructing the assembly, raised this gongan, and then raised Xuedou words, *Struck him on his back.* The master said,[1067] "Daci and Xuedou are both virtuosos. But they could only see what was in front of their eyes and could not inhibit what was under their feet. Had a man who does not distinguish good from evil and does not ask East or West stepped forward and flipped over the corded chair, even if they made a move with all their skills they would still be at a loss and unable to control their hands and feet. Right at that moment would they have known illness?"

天童覺, 示衆, 擧此話, 連擧雪竇云, '劈脊便打.' 師云, "大慈雪竇, 二俱作家, 要且, 只顧目前, 不防脚下. 或有个不識好惡, 不問東西底漢, 出來便掀倒禪床, 直饒你全機大用, 也只恐着手脚不辦. 正當與麽時, 還有識病底眼麽?"

[1067] For this teaching, see also the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.32c11–15).

Case 411.

Zhaozhou's "Go Have Some Tea"

趙州喫茶

[Old case]

Zhaozhou asked a monk, "Have you been here before?" The monk replied, "I have." The master said, "Go have some tea!" Again, he asked a monk, "Have you been here before?" The monk replied, "I've never been here before." The master said, "Go have some tea!" The cloister chief asked, "Why do you tell them to go have some tea when they've been here before and (also) when they've never been here before?" The master called for the cloister chief and the chief answered. The master said, "Go have some tea!" [1068]

趙州問僧, "曾到此閒否?" 僧云, "曾到." 師云, "喫茶去!" 又問僧, "曾到此閒否?" 僧云, "不曾到." 師云, "喫茶去!" 院主問, "爲什麼, 曾到也敎伊喫茶去, 不曾到也敎伊喫茶去?" 師召院主, 主應喏. 師云, "喫茶去!"

[Explanation of the gongan]

Here: where his reverence is.

Have you been here before: an awakened monk.

I've never been here before: a deluded monk.

The cloister chief is a monk who was neither awakened nor deluded.

The master told everyone, *"Go have some tea!"*: he instructs the deluded

1068 For this story, see also the *Fenyang Wude chanshi yulu* 汾陽無德禪師語錄 (T 1992.47.608c27–609a1); *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.50c4–7); *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.163a15–19) etc.

to reach awakening and the awakened to reach delusion. Those who are neither deluded nor awakened are instructed to reach both awakening and delusion. He changes their eyeballs so that they can see the truth. Again, the deluded follow the (doctrinal) teachings and become deluded. The awakened follow the teachings and become awakened. Those who are neither deluded nor awakened follow the teachings and become neither deluded nor awakened. This is how one follows the waves and currents and makes a judgment according to procedure. According to the *Chongsurok,* "The śrāvaka are given the teaching of the four noble truths within the complete ocean seal teachings, the solitary buddhas (pratyeka buddas) are given the teaching of dependent origination within the complete ocean seal teachings, the bodhisattvas are given the teaching of the six perfections within the complete ocean seal teachings, and those who have matured to sudden (awakening) are people who have (awakened) to their original endowment in the past. They are given the entirety of the complete teachings."[1069] This is an example of an plainly presented house style. Tiantong's verse says, "If it is not a plainly presented house style, how could one go with the waves and follow the tide?"[1070] This is merely talking to patched-robe monks in the Chan monasteries about the weather. An ancient one's verse says, "Heshan's "beat his drum' and Zhaozhou's 'tea' etcetera."[1071] This is a case of caring for others with the matter of one's original endowment.

此間者, 和尙這裏也. 曾到, 悟地僧; 不曾到, 迷地僧; 院主迷悟不干地僧也. 皆云喫茶去者, 迷者打教悟, 悟者打敎迷, 不迷不悟者, 打敎亦迷亦悟. 此則換却眼睛也. 又迷者從敎迷, 悟者從敎悟, 不迷不悟者, 從敎不迷不悟. 則隨波逐浪, 據款決案也. 叢髓錄云, "聲聞人中, 與全海印四諦之法;緣覺人中, 與全海印緣生之法;菩薩人中, 與全海印六度之法;至於熟頓人中, 過去本分人也, 亦全全與之爾." 則平展家風也. 天童頌曰, '且非平展家風, 豈是隨波逐浪!' 則叢林中對衲僧寒

1069 See the *Beopgye dogi chongsurok* 法界圖記叢髓錄 (T 1887B.45.719a21–23).

1070 See the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.2a19–20).

1071 The identity of this ancient one is unclear, but see the *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997. 47.782b9–10).

暄而已. 古人頌云, ‘和[1072]山打鼓, 趙州茶云云’ 此是本分事接人也.

Dajue Huailian’s verse

How could you call *baitu* and seseame tea precious?[1073]
When northerners exchange greetings they show deep affection, [1074]
Right now if you encounter a *saindhava,*
Specially cook some *yan’gao* and treat him like a guest of honor.[1075]

> 大覺璉頌, “白土和麻詎足珎? 北人相見話殷勤. 如今若遇仙陁至, 別煑研膏待上賓.”

[Explanation]

Dajue: What he gave to this man and that man is *baitu* and sesame. They are different from *yan’gao*. *Baitu* and sesame are names of common teas or treats. *Yan’gao* is the name of a type of tea.

大覺: 此東獻西獻地, 是白土和麻, 亦是別研膏也. 白土和麻, 常茶名, 又果茶名. 研膏, 亦茶名.

Touzi Yiqing’s verse[1076]

Seeing a monk, (the master) asks whether he’s been here before or not,

---

1072 I substitute *he* 禾 for *he* 和.

1073 *Baitu* 白土 (Yunnan province) and sesame (*hema* 和麻, alt. *huma* 胡麻) refer to common and nonexceptional types of tea.

1074 Northerner here refers to Zhaozhou.

1075 *Yangao* 研膏 is a more exceptional type of tea prepared from tea-leaf juices. For *saindhava* see note 1001.

1076 For this verse, see also the *Touzi Yiqing chanshi yulu* (XZJ 124.466a11–12).

Some say they have and others say they have not been here before,
Sit them down, drink some tea, and bid them farewell,
The dark smoke deceptively changes the green patterns on the moss.

投子青頌, "見僧便問曾到否, 有言曾到不曾來. 留坐喫茶珍重去, 青煙暗換綠紋苔."

[Explanation]

Touzi: (Zhaozhou's) intent is to change eyeballs (so that they can see the truth).

投子: 換却眼睛之意.

Jianfu Benyi's verse[1077]

Master craftsmen of the Chan grove truly find it difficult to contribute,
Facing the task, how could there be degrees of disparity,
Regardless of whether you are a new arrival or an old resident,
He shows deep affection with a single cup of tea.

薦福逸頌, "叢林宗匠實難加, 臨事何嘗有等差? 任是新來將舊住, 殷勤秖是一甌茶."

[Explanation]

Jianfu: A plainly presented house style.

薦福: 平展家風

[1077] For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.240b6–7).

Jiangshan Faquan's verse[1078]

The cup is raised in three different grades to maintain utmost propriety,
Who can stare at a face and determine ugly and beautiful?
Stone bridge, dilapidated cloister, and nothing of value,
Mix some sesame in and boil it in the same way.

蔣山泉頌, "三等擎甌禮數全, 誰能覿面辨媸姸? 石橋破院無珎品, 且夾油麻一例煎."

[Explanation]

Jiangshan: He makes a judgment (on the case) according to procedure. Cuiyan, Huanglong, Tiantong, and the other verses are all examples of this. Some are deep and some are shallow. Some push down and some raise up. Although what they say is different, their purport is the same.

蔣山: 據款結案, 翠巖黃龍天童, 與餘頌, 皆此例. 或深或淺, 或抑或揚, 言雖似別, 其旨一也.

Cuiyan Zongyue's verse

Zhaozhou has a saying, "Go have some tea,"
Clear-eyed monks in patched robes are all swindled,

1078 A different version of this verse can be found in the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.240b8–9):

The cup is raised in three different grades
to maintain utmost propriety
They are ladled out the same without any partiality
Stone bridge, dilapidated cloister, and no special taste
Mix some sesame and boil it in the same way

三等擎甌禮數全 一般平挹更無偏 石橋破院無珍味 且夾油麻一例煎

Un-swindled but not permitted,
Heshan's "He knows how to beat a drum"[1079] —how laughable!

> 翠嵓悅頌, "趙州有語喫茶去, 明眼衲僧皆賺擧. 不賺擧未相許, 堪笑禾山解打鼓."

Huanglong Huinan's verse[1080]

Zhaozhou tests people about the ins and outs (of the Way),
They nonchalantly open their mouths and he become their sympathetic friend,
Had he stared at them in the face without clear eyes,
How could the style of our tradition have survived to this day?

> 黃龍南頌, "趙州驗人端的處, 等閑開口便知音. 覿面若無青白眼, 宗風爭得到如今!"

Again his verse[1081]

He meets, inquires, and learns where they came from,
Be it an acquaintance or not he offers them tea,
Reflecting back on those who ephemerally came and went,
Hurry! Hurry! Who could discern the flowers that fill the cup?[1082]

1079 For Heshan Wuyin's 禾山無殷 (884–960) "He knows how to beat a drum" (*jiedagu* 解打鼓), see Case 44 of the *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.180c21–181a1).

1080 For this verse, see also the *Huanglong Huinan chanshi yulu* (T 1993.47.635a13–14); and also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.240a18–b1).

1081 For this verse, see also the *Huanglong Huinan chanshi yulu* (T 1993.47.635a15–16).

1082 Here, the flowers refer to the steam rising from the hot tea in the cup.

又頌, "相逢相問知來歷, 不揀親踈便與茶. 翻憶憧憧來往者, 忙忙誰辨滿甌花."

Haiyin Chaoxin's verse

At Zhaozhou's "Go have some tea,"
Patch-robed monks are all at a loss what to do,
Even a *saindhava*,
Would not be able to avoid being given instructions,
If not an instruction, then go have some tea.

海印信頌, "趙州喫茶去, 衲僧皆罔措. 任是仙陁婆, 未免遭指注, 非指注喫茶去."

Donglin Changcong's verse[1083]

With three cups of tea he advances his house style,
Far, near, high, or low, they all share the same road,
Those who come and go without having enjoyed the clear fragrance,
Who knows the man who dwells west of the eastern cloister well?[1084]

東林惣頌, "三甌茶自振家風, 遠近高低一徑通. 未薦清香往來者, 誰諳居止院西東."

Fazhen Shouyi's verse[1085]

1083 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.240b2–3).

1084 The text seems to be corrupted here or the sense changed in order to conform to a rhyme scheme. It should be "west of the eastern cloister" (*dongyuan xi* 東院西). Zhaozhou's residence, Guanyin Cloister, is said to have been located to the west of the eastern cloister (XZJ 118.804a9).

1085 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.241b2–3).

People come to pay Zhaozhou a visit,
All they were told was to go have some tea,
The clueless cloister chief did not understand,
But he was given another cup and now he understands.

法眞一頌, "人來訪趙州, 唯道喫茶去. 無端院主不惺惺, 更與一甌今惺悟."

Tiangtong Zhengjue's verse[1086]

Whether they've ever been there before or not,
They drink tea all the same,
Not attached to mechanisms,
Not especially skilled,
If it isn't a plainly presented house style,
How could you follow the waves and currents?
Just be wary of picking and choosing and do not discriminate,[1087]
And you'll be able to understand the old reverend Zhaozhou.

天童覺頌, "到與不到, 喫茶一樣. 不着機關, 殊無伎倆. 且非平展家風, 豈是隨波逐浪! 唯嫌揀擇沒分疎, 識得趙州老和尚."

Chengtian Huai's verse

Making moves without end in response to skill (in *chan*),
Whether they've ever been there before or not it is tea all the same,
Before it could enter the mouth the whole thing is spilled,

1086 For this verse, see also the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.2a18–20).

1087 "Just be weary of picking and choosing" (*weixian jianze* 唯嫌揀擇) is a line from the *Xinxin ming* 信心銘; see the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.457a19).

Who can, under these circumstances, discern the flowers in the cup?

承天懷頌, "應機隨手用無涯, 不到曾經一樣茶. 未入口時全漏泄, 那堪更辨盞中花?"

Zhihai Zhiqing's[1088] verse

Zhaozhou Congshen is the true good teacher (知識),
Everyone who comes he offers them tea to drink,
Ever since Lu Yu compiled the *Scripture of the Transcendents,*[1089]
To this very moment we are remain cut off from the reveal facts.

智海清頌, "趙州諗老眞知識, 來者人人與茶喫. 自從陸羽著仙經, 直至如今絕消息."

Again his verse

The decrepit Chan monk is Zhaozhou,
Knowledgeable about the ins and outs of drinking tea,
With the demons gone there is no news from him,
He makes the tortoise king wait endlessly in vain.

又頌, "老倒禪和是趙州, 喫茶端的好來由. 魔斯去後無消息, 空使龜王望不休."

Huanglong Xin's verse[1090]

1088 This is Foyin Zhiqing, see note 612 above.

1089 Lu Yu 陸羽 (733–804) is the reputed author of the *Cha jing* 茶經 or *Classic of Tea,* also known as the *Scipture of the Transcendents*.

1090 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.241a11).

Zhaozhou's "Go have some tea,"
An extraordinary house style,
Whether they've ever been there before or not,
A true pick-pocket.

黃龍新頌, "趙州喫茶! 宗風奇特. 到與不到, 正白拈賊."

Shangfang Riyi's verse

Once they enter the gate he does not question their rank,
With lightning speed he offers them a cup of tea,
How laughable! A Shandong native living in Hebei,
He adds *zhima* (sesame) to what had already been prepared.

上方益頌, "入門曾不問堦差, 雷例還他一椀茶. 堪笑山東河北子! 更來裏面著脂麻!"

Chongsheng Yuangong's verse

Zhaozhou's tea gongan is truly difficult to discuss,
A clear mirror is originally spotless,
Reflecting back on those who paid tribute back then,
At (the Buddha's) last moments Cunda showed the deepest affection,
The deepest affection!
How could this compare to swallowing a chewed-up pit?[1091]

崇勝珙頌, "趙州茶話實難論, 明鏡從來絕點痕. 繇憶當時獻供者, 純陀末後最殷勤. 最殷勤, 爭如爛嚼核輪呑!"

1091 My translation of "pit" (*helun* 核輪) is tentative.

Cishou Huaishen's verse[1092]

Those who've already been there before, "Go have some tea,"
Those who've never been there before, "Go have some tea,"
The old Chan monk Zhaozhou,
His words are sweet but his mind is bitter,
His mind is bitter!
Even to this very moment there is no way to wipe it away.

> 慈受頌, "曾到喫茶去, 未到喫茶去. 趙州老禪和! 口甜心裏苦. 心裏苦! 直至如今無雪處."

Foyan Qingyuan's verse[1093]

Zhaozhou's one cup of tea,
He examines every expert,
As a temporary measure it seems okay,
But how could you avoid becoming scattered all over the place?[1094]

> 佛眼遠頌, "趙州一椀茶, 驗盡當行家. 一期雖似好, 爭免事如麻."

Muan Fachong's verse[1095]

Whether they've ever been there before or not,
They drink a cup of tea,

1092 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.241a14–15).

1093 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.241a2–3).

1094 For "become scattered all over the place" (*ruma* 如麻 or *ruma sisu* 如麻似粟); see Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 362; and also ZGD, p. 5.

1095 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.241a12–13).

The way he greets a guest was like this,
Indifference is (the way of the) sangha.

牧庵忠頌, "曾到不曾到, 且喫一盃茶. 待客只如此, 冷淡是僧家."

Songyuan Chongyue's verse[1096]

Zhaozhou's "Go have some tea,"
A poisonous snake is blocking the old path,
Only after you take a step on it will you know your mistake,
Even the Buddha can't do anything about it.

松源頌, "趙州喫茶去! 毒蛇横古路. 踏着乃知非, 佛也不堪做."

Jiean Zhipeng's verse

Light a fire in a cold stove,
Drop a brick (and fetch a jade) in a busy crowd,[1097]
Have the boat follow the current down stream,
Where you wash your feet you board a ship.[1098]

介庵朋頌, "冷處着火, 閙裏抛塼. 順水流舟, 洗脚上船."

1096 See the Songyuan *Chongyue chanshi yulu* 松源崇嶽禪師語錄 (XZJ 121.621a16).

1097 For "dropping a brick or tile and fetching jade" (*paozhuan yinyu* 抛塼引玉), that is, using something insignificant or meaningless to gain something great or important, see Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten,* p. 421.

1098 According to the *Bintui lu* 賓退錄 by Zhao Yushi 趙與時 (1175–1231), the idiom, "where you wash your feet you board a ship" (*xijiao shangchuan* 洗脚上船), is based on a passage from the biography of Lü Meng 呂蒙 (178–220) in the *Treatise on the Three Kingdoms* (Sanguo zhi 三國志); see *Bintui lu* (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 5, 20b. When the king wished build an entrenchment his generals disagreed and reminded him that since they are close to water it is easier to board their ships than to fight form an entrenchment.

Baofu Congzhan said, "Zhaozhou indulges in his expedient means."[1099]

保福云, "趙州, 慣得其便."

[Explanation]

Baofu: Looking for a convenient opportunity is to fall into a convenient opportunity. Why? Because you fall into a state of doing nothing (無事).

保福:得便宜, 是落便宜. 何也? 無事處, 著倒故也.

Fayun Yue[1100] added a comment, "Reverend Zhaozhou knew only how to work this way but not that way. Be that as it may, 'the performance comes to an end and no one (of the performers) is in sight; the numerous peaks floating on top of the river are green.'"

法雲岳拈, "趙州和尚, 只知伊麽去, 不會伊麽來. 雖然如此, 曲終人不見, 江上數峯青."

[Explanation]

Fayun: *Reverend Zhaozhou knew only how to work this way but not that way*: he indulges in his expedient means.

The performance comes to an end and no one (performer) is in sight: thoroughly without remainder. *The performance comes to an end* … is from the last couplet of the poem "The Spirit of Xiang Lake Strum the Zither."[1101] This refers to the facts revealed after three cups.

法雲: 只知伊麽去云云者, 慣得其便也. 曲終人云云者, 徹底無餘也. 曲終云云, 湘妃鼓瑟詩末聯, 三盞後消息也.

1099 For this comment, see the *Zhengfa yanzang* 正法眼藏 (XZJ 118.133a9).

1100 The identity of Fayun Yue is unclear.

1101 See "The Spirit of Xiang Lake Strum the Zither" (*Xiangling guse* 湘靈鼓瑟) by the Tang poet Qian Qi 錢起 (710–782) in the *Quan Tang shi* 238, 4b.

Nanming Faquan during an informal sermon raised this gongan and said, "How pitiful! Zhaozhou took a cup of low-grade tea and gave it to this person and that person. Although it is bitter and does not suit your taste, the tea came from the family garden. All of you have been to the Jiangnan, Liangzhe, Hebei, Xichuan (Sichuan) circuits, so speak! Whose tea is the best? Is there no one who brought some back? Show it to the assembly!" After a pause he said, "Even if you are able to bring some back, you won't be able to avoid preparing it carelessly."

南明泉, 小叅, 擧此話云, "可憐, 趙州! 將一盞麁茶, 東獻西獻! 雖然苦澁難當, 要且家園所出. 諸人, 江南兩浙, 河北西川, 盡曾到來, 且道! 甚處茶最好? 莫有收得底麼? 對衆呈似看!" 良久云, "直饒將得出來, 未免胡點亂點."

[Explanation]
Nanming: He clarifies Zhaozhou's original endowment and house style.

南明: 明趙州本分家風.

Tiantong Zhengjue ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and also raised,[1102] "Jingqing asked a monk, 'Zhaozhou's "Go have some tea," what do you make of it?' The monk just left. Jingqing said, 'Someone from Handan learns the Tang gait.'" Xuedou added a comment and said, "This monk is not a man from Handan. Why would he learn the Tang gait?" The master said, "Go have some tea! Go have some tea! He clearly instructed people without saying anything exceptional. His house style was plainly presented and did not use mechanisms. Who says Zhaozhou deceived the cloister chief? How painful! How painful! How painful! People from Handan often learn the Tang gait (i.e., superficially imitate style) and walk as they are supposed to on the roads of Chang'an. They clearly have eyes, but they are like the blind.

1102 For this sermon, see also the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.50c7–15).

Jingqing said, 'Someone from Handan learns the Tang gait.'[1103] Xuedou said, 'This monk is not a man from Handan. Why would he learn the Tang gait?'[1104] Do you understand? Those who rely on their skills (機) lose. Those who deceive their enemy perish."

天童覺, 上堂, 擧此話, 兼擧鏡淸問僧, '趙州喫茶去, 作麽生?' 僧便行. 淸云, '邯鄲學唐步.' 雪竇拈云, '者僧不是邯鄲人, 爲什麽學唐步!' 師云, "喫茶去, 喫茶去. 明明指人無異語. 家風平展沒機關, 誰道趙州謾院主? 苦苦苦! 往往邯鄲學唐步, 恰恰長安道上行, 分明有眼如天瞽. 鏡淸道, '邯鄲學唐步.' 雪竇道, '者僧不是邯鄲人, 爲什麽學唐步?' 還會麽? 登機者失, 欺敵者亡."

[Explanation]

Tiantong: *Someone from Handan learns the Tang gait*: this monk only figured out Zhaozhou's expedient means and does not know Zhaozhou's intent.

This monk is not a man from Handan … : This monk already understood Zhaozhou's intent. What is Zhaozhou's intent? Look at the verse that follows.

Go have some tea: Zhaozhou said, *Go have some tea,* three times, but here only two of them are raised. There is a profound reason behind this. How could it not be to clearly instruct people?

His house style was plainly presented and did not use mechanisms: there is also no room for mechanisms.

Who says Zhaozhou deceived the cloister chief: Tiantong only raised two (of the three) lines because Zhaozhou's intent does not go beyond these two lines. If so, the third *Go have some tea* is functionless. What use is there in calling it deceitful? This is what is meant by not having mechanisms.

How painful! How painful!: this means it is difficult to understand why he

---

1103 The Handan 邯鄲 walk or gait is also mentioned in the *Zhuangzi,* see Watson, *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu,* p. 187.

1104 See the *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.687c9–10).

said, *Go have some tea*, three times.

People from Handan often learn the Tang gait: this means people become fixated on incoherence (沒道理). This is what is meant by a person from Handan.

Walk as they are supposed to on the roads of Chang'an: a plainly presented house style.

They clearly have eyes, but they are like the blind: this means they are mistakenly attached to not having meaning (無意味). If one tries to seek understanding in the lack of coherence one will not tally with Zhaozhou's intent. If one seeks understanding in his instructions, this too eats away at Zhaozhou's intent.

Those who rely on their skills lose: this means Jingqing tried to develop Zhaozhou's intent as the lack of coherence.

Those who deceive their enemy perish: Xuedou supports this monk as someone who gets (Zhaozhou's) instructions.

Relying on skills and deceiving the enemy are at odds with each other. A person from Handan has a small frame. When he learns the Tang gait he loses his own manner of walking.

天童: 邯鄲學唐步者, 這僧一向趙州得其便處會去, 不知趙州意也. 這僧不是邯鄲人云云者, 這僧已會得趙州意, 趙州意作麼生? 看取下面頌. 喫茶去者, 三度喫茶去, 只擧兩句, 深有所以, 豈不是明明指人也! 家風至關者, 亦無機關處也. 誰道趙州云云者, 只擧兩句, 則意不出兩句. 然則第三喫茶, 也無用處, 何用言謾也. 所言沒機關也. 苦苦者, 會三度喫茶也難也. 往往邯鄲云云者, 而人向沒道理處著眼, 是邯鄲也. 恰恰長安云云者, 家風平展也. 分明有眼云云者, 却向無意味處著倒故也. 然則沒道理處會去, 不契趙州意;有指示處會去, 亦食趙州意也. 登機者失者, 鏡淸向沒道理處, 發揚趙州意也. 欺敵者亡者, 雪竇向有指示處, 扶見這僧也. 登機欺敵皆相戰. 須邯鄲人體小, 學唐步失向步也.

Yangshan Xingwei[1105] ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and said,

1105 Yangshan Xingwei 仰山行偉 (1018–1080) is a dharma heir of Huanglong Huinan. He moved to Mt. Yang after Huinan's death.

"The cloister chief does not ask east or west, drinks a cup, and does not know where it came from. Anyone who has had a cup of Zhaozhou's tea must demand a snack since his tea is tasteless. It is not like the scrumptious *jian* tea[1106] of Mt. Huangbo. Therefore our former master Huanglong said, 'Who is willing to drink Zhaozhou's tea?'[1107] Today I briefly exposed my house style and showed it to the great assembly. My house style is very normal. It is simple, straightforward, and does not hide. If you understand, then you understand immediately. If you don't understand, then don't come up with random calculations. Speak! Is this in line with (teachings of) the ancients or not?" He struck the meditation bench once with his staff.

仰山偉, 上堂, 擧此話云, "院主, 不問東西, 喫却一椀, 不知來處. 若是喫着趙州茶者, 須是討藥取下始得, 爲他茶無味. 不似黄蘗建茶, 滋味好喫. 所以, 黃龍先師道, '誰人, 肯喫趙州茶?' 仰山今日, 略露家風, 呈示大衆, 仰山家風事大常, 一言直下不隱藏. 會即, 直下便會取, 不會, 且莫亂商量. 且道! 與古人, 是同是別?" 以拄杖, 擊禪床一下.

[Explanation]

Yangshan: *The cloister chief … does not know where it came from*: all he knows is the tasteless. He does not know the tasteful.

Anyone who has had a cup of Zhaozhou's tea … :his body has been turned around and vital energy made to flow freely.

It is not like the scrumptious Jian tea of Huangbo: this tea is tasteful.

Today I briefly … does not hide: There is no harm in seeing everyone face-to-face.

If you understand … random calculations: even if this is the case, one must still not do so.

1106 Jian tea 建茶 refers to a type of tea leaves grown and prepared for consumption in Fujian. Mt. Huangbo is located in Fujian province.

1107 This is a line from Huanglong Huinan's verse comments on his own three barriers (i.e., Why does my hand look like the Buddha's hand? Why does my leg look like an ass' leg? Wherein lies the conditions of your birth?); see the *Huanglong Huinan chanshi yulu* (T 1993.47.639b28).

仰山: 院主至來處者, 只知無滋味, 不知有滋味也. 若是喫着云云者, 須是轉身通氣也. 黃蘗建茶云云者, 有滋味也. 仰山至不隱藏者, 不妨與一切人相見也. 會即至亂商量者, 雖然如是, 亦不得伊麼去也.

Hanyan Huisheng[1108] entered the cloister,[1109] ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and said, "Great assembly! Zhaozhou brandished a three-foot hair-splitting sword and brandished it all around at the crossroad. No one could match his barbs. But for this reason most people keep their eyes and mouth wide open and have not tried Zhaozhou's tea. In the end what can be done?" After a pause he said, "Go drink some tea."

寒嵓升, 入院上堂, 擧此話云, "大衆! 趙州把三尺吹毛劒, 向十字路頭, 旋轉揮弄, 無有當其鋒者. 然雖如是, 大有人, 目瞪口呿, 不曾得趙州茶喫在. 畢竟作麽生?" 良久云, "喫茶去."

[Explanation]
Hanyan: *Hair-splitting sword*: it cuts each and every thing.
Brandished … at the crossroad: this means he tried to test their skill.

寒巖: 吹毛劒, 則一一斬斷也. 十字路至弄, 則對機之義.

Baiyun Zhibing added a comment, "He placed it right before your eyes. It's been clearly exposed and nothing has been left private. It's been presented to you right in front of your face. Not a single phrase hides anything. 'Were a toad to go into your ear or a poisonous snake to dig into your eyes, at that time, how would you get it?'[1110] I had assumed that the barbarian's beard was

1108 Yanfu 延福 or Hanyan Huisheng 寒嵓慧升 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Yuanwu Keqin's disciple Zhifeng Duanyu 智蓬端裕 (1085–1150). Huisheng served as the abbot of Yanfu Monastery 延福寺 in Quanzhou 泉州, Fujian province.

1109 That is, he became the new abbot of the cloister.

1110 This is a quote from the sayings of Yunmen; see the *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T 1988. 47.556a11–12).

red, but here we have a red-bearded barbarian!"[1111]

白雲昺拈, "當頭按下, 明明獨露無私;覿面相呈, 句句曾無盖覆. 或若蝦蟇, 入你耳朶裏, 毒虵, 鑽你眼睛中, 當伊麽時, 如何委悉? 將謂胡鬚赤, 更有赤鬚胡."

[Explanation]

Baiyun: *He placed it right before your eyes* … :Zhaozhou had a way to test their skill (in *chan*), but he told those who have already been there before to go have some tea and those who have not been there before to go have some tea. Whether they've ever been there before or not he told them to go have some tea.

A *toad* does not have patterns and a *poisonous snake* has a way to stay alive. Ears perceive sound and eyes illuminate everything. We can, then, understand what he meant by these things entering your ears and digging into your eyes.

Therefore he goes on to say, *I had assumed that the barbarian's beard was red, but here we have a red-bearded barbarian.*

白雲: 當頭按下云云者, 趙州各有當其機, 曾到也, 教你喫茶去, 不曾到也, 教伊喫茶去, 曾到不曾到, 教伊喫茶去也. 蝦蟆沒文彩, 毒蛇有活用. 耳朶領納音聲, 眼睛照破一切, 入你耳朶, 鑽你眼睛, 則其意可知. 故下云, 將謂胡鬚云云.

Xinwen Tanfen added a comment, "Zhaozhou uses his mouth to manage human affairs and yet his lips aren't even wet. If a special guest with an eye for the truth were to see him (Zhaozhou) say that, this guest would raise his clasped hands high and say, 'Please don't bother getting up.'"

心聞賁拈, "趙州口行人事, 且無涓滴沾唇. 若是具眼高賓, 見他伊麽道, 但高揖云, '不煩起動.' "

[1111] This is a quote from the sayings of Yunmen; see the *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T 1988. 47.552c11).

[Explanation]
Xinwen: *Yet his lips aren't even wet*: Zhaozhou had never said such a thing. *Please don't bother getting up*: the guest also lacks understanding.

心聞: 且無涓滴云云者, 趙州曾無此語也. 不煩起動者, 賓家, 亦是無理會處.

Case 417.

Zhaozhou's Dog

趙州狗子

[Old case]

Zhaozhou was asked by a monk, "Does a dog also have buddha nature or not?" The master said, "It has (有)." The monk replied, "If it does, why did it enter this bag of flesh?" The master replied, "Because it knows and yet transgressed on purpose." Again, a monk asked, "Does a dog also have buddha nature or not?" The master said, "It does not (無)." The master replied, "All living beings have buddha nature. Why does a dog not have it?" The master said, "Because it still has karmic consciousness."[1112]

趙州因僧問, "狗子還有佛性也無?" 師云, "有." 僧云, "旣有, 爲什麽却撞入者箇皮袋?" 師云, "爲他知而故犯." 又有僧問, "狗子還有佛性也無?" 師云, "無." 僧云, "一切衆生皆有佛性, 狗子爲什麽却無?" 師云, "爲伊有業識在."

[Explanation of the gongan]

Buddha nature: the calculations of Chan monks are diverse and confused. Some say, "There's not a place through which the patch-robed monks everywhere to bore a hole[1113] in Zhaozhou's 'It does not.'" It cannot be said that this is not the case.

1112 For this story, see also the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.17b13–18 and 20a20–24); and *Congrong lu* (T 2004.48.238b25–c1).

1113 For "bore a hole" (*chuanzuo*), see note 77 above.

Generally, each and every saying that the masters of our tradition who've realized their original endowment utter is like an iron mallet without hole for the handle.[1114] Where could you bore a hole? Putting aside the other sayings, public cases that are similar to "It does not" are also innumerable. How could it only be the public cases that are similar? There are many (sayings) with nuances that are also not different. As Weishan said, "All living beings originally do not have buddha nature."[1115]

Again, an ancient worthy was asked by a monk, "What is my buddha nature?" The worthy replied, "Go away! Go away! You do not have buddha nature."[1116] Again, an ancient worthy was once asked by a monk, "What is thusness-like buddha nature?" He answered, "Who has it?"[1117] With regards to other (gongans) you say this and that. With regards to this one why can't you bore a hole? If you can't bore a hole, then did you really understand and bore a hole through the others?

Again, there was a good teacher who said he knew that he had (buddha nature). He told students, "Zhaozhou said, 'Doesn't have it.' This is a hair-splitting sword. And then in a loud voice he said, " 'It does not have it' is right behind you!" Again he said, "Try to understand (what I just said) right here and now."[1118] This will also work, but this is like taking off your shoe and scratching an itchy spot. It bears no relevance. How could it be satisfying to clench the other random sayings between your teeth? If so, what then can be done? Did not the ancient one say, "When he encounters people he exchanges their eyeballs for ass shit." If you've understood "It does not have

---

1114 For the iron mallet without hole for the handle, see note 403 above.

1115 See *Yuanzhou Yangshan Huiji chanshi yulu* 袁州仰山慧寂禪師語錄 (T 47.1990.583a25).

1116 This response is known to have been used to two Chan masters: Guti 古堤 (d.u.); see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 51.2076.270a17–18), and Zhaoti Huilang 招提慧朗 or Dalang 大朗 (d.u.); see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 51.2076.311b9). In this case, Huilang or Dalang seems to be the ancient worthy in question.

1117 This is referring to the conversation between Yanhua Zhiyuan 演化知遠 (d.u.) and Jingguo Shoucheng 淨果守澄 (d.u.); see *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.435a12–13).

1118 Source unknown.

it," then you will understand why he said, "It has." An ancient one at this moment would say, "Chop down the cassia tree in the moon and the clear radiance will necessarily increase."[1119]

(佛性) 禪和家商量紛紜, 有云, '趙州無字, 天下衲僧話頭, 穿鑿無分.' 不道不是. 大凡本分宗師, 所發言句, 一一如無孔鐵鎚, 豈有穿鑿分! 諸餘言句且置, 無字一般公案, 又無數也. 豈徒公案一般! 語勢亦無異地頗多. 如潙山云, '一切衆生, 本無佛性.' 又古德因僧問, '如何是學人佛性?' 云, '去! 去! 汝無佛性.' 又有古德因僧問, '如何是眞如佛性?' 答云, '誰有?' 於彼, 胡說亂說; 於此, 爲什麽穿鑿不得? 旣於此穿鑿不得, 於彼還曾解穿鑿得麽? 又有知識自謂知有, 對學人云, '趙州道無, 是一柄吹毛.' 遂高聲云, '無隨後!' 又云, '直下會取好.' 是則也是, 是隔靴搔痒, 且沒交涉. 自餘駁雜之說, 何足掛齒牙間哉! 然則如之何? 古人豈不云乎? 驢糞逢人換眼珠. 若會得無, 便會得道箇有. 古人, 到這時節道, "斫却月中桂, 清光應更多."

Dahong Baoen's verse

"Has it," "Has it." On that path of "Has it,"
There is a flower and also some wine.
He divides a day's walk into ten,
And watches the southern star hang on the northern dipper from his seat.

大洪恩頌, "有有有路上, 有花兼有酒. 一程分作十程行, 坐看南星懸北斗."

[Explanation]

Dahong: *"Has it," "Has it." etc.*: the phrase *Has it* has *Has it* and has *Doesn't have it*.

1119 According to legend, Wu Gang 吳剛 had offended the gods and as punishment he was condemned to the moon until he could chop down a special cassia tree. The tree, however, grew a new trunk each time it was chopped down. Chopping down the cassia tree in the moon thus refers to an impossible task. See also note 734 above.

There is a flower and also some wine: therefore it is said, *He divides a day's walk into ten.* If so, outside of "has buddha nature" there is no "doesn't have buddha nature."

大洪: 有有云云者, 有句. 有有有無, 所謂有花有酒. 故云, '一程分作十程行也.' 然則有佛性外, 無無佛性也.

Again his verse

"Doesn't have it," "doesn't have it." In that box of "doesn't have it,"
There is neither sword nor text.
"I enter Luoyang three times, but no one recognizes me.
I turn my body around and fly past Dongting lake."[1120]

又頌, "無無無匣中, 無劍又無書. 三入洛陽人不識, 翻身飛過洞庭湖."

[Explanation]

Dahong: *"Doesn't have it," "doesn't have it."*: the phrase *Doesn't have it* doesn't have *Has it* and doesn't have *Doesn't have it.*

There is neither sword nor text: therefore *He enters Luoyang three times, but no one recognizes him*. If so, outside of "doesn't have buddha nature" there is no "has buddha nature."

無無無者, 無句. 無有無無, 所謂無劍無書. 故三入落陽人不識云云. 則無佛性外, 無有佛性.

Again his verse

"Has it" but also "doesn't have it." "Doesn't have it" but also "has it."

[1120] These last two lines are most likely a quote from a poem by Lü Dongbin 呂洞賓; see *Quan Tang shi* 858, 5a.

The hundred-year old ghoul vainly opens its mouth,
A single phrase rumbles like thunder before the wind,
The toad in the well croaking in the middle of the night sounds just like a roar.

又頌, "有復無無復有, 百年妖怪虛開口. 一句當風震若雷, 井蛙半夜同哮吼."

[Explanation]

Dahong: *"Has it" but also "doesn't have it." "Doesn't have it" but also "has it."*: this is the middle way.

"Doesn't have it" but also "has it." "Has it" but also "doesn't have it.": this is the same.

The hundred-year old … opens its mouth: "Has it " and "Doesn't have it" is a ghoul opening its mouth.

A single phrase etcetera: this is a single phrase that is unrelated to neither "Has it" nor "Doesn't have it."

The toad in the well etcetera: this emerged together with the "Has it" phrase and the "Doesn't have it" phrase. It simultaneously illuminates and conceals both phrases.

有復無無復有者, 中間也. 下無復有有復無, 亦同也. 百年至口者, 有無是妖怪開口也. 一句云云者, 不涉有無底一句也. 井蛙云云者, 有句無句, 隨逐而出, 此雙照雙遮也.

Again his verse

"Doesn't have it" but also "has it." "Has it" but also "doesn't have it."
What brought people to come and pay Zihu[1121] a visit?

1121 This refers to Zihu Lizong 子湖利蹤 (800–880). Like Zhaozhou Congshen, Lizong is a dharma heir of Nanquan Puyuan. Since they inherit the same family style, what need, this line is telling us, is there for students to study under both.

Everywhere the style is the same and "doesn't have it" has been said enough times.
The two men rest on a single staff.

又頌,"無復有有復無, 何事人來訪子湖. 千里同風無足道, 一條杖子兩人扶."

[Explanation]

Dahong: *What brought people to come and pay Zihu a visit*: one cannot avoid hurting his body and losing his life. One must, therefore, not pay him a visit.

I enter Luoyang three times: according to Yang Wengong's[1122] *Tanyuan,* "Lü Dongbin practiced fencing techniques and, though he was over a hundred years old, his appearance was that of an infant and his pace was light and fast."[1123] He himself sang, "In the morning I part ways with Baiyue and at night I arrive in San Wu. In my sleeve there's a blue snake with tenacious spirit. I enter Luoyang three times, but no one recognizes me. I turn my body around and fly past Dongting lake." [1124]

何事人來訪子湖者, 未免喪身失命也, 然則不須訪也. 三入落陽. 楊文公, 談花[1125], 呂洞賓有劒術, 年百餘歲, 貌如嬰兒, 行步徑疾, 自有詠云,"朝辭百越暮三吳, 袖裹青蛇膽氣麤. 三入落陽人不識, 翻身飛過洞庭湖."

Qiangfu Benyi's verse [1126]

[1122] This is the famed literatus Yang Yi 楊億 (974–1020). Wengong 文公 is his posthumous title. In 1009, he reedited Daoyuan's 道原 (d.u.) the *Fozu tongcan ji* 佛祖同參集 and published it as the *Jingde chuandeng lu.*

[1123] This story appears not in Yang Yi's *Tanyuan* 談苑, but in Jiang Shaoyu's 江少虞 (fl. twelfth century) *Shishi leiyuan* 事實類苑 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 43, 4a.

[1124] For this verse, see note 1120 above.

[1125] Here, I substitute *yuan* 苑 for *hua* 花.

[1126] For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.236a17–b1).

It has buddha nature, it does not have buddha nature.
The proper becomes crooked and the crooked becomes proper.
Stomp on the moon's (reflection) in the clear pool,[1127]
Break the scale that has no notches.
Burn fire in water,
Drive a stake into the empty sky.[1128]
How could this be likened to the blind tortoise gnawing at a dead snake?[1129]
Keep the jaw tightly closed.

[This master raising this record: "A monk asked Zhaozhou, 'Does a dog have buddha nature or not.' … still has karmic consciousness." Again, a monk asked Xingshan, "Does a dog have Buddha nature or not?" Xingshan replied, "Has it." The monk said, "Does your reverence still have it or not?" Xingshan replied, "I do not have it." The monk said, "All living beings have buddha nature, why does your reverence alone not have it?" Xingshan replied, "I am not all living beings."[1130]]

> 薦福逸頌, "有佛性無佛性, 正却倒倒却正. 踏破澄潭月, 拗折無星秤! 火向水中燃, 橛從空裏釘. 肯類盲龜囓死蛇! 一對牙關緊鼓定."<此師擧錄, 僧問趙州, 狗子還有佛性也無? 至爲有業識在. 又僧問興善, "狗子還有佛性也無?" 善云, "有." 僧云, "和尚還有否?" 善云, "我無." 僧云, "一切衆生皆有佛性, 和尚因何獨無?" 善云, "我非一切衆生.">

1127 Stomping on the reflection of the moon in a clear pool is a metaphor for ridding oneself of illusions; see also *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.417a2); *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.715a4–5); *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.881b3–4) etc.

1128 This analogy is often used to emphasize the paradox of using words to seek the ineffable truth; see Sasaki and Kirchner, *The Record of Linji,* p. 121.

1129 The blind tortoise is a famous metaphor in Buddhism. The chance of being reborn as a human being is said to be as rare as a blind turtle that raises its head above water every one hundred ears putting its head through a yoke that is floating in the great ocean; see the *Za ahan jing* (T 99.2.108c6–15). The dead snake is another common metaphor in Chan writings for an attachment to dead words or a false truth; for instance, see the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.23c28–24a5).

1130 See the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 51.2076.255a18–21).

Baoning Faxiu's verse[1131]

When young he learns and understands but remains in the dark about the course of the tenet,
At old age he is still mired in "has it" and "doesn't have it."
The old Buddha is pure gold—who can discern its color?
In confusion he uses his wit and wisdom to fight hesitation.
Don't hesitate!
Saying "has it" and speaking of "doesn't have it"—it must be him.

> 保寧秀頌, "小年學解昧宗途, 老倒依還滯有無. 古佛純金誰辯色? 惑爲機智競躊躇. 莫躊躇! 話有談無須是渠."

Tiantong Zhengjue's verse

A dog has buddha nature,
A dog does not have buddha nature.
The straight fishhook[1132] is originally for seeking fish that risk their lives,
Chan guests on pilgrimage follow the steam and the scent,
In a rowdy and discombobulated way they make differing comments.
He plainly presents everything and opens a great shop,
Do not think it odd that I did not act with care in the beginning,
(Lin Xiangru) points to a small flaw and takes back the jade annulus,
The king of Qin does not recognize Lin Xiangru.[1133]

> 天童覺頌, "狗子佛性有, 狗子佛性無. 直釣元求負命魚, 逐氣尋香雲水

1131 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.236a9–10). The last two lines do not appear in the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* version.

1132 Here, the straight fishhook is being used as a metaphor for Zhaozhou's dog gongan.

1133 By pointing out a nonexistent flaw in the jade, Lin Xiangru convinced the king of Qin 秦 to return Bian He's jade to his native Zhao 趙. For Bian He's jade, see note 367 above.

客, 嘈嘈雜雜作分疏. 平展演大鋪舒, 莫怪儂家不愼初. 指點瑕疵還奪壁, 奏王不識藺相如."

Again his verse[1134]

Zhaozhou says 'Has it,"
Zhaozhou says "Doesn't have it."
A dog's buddha nature,
The whole world makes differing comments.
Making your face red is not as good as speaking frankly,
His mind was true—do not think his coarse words odd.
The old Chan uncle who lived for seven-hundred day cycles (i.e., Zhaozhou),[1135]
When he encounters people he exchanges their eyeballs for ass shit.

又頌, "趙州道有, 趙州道無, 狗子佛性, 天下分踈. 面赤不如語直, 心眞莫怪言麤. 七百甲子老禪伯, 驢糞逢人換眼珠."

[Explanation]

Tiantong's two verses: Saying *Has it* and saying *Doesn't have it* both are a way of retrieving the jade annulus and exchanging eyeballs for ass shit.

天童二頌, 道有道無, 皆是還奪壁, 驢糞換眼珠.

Fazhen Shouyi's verse[1136]

1134 For this verse, see also the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.17b18–20).

1135 There are about six ritual day cycles (甲子) in one year. There are about 700 day cycles in 116 years. Zhaozhou lived for 119 years (778–897).

1136 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu luanzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.236b6–7).

A dog does not have buddha nature,
A dog has buddha nature.
From the beginning he runs in two directions,
Two barriers cannot be hit with one arrowhead.
Karmic consciousness is like before and it again becomes a dog.

法眞一頌, "狗子佛性無, 狗子佛性有. 從來只向兩頭走, 未能一鏃破雙關, 業識依前還作狗."

Zhenjing Kewen's verse

He says it still has karmic consciousness,
Who says his intent is not deep?
"When the ocean dries up eventually the bottom can be seen,
(But) when a person dies his mind cannot be known."[1137]

眞淨文頌, "言有業識在, 誰云意不深! 海枯終見底, 人死不知心."

Baiyun Fayan's verse[1138]

Zhaozhou exposed his blade,
Its cold frost-like radiance shines brightly,
If you again hesitate in asking him what he means,
He will cut your body in two.

白雲演頌, "趙州露刃劍! 寒霜光燄燄. 更擬問如何, 分身作里段."

[1137] These last two lines are a quote from a poem by Du Xunhe, see note 684 above.

[1138] For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.237a3–4).

Jingshan Zonggao's verse[1139]

When someone asks about the buddha nature of a dog,
Zhaozhou answers, "Doesn't have it."
The barbarian's clan (i.e., Chan lineage) perishes with that answer,
It's as if he was not a great man.

徑山杲頌, "有問狗佛性, 趙州答曰無. 言下滅胡族, 猶爲不丈夫."

Zhu'an Shigui's verse[1140]

He passes by in front of Xuande gate,
As soon as he turns his head he invites disaster.
If you wish for nothing to happen,
Go home and sit inside.

竹庵珪頌, "宣德門前過, 廻頭便招禍. 若要無事時, 且歸屋裏坐."

[Explanation]
Zhu'an: *Xuande gate*: this is a palace gate.

竹菴: 宣德門者, 禁門也.

Yuwang Jiechen's verse

A thousand leagues under the waves fish grow horns,
Atop a ten-thousand fathom high cliff a tiger whistles,
How laughable! Zhaozhou's "It does not have buddha nature."

1139 For this verse, see also the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.851c27–28).

1140 For this verse, see also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.803b6).

But he can still bark at the moon on a clear night.

育王諶頌, "千尋浪底魚生角, 萬仞崖頭虎嘯風. 却笑趙州無佛性! 猶能向月吠晴空."

[Explanation]

Yuwang: The first line gets to the bottom of *has buddha nature*. The second line gets to the bottom of "doesn't have buddha nature." The third line speaks of having buddha nature to counter Zhaozhou's "Doesn't have buddha nature." Therefore having buddha nature is also not having buddha nature. (Without each other) *Has it* and *Doesn't have it* cannot be without comparison and therefore he says, *How laughable!*

Bark at the moon on a clear night: according to an ancient saying, "In the fall dogs bark and in the spring cocks crow."[1141]

育王: 一句, 有佛性到底也, 二句, 無佛性到底也. 三句, 趙州無佛性, 對有佛性言也, 故有佛性, 還是無佛性, 有無未能絶對故, 可笑也. 吠晴空者, 古云, '中秋犬吠, 春日鷄鳴.'

Mi'an Xianjie's verse[1142]

A dog does not have buddha nature.
It kills people and hurts lives,
Cruel in a hundred-thousand ways,
The heretical produces the proper.

密庵傑頌, "狗子無佛性, 殺人便傷命. 楚痛百千般, 因邪却打正."

1141 This expression also appears in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.259c22–24).

1142 For this verses, see also the *Mi'an heshang yulu* (T 1999.47.976c1–2).

Wuweizi's verse

It has been clearly said that a dog does not have buddha nature,
Why is everyone forcibly making conjectures?
Still chasing after lumps of dirt and seeking scents and steam,[1143]
How could they have the awe-inspiring authority to assist Zihu?

無爲子頌, "佛性明言狗子無, 諸方何事强名摸? 尙猶趂塊尋香氣, 豈有威風助紫胡!"

Layman Yuezhai's verse

Zhaozhou fraudulently used the seal of the office of supervisors of agriculture,
The sun sets and the path runs out, so he turns back.
He shoots a tiger that isn't real and (the arrow) quickly sinks all the way to the feathers.
Suddenly a dot made by mistake becomes a fly.[1144]

悅齋居士頌, "趙州倒用司農印, 日暮途窮且逆行. 射虎不眞俄沒羽, 忽然誤點却成蠅."

[Explanation]

Yuezhai: *Suddenly a dot made by mistake becomes a fly*: Cao Pi was painting a screen for Sun Quan and by mistake he made a dot that looked like a fly. Sun Qun thought it was a real fly and raised his hand to shoo it away.[1145]

1143 For the analogy of a dog chapsing after a lump of dirt, see note 810 above.

1144 See the comment on this verse below.

1145 This story appears in the *Lidai minghua ji* 歷代名畫記 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 4, 5a. Cao Pi 曹丕 (187–226) is the first emperor of Western Wei. Sun Quan 孫權 (182–252) is the first emperor of Eastern Wu.

悅齋: 誤點却成蠅者, 曹丕爲孫權畫扇, 誤點成蠅, 權以爲生蠅, 擧手拂之.

Cuiyan Shouzhi added a comment, "He says 'Has it' and says 'Doesn't have it.' Two prizes for one throw of the dice. Now what will you say?"

翠嵓芝拈, "說有說無, 兩彩一賽, 如今作麽生道?"

[Explanation]

Cuiyan: Should one speak with *Has it* and *Doesn't have it* or speak without having recourse to "Has it" and "Doesn't have it"?

翠巖: 卽有無而道耶? 離有無而道耶?

Guangling Xizu[1146] ascended the hall, raised this gongan up to *it still has karmic consciousness.* The master said, "Criticisms of this public case are extremely many in the Chan grove. Some say, 'What kind of a buddha nature does a dog have? The questioner does not have buddha nature.' Others say, 'These were words of sarcasm thrown at him.' And there are still others who stretch their hands out. Again, a certain monk asked Xiu shanzhu, 'Does a dog have buddha nature or not?' Xiu shanzhu replied, 'It has … it knows and yet transgressed on purpose.' Great assembly! If the question is the same, why did Zhaozhou answer, 'It doesn't have it,' and Xiu shanzhu answer, 'It has'?" Someone in the assembly replied, "When the masters of our tradition speak they react according to the circumstances, saying 'it doesn't have it' will do; saying 'it has' will also do. Some say, 'He did not fall into "it has" and "it doesn't have it." He is somewhere in between "it has" and "it doesn't have it."' Others say, 'According to the *Nirvana Sūtra,* the Buddha himself said it has

1146 Lingyin 靈隱 or Guangling Xizu 廣靈希祖 (d.u.), also known as Fozu 佛祖, is a disciple of Huilin Zongben.

buddha nature and also said that it does not have buddha nature.'[1147] And there are still others who say, 'If you make it your own (承當), then you can become the controller (主宰).'[1148] If all these understandings are instances of emotions following calculations about holiness and consciousness sticking to the dusts of dharma, then when they say 'It doesn't have it' they are attached to 'It doesn't have it.' When they say 'It has' they are attached to 'It has.' This is not as good as setting it all aside. If the treasury of the eye of the true dharma is understood with such calculations, what the Patriarch transmitted from the west will be of absolutely no avail and this will, moreover, do old man Zhaozhou and Reverend Xiu shanzhu an injustice. If so, what then?" After a while he replied, "Making your face red is not as good as speaking frankly."[1149]

廣靈祖, 上堂, 擧此話,<至>有業識在, 師云, "此箇公案, 叢林批判甚多. 或云, '狗子討甚佛性? 問者無佛性.' 或云, '是冷語對伊.' 或乃展開兩手. 又有僧問修山主, '狗子還有佛性也無?' 主云, '有.' "<至> 知而故犯, "大衆, 問旣一般, 趙州爲甚答無, 山主爲甚答有? 衆中道, '宗師家出語, 臨時應用, 說無也得, 說有也得.' 或云, '不落有無, 在有無中閒.' 或云, '涅槃經, 佛自說有性, 又說無性.' 或云, '汝但承當取, 自作主宰.' 若惣如此解會, 盡是情存聖量, 識附法塵, 說無時着無, 說有時着有, 不若都盧撥在一邊. 正法眼藏, 若伊麽商量, 祖師西來, 大殺無補, 亦乃屈他趙州老人, 山主和尙. 且如何卽是?" 良久云, "面赤不如語直."

[Explanation]
Guangling: The meaning is identical to Tiantong's two verses.

廣靈: 天童二頌同義

[1147] *Nirvana Sūtra* (T 374.12.521b05).

[1148] The source of this quote is unclear, but a similar idea can be found in the *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.780a26); and also *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.161a1–2).

[1149] This last line is a common expression in Chan writings; for instance, see *Fayan chanshi yulu* (T 1995.47.654b24); *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.63b2–3 and 120b14); *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.896b16) etc.

Baiyun Fayan ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and said,[1150] "Great assembly! What kind of understanding do all of you usually make? I usually just raise, 'It doesn't have it' and rest. If you penetrate this one character (i.e., "doesn't have it" or *wu* 無), no one can do anything to you. How will all of you penetrate it? Is there someone who has already been able to penetrate it? If there is, come out and try to say something. I do not wish you to say 'has it' and also do not wish you to say 'it doesn't have it.' I also do no wish you to say 'neither has nor doesn't have it.' What will you say? Take care of yourselves."

白雲演, 上堂, 擧此話云, "大衆! 你諸人尋常作麽生會? 老僧尋常, 只擧無字便休. 你若透得者一个字, 天下人不奈你何. 你諸人作麽生透? 還有透得徹底麽? 有則出來道看. 我也不要你道有, 也不要你道無, 也不要你道不有不無. 你作麽生道? 珎重!"

[Explanation]

Baiyun: Saying "has it" and "doesn't have it" and saying "neither has nor doesn't have it" are all matters of discriminative consciousness (情識). Branches and shoots grow on top of branches and shoots. How will you transcend this and penetrate through?

白雲: 道有道無, 道不有不無, 皆是情識邊事, 枝蔓上更加枝蔓, 離此如何透得?

Yuwang Fozhi ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and said, "A single drop muddles the thousand rivers. One blow of the hammer opens myriad holes. If you present something before a sound is uttered, not only old man Zhaozhou but also the great treasury of teachings will at once be clarified. If this cannot be done, then like adding hail to snow you will repeatedly add comments." And then he said, "A dog does not have buddha nature—the *qilin* beneath the ocean lets out a great roar; a dog does not have buddha

1150 For this sermon, see also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.445b18–446a4).

nature—pushing away Mt. Sumeru with the tongue. Even though snowflakes cover the mountain peak, the moon is alone as usual in the blue sky. The moon is alone and coral grows on the *jili* tree on Mt. Tiantai.

育王智, 上堂, 擧此話云, "一滴混千江, 一鎚開衆竅. 若向聲前薦得, 不但趙州老人, 一大藏敎, 一時明破. 其或未然, 更向雪上加霜, 重爲注破." 乃云, "狗子佛性有, 海底麒麟大哮吼; 狗子佛性無, 舌頭着須彌盧. 任使雪花封岳頂, 碧天依舊月輪孤. 月輪孤, 天台榔栗長珊瑚."

[Explanation]

Yuwang: *A single drop muddles the thousand rivers*: this means "has buddha nature."

One blow of the hammer opens myriad holes: this means "doesn't have buddha nature."

A dog … a great roar: *ocean* refers to the ocean of wisdom. *Qilin* is an auspicious animal that is both male and female. Elsewhere it is said, "Forget the understanding of awakening and then awakening becomes buddha nature."[1151]

A great roar: this is something that can strike fear in someone and cannot be offended.

A dog … Mt. Sumeru with the tongue: Pushing away Mt. Sumeru with the tongue means one knows the buddha nature that appeared before the mountain. Pushing it away means one did not let it remain the way it is.

Snowflakes cover the mountain peak: high, steep, precipitous, dangerous, and incredibly cold. This is "Doesn't have buddha nature."

Even though: this sets up the next line.

The moon is alone as usual in the blue sky: as before, Buddha nature is evident.

The moon is alone and coral grows on the jili tree on Mt. Tiantai: Mt. Tiantai refers to "Doesn't have buddha nature." Corals refer to "Has buddha nature."

1151 See the *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T 1988.47.559b2–3).

育王: 一滴混千江者, 有佛性也; 一鎚開衆竅者, 無佛性也. 狗子至哮吼者, 海則智之海, 猉獜卽瑞物, 亦雌雄也. 他處云, '忘知於覺, 覺則佛性.' 大哮吼, 則甚可怖畏, 不可犯干也. 狗子至彌盧者, 舌頭著須彌, 則智之山前, 所出佛性也, 著則不存也. 雪花封嶽頂者, 高危峭峻, 寒威威地, 卽無佛性也. 任使者, 復起下文也. 碧天云云者, 依前是佛性更分明也. 天台云云者, 天台則無佛性, 珊瑚則有佛性也.

Zhu'an Shigui ascended the hall. A monk raised and asked about this gongan, "What is its intent?" The master replied, "Bitten by a snake once and you're afraid when you see a snapped rope from a well."[1152]

竹庵珪, 上堂, 僧擧問此話, "意旨如何?" 師云, "一度着蛇咬,怕見斷井索."

[Explanation]

Zhu'an: If you have doubt about "Has buddha nature," you cannot but have doubt about "Doesn't have buddha nature." If you don't have doubt about "Has buddha nature," then you can get "Doesn't have buddha nature."

竹菴: 有佛性處有疑, 無佛性處亦不無疑也. 若有佛性處無疑, 可得無佛性.

1152 For this comment, see also the *Wudeng huiyuan* (XZJ 138.777a11–12).

Case 429.
Zhaozhou's "Go Wash Your Bowl!"
趙州洗鉢

[Old case]
Zhaozhou was asked by a monk, "I just entered the Chan grove and I beg the master to give me instruction." The master said, "Have you had your rice gruel yet?" The monk replied, "I had the rice gruel." The master said, "Go wash your bowl!" The monk had a flash of great awakening.[1153]

趙州因僧問, "學人乍入叢林, 乞師指示." 師云, "喫粥了也未?" 僧云, "喫粥了." 師云, "洗鉢盂去!" 僧豁然大悟.

[Explanation of the gongan]
Just entered the Chan grove *and I beg the master to give me instruction*: when a student with a beginner's mind first enters the Chan grove he has sincerity and resolve but can't find the proper entry point.

Have you had your rice gruel yet: Wansong (Xingxiu) said, "When food comes open your mouth wide. When sleep comes close your eyes. When you put your shoes on you wriggle your heels and when you wash your face you touch your nose. At that moment if you lose the point of the story (話頭) and look for it somewhere else in the deep night with a lamp, then when

1153 For this story, see also the *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T 1988.47.554b16–19); *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.54a18–20); *Congrong lu* (T 2004.48.253a24–26); *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 118.8a6–7); *Wumen guan* (T 2005.48.293c27–29); *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.353b11–15) etc.

will you be able to mutually resonate with it?"[1154] These words of Wansong get Zhaozhou into trouble and mixes mud with water. Again, an ancient one said, "Layman Chaoran[1155] offered gruel to the dragons and elephants[1156] in one hall. After the meal they hung their bowls. How wonderful is the model of behavior that came from the West!"[1157] These words of the ancient one (i.e., Dahui) drown other students and cause them to make understandings about doing nothing (無事). If this was the case, what was Zhaozhou's intent? Was there instruction or no instruction?

The monk had a flash of great awakening: did he have awakening or did he not have awakening? What did he realize?

> 乍入叢林乞師指示者, 初心學人, 創入叢林, 存誠堅確, 正覓入頭處不得也. 喫粥云云者, 萬松云, "飯來張口, 睡來合眼. 鞋時摸着脚跟, 洗面處拾得鼻孔. 那時蹉却話頭, 把火深夜別覓, 何時得相應去哉!" 萬松伊麼道, 帶累趙州, 和泥合水. 又古人云, "超然居士設粥, 供養一堂龍象. 喫了掛起鉢盂云,[1158] 好箇西來榜樣!" 古人伊麼道, 沒他學者, 作無事會. 然則趙州意作麼生? 有指示耶, 無指示耶? 僧豁然大悟者, 有悟無悟? 悟箇什麼?

Nanming Faquan's verse

When done with the rice gruel, go wash your bowl,
Successfully shooting the willow and also splitting the arrow end in two.[1159]
A gust of the wind in dawn blows over the pond,

[1154] See the *Congrong lu* (T 2004.48.253a21–23).

[1155] Layman Chaoran refers to Zhao Lingjing 趙令衿 (d. 1158), whose style name was Biaozhi 表之. He was a student of Yuanwu Keqin and composed the posthumous biography of Hongzhi Zhengjue.

[1156] Dragons and elephants is another word for great Chan masters; see the *Zuting shiyuan* (XZJ 113.20a16–17).

[1157] See the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.817c3–4).

[1158] I follow the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* and leave this character out in my translation.

[1159] This is an allusion to a famous story from the *Zhanguo ce* 戰國策. When Yang Youji 養由基 was

The autumn lotus takes off its rosy clothes[1160] in the undulating waves.

> 南明泉頌, "喫粥了去洗鉢, 善射穿楊復劈筈. 一陣曉風池上來, 秋蓮浪擺紅衣脫."

[Explanation]

Nanming: The second line means Zhaozhou did not erroneously fire an arrow. The next two lines means the beginning-less ignorance that this monk had has been cleared up on that spot.

南明: 二句, 趙州箭不虛發. 下這僧無始無明, 當下消釋.

Tianfu Benyi's verse[1161]

He just entered the Chan grove and begs for instruction,
The gate of great giving is opened and nothing is held back,
Often people who received prediction (of enlightenment) on Vulture Peak in the distant past,
Never took these steps (at the beginning).

> 薦福逸頌, "乍入叢林乞指示, 大施門開無擁滯. 往往靈山得記人, 未有如斯箇次第."

Tiantong Zhengjue's verse[1162]

---

challenged to shoot three leaves from a hundred paces away he successfully shot all three. This is the source of the idiom, "hitting the target with every shot" (*baifa baizhong* 百發百中); see the *Zhanguo ce* (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 2, 5.

1160 "Rosy clothes" (*hongyi* 紅衣) is also another name for lotus leaves; for instance, see the *Quan Tang shi* 627, 5a.

1161 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.234a8–9).

1162 For this verse, see also the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.22a15–16).

Once he was done with his rice gruel he was commanded to wash his bowl,
He had a flash of (realization) and naturally tallied with his mind ground,
But you guests of the Chan grove today who have investigated enough (gongans),
Speak! Have you had any awakenings so far or not?

天童覺頌, "粥罷令教洗鉢盂, 豁然心地自相符. 而今叅飽叢林客! 且道其間有悟無?"

[Explanation]
Tiantong's first verse: One must attain awakening today.

天童初頌: 須是今日悟得, 始得.

Again his verse[1163]

After the rice gruel, go wash your bowl,
Achieving perfection according to the law—(he followed) proper rules.
How pitiful! The Duke of She was afraid of a real dragon,[1164]
He thought it stranger that the son of Xie was riding a ferocious tiger.[1165]
Fundamentally an eternal principle and true words,[1166]
This monk still asked how to (reach) awakening.

1163 For this verse, see also the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.54a20–23).

1164 This is a reference to the famous story of the high minister of Chu 楚 and the Duke of She 葉公, Zi Gao 子高, who liked images of dragons. Curious, a real dragon tried to take a look at the images. The duke saw the dragon and lost his senses in fear. See Liu Xiang's 劉向 *Xin xu* 新序 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 5.16b–17a.

1165 Son of Xie here could be referring to Xuansha Shibei whose surname was Xie and was often associated with fishing and called the third son of Xie (*Xie sanlang* 謝三郎); see the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.343c27–28); and *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.842c24).

1166 That is, "Go wash your bowls."

Since the beginning his nose sticks far out,
There is no need to make any arrangements, as it will stay where it is.

> 又頌, "喫粥了洗鉢去, 法爾圓成正規矩. 可憐葉氏怕眞龍, 却怪謝郎騎猛虎. 本常理眞實語, 這僧且問如何悟. 從來鼻孔大頭垂, 不用安排兮自着處所."

[Explanation]
Next verse: If it is a fundamentally an eternal principle, why must one attain awakening today?

次頌: 旣是本常理, 何必今日悟得.

Again his verse

Hearing of the hero struggling at war,
It has become difficult to walk on the crossroads in the four directions,
But today I tread on the roads of Chang'an,
Only then did I believe that the country has enjoyed great peace for quite a while.

> 又頌, "聞說英雄苦戰爭, 四方歧路自難行. 而今踏着長安道, 始信邦家久太平."

[Explanation]
The last verse: *The first two lines*: calculation about being awakened and not being awakened is a hero's war and a crossroad difficult to pass.

But today I tread on the roads of Chang'an: attaining awakening from today on.

Only then did I believe etcetera: great peace from the beginning. This includes the meaning of the first two lines.

後頌: 前句, 有悟無悟商量, 是英雄戰爭, 歧路難通也. 而今踏着長安道者, 從今日悟去也. 始信云云者, 本自太平, 兼前二義.

Huilin Desun's verse

After the rice gruel, he is instructed to wash his bowl,
The mind of a beginner is often rough,
Even if he at this point clearly understands,
He has already not been a great man his whole life.[1167]

> 慧林遜頌, "粥後令教洗鉢盂, 初[1168]心往往便心麤. 直饒到此分明了, 已是平生不丈夫."

Fazhen Shouyi's verse[1169]

Just entered the Chan grove and laid out a question,
What was the intent behind Zhaozhou's instruction?
He didn't leave a trace—who could discern (his intent)?
After the rice gruel, he was instructed to wash his bowl.

> 法眞一頌, "乍入叢林伸一問, 趙州指示意何如? 不留朕跡誰能辨! 粥了令教洗鉢盂."

[1167] For this verse, see the *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.382a5–6); and also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.233b18–234a1).

[1168] The *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* verse, like the *Seonmun yeomsong*, has *chu* 初, but the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* has *cu* 麤 ("rough").

[1169] There is a similar verse by Huanglong Huinan's dharma heir Sanzu Fazong 三祖法宗 (d.u.) in the *Chanlin leiju* (XZJ 117.212a7–9):

> Just entered the Chan grove and laid out a question
> After you wash your bowls what more is there to doubt?
> As usual the official road is not twisting and turning
> For what reason do we not see the traveler return?
>
> 乍入叢林伸一問 鉢盂洗却更何疑 從前官路無迂曲 底事遊人不見歸

Chongsheng Yuangong's verse

Just entered the Chan grove and begging the master for instruction,
Zhaozhou opens his mouth, "Have you had your rice gruel yet?"
He already had his rice gruel—wealthy in many different ways,
"Go wash your bowl"—perfect for making you doze off.

> 崇勝珙頌, "乍入叢林兮, 乞師指示. 趙州開口兮, 喫粥了未. 喫粥旣了兮, 千般富貴. 洗鉢盂去兮, 正好瞌睡."

Muan Fachong's verse

The rice gruel is over and you must wash your bowls,
Do not neglect everyday actions.
If you say you've attained awakening and know its ins and outs,
You'll laugh at the blue-eyed barbarian who came from the West.

> 牧庵忠頌, "粥罷當須洗鉢盂, 尋常受用莫相辜. 若言悟去知端的, 笑殺西來碧眼胡."

Mi'an Xianjie's verse[1170]

After the rice gruel he was instructed to go wash his bowls,
A bottomless iron boat needs to be held up by someone,
Hoist the sail up high and ride the wind,
Slice the ocean and you will certainly become a great man.

> 密庵傑頌, "粥了令教洗鉢盂, 鐵舡無底要人扶. 片帆高掛乘風便, 截海須還大丈夫."

[1170] For this verse, see the *Mi'an heshang yulu* 密菴和尚語錄 (T 1999.47.976c7–8); and also *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.235a4–5).

Wuweizi's verse[1171]

After you are done eating the rice gruel, go wash your bowls,
When did he ever point out the path to Caoxi?
You lie about practicing in the assembly for thirty years,
You remember how to lay the mat out but forgot how to use your chopsticks.[1172]

> 無爲子頌, "喫粥了洗鉢去, 何曾指示曹溪路? 謾言隨衆三十年. 記得展單忘却筯."

Layman Yuezhai's verse

After the rice gruel, (Zhaozhou) instructed him to wash his bowls,
Ordering someone to remember the perch of Chu River,
The color of the Wuchang willow is so vibrant,[1173]
Is this comparable to the snow falling at night in Shanyin or not?[1174]

> 悅齋居士頌, "粥了教伊洗鉢盂, 令人還憶楚江鱸. 武昌柳色今如許, 似得山陰雪夜無?"

1171 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.234a12–13).

1172 Here, I substitute *zhu* 筯 ("chopsticks") for *jin* 筋 ("muscule").

1173 The willow of Wuchang, referring to a willow owned by the state, is an allusion to a story about a man named Xia Shi 夏施 who had to apologize for stealing a willow that grew near the western gate of Wuchang and replanting it near the gate of his own home; see *Jin shu* 晉書 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 66, 21.

1174 The snow falling at night in Shanyin 山陰 (Zhejiang province) is an allusion to the famous story of Wang Xizhi 王羲之 (303–361) boarding a small boat to see his friend Dai Kui 戴逵 (d. 395; style name Andao 安道) on a snowy night in Shanyin; see the *Shishuo xinyu* 世說新語 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) volume 2A 巻下之上, 56. See Richard Mather's trans and annotation, *Shih-shuo Hsin-yu: A New Account of Tales of the World* (Minneapolis: Minnesota University Press, 1976).

Yunmen added a comment, "Speak! Was there instruction or no instruction? If you say there was, then what did Zhaozhou tell him? If you say there wasn't, on what basis will this monk attain awakening?"[1175]

雲門偃拈 "且道! 有指示無指示? 若言有, 趙州向伊道箇什麽? 若言無, 者僧因甚悟去?"

[Explanation]

Yunmen: If you say there was instruction, Zhaozhou originally never said such words. If you say there was no such instruction, the monk did attain awakening then how could there have been no instruction?

雲門: 若言有指示, 趙州元無此語; 若言無指示, 這僧悟去, 豈無指示處!

Xuedou Chongxian added a comment,[1176] "I will not draw legs on a snake like Yunmen. I will tell you directly. The question is like worms eating away at a tree—the answer is a coincidence that became a text.[1177] Although this is the case, it blinded a patch-robed monk. How will he avoid committing this sin? Do all of you wish to understand? I return Zhaozhou's 'Have you had your rice gruel yet?' And I add a comment that monk's 'I had the rice gruel.' I give you the staff and return to the hall."

雪竇顯拈, "我不似雲門爲蛇畫足, 直言向你道. 問者, 如蟲蝕木, 答者, 偶爾成文. 然雖與麽, 瞎却衲僧眼, 作麽生免得此過? 諸仁者, 要會麽? 還爾趙州喫粥未, 拈却者僧喫粥了. 雪竇, 與你拄杖子歸堂."

[Explanation]

1175 For this comment, see also the *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.532a6–7).

1176 For this comment, see also the *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.683a22–26).

1177 This is an allusion to a passage from the *Nirvana Sūtra* (T 374.12.378b27–28) that speaks of bugs eating a tree and leaving traces that look like words behind. The bugs, the *sūtra* tells us, do so without knowing these words.

Xuedou: Yunmen's "was there instruction or no instruction" and this monk's "had awakening or didn't have awakening" are all superfluous words.

雪竇: 雲門有指示無指示, 這僧有悟無悟, 皆是剩語也.

Yunfeng Wenyue added a comment,[1178] "What Yunmen said is just like a eunuch growing a beard and drawing legs on a snake. I would not have done so. This monk, who attained awakening that way, entered hell as fast as an arrow."

雲峯悅拈, "雲門與麼道, 大似爲黄門栽鬚, 與蛇畫足. 雲峯則不然. 這僧伊麼悟去, 入地獄如箭射."

[Explanation]

Yunfeng: *Eunuch growing a beard*: this refers to the fact that Zhaozhou did not offer instruction, which lacked content.

Drawing legs on a snake: this refers to the fact that Zhaozhou did offer instruction and an instance of superfluousness.

The illnesses are the same.

Entered hell etcetera: pulled it out from the root.

雲峯: 黄門栽鬚者, 謂趙州無指示, 是欠事也; 與蛇畫足者, 謂趙州有指示, 是剩法, 其病一也. 入地獄云云者, 和根拔去也.

Huanglong Sixin raised this gongan and then raised Yunmen and Yunfeng's comment. The master said,[1179] "Although Yunmen and Cuiyan[1180]

1178 For this comment, see the *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.532a12–13); and also the *Baojue Zuxin chanshi yulu* (XZJ 120.232b15–17). In both of these versions the order of "a eunuch growing a beard" and "drawing legs on a snake" are reversed.

1179 For this sermon, see also the *Baojue Zuxin chanshi yulu* (XZJ 120.232.b17–233a2).

1180 Cuiyan refers to Yunfeng Wenyue. I suspect the *Seonmun yeomsong* kept the name Cuiyan despite the inconsistency because it simply copied the *Baojue Zuxin chanshi yulu* or a related text.

skillfully took away from the strong and reinforced the weak, abandoned the wealthy and followed the poor, in the end they were unable to bring peace to the family and establish the country." He then asked a monk, "But what about the chief seat who when morning comes will eat rice gruel and also wash his bowls? Right now are you deluded or awakened?" That monk made obeisance and stood up. The master call him, "Come closer!" The monk came closer. "I have a fly whisk for you to take back with you."

黄龍心, 擧此話, 連擧雲門雲峯拈. 師云, "雲門翠嵓, 雖則善能鋤强輔弱, 捨富從貧, 要且, 不能安家立國." 乃問僧, "只如上座, 朝來亦喫粥亦洗鉢, 卽今是迷是悟?" 其僧禮拜起, 師喚 "近前!" 僧近前, " 我有一柄拂子, 與你歸去."

[Explanation]

Huanglong: *Took away from the strong and reinforced the weak*: this is Yunmen's intent.

Abandoned the wealthy and followed the poor: this is Cuiyan's intent.

Neither (Yunmen nor Cuiyan) attained the state of do nothing (無事). Therefore it is said, *bring peace to the family and establish the country.*

Eat rice gruel and also wash his bowls … are you deluded or awakened: neither deluded nor awakened. Great peace from the beginning.

A fly whisk: his actions are worthy.

黄龍: 鋤强輔弱者, 雲門意也: 捨富從貧者, 翠巖意也. 皆未得無事, 故云, '不能安家立國' 也. 喫粥洗鉢是迷是悟者, 無迷無悟, 本自太平也. 一柄拂子者, 受用有分.

Zhaxi Riyi added a comment,[1181] "Zhaozhou not only blinded that monk but also made the Chan groves in the north and the south all devise strategies for life (活計) in their bowls. At that time had he said, *Go have some tea,* everything would be fine, but he did not know how to say that."

1181 For this comment, see also the *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.364a15–17).

雪溪益拈,"趙州不唯瞎却者僧眼, 直得南北叢林, 盡向鉢盂上作活計. 當時幸好箇喫茶去, 不會道得."

[Explanation]

Zhaxi: *Zhaozhou not only* etcetera: it was as if there was an instruction.

'Go have some tea': neither deluded nor awakened. Great peace from the beginning.

雪溪: 趙州不唯云云者, 似有指示處故也. 喫茶去者, 無迷無悟, 本自太平也.

Again, he ascended the hall and said, "The chiliocosm is all one monastery. What Jiangxi or Lingnan is there to speak of? Pass morning gruel and noon feast, both times, as you wish. Especially for those of you who don't understand I will offer a consultation." He then raised this gongan and said, "Old man Zhaohzou knew only one side (of the truth) and not the other. If that monk still had leftover food or unfinished rice gruel, how then could he wash (his bowls)? Although this is the case, all of you must stack (your bowls) together and keep them clean. When you encounter Zhaozhou don't let him pour slop all over you. What a pity! *Can* (investigate)!"

又上堂云,"大千都是箇伽藍, 說甚江西與嶺南? 齋粥二時隨分過, 未明特地爲君叅." 乃擧此話云,"趙州老漢, 只知其一,未知其二. 忽若這僧, 有喫不盡底飯, 喫不了底粥, 又作麼生洗? 然雖如是, 諸人也須併疊, 敎潔淨, 始得. 莫敎撞着趙州, 被伊惡水澆却也, 可惜許!" <叅!>

[Explanation]

Again, he ascended the hall: It seems like Zhaozhou said what we said because there was leftover rice gruel. One must wash it clean. If not, one cannot prevent Zhaozhou from pouring slop all over you.

又上堂: 趙州伊麼道, 似有喫不盡底粥飯故也. 須洗得淨潔, 若不如是, 未免被趙州惡水澆却.

Foyan Qingyuan ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and said,[1182] "Great assembly! This morning I had my rice gruel and also washed my bowls and yet I am not awakened. If I am a good teacher (善知識), why am I not enlightened? Do you understand? How could one mistake the clattering pots for the bell? One can never point to a deer and call it a horse. A good person finds it difficult to transgress. Quicksilver never stays still. Calmly and suddenly see through it and surely in an instant you'll let it go."

佛眼遠, 上堂, 擧此話云, "大衆, 山僧今朝, 喫粥也洗鉢盂, 只是不悟. 旣是爲善知識, 爲什麽却不悟? 還會麽? 豈可喚鍾作甕! 終不指鹿爲馬. 善人難犯, 水銀無假. 冷地忽然覷破, 管取一時放下."

[Explanation]

Foyan: *This morning I had my rice gruel* etcetera: neither deluded nor awakened. The intent is the same as Zhaxi above.

佛眼: 山僧今朝喫粥云云者, 無迷無悟, 上雪溪意同.

Again, he ascended the hall and said,[1183] "Zhaozhou said 'Go wash your bowl' and that monk had a flash of insight and returned. Niaoke blew away some down in his coat and the attendant understood his intent on the spot.[1184] Did (Niaoke) clarify it for him? Or did he expose it for him? He neither clarified nor exposed it for him. Great assembly! Do you understand? Why do you not understand the (Buddha) nature you originally possess?"

1182 For this sermon, see the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.522a15–18); and also *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.369b4–7).

1183 For this sermon, see also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.523b14–17).

1184 This story is found in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.230b19–21); see also Case 747 of the *Seonmun yeomsong*. Chan master Niaoke Daolin 鳥窠道林 (741–824) used the down in his coat as a metaphor for the ubiquity of the Dharma.

又上堂云, "趙州道箇洗鉢去, 其僧豁爾知歸; 鳥窠吹起布毛. 侍者當下得旨. 爲復是就伊明破? 爲復是吐露向伊? 亦不是就伊明破, 亦不是吐露向伊. 大衆, 會麽? 本有之性, 爲什麽不會?"

[Explanation]

Again, he ascended the hall: *Did (Niaoke) clarify it for him*: he simply pointed out what the monk originally possesses.

Or did he expose it for him: today it is not that there was no instruction.

He neither clarified nor etcetera: neither one's original endowment nor the present moment.

Why do you not understand the (Buddha) nature you originally possess: although he originally possesses it, one must rely on what one newly learns and understand it. If so, then he had both clarified and exposed it for him.

又上堂: 就伊明破者, 但指出這僧本有之事也. 吐露向伊者, 今日不無指示也. 亦不是就伊明破云云者, 非本分非今時也. 本有之性云云者, 雖本有, 必借新熏而會得也. 然則亦是就伊明破, 亦是吐露向伊.

Changling Shouzhuo ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and said,[1185] "All of you, every one of you, eat rice gruel. Each of you wash your bowls. What Zhaozhou said and what this monk realized—do you understand it or not? If a patch-robed monk steps up and says, 'Always when I send someone off I recall the time that I left home.'[1186] I (Tianning) would tell him, 'It is

1185 For this sermon, see also the *Changling Shouzhuo chanshi yulu* (XZJ 120.317b14–17).

1186 This is quote from Zhang Ji's 張籍 (766?–ca. 830) poem, see *Quan Tang shi* 384, 1. The following translation of Zhang Ji's poem is borrowed from Stephen Owen, *The Late Tang: Chinese Poetry of the Mid-Ninth Century (827–860)* (Cambridge: Harvard University Asia Center, 2006), pp. 99–10:

Traveler's Thoughts in Jibei
Every day I gaze toward my homeland
Singing in vain the "White Linen" song
And always when I send someone off

easy to speak consistently but difficult to maintain unyielding rectitude.'"[1187]

長靈卓, 上堂, 擧此話云, "汝等諸人, 早來人人喫粥, 各各洗鉢盂, 趙州伊麽道, 這僧伊麽省, 還會得也未? 忽有个衲僧出來道, '長因送客處, 記得別家時.' 天寧向伊道, '易開終始口, 難保歲寒心.'

[Explanation]

Changling: *If you stay long at a place* etcetera: because of what Zhaozhou said so-and-so was able to recall how he used to practice everyday.

It is easy to speak consistently etcetera: if Zhaozhou's intent is understood this way, there may be realization but not unyielding rectitude.

長靈: 長因送客處云云者, 因趙州語, 記得某甲舊時行李處也. 易開終始口云云者, 雖然伊麽會趙州意, 若有省得處, 非歲寒心也.

Yunmen Zonggao raised this gongan and then raised Yunmen and Cuiyan's comment. The master said, "Old man Yunmen is just like the Asura king who causes commotion in all the oceans of affliction in the great cities of the three realms.[1188] Afterwards he let out a shout and said, "Why all this

---

I recall the time that I left home
Losing heart, I often talk to myself
The degree of my sorrow known to myself alone
Willows outside the pavilion gate
Have all their southward branches broken

薊北旅思 日日望鄉國 空謌白苧詞 長因送人處 憶得別家時 失意還獨語 多愁祇自知 客亭門外柳 折盡向南枝

[1187] "Unyielding rectitude" (Ch. *suihanxin* 歲寒心) is an allusion to a passage from the *Analects;* see *Analects* 9.28: "Only when the cold season comes is the point brought home that the pine and the cypress are the last to lose their leaves." This term can also be found in a poem by Zhang Jiuling 張九齡 (678–740); see *Quan Tang shi* 47, 14a. Zhang sings of the red oranges (Ch. *danju* 丹橘) that grow south of the Yangzi and whose leaves stay green in the winter because of their unyielding rectitude.

[1188] This is a reference borrowed from the *Huayan jing* (T 279.10.359c13).

sleep talking?"[1189] Again, he said, "Cuiyan, although he was able reach back for a golden arrowhead, flip his body around, and fire the bow decorated with horns, what can be done about missing Yunmen!"

雲門杲, 擧此話, 連擧雲門翠嵓拈, 師云, "雲門老漢, 大似阿脩羅王, 耗[1190]動三有大城諸煩惱海." 隨後喝云, "寐語, 作什麼!" 復云, "翠嵓, 雖善背手抽金鏃, 飜身控角弓, 爭奈蹉過雲門何!"

[Explanation]

Yunmen: *Asura king* etcetera: there is no beginning-less ignorance that has not been completely purified.

Why all this sleep talking etcetera: there are still marks. It is like trying to cover your ears and steal a bell.[1191]

Although he was able reach back etcetera: Cuiyuan also ran rapidly in the vast and expansive (truth) and was thus out of energy.

雲門: 阿脩羅王云云者, 無始無明, 無不淨盡也. 寐語作什麽云云者, 猶有痕朕, 如掩耳偸香[1192]也. 雖善背手云云者, 翠巖, 亦騖於虛遠, 而無氣力也.

Again, he ascended the hall and raised this gongan: "Does he have the ins and outs? Yunmen said, 'Now say, were there instructions … why is he enlightened?' " The master again said, 'If Zhaozhou and that monk do not get Yunmen, then for their whole lives they will be humiliated/wronged. And now everwhere there are blind fellows who frequently (think) they fully understand the gongan of wash your bowl."

1189 Accusing someone of sleep talking is often associated with a famous story from the teachings of Linji Yixuan; see *Zhenzhou Linji Huizhao chanshi yulu* (T 1985.47.505a14–15); and also Sasaki and Kirchner, *The Record of Linji,* p. 318.

1190 I substitute *nao* 撓 for *hao* 耗.

1191 See note 110 above.

1192 I substitute *ling* 鈴 for *xiang* 香.

又上堂, 擧此話云, "還端的也無? 雲門云, '且道! 有指示, 至爲甚悟去.' " 師復云, "趙州與這僧, 若不得雲門, 一生受屈. 而今諸方, 有一種瞎漢, 往往盡作洗鉢盂話會了."

[Explanation]

Again, he ascended the hall: Because Yunmen knew how to play around with views.

又上堂: 雲門, 解弄見故也.

Again, he raised this gongan and said,[1193] "Comments on the key point offered by teachers everywhere are extremely many and the interlineal notes are also not few. But there has never been a single person who has clearly explained it away. Today for all of you I will clearly explain it away. After you're done with rice gruel, wash your bowls. Speak! Is there an instruction here or not? Black soyabeans have always been good for making soya paste and nuns will certainly become abbesses."

又擧此話云, "諸方拈掇甚多, 下注脚亦不小, 未曾有一人, 分明說破. 妙喜今日爲諸人, 分明說破. 喫粥了, 便洗鉢盂, 且道! 還曾指示無? 黑豆從來好合醬, 比丘尼定是師姑."

[Explanation]

Again, he raised: There's nothing special about today's instruction. It is simply a matter of that monk's original endowment. It is not that there was no instruction. Nor is it the case that there was no awakening. The previous ascending the hall sermon originally has no instruction. Nor does it induce awakening. The ascending the hall (formal) sermon before that encompasses both intents.

1193 For this teaching, see also the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.834b12–16).

又擧: 今日指示, 別無特地, 只是這僧分上事也. 此不無指示, 亦不無悟處. 前上堂, 本無指示, 亦無悟處. 前前上堂, 兼後二意也.

Yuwang Jiechen added a comment, "That monk ate rice gruel but never had a mouth. He washed his bowls but never had hands. If he had hands why did he not destroy them? If he had a mouth why did he not spit it out? If he did not spit it out and did not destroy them, how did he attain awakening?"

育王諶拈, "者僧, 喫粥不曾有口, 洗鉢不曾有手. 有手何不打破? 有口何不吐却? 旣不吐却, 又不打破, 因甚悟去?"

[Explanation]

Yuwang: One must destroy the bowls and also spit out the rice gruel. Only then can one (attain awakening). If not, what are we calling awakening? But doing this will not do either.

育王: 也須打破洗地鉢, 也須吐却喫地粥, 方可卽, 不然, 何名有悟? 伊麼又却不是.

Baiyun Zhibing raised this gongan and then raised Yunmen and Xuedou's comment. The master said, "Yunmen and Xuedou put the true command into full force and destroyed the cage. They tried to brush away the traces but left marks behind; they wished to conceal but exposed even more.[1194] I (Nanhua) say, even if this monk did attain awakening all he was awakened to was Zhaozhou's second handout. A patch-robed monk with eyes that penetrated (the truth) will certainly not echo what others have said."

白雲昞, 擧此話, 連擧雲門雪竇拈, 師云, "雲門雪竇, 全提正令, 打破羅籠, 拂迹成

[1194] For this statement, see also the *Congrong lu* (T 2004.48.234b8); *Konggu ji* (XZJ 117.546b3) *Qingyi lu* (XZJ 117.834a15–16); *Chanlin leiju* (XZJ 117.71a6). Hongzhi Zhengjue and Foyan Qingyuan appear to have often used this statement.

痕, 欲隱彌露. 南華道, 者僧雖然悟去, 只悟得趙州第二杓. 具透開眼底衲子, 必不雷同."

[Explanation]

Baiyun: Zhaozhou's intent is simply limitless. Do not take the words uttered by the monk to Zhaozhou for granted. Even if you transcend this and attain awakening, this too is just a second handout. One must penetrate through (even this).

白雲: 趙州意直得無限, 莫道這僧向趙州言句裏承當. 直饒離此而悟得, 亦是第二杓也. 然則趙州意如何? 也須透得, 始得.

Xinwen Tanfen ascended the hall and said, "After you eat the rice gruel, go wash your bowl. Have you ever seen this way? After you eat the rice gruel, go wash your bowl. What else have you seen? If you wish to mutually resonate (with the truth) raise only what you've seen for comment. But even if you raise what you've seen for comment, what then? Do you wish to know? Right now Zhaozhou is dancing in the eyes of Xitang. Before he realizes it (Zhaozhou) comes out of the chief seat's ear. But now he shilly-shallies on the prior's mind. Suddenly (Xinwen) raised his whisk and said, "I've (Changlu) caught him here for you today. Each of you please take a quick look! Don't let him out of your sight as before!"

心聞賁, 上堂云, "喫粥了洗鉢盂去, 還曾恁麽見得也未? 喫粥了洗鉢盂去, 又見个什麽? 要得相應, 但拈了見底. 只如拈了見, 又作麽生? 要會麽? 趙州卽今, 在西堂眼睛裏跳. 不覺,又從首座耳根裏出, 而今又在監院心頭上, 遅遅疑疑地." 驀堅起拂子云, "長蘆爲你擒在這裏了也. 各請急着眼看, 莫敎依舊走失!"

[Explanation]

Xinwen: *After you eat the rice gruel … ever seen this way*: one must understand Zhaozhou's intent.

After you eat the rice gruel … else have you seen: if you apprehend it then

that isn't it.

If you wish to mutually resonate etcetera: being equipped with both the ability to ignore and confront (the truth)—this is not Zhaozhou's intent.

Zhaozhou is dancing in the eyes of Xitang etcetera: Xitang holds the position of the Real (正位). Eyes are for illuminating something. A chief seat is someone who holds a position in the eastern (hall). Ears are for perceiving sound. A prior is someone who supervises all matters at a cloister. The mind belongs to the center. It enters and exists according to what the person sees.

He shilly-shallies: if you again sit on top of the abbot's head, how could you understand?

Suddenly (Xinwen) raised his whisk: this is the original position of Zhaozhou.

Each of you please etcetera: if you transcend the ability to ignore and confront (the truth), on that spot you will have an insight.

心聞: 喫粥了至也未者, 也須會取趙州意, 始得. 喫粥了至什麽者, 認着則不是也. 要得相應云云者, 背觸俱非, 趙州意也. 卽今在西堂云云者, 西堂則正位, 眼睛則照破也. 首座則位居東, 耳根則領納音聲. 監院則摠執一院之事, 心則屬中. 隨人所見, 彼此出入也. 遅遅疑疑, 則又向長老頂門上坐地, 焉知之哉. 驀竪起拂子者, 此是趙州本位也. 各請云云者, 直得離却背觸, 直下見得.

Case 471.

Zhaozhou's Two Dragons

趙州二龍

[Old case]

Zhaozhou was asked by a monk, "When two dragons fight over a (wish-fulfilling) jewel, who is the winner?"[1195] The master said, "I would just observe."[1196]

趙州因僧問, "二龍爭珠, 誰是得者?" 師云, "老僧只管看."

[Explanation of the gongan]

When two dragons fight over a (wish-fulfilling) jewel: as (Xuedou says,) "A bright jewel is in my palm. Those with merit will be rewarded."[1197] In the realm of the ordinary it is completely ordinary. In the presence of the holy it is completely holy. Again, this is a single position without private (interests). Guest and host each take turns playing host. Both meanings will do.

I would just observe: one is only permitted to watch from the side and must not interfere at all.

1195 This gongan appears in other contexts as well; for instance, see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076. 51.304b7, 326c19, 332b1, 339b19, 361c13, 391c29, 420a26).

1196 For this story, see also the *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.680b3–4); *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.320a18–b1); *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.532a17); *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.248b4–5) etc.

1197 See the *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.220c18).

二龍爭珠者, 如明珠在掌, 有功者賞. 居凡全凡, 處聖全聖. 又無私一位, 賓主兩箇, 互相作主, 兩義皆得. 老僧只管看者, 只可傍觀, 都不干涉也.

Xuedou Chongxian added a comment,[1198] "If you observe, it is not that there isn't anything. If you fight over it, you will not attain it. Speak! Will you support the monk or support Zhaozhou?"

雪竇顯拈, "看則不無, 爭則不得. 且道! 扶者僧, 扶趙州?"

[Explanation]

Xuedou: *If you observe* etcetera: although Zhaozhou (said) observe, if you fight over it, you will not attain it. This refers to not falling for either side.

If you observe, it is not that there isn't anything: this supports Zhaozhou.

If you fight over it, you will not attain it: this supports the monk.

雪竇: 看則云云者, 趙州雖然看, 爭則不得也. 謂兩頭不落也. 看則不無, 則扶趙州; 爭則不得, 則扶這僧也.

1198 For this comment, see also the *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.532a18–b1).

Case 488.

Changsha's Hundred-Foot Pole

長沙百尺

[Old case]

Chan Master Jingcen of Changsha ordered a monk to ask venerable Hui,[1199] "What were you like before you saw Nanquan?" Hui paused. The monk said, "What were you like after you saw him?" Hui said, "An extra something special is not allowed." When the monk returned and raised this before the master, the master composed a verse,

A person sitting on top of a hundred-foot pole,
Although you may have attained it, it is still not the truth,
Take a step forward while on top of the hundred-foot pole,
And the whole world will be your entire body.
That monk asked again, "How does one step forward on a hundred-foot pole?"

The master said, "The mountains of Langzhou, the waters of Lizhou."[1200] The monk said, "I understand." The master said, "The four oceans and five lakes are within the king's power of (moral) transformation."[1201]

1199 For more on Changsha Jingcen and Venerable Hui, see the explanation of the gongan.

1200 Langzhou 朗州 and Lizhou 澧州 are both located in Hunan province.

1201 For this story, see the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.25b26–c3); and also *Congrong lu* (T 2004.48.277c10–17).

長沙景岑禪師, 令僧問會和尚曰, "和尚未見南泉時, 如何?" 會良久. 僧云, "見後, 如何?" 會云, "不可更別有也." 僧廻擧似師, 師作偈云, "百尺竿頭坐底人! 雖然得入未爲眞. 百尺竿頭須進步, 十方世界是全身." 其僧便問, "百尺竿頭如何進步?" 師云, "朗州山, 澧州水" 僧云, "不會." 師云, "四海五湖王化裏."

[Explanation of the gongan]

Wansong (Xingxiu) said, "Great master Chaoxian of Changsha in Hunan. His style name is Jingcen. (Juefan says) he is the grandson of Mazu (Daoyi), the son of Nanquan (Puyuan), and the brother of Zhaozhou (Congshen). At that time, someone obstinate like Yangshan (Huiji) seemed as if he were humbled by him and that is why he is called 'Tiger Cen.'"[1202] Venerable Hui is Ruhui of Dong Monastery. He is a dharma heir of Mazu named Broken Platform Ruhui.[1203] They are students who covertly tallied with and secretly realized under Nanquan.

What were you like before you saw Nanquan: this is when he was deluded.

After you saw him: this is when he was awakened.

But this is not like the case of Niutou[1204] before he saw the fourth patriarch and after he saw the fourth patriarch.[1205]

1202 See *Congrong lu* (T48.2004.277c18–20). Jingcen came to be known as Tiger Cen (Cen Dachong 岑大蟲) because he pounced on Yangshan Huiji when Yangshan asked him about function (*yong* 用). For the provenance of Jingcen's nickname Tiger Cen; see also the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.275a29–b2).

1203 He came to be known as Broken Bench or Zhechuang Ruhui 折床如會 because a great number of students gathered at his monks' hall and the bench inside the hall broke as a consequence; see the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.255b16–17).

1204 Niutou Farong 牛頭法融 (594–657) is the founder of the so-called Niutou branch or school of Chan. He was the disciple of the fourth patriarch Daoxin. In 643 Farong became the abbot of Youqi Monastery 幽棲寺 on Mt. Niutou 牛頭山 near Nanjing.

1205 This is a reference to the well known gongan, "Niutou before he met the fourth patriarch" (*Niutou weijian sizu* 牛頭未見四祖); for instance, see *Jingde chandeng lu* (T 2076.51.227b6–10, 233a27–28, 287b23–24, 299a21–22, 320a4–5, 329b16–17, 350c2–3, 358b29–c1, 365c12–13, 373b18–19, 381a10–11, 389c16–17, 400b18, 410a22–23); *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T 1988.47.549b8

Hui remained silent. Also, he said, *An extra something special is not allowed*: before he saw him he was the way he is and after he saw him he was also the way he is. Delusion and awakening have both fallen away.

A person sitting on top of a hundred-foot pole … it is still not the truth: (like a frog) looking at the sky from the bottom of the well[1206] he thinks what he sees from the praying mat is the sky.

Take a step forward while on top of the hundred-foot pole etcetera: only then did he believe that what he sees from the praying mat is not the sky.

The mountains of Langzhou etcetera: differentiating all the dharmas.

Four oceans and five lakes etcetera: an even more sophisticated move. If you are going to care for others, you must be thorough. The *Huayan jing* says, "Maitreya told Sudhana, 'This son of a householder has visited a hundred and ten cities and come to my place.' "[1207] The ten stages of faith each have a cause and effect, making a total of twenty. The (ten) abodes (住), practices (行), dedications (向), and stages (地) also follow this rule.[1208] There are also five positions and each have a cause and effect. In total this makes a hundred and ten. The moment of "working together" is the entrance into teachings. From regression to the effects of Buddhist practice is the moment of "the perfection of work."[1209] If you take away the original cause and original effect, it become a hundred positions and this is precisely what we call "hundred-foot (pole)."

---

and 559b12); *Fenyang Wude chanshi yulu* (T 1992.47.611b26); *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.682a10); *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.162a16) etc. For a reference to Niutou *before and after* he met the fourth patriarch, see also the *Jingde chandeng lu* (T 2076.51.421c2–5).

1206 For this famous analogy from the *Zhuangzi* (i.e., "You can't discuss the ocean with a frog in a well. It is limited by the space that it lives in" 井蛙不可以語於海者 拘於虛也); see Watson, *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu,* p. 175.

1207 See *Huayan jing* (T 293.10.824a25–26).

1208 These are the different stages in a bodhisattva's cultivation of perfection; for instance, see the *Huayan jing* (T 278.9.418b11).

1209 This is a reference to the famous five positions (*wuwei*) theory of Dongshan Liangjie. The five positions can be formulated in many ways, but one variation follows the following gloss: "to head

萬松云, "湖南長沙招賢大師, 諱景岑, 馬祖之孫, 南泉之子, 趙州之兄. 當時, 倔强如仰山者, 猶下之, 而呼以爲岑大蟲." 會和尙者, 有東寺如會者, 法嗣馬祖, 謂折床如會. 此則南泉下, 潛符密證之徒也. 未見南泉者, 迷時也. 見後者, 悟時也. 然, 非如牛頭未見四祖前事, 已見四祖後事也. 良久, 又云, 不可更別有也者, 見前也伊麼, 見後也伊麼也, 則迷悟幷沉也. 百尺竿頭至未爲眞者, 坐井裏觀天, 蒲團以爲天也. 百尺云云者, 方信蒲團, 不是天也. 朗州山云云者, 差別萬法也. 四海五湖云云者, 更高一著耶, 爲人須爲徹也. 華嚴經云, "彌勒謂善財曰, '此長者子, 經歷一百一十城, 來至我所.' " 言十信, 各有因有果, 合成二十, 住行向地例此. 又五位, 各有因有果, 摠爲一百一十也. 共功時爲入門, 從轉位後至沙門果, 功功時也. 前除本因本果, 一百位也. 則此所謂百尺也.

Jiangshan Faquan's verse

How sad, old Hui!
All day he frivolously longs for wild grasslands.
Sigh, Changsha!
He only desired to take a step forward and forgot to return home.
Who won't end up on a hundred-foot pole?
When the fog rolls out and the clouds scatter the sun shines brightly,
The man who traveled north and south returns,
The mountains and waters of Lizhou and Langzhou are excellent.

toward" (*xiang* 向), "to follow" (*feng* 奉), "to work" (*gong* 功), "working together" (*gongong* 共功), and "the perfection of work" (*gongong* 功功); see the *Rentian yanmu* 人天眼目 (T 2006.48.315c20–316a24). The precise meaning of the stage of "perfection of work" is unclear. A reference to this term appears in the *Shoulengyan jing* (T 945.19.142c18–19). Once a bodhisattva reaches the immovable stage (*budongdi* 不動地) he or she begins to cultivate the perfection of work and virtue. According to Juefan Huihong's *Chanlin sengbao zhuan* 禪林僧寶傳, the perfection of work refers to the five positions of the completion of work (*gongxun wuwei* 功勳五位) (XZJ 137.520b4–5). According to the *Rentian yanmu*, Dahui Zonggao offered the following gloss for the perfection of work: "it refers to the fact that dharmas and obects of perception are all empty" (T 2006.48.316a19). The previous position of "working together" is glossed as "dharmas and objects of perception resisting each other" (T 2006.48.316a14).

蔣山泉頌, "悲哉會老! 終日區區戀荒草. 嗟爾長沙! 秖貪進步忘還家. 百尺竿頭誰不到? 霧卷雲收日杲杲. 南北遊人歸去來, 澧朗州中山水好."

[Explanation]
Jiangshan Faquan: *How sad … forgot to return home*: both are at fault. *Who won't end up on a hundred-foot pole* etcetera: neither are at fault.

蔣山云云, 忘還家者, 二俱有過也. 百尺云云已下, 二俱無過也.

Tiantong Zhengjue's verse[1210]

The rooster's cry disturbs the dream of a jade being,
Look askance at one's life and its various aspects are all even.
Seasonal winds blow, thunder rumbles, and ending hibernation ends,
A footpath forms of its own accord under the silent pear and peach tree.[1211]
When the time is right save your strength and plow the field,
Who's afraid of being shin-deep in the mud of a paddy field in the spring?

天童覺頌, "玉人夢破一聲雞, 轉眄生涯色色齊. 有信風雷催出蟄, 無言桃李自成蹊. 及時節力耕犁, 誰怕春疇沒脛泥!"

[Explanation]
Tiantong: The first two lines clarify Reverend Hui's hundred-foot pole. The next part clarifies Changsha's stepping forward.

1210 For this verse, see also the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.25c4–6).

1211 That is, when peaches and pears appear people naturally gather and give rise to a footpath. This idea appears in the story of general Li Guang 李廣 (d. 119 BCE) whose death was mourned by everyone; see the *Shi ji* 109, 12a.

天童: 二句, 明會和尚百尺竿頭也. 下明長沙進步處.

Xuedou Chongxian arrived at Lingyin Monastery,[1212] ascended the hall, and said,[1213] "This is a discussion of war. Each and everyone's strength lies in the way they aim for each other's arrowhead. That's why it has to be an exceptionally talented man. If the thought faculty is still obstructed, one must make a decision to step forward. Therefore, Changsha said, *Take a step forward while on top of the hundred-foot pole … will be your entire body.* A monk raised the gongan and asked Nanquan, 'How does one step forward on a hundred-foot pole?' Nanquan replied, 'Take another step forward.' The monk again asked Waguan[1214] [Yanguan in one text[1215]] and Waguan said, 'Why step forward on a hundred-foot pole?' The monk did not agree. Waguan struck him."[1216] The master said, "Great assembly! The ancient ones demonstrate witty responses to skill (in *chan*) in a single moment. (Even if) one were to make other calculations in that moment, one would still be unable to verbalize them. If I were to re-enter Lingying Monastery today, it would also be as if I were on top of a hundred-foot pole. Relying on what Nanquan said, I would be able to take a step forward. Fortunately, I saw the great assembly face to face and thus circled the entire world in a single moment."

雪竇顯, 到靈隱, 上堂云, "論戰也, 箇箇力在箭鋒相柱, 又須是箇特達漢, 始得. 若意根尚滯, 直須向前決擇. 所以, 長沙道, '百尺竿頭至是全身.' 僧擧問南泉, '百尺竿頭如何進步?' 泉云, '更進一步.' 僧復問瓦官<一本鹽官>, 官云, '百尺竿頭用

1212 Lingyin si 靈隱寺 is a famous monastery loated near Hangzhou to its northwest in Zhejiang province.

1213 For this sermon, see also the *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.675a9–19).

1214 Quanzhou Waguan 泉州瓦官(alt. 瓦棺) is a dharma heir of Deshan Xuanjian.

1215 See the *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.371a4–6); and also *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.493a5–6). Yanguan Qi'an 鹽官齊安 (752?–841) is a dharma heir of Mazu Daoyi.

1216 See the *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.675a14–15).

進, 作什麽?' 僧不肯, 官便打." 師云, "大衆, 古人機變, 出在一時, 其閒別有商量, 亦未言著. 且如雪竇, 今日再入靈隱, 也似百尺竿頭, 依南泉之言, 得進一步. 喜與大衆相見, 則十方世界, 一時周匝."

[Explanation]

Xuedou: *This is a discussion of war* etcetera: the hundred-foot pole, the mountains of Langzhou, and waters of Lizhou lie in the original endowment of exceptionally talented men. This is thus like aiming for each other's arrowhead. That's why you have to be exceptional men. Reverend Hui's thought faculty is still obstructed and therefore he is not there yet.

Take another step forward: another clarification of Changsha's stepping forward.

Why step forward on a hundred-foot pole: clarification of the hundred-foot pole.

Struck him: this monk only knew how to take a step forward. This too is also because the thought faculty still obstructed.

If I were to re-enter Lingying Monastery today etcetera: since Changsha taking a step forward is none other than Nanquan taking a step forward, his first stay at Lingyin Monastery and second stay at Lingyin Monastery are alike.

Fortunately, I saw the great assembly etcetera: clarification of the reveal facts therein.

雪竇: 論戰云云者, 百尺竿頭, 朗州山澧州水, 在特達漢分上, 則箭鋒相拄. 如會和尙, 意根尙滯, 則未可也. 更進一步者, 重明長沙進步也. 用進作什麽者, 明百尺竿頭也. 便打者, 這僧只知進步, 亦意根尙滯故也. 雪竇今日云云者, 長沙進一步, 卽是南泉進一步故, 前住靈隱, 後住靈隱如之也. 喜與大衆云云者, 明其中消息也.

Chengtian Chuanzong ascended the hall and raised what Changsha said, *A person sitting on top of a hundred-foot pole … take a step forward while on top of the hundred-foot pole.* The master picked up the staff and said, "The hundred-foot pole is right here! Take a step forward and yet you can't jump

off. Don't take a step forward and you still can't jump off. Even if you were to break the stone Buddha's staff in two, you still can't jump off. Why is this so? What all of you understand, the stone Buddha completely understands. What the stone Buddha understands, all of you do not understand. The last phrase, 'And the whole world will be your entire body' also cannot jump out. If you don't have eyes that see into every nook and cranny (penetrating), you won't be able to avoid falling into Changsha's trap."

承天宗, 上堂, 擧長沙道, '百尺竿頭, 至須進步.' 師拈柱杖云, "百尺竿頭在者裏! 進也跳不出, 不進也跳不出, 忽若拗折石佛柱杖子, 也跳不出. 爲什麼如此? 諸人會處, 石佛總會; 石佛會處, 諸人不會. 末後一句道, '十方世界是全身.' 更跳不出. 若無七穿八穴底眼, 未免墮在長沙窠裏."

[Explanation]

Chengtian: *Take a step forward and yet you can't jump off*: step forward or not one cannot transcend a single staff. Break the stone Buddha's staff in two and the opinion can be called outstanding. This too cannot transcend the reveal facts.

What all of you understand etcetera: since the stone buddha's understanding is basically limitless, one cannot jump out even with 'And the whole world will be your entire body.' Although that is the case, it is the case only if one has eyes that see into every nook and cranny.

Changsha's nest: a kudzu-like trap.

承天: 進也跳不出者, 進不進, 不離一條柱杖也. 拗折石佛柱杖, 則見解可謂高邁, 亦不離這箇消息也. 諸人會處云云者, 石佛會處, 直得無限故, 十方世界是全身, 更跳不出也. 雖然, 須有七穿八穴地眼, 方能如是也. 長沙窠裏者, 葛藤窠裏也.

And then he raised Nanquan and Yanguan's words. The master said,[1217]

[1217] For this comment, see the *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.371a6–7); and also *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.493a7–8).

"If you consult Nanquan, you must take one step forward. If you consult Yanguan, you must take one step back. Those with clear eyes, try to discern (what I've just said)."

又連擧南泉鹽官語, 師云, "若叅南泉, 須進一步; 若叅鹽官, 須退一步. 明眼底, 辨看!"

[Explanation]

Again he raised: Other than Nanquan's taking a step forward one cannot take another step forward. Other than Yanguan's taking a step backward one cannot take another step backward.

又擧: 南泉, 進一步外, 更不退步; 鹽官, 退一步外, 更不進步.

Chengtian Huai ascended the hall and raised, "A person sitting on top of a hundred-foot pole … your entire body." The master said, "Great assembly! These sayings of the ancients—you might as well call them special. But if you examine them, all they knew was how to cross the water. They were unaware of the water's current. Why? What if the whole world is one big body. Where can a hundred-foot pole stand? Is there anyone who has insight in this matter? If you have insight, then you can let it go, return home, and sit peacefully. If don't have insight yet, then continue to carry it around with you."

承天懷, 上堂, 擧百尺竿頭, 至是全身. 師云, "大衆, 古人與麽語話, 不妨奇特. 然, 奈檢點將來, 只知過渡, 不覺水流! 何故? 只如十方世界, 是个全身, 百尺竿頭, 向什麽處安着? 還有人於者裏見得麽? 若也見得, 便能放下, 歸家穩坐; 若也未見, 一任擔取去."

[Explanation]

Chengtian: All they knew was how to cross the water etcetera: all they knew was how to take a step forward and didn't realize how to take a step backward. By saying this Changsha simply transferred his illness and didn't transfer his Dharma. He had thus never transcended the hundred-foot pole.

承天: 只知過渡云云者, 只知進步, 不覺退步也. 長沙伊麼道, 但轉其病, 不轉其法, 則未嘗離百尺竿頭也.

Yunmen Zonggao added a comment,[1218] "Do you want to have an insight into Changsha's (words)? Then take another step forward. If someone asks, 'How do I take a step forward?' I'll wait till you're sincere and then give you some kudzu-like (words)."

雲門杲拈, "要見長沙? 更進一步! 若有人問, '如何進這一步?' '我待款款地, 與你葛藤.'

[Explanation]

Yunmen: This is a thorough analysis of Changsha's words. The meaning is identical to what Xuedou said above.

雲門: 明長沙道底徹底, 前雪竇義一般.

Wuyong Jingquan[1219] ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and then raised Dahui's words, "Do you want to have an insight into Changsha's (words)? Then take another step forward."[1220] The master said, "I would not have done so. Do you want to have an insight into Changsha's (words)? Then take another step backward. In the end what can be done? Wash your bones, exchange your intestines, and neatly arrange them again. Once your entire body becomes an (appreciative) eye, you must seek consultation again."

無用全, 上堂, 擧此話, 連擧大慧道, '要見長沙麼? 更進一步!' 師云, "保寧則不然. 要見長沙麼? 更退一步! 畢竟如何? 洗骨換腸重整頓, 通身是眼更須叅!"

1218 For this comment, see also the *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 118.137a6–7).

1219 Wuyong Jingquan 無用淨全 (1137–1207) is a dharma heir of Dahui Zonggao. In 1189 Jingquan became the abbot of Jingde Monastery on Mt. Tiantong in Zhejiang province.

1220 For this sermon, see also the *Xu chuandeng lu* (T 2077.51.689c3–5).

[Explanation]

Wuyong: He clarified the hundred-foot pole. Although Changsha said to step forward, he too had never transcended the hundred-foot pole. He must take another step forward.

無用: 明百尺竿頭. 長沙雖道進步, 亦未嘗離百尺竿頭, 更進一步, 始得.

Case 494.

Changsha's Impediment

長沙礙處

[Old case]

Changsha (Jingcen) was asked by a monk, "Form is emptiness and emptiness is form.[1221] What is the principle behind this?" In verse the master said,

The state of obstruction is not a wall,
The state of penetration cannot be an empty void,
If a person understands this way,
Mind and form are originally identical.[1222]

長沙因僧問, "色卽是空, 空卽是色, 此理如何?" 師偈曰, "礙處非牆壁, 通處勿虛空. 若人如是解, 心色本來同."

[Explanation of the gongan]

Form is emptiness and emptiness is form: the bodhisattvas of the four teachings [tripiṭaka, shared, distinct, and perfect][1223] each had different opinions.

1221 This is arguably the most recognizable line from the famous *Heart Sūtra* (T 251.8.848c9).

1222 For this story, see the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.275b24–27); and also *Fozu lidai tongzai* (T 2036.49.644a14–16).

1223 For this classification of the different types of teaching methods in Buddhism, see Zhiyi's 智顗 (538–597) *Sijiaoyi* 四教義 (esp. T 1929.46.721a20). See also David Chappell, "Introduction to the T'ien-t'ai ssu-chiao-i," *Eastern Buddhist, New Series* 9.1 (1976): 72–86.

The state of obstruction is not a wall: this means form is emptiness.

The state of penetration cannot be an empty void: is emptiness form?

The state of obstruction and the state of penetration are identical. It is form and not a wall. It cannot be empty space. That is, form is emptiness and emptiness is form.

If a person understands this way etcetera: this is a case of perfect interpenetration and progressive advancement.[1224]

色卽是空, 空卽是色者, 四教<藏通別圓>菩薩, 所見各別. 礙處非墻壁, 則色卽是空; 通處勿虛空, 則空卽是色耶. 礙處通處一般, 是色非墻壁, 勿虛空, 則色卽是空, 空卽是色也. 故若人如是解云云. 此圓融後行布也.

Changlu Zongze raised this gongan and said, "I would not have said so. The state of obstruction is a wall and the state of penetration is an empty void. If you can understand this way, the sun rises east over the ocean."

長蘆賾, 擧此話云, "山僧卽不然. 壅處是墻壁, 通處是虛空. 若能如是會, 日出海門東."

[Explanation]

Changlu: Emptiness is form.

長蘆: 空卽色也.

1224 This refers to the Huayan classification of Buddhist practice into two types: perfect interpenetration (*yuanrong* 圓融) and progressive advancement (*xingbu* 行布). According to the *Huayanjing tanxuan ji* 華嚴經探玄記:

> The first is step-by-step gradual progression and refers to the arrival at the state of buddhahood after the completion of the ten faiths, ten understandings, ten practices, ten dedications, and ten stages. From the subtle to the explicit one climbs the stages gradually. The second is perfect interpenetration and mutual integration and refers to all stages, before and after, being integrated in one stage. Therefore, one arrives at the state of buddhahood with the completion of each stage 一次第行布門 謂十信十解十行十迴向十地滿後方至佛地 從微至著階位漸次 二圓融相攝門謂一位中即攝一切前後諸位 是故一一位滿皆至佛地 (T 1733.35.108c4–8).

Huitang Zuxin ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and said,[1225] "The fly whisk is form. What is the mind? A clever man, as soon as he hears what I've raised, will see horns through the partition in the wall and immediately know it is a cow. Again, if it is someone who hesitates and cogitates, white clouds stretch across thousands and thousands of miles.

晦堂心, 上堂, 擧此話云, "拂子是色, 那箇是心? 靈利漢, 才聞擧着, 隔牆見角, 早知是牛. 更若擬議思量, 白雲千里萬里."

[Explanation]
Huitang: Seeing form is seeing the mind.

晦堂: 見色便見心.

1225 For this teaching, see the *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 118.97a7–9); and also *Baojue Zuxin chanshi yulu* (XZJ 120.220a3–4).

Case 507.

Ganzhi's "Mind" Character

甘贄心字

[Old case]

Because a hermitage monk came to postulant Ganzhi[1226] asking for daily necessities, Ganzhi said, "If you can tell me something I'll give you what you need." Thereupon he wrote the character for mind and asked, "What is this character?" The monk said, "The character for mind." Ganzhi then asked his wife and the wife replied, "The character for mind." Ganzhi said, "My wife (lit. mountain wife) is also suitable for hermitage living." The monk was speechless. Ganzhi also gave him nothing.[1227]

甘贄行者, 因有住庵僧來, 緣化什物曰, "若道得卽施." 乃書心字問, "是什麽字?" 僧云, "心字." 贄却問其妻, 妻云, "心字." 贄云, "妻亦合住庵." 僧無語, 贄亦無施.

[Explanation of the gongan]

Wrote the character for mind and asked, "What is this character?": will he not misunderstand why (Ganzhi) wrote the character for mind? Is picking up a mallet and holding up a fly whisk the same thing? Although the words are different, the intent is identical.

The monk said, "The character for mind": did he answer based on the truth? It is a misunderstanding.

1226 Ganzhi 甘贄 is a dharma heir of Nanquan Puyuan.

1227 For this story, see the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.279b15–18).

Ganzhi then asked his wife etcetera: he tricked that monk. But the monk was not equipped with eyes and therefore he was tricked. That's it. If he had been equipped with eyes and said what he said, then he would certainly been in Ganzhi's good graces.

My wife: the wife has the kind of virtue that is stored in the mountain and therefore she is called "mountain wife." Also, Liang Hong's wife is referred to as mountain wife. She lived in a mountain and was therefore called mountain wife.[1228]

書心字問是什麼字者, 認着所以書心字義不無耶? 拈槌竪拂一般耶? 言雖別, 意則同也. 僧云心字者, 據實支對耶? 認著也. 贊却問其妻云云者, 謾這僧也. 但這僧不具眼故謾耳. 若具眼伊麼道, 甘贊必然青眼相見. 山妻者, 妻有山藏之德, 故云山妻. 又梁鴻妻, 謂之山妻, 謂居山中, 故曰山妻.

Fazhen Shouyi added a comment, "Living in a hermitage in this way, how could you not completely fool people? You were cracked by a layman. He wrote the character for mind and asked what character it was. You should have just said, 'It's your grandfather's taboo name and you don't recognize it?' If Ganzhi is such a man, you would have necessarily been in his good graces."

法眞一拈 "伊麼住庵, 豈不鈍置殺人? 被箇俗漢折倒. 他書心字問, '是什麼字?' 只向道, '是汝祖諱也不識?' 甘贊若是箇漢, 必然青眼相看."

[Explanation]

Fazhen: *It's your grandfather's taboo name* etcetera: if he knew that it was his grandfather's taboo name, then there is nothing else left. Since he simply misunderstood, Ganzhi said what he said. If you understand what he said, then you will certainly be in his good graces.

法眞: 是汝祖諱云云者, 知是祖諱, 則更無餘事也. 只認著故, 甘贊伊麼道. 若解伊麼道, 必然青眼相見也.

1228 For Liang Hong's 梁鴻 wife Meng Guang 孟光, see the *Hou Han shu* 113, 10–13.

Case 508.

Mimo's Pitchfork

秘魔杈却

[Old case]

Venerable Mimoyan[1229] of Mt. Wutai always carried around a wooden pitchfork. Every time he saw a monk come to bow he would immediately point the pitchfork at his neck and say, "Which demon made you leave home? Which demon made you go on pilgrimage? Tell me and I'll pitchfork you to death. Don't tell me and I'll still pitchfork you to death. Speak quickly! Speak quickly!" On one of those occasions Huoshan[1230] came and jumped into his lap. Mimoyan stroked his back three times. Huoshan jumped out and gave his hand a chop[1231] and said, "You tricked me into coming from three-thousand miles away!"[1232]

五臺山, 秘魔嵓和尙, 常持一木杈, 每見僧來禮拜, 卽杈却頸云, "那箇魔魅, 敎汝出家; 那个魔魅, 敎汝行脚? 道得也, 杈下死; 道不得也, 杈下死. 速道, 速道!" 時有霍山來, 跳入懷中, 秘魔於背上撫三下. 霍山跳出斫手曰, "三千里外賺我來."

1229 Mimoyan 秘魔巖 refers to Changyu 常遇 (817–888). In 850 he climbed Mt. Wutai 五臺山 and sacrificed the middle finger on his right hand as an offering to Mañjuśrī. Later, he moved to Mimoyan and there he stayed for the next seventeen years.

1230 Huoshan 霍山 here probably refers to Yangshan Huiji's dharma heir Huoshan Jingtong 霍山景通 (d.u.), who called himself Dachanfo 大禪佛; see note 1237 below.

1231 Translation tentative.

1232 For a different version of this story, see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.285c29–286a3); *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.488a8–11) and also *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.598a5–9).

[Explanation of the gongan]

Point the pitchfork at his neck and say, "Which demon made you leave home?" etcetera: today, when people leave home and go on pilgrimage they are all made to do so by demons.

Tell me and I'll pitchfork you to death etcetera: telling him and not telling him, that is, words and silence. Does this mean words are wrong and silence is also wrong? You understand how to tell him and don't understand how to tell him. Even if you understand how to tell him, you will still not be able to avoid dying under the pitchfork.

Speak quickly! Speak quickly!: go facing him.

Jumped into his lap: the way he deals with others was examined. Whether they tell him or don't tell him, what fault is there in the intent?

Stroked his back three times: each one settled him down. This means "he refused to be inflexible and refused to insist on certainty."[1233]

Jumped out: this too is not the original intent.

Gave his hand a chop: gazing from three-thousand miles away.

You tricked me into coming from three-thousand miles away: it seemed as if he were three-thousand miles away. This is what is meant by *tricked me*.

权却頸云那箇魔魅云云者, 今日出家行脚, 皆是魔魅所使也. 道得也权下死云云者, 道得道不得, 語默, 則語也錯, 默也错耶? 解道得不解道得也, 雖解道得, 亦未免权下死也. 速道速道者, 正面而去也. 跳入懐中者, 看他支對, 其意似道得道不得, 有什麽過? 於背上撫三下者, 一一安着, 毋固毋必也. 跳出者, 亦不是本意也. 斫手者, 三千里外望見也. 三千里外云云者, 在三千里內, 似乎在三千里外, 是賺我也.

1233 "He refused to be inflexible and refused to insist on certainty" (*wugu wubi* 毋固毋必) is a quote from the *Analects* (i.e., "There were four things the Master refused to have anything to do with: he refused to entertain conjectures or to insist on certainty; he refused to be inflexible or to be egotistical"); see *Analects* 9.4.

Dajue Huailian's verse

Always carrying around a fork in his palm,
Among those who come and go, who dares to match his wit?
Huoshan jumps into his lap and takes a seat,
How could giving his hand a chop allow him to return alive?

> 大覺璉頌, "叉子常安掌內持, 往來誰敢觸雄機? 霍山跳入懷中坐, 斫手如何得活歸?"

[Explanation]
Dajue: Although Huoshan did what he did, he did not escape Mimo(yan)'s trap.

大覺: 霍山雖然伊麼, 不出秘魔圈樻.

Haiyin Chaoxin's verse[1234]

Boasting about he alone owning a sword for slaying dragons,
When he encounters a true dragon he couldn't do anything.
This is like a general pointlessly looking for a battle,
He makes no accomplishments and mobilizes arms in vain.

> 海印信頌, "自誇獨握誅龍劒, 及遇眞龍不奈何. 也似將軍空索戰, 無功虛枉動干戈."

[Explanation]
Haiyin: Huoshan was able to beat Mimo(yan). When he met Huoshan there was nothing he could do.

海印: 霍山得勝秘魔, 遇霍山無如之何.

1234 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.254b5–6).

Huanglong Huinan's verse[1235]

Uncle and nephew meet and do not doubt each other,
In the end, stroking the back seemed foolish.
Fearing the sneer of others, he turns his head,
As a reply it was said, you tricked me into coming from a thousand miles away.

> 黃龍南頌, "叔姪相逢兩不猜, 到頭撫背似癡獃. 迴首恐人生怪笑, 報云千里賺余來."

Fotuo Desun's verse

Bold and rude—that is Mimo(yan),
Curling up under a boulder with fork in hand,
One glance and Huoshan knew the ins and outs,
If not a sympathetic friend who would dare to pass?

> 佛陀遜頌, "大膽麤心是秘魔, 擎杈嵓下坐盤陀. 霍山一見知端的, 不是知音孰敢過!"

Fazhen Shouyi's verse

With a fork in hand who would accompany you?
Visiting monks often just return empty handed,
Dachanfo lies down in your lap,[1236]
You tricked me into coming three-thousand miles on the travelers' road.

1235 For this verse, see also the *Huanglong Huinan chanshi yulu* (T 1993.47.634c24–25).

1236 Dachanfo or the Great Chan Buddha (大禪佛) was the nickname of two monks. One is Huoshan Jingtong and the other is Guishan Zhichang's disciple Zhitong; see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.285c27).

法眞一頌, "手裡擎叉孰可陪? 行僧往往只空迴. 大禪佛向懷中臥, 客路三千賺我來."

Chengtian Huai's verse

Cloud and mist fill the deep deep cavern,
Inside there's an old Chan man holding a fork.
When a patch-robed monk arrives he tells them all they will die,
Who understands his intention to take away the (illusory) flowers in their eyes?

承天懷頌, "深深嵓穴傍煙霞, 中有禪翁持一叉. 衲子到來俱謂死, 誰知爲去眼中花?"

Chongsheng Yuangong's verse[1237]

Mimo's fork moves the entire country,
Visiting Chan travelers are made to surrender.
At the state where the great Chan Buddha went straight to the point,
You will only then know Xiang Yu arrived in the Wu river.[1238]

崇勝珙頌, "秘魔叉子動家邦, 來往禪流被死降. 禪佛單刀直入處, 始知項羽到烏江."

Layman Wujin's verse

You place a staff on your shoulders and go on pilgrimage,

1237 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.254b7–8).

1238 Chased by the soldiers of Liu Bang 劉邦 (d. 195 B.C.E.), Xiang Yu 項羽 (232–202 B.C.E.) ended up commiting suicide on the bank of the Wu river 烏江; see *Shi ji* 7, 39–40.

With your robe hanging from one shoulder you leave home.
Knowing that you were tricked into walking a thousand-mile road,
How could you help but break the fork in his hand in two?

無盡居士頌,"橫擔柱杖來行脚, 偏搭袈裟去出家. 知是賺行千里路, 何妨拗折手中叉!"

Zhifeizi's verse

Mimo's fork,
Zhongyi's "Aah,"[1239]
Sifting rice and caring for beings,[1240]
The virtuoso who hit the ground,[1241]
At that time they were right,
But descendents go *tut-tut*.

知非子頌,"秘魔一叉, 中邑嗚耶, 米篩接物, 打地作家, 當時卽是, 後嗣咄嗟."

Layman Yuezhai's verse

When were you ever tricked into coming a thousand miles?

1239 Every time Zhongyi Hongen called monks he would clap his hands and move his lips, making the sound "Aah!" This was probably not a sound with any specially discriminating meaning, but was a kind of contrivance. See *Fenyang yulu* (T 1992.47.611a9).

1240 This is a teaching offered by Weishan Lingyou 潙山靈祐 to Shishuang Qingzhu 石霜慶諸 (807–888). While Shishuang was in charge of sifting the rice on Mt. Wei, Weishan came by and told him not to waste precious rice. When Shishuang insisted that he did not waste rice, Weishan picked one up and told him that a hundred thousand grains of rice came from this one grain of rice. Shishuang thereupon asked Weishan where the one grain of rice came from. Weishan just laughed and returned the abbot's quarters. See the *Wudeng huiyuan* (XZJ 138.181b12).

1241 This is a reference to Xinzhou 忻州 who used to hit the ground with his staff whenever he received a question; see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.261c2).

To trick me he patted me three times but it didn't work.
A good person does not show a lowly countenance,
But I must jam his head and bury it in a piss-pot.

悅齋居士頌, "千里何曾賺汝來? 賺吾三拊不當才. 賤相好人不肯造, 刺頭須要尿中埋."

Mingchao's[1242] substitute reply,[1243] "At that time had I seen him, before he could say what he wanted to say, I would have first pitchforked him.

明招代, "我當時若見伊, 欲道未道, 先與一杈."

[Explanation]
Mingchao: He would catch and expose Mimo(yan).

明招: 捉敗秘魔.

Fayan's substitute reply, "Help! Help!"[1244]

法眼代, "乞命, 乞命!"

Fadeng's[1245] substitute reply, "Just pull your neck out and show it to me."[1246]

法燈代, "但引頸示之."

1242 This is Mingchao Deqian 明招德謙 (d.u.), a dharma heir of Luoshan Daoxian 羅山道閑 (d.u.). Deqian served as abbot on Mt. Mingchao 明招山 in Zhejiang province.

1243 For this comment, see also the *Jiaowai biechuan* 教外別傳 (XZJ 144.128a14).

1244 For this substitute reply, see also the *Jinling Qingliang yuan Wenyi chanshi yulu* 金陵淸涼院文益禪師語錄 (T 1991.47.593b1).

1245 This is Fayan Wenyi's disciple Taiqin 泰欽 (d. 974). Taiqin served as abbot of Shuanglin Cloister 雙林院 in Jiangxi province and Qingliang Monastery 淸涼寺 in Jinling (present-day Nanjing). Chan Master Fadeng 法燈禪師 is his posthumous title.

1246 For this substitute reply, see also the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.280b3).

[Explanation]
Fayan and Fadeng's substitute replies showed Mimo(yan) up.

法眼法燈代, 賣弄秘魔.

Xuanjue's[1247] substitute reply, "Old man, you should put the pitchfork down."[1248]

玄覺代, "老兒家, 放却叉子, 得也."

[Explanation]
Xuanjue: He did not agree with Mimo(yan).

玄覺: 不肯秘魔

Kaixian Shanxian's substitute reply, "At that time he should have simply said, 'Heavens!' and left."

開先暹代, "當時但云, '蒼天!' 便出."

[Explanation]
Kaixian: Kaixian did what he did because he is a dead man.

開先: 秘魔伊麼, 是死漢故也.

Wuzu Shijie said,[1249] "At that time had I seen him I would have taken the fork away, stabbed him in the back of his neck with the fork, and lit a torch to see how thick the skin on his face is (how shameless he is)."

1247 This is Fayan Wenyi's disciple Baoci Wensui, see note 1062 above.

1248 For this substitute reply, see also the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.280b3–4).

1249 For this teaching, see also the *Chanlin leiju* (XZJ 117.204a17–18).

五祖戒云, "山僧, 當時若見, 奪取叉來, 驀項叉倒, 點把火看伊面皮厚多少."

[Explanation]
Wuzu: He saw through Mimo(yan).

五祖: 覷破秘魔.

Cuiyan Shouzhi added a comment,[1250] "Was he tricked or not? Not only did the great Chan Buddha [Huoshan called himself a great Chan Buddha] trick him but I too will try to trick all of you here in the assembly."

翠嵓芝拈, "還有賺處也無? 非但賺他大禪佛<霍山, 自稱大禪佛.> 大愚今日, 也賺大衆上來."

[Explanation]
Cuiyan: If he was tricked, then everyone has the guilty conscience of a thief.

翠巖: 旣是賺, 皆是作賊人心虛.

Haiyin Chaoxin added a comment, "He could pull the bow but could not release the arrow."

海印信拈, "只解張弓, 不能放箭."

[Explanation]
Haiyin: This refers to the fact that Mimo(yan) never brought it to a conclusion.

海印: 謂秘魔無折合也.

1250 For this comment, see also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.488a11–13).

Case 533.

Decheng's Thousand-Foot Fishing Line

德誠千尺

[Old case]

The boatman of Huating, Chan Master Decheng,[1251] in verse said,

Casting a thousand-foot fishing line directly below,
One wave moves and ten thousand waves follow.
The night is quiet, the water is cold, and the fish do not bite,
In an empty boat I return with a load of moonlight.[1252]

華亭舡子, 德誠禪師, 偈云, "千尺絲綸直下垂, 一波才動萬波隨. 夜靜水寒魚不食, 滿船空載月明歸."

[Explanation of the gongan]

According to the *Chuandeng lu*,[1253] in Xiuzhou the boatman of Huating, Chan master Decheng, is a man of high moral character and his

---

1251 Decheng 德誠 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Yaoshan Weiyan. Decheng spread the teachings of his teacher Yaoshan from a small boat in Huating 華亭 (Zhejiang province), hence the nickname the boatman of Huating; see the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.315b19–20).

1252 For Decheng's verse, see also the *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.692a7–8); *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.755b2–3); *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.750a6–7); and *Wudeng huiyuan* (XZJ 138.175b2–4).

1253 See the *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.749b11–750a5); and also *Wudeng huiyuan* (XZJ 138.175a10–b2); cf. *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.315b19–28).

magnanimity was not like any other. Ever since his mind was sealed by Yaoshan he always stayed the best of friends with Daowu[1254] and Yunyan.[1255] As the time came to leave Yaoshan he told his two comrades, "Each of you occupy a certain area and there you've established Yaoshan's tenet. But I am careless and rash in nature. I only like mountains and rivers and delight in music. I take comfort in the fact that I am unable to do anything. Later, when you find out where I have settled down and if you meet a clever chief seat, then point him over to my direction. If he can be sculpted, I'll give him everything I've acquired so far and pay back the former master's debt." He went where fate took him and arrived at Huating in Xiuzhou. There he set a small boat afloat and passed the days doing what the situation called for. He welcomed people from all four directions. At the time people did not understand his hermit-like nature and called him Reverend Boatman. One day he moored along the shore and sat idly. A certain official asked him, "What is the matter of daily actions?" The master raised the oar upright and said, "Do you understand?" The official said, "I don't understand." The master said, "You can row through the clear waves but you seldom encounter a brocaded carp (錦鱗). The master said in verse (gatha), "For thirty years I sat on a fishing pier, I often catch *huangneng* [pronounced *lei,* a small beast] on my fishing rod, I waste effort trying to encounter a brocaded carp, so I retrieve the fishing line and go back home."[1256]

Casting a thousand-foot fishing line etcetera: "For thirty years I roamed the ocean. The water is clean and fish appear, but they do not bite. Having cut down enough fishing rods, I plant more bamboo trees. Not paying any

---

1254 Daowu Yuanzhi 道吾圓智 (769–835) is a dharma heir of Yaoshan Weiyan. Yuanzhi served as abbot on Mt. Daowu in Hunan province. He was given the posthumous title Great Master Xiuyi 修一大師.

1255 Yunyan Tancheng is a dharma heir of Yaoshan Weiyan. Tancheng served as abbot on Mt. Yunyan in Hunan province. He produced a famous dharma heir by the name of Dongshan Liangjie.

1256 Huangneng 黄能 (when in water), also known as huangxiong 黄熊 (when on land), is a legendary beast that lives on land and in water; see the *Shuyi ji* 述異記 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) volume 1, 2–3. The significance of the pronunciation *lei* is unclear.

attention to the effort that was made, I take a break."[1257] This is one of the ten poems by Zhang Zhihe titled, "The Fisherman."[1258]

A thousand-foot fishing line: the *jinlin* properly reside in very deep waters, so you must cast a thousand-foot fishing line. If you want to catch the red-tailed jinlin you must use a thousand-foot fishing line. This is the great teaching of effortless action (無爲).

One wave moves and ten thousand waves follow: did the waves appear because of the fishing rod? Or did the waves appear because of the wind? This is like the saying, "As soon as one thought occurs the three realms and five aggregates are in place."[1259] This means the billows of life and death surge up violently and do not stop.

The night is quiet, the water is cold etcetera: there is not a single living being to save.

傳燈錄云, "秀州, 華亭船子, 德誠禪師, 節操高邁, 度量不群. 自印心於藥山, 常與道吾雲巖, 爲同道交. 洎離藥山, 乃謂二同志曰, '公等應各據一方, 建立藥山宗旨, 予率性踈野, 唯好山水樂情, 自遣無所能也. 他後, 知我所止之處, 若遇利座主, 指一人來. 或堪雕琢, 將授平生所得, 以報先師之恩.' 遂分携至秀州華亭, 泛一小舟, 隨緣度日, 以接四方來往之者, 時人莫知其高蹈, 因號船子和尚. 一日, 泊船岸邊閑坐, 有官人問, '如何是日用事?' 師竪起橈子曰, '會麼?' 官人曰, '不會.' 師曰, '棹撥清波, 錦鱗罕遇.' 師有偈曰, '三十年來坐釣臺, 鉤頭往往得黃能 <音未, 小獸也.> 錦鱗不遇空勞力, 收取絲綸歸去來.' "
千尺絲綸直下垂云云, 三十年來海上遊, 水清魚現不呑鉤. 釣竿斫盡重栽竹, 不計功勞得便休. 此則張志和尚[1260]漁父詞十首之一也. 千尺絲綸者, 錦鱗正在深深處, 千尺絲綸也須垂, 則若也釣得錦鱗頳尾, 須是千尺絲綸. 是無爲大化也. 一

[1257] See also the *Wudeng huiyuan* (XZJ 138.175b4–5).

[1258] Zhang Zhihe's 張志和 (fl. eighth century) poem "The Fisherman" (Yufu 漁父) in five stanzas can be found in the *Quan Tang shi* 890, 6–7. The verse in question is not contained in these five stanzas. See also *Quan Tang shi* 308, 1–2.

[1259] Similar passages can be found in the *Jin'gang sanmei jing* 金剛三昧經 (T 273.9.369a13–14); *Mohe zhiguan* 摩訶止觀 (T 1911.46.139a5–6); and *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.292c10–11).

[1260] This character is an obvious mistake and has not been translated.

波才動萬波隨者, 因鈞而起波耶? 因風而起波也? 如云一念才生, 便具五陰三界. 生死波瀾, 洶湧不停也. 夜靜水寒云云者, 無一衆生可度也.

Xuedou Chongxian added a comment,[1261] "This man labors and yet has nothing to show for it. If Yunmen were to speak he would say, 'A single phrase that gets to the point is a hitching post to which an ass is tied for ten-thousand kalpas. How can he avoid this fault?'[1262]" After a pause he said, "Don't say the fish won't bite because the water is cold. Catch a boatful and return today."

雪竇顯拈, "者漢, 勞而無功. 忽若雲門道, '一句合頭語, 萬劫繫驢橛, 又作麼生免此過?' " 良久云, "莫謂水寒魚不食, 如今鈞得滿舩歸."

[Explanation]

Xuedou: *Don't say the fish won't bite because the water is cold* etcetera: one must rely on new experiences.

雪竇: 莫謂水寒云云者, 必借新熏也.

Cishou Huaishen during an informal sermon raised this gongan and then raised Xuedou's added comment, *What a pity! This man labors and yet has nothing to show for it.* The master said, "I (Huilin) also have a verse, 'In a bamboo straw hat and straw rain cape on a single boat./ Wild winds and white waves make people anxious./ I forcibly try delicious bait on the fishing line,/ But the relentless waves do not allow it to rest.'" If a patch-robed monk were to suddenly step forward and say, 'What your reverence said is also a case of laboring and yet having nothing to show for it.' I would then tell him,

1261 For this comment, see also the *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.692a9–11).

1262 See the *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T1988.47.562a7–8); and also *Zuting shiyuan* (XZJ 113.41a9ff).

'From now on if you know a person's intent, enter deeply into the reeds and do not turn your head."[1263]

慈受, 小叅, 擧此話, 連擧雪竇拈, '可惜! 者漢, 勞而無功.' 師云, "慧林, 亦有一頌. '雨笠煙蓑一葉舟, 黑風白浪使人愁. 强將絲釣抛香餌, 歷盡波濤未肯休.' 忽有箇衲僧出來云, '和尙恁麽道, 也是勞而無功.' 山僧, 却向他道, '自今已後知人意, 深入蘆花不轉頭.' "

[Explanation]

Cishou: *In a bamboo straw hat … do not allow it to rest*: this is Xuedou's intent.

From now on etcetera: this is the boatman (of Huating)'s intent.

This, in other words, means he is free in (both) the present moment and his original endowment.

慈受: 雨笠至肯休者, 雪竇意也. 自今已後云云者, 舡子意也. 此則今時本分自在也.

1263 Cf. the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.336b15).

Case 553.

Moshan's "Neither Man Nor Woman"

末山男女

[Old case]

The nun Liaoran[1264] of Moshan was asked by Reverend Guanxi Zhixian,[1265] "What is Moshan?" Liaoran replied, "It does not expose its peak." Zhixian said, "Who is the host of Moshan?" Liaoran replied, "It has the mark of neither man nor woman." Zhixian thereupon let out a shout and said, "Why does it not transform?" Liaoran said, "It is neither a god nor a ghost. What would it transform into?" Zhixian consequently paid allegiance to her and served as the head gardener for three years.[1266]

末山尼了然, 因灌溪閑和尙問, "如何是末山?" 然云, "不露頂." 閑云, "如何是末山主?" 然云, "非男女相." 閑乃喝云, "何不變去?" 然云, "不是神, 不是鬼, 變个什麼?" 閑於是伏膺, 作園頭三載.

[Explanation of the gongan]

Moshan: a realm. This is the position of the host within the host.[1267] The host of Moshan is a person within the realm. This is the host within the host.

1264 Liaoran 了然 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Gaoan Dayu 高安大愚 (d.u.). Liaoran served as abbot on Mt. Mo 末山 in Jiangxi province.

1265 Guanxi Zhixian 灌溪志閑 (d. 895) is a dharma heir of Linji Yixuan. Zhixian served as abbot on Mt. Guanxi 灌溪山 in Hunan province.

1266 For this story, see also the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.289a5–9).

1267 "Host within host" (*zhu zhong zhu* 主中主) is one variation of the relation between host and

It does not expose its peak: one can't see the exposed peak because the clouds have gathered.

It has the mark of neither man nor woman: involved with neither the biased nor the upright.[1268]

Thereupon let out a shout etcetera: Guanxi is a son of Linji, but what they've attained is not the same.

It is not a god etcetera: originally there was no transformation. Quanshi[1269] said, "It did not transform! It transcends the biased and the upright. A shout! He alternately used firmness and flexibility. 'Conflagration at the final kalpa burns every single little thing; as before, the green mountain stands around the white clouds.'"[1270]

Consequently paid allegiance to her etcetera: here, he again had an attainment. If he's attained the great function of Linji, then he understands the last word. There are no other matters. Why, then, did he pay allegiance to her at this stage? This cannot but be discerned. When Guanxi first asked the great intent of Linji's Buddha dharma he was grabbed by Linji and at that moment he would say, "Yes sir, yes sir." This is simply the attainment of his essence. Afterwards, there is a public case that is necessary for attaining his function. It is not the complete attainment of Linji's intent. This is similar to the case of Baizhang who, when Mazu hung his fly whisk and set his fly whisk straight up, had not yet awakened to the great essence and great function and only understood how to control (把定) and release (放行).

---

guest in the so-called "four types of guest and host" (*si binzhu* 四賓主); for instance, see *Shoushan Nian heshang yulu* 汝州首山念和尚語錄 in the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.252b17–253a12); and *Rentian yanmu* (T 2006.48.303a16–304a9). See also entry for Yunyan Tancheng in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.323a25–29); Juefan Huihong's *Linji Zongzhi* (XZJ 111.174a7–b2); and Dahui Zonggao's *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 118.61b12–62a11).

1268 This is a reference to the five ranks or positions (*wuwei*).

1269 The identity of Quanshi is unclear.

1270 For "Conflagration at the final kalpa burns every single little thing; as before, the green mountain stands around the white clouds," see *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.718c23–24); *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 118.52b14); *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.190b6–7); *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.909b14) etc.

Therefore when he arrived at Moshan he said, "If you tell me, I'll stay." Again, he let out a shout and said, "Why doesn't it transform?" This is the case of attaining Linji's function and believing it is the ultimate. But since this is like the moving images in the lamp's shadow he was told by Moshan, "Why did you not cover it?" He was unable to answer and therefore in the end he paid allegiance to her. After serving as the head gardener for three years, he completely attained Moshan's intent and finally understood Linji's method is great essence and great function.[1271] This is similar to Xinghua[1272] using two shouts at Sansheng's[1273] place and also being stripped of his patched robes and painfully being struck twenty times at Dajue's[1274] place.[1275] This is how one can awaken to the tenet of Linji and become his lineal descendant. Therefore, after his stay, he told the assembly, "At Mama Moshan's place I gained a handout and at Papa Linji's place I gained a handout."[1276] How could this not make the fact that he had attained awakening as a result of being grabbed by Linji clearer?

1271 For "great essence and great function" (*dati dayong* 大體大用); see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.285c13). For "great skill and great function" (*daji dayong* 大機大用), see *Zhenzhou Linji Huizhao chanshi yulu* (T 1985.47.495a11); *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.265a7–8); *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.162b5–6) etc.

1272 Xinghua Cunjiang 興化存獎 (830–888) is a dharma heir of Linji Yixuan. For more on Cunjiang in English, see also Sasaki and Kirchner, *The Record of Linji,* p. 101.

1273 Sansheng Huiran 三聖慧然 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Linji Yixuan. For a while he also studied under Yangshan Huiji. For more on Huiran in English, see also Sasaki and Kirchner, *The Record of Linji,* pp. 100–101.

1274 Little is known about Dajue 大覺 (d.u.). He is the dharma heir of either Linji Yixuan or Huangbo Xiyun. For more on Dajue in English, see also Sasaki and Kirchner, *The Record of Linji,* p. 100.

1275 The commentary seems to be in error here. The two shouts also took place while Cunjiang was studying under Dajue. For the two shouts, see the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.295a15–18); and also *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* (XZJ 135.708a5–9). For the story of Dajue stripping Cunjiang of his robes and giving him a great blow, see the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.295a22–23); and also *Tiansheng guangdeng* lu (XZJ 135.708a13–15).

1276 See the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.32b5–6); and also *Tiansheng guangdeng* lu (XZJ 135.712b4–5).

Paid allegiance to her (*fuying* 伏膺): did he bend (*fu*) his head down to his chest (*ying*)? Bend (*fu* 伏) and obey (*fu* 服) are the same. He obeyed and received (*ying* 膺) it (i.e., Moshan's teachings).

末山者, 境, 是主中主位也; 末山主者, 境中人, 是主中主也. 不露頂者, 無見頂露, 雲攢急也. 非男女相者, 偏正不干也. 乃喝云云者, 灌溪是臨濟之子, 所得不同故也. 不是神云云者, 本無轉變也. 泉石云, "不變兮! 逈超偏正. 喝咄兮! 迭用剛柔. 劫火洞然毫末盡, 青山依舊白雲邊." 於是伏膺云云者, 於此, 又有所得也. 旣是臨濟得大用, 則會得末後句, 更無後事, 到此伏膺者, 何也? 此不可不辨. 灌溪初問臨濟佛法大意, 被他擒住, 却道, "領領." 是只得其體. 此後必有得其用地一公案, 非盡得臨濟意. 如百丈, 於馬祖掛拂竪拂處, 未悟得大體大用, 只知得把定放行也. 故到末山處云, "道得卽住." 又喝云, "何不變去?" 是得臨濟之用, 自以爲究竟. 然如在燈影裏行相似故, 被末山道, "何不盖却?" 不能對, 乃終伏膺也, 作園頭三年, 盡得末山意, 方知臨濟手段, 是大體大用. 如興化在三聖處, 用得兩喝, 又到大覺處, 被他脫下衲衣, 痛打一頓, 悟得臨濟宗旨, 爲嫡孫也. 故住後示衆云, "末山孃孃處, 得一杓; 臨濟爺爺處, 得一杓." 末山處得一杓, 豈非被臨濟擒住處悟得, 更是分明也! 伏膺者, 首伏於膺耶? 伏, 服同, 服而膺之也.

Tiantong Zhengjue's verse

It has the mark of neither man nor woman,
It escaped the measure of existence and non-existence,
It penetrated through to the state before all skills (in *chan*),
It transcended above the three realms,
Impoverished and yet open; simple but just right,
The pine tree frames the moon and the night is cold,
The creek gathers the rain and is brimming with the news of spring waters' surge.

天童覺頌, "非男女之相, 出有無之量. 透萬機之前, 超三界之上. 窮而通, 簡而當. 松含月兮夜寒, 溪帶雨而春漲."

[Explanation]

Tiantong: *Impoverished and yet open* etcetera: biased and the upright have never left the original position.

天童云云, 窮而通云云者, 偏正不曾離本位.

Zhenjing Kewen's verse

Moshan did not reveal the peak that reaches the clouds,
Since old times to the present the lofty peak is before our eyes,
Again, it is said that originally one possesses the mark of neither man nor woman,
Were it not for you I would not have been able to discern the lotus in the flames.[1277]

眞淨文頌, "末山不露凌雲頂, 今古岧嶢在目前. 又道本無男女相, 非君莫辨火中蓮."

Xinwen Tanfen's verse

The mountain does not reveal its peak,
Its form has no mark,
That which appears and stares at you right in your face
What is its appearance?
Exit the door and you can't see even a bit of it,
But white clouds and green peaks fill the eyes.

心聞賁頌, "山不露頂, 形非有相. 覿面相呈, 是何模樣? 出門不見一絲毫, 滿目白雲與青嶂."

1277 This is an allusion to a line from the *Zhengdao ge,* see note 66 above.

Daohong Baoen raised, "While on pilgrimage Guanxi went to the assembly of the nun Liaoran of Moshan and first said, 'If we are mutually compatible, then I will stay. If we are not mutually compatible, then I will flip over the meditation bench. Liaoran ascended the seat and Guanxi went up to have an interview. Liaoran asked, 'Today, where did you leave?' Guanxi said, 'A road crossing.' Liaoran said, 'Why did you not cover it up?' Guanxi did not have a response. He thereupon bowed and again asked, 'What is Moshan?' Liaoran said, 'It does not expose its peak.' Guanxi consequently paid allegiance to her and served as the head gardener for three years." To the former question the master offered a substitute reply, 'I have long heard of Moshan.' To the latter he offered a substitute reply, 'I've completely figured out Moshan.' Bearing in mind that she is a woman, if the responses were like this, think about how she would have responded. If she again, as before, assumes the mark of an old woman and you flip over the meditation bench afterwards, it won't be too late. Masters everywhere sometimes say, 'That's not true. Moshan desperately needed a head gardener.'"

大洪恩擧, "灌溪遊方日, 至末山尼了然會中, 先自云, '相當卽住; 若不相當卽推倒禪床.' 然陞座, 溪上參. 然問, '今日離何處?' 溪云, '路口.' 然云, '何不盖却?' 溪無對, 乃禮拜復問, '如何是末山?' 然云, '不露頂' 至溪於是伏膺, 作園頭三年." 師代前語云, "久響末山." 代後語云, "識得末山了也. 念伊是女人家, 但且恁麽道, 更看伊如何. 若他依舊, 又作老婆相然後, 與推倒禪床, 未遲. 諸方或謂, 不然末山園頭甚要."

[Explanation]

Dahong: *I have long heard of Moshan*: this is also followed by the words, *Why did you not cover it up*. This was said to overwhelm.

I've completely figured out Moshan: originally his views and understandings were simply like this.

Bearing in mind that she is a woman … flip over the Chan meditation bench afterwards, it won't be too late: if it had been done this way, she would not have delayed the deprecation from all over, "She desperately needed a head gardener."

Late (*chí*): second tone. This means, "delay."

That's not true: this is like saying, "It was not like that." This is a deprecation of the inability to flip over the meditation bench.

大洪: 久響末山者, 又有後語云, '何不盖却?' 此言壓倒也. 識得末山了也者, 元來見解, 只如此也. 念伊是女人家, 至倒禪床者, 若伊麼, 不待諸方園頭甚要之噴. 遲, 上聲, 待也. 不然者, 如云不伊麼也, 噴不能推倒禪床.

Tiantong Zhengjue in an informal sermon raised this gongan and said,[1278] "It (Moshan) is not a man and not a woman. It is not a god and not a ghost. It is not a buddha and not a thing. All one knows is that the white clouds are indifferent. Who can discern the green mountains in his eyes? It glows in the night, so I can recognize that it is the jewel presented by the cut snake.[1279] The pond is cold—the blue dragon's bones have fallen to the bottom. One may nonchalantly pull back and cut the purple silk cord, but one cannot collect in Heaven above or among human beings. Being unable to collect has never been a conceptual trap."

天童覺, 小參, 擧此話云, "不是男, 不是女; 不是神, 不是鬼; 不是佛, 不是物. 只知白雲無心, 誰辨青山在目? 夜明識取斷蛇珠, 潭寒退下蒼龍骨. 等閑掣斷紫絲條,[1280] 天上人間收不得. 收不得底事, 從來沒窠窟."

[1278] *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.16b4–8).

[1279] There are different accounts regarding the jewel presented by the injured snake. According to the *Shoushen ji* 搜神記, the marquis of Sui 隋 saw a heavily injured snake, so he had his men sew it back together and healed it with medicine. The snake was thus able to slither away. The snake later repaid this debt by presenting the marquis with a bright jewel, which came to be known as the "numinous snake jewel" (*lingshezhu* 靈蛇珠). For this version, see the *Shoushen ji* 20, 2. According to the Ming dynasty encyclopedia entitled the *Shantang sikao* 山堂肆考, Zhu Yuanchang 祝元暢, the marquis of Sui, saw an injured snake in the sand, so he picked it up with a stick and put it in the water. When he returned to the spot where he found the injured snake he saw a snake holding a jewel, but he dared not pick the jewel up. Later that night he dreamt that he stepped on a snake. When he woke up he acquired a jewel. For this version of the story, see the *Shantang sikao* 223, 23b.

[1280] I follow the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* version and substitute *tao* 絛 for *tiao* 條.

[Explanation]

Foguo: He clarified the fact that there aren't any more transformations in Moshan's state.

佛果: 明末山地, 更無轉變也.

Foguo Keqin's *Xinyao* says,[1281] "A long time ago Guanxi went to Moshan and Moshan asked, 'Where did you leave recently?' Guanxi said, 'A crossroad.' Moshan said, 'Why did you not cover it up?' Guanxi was speechless. The next day he went from being asked, 'What is Moshan's realm?' to being asked, 'What would it transform into?' If this is the case, why did he not tread on the real ground[1282] and face a steep, ten-thousand fathom high cliff? Therefore it is said, 'After the last phrase, one finally arrives at the impenetrable barrier. Hold the key post and do not let ordinary beings or sages pass.' If the ancient ones were like this, then how could people today be slightly deficient? Fortunately, I have the Vajra king's treasure sword.[1283] Only when I meet a sympathetic friend can I take it out."

佛果勤, 心要云, "昔灌溪往末山, 山問, '近離甚處?' 溪云, '路口.' 山云, '何不盖却?' 溪無語. 次日致問, '如何是末山境?' <至> '變个什麽?' 如此, 豈不是脚踏實地, 到壁立萬仞處? 所以道, '末後一句, 始到牢關, 把斷要津, 不通凡聖.' 古人旣爾, 今人豈少欠耶! 幸有金剛王寶劒, 當須遇著知音, 可以拈出."

[Explanation]

Tiantong: *All one knows is that the white clouds … in his eyes*: this means one only knows essence and not the fact that it has function. Therefore, *the*

1281 *Foguo Keqin chanshi xinyao* (XZJ 120.722a13–b1).

1282 "Tread the real earth." These words were used by the Neo-Confucian Shao Yong 邵雍 (1011–1077) to evaluate Sima Guang 司馬光 (1019–1086). "He treads the real earth" became widely known and were used by Chan and Neo-Confucian scholars.

1283 The treasure or diamond sword of the Vajra king refers to the sword of wisdom that cuts off delusion; see Sasaki and Kirchner, *The Record of Linji,* p. 308.

night is bright … the blue dragon's bones have fallen to the bottom discerns its function. What follows is also the same intent.

天童: 只知白雲至在目者, 只知是體, 不知有用也. 故夜明至龍骨者, 辨其用也. 下亦此意也.

Case 559.

Shishuang's "Patriarch's Intent Still in the Teachings"

石霜敎中

[Old case]

Shishuang[1284] was asked by a monk, "Is the Patriarch's intent in the teachings?" The master said, "It is." The monk said, "What is the Patriarch's intent in the teachings?" The master said, "Do not look for it in books."[1285]

石霜因僧問, "敎中還有祖師意麽?" 師云, "有." 僧云, "如何是敎中祖師意?" 師云, "莫向卷中求!"

[Explanation of the gongan]

Is the Patriarch's intent in the teachings etcetera: if you say it is, then why did the World Honored One raise the flower[1286] and also why did Bodhidharma come from the west? If you say it isn't, then since the three vehicles and twelve divisions of the teachings[1287] embody Principle and work sublimely

---

1284 Shishuang Qingzhu is a dharma heir of Daowu Yuanzhi. Qingzhu served as abbot of Mt. Shishuang 石霜山. Qingzhu and his assembly on Mt. Shishuang just practiced seated meditation and for that reason they were known as the "withered tree assembly" (*kumuzhong* 枯木衆). Qingzhu received the posthumous title Great Master Puhui 普會大師.

1285 For this case, see also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.359b14–15); and *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T 1988.47.558a1–2).

1286 See old case 5 of the *Seonmun yeomsong* above.

1287 The three vehicles and twelve divisions of the teachings refer to the Buddha's teachings in their entirety.

where could there be another Patriarchal Teacher Chan?[1288]

It is: this means (the teachings) embody Principle and work sublimely.

Do not look for it in books: getting stuck in the net of the teachings[1289] is also wrong.

教中還有云云者, 若道有, 世尊何故更拈花, 達摩何故更西來? 若道無, 三乘十二分教, 體理得妙, 何處更有祖師禪? 有者, 體理得妙之意也. 莫向卷中求者, 滯於教網之中, 又却不是也.

Yunmen Wenyan offered a substitute reply,[1290] "You can't betray this old monk and sit inside a shithole. What will you do?"

雲門偃代, "不得辜負老僧, 卻向屎坑裏坐地, 作什麼?"

[Explanation]

Yunmen: *Betray*: to speak this way with respect to the intent of the teachings (i.e., asking about the Patriarch's intent and the teachings) is to betray the intent of the teachings. If that is the case, then looking for a separate intent of the Patriarch is (to be in) a shithole.

雲門: 辜負者, 當教意伊麼道, 卽教意辜負也. 然則別討祖師意, 是屎坑也.

Changlu Zongze ascended the hall, raised this gongan, looked at the great assembly, and said, "If you understand (this gongan), the three-hundred

1288 In Chan writings Patriarchal Teacher Chan or Patriarchal Teacher Chan (*zushi chan* 祖師禪) is often contrasted with Tathāgata Chan (*rulai chan* 如來禪). Patriarchal Teacher Chan does not rely on words and letters; see *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 118.16a3–4).

1289 The Buddha's teachings are likened to a net because they are used to scoop people out of the sea of life and death; see the *Dasheng bensheng xindi guanjing* 大乘本生心地觀經 (XZJ 118.182b8). The "teaching net" (*jiaowang* 教網) is also likened to medicine that is dispensed according to potential; see *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.182b8).

1290 For this substitute reply, see also *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T 1988.47.558a2–4).

and sixty or so assemblies of the World Honored One and the five-thousand and forty-eight volumes will all be swallowed in one gulp by all of you, everywhere the titles will become clear, and everywhere the meaning of the characters will become manifest for everyone to see. If this is not the case, then the black parts are characters and the yellow parts are paper. Which is the (right) way to look at the scriptures?"

長蘆賾, 上堂, 擧此話, 顧大衆云, "這裏會得, 世尊三百六十餘會, 五千四十八卷, 被諸人一口呑盡, 一切處題目分明, 一切處字義炳然. 其或未然, 墨底是字, 黄底是紙. 那箇是看經眼?"

Case 598.

Xiangyan's "Last Year"

香嚴去年

[Old case]

Because Xiangyan in verse said,

Last year poverty was not poverty.
Only this year is poverty poverty.
Last year I didn't have a place to put down an awl,
And this year I don't even have an awl.

Yangshan said, "I will admit that you, older brother, understand Tathāgata Chan, but you haven't yet seen Patriach chan even in your dreams."[1291] The master again presented a verse,

I have a trick (機)
that I can show you in the blink of an eye.
If there is a person who does not understand it,
I will specially call him a śrāmanera."[1292]

Yangshan said, "How wonderful! Brother, you understand Patriach

[1291] For the story up to this point, see the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.283b3–6).

[1292] A śrāmanera is someone who has left home (*chujia* 出家) but hasn't received the full precepts. Here, it refers to someone whose state of spiritual maturation is still lacking.

chan!"[1293]

香嚴頌云, "去年貧未是貧, 今年貧始是貧. 去年無卓錐之地, 今年錐也無." 因仰山云, "如來禪, 卽許師兄會, 祖師禪, 未夢見在." 師又呈偈云, "我有一機, 瞬目示伊. 若人不會, 別喚沙彌." 仰云," 且喜, 師兄! 會祖師禪也."

[Explanation of the gongan]

Last year poverty was not etcetera: before, he was told by Yangshan, "Your understanding is still in the realm of perception. You know that there is not a single dharma that corresponds to sentience, but how can there not be a knowing subject?" Because the knowing subject was also lost Xiangyan only understood Tathāgata Chan.

I have a trick etcetera: because the way he raises his eyebrows and blinks his eyes is thorough and without remainder I specially call him a śrāmanera but in the end he does not change.

去年貧云云者, 前被仰山云, "你解猶在境! 你能知無一法可當情, 豈無能知者!" 是能知亦亡, 只會如來禪也. 我有一機云云者, 揚眉瞬目徹底無餘故, 別喚沙彌, 終不移易也.

Layman Yuezhai's verse

Patriarchal Teacher Chan!
There is a lack of perfection in one part of your meditative work,
You only understand how a seed grows into a shadow-less tree,
But you can't open the lotus in the flame,
Tathāgata Chan!
Fold your fingers and it becomes a fist; open your fingers and it becomes a palm.

[1293] For this story, see the *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.566a13–17); *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.826b10–13); and *Wudeng huiyuan* (XZJ 138.327a12–16).

I use a bamboo strainer to scoop up all the (fragrance) in the Land of Abundant Fragrance,[1294]
I fan it with a fan and (the fragrance) reached the Brahma-king heaven.

悅齋居士頌, "祖師禪! 一處工夫有未圓. 只解種成無影樹, 未能開得火中蓮. 如來禪! 合手成掌開成拳.[1295] 笊籬舀盡香積國, 扇子扇到梵王天."

[Explanation]
Yuezhai: *Fold your fingers* etcetera: to control (把定) is to release (放行); to release is to control. It is the middle way.
I use a bamboo strainer etcetera: this is essence.
I fan it etcetera: this is function.
This covers everything from the subtle to the obvious.

悅齋: 合手成掌云云者, 把定卽放行, 放行卽把定, 中間也. 笊籬云云者, 體也. 扇子云云者, 用也. 從微至著也.

Changqing Huileng[1296] said, "Cut them out simultaneously."[1297]

長慶稜云, "一時坐[1298]却."

[Explanation]
Changqing: Tathāgata Chan and Patriarchal Teacher Chan—you can let neither off the hook.

1294 As the name implies, the Land of Abundant Fragrance (*Xiangjiguo* 香積國) is a land where everything that is contained therein is fragrant. Abundant Fragrance was also used as a name for the kitchen at a Zen monastery; see ZGD, p. 312.

1295 The received text appears to be in error here. I have changed the place of the characters for fist (*zhang* 掌) and palm (*quan* 拳).

1296 For Changqing Huileng, see note 150 above.

1297 For the comment, see also the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.283b6).

1298 Here I substitute cuo 挫 for zuo 坐.

長慶: 如來禪祖師禪, 皆不得放過.

Xuanjue[1299] inquired,[1300] "Speak! Can one distinguish Tathāgata Chan from Patriarchal Teacher Chan or not?"

玄覺徵, "且道! 如來禪與祖師禪, 分不分?"

[Explanation]

Xuanjue: If you understand Tathāgata Chan, where would you find a separate Patriarchal Teacher Chan?

玄覺: 會得如來禪, 何處更討祖師禪!

Yunju Qingxi[1301] inquired, "According to calculations in the assembly, Tathāgata Chan is shallow and Patriarchal Teacher Chan is deep. But what about Xiangyan at that time? Why did he not ask, 'What is Patriarchal Teacher Chan?' If this question was put forward, where was (the master)?"[1302]

雲居錫徵, "衆中商量, 如來禪淺, 祖師禪深. 只如香嚴當時, 何不問如何是祖師禪? 若置此一問, 何處有也?"

[Explanation]

Yunju: *But what about Xiangyan at that time* etcetera: other than Tathāgata Chan, what could Patriarchal Teacher Chan be?

Where is (the master): this means where is Yangshan.

1299 This is Fayan Wenyi's disciple Baoci Wensui, see note 1059 above.

1300 See the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.283b6).

1301 Yunju Qingxi 雲居清錫 (d.u.) is a dharma heir of Fayan Wenyi. Qingxi served as abbot of Guangping Cloister 廣平院 in Longxu 龍須 (Hebei province), Zhenru Cloister 真如院 on Mt. Yunju 雲居 (Jiangxi province), and Ximing Cloister 西明院 in Quanzhou (Fujian province).

1302 For this question, see also the *Chanlin leiju* (XZJ 117.103b8–10).

雲居: 香嚴當時云云者, 如來禪外, 何者是祖師禪也. 何處有者, 何處有仰山也.

Langya Huijue added a comment, "Emperor Wu[1303] sought transcendence but could not attain transcendence.[1304] Wang Qiao[1305] sat up straight but ascended to Heaven."[1306]

瑯琊覺拈, "武帝求仙不得仙, 王喬端坐却昇天."

[Explanation]

Langya: *Xiangyan* etcetera: this is *Emperor Wu sought transcendence* etcetera.

What Yangshan said—is this *Wang Qiao* etcetera?

Patriarchal Teacher Chan is *Emperor Wu* etcetera.

Tathāgata Chan is *Wang Qiao* etcetera.

瑯琊: 香嚴云云者, 是武帝求仙云云也. 仰山道得, 是王喬云云耶? 祖師禪, 是武帝云云也. 如來禪, 是王喬云云也.

Zhihai Benyi ascended the hall and raised this gongan. When he reached, "I don't even have an awl," the master said, "I would not have done so. 'Last year the end of wealth was not wealth; this year the beginning of wealth is wealth. Last year all I wore was Zhaozhou's jacket[1307]; this year I've taken off

---

1303 This is referring to Emperor Wu 武帝 (r. 141–187 B.C.E.) of the Han dynasty.

1304 For Emperor Wu's interest in transcendence or immortality, see Livia Kohn, *Daoism Handbook* (Leiden: Brill, 2000), pp. 111–112.

1305 Wang Qiao 王喬 is a famous practitioner of transcendence or immortality from the Han dynasty; see the *Shoushen ji* (Wenyuange Siku quan shu edition) 1, 5a.

1306 For this comment, see also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.791a17); and *Chanlin leiju* (XZJ 117.103b10–11).

1307 Zhaozhou is known to have mentioned his jacket on two different occasions. Once a monk asked, "Where do the ten-thousand dharmas return?" Zhaozhou said, "When I was in Qingzhou I

Yunju's trousers.[1308] Dear Chan virtuosos! The poor are poor like ghosts; the rich are rich like donkeys. How could the poor and rich become even?" He himself replied, "One cannot stretch a duck's feet or cut a crane's legs." Again he said, "Why can't one stretch a duck's feet or cut a crane's legs?[1309] A great tree is wrapped inside great bark; a small tree is surrounded by small bark."

智海逸, 上堂, 擧此話, 至錐也無, 師云, "智海卽不然. '去年富未是富, 今年富始是富. 去年猶著趙州衫, 今年脫下雲居袴.' 諸禪德, 貪者貧似鬼, 富者富如驢, 作麼生得貧富均平去?" 自云, "不可續鳬截鶴." 又云, "爲什麼不續鳬截鶴? 大樹大皮裹, 小樹小皮纏."

[Explanation]

Zhihai: *Zhaozhou's jacket*: its weight is seven catties (*jin*).

Yunju's trousers: inherited trousers. If you're wearing a seven-pound jacket there is no need for a pair of trousers that you received from your mother at birth.

The poor become poorer and the rich become richer. In other words, to make the poor and rich even is to cut the long and supplement the short. The duck's leg is short and the crane's leg is long. A big tree is big and the small tree is small.

智海: 趙州衫者, 重七斤地. 雲居袴者, 孃生袴也. 被著七斤衫, 不要孃生袴也. 貧

---

acquired a seven pound cloth jacket"; see the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.278a2–3). For the other instance of Zhaozhou's reference to his cloth jacket, see old case 204 above.

1308 Yunju is said to have dispatched a messenger to present a monk who was living in a hermitage nearby with a pair of trousers. The monk returned the trousers with the explanation that he already had a pair of trousers that he received from his mother at birth. Yunju then asked his messenger why he didn't ask the monk at the hermitage what he wore before his mother was born. For this story, see *Xutang heshang yulu* (T 2000.47.1025c27–1026a1); and also case 864.

1309 This is an allusion to a passage from the "Webbed Toes" (*pianmu* 駢拇) chapter in the *Zhuangzi* (i.e., "The duck's legs are short, but to stretch them out would worry him; the crane's legs are long, but to cut them down would make him sad"); see Watson, *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu*, pp. 99–100.

則貧到底, 富則富到底, 則貧富平均, 是裁長補短也. 不如鳧脛短鶴脛長, 大樹大小樹小.

Jinshan Liaoyuan ascended the hall and raised this gongan. When he reached, *I don't even have an awl,* the master said, "Dear eminent virtuosos! Speak! If Xiangyan does not have an awl, this time what will he use?" He held up his staff straight and said, "Return to the hall and drink some tea."

金山元, 上堂, 擧此話,<至>錐也無, 師云, "諸高德, 且道! 香嚴錐子旣無, 遮回用个什麽?" 卓拄杖云, "歸堂喫茶!"

[Explanation]
Jinshan: What we use today—how could this not be the awl that (Xiangyan) used at the time? He only eliminated its illness. If you understand the intent behind this, then return to the hall and drink some tea.

金山: 卽今用底, 豈不是當時錐子! 但除其病, 爾若會此意, 歸堂喫茶.

Jiangshan Canyuan ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and said, "If you don't even have place to put down an awl, what will you use to cover mouths and screen off bodies. Haven't you seen the saying, 'The golden rooster an carry a grain of rice in its mouth and make offerings to arhats in the ten directions.'"[1310]

蔣山元, 上堂, 擧此話云, "旣無卓錐之地, 將什麽塞口遮身? 不見道, 金雞解含一粒米, 供養十方羅漢僧?"

[Explanation]
Jiangshan: Still there actually is a place to put an awl.

1310 This is originally a prediction of the spread of Chan in the East. The golden rooster is a metaphor for Bodhidharma; see *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.245c28–29).

蔣山: 亦不妨有卓錐之地.

Jiangshan Faquan while instructing the assembly raised this gongan and said,[1311] "Xiangyan, although his compassion was vast, how could he know that the more favors you receive the deeper resentment becomes? I would not have done so. I have skills (機) that are faster than lightning. If there is someone who does not understand, I will strike the back of his head (a vulnerable place) with an iron hammer."

蔣山泉, 示衆, 擧此話云, "香嚴, 雖然慈悲廣大, 豈知恩多怨深! 山僧卽不然. '我有一機, 電掣猶遲. 有人不會, 腦後金鎚.' "

[Explanation]

Jiangshan (Faquan): *I have a trick that I can show you in the blink of an eye* etcetera: it seems as if there is an instruction here. This is what is meant by *the more favors you receive the deeper resentment becomes.*

I have a trick etcetera: "in the blink of an eye you've already erred."[1312]

蔣山: 話中, 瞬目示伊云云, 似有指示處也, 是恩多而怨深也. 我有一機云云者, 眨上眉毛, 早已蹉過.

Weishan Mutie added a comment,[1313] "Xiangyan can be called someone who does not have roof tiles to place above or a place to put an awl below.' He is bare-nakedly pure and immaculately exposed and cannot be grasped. If it were not for Yangshan we almost let this man off the hook. Why? Had it not been for the force of the snow and frost, how could we know the integrity of the pine and cypress?"

1311 For this comment, see also the *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.369b18–370a2).

1312 These are the words of Mazu Daoyi's dharma heir, Sanjue Congyin 三角總印 (d.u.); see the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.251c17–18).

1313 For this comment, see also the *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.527a5–6).

潙山喆拈,"香嚴可謂, 上無片瓦, 下無卓錐. 露躶躶, 赤灑灑, 沒可把, 若不是仰山, 幾乎放過這漢. 何故? 不得雪霜力, 焉知松柏操!"

[Explanation]

Weishan: *Had it not been for the force of the snow and frost* etcetera: did he only come to understand Patriarchal Teacher Chan because of Yangshan's exhaustive interrogation? Tathāgata Chan is none other than understanding Patriarchal Teacher Chan.

潙山: 不得雪霜力云云者, 因仰山窮詰, 始會得祖師禪耶? 卽如來禪, 會祖師禪也.

Zhenjing Kewen ascended the hall and raised this gongan. When he reached, *I don't even have an awl,* the master said,[1314] "What Xiangyan said was special,very special. But still, all he knew was how poor he was and not how rich he was. I (Dongshan) would not have done so. 'Last year the end of wealth was not wealth; this year the beginning of wealth is wealth.' Last year's wealth was nothing but a dark grey cotton jacket; this year's wealth is a white robe brocaded with images of mountains and waters. On New Year's morning I shake it out to show the Chan assembly. Truly this can be called stylishness brought out from my own house. Dear Chan virtues! What I've said—does this disagree with the ancient one or does it support the ancient one? Try discerning it for yourself."

眞淨文, 上堂, 擧此話,<至> 錐也無, 師云,"香嚴與麽道, 奇特甚奇特. 要且, 只知其貧, 不知其富. 洞山卽不然. '去年富未是富, 今年富始是富. 去年富, 唯有一領墨黲布褊衫, 今年富, 添得一條百衲山水袈裟.' 歲朝抖擻呈禪衆, 實謂風流出當家. 諸禪德! 洞山與麽, 爲復是不肯古人耶? 爲復扶古人耶? 試辨看."

1314 For this sermon, see also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ118.714b10–15).

[Explanation]

Zhenjing: The great meaning of (Zhenjing's sermon) is identical to Zhihai's ascending the hall (formal) sermon above.

Dark gray: a undecorated undergarment.

A white robe brocaded with images of mountains and waters: a decorated outergarment.

In other words, the one mind is the ten-thousand dharmas.

眞淨: 大義, 智海上堂同也. 墨黲者, 沒文彩地內衣也. 百衲山水袈裟者, 有文彩地外衣也. 則一心萬法也.

Xuedou Faning ascended the hall and raised Xiangyan's saying, "I have a trick … specially call him a śrāmanera." The master said, "I would not have done so. 'I have a trick that the patriarchs and buddhas do not know. Words change according to phenomena and things move according to one's intent. There are times when I'm faced with putting things to use, but nothing is worth pursuing.'" He thereupon called the great assembly in the loud voice. Everyone in the assembly raised his head and the master again said, "Return to the hall and drink some tea."

雪竇寧, 上堂, 擧香嚴云, '我有一機, 至別喚沙彌.' 師云, "雪竇卽不然. '我有一機, 祖佛不知. 言隨事變, 物逐意移. 有時當面用, 無物可追隨.' " 乃高聲召大衆, 衆擧頭, 師復云, "歸堂喫茶去."

[Explanation]

Xuedou: *The patriarchs and buddhas do not know*: how will you respond?

Words change according to phenomena etcetera: he still wants to make calculations with you.[1315]

There are times when I'm faced with etcetera: you have to be such a person.[1316]

1315 This expression is also found in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.305a19).

1316 This expression is also found in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.305a20).

Drink some tea: how will you piece everything together?

雪竇: 佛祖不知, 作麽生當抵? 言隨事變云云者, 要且[1317]共汝商量也. 有時當面云云者, 如也須箇人. 喫茶去者, 汝作麽生湊泊?

Songyuan (Chongyue) ascended the hall and raised this gongan. When he reached, *I don't even have an awl,* the master said,[1318] "A year has passed and a new year has arrived, but the poor are still poor. The foot that the patriarch lifts weighs a thousand catties. A person full of grief does not tell another person full of grief. If you tell a person full of grief, the grief will kill the person."

松源, 上堂, 擧此話,<至> 錐也無, 師云, "年去年來貧復貧, 祖師擡脚重千斤. 愁人莫向愁人說, 說向愁人愁殺人."

[Explanation]

Songyuan: The poor are still poor: this is why he cannot take another step and also why grief kills the person.

松源: 貧復貧, 是擡脚不起, 亦愁殺人.

1317 I follow the *Jingde chuandeng lu* and substitute *qieyao* 且要 for *yaoqie* 要且.

1318 For this comment, see also the *Songyuan Chongyue chanshi yulu* (XZJ 121.592b18–593a2).

Case 600.

Xiangyan's "Let's Say There is a Person …"

香嚴如人

[Old case]

Xiangyan while instructing the assembly said, "Let's say a person is up in a tree hanging by his teeth from a branch. He can't hang on to the branch with his hands or step on the tree with his feet. Under the tree a certain person asks about (Bodhidharma's) intention in coming from the west. If he doesn't respond, then he will commit an offense against the person who asked the question. If he responds, then he will hurt his body and lose his life. When you are faced with such a situation, what is the right thing to do?" At that time chief seat Hutou[1319] stepped forward and asked, "I won't ask about being up in a tree. I beseech your reverence to tell us what it is like when he has not yet been up the tree." The master laughed out loud, "Ha, ha!"[1320]

香嚴, 示衆云, "如人上樹, 口啣樹枝, 手不攀枝, 脚不踏樹, 樹下有人問西來意. 不對則違他所問, 若對則喪身失命. 當與麽時, 作麽生則是?" 時有虎頭上座, 出問, "上樹即不問, 未上樹時, 請和尚道." 師呵呵大笑.

[Explanation of the gongan]

Let's say a person is up in a tree hanging by his teeth from a branch etcetera: both speech and silence are wrong.

1319 The identity of Hutou 虎頭 is unclear.

1320 For this story, see also the *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.360b9–14); and also *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.566b4–8).

I won't ask about being up in a tree etcetera: does this mean that both speech and silence are right? No it does not.

Under the tree: this is not being under the tree after being up in the tree. From the very beginning he had not yet been up the tree. Therefore commentators (拈頌家) say, "under the tree" (樹下) or say "not yet been up the tree" (未上樹)" and do not say "coming down the tree" (下樹).

Laughed out loud, "Ha, ha!": the tiger's head (Hutou) and the tiger's tail are simultaneously collected.

如人上樹口啣樹枝云云者, 語也錯, 黙也錯也. 上樹卽不問云云者, 語也得黙也得耶? 非也! 樹下者, 非上樹然後下樹, 始初未上樹時也. 故拈頌家云, '樹下.' 或云, '未上樹.' 而不云 '下樹' 也. 呵呵大笑者, 虎頭虎尾一時收也.

Fenyang Shanzhao's verse[1321]

Xiangyan instructed many people with "Hanging by his teeth from a tree,"
So that he can pull them towards and reach the original truth,
But they hesitate and seek it in words,
Those who hurt their bodies and lose their lives are as numerous as dust,
I will open Heaven's path for you,
As the clouds scatter the fresh color of the moonlight spreads across the sky.

汾陽昭頌, "香嚴啣樹示多人, 要引同袍達本眞. 擬議却從言下覓, 喪身失命數如塵. 汾陽爲你開天[1322]路, 雲散長空[1323]月色[1324]新."

1321 For this verse, see the *Fenyang Wude chanshi yulu;* and also *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.872a28-b3). The verse that we have above is closer to the version found in the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu*.

1322 *Fenyang Wude chanshi yulu* has *mi* 迷 ("delusion") for *tian* 天 ("Heaven").

1323 *Fenyang Wude chanshi yulu* has *tian* 空 ("sky") for *kong* 天 ("Heaven").

1324 *Fenyang Wude chanshi yulu* has *riyue* 日月 ("sun and moon") for *yuese* 月色 ("color of the moonlight").

[Explanation]

Fenyang: *As numerous as dust*: what Xiangyan said.

As the clouds scatter etcetera: the state of being up in the tree never transcended the state of being under the tree. Jiangshan's verse below also has this same intent.

汾陽云云, 數如塵者, 香嚴道地也. 雲散云云者, 樹上地未嘗離下樹地也. 下蔣山頌亦此意.

Jiangshan Faquan's verse[1325]

Laughing out loud, "Ha, ha"—no place to poke a needle,
How could the state of being up in the tree be like the state of not yet having been up the tree?
Even though Xiangyan has many tricks and skills,
While watching from the sidelines one can't help but knit one's brows.

蔣山泉頌, "呵呵大笑沒針錐. 上樹何如未上時? 任使香嚴多伎倆, 傍觀不免爲攢眉."

Shimen Yuanyi's verse[1326]

An ancient sage's compassionate mind benefits later generations,
Hanging by his teeth from a branch, he exposes his entire body,
Even if the mysterious path does not have any revealed facts,
One can't avoid learning about the death of both parents at home.[1327]

1325 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.318b8–9).

1326 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.318b12–13).

1327 Here, both parents probably refers to speech and silence.

石門易頌, "古聖悲心利後人, 口啣枝上露全身. 直饒玄路無消息, 未免家中喪二親."

Baoning Renyong's verse[1328]

Creatively establishing many methods—the old awl,[1329]
How can more branches grow on branches?
It is good to act like a fine horse who (runs) when it catches a glimpse of the whip's shadow,[1330]
A clod chasing (dog) is no lion's cub.[1331]

保寧勇頌, "曲設多方老古錐! 那堪枝上更生枝? 好如良馬窺鞭影, 逐塊且非師子兒."

Xuedou Faning's verse

Xiangyan stirred up a disturbance on top of a tree,
You answer with a smile from the source (of water) under the tree.
Go up the tree and you can clarify the way to go beyond (向上),
How could this be like quietude? *Svāhā!*

雪竇寧頌, "香嚴樹上皷風波, 樹下窮源笑答他. 上樹更能明向上, 爭如靜處薩婆訶!"

1328 For this verse, see also *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 118.102b11–12).

1329 "Old awl" (*laoguzhui* 老古錐) is a metaphor that is often used to refer to a great teacher; for instance, see *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.848c1). Here, it refers to Xiangyan.

1330 For this analogy, see *Za ahan jing* (T2.XX.154a11).

1331 For the Han hound that chases after a lump of dirt, see note 810 above.

Zhaxi Riyi's verse[1332]

On a narrow path it is difficult to turn around,
Both east and west are mountains.
In a place where travelers cannot go,
The flowers that fall as the winds settle down are restful.

雪溪益頌, "狹路轉身難, 東西盡是山. 行人不到處, 風定落花閑."

Layman Yuezhai's verse

Taking pity on him, he asks what it's like to be up in a tree,
The calculations under the tree are incomparably numerous,
Step on the scale (and you know) the needle on the scale is as hard as iron,
Chang'an is originally not separated by mountains and rivers.

悅齋居士頌, "憐渠上樹問如何, 樹下商量不較多. 踏著秤槌硬似鐵, 長安元不隔山河."

Xuedou Chongxian added a comment,[1333] "It is easy to speak up in the tree, but it is difficult to speak under the tree. The old monk climbed the tree, so go and ask him a question."

雪竇顯拈, "樹上道即易, 樹下道則難. 老僧上樹也, 致將一問來."

[Explanation]
Xuedou (Chongxian): The great intent is that to be up in the tree is to be under the tree.

1332 For this verse, see also the *Chanlin leiju* (XZJ117.227a15–16).

1333 For this comment, see also the *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.685c19–20).

雪竇大意, 樹上卽樹下也.

Cuiyan Shouzhi added a comment,[1334] "The person who asks the question and the person who answers cannot but hurt their bodies and lose their lives. *What will you* patched-robe monks *do today?*"

翠巖芝拈, "問者對者, 不免喪身失命. 如今衲僧作麼生?"

[Explanation]
Cuiyan: What will you patched-robe monks do today: is this an understanding up in the tree or under the tree?

翠巖: 如今衲僧作麼生者, 樹上會耶? 樹下會耶?

Zhihai Benyi ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and then raised Xuedou's added comment. The master said, "Old man Xuedou is usually *a man who surpasses his predecessors and his descendents and an unrivaled figure in this domain*. But before he could realize it, he was sent up on the tree by Xiangyan and to this day he legs have not touched the ground. Those with an eye for the truth should try to discern this."

智海逸, 上堂, 擧此話, 連擧雪竇拈, 師云, "雪竇老漢, 尋常, 光前絕後, 獨步寰中, 不覺被香嚴送放樹上, 直至于今, 脚不履地. 具眼者, 辨取!"

[Explanation]
Zhihai: He supports chief seat Hutou when he is not up in the tree. Hutou can therefore be said to be a man who surpasses his predecessors and his descendents and an unrivaled figure in this domain.

智海: 扶他虎頭上座未上樹時也. 然則虎頭可謂光前絶後, 獨步寰中.

1334 For this comment, see also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.486a12–13).

Tiantong Zhengjue raised this gongan and then raised Xuedou's added comment. The master said,[1335] "Chief seat Hutou is an evil thief. He uses his immoral hands to strike a defenseless house. Even if he is a virtuoso of original form often he doesn't know what to do with his hands and feet. Xuedou was man of special aptitude and is best recognized as a faultless fellow. But in the present situation, he too was only able to hide his body and expose his shadow. Can you understand what Xiangyan is doing? Where are the three thousand swordsmen now? We can only admit Zhuang Zhou as someone who saw Great Peace."[1336]

天童覺, 擧此話, 連擧雪竇拈, 師云, "虎頭上座, 是个惡賊, 用無義手, 打不妨家. 直饒本色作家, 往往措手脚不辨, 雪竇是別機, 宜識休咎底漢. 到這裏, 亦只得藏身露影. 還會香嚴做處麽? 三千劔客今何在? 獨許莊周見太平."

[Explanation]
Tiantong: This supports chief seat Hutou.

天童: 扶虎頭上座也.

Fazhen Shouyi added a comment, "In fact, why did Xiangyan laugh?" And then he raised Xuedou's added comment. The master said, "Speak! Is Xuedou's (added comment) words up in the tree or words under the tree? Try and say it for yourself."

法眞一拈, "秖如香嚴, 笑箇什麽?" 乃擧雪竇拈, 師云, "且道! 雪竇是樹上語, 樹下語? 試請道看."

1335 For this sermon, see also the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.28b1–6).

1336 This is a reference to the "Discoursing on Swords" (*shuojian* 說劍) chapter in the *Zhuangzi*, see Watson, *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu*, pp. 339–343. Zhuang Zhou 莊周 or Zhuangzi convinced King Wen 文王 of Zhao 趙 to abandon his passion for swords and brought peace to the realm.

[Explanation]
Fazhen: He playfully showed the meaning of Xiangyan's laugh.

法眞: 弄現香嚴笑處.

Zhu'an Shigui raised this gongan. When he arrived at "hurt his body and lose his life" the master said, "Xiangyan is just like Xiao He when he compiled the legal code."[1337]

竹庵珪, 擧此話, 至喪身失命, 師云, "香嚴, 大似蕭何置律."

[Explanation]
Zhu'an: Because (his distorted understanding) was inverted right there up in the tree.

竹庵: 只向樹上著倒故也.

Jingshan Zonggao[1338] ascended the hall. A monk asked, "An ancient one said, 'Let's say a person is up in a tree hanging by his teeth from a branch. He can't hang on to the branch with his hands or step on the tree with his feet.' I wonder if there is enough in the gongan to answer it before it is fully examined or not?" The master said,[1339] "*The gongan has already been answered*." The monk continued, "I asked about the gongan, 'Up in the tree,' why is your reverence answering 'Under the tree'?" The master replied, "I simply answered 'Under the tree' for your sake." The monk continued, "*Are you deceiving the great assembly's eyes?*" The master replied, "*It's so obvious I can't deceive*." The monk continued, "But what about the time before the tree grew and the revealed facts have not yet been set in motion? Where can Xiangyan get

1337 For Xiao He and the legal code, see note 426 above.

1338 This is Dahui Zonggao, see note 70 above.

1339 For this sermon, see also the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.827b27–c17).

this point of the story?" The master replied, "You can get it in your lacquered bucket." The monk continued, "But what about your reverence's saying, 'If you call this a bamboo stick you confront it, but if you don't call it a bamboo stick you ignore it.'[1340] Is there some other way to care for others or not?" The master said, "No." The monk continued, "If that's the case, then (the saying) becomes an empty contrivance." The master said, "It is an empty contrivance." He thereupon said, "Let's say a person is up in a tree hanging by his teeth from a branch … he will commit an offense against the person who asked the question. At that time just as Xiangyan uttered these words next to him there was someone who did not agree with him called chief seat Hutou. He stepped forward from the assembly and said, 'I won't ask about being up in a tree. Tell us a phrase from under the tree.'" The master said, "Dangerous!" (The master continued,) "Xiangyan laughed out loud, 'Ha, ha!'" The master said, "Dangerous!" (The master continued,) "As for my (Jingshan) use of 'Dangerous' twice, one 'Dangerous' covers everything like the sky and undergirds everything like the earth and the other 'Dangerous' is way off and bears no relevance. Is there anyone who can tell them apart? If you can tell them apart, not only did you personally see Xiangyan but you also made it impossible for chief seat Hutou to settle down and get on with his pursuit. If there isn't anyone, then I'll take a clear-cut public case[1341] and add a footnote for all of you: 'If you call this a bamboo stick you confront it, but if you don't call it a bamboo stick you ignore it.'"

> 徑山杲, 上堂, 僧問, "古人道, '如人上樹, 口啣樹枝, 手不攀枝, 脚不踏樹.' 未審還有答話分也無?" 師云, "答話了也." 進云, "學人問樹上話, 和尚爲什麼, 向樹下答?" 師云, "只爲你在樹下問." 進云, "謾得大衆眼麼?" 師云, "灼然, 謾不得." 進云, "只如樹子未生, 消息未動, 香嚴向甚麼處, 得這个話頭來?" 師云, "向你柒桶

1340 According to the *Tiansheng guangdeng lu,* Shoushan Shengnian gave this gongan to his disciple Guisheng 歸省 (d.u.); see *Tiansheng guangdeng lu* (XZJ 135.744b18–19). Dahui seems to have been fond of this gongan; for instance, see *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.825c21, 825c24–25, 827c5, 827c17, 831b12–13, 856a9–10, 869a27, 870a14–15, 876c27–28, 879c11–12, 881c25, 882a2, 882a15); and also the *Congrong lu* (T 2004.48.267c24–25).

1341 For "clear-cut public case" (*xiancheng gong'an* 現成公案), see Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten,* p. 112.

裹得來." 進云, "只如和尚道, '喚作竹篦則觸, 不喚作竹篦則背.' 還有爲人處也無?" 師云, "無." 進云, "恁麽則却成虛設." 師云, "虛設." 乃云, " '如人上樹, 至達他所問.' 是時香嚴, 才恁麽道, 便有个傍不肯底, 喚作虎頭上座, 出衆云, '樹上即不問, 樹下道將一句來.' " 師云, "險!" 香嚴呵呵大笑, 師云, "險!" "徑山這兩險, 有一險, 如天普盖, 似地普擎;有一險, 料掉沒交涉. 還有揀得出者麽? 若揀得出, 非唯親見香嚴, 亦使虎頭上座, 無安身立命處. 如無, 徑山將現成公案, 爲你諸人, 下个注脚. 喚作竹篦則觸, 不喚作竹篦則背."

[Explanation]

Jingshan: The gongan has already been answered: the intent behind answering the gongan is also up in the tree.

Are you deceiving the great assembly's eyes: the great assembly's eyes are neither up in the tree nor under the tree. Therefore, It's so obvious I can't deceive.

But what about the time … get this point of the story: he raised a point that is concerned with neither "up in the tree" nor "under the tree."

You can get it in your lacquered bucket: not being able to say anything up in the tree is a lacquered bucket.

Your reverence's saying, 'If you call this a bamboo stick' etcetera: again, a question for him from under the tree.

Is there some other way to care for others or not: there is no other way to care for others. This is "Up in the tree."

Then (the saying) becomes an empty contrivance: this is an investigation.

It is an empty contrivance: (to say,) "Indeed, where can one find the truth?" is an empty contrivance.

As a capping phrase for the question raised by chief seat Hutou, (the master said) *Dangerous.* And for "Xiangyan laughed out loud, 'Ha, ha!" (the master said) *Dangerous*. Xiangyan's words are dangerous. How could Hutou's words be dangerous?

One 'Dangerous' covers etcetera: this points to the dangerous. Laughing out loud, "Ha, ha!" is precisely this.

Covers everything like the sky etcetera: this means, "How could Hutou's

words be like this?"

The other 'Dangerous' is way off etcetera: this points to chief seat Hutou's (previous question about) the dangerous under the tree. If this is understood as bearing no relevance, then how could it be dangerous?

Not only did you personally see etcetera: if you personally get Xiangyan's intent, then *it is impossible for chief seat Hutou to settle down and get on with his pursuit.*

If you call this a bamboo stick etcetera: if that is the case, then Hutou also has a way to settle down and get on with his pursuit.

> 徑山: 答話了也者, 樹上亦有答話意也. 謾得大衆眼麽者, 大衆眼則不在樹上樹下也. 故灼然謾不得也. 只如樹子至話頭來者, 樹上樹下不干處拈出也. 漆桶裏得來者, 樹上道不得, 是漆桶也. 和尚道, 喚作竹篦子云云者, 又向樹下問他. 爲人不爲人也無者, 無爲人處也. 即是樹上也. 却成虛設者, 勘驗也. 虛設者, 果然甚處摸摖, 眞是虛設也. 虎頭上座問處著語, 險, 香嚴呵呵大笑處, 險, 香嚴語, 是險也, 虎頭語, 豈是險也. 有一險如天云云者, 指險也, 呵呵大笑是. 如天普盖云云者, 豈是虎頭如是也. 有一險料掉云云者, 指前虎頭上座樹下險也. 旣是了沒交涉, 豈是險也. 非唯親見云云者, 親得香嚴意, 則虎頭上座, 却是無安身立命處. 喚作竹篦云云者, 然則虎頭, 亦有安身立命處.

Again, during a general sermon he raised this gongan and said,[1342] "Years ago I had beseeched a venerable worthy for instruction, 'I wonder what is Xiangyan's intent before it is fully examined?' He took the whisk's handle and placed it horizontally in his mouth, closed his eyes shut, and acted as if he were hanging from a tree branch with his teeth. He shook his hands and moved his legs to and fro. This is how he answered me." The master thereupon snapped his fingers and said, "As for a response like this, even someone whose reputation made the rounds back in those days exhibited such behavior. The strange reactions of the rest are not worth mentioning. Do you wish to understand? If you can come up with even a single phrase,

1342 *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.872a6–872b4).

I will explain it first for you. If I don't see you come up with even a single phrase, then try to seek understanding in the story that was raised. When I'm done raising it then you're done understanding it. If this isn't the truth, then what is the truth? What about *Let's say a person is up in a tree hanging by his teeth from a branch … will hurt his body and lose his life?* What will you do? There is not an opening here for even a strand of hair."

"At that time, in Xiangyan's assembly only chief seat Hutou was able to receive Xiangyan's intent. So he stepped forward and to give Xiangyan a break he said, *I won't ask about being up in a tree. I beseech your reverence to tell us what it is like when he has not yet been up the tree*": the master (Dahui) said, "Although he gained fame, he lost both feet."[1343]

"Xiangyan laughed out loud, "Ha, ha!": the master said, "Thick skinned," and again said, "He rotates the Heaven-disc and the earth-axis." "Later Xuedou added a comment, *It is easy to speak from on top of the tree … go and ask him a question*. Although Xuedou gave chief seat Hutou a break, how could this not miss Xiangyan's point? These days there are some confused men who hear about what Xuedou said, borrow the words of Dongshan, and say,[1344] 'As long as you don't offend against present taboos, you are even superior to the talented man with the cut tongue from the previous dynasty.'[1345] And they refer to the question raised by Xiangyan as something that is 'like a ball of fire' and so one cannot confront it. Although this is

---

1343 This a reference to the story of Bian He and his jade; see note 367 above.

1344 For this comment, see also the *Linjian lu* (XZJ 148.634a18–b1); *Wudeng huiyuan* (XZJ 138.471a18–b1); and *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.63c7). The subject of Dongshan Liangjie's comment, according to these and other sources, is one of the five positions (*wuwei*), "coming from within the real" (*zhengzhong lai* 正中來).

1345 "The talented man with the cut tongue from the previous dynasty" refers to Heruo Bi 賀若弼 (544–607). Bi's father Dun 敦, a general of the Zhou 周 dynasty, was isolated by the invading troops of Chen 陳 and was forced to retreat in 561. Blaming his own tongue for his death, Dun reminded his son Bi of his desire to reclaim the lost territory and took an awl and cut Bi's tongue; see *Sui shu* 隋書 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 52, 6–7. Heruo Bi, as a general of the new Sui 隋 dynasty, eventually succeeded in defeating the forces of Chen. See also the account in the *Linjian lu* (XZJ 148.634b4–7).

the case, one cannot cut off words and phrases. 'Someone asked, "What is a Buddha." (Dongshan Shouchu replied,) "Three pounds of hemp." '[1346] '"What is the Patriarch's intent in coming from the West?" (Zhaozhou Congshen replied,) "Cypress tree in the front of the courtyard garden." '[1347] What harm could there be (in saying this)? There is no harm and you can understand it well."

"Did you not see Reverend Fenyang say in verse, *Xiangyan instructed many people with 'Hanging by his teeth from a tree' so that he can pull them towards and reach the original truth*": The master said, "Relying on reality, they penetrate through together."

"But they hesitate and seek it in words and those who hurt their bodies and lose their lives are as numerous as dust": The master said, "If one is not a person who makes an effort, one cannot understand."

"I will open Heaven's path for you. As the clouds scatter the fresh color of the moonlight spreads across the sky": The master said, "Useless words. Although this is the case, if you investigate (these words), your lifelong studies will come to an end."

又普說, 擧此話云, "山僧昔年, 曾請益一个尊宿, '未審香嚴意旨, 如何?' 遂以拂子柄, 銜在口中, 緊閉却眼, 便作銜樹枝勢, 搖手擺脚, 秖對山僧." 師乃彈指云, "如此者, 亦是當年馳聲走譽底, 尙作這般去就, 其餘作恠, 不在言也. 你要會麽? 但只作一句看, 我先爲你說. 莫見道作一句看, 便向擧起處會, 擧了便會了. 且不是這个道理, 是什麽道理? '如人上樹, 口銜樹枝, 至喪身失命.' 如何這裏閒不容髮? 當時香嚴會中, 只有个虎頭上座, 領得香嚴意, 便出來, 爲香嚴出氣云, '上樹即不問, 未上樹, 請和尙道.' " 師云, "雖得一場榮, 刖却一雙足." 香嚴呵呵大笑, 師云, "鐵作面皮." 又云, "回天輪轉地軸." "後來雪竇拈云, '樹上道則易, 至致將一問來.' 雪竇雖爲虎頭上座出氣, 爭奈蹉過香嚴! 今時有般謬漢, 聞雪竇恁麽道, 便引洞山語云, '但能莫觸當今諱, 也勝前朝斷舌才.' 謂香嚴立此个問頭,

---

[1346] For this gongan, see also case 12 of the *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.152c19–20); and *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.386c21).

[1347] For this gongan, see also the *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 118.33a16); *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.307a17–18); *Wujia zhengzong can* (XZJ 135.913b7–8); *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.378b5–6); *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.528b1–2) etc. See also case 421 in the *Seonmun yeomsong*.

喩如一團火相似, 不可觸. 雖然如此, 不可斷却言句. 有問, '如何是佛?' '麻三斤.' '如何是祖師西來意?' '庭前栢樹子.' 又且何妨! 你不妨會得好. 不見汾陽和尙頌曰, '香嚴銜樹示多人, 要引同袍達本眞.' " 師云, "依實供通." '擬議却從言下覓, 喪身失命數如塵.' 師云, "不是苦心人不知." '汾陽爲你開天路, 雲散長空月色新.' 師云, "閑言語." "雖然如是, 若向這裏提得去, 一生叅學事畢."

[Explanation]

Again, during a general sermon: *He took the whisk's handle and placed it horizontally in his mouth* etcetera: this only recognizes Xiangyan's (words) and means, "How could this not be someone who is pursuing reputation by doing something strange?"

If you can come up with even a single phrase: trying to come up with even a single phrase up in the tree and under the tree.

Try to seek understanding in the story that was raised: this is the story that Xiangyan raised.

If I don't see you come up with even a single phrase … If this isn't the truth: this too is a case of following words wildly.

Although he gained fame etcetera: Xiangyan's "Up in the tree" is *Although he gained fame* etcetera. To not understand under the tree is to *lose both feet*.

Thick skinned: his stance is firm. You can't bore a hole through it.

He rotates the Heaven-disc and the earth-axis: there is no harm in answering the gongan under the tree.

Miss Xiangyan's point: he didn't know that Xiangyan's intent was boundless.

Borrow the words of … cannot confront it: he simply thinks Xiangyan cut off words and phrases.

Although this is the case … What harm could there be (in saying this): there is a similar intent behind "Under the tree."

Fenyang say in verse … Useless words: discuss what about "Under the tree"?

Although this is the case etcetera: beyond "Under the tree" what is there to discuss?

又普說: 拂子柄銜在口中云云者, 只認得香嚴地, 豈不是馳聲走譽地作恠也. 只作一句看者, 樹上樹下作一句看也. 擧起處會者, 香嚴擧起處也. 莫見道至不是

這箇道理者, 伊麽會又却不是, 此亦隨言走殺也. 雖得一場榮云云者, 香嚴樹上, 雖得一場榮云云也, 不會樹下, 刖雙足也. 鐵作面皮者, 立處堅固, 穿鑿不得也. 迴天輪云云者, 不妨向樹下答話也. 蹉過香嚴者, 不知香嚴意無限也. 便引至不可觸者, 只知香嚴斷却言句也. 雖然至何妨者, 樹下有此等意也. 汾陽云云閑言語者, 討甚樹下. 雖然如是云云者, 離樹下便討甚麽.

Jiean Zhipeng ascended the hall and raised Xianyan's instructions to the assembly: *Let's say a person is up in a tree hanging by his teeth from a branch over a thousand-foot cliff. He can't hang on to the branch with his hands or step on the tree with his feet. Under the tree a certain person asks about (Bodhidharma's) intention in coming from the west … what is the right thing to do?*: The master added a capping phrase, "Thief!"

At that time chief seat Hutou stepped forward and asked, "I won't ask about being up in a tree. I beseech your reverence to tell us what it is like when he has not yet been up the tree: the master added a capping phrase, "Thief!"

Xiangyan laughed out loud, "Ha, ha!": the master said, "In the mud there are thorns."

Xuedou said, *It is easy to speak up in the tree, but it is difficult to speak under the tree. The old monk climbed the tree, so go and ask him a question*: the master added a capping phrase, "Thief!"

The master said, "Within these three thieves one person is the real thief, one person assisted the thief with a ladder, and one person sat down and divided the loot. Speak! Who is the real thief? If you can pick him out, not only will you be able to understand Xiangyan's intent you will also hold down the path to freeing yourself. If you can't escape, then listen to this verse:

During an age of disturbance, many villains practice the hegemon's Way,
Wife, child, father, and son cannot protect each other,
Finding a way to escape from the net and preserve one's life,
This is no different from Li Guang back in those days.[1348]

1348 For Li Guang, see note 831 above.

介庵朋, 上堂, 擧香嚴示衆云, '如人在千尺懸崖, 口含樹枝, 手無所攀, 脚無所蹋, 忽有人問西來意, 至正恁麽時, 如何?' 師着語云, "賊!" 時有虎頭上座出衆云, '上樹即不問, 未上樹時, 請和尚道.' 師着語云, "賊!" 香嚴呵呵大笑, 師云, "爛泥裏有刺." 雪竇云, '樹上道即易, 樹下道即難. 老僧上樹也, 致將一問來.' 師着語云, "賊!" 師云, "這三箇賊數中, 一人正賊, 一人與賊過梯, 一人坐地分贓. 且道! 那箇是正賊? 諸人若向這裏, 揀辨得出, 非唯會得香嚴意, 抑亦自有出身之路. 脫或未然, 更聽一頌. '亂世奸雄多行覇道, 妻兒父子各不相保. 罕中拾得性命, 無異當年李廣.' "

[Explanation]

Kaian: Xiangyan, Hutou, and Xuedou are all thieves. Who is the real thief? Each and every one of them is the real thief.

During an age of disturbance etcetera: if you understand Xiangyan, Hutou, and Xuedou's intent, then you produce understanding by following the words.

箇庵: 香嚴虎頭雪竇, 皆是賊, 那箇是正賊? 一一是正賊也. 亂世奸雄云云者, 會香嚴虎頭雪竇意, 隨語生解者也.

Case 607.

Linji's Buddha Dharma

臨濟佛法

[Old case]

When Chan Master Linji Yixuan of Zhenzhou was in Huangbo's[1349] assembly he was told by the chief seat to ask Huangbo, "What is the clear and great intent behind the Buddha dharma?" Huangbo struck him. They did this three times. Linji thereupon came to bid Huangbo farewell and Huangbo made him visit Dayu.[1350] Dayu asked, "Where did you come from?" The master said, "I came from Mt. Huangbo." Dayu said, "What words did Huangbo have for you?" The master said, "I asked him about the clear and great intent behind the Buddha dharma three times and was struck three times. I don't know if I am at fault or not at fault." Dayu said, "Huangbo pressed you so thoroughly like an old woman this way and you still come and ask whether you are at fault or not at fault?" Upon hearing these words the master had a great awakening. He said, "Fundamentally, there isn't much to Huangbo's Buddha dharma." Dayu seized him by the collar and said, "You bedwetting brat! Just a moment ago you asked me whether you are at fault or not at fault and now you say there isn't much to the Buddha dharma. What truth did you see? Speak quickly! Speak quickly!" The master hit Dayu in the ribs three times. Letting him go, Dayu said, "Your teacher is Huangbo. This

[1349] This is Huangbo Xiyun; see note 719 above.

[1350] This is Gaoan Dayu. Little is known about Dayu 大愚. He is said to be the dharma heir of Guizong Zhichang.

is not a matter that concerns me."[1351] [At the time venerable worthy Chen[1352] was the chief seat.]

鎭州臨濟義玄禪師, 在黃蘗會, 因第一座勉令, 問黃蘗, "如何是佛法的的大意?" 蘗便打. 如是三度, 乃辭, 蘗令見大愚. 愚問, "什麽處來?" 師云, "黃蘗來." 愚云, "黃蘗有何言句?" 師云, "某甲三問佛法的的大意, 三度喫棒, 不知有過無過." 愚云, "黃蘗恁麽老婆, 爲你得徹困, 更來問有過無過?" 師於言下大悟云, "元來黃蘗佛法, 無多子." 愚扭住云, "者尿床鬼子! 適來道有過無過, 如今却道佛法無多子. 你見个什麽道理? 速道, 速道!" 師便向大愚肋下, 築三拳. 愚托開云, "汝師黃蘗, 非干我事." <時陳尊宿爲首座.>

[Explanation of the gongan]

Since the sharpness of Linji's skill (機鋒) is not like that of the average folk he was made to ask about the clear and great meaning.

Was struck: each time he was given twenty blows three times. This is the clear and great meaning.

I asked him about the clear and great intent behind the Buddha dharma three times etcetera: he understood this as being struck for being at fault.

Fundamentally, there isn't much to Huangbo's Buddha dharma: there is no Buddha dharma about which one can ask and into which one can poke his beak (and say something).

Seized him by the collar etcetera: (Dayu) again feared that he would mistakenly understand Huangbo's intent.

The master hit Dayu in the ribs three times: this is the clear and great intent.

1351 For a different version of this story, see also the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.290a20–b5); *Fozu lidai tongzai* (T 2036.49.643b5–15); *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.255b9–256a3); *Zhenzhou Linji Huizhao chanshi yulu* (T 1985.47.504c3–23); *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.152a1–13); *Wujia zhengzong zan* (XZJ 135.922a13–b6); *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.574a17–b16); *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 118.144a11–b7) etc. See also Sasaki and Kirchner, *The Record of Linji,* pp. 312–316.

1352 Reverend Chen, also known as Muzhou Daoming or Daozong 道蹤, is a dharma heir of Huangbo Xiyun. He lived at the temple Guanyin Cloister 觀音院 in Muzhou, Zhejiang province.

臨濟機鋒, 不同常流故, 令問的的大義也. 便打者, 三度每二十棒, 是的的大義也. 某甲三問佛法的的大意云云者, 作過棒會也. 元來黃蘗佛法無多子者, 無佛法可問, 無揷觜處也. 扭住云云者, 又恐他錯會黃蘗意也. 築三拳者, 用得黃蘗手段, 是的的大意也.

Tiantong Zhengjue's verse[1353]

A phoenix with nine special characteristics,[1354]
A stallion that runs a thousand miles (in one day),
A bellows that blows the winds of truth,[1355]
The numinous potential turns the pivot,
When it comes right in the face it flies as fast as lightning,
Dark clouds scatter and the sun shines alone,
Have you ever seen a (courage) to pluck a tiger's whiskers or not?
This is a formidable great man.

> 天童覺頌, "九包之雛, 千里之駒. 眞風度籥, 靈機發樞. 劈面來時飛電急, 迷雲破處大陽孤. 捋虎鬚見也無? 箇是雄雄大丈夫."

[Explanation]

Tiantong: *A phoenix with nine special characteristics* etcetera: a phoenix also has a pattern.

1353 For this verse, see also the *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.26b4–6).

1354 The *Congrong lu* (T 2004.48.283a18–21) and *Zuting shiyuan* (XZJ 113.100b1–4) cite the *Ruiying tu*'s 瑞應圖 list of the nine special characteristics of the phoenix: (1) it gives back its life (*guiming* 歸命); (2) its mind accords with the standards of Heaven (*xin hedu wei tiandu* 心合度謂天度); (3) it hears everything (*er tongda* 耳聽達); (4) its tongue can curl and extend (*she qu shen* 舌屈伸), (5) it has lustrous color (*cai guangse* 彩光色), (6) it has a short red crown (*guan duan zhou dang zhuse* 冠短州當朱色); (7) it has sharp talons (*ruigou* 銳鈎); (8) it has a fierce cry (*yin jiyang* 音激揚); (9) it has an opening in its abdomen (*fu hu* 腹戶).

1355 See *Laozi,* stanza 5.

Nine special characteristics: one phrase contains three mysteries and one mystery contains the three essentials.[1356] Three times three is nine.

A stallion that runs a thousand miles: this means liberation.

The first two lines praise Linji.

Bellows that blows the winds of truth etcetera: jewels rolling around freely. This praises Huangbo.

When it comes right in the face etcetera: this is Dayu.

Dark clouds scatter etcetera: this is the state of Linji's awakening.

Have you ever seen courage to pluck a tiger's whiskers etcetera: this is *the master hit Dayu in the ribs three times.*

天童: 九包云云者, 鳳也有文彩也. 九包者, 一句中具三玄, 一玄中具三要, 三三是九也. 千里之駒者, 超脫之意. 二句, 賛臨濟也. 眞風度籥云云者, 玲瓏宛轉也. 賛黃蘗也. 劈面來時云云者, 大愚也. 迷雲破處云云者, 臨濟悟處也. 捋虎鬚云云者, 大愚肋下築三拳也.

Zhenjing Kewen's verse[1357]

When preparing supplies and provisions there is no further need to pay attention to the minute details,
As the years pass at the crossroad the loan continues to grow.
Strike him fiercely three times on the spot,
When night comes, as usual, he spends the night among the rush leaves.

眞淨文頌, "資粮更不着些些, 歧路年深恐轉賒. 直下痛施三頓棒, 夜來依舊宿蘆花."

1356 This is a line from the *Zhenzhou Linji Huizhao chanshi yulu* (T 1985.47.497a19–20); cf. *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.291a14). See also Sasaki and Kirchner, *The Record of Linji*, pp. 148–149.

1357 For this verse, see also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.750b3–4); and *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.257a4–5).

Again, his verse[1358]

He said there's not much to Huangbo's Dharma,
As a great man how could he contradict himself?
Striking him in the ribs twice clearly reveals something,
This was not entrusted by Huangbo.

又頌, "便言黃蘗無多法,[1359] 大丈夫兒豈自乖. 肋下兩拳明有信, 不從黃蘗付將來."

Fazhen Shouyi's verse

Fundamentally, there's not much to the house style of Duanji (Huangbo),
Although he was struck three times, he is no *saindhava*.
Dayu one day carelessly opened his mouth,
Huangbo is originally an old woman.

法眞一頌, "斷際家風本沒多, 雖蒙三頓不仙陀. 大愚一日輕饒舌, 黃蘗元來是老婆."

Donglin Changcong's verse[1360]

When thunder roars and the winds blow one should rest,
The giant sea turtle does not climb to the shore with ease,
It turns itself around and drinks the ocean dry in one gulp,

1358 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong gonggu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ115.256a18–b1).

1359 The *Chanzong gonggu lianzhu tongji* version has "He said there isn't much to the Buddha dharma" (*bian yan fofa wu duozi* 便言佛法無多子).

1360 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.256a16–17). There are some minor differences.

The mountains and waters of the four-hundred prefectures[1361] are aroused.

東林總頌, "雷震風行便合休, 巨鼇無便上灘頭. 翻身一吸滄溟竭, 鼓動山河四百州."

Baoning Renyong's verse[1362]

Under the loud clamor of lightning and thunder the oceans and mountains darken,
Full of concern, one house closes its doors to stop the rain from coming in,
Wild winds suddenly stir and the dark clouds scatter,
The sky is full of stars in broad daylight.

保寧勇頌, "雷電喧轟海岳昏, 一家愁閉雨中門. 狂風忽起烏雲散, 白日滿天星斗分."

Baiyun Shouduan's verse[1363]

With a single blow he knocks down Huanghe Tower,
With a single kick he flips over Yingwu Island.[1364]
When there is will power he increases will power,
And what is not stylish also becomes stylish.

1361 The four-hundred prefectures refer to the Chinese empire in its entirety.

1362 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.256a14–15); *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ 137.382b3–4); and *Baoning Renyong chanshi yulu* (XZJ 120.377b10–11).

1363 For this verse, see also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.425b16–17).

1364 Huanghe (Yellow Crane) Tower and Yingwu (Parrot) Island are famous attractions in Wuhan 武漢, Hubei province. There is a famous Yuan dynasty painting of Huanghe Tower painted by Xia Yong 夏永. There are poems about Yingwu Island and Huanghe Tower by Li Bai; see *Quan Tang shi* 180, 7. See also the poem about Huanghe Tower by Cui Hao 崔顥 (704–754) in *Quan Tang shi* 130, 12b.

白雲端頌,"一拳拳倒黃鶴樓, 一剔剔飜鸚鵡洲. 有意氣時添意氣, 不風流處也風流."

Zhaxi Riyi's verse[1365]

He bumped his head three times and fell from Yu's Gate,[1366]
Both cheeks exposed in the sun and red as if they're burned.
One morning he suddenly burst through the waves of peach blossoms,
The winds and clouds rise from the steaming horns (of the dragon),
The winds and clouds rise and cannot stay,
He returns to Yingzhou[1367] with beard fluttering in the blowing wind,
I meet the old dragon in person and exchange questions,
It spits out a bright (wish fulfilling) jewel and does not feel ashamed (in striking Dayu).

霅溪益頌,"點額三迴下禹門, 雙腮曝日赤如焚. 一朝忽透桃花浪, 騰騰頭角生風雲. 風雲生兮不可留, 揚鬚獵獵歸瀛洲. 老龍相見還相問, 吐出明珠更不羞."

Chongsheng Yuangong's verse

As he gained advantage he lost advantage,
Wisdom was flipped over to become stupidity,
Without being told the great intent of the Buddha dharma,

1365 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.256b11–13).

1366 Yu's gate (Yumen 禹門) is another name for Longmen 龍門 in Shaanxi province. Dragon Gate or Longmen was called Yu's Gate or Yumen because it was believed that Sage Yu had opened Dragon Gate so that the Yellow River would not flood; see *Shi ji* 史記 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 2, 14.

1367 Yingzhou 瀛洲 is a legendary divine mountain off the east coast of China; see the *Shi ji* 6, 21b–22a.

He was struck three rounds, that is, sixty times with a mugwort branch,[1368]
Huangbo pressed him thoroughly like an old woman,
And Dayu was not concerned with our teacher,
Recently I learned the technique for pacifying the self,
If someone asks, I shamelessly say I don't know anything.

崇勝珙頌, "得便宜失便宜, 智慧飜成愚癡. 佛法大意不語, 三回六十蒿枝. 黃蘗老婆徹困, 大愚非干我師. 近來學得安身法, 問着無過惣不知."

Foyan Qingyuan's verse[1369]

He tears open Mt. Hua, which stretches to match the color of the sky,
He lets out the Yellow River until it reaches the sound of the ocean,
After the blind ass is dead,[1370] the mugwort branch is broken,[1371]
Today, on this great earth how many people (like this) are there?[1372]

佛眼遠頌, "擘開華岳連天色, 放出黃河到海聲. 瞎驢死後蒿枝折, 大地如今有幾人?"

Jiean Zhipeng's verse

Before it rains the thunder really startles people,

1368 Being struck with a mugwort branch was believed to make the child grow faster.

1369 For this verse, see also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.596b7–8); and the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.257a2–3).

1370 Blind ass (*xialü* 瞎驢) probably refers to Sansheng Huiran; see *Zhenzhou Linji Huizhao chanshi yulu* (T 1985.47.506c3–7); and Sasaki and Kirchner, *The Record of Linji,* p. 340.

1371 The mugwort branch probably refers to Huangbo or Linji; see *Zhenzhou Linji Huizhao chanshi yulu* (T47.1985.496c27–28); and Sasaki and Kirchner, *The Record of Linji,* 136.

1372 Here, Foyan seems to be saying that teachers like Huangbo or Linji are now few and far between.

How many times did the dust stir because of the gusty winds?
After the herons cut through the smoke and clouds,
I idly stand and stare at the sun in the blue sky.

> 介庵朋頌, "未雨先雷驚殺人, 黑風幾度卷埃塵? 鷺鷥衝斷煙雲後, 竚看青天大日輪."

Mi'an Xianjie's verse[1373]

In one blow the whole family is completely exterminated,
Two more blows and the sons and grandsons are also implicated,
He penetrated through both the silver mountains and iron walls,
No clouds for ten thousand miles and the universe is clear.

> 密庵傑頌, "一頓渾家盡滅門, 更加兩頓累兒孫. 銀山鐵壁俱穿透, 萬里无雲宇宙分."

Layman Wujin's verse[1374]

Linji spent three summers,
But he did not investigate Huangbo's *Chan,*
Go up for a visit and receive sixty blows,
He is thus at a loss about what to do with his hands and feet,
Suddenly he is awakened to the sincerity of (Huangbo's) old woman-like mind,
He turns it around and hit (Dayu) in the ribs,
No one knew the intent behind this,
Linji's disciples preach the three mysteries.

1373 For this verse, see the *Mi'an heshang yulu* 密菴和尚語錄 (T 1999.47.976c10–11); and *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.257a14–15).

1374 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.256b17–257a1).

無盡居士頌, "林際[1375]度三夏, 不叅黃蘗禪, 上來六十棒手脚遂茫然. 忽悟婆心切, 飜行肋下拳, 無人知此意, 林下說[1376]三玄."

Layman Yuezhai's verse

A single plum flower in the snow,
Thus we know spring has arrived,
How about a glass of wine?
Wait and the forest will be full of blossoms.

悅齋居士頌, "一枝雪中梅, 便知春到來. 如何一盃酒? 須待滿林開."

Weishan raised the gongan and asked Yangshan,[1377] "Did Linji gain Dayu's power or Huangbo's power?" Yangshan replied, "Not only did he pull out the tiger's whiskers but he also could cut off its head."

潙山擧問仰山, "臨濟得大愚力黃蘗力?" 仰山云, "非但捋虎鬚, 亦解坐[1378]虎頭."

[Explanation]

Weishan: Dayu's power is the tiger's head. Huangbo's power is the tiger's whiskers.

潙仰問答: 大愚力是虎頭;黃蘗力是虎鬚也.

Xiangshan Wenliang, while offering pointers and substitute replies in the

1375 The *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* version has the more common rendition of Linji's name 臨濟.

1376 The *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* version has *yi* 憶 ("remember") for *shuo* 說 ("preach").

1377 For this exchange, see also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.823b14–16).

1378 Here I substitute *cuo* 挫 for *zuo* 坐.

abbot's room, asked a monk, "Huangbo gave Linji three blows and then Linji attained awakening. Now, everyday, from the moment they begin till late at night, why can't the prefect and the country magistrate attain awakening?" There was no answer, so he offered a substitute reply, "You cannot learn even a little bit from this servant boy!"[1379] Again he said, "Do not say they cannot attain awakening."

香山良, 室中垂代, 問僧, "黃蘗打林際三頓棒, 林際便悟去, 而今知州知縣, 每日打到夜, 因什麼不悟?" 無對, 代云, "不可惣學這厮兒." 又云, "莫道不悟."

[Explanation]

Xiangshan: *Now, everyday, from the moment they begin till late at night, the prefect and county magistrate* etcetera: a clear-cut case of sixty blows.

You cannot learn even a little bit etcetera: what was he awakened to?

Again he said, "Do not say they cannot attain awakening": what is not attaining awakening?

香山: 而今知州知縣云云者, 現成六十棒也. 不可惣學云云者, 什麼處是悟處. 又云莫道不悟者, 什麼是不悟.

Baiyun Fayan ascended the hall and raised Baiyun Shouduan's verse, *With a single blow … also becomes stylish.* The master said,[1380] "Great assembly! Had you gone to study under Baiyun, you would have had to borrow the fist of many people."

白雲演, 上堂, 擧白雲端頌, '一拳, 至也風流' 師曰, "大衆! 若到白雲門下, 須要衆人助拳."

[1379] Servant boy (*sier* 厮兒) probably refers to Linji; see *Zhenzhou Linji Huizhao chanshi yulu* (T 1985.47.503b14–15).

[1380] For this comment, see also the *Fayan chanshi yulu* (T 1995.47.656a8–9).

[Explanation]

Baiyun: What Dayu said strikes down (Yellow Crave Tower) with a fist and flips over (Parrot Island) with a kick.

When there is will power etcetera: this is still sixty blows.

Had you gone to study under Baiyun etcetera: this supports Dayu's intent.

白雲: 大愚伊麼道, 是拳倒踢飜也. 有意氣時云云者, 還是六十棒也. 若到白雲門下云云者, 助大愚之意.

Case 633.

Linji's Shout

臨濟便喝

[Old case]

Linji, whenever he saw a monk enter the gate, gave out a shout.[1381]

臨濟, 凡見僧入門, 便喝.

[Explanation of the gongan]

There are four different types of shouts: the jeweled sword of the Diamond King, a lion crouching on the ground,[1382] a search pole and shadow grass (used as bait),[1383] and a shout that doesn't work like a shout at all.[1384]

Whenever he saw a monk enter the gate, gave out a shout: this does not surpass these four types. Sometimes it functions like the jeweled sword of the Diamond King, sometimes it functions like a golden-haired lion

1381 For this old case, see the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.851a25, 887c8, 894b11); and *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.799b4).

1382 A lion crouching on the ground refers to someone with talent and understanding, that is, an adept; for instance, see *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi yulu* (T 1988.47.552c28–29).

1383 A search pole (*tan'gan* 探竿) and shadow grass (*yingcao* 影草), both traditional tools used for fishing. A pelican's feather, tied to the end of a pole, was placed in a river or lake to draw fish. A blade of grass was set afloat as bait. In Chan and Zen literature, both are best understood as "bait." See ZGD, p. 835.

1384 These are known as the four shouts of Linji; see the *Zhenzhou Linji Huizhao chanshi yulu* (T 1985.47.504a26–28); and Sasaki and Kirchner, *The Record of Linji,* p. 308.

crouching on the ground, and sometimes it functions like a search pole and shadow grass. Although this is the case, each and every one is a shout that doesn't work like a shout at all. Moreover, it is not the case that outside of the three shouts there is another shout that doesn't work like a shout at all. Some say, "The four shouts are all contrivances that were devised according to potential. You should know that there was a shout right there with the primordial Buddha. This is the shout that doesn't work like a shout at all."[1385] These sayings pursue what is empty and far from the truth. They do not convey the intent. Dahui said, "Deshan, whenever he saw someone enter the gate, struck him. Linji, whenever he saw someone enter the gate, gave out a shout. Masters everywhere call this 'Raising a shortcut right in front of your face and entrusting it to you.' I call it, 'Above all else, a case of dragging mud and carrying water.' Even if the whole body already carried the load with a single blow and a single shout, this is not a great man."[1386] These words were uttered by Dahui for those with mediocre potential. This is not his great original intent.

喝有四種, 金剛王寶劒, 踞地師子, 探竿影草, 一喝不作一喝用也. 見僧入門便喝者, 不過此四種. 有時, 用得金剛王寶劒;有時, 用得踞地師子;有時, 用得探竿影草. 雖然如是, 一一是一喝不作一喝用也. 又非三喝外, 別有一箇喝不作一喝用也. 或有道,"四喝, 皆是隨機施設, 須知有直在威音那畔地一喝. 此爲一喝不作一喝用." 這般說話, 騖於虛遠, 非得意者也. 大慧云,"德山入門便棒, 臨濟入門便喝, 諸方喚作, 劈面提持, 直截分付. 妙喜喚作, 第一等拖泥滯[1387]水. 直饒向一棒一喝下, 全身荷擔已, 是不丈夫漢也." 大慧此言, 爲中根發, 非大慧本意也.

Dahong Baoen's verse[1388]

1385 Source unknown.

1386 See *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.894b13–14).

1387 Here, I follow the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* version and substitute *dai* 帶 for *zhi* 滯.

1388 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.257b14–15); and *Chanlin leiju* (XZJ 117.77b6–7).

One enters the gate and he gives out a shout,
This is already being too garrulous,
Endless number of careless Chan monks,
They again cover everything in their discussions.
Huh![1389]

大洪恩頌, "入門來便喝, 已是大忉怛, 無限杜禪和, 更復論該括." <咄!>

[Explanation]
Dahong's intention: Slips are not few.

大洪意, 漏逗不少.

Jingyan Shousui's verse[1390]

With a single sword he pacified the smoke and dust (i.e., war-torn country),
What will he rely on to discern host and guest?
They climb the mountain and all together offer tribute,
Who will recognize the sagely and wise lord?

淨嚴遂頌, "一釼定煙塵, 憑何辨主賓? 梯山齊入貢, 誰識聖明君?"

[Explanation]
Jingyan: There is just no way to see through it.

淨嚴: 直是窺覷不得.

1389 This is not in the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* and *Chanlin leiju* versions.

1390 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.257b18–258a1).

Jingci Zongben's verse

How extraordinary! Linji's shout!
Its force is like thunder in the spring,
Grass and trees are all thriving,
(Even) the sea serpent and dragon have a hard time preventing this,[1391]
Make a mistake and there will be delusion in awakening,
Get it right and gain life in death,
A looper caterpillar and pond frog,
How could they know the blue ocean is broad?
(Huh!)

淨慈本頌, "偉哉臨濟喝! 狀似春雷發. 草木盡滋榮, 蛟龍難止遏. 差之悟裏迷, 的也死中活. 尺蠖與池蛙, 豈知滄海闊!" <咄!>

[Explanation]
Jingci: This reflects the intent of the two previous verses.

淨慈: 兼前二意也.

Jingshan Zonggao's verse[1392]

Someone enters the gate and he shouts,
There is absolutely no method,
He draws in descendants,
And has them waste the energy they gained from gruel and rice.

徑山杲頌, "入門便喝, 全無巴鼻, 引得兒孫, 弄粥飯氣."

1391 The sea serpent (kraken) and dragon (*jiaolong* 蛟龍) are believed to control rain and floods; see *Shi ji* 47, 19.

1392 For this verse, see also the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.851a26).

Zhu'an Shigui's verse[1393]

A single shout reached the four *dhyāna* heavens,
Linji originally did not understand *dhyāna*,
They all speak of the morning sun that appeared outside the door,
But they don't know that the moonlight at night falls on the front of the stairs.

竹庵珪頌, "一喝喝上四禪天, 臨濟元來不會禪. 盡道朝陽生戶外, 不知夜月落堦前."

Jiean Zhipeng's verse

A single shout—mountains crumble and oceans dry up,
The perfected skill is unrestrained and has no scope,
The mud ox jumps out of the sky,
Immediately his beautiful reputation fills the roads.

介庵朋頌, "一喝山崩海水枯, 全機脫略沒規模. 泥牛迸出煙霄外, 直得嘉聲滿道途."

Layman Wujin's verse

Hibernating in the tightly shut cave, it is frozen and won't open,
In the empty sky suddenly the sound of thunder,
Each and every sea serpent and dragon drags the cloud and fog,
Each and every earthworm eats dirt and soil.

無盡居士頌, "蟄戶幽扃凍不開, 虛空忽震一聲雷. 蛟龍一一拏雲霧, 蚯蚓頭頭食土塵."

1393 For this verse, see also the *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.799b6–7).

Case 639.

Muzhou's "Narrow-Minded Fellow"

睦州擔板

[Old case]

Muzhou[1394] called out to a monk, "Great virtuoso!" The monk turned his head. The master said, "A narrow-minded fellow."[1395]

睦州喚僧云, "大德!" 僧迴首. 師云, "擔板漢."

[Explanation of the gongan]

Narrow-minded fellow: this monk heard the sound and turned his head. This is what is meant by narrow-minded (lit. carrying a board on one's shoulders). Even if he did not turn his head, he cannot but be a narrow-minded fellow.

擔板漢者, 這僧隨聲回首, 是擔板也. 直饒不回首, 亦未免擔板漢也.

1394 This is Muzhou Daoming or Reverend Chen, see note 1353 above.

1395 For this gongan, see the *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.571a4). A different version of this gongan can be found in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.291b3–4): "When he (Muzhou) saw a lecturer monk, he would call his chief seat. If the (lecturer) monk responded, the master would say, 'Narrow-minded fellow.'" Here, "narrow-minded" (*danban* 擔板) can be more literally translated as "carrying a wooden board or plank on one's shoulders," which functions as a metaphor for someone who can only see in one direction, hence the translation "narrow-minded."

Changling Shouzhuo's verse[1396]

Bore a hole through the back of his skull,
He falls into the pit every time,
Even if he doesn't turn his head when he's called,
He too is a substance-less narrow-minded fellow,
Stop being narrow-minded
And penetrate through Muzhou's barrier,
(Then gain) a pair of eyes that can see the entire universe.

長靈卓頌, "腦後與一錐, 頭頭墮坑坎. 直饒喚不回, 也是虛擔板. 休擔板, 透過睦州關, 乾坤一隻眼."

[Explanation]
Changling: *Bore a hole through the back of his skull* etcetera: this refers to turning the head and being a narrow-minded fellow.

Every time: later it is said that even if he does not turn his head he is still a narrow-minded fellow. In other words, if you confront it (觸), this will not do; if you ignore it (背), this too will not do.

長靈: 腦後云云者, 回首也, 擔板漢也. 頭頭者, 後云不迴頭也擔板也. 謂觸亦不是, 背亦不是也.

Jingshan Zonggao's verse[1397]

Muzhou's "Narrow-minded fellow,"
How could it allow you to blink?
Broad, narrow, short, and long,
You must not add or subtract.

1396 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.266b17–18); and *Changling Shouzhuo chanshi yulu* (XZJ 120.327a1–2).

1397 For this verse, see also the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.853a5).

徑山杲頌, "睦州擔板, 那容眨眼! 闊狹短長, 不須增減."

[Explanation]
Jingshan: *Muzhou's* ectetera: it has to be an understanding that transcends confronting (觸) and ignoring (背).
Broad, narrow, short, and long: this is confronting and ignoring.

徑山: 睦州云云者, 直須離却背觸會也. 闊狹短長增減, 則是背觸也.

Zhu'an Shigui's verse[1398]

Stop being carelessly hasty in a lightning storm,
Don't be afraid of sharp edge of a swinging blade,
Nonchalantly let go of the entire body and enter,
Not a hair of it will be harmed right in front of your eyes.

竹庵珪頌, "電火光中休草草, 鉯輪鋒上莫忉忉. 等閑却放全身入, 終不當頭犯一毫."

[Explanation]
Zhu'an: Same as above.

竹庵頌, 上同.

Wuwezi's verse

Muzhou's call,
Determine it according to divination,
Turn or not turn,

1398 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.267a3–4); and *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.810b7–8).

(Still he is) a narrow-minded fellow.[1399]

無爲子頌, "睦州喚, 隨卦斷. 回不回, 擔板漢."

Xuedou Chongxian added a comment,[1400] "Muzhou has only one eye. Why? All the monk did was turn his head when he was called. Why does this make him a narrow-minded fellow?"

雪竇顯拈, "睦州只具一隻眼. 何故? 這僧喚旣回頭, 因甚却成擔板!"

[Explanation]

Xuedou: What Muzhou said only made matters more complicated. What fault does that monk have?

雪竇: 睦州伊麽道, 却成多事, 這僧有什麽過!

Huitang Zuxin added a comment,[1401] "Xuedou also only has one eye. The monk turned his head as soon as he was called. Why would this not make him a narrow-minded fellow?"

晦堂心拈, "雪竇亦秖具一隻眼. 這僧一喚便迴, 爲甚麽不成擔板!"

Cuiyan Sizong added a comment, "The monk turned his head and didn't discern true and false. What can be done about Muzhou who used his influence to bully an ordinary person? Had Xuedou not testified on his behalf, this monk would have been wronged again. Although this is the case, Muzhou has a kind heart. Even if you follow what Xuedou said, it is still okay to call him a narrow-minded fellow for turning his head when he was called."

1399 Cf. *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.117a29–b1).

1400 For this comment, see also the *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.571a5–6).

1401 For this comment, see also the *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.571a6–7).

翠嵓宗拈,“這僧迴首, 眞虛莫辨. 爭奈睦州用勢, 欺壓平人! 若無雪竇證明, 這僧還同受屈. 雖然如是, 睦州却是好心, 若據雪竇恁麽道, 也好喚迴與箇檐板漢.”

Lingyuan Weiqing ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and then raised Xuedou and Huitang's added comments. The master said, "What family does a narrow-minded fellow come from and how does someone one eyed discern (the truth)? Deep in the mountain at midnight under the moonlight, an arrow hits the mind of a screaming stone man."

靈源清, 上堂, 擧此話, 連擧雪竇晦堂拈. 師云,“擔板漢落誰家, 一隻眼如何辨? 深山午夜月明中, 叫哭石人心中箭.”

[Explanation]

Lingyuan: *What family does a narrow-minded fellow come from*: they are all narrow-minded.

One eyed etcetera: none are equipped with an eye.

Deep in the mountain at midnight etcetera: an arrow hits a stone man and so it screams. That is, what Xuedou and Huitang said hurt the stone man. Therefore, all they understood was just Muzhou's intent.

Deep in the mountain: where the stone man is.

Midnight: this is darkness.

Moonlight: this is light.

He is equipped with both darkness and light.

靈源: 擔板漢落誰家者, 皆是擔板也. 一隻眼云云者, 皆未具一隻眼也. 深山午夜云云者, 石人中箭而叫哭, 則雪竇晦堂地, 皆是害石人也. 然則但會取睦州意也. 深山則石人在處. 午夜則暗, 月明則明, 明暗具足.

Yunmen Zonggao during a general sermon raised this gongan and said,[1402] "Before there was a Chan monk who raised this gongan and asked

[1402] For this sermon, see also the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.871b14–20).

a monk, 'How do you understand it?' As soon as he saw the monk open his mouth he said, 'Indeed, a narrow-minded fellow. How fortunate! It bears no relevance.' " And then he raised Xuedou and Huitang's comments. The master said, "These two old men can walk hand-in-hand with Muzhou. If he is a clever fellow, as soon as he hears the gongan raised his eyes should be as wide as copper bells and he will never go round in circles in (the gongan)."

雲門杲, 普說, 擧此話云, "曾有个禪頭, 擧這話問僧. '你作麼生會?' 才見僧開口, 便道, '果然擔板. 且喜, 沒交涉!' " 遂擧雪竇晦堂拈, 師云, "者兩个老漢, 可與睦州, 把手共行. 若是个靈利漢, 才聞擧着, 眼似銅鈴, 終不向者裏, 打之遶."

[Explanation]

Yunmen: *As soon as he saw the monk open his mouth* etcetera, was because he understood in terms of gain and loss.

These two old men etcetera: both tallied with Muzhou's intention.

If he is a clever fellow etcetera: this means he does not rush wildly after words.

雲門: 才見僧開口云云者, 作得失會故也. 兩箇老漢云云者, 皆契睦州意也. 若是箇靈利云云者, 不以隨言走殺也.

Zhu'an Shigui added a comment, "This monk saw right through Muzhou."

竹庵珪拈, "睦州被這僧勘破."

[Explanation]

Zhu'an: This monk was equipped with eyes, so what was his fault?

竹庵: 這僧却具眼, 有什麼過!

Baiyun Zhibing added a comment, "Real brass is not to be exchanged for gold. Petty persons from all over this world believe this."

白雲昺拈, "眞鍮不博金, 擧世小人信."

[Explanation]
Baiyun: This supports that monk.

白雲: 扶這僧也.

Case 655.

Muzhou's Great Matter

睦州大事

[Old case]

Muzhou, while instructing the assembly, said, "When the great matter has not been completed, this is like mourning one's dead parents.[1403] When the great matter has been completed, this is like mourning one's dead parents."[1404]

睦州, 示衆云, "大事未辦, 如喪考妣, 大事已辦, 如喪考妣."

[Explanation of the gongan]

When the great matter has not been completed, this is like mourning one's dead parents: one finds no pleasure in music and no relish in sweet food.[1405] You are able to complete the great matter without being impelled by sound and form.

When the great matter has been completed etcetera: when you haven't gained entrance to (the truth), then you must find an entrance. If you've already gained entrance, then you must find a way out. Elsewhere it is said, "Without the assistance of the spring wind the flowers do not blossom; the flowers

1403 For this part of the story, see also the *Yuanwu Foguo chanshi yulu* (T 1997.47.753b15).

1404 For this story, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.268a10–11); and *Chanlin leiju* (XZJ 117.70a6–7).

1405 This is quote from the *Analects* 17.21: "The gentleman in mourning finds no relish in sweet food, no pleasure in music…" 夫君子之居喪 食旨不甘 聞樂不樂.

having blossomed they are blown away by the wind."

Dead parents: when the father dies he is called *go* 考. When the mother dies she is called *bi* 妣. Some say, late *go* (先考) and late *bi* (先妣), but this is a mistake.

Mourning (*sang* 喪) in the *ping* (even) tone means performing a funeral and in the *ze* (uneven) tone means losing something. Since they've already become dead parents, what then is there to lose?

大事未辦如喪考妣者, 聞樂不樂, 食旨不甘, 不被聲色使殺, 能辦大事也. 大事已辦云云者, 未得箇入頭處, 須得箇入頭處; 旣得箇入頭處, 須得箇出路也. 他處云, '不得春風花不開, 花開又被風吹落也.' 考妣者, 父死曰考, 母死曰妣. 或云, 先考先妣者, 誤矣. 喪平音, 行喪也, 則音則喪失義, 已爲考妣, 則更何言喪乎!

Baoning Renyong's verse[1406]

Spring is gone and fall has come today as it did in the past,
After you meet each other, stop discussing how fast the time has gone by,
When you're hungry you eat and thirsty you drink—there are no other matters to attend to,
Carefully listen to the fact that your head is full of frost and snow.

保寧勇頌, "春去秋來古與今, 相逢休論歲時深. 饑飡渴飮無他事, 盡聽滿頭霜雪侵."

[Explanation]

Baoning: The past is gone and the present has come—(this verse is about) the passing of time. The character *chin* 盡 in the last line means "allow" (*im* 任) and permit (*heo* 許).

保寧: 古往今來時節遷變也. 此出頭處盡字, 任也許也.

1406 For this verse, see also the *Chanlin leiju* (XZJ 117.70a8–9).

Case 672.

Deshan's Blow

德山便棒

[Old case]

Deshan,[1407] whenever he saw a monk enter the gate, gave him a blow.[1408]

德山, 見僧入門, 便棒.

[Explanation of the gongan]

Enter the gate, gave him a blow: with a plain staff[1409] when the Buddha comes he hits him and when the Patriarch comes he hits him. An ancient one said, "The blows are as numerous as raindrops, but where one receives the blow there is no scar. The shouts resound like thunder, but where one receives the shout there is no sound." Although this is the case, because this is a technique that changed (students') eyeballs according to their skills so that they can see the truth, whenever he saw a monk come he gave him a blow.

入門便棒者, 一條白棒, 佛來也打, 祖來也打也. 古人云, "棒如雨滴, 棒處無痕;

1407 This is Deshan Xuanjian.

1408 For this old case, see also the *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.852b11); and *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.806b12). According to the *Fozu lidai tongzai,* Deshan, after he attained awakening under Longtan Chongxin, used to give anyone who came to ask his a question a blow to prevent them from falling into names and forms. This, the *Fozu lidai tongzai* tells us, is the origin of the blow; see *Fozu lidai tongzai* (T 2036.49.720c20–25).

1409 A plain staff is one that is not lacquered or decorated.

喝似雷奔, 喝處無聲." 雖然如是, 亦有隨機換却眼睛地手段故, 凡見僧來便棒也.

Dahong Baoen's verse[1410]

A single blow leaves a single scar,
Its bitterness cannot be put into words,
A great man has a lot of will power,
How many know the debt (we owe him)?
(Huh!)

大洪恩頌, "一棒一條痕, 辛酸不可論. 丈夫多意氣, 幾箇是知恩?" <咄!>

[Explanation]
Dahong: You have to know pain and only then can you repay your debt.

大洪: 須知痛痒, 方始報恩.

Jingyan Shousui's verse[1411]

During a rain shower thunder strikes suddenly,
Clouds rise and lightning follows,
Although the general has the command,
How could this be like the time of Yao and Shun?

淨嚴遂頌, "驟雨迅雷擊, 雲興電影隨. 將軍雖有令, 何似舜堯時!"

[Explanation]
Jingyan: The first two lines: his techniques were swift and subtle.

1410 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.287b13–14).

1411 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.287b17–18).

The time of Yao and Shun: originally from the time of Great Peace.

淨嚴: 二句, 手段迅速妙密也. 舜堯時, 本自太平時也.

Jingci Ben's verse

What do the craftsmen of our tradition rely on to reveal right and wrong?
With a single staff they discern dragons and snakes.
As soon as the leg steps across the door, you receive thirty blows,
I fear even old Śākyamuni might get buried (under the blows).

> 淨慈本頌, "宗匠憑何顯正邪? 一條拄杖辨龍蛇. 脚纔跨戶答三十, 猶恐沈埋老釋迦."

Changling Shouzhuo's verse[1412]

Deshan's blow and Linji's shout,
Copper, diamond, and iron bodhisattvas,
Where thunder rumbles every ear goes deaf,
When comets come there are no eyes that are not blinded,
They went blind but still point to Caoxi's moon.[1413]

> 長靈卓頌, "德山棒臨濟喝! 銅金剛鐵菩薩. 轟雷發處有耳皆聾, 撒星來時無眼不瞎. 瞎與公重指曹溪月."

[Explanation]

Changling: *Copper, diamond*: awesome and fearsome images. This is a metaphor for Deshan's blow.

1412 For this verse, see also the *Changling Shouzhuo chanshi yulu* (XZJ 120.326b7–8).

1413 For the analogy of the finger pointing at the moon, see note 555 above.

Iron bodhisattva: a compassionate mind. This is Linji's shout. The intent behind iron and copper can thus be known.

Where thunder rumbles etcetera: this is the shout.

When comets come etcetera: this is the blow.

They went blind but still point etcetera: this also contains an instruction. *They* refers to everyone.

長靈: 銅金剛, 有威猛之相, 喻德山棒也. 鐵菩薩, 有慈悲之心, 臨濟喝也. 所以鐵銅, 其意可知. 轟雷云云者, 喝也, 撒星云云者, 棒也. 重指云云者, 亦有指示處也. 公謂諸人也.

Jiean Zhipeng's verse

All his life he poured his mind into (taking care of) others,
A single blow makes it perfectly clear but the painting is not done,
If you flip yourself around and know where you land,
Where the water meets the sky is broad and the moon is as clear as can be.

介庵朋頌, "平生心膽向人傾, 一棒分明畵不成. 若也翻身知落處, 水天空闊月澄清."

Layman Wujin's verse[1414]

He sets the staff up against the blue sky,
And offers a separate transmission outside the teaching of the three vehicles,
Before you can blink an eye you are met with eight hundred blows,
If you hesitate to open your mouth, you will receive three thousand.

1414 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ115.288a7–8).

無盡居士頌, "一條榔栗倚青天, 別向三乘教外傳. 未眨眼時遭八百, 擬開口處著三千."

Dayu Shouzhi ascended the hall and said, "Deshan, whenever someone entered the gate, struck him. Linji, whenever someone entered the gate, gave out a shout. I (Cuiyan) would not do so. Before he enters the mountain gate I would give him thirty blows. Why do I say this?

Giving a shout and a blow together is already a debt.
In both the past and the present everyone offers praise—excessive jabber.
What can you say if you don't tread on these two paths?
The Persian from the southern sea offers an elephant husk."[1415]

大愚芝, 上堂云, "德山, 入門便棒;臨濟, 入門便喝. 翠嵓卽不然. 三門前好與三十棒. 何謂如此? 棒喝齊施早已賒, 古今皆贊絶周遮. 二途不涉憑何說? 南海波斯進象牙."

[Explanation]

Dayu: *Before he enters the mountain gate* etcetera: what use is there in entering the gate?

In both the past and the present everyone offers praise etecetera: in both the past and the present the blow and the shout are praised. This was just jabber. Excessive (*chŏl* 絶) means "extreme."

What can you say if you don't tread on these two paths: the two paths refer to the two paths of the blow and the shout.

The Persian from the southern sea: there is light in darkness.

Offers an elephant husk: this refers to the fact that during time of Great Peace tribute is sent from abroad.

1415 For this sermon and verse, see also the *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ136.78a10–13). The verse is also associated with a different sermon in the *Tiansheng guandeng lu* (XZJ135.762a9–10); *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ136.634b5–6); and *Jiatai pudeng lu* (XZJ137.52a17–b1).

大愚: 三門前云云者, 何用入門來也. 古今皆讚云云者, 古今讚揚棒喝, 是周遮也. 絶極也. 二途不涉云云者, 二途謂棒喝二途也. 南海云云者, 暗中有明也. 進象牙者, 言致得大平, 海外輸貢也.

Case 677.

Deshan's "Ouch, Ouch!"

德山啊耶

[Old case]

Deshan[1416] was not well and a certain monk asked, "Is there someone who does not get sick or not?" The master said, "There is." The monk said, "Who does not get sick?" The master said, "Ouch, ouch!"[1417]

德山不安, 有僧問, "還有不病者也無?" 師云, "有." 曰, "如何是不病者?" 師云, "啊哪! 啊哪!"

[Explanation of the gongan]

Ouch, ouch: this is illness. Other than the sick there are no sick people.

啊哪啊哪者, 是病者也. 病者外無不病者也.

Dajue Huailian's verse

With cataracts I see flowers (spots) appear in empty space,
Now clear and bright, what is there and also what is not there?
Ouch—do you know this thunder-like sound?
After enlightenment, you'll see it was not a sick body.

1416 This is Deshan Xuanjian.

1417 For this story, see also the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.318a22–24).

大覺璉頌,"翳目觀花起大虛, 澄澄何有復何無! 啊哪一震還知否? 見覺元來不病軀."

[Explanation]
Dajue said … *in empty space* means if you are deluded you will be like this. The following words are what Deshan said properly.

大覺云云, 大虛者, 迷則如是也. 下言, 德山道得處也.

Jianfu Benyi, after he recovered from his illness, ascended the hall, raised this gongan, called the great assembly, and said,[1418] "The virtuosos and craftsmen of our tradition did not indiscriminately display words and like a person who can shoot an arrow and hit the target a hundred times out of a hundred[1419] (their words) are true and borne out of what is there.[1420] Although this is the case, I would like all of you to also know the content of my insight. 'Is there someone who does not get sick or not?' I say, 'There is.' 'Who does not get sick?' I say, 'Cold damage leads to a runny nose.' Take care!"

薦福逸, 因病起, 上堂, 擧此話, 召大衆云,"作家宗匠, 語不浪陳. 如人解射, 百發百中, 信而有之. 然雖如是, 薦福見處, 也要諸人共知. 還有不病者也無?" 自云,"有." "如何是不病者?" 自云,"傷寒鼻涕流." "珍重!"

[Explanation]
Jianfu: *Cold damage leads to a runny nose*: it is all an illness.

1418 A shorter version of this sermon can be found in the *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.370b14–16).

1419 This is a reference to the story of Yang Youji; see note 1160 above.

1420 This may be an allusion to a passage from the *Zuo zhuan* 左傳: "The words of a gentleman are true and borne out of evidence" 君子之言信而有徵; see *Zuo zhuan jishi benmo* 左傳紀事本末 (Wenyuange Siku quanshu edition) 33, 9b.

薦福: 傷寒鼻涕流者, 全是病也.

Xuefeng Qingliao[1421] raised, "Deshan was about to pass away and showed signs of illness … 'Ouch, ouch!' The monk was speechless. Deshan said, 'You lay your hands on the sky and chase after echoes, exhausting your mind and body. You wake up from the dream and realize it was not [real]. In the end what is there to do?' Once he was done talking he sat peacefully and passed away." The master slapped his knees and said, "What a pity! All his life the old man saw monks enter the gate and gave out blows like falling raindrops, but when he reached the time of his death and pressed for an answer he forgot the point of the story (話頭). Although this is true, when he screamed 'Ouch, ouch!' in a loud voice what illness does this pain belong to?"

雪峰了, 擧, "德山臨遷化示疾,<至> 啊哪啊哪, 僧無語, 山云, '捫空追響, 勞汝身心, 夢覺覺非, 竟有何事!' 言訖安坐而逝." 師拍膝云, "可惜許! 老漢, 平生見僧入門, 棒如雨點, 及乎臨行, 被人拶著, 忘了話頭. 雖然恁麽, 祇如高聲叫, '啊哪! 啊哪!' 是是麽病痛?"

[Explanation]
Xuefeng: This thoroughly clarifies Deshan's illness.

雪峰: 明得德山病到底也.

Baolin Ben, after he recovered from his illness, ascended the hall and said, "For days I was immobilized by a minor ailment and was unable to grant the great assembly an audience. For this reason, the body is the origin

---

[1421] Xuefeng or Zhenxie Qingliao 真歇清了 (1088–1151) is a dharma heir of Danxia Zichun. In 1122 he became the abbot of Mt. Changlu 長蘆山 in Jiangsu province and eight years later he moved to Xuefeng Monastery 雪峰寺. In 1136 he became the abbot of Guangli Monastery 広利寺 on Mt. Ayuwang in Zhejiang province. And in 1145 he became the abbot of Nengren Chan Monastery on Mt. Jing. He posthumously received the title Chan Master Wukong 悟空禪師.

of suffering and that on which all illnesses rely. When it does occur no one can avoid it. Remember, “Deshan … Ouch, ouch”? The master said, “How laughable, everyone! This old man had a spine that was as hard as iron, but in this state he forgot the past and lost the future. Today I wish to offer to others what people have not been allowed to taste for ages and set a declining Order straight. I will cause its luster to shine repeatedly and prevent views from progressively making others stupid. How could this not be refreshing?” He thereupon *raised his staff and said, “Where did it go?”* And he struck the meditation bench.

寶林本, 因病起, 上堂云, “數日劣疾所拘, 不得與大衆相見. 然卽身爲苦本, 衆病攸依, 凡厥有生, 無能免者. 記得, ‘德山, 至啊哪啊哪’ ” 師云, “好笑! 諸仁者, 這老漢, 尋常一條脊梁硬似鐵, 洎乎到此, 便乃忘前失後, 千古之下, 令人不甘. 如今欲與佗, 扭正頹綱, 令重生光彩, 免見遮相鈍置, 豈不快哉!” 乃驀拈拄杖云, “甚處去也?” 擊禪床.

[Explanation]

Baolin: Raised his staff and said, “Where did it go?”: “where are you searching with your hands?”

寶林: 拈拄杖云甚處去者, 向甚麼處摸摖.

Zhu’an Shigui ascended the hall, raised this gongan, and again raised, “One day attendant Shoukuo asked Deshan, ‘All the sages from the past, where did they go?’ Deshan said, “What? What?’ Shoukuo said, ‘What was ordered (by the emperor) was a dragon horse that soars through the sky, but what appeared was a crippled sea turtle’” The master said, “‘Ouch, ouch!’ and ‘What? What?’ are not similar and almost the same. If you simply do what others expect you to do,[1422] then what shall we do with you? ‘The white heron

[1422] “Simply do what others expect one to do” (*mahou luqian* 馬後驢前). This phrase literally means “behind a horse and in front of an ass.” This is an analogy of someone who follows people who are

stands on snow, but they are not the same color. The bright moon and the rush are not other things.' "[1423] Afterwards, he let out a great laugh and said, "Of all people! It was the old Chan master who simply spoke similar phrases. What is a phrase that is not similar?

Lotus leaves so round, they are as round as a mirror,
Water chestnuts so square, they are as sharp as gimlets,
Wind blows, willow catkins float away like balls of fur,
Rain beats down, plum flowers fly away like butterflies.[1424]

Is this not a phrase that is not similar?" He threw down the fly whisk and said, "You lacquer bucket! Go investigate further in the hall!"

竹庵珪, 上堂, 舉此話, 又舉, 一日廓侍者問德山, '從上諸聖, 向什麽處去?' 云, '作麽? 作麽?' 廓云, '敕點飛龍馬, 跛鱉出頭來.' 師云, "阿耶阿耶, 作麽作麽, 絶相似, 不爭多. 馬後驢前奈你何? 鷺鷥立雪非同色, 明月蘆花不似佗." 遂大笑云, "大小老禪! 也只道得箇相似句, 如何是不相似句? 荷葉團團團似鏡, 菱角尖尖尖似錐. 風吹柳絮毛毬走, 雨打梨花蛺蝶飛. 莫便是不相似句麽!" 擲下拂子云, "漆桶, 參堂去!"

[Explanation]

Zhu'an: *Ouch, ouch! What, what?*: these are similar phrases.

Of all people! It was the old Chan master … fly away like butterflies: phrases that are not similar are precisely similar phrases.

He threw down the fly whisk etcetera: he heard a similar phrase and yet

---

greater than himself and leads who are lesser than himself but never does anything unexpected and exceptional.

1423 This last quote is from a verse by Jiufeng Daoqian's dharma heir Tongan Changcha 同安常察 (d.u.); see the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.455c15–16).

1424 This verse was composed by Dahui; see *Dahui Pujue chanshi yulu* (T 1998A.47.855a28–29 and 936b23–25).

considered it not similar. They were not similar and yet they were considered similar. Hence he is a lacquer bucket.

竹庵: 啊哪啊哪, 作麼作麼者, 相似句也. 大小勞禪至蝶飛者, 不相似句, 卽相似句也. 擲下拂子云云者, 聞相似句, 而便謂絶相似也, 絶相似, 而便謂相似, 是柒桶也.

Case 685.

Dongshan's Three Bodies

洞山三身

[Old case]

Dongshan[1425] was asked by a monk, "Which of the three bodies does not fall into the myriad differentiations?"[1426] The master said, "I've always been serious about this."[1427] The monk later asked Caoshan,[1428] "Dongshan said, 'I've always been serious about this.' What was his intent?" Caoshan said, "If you need it, chop off and take my head." The monk again asked Xuefeng.[1429] Xuefeng took his staff, struck his mouth, and said, "I too have been to Dongshan."[1430]

洞山因僧問, "三身中那身不墮諸數?" 師云, "吾常於此切." 僧後問曹山, "洞山道, '吾常於此切.' 意旨如何?" 曹云, "要頭斫將去." 僧又問雪峯, 峯以拄杖劈口打云, "我也曾到洞山來."

[1425] This is Dongshan Liangjie.

[1426] This is a reference to the *Vimalakīrti-nirdeśa sutra* (T 475.14.542a16ff).

[1427] For this part of the old case, see the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.327a25–27).

[1428] Caoshan Benji 曹山 本寂 (840–901) is a dharma heir of Dongshan Liangjie. Benji served as abbot on Mt. Cao 曹山 in Jiangxi province. He received the posthumous title Great Master Yuanzheng 元証大師.

[1429] This is Xuefeng Yicun; see note 628 above.

[1430] For this old case, see the *Xutang heshang yulu* (T 2000.47.1025b11–14). Xuefeng's answer is slightly different in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.327a27).

[Explanation of the gongan]

Which of the three bodies etcetera: the Dharma body is serene and does not have a past, present, or future. Hence, the Dharma body does not fall into the myriad differentiations. The three bodies are perfectly integrated and the ten bodies are without obstruction. Hence, none of the bodies fall into the myriad differentiations.

I've always been serious about this: it will not work if you discern with a slanted view. Hence, *If you need it, chop off and take my head.*

I too have been etcetera: all of this is something that cannot be said. Is the intent of the three masters identical or are they different? If it is identical, then it cannot be said. However, the taste of the salt in the water and the dye in color (although they cannot be seen directly) certainly exist and cannot be said to not exist.[1431] Therefore, Chengtian Chuanzong said what he said. Yunmen Zonggao too feared people would understand it this way and thus said what he said.

三身中云云者, 法身凝寂, 非去來今, 則法身不墮諸數也. 三身圓融, 十身無礙, 則一一不墮諸數也. 吾常於此切者, 一隅分辨不得也, 則要頭斫將去也. 我也曾到云云者, 皆是道不是也. 三師意一般耶, 各別耶? 一般是道不得也. 然水中鹽味, 色裏膠精, 決定是有, 不可道無也. 故承天宗拈云云, 雲門杲, 又恐人伊麽會故云云.

Tiantong Zhengjue's verse[1432]

It did not enter the world and has not yet found causes and conditions,
The family legacy is in the emptiness of (the world) in a jar before the primordial kalpa,[1433]

1431 See *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.456c28).

1432 For this verse, see also *Hongzhi chanshi guanglu* (T 2001.48.27b17–18).

1433 For "The world in a jar before the primordial kalpa" (*jiehu* 劫壺); see Koga and Iriya, *Zengo jiten*, p. 140. For the world in a jar, see note 989.

White duckweed blows gently at dusk on the autumn river,
A boat returns to the old shore enshrouded in mist.

天童覺頌,"不入世未循緣, 劫壺空處有家傳. 白蘋風細秋江暮, 古岸舩歸一帶煙."

[Explanation]

Tiantong: The intent of the first two lines is to speak about that which does not fall into the myriad differentiations. And the next two lines speak of the way things work according to the Dharma today. The way things work according to the Dharma is the taste of salt in the water etcetera.

World in a jar before the primordial kalpa: "the matter (of one's original endowment)] at the time of the primordial kalpa" and "world in a jar" etcetera.

天童: 二句, 不墮諸數意也, 下言今日如法就向也. 如法就向者, 水中鹽味云云也. 劫壺者, 空劫時事, 如壺中天地云云也.

Baoning Renyong's verse[1434]

Being serious (about the teaching) is detrimentally sought outside oneself,
Why does the close friend look like my worst enemy?
From beginning to end not a hint of shame on his face,
There will again be a time when Caoshan asks for your head.

保寧勇頌,"此切堪傷走外求, 至親何故似怨讎? 始終滿面無慙色, 更有曺山乞你頭."

1434 For this verse, see also the *Chanzong songgu lianzhu tongji* (XZJ 115.295b10–11); and *Baoning Renyong chanshi yulu* (XZJ 120.379a7–8).

Xuedou Faning's verse

Always been serious about this—a sublime and transcendent relationship,
The body that does not fall into (the myriad differentiations) is this body,
He again asks Caoshan who, if wanted, offers his head,
Stop tricking people with seemingly real words.

雪竇寧頌, "常於此切妙超倫, 不墮之身是此身. 更問曹山要頭與, 休將實語作謾人."

Layman Yuezhai's verse

He understands and says, 'I've always been serious about this,'
Every time you drink you choke,
How laughable! Worldly people do not recognize him,
He flares his original nose as he pleases.

悅齋居士頌, "解道吾常於此切, 一迴飲水一迴噎. 堪笑世人不識渠, 孃生鼻孔恣扭捏."

Chengtian Chuanzong added a comment,[1435] "Dear chief seats! One turning phrase is 'The ocean is peaceful and the river is clean'[1436]; the other turning phrase is 'The wind is high and the moon is cold'[1437]; and the last

1435 For this comment, see also the *Congrong lu* (T 2004.48.291a9–11); *Zhengfa yanzang* (XZJ 118.129b10–12); and *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.768a4–6).

1436 This comment is also found in the *Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu* (T 1988.47.553b4); *Fenyang Wude chanshi yulu* (T 1992.47.600a4); *Mingjue chanshi yulu* (T 1996.47.669c9); *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.158a2–3, 165b11 and 171a26) etc. The line in question also appears in a poem by Xue Feng 薛逢 (806–876?); see *Quan Tang shi* 548, 13b.

1437 This comment is also found in the *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.304c14); *Guzunsu yulu* (XZJ 118.246a17); *Jianzhong jingguo xudeng lu* (XZJ 136.137b4 and 169, a6); *Liandeng huiyao* (XZJ 136.914a16) etc.

turning phrase is "I chase the thief on the thief's horse." Please try to discern for yourselves. If a patch-robed monk were to come out and say, 'That's not it at all,' I'll admit that you have an eye."

承天宗拈, "諸上座! 一轉語, 海晏河清;一轉語, 風高月冷;一轉語, 騎賊馬趁賊. 試請辨看. 忽有箇衲僧出來道, '摠不與麼.' 也許伊具一隻眼."

[Explanation]

Chengtian: *The ocean is peaceful and the river is clean*: the position of the real.

The wind is high and the moon is cold: the position of the provisional.

I chase the thief on the thief's horse: unity (of the real and provisional) attained (兼帶).[1438]

If so, then the intent of the three masters is that they did not all provide a conclusive expedient.

If a patch-robed monk etcetera: one who did not fall for the three turning prhases.

I'll admit that you have an eye: on the one hand, an award and, on the other hand, a penalty.

承天: 海晏河清則正位, 風高月冷則偏位, 騎賊馬趁賊, 則兼帶也. 然則三師意, 皆不端便也. 忽有个衲僧云云者, 不落前三句也. 許伊具一隻眼者, 一則賞, 一則罰.

Yunmen Zonggao raised Chengtian Chuanzong's comment and said, "With these kudzu-like words one cannot see the three old men even in his dreams." Again, he said, "Why could you not apply a needle to the *gaohuang* pressure point (that is difficult to cure)?"

1438 "Unity attained" (*jiandai* 兼帶) is a term with strong associations to the five position (wuwei) theory. To have attained unity is to respond to all conditions without becoming attached to existence. It is neither pure nor impure. And it is neither real nor provisional; see the *Rentian yanmu* (T 2006. 48.313c19–21).

雲門杲, 擧承天宗拈云, "恁麼葛藤, 也未夢見三箇老漢在." 復云, "何不向膏肓穴上下一針!"

[Explanation]

Yunmen: *With these … see the three old men even in his dreams*: not this at all, hence they do not understand the three master's intent.

Why could you not apply a needle to the gaohuang *pressure point*: treat the three phrases for their respective illnesses.

雲門: 伊麼至老漢者, 摠不伊麼, 則不會三師意也. 膏肓云云者, 當三句治其病也.

Case 688.

Dongshan's Experience

洞山體得

[Old case]

Dongshan[1439] in a pointer said, "Only a person who has experienced going beyond buddhahood has the right to explain gongans." At that time a certain monk asked, "What is a person who has gone beyond buddhahood?" The master replied, "He is not a buddha."

洞山垂語云, "體得佛向上人, 方有說話分." 時有僧問, "如何是佛向上人." 師云, "非佛."

[Explanation of the gongan]

A person who has experienced going beyond buddhahood: this is a host within host[1440] and a perfected person with no position.[1441]

Experienced … has the right to explain gongans: this is because, although this person has no deficiencies in exchanging questions and answers and completely understands where the other is coming from, in order to

1439 This is Dongshan Liangjie.

1440 See note 1268 above.

1441 The locus classicus of this expression, "perfected person with no position" (*wuwei zhenren* 無位眞人) is the recorded sayings of Linji, see *Zhenzhou Linji Huizhao chanshi yulu* (T 1985.47.496c10–14); see also the *Zongjing lu* (T 2016.48.943c19–22) and *Jingde chuandeng lu* (T 2076.51.276a22, 290c18–21, and 447a2).

penetrate through the contamination of words[1442] he does not doubt what is uttered by people under Heaven.

He is not a buddha: *You cannot give him a name*. *You cannot give him a shape*. There is no perfect way to speak of him.

佛向上人者, 主中主, 無位眞人, 是也. 體得至說話分者, 但有問答不虧欠, 摠識伊來處. 只爲透得語滲漏, 不疑天下人舌頭故也. 非佛者, 名不得狀不得, 不可的言也.

Yunmen Wenyan added a comment, "You cannot give him a name. You cannot give him a shape. Therefore, it is said he is not a buddha."

雲門偃拈云, "名不得, 狀不得. 所以言非."

[Explanation]

Yunmen: If he is a person who has gone beyond buddhahood, then there is no perfect way of saying he is such-and-such a thing.

雲門: 若是佛向上人, 則不可的言某物故也.

Fayan added a comment, "As an expedient means, we call him a buddha."

法眼拈云, "方便呼爲佛."

[Explanation]

Fayan: If you know the Buddha is an expedient means, then there is no reality to which you can become attached. If there is no reality to which you can become attached, then what further need is there to go beyond?

法眼: 知佛是方便, 則無實執處. 無實執處, 則更要向上作麽?

1442 The contamination of words is one of the "three types of contamination" (*sanzhong shenlou* 三種滲漏): the contamination of emotions (*qing shenlou* 情滲漏), contamination of views (*jian shenlou* 見滲漏), and contamination of words (*yu shenlou* 語滲漏); see *Biyan lu* (T 2003.48.155c6–10) and *Wujia zhengzong zan* (XZJ 135.953b13–16).

Tiantong Zhengjue raised, "A monk as Dongshan, 'What is a person who has gone beyond buddhahood?' Dongshan replied, 'He is not a buddha.'" The master said, "When Dongshan speaks this way he firmly grasped the house style and didn't allow a single drop of water to leak. (The truth) could not be reached by seeing and hearing. The traces of the mind were completely erased. When you reach this state you must penetrate his transformations and do not allow people to become weary of it. Then the blue dragon will shed its skin and the jade phoenix will give birth to its chick. How is one to explain the truth of penetrating transformations? Do you understand? The clear wind grows with each row and the bright moon follows the boat."

天童覺, 擧僧問洞山, '如何是佛向上人?' 山云, '非佛.' 師云, "洞山恁麽道, 直是把斷家風, 不通水泄, 見聞匪及, 心迹俱消. 到這裏, 却須通其變, 使人不倦, 直得蒼龍蛻骨, 玉鳳生雛. 且作麽生說个通變底道理? 還會麽? 清風隨棹滿, 明月逐舟來."

Again, he raised this gongan and then raised Fayan's comment and said, "The two old worthies—how different are they? It is true that *diao* (刁) and *dao* (刀) are similar, what should we do with the difference between *yu* (魚) and *lu* (魯)? When you arrive at this state you must activate the potential before the (primordial) kalpa, release the arrow facing the wind, carry your body on your shoulders, make the truth your own (承當) by letting it go, and be equipped with such eyes. Can you discern it? It is easy to distinguish flour in snow but difficult to discern coal in black ink."

又擧此話, 連擧法眼拈云, "二老宿, 相去多小? 直是刁刀相似, 奈何魚魯參差! 到者裏, 須是轉劫外機, 放風前箭, 橫身擔荷, 撒手承當, 具者般眼目, 始得. 還辨得麽? 易分雪裏粉, 難辨墨中煤."

[Explanation]

Tiantong: *Again, he raised … the two old worthies*: this is Yunmen and Fayan. Diao (刁) *and* dao (刀) *are similar* etcetera: they are similar and yet not similar. *Activate the potential before the (primordial) kalpa* and *carry your body on*

your shoulders: this understands Yunmen's intent.

Release the arrow facing the wind and *making the truth your own by letting it go*: this understands Fayan's intent.

It is easy to distinguish flour in snow etcetera: in the end one cannot distinguish or discern.

天童又擧: 二老宿者, 雲門法眼也. 刁刀相似云云者, 似而不似也. 轉劫外機, 橫身荷擔者, 會雲門意也. 放風前箭, 撒手承當者, 會法眼意也. 易分雪裏云云者, 畢竟分辨不得也.

Yunmen Zonggao while instructing the assembly raised this gongan and then raised Yunmen's comment. The master said, "The matter of going beyond buddhahood thus raised by the two worthies is lackluster. Here (in my assembly) we would not answer so. What is the matter of going beyond buddhahood? Drag out the staff, hit him on his back and prevent him from growing roots (stuck) in the matter of going beyond buddhahood."

雲門杲, 示衆, 擧此話, 連擧雲門拈, 師云, "二尊宿, 恁麽提持佛向上事, 且緩緩. 這裏卽不然. 如何是佛向上事? 拽拄杖, 劈脊便打, 免敎伊在佛向上埰根."

[Explanation]
Yunmen: Songyuan's intent is the same.

雲門: 松源意同也.

Songyuan ascended the hall raised this gongan and then raised Yunmen's comment. The master said, "Yunmen had good words, but they cannot but be nails and glue."

松源, 上堂, 擧此話, 連擧雲門拈, 師云, "雲門好語, 未免釘釘膠粘."

INDEX

A.

B.

C.

D.

E.

F.

G.

H.

M.

N.

O.

P.

Q.

R.

S.

T.

U.

V.

W.

X.

Y.

Z.

Contributors

Editor

John Jorgensen is currently Adjunct Professor at the Australian National University, Canberra. He has published *Inventing Hui-neng: Hagiography and Biography in Early Ch'an*, vol. 68 Sinica Leidensia, Brill: Leiden, 2005; with Eun-su Cho, translators, *The Essential Passages that Directly Point at the Essence of the Mind, Reverend Baegun (1299–1375)*, Jogye Order Publishing: Seoul, 2005; as well as articles, book chapters and encyclopedia entries on Korean, Chinese and Japanese Buddhism.

Translator

Juhn Y. Ahn is Assistant Professor of Buddhist and Korean Studies at the University of Michigan Ann Arbor, His research touches upon issues related to the history of Buddhism, reading, medicine, and the environment in East Asia. He is currently investigating the complex relations between Buddhism and the State in 14th century Korea. His publications include "Zen and the Art of Nourishing Life: Labor, Exhaustion, and the Malady of Meditation" (2008); "This Way of Ours: Buddhism and the Search for Values during the late Koryŏ Dynasty" (2009); "Who Has the Last Word in Chan? Secrecy, Transmission, and Reading During the Northern Song Dynasty" (2009); and "The Merit of Not Making Merit: Buddhism and the Late Koryo Fiscal Crisis" (2010).

Editorial Consultants

Kim, Young-Wook received his doctorate from the Department of Philosophy of Korea University in 1994, and is presently Chief of Research at the Kasan Institute of Buddhist Culture. He is a scholar specializing in the Korean Kanhwa Sŏn tradition of meditation.

Ven. Misan (Kim, Wan-Doo), who currently teaches at Joong-Ang Sangha University, has been a monk in the Korean Seon tradition for thirty-two years. After his formal training

in Buddhist meditation in Korean monasteries, he pursued the study of the theoretical aspects of the Buddhist teaching at postgraduate level, spending more than ten years studying early Buddhism along with Pali and Sanskrit in Sri Lanka, India, and finally at Oxford University. He has worked as a senior fellow at the Center for the Study of World Religions at Harvard University and as Director of the Social Affairs Department of the Jogye Order of Korean Buddhism. He is a director of the Sangdo Meditation Center.

Ven. Chongdok (Park, Cheong-Hwan) is Assistant Professor at the Department of Buddhist Scripture Translation at Joong-ang Sangha University in Korea. He received his DPhil degree in Buddhist Studies at the University of Oxford in 2005, based on his dissertation entitled *A Translation and Study of Selected Avadānas of the Mūlasarvāstivādin Vinaya (MSV)*. His main research interest is Buddhist narratives. He has published "An analysis on the image of women in the *Mallikāvadāna* of the *Mūlasarvāstivādavinaya Ksudrakavastu (MSVKv)*" (2006); "A Study of the Avadāna Literature" (2006); "A Study of the Concept of the Buddha through the Idea of the *Pubbakammapiloti* in Theravāda Buddhism (I)" (2006); "A Study on the Buddhist Folktale, Two Nāgas and King Bimbisāra" (2008).

Members of the English Translation Editorial Board
The Collected Works of Korean Buddhism

Members of the Compilation Committee of Korean Buddhist Thought

韓國傳統思想書 刊行委員會 刊行委員

Ven. Haeju (海住): Professor, Dongguk University

Dr. Kim Young-Wook (金榮旭): Chief of Research, Kasan Institute of Buddhist Culture

Jung Byung-Sam (鄭炳三): Professor, Sookmyung Women's University

Lee Jin-Oh (李晉吾): Professor, Pusan National University

Ven. Woncheol (圓徹): Former Director of the Research Institute of Buddhism Studies, The Jogye Order of Korean Buddhism

Ven. Go-Ok (古玉): Director, Kasan Institute of Buddhist Culture

Ven. Misan (彌山): Professor, Joong-Ang Sangha University

Ven. Chongdok (正德): Assistant Professor, Joong-Ang Sangha University

Kim Jae-Sung (金宰晟): Senior Researcher

Kwon Ki-Chan (權奇燦): Researcher

In Memoriam
The Most Venerable Kasan Jikwan (1932–2012)

The heart and soul of this monumental publication project from its conception to its completion was the late Most Venerable Kasan Jikwan, Daejongsa, the 32nd President of the Jogye Order of Korean Buddhism. Throughout his illustrious career as a scholar-monk, his cherished wish was to aid the study of Korean Buddhism overseas and to enable its legacy, which reaches back some seventeen hundred years, to become a part of the common cultural heritage of humankind. After years of prayer and planning, Ven. Kasan Jikwan was able to bring this vision to life by procuring a major grant from the Korean government. He launched the publication project shortly after taking office as president of the Jogye Order. After presiding over the publication of the complete vernacular Korean edition, Ven. Kasan Jikwan entered nirvāṇa as the English version of *The Collected Works of Korean Buddhism* was in final manuscript stage. With the publication of the English version, we bring this project to completion and commemorate the teacher whose great passion for propagation conceived it, and whose loving and selfless devotion gave it form.

Ven. Kasan Jikwan was founder of the Kasan Institute of Buddhist Culture, President of the Jogye Order of Korean Buddhism, and President of the Compilation Committee of Korean Buddhist Thought. A graduate of Haeinsa Saṅgha College, he received his doctorate in philosophy from Dongguk University in 1976. He led Haeinsa as the monastery's head lecturer and abbot, and Dongguk University as Professor and the 11th President. After assuming the title of *Daejongsa*, the highest monastic rank within the Jogye Order, he became the 32nd President of the Jogye Order.

The leading scholar-monk of his generation, Ven. Kasan Jikwan published over a hundred articles and books, ranging from commentaries on Buddhist classics to comparative analyses of northern and southern *Vinayas*. A pioneer in the field of metal and stone inscriptions, he published *A Critical Edition of Translated and Annotated Epitaphs of Eminent Monk*s and also composed over fifty commemorative stele inscriptions and epitaphs. He compiled the Kasan Encyclopaedia of Buddhism, thirteen volumes of which have so far been published. He was the recipient of the Silver Crown Medal of Honor, the Manhae Prize for Scholarship, and the Gold Crown Medal of Honor for Outstanding Achievement in Culture, which was awarded posthumously.

On January 2, 2012, Jikwan Sunim severed all ties to this world and entered quiescence

at Gyeongguk Temple in Jeongneung-dong, Seongbuk-gu, Seoul. He left behind these words as he departed from this world: "With this ephemeral body of flesh, I made a lotus blossom bloom in this Sahā world. With this phantom, hollow body, I reveal the dharma body in the calm quiescence of nirvāṇa." Jikwan Sunim's life spanned eighty years, sixty-six of which he spent in the Buddhist monastic order.

Executive Members of the Steering Committee of Korean Buddhist Thought
韓國傳統思想書 運營委員會 運營委員

The Late Ven. Kasan Jikwan (伽山 智冠): 32nd President of the Jogye Order of Korean Buddhism, Former President, Compilation Committee of Korean Buddhist Thought

Ven. Haebong Jaseung (海峰 慈乘): 33rd President of the Jogye Order of Korean Buddhism, President, Compilation Committee of Korean Buddhist Thought

Ven. Jihyun (智玄): Director, Department of General Affairs 總務部長

Ven. Neungdo (能度): Director, Department of Planning 企劃室長

Ven. Ilgam (日鑑): Director, Department of Financial Affairs 財務部長

Ven. Jinmyung (眞明): Director, Department of Cultural Affairs 文化部長

Ven. Beopgwang (法光): Director, Department of Social Affairs 社會部長

Ven. Heojung (虛淨): Director, Research Institute of Buddhist Studies 佛學研究所長

Ven. Popchin (法眞): Director, Cultural Corps of Korean Buddhism 文化事業團長

Ven. Subul (修弗): President, *The Buddhist Newspaper* 佛教新聞社長

Ven. Dohgyeon (道見): Deputy Director, Department of Planning 企劃局長

Collected Works of Korean Buddhism

韓國傳統思想叢書

No.		Title	Edited by	Translated by
1	元曉	Wonhyo: Selected Works	A. Charles Muller	A. Charles Muller Jin Y. Park Sem Vermeersch
2	知訥	Chinul: Selected Works	Robert E. Buswell, Jr.	Robert E. Buswell, Jr.
3	休精	Hyujeong: Selected Works	John Jorgensen	John Jorgensen
4	華嚴 I	Hwaŏm I: The Mainstream Tradition	Richard D. McBride II	Richard D. McBride II Sem Vermeersch
5	華嚴 II	Hwaŏm II: Selected Works	Richard D. McBride II	Richard D. McBride II
6	諸教學	Doctrinal Treatises: Selected Works	A. Charles Muller	A. Charles Muller Richard D. McBride II
7-1	公案集 I	Gongan Collections I	John Jorgensen	Juhn Y. Ahn
7-2	公案集 II	Gongan Collections II	John Jorgensen	John Jorgensen
8	禪語錄	Seon Dialogues	John Jorgensen	John Jorgensen
9	詩選集	Seon Poems: Selected Works	Roderick Whitfield	Roderick Whitfield Young-Eui Park
10	文化	Korean Buddhist Culture: Accounts of a Pilgrimage, Monuments, and Eminent Monks	Roderick Whitfield	Matty Wegehaupt Michael Finch Sem Vermeersch
11	梵網經古迹記	Exposition of the Sutra of Brahma's Net	A. Charles Muller	A. Charles Muller
12	韓國高僧碑文	Anthology of Stele Inscriptions of Eminent Korean Buddhist Monks	John Jorgensen	Patrick R. Uhlmann